

## Disclaimer for Rough Real-Time Transcripts

“Do not quote or rely on this uncorrected transcript without obtaining written permission from the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights at [transcripts@usccr.gov](mailto:transcripts@usccr.gov).”

## U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

+ + + + +

MEETING **UNEDITED**

+ + + + +

FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2016

+ + + + +

The Commission convened in Suite 1150 at  
1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington, D.C.  
at 10:00 a.m., Martin R. Castro, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

MARTIN R. CASTRO, Chairman

PATRICIA TIMMONS-GOODSON, Vice Chair

ROBERTA ACHTENBERG, Commissioner

GAIL HERIOT, Commissioner

PETER N. KIRSANOW, Commissioner

DAVID KLADNEY, Commissioner

KAREN K. NARASAKI, Commissioner

MICHAEL YAKI, Commissioner\*

MAURO MORALES, Staff Director

MAUREEN RUDOLPH, General Counsel

\* *Present via telephone*

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

## STAFF PRESENT:

WARIGIA BOWMAN\*

TERESSA BROOKS\*

GAVIN BROWN\*

DONNA BUDNICK, Michigan SAC Chair\*

MATTHEW DIAL

PAMELA DUNSTON, Chief, ASCD

SIABHAN HAWKINS, Intern, OGC

JENNIFER HEPLER, Parliamentarian

TINALOUISE MARTIN, Director, OM\*

DAVID MUSSATT, Director, RPCU\*

MICHELE RAMEY\*

JUANDA SMITH\*

BRIAN WALCH

MELISSA WOJNAROSKI, MWRO\*

## COMMISSIONER ASSISTANTS PRESENT:

SHERYL COZART

ALEC DEULL

JASON LAGRIA

CARISSA MULDER

AMY ROYCE

ALISON SOMIN

KIMBERLY TOLHURST

IRENA VIDULOVIC

A G E N D A

I. APPROVAL OF AGENDA.....4

II. BUSINESS MEETING

    A. PROGRAM PLANNING

        Vote and Discussion on FY17 Statutory.....6  
            Enforcement Report

        Vote and Discussion on Native American....8  
            Heritage Month Statement

        Vote and Discussion on Dakota Access ....11  
            Pipeline Statement

    B. STATE ADVISORY COMMITTEES

        State Advisory Committee Appointments

            Arkansas.....20

            Pennsylvania.....21

            Ohio.....23

            Iowa.....26

    C. MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS

        Staff Director's Report.....28

III. ADJOURN MEETING.....30

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

## P R O C E E D I N G S

(10:00 a.m.)

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: This meeting will come to order. This is a meeting of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights. We are meeting here on November 18th commencing at 10 a.m. at the offices of the Civil Rights Commission at 1331 Pennsylvania Avenue NW in Washington, D.C.

I am Chairman Marty Castro. Commissioners who are present with me here at the meeting are Vice Chair Timmons-Goodson; Commissioners Kirsanow, Kladney, Achtenberg, Heriot, and Narasaki. Participating by telephone is Commissioner Yaki. A quorum of the Commissioners is present. Is the court reporter present? Yes, she is. Is the staff director present?

MR. MORALES: Yes, I am.

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So the meeting will now come to order. The first item is the approval of the agenda.

**I. Approval of Agenda**

CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I know we're going to have some amendments, but let me first move that we approve the agenda. Is there a second?

COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Second.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Are there any  
2 amendments?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I know we have to add two  
5 statements. I will entertain a motion that we add for  
6 consideration a statement on the Dakota Access Pipeline  
7 as well as a statement on Native American History Month.  
8 Is there a motion on that?

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: So moved.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

11 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I second.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Are there any  
13 further amendments?

14 (No response.)

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, I move  
16 that we approve the agenda as amended. All in favor,  
17 say aye.

18 (Chorus of ayes.)

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any abstentions?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. So first item is  
24 a discussion and vote on the outline and timeline and  
25 discovery plan for the fiscal year 2017 Statutory

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Enforcement Plan -- I am sorry, report.

2 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**

3 **Vote and Discussion on FY17 Statutory Enforcement**

4 **Report**

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any folks want to make  
6 a motion for discussion purposes?

7 MR. MORALES: I move to adopt.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

9 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: I second.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Discussion? Go  
11 ahead.

12 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: I will begin  
13 the discussion by observing that our staff counsel has  
14 done -- and others have done a tremendous amount of work  
15 on this, and I especially appreciate the manner in which  
16 she has addressed the concerns that have been expressed  
17 throughout, and for me, I -- I think it looks good.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Others?

19 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Chairman, I  
20 just want to --

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
22 Achtenberg?

23 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: -- comment on  
24 that. I think it was an extraordinary amount of work  
25 and work well done, so I want to add my congratulations.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any other comments from  
2 Commissioners?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: If not, I will do a roll  
5 call vote.

6 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
9 how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: I am going to  
11 abstain on this one.

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Commissioner  
13 Narasaki, how do you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
19 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
22 do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I vote yes, but I  
24 would just like to say that I can barely understand  
25 anyone on this call.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, we just have the  
2 same problem back with you. We will have them check  
3 the -- could you check the -- oh, I am sorry, someone  
4 is looking into it already Commissioner Yaki. He  
5 cannot hear us well, and he just came back a bit garbled  
6 as well.

7 Madam Vice Chair, how do you vote?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so it is  
10 seven yeses and one abstention. The discovery plan  
11 passes.

12 We now move on to a vote and discussion on  
13 the Native American Heritage Month statement.

14 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**  
15 **Vote and Discussion on Native American Heritage Month**  
16 **Statement**

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Could we get a motion  
18 for discussion?

19 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: So moved.

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

21 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Anybody have any  
23 discussion here? Can I get a copy of that?

24 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Mr. Chair?

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: I just want to  
2 note that there were two typos that were corrected since  
3 we had circulated this statement.

4                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

5                   COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: It's in your  
6 quote on the last page, spelling out "U.S." to "United  
7 States" and fixing it so it is "Native Americans."

8                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. And I think that  
9 was -- those were fixed, right?

10                  COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

11                  CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, okay. Any  
12 questions?

13                                 (No response.)

14                  CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, then we  
15 will vote on the motion. Let me do a roll call vote  
16 on this. Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

17                                 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Yes.

18                  CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
19 how do you vote?

20                                 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

21                  CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
22 how do you vote?

23                                 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, and  
24 hopefully, the motion includes asking -- directing  
25 staff to go ahead and issue it.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Oh, of course. It is  
2 always --

3 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Okay.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: -- given, yes. They  
5 will issue a press release along with this.

6 Commissioner Kladney, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
9 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
12 do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I think you just asked  
14 me how I voted, so I will say "Yes."

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

16 (Laughter.)

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: That is a man who has a  
18 lot of faith in --

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: It sounds like I am in  
20 the back room of a rock concert.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, we're having the  
22 exact same problem with you, but tech people are looking  
23 into it right now.

24 Commissioner -- Madam Vice Chair, how do  
25 you vote?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we  
3 have unanimous passage, and our staff will issue an  
4 appropriate press release to circulate that to the  
5 public. Thank you.

6 We now move on to a discussion and vote on  
7 the Dakota Access Pipeline statement.

8 **II. Business Meeting: Program Planning**

9 **Vote and Discussion on Dakota Access Pipeline Statement**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I will entertain a  
11 motion for discussion purposes.

12 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: So moved.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is there a second?

14 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. And discussion?  
16 Any questions?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Are we sure we want  
18 to say something like "The pipeline also poses a threat  
19 to the water supply"? I mean, I don't know how we as  
20 a Commission know that.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: How about "could pose a  
22 threat"?

23 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Possibly.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Is that the -- is that  
25 the --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: The pipeline is  
2 supposed to go over the river, and pipelines have been  
3 known to leak going over rivers from time to time.

4 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Is that the  
5 only concern you have, Commissioner Heriot?

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Can I --

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
8 go right ahead.

9 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes, so I  
10 actually watched an interview of the owner of the  
11 pipeline, and his company actually has the worst record  
12 in terms of all companies who do this kind of work for  
13 leaks, and even many of the recent projects that his  
14 company has done have resulted in numerous leaks, so  
15 there is actually a rational concern that this could  
16 result in leaks.

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: That's not the same  
18 as a threat to the water supply.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Any -- what  
20 other questions do you have, Commissioner? Anybody?

21 If not, then I will call it for a vote.

22 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Abstain.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
25 how do you vote?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
3 how do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
6 how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
9 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
12 do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

14 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. You sound like  
15 Darth Vader. Madam Vice Chair, how do you vote?

16 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we  
18 have six yeses, one abstention, and one no. The  
19 statement passes, with directions to our staff to  
20 appropriately issue this to the public via press  
21 release.

22 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Maybe Michael  
23 should try to call in again.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes, have our tech  
25 people figured that issue out yet? It's on a -- so even

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 if he dials in, it won't make a difference? No? Okay.

2 Commissioner Yaki, if you can hear me,  
3 while this may not solve the problem, could you hang  
4 up and try to dial in again? Hopefully, it will clear  
5 up, but it sounds like it is something that we cannot  
6 control from here.

7 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry, what?

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I'm going to have your  
9 special assistant text you.

10 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I can barely -- did  
11 you -- ?

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Your special assistant  
13 is texting you, if you can even hear that, to ask you  
14 to hang up and dial in again.

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Okay. Sorry, hang up  
16 and dial again, okay, got it.

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Correct. We will wait  
18 for you to dial on before we proceed.

19 (Pause.)

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, have  
21 you dialed back in yet?

22 (No response.)

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

24 (Pause.)

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Kim, was there a way you

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 can dial in on your phone, and then maybe we could bring  
2 it near a mic or something? But that might cause  
3 feedback though, wouldn't it? Yeah, nevermind. Kim,  
4 could you find out if he is trying to dial in?

5 PARTICIPANT: He is trying to dial in.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Oh, he is? Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can you plug the  
8 phone into your board?

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Why don't we do this?  
10 While we wait for him to dial in, do you think we could  
11 just ask the Chair of the Michigan Advisory Committee  
12 to begin the presentation? I mean, there is nothing  
13 we need to vote on there.

14 Chairman Donna Budnick? Is she on the  
15 phone yet, Michigan State Advisory Chair? Yeah, she  
16 is not on either, so we'll just continue -- oh, are you?

17 MS. BUDNICK: I am sorry --

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Okay. Are you  
19 on a speakerphone, Madam Chair? If you could speak  
20 directly into your phone, that would be better. We are  
21 getting a little distortion. Madam Chair?

22 MS. BUDNICK: Yes, I am sorry. Yes, there  
23 is a bit of distortion, but I am on speakerphone. Do  
24 you want me to call back?

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yeah, it sounds like she

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 is having the same problem we are having with  
2 Commissioner Yaki. Yeah. No, I understand.

3 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, that did not  
4 help at all.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: No, it does not, and we  
6 have the similar problem with the State Advisory  
7 Committee Chair. May I suggest if possible, it would  
8 be -- if -- I don't know how much we're going to be able  
9 to hear the Chair speak, or she hear us. Let's put her  
10 off until next month, if possible. Does that work for  
11 folks? Yes, well it sounds like it's not something our  
12 people can fix here right now.

13 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Wait, wait, wait,  
14 wait, who else -- who just spoke?

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: This is --

16 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Who just spoke?

17 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, this  
18 is Chair Castro.

19 COMMISSIONER YAKI: No, no, no, no,  
20 someone -- what I am trying to say -- what I am trying  
21 to say, Mr. Chair --

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Yes.

23 COMMISSIONER YAKI: -- is I think it is  
24 your microphone.

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I think it's all --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 it is the conference center, the entity that is relaying  
2 this to you and you to us, there is a problem there that  
3 we cannot deal with here. We also have the Chair of  
4 the Michigan State Advisory Committee prepared to make  
5 a presentation, but we are having the same  
6 communication problem with her that we were having with  
7 you, so we are trying to determine whether out of  
8 fairness to her that we ask her to, instead of  
9 presenting today, which would be very difficult for us  
10 to hear her and she to hear us, that we continue this  
11 hopefully to the next meeting, where -- wait, what are  
12 you going to say?

13 Oh wait, so we're going to reset all the  
14 mics here? Okay. Nevermind. We have a better -- we  
15 have another plan. We're going -- we're going to hang  
16 up, and we're going to collectively call back in, so  
17 please --

18 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Well, I hear Pam just  
19 fine.

20 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Really?

21 (Laughter.)

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Well, and she doesn't  
23 even have a mic. Okay. Well, we are going to -- how  
24 about now, Commissioner Yaki? Do you hear me better  
25 now?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 (No response.)

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Let's -- we're going to  
3 hang up and re-dial in. We're going to reboot on our  
4 end.

5 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Wait, am I hanging up  
6 again?

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You hang on. We're  
8 going to hang up.

9 PARTICIPANT: We are hanging up and trying  
10 again.

11 COMMISSIONER YAKI: That I hear. It is  
12 really the PA system, because I can hear people off mic  
13 fine.

14 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Can you hear me,  
15 Kladney?

16 (No response.)

17 (Whereupon, the meeting went off the  
18 record at 10:15 a.m. and resumed at 10:16 a.m.)

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Chair of Michigan  
20 SAC, we're sorry about the communication problem. We  
21 are going to coordinate with your office to present with  
22 -- present for us perhaps at the next meeting or the  
23 meeting after that at a time when it is convenient for  
24 you because today, we're not going to be able to hear  
25 you well, nor will you be able to hear our questions

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 well.

2 We apologize for the inconvenience. You  
3 are free to stay on the line and try to decipher the  
4 rest of the meeting, but we will follow up with your  
5 office to reschedule a presentation. Thank you.  
6 Commissioner Yaki, you're just going to have to stay  
7 on, and we're all going to have to make do to try the  
8 best to communicate with one another.

9 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committees**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: So now I will move on to  
11 the State Advisory Committee appointments. Today we  
12 have four State Advisory Committees to consider, so let  
13 me start with the first one.

14 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

15 **Appointments: Arkansas**

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am going to make a  
17 motion that the Commission appoints the following  
18 individuals to the Arkansas State Advisory Committee  
19 based upon the recommendation of our staff director:  
20 Warigia Bowman, Erika Benedicto, Jimmy Cline, Diana  
21 Gonzalez Worthen, Valerie Hunt, Carol Johnson, Cynthia  
22 Nance, Xavier Medina, Michael Cantrell, Josh Mostyn,  
23 Robert Steinbuch, Lee Rudofsky, Sean Teuton and Brian  
24 Vandiver.

25 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 appoints Warigia Bowman as Chair of the Arkansas State  
2 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as  
3 uncompensated government employees. Under this  
4 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director  
5 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the  
6 appointments. Do I have a motion -- I mean, I have a  
7 motion. Do I have a second?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. Any discussion?  
10 (No response.)

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none, I will  
12 call the roll call.

13 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

14 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
22 how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
25 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

2 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
3 do you vote?

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
6 Timmons-Goodson, how do you vote?

7 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes. That is  
9 seven yeses and one no. The Arkansas State Advisory  
10 Committee passes.

11 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

12 **Appointments: Pennsylvania**

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am now going to make  
14 a motion that the Commission appoints the following  
15 individuals to the Pennsylvania State Advisory  
16 Committee based upon the recommendation of our staff  
17 director: Patricia Hopson-Shelton, Marcus Allen,  
18 Christopher Armstrong, Juan Baez, Deborah Gordon  
19 Klehr, Steven Irwin, Julia Kernan, Romana Lee-Akiyama,  
20 Blake Lynch, Angela McIver, Yvette Nunez, David  
21 Osbourne, William Rothman, Riya Saha Shah, Stewart  
22 Wiener.

23 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission  
24 appoints Patricia Hopson-Shelton as Chair of the  
25 Pennsylvania State Advisory Committee. These members

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 will serve as uncompensated government employees.  
2 Under this motion, the Commission authorizes the staff  
3 director to execute the appropriate paperwork for the  
4 appointments. Do I have a second?

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Second.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Any discussion?

7 (No response.)

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hearing none,  
9 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

10 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

11 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
12 how do you vote?

13 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: Yes, but just  
14 barely.

15 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
16 how do you vote?

17 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
19 how do you vote?

20 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
22 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

23 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
25 do you vote?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes, but not barely.

2 (Laughter.)

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair, how do  
4 you vote?

5 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we  
7 have seven yeses and one no. The state passes.

8 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

9 **Appointments: Ohio**

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: I am now going to make  
11 a motion that the Commission appoints the following  
12 individuals to the Ohio State Advisory Committee based  
13 upon the recommendation of the staff director: Diane  
14 Citrino, Cassandra Bledsoe, Deborah  
15 Burstion-Donbraye, Dan Carter, Subodh Chandra,  
16 Catherine Crosby, Sharon Davies, Dilip Doshi, David  
17 Forte, Scott Gerber, Emerald Hernandez, Kevin  
18 McDermott, Robert Salem, Lee Strang, Mark Strasser,  
19 Edith Thrower, and David Tryon.

20 Pursuant to this motion, the Commission  
21 appoints Diane Citrino as the Chair of the Ohio State  
22 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as  
23 uncompensated government employees. Under this  
24 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director  
25 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 appointments. Is there a second?

2 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
4 Achtenberg seconds. Any questions?

5 (No response.)

6 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. I will call the  
7 vote.

8 Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: Abstain.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
11 how do you vote?

12 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
14 how do you vote?

15 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
17 how do you vote?

18 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
20 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

21 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

22 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
23 do you vote?

24 (No response.)

25 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 do you vote?

2 COMMISSIONER YAKI: I'm sorry. Yes, yes.

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay.

4 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair?

6 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: How do you vote? Yes?

8 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

9 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Hold on a second. What  
10 was that? Okay. I made a mistake in the reading. Dan  
11 Carter's name should not be on there. He did not submit  
12 his paperwork, so just for the record, Dan Carter's name  
13 should be stricken.

14 And then I vote yes. Does that change  
15 anybody's vote, by the way?

16 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Wait, wait,  
17 what?

18 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: In the list of names  
19 that I read, I read Dan Carter as a member of the  
20 committee. His name should not have been on there. He  
21 did not submit his paperwork, so is everybody clear on  
22 that? So the motion passes without Mr. Carter, six  
23 votes yes, one no, and one abstention.

24 **II. Business Meeting: State Advisory Committee**

25 **Appointments: Iowa**

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Okay. I am now going to  
2 make a motion to appoint the following individuals to  
3 the Iowa State Advisory Committee based upon the  
4 recommendation of our staff director: Emma  
5 Aquino-Nemecek, Genevieve Babecki, Nancy Boettger, Joe  
6 Coulter, Richard Dedor, Art Figueroa, Juan Garcia,  
7 Anthony Gaughan -- Gaughan, Gaughan, sorry about that  
8 -- Sheryl Leonard, Cynthia Miller, Angela  
9 Onwuachi-Willig, Allan Max Richards, Sal Valadez, and  
10 Zach Whiting.

11                   Pursuant to this motion, the Commission  
12 appoints Joe Coulter as the Chair of the Iowa State  
13 Advisory Committee. These members will serve as  
14 uncompensated government employees. Under this  
15 motion, the Commission authorizes the staff director  
16 to execute the appropriate paperwork for the  
17 appointments. Is there a second?

18                   COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Second.

19                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: A second from  
20 Commissioner Achtenberg. Any discussion?

21                   (No response.)

22                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Seeing none, I will call  
23 the question for a vote.

24                   Commissioner Kirsanow, how do you vote?

25                   COMMISSIONER KIRSANOW: No.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Heriot,  
2 how do you vote?

3 COMMISSIONER HERIOT: No.

4 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Narasaki,  
5 how do you vote?

6 COMMISSIONER NARASAKI: Yes.

7 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Kladney,  
8 how do you vote?

9 COMMISSIONER KLADNEY: Abstain.

10 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner  
11 Achtenberg, how do you vote?

12 COMMISSIONER ACHTENBERG: Yes.

13 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Commissioner Yaki, how  
14 do you vote?

15 COMMISSIONER YAKI: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Madam Vice Chair, how do  
17 you vote?

18 VICE CHAIR TIMMONS-GOODSON: Yes.

19 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: And I vote yes, so we  
20 have one, two, three, four, five yeses, two noes, and  
21 an abstention. The package passes.

22 And that terminates our State Advisory  
23 Committee votes. Now we have a management and  
24 operations report from our staff director. Mr. Staff  
25 Director, you have the floor.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1           **II. BUSINESS MEETING: MANAGEMENT AND OPERATIONS: STAFF**

2   **DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

3                   MR. MORALES: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

4                   CHAIRMAN CASTRO: You're welcome.

5                   MR. MORALES: I of course have the staff  
6 director's report, and I can obviously talk to you about  
7 that individually. It is in there.

8                   What I do want to talk to you about are a  
9 couple items. One has to do in particular to the OCRE  
10 vacancies in the Office of Civil Rights evaluation. I  
11 wanted to inform Commissioners that we made an offer  
12 that was accepted for a civil rights analyst, and we  
13 have another outstanding offer we have not heard back  
14 from.

15                   Our detail from USDA has agreed to come and  
16 serve the detail, and we are finalizing an announcement  
17 with OPM to bring in a Presidential Management Fellow,  
18 so we're taking I think some good steps to help staff  
19 of OCRE. We are optimistic that we will have it up to  
20 speed in the next few months here and weeks, so we are  
21 looking forward to that.

22                   And I really appreciate the staff, both  
23 Tina and of course Maureen, for all their help in  
24 getting out the vacancy announcements, doing the  
25 interviews. It's a very time-consuming process, so I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 really appreciate all of them and all their staff and  
2 their efforts to get this done.

3 Wanted to let folks know, of course next  
4 week is Thanksgiving. I will probably do an early  
5 announcement of early dismissal for staff for next week  
6 so that they can join their families for the holiday.  
7 We are -- we just received a draft of a -- an assessment  
8 on the SAC regional offices from our contractor,  
9 Optimal Solutions. We are evaluating that, and I will  
10 get that to Commissioners as soon as we have an  
11 opportunity to -- to go through that with staff.

12 Lastly, I would like to mention that we  
13 have a December 2nd tour of the African American Museum.  
14 We have invited all staff, including regional staff,  
15 to come. Regional staff will make a presentation  
16 during the business meeting after the tour, and then  
17 I understand there may be some sort of a holiday  
18 celebration as well, so we are looking forward to that.

19 And lastly, I will send out a reminder of  
20 the schedule for next year's Commission business  
21 meetings, and the next one I believe is December -- I  
22 am sorry, January --

23 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: The one after the  
24 December 2nd meeting?

25 MR. MORALES: Yes, the one after that is

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 -- I just -- I just had it, and it just slipped my mind.  
2 I guess I am --

3 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: 13th.

4 MR. MORALES: The 13th, thank you.  
5 Friday the 13th, wow, that is interesting.

6 (Laughter.)

7 MR. MORALES: So thank you very much.

8 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Thank you. Any  
9 questions for the staff director?

10 (No response.)

11 **III. Adjourn Meeting**

12 CHAIRMAN CASTRO: Seeing none, I hereby  
13 adjourn the meeting. It is now 10:27 Eastern Time.  
14 Until December 2nd, see you all then.

15 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter  
16 went off the record at 10:27 a.m.)

17

18

19

20