### Review article Altered lignin biosynthesis using biotechnology to improve lignocellulosic biofuel feedstocks

Charleson R. Poovaiah<sup>1,2</sup>, Madhugiri Nageswara-Rao<sup>1,3</sup>, Jaya R. Soneji<sup>4</sup>, Holly L. Baxter<sup>1,2</sup> and Charles N. Stewart Jr<sup>1,2,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Plant Sciences, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN, USA

<sup>2</sup>Oak Ridge National Laboratory, BioEnergy Science Center, Oak Ridge, TN, USA <sup>3</sup>Department of Biology, New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, NM, USA

<sup>4</sup>Department of Entomology, Plant Pathology & Weed Science, New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, NM, USA

Received 20 September 2013; accepted 30 May 2014. \* Correspondence (Tel 865 974 7324; fax 865 946 1989; email nealstewart@utk.edu)

**Keywords:** bioenergy, biomass, fermentable sugars, genetic manipulation, lignin biosynthetic pathway, transcription factors.

#### Summary

Lignocellulosic feedstocks can be converted to biofuels, which can conceivably replace a large fraction of fossil fuels currently used for transformation. However, lignin, a prominent constituent of secondary cell walls, is an impediment to the conversion of cell walls to fuel: the recalcitrance problem. Biomass pretreatment for removing lignin is the most expensive step in the production of lignocellulosic biofuels. Even though we have learned a great deal about the biosynthesis of lignin, we do not fully understand its role in plant biology, which is needed for the rational design of engineered cell walls for lignocellulosic feedstocks. This review will recapitulate our knowledge of lignin biosynthesis and discuss how lignin has been modified and the consequences for the host plant.

### Lignocellulosic biomass as a source for biofuel

Lignocellulosic biomass is a potential large-scale biofuel feedstock wherein entire aboveground biomass would be converted to fuels. The major candidates of lignocellulosic biomass are dedicated biofuel crops such as switchgrass (Panicum virgatum L.), Miscanthus, and poplar (Populus spp.), as well as 'waste' products from forest biomass, crop residuals, and household refuse. In the USA alone, biofuels could sustainably replace nearly 30% of current petroleum used in transportation fuels (Perlack and Stokes, 2011). Dedicated perennial biomass crops could have many environmental and resource advantages over nonrenewable fossil fuels as well as annual crops. An advantage of perennials over annuals is that they regrow each year after harvest, reducing the time and energy spent for replanting each season. Another benefit is that they translocate minerals and carbohydrates into belowground storage at the dormancy stage, making the crop more suitable for the bioconversion process as well as reducing fertilizer needs in the subsequent growing season (Propheter and Staggenborg, 2010). Advantageous environmental gualities associated with perennial grass crops include reduced soil erosion, improved water guality, and the ability to sequester significant amounts of carbon belowground (McLaughlin et al., 2002). A 5-year field study led to projections that lignocellulosic biofuels derived from switchgrass, a leading perennial biofuel candidate, would decrease greenhouse gas emissions and would act as a carbon sink compared with fossil fuels equivalents (Schmer et al., 2008).

Carbohydrate-rich plant cell walls are the major energy sink in plant biomass (Hisano et al., 2009). After growth and harvest of

biomass, the major biofuel expense is pretreatment to loosen/ breakdown cell walls, followed by saccharification and their conversion into biofuels (Rubin, 2008). Although lignocellulosic biofuels potentially provide benefits like reducing greenhouse gases, the high costs of pretreatment, saccharification, and fermentation can render them economically nonviable when taken in context of other fuel opportunities (Hisano *et al.*, 2009). Therefore, a major challenge is to decrease the effort and cost to convert these feedstocks into fuel. Fortunately, advances in our knowledge of the lignin biosynthetic pathway and plant biotechnology can be used to reduce the resistance of lignocellulosic biomass to breakdown into simple sugars and increase biofuel production; we now have effective tools to address the recalcitrance problem.

# Why lignin needs to be manipulated in lignocellulosic feedstocks

Cellulose is the most prevalent polymer on earth and a primary source for the production of biofuels (Lynd *et al.*, 2008). Cellulose is difficult to convert into fermentable sugars because of its crystallinity and occlusion by lignin; decreasing lignin in cell walls can enhance saccharification (Saballos *et al.*, 2012; Vanholme *et al.*, 2008, 2010b). It is thought that lignin occludes cellulose by physically shielding it from microbial or enzymatic decomposition (Berlin *et al.*, 2006; Vanholme *et al.*, 2010a). Lignin can also adsorb hydrolytic enzymes to prevent them from breaking down cellulose into monosaccharides (Converse *et al.*, 1990; Lee *et al.*, 1994). In addition, lignin degradation products can inhibit the performance of yeast for fermentation of monosaccharides

Please cite this article as: Poovaiah C.R., Nageswara-Rao M., Soneji J.R., Baxter H.L. and Stewart Jr C.N. (2014) Altered lignin biosynthesis using biotechnology to improve lignocellulosic biofuel feedstocks. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, doi: 10.1111/pbi.12225

#### 2 Charleson R. Poovaiah et al.

(Keating *et al.*, 2006). Such breakdown products or derivatives of lignin can also negatively affect the growth of microorganisms that can be used in consolidated bioprocessing (Agbor *et al.*, 2011). Thus, lignin has received significant attention in biofuels research with the goal of improving conversion efficiency. One of the most promising solutions to the lignin problem is to decrease its biosynthesis in the plant itself, as this approach might be more efficient and cost effective than removing it at the biorefinery. Pretreatment methods, such as acid hydrolysis, alkaline hydrolysis, and enzymatic hydrolysis, are currently being used to breakdown the lignocellulosic matrix and remove lignin (Kumar *et al.*, 2009; Mosier *et al.*, 2005). Expensive pretreatment might be decreased or eliminated by the use of low-lignin feedstocks (Chen and Dixon, 2007; Hisano *et al.*, 2009).

### Evolution and biosynthesis of lignin

It is widely accepted that the adaptation of vascular plants to terrestrial habitats was made possible by lignin (Figure 1), which provides structural support and affiliated traits required for an erect growth habit (Jones *et al.*, 2001). Lignin, once believed to be limited to vascular plants, has recently been discovered in the bryophyte *Marchantia polymorpha* (Espineira *et al.*, 2011). Gene network studies have revealed the earliest appearance of the monolignol biosynthetic gene families in the moss *Physcomitrella patens*, but lignin and lignin monomers have not been found (Xu

et al., 2009). Studies by Martone et al. (2009), however, have identified the existence of secondary walls and lignin in the marine red alga Calliarthron cheilosporioides through derivatization followed by reductive cleavage (DFRC), a β-O-4 linkage specific lignin analysis technique. The relevant pathways might have evolved more than one billion years ago, prior to the divergence of red and green algae, or have developed convergently in C. cheilosporioides and land plants (Martone et al., 2009). The presence of syringyl monomers (S-lignin) in the lignin polymer, which was thought to be a unique characteristic of angiosperms, has been found in some lycophytes (Selaginella), ferns (Dennstaedtia bipinnata), and gymnosperms (Podocarpus macrophyllus and Tetraclinis articulate). Thus, it might have evolved independently among plant taxa (Espineira et al., 2011; Martone et al., 2009). The discovery of a novel ferulate 5-hydroxylase (F5H) in Selaginella, which is structurally distinct from the angiosperm F5H, supports the hypothesis that the enzyme evolved independently at least twice (Weng et al., 2008a). It is interesting to note that Ginkgo biloba cell suspension cultures have the ability to synthesize S-lignin, a trait not observed in its woody tissues (Uzal et al., 2009).

Lignin, the second most abundant polymer in nature, functions as inter- and intramolecular adhesive, providing rigidity to secondary cell walls and the plant body (Boerjan *et al.*, 2003; Jones *et al.*, 2001). Lignin is formed via oxidative coupling of three p-hydroxyphenylpropanoids, namely *p*-coumaryl, coniferyl,



**Figure 1** Evolution of lignin biosynthesis. Phylogenetic tree depicting the evolution of monolignols across major plant phyla (Weng and Chapple, 2010). Hollow circles indicate absence of lignin, orange circles indicate plants with H-lignin and G-lignin, and red circles indicate plants with S-lignin, G-lignin, and H-lignin. The presence of red circles more than once in the evolutionary tree indicates convergent evolution of S-lignin in *Selaginella* and angiosperms. Image used with permission from John Wiley & Sons, Inc.



**Figure 2** Diagram of the current accepted model of monolignol biosynthesis for *p*-coumaryl, coniferyl, and sinapyl alcohol in angiosperms including the newly identified enzyme caffeoyl shikimate esterase (Vanholme *et al.*, 2013b). The abbreviations: *PAL*, phenylalanine ammonia-lyase; *C4H*, cinnamate 4-hydroxylase; *CSE*, caffeoyl shikimate esterase; *4CL*, 4-coumarate:CoA ligase; *C3H*, *p*-coumarate 3-hydroxylase; *HCT*, *p*-hydroxycinnamoyl-CoA:quinate/ shikimate *p*-hydroxycinnamoyltransferase; *CCoAOMT*, caffeoyl-CoA *O*-methyltransferase; *CCR*, cinnamoyl-CoA reductase; *F5H*, ferulate 5-hydroxylase; *COMT*, caffeic acid *O*-methyltransferase; and *CAD*, cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase.

and sinapyl alcohols, which produce p-hydroxyphenyl (H), guaiacyl (G), and syringyl (S) units (Figure 2) (Nove-Uzal et al., 2012). The relative quantity of each component varies by species, organ, and growth stage (Hisano et al., 2009). The lignin polymer in dicots is primarily composed of G and S monolignol units with trace amounts of H units. Similar to dicot lignin, G and S units are the main components of monocot lignin; however, monocot lignin tends to incorporate a higher proportion of H units than dicot lignin. Gymnosperm lignin is made up of almost entirely G units (Boerjan et al., 2003; Gross, 1980). Biosynthesis of monolignols followed by their polymerization are the two main steps in lignin biosynthesis (Figure 2). Monolignol biosynthesis is thought to be highly conserved among angiosperm taxa, at least in its basic layout. The deamination of phenylalanine to produce cinnamic acid in the presence of phenylalanine ammonia-lyase (PAL) followed by the conversion of cinnamic acid to p-coumaric acid by cinnamate 4-hydroxylase (C4H) are the initial steps in the monolignol biosynthesis pathway. Following this conversion,

*p*-coumaric acid undergoes a series of hydroxylation and methylation reactions that lead to the downstream production of the monolignols (Humphreys and Chapple, 2002) (Figure 2). Characterization of most of the enzymes in the monolignol biosynthesis pathway, along with the identification of various intermediates and precursors, has led to the discovery of pathways for further hydroxylation and methylation steps (Humphreys and Chapple, 2002; Ye *et al.*, 1994). The quantity of various monolignols produced in the earlier steps of lignin biosynthesis is the main determinant of the lignin polymer structure and is dependent on the plant species, cell type, and developmental stage.

# Lignin manipulation in monocot and dicot species

Plants that have received considerable interest as potential biofuel feedstocks include monocot perennial grasses such as switchgrass

*Miscanthus*, and sugarcane (*Saccharum* spp.), as well as the dicot species, poplar (Populus spp.), and alfalfa (Medicago sativa L.). Monocot and dicot species each have distinct cell walls which differ from each other in the types and amounts of structural polysaccharides present, how the polysaccharides are linked, and in the abundance of proteins and phenolics (Vogel, 2008). In particular, the relative abundance and composition of the noncellulosic components, specifically hemicellulose and pectin, tend to differ between the two. Dicot and noncommelinoid monocot cell walls have type I cell walls, in which the cellulose microfibrils are cross-linked with xyloglucans and surrounded by a matrix of pectins and proteins. Type II cell walls, which are found in grasses and other commelinoid monocot species, are characterized by cross-links with glucoarabinoxylans and contain higher levels of phenolic acids such as hydroxycinnamates (McCann and Carpita, 2008; Shedletzky et al., 1992; Vogel, 2008). Despite these compositional and structure differences, the lignin pathway is considered to be highly conserved across plant species, and similar trends resulting from lignin modification can be observed among monocots and dicots. For example, approaches for manipulating lignin in alfalfa (Chen and Dixon, 2007; Guo et al., 2001) have been transferable to the monocot species, switchgrass, and sugarcane (Fu et al., 2011a; Jung et al., 2012). The next section will discuss various biotechnological methods for manipulating lignin biosynthesis in important model species and potential bioenergy crops, specifically focusing on how these approaches could be utilized for improving cell wall saccharification and biofuel yields in commercially relevant monocot and dicot species.

#### Cornucopia of choices for lignin modifications

The genes in the lignin biosynthesis pathway have been identified (Bonawitz and Chapple, 2010; Vanholme et al., 2012; Weng and Chapple, 2010). More than ten enzymatic conversions are involved in monolignol synthesis, each step representing a potential target for lignin manipulation by down-regulation or overexpression of the enzyme involved in its catalysation. Polymerization of the monolignols is catalysed by peroxidases and laccases (Berthet et al., 2011; Herrero et al., 2013; Lee et al., 2013); manipulating this process of monolignol polymerization is also considered to be a possible route for engineering lignin (Weng et al., 2008b). Another approach for altering lignin lies in the manipulation of regulators of lignin biosynthetic genes. The expression of monolignol biosynthesis genes are regulated by a series of transcription factors during secondary cell wall formation (Zhong et al., 2008, 2010), some of which can be manipulated to reduce carbon flow into lignin biosynthesis (Fornalé et al., 2010; Shen et al., 2012). MicroRNAs (miRNAs) that have been found to regulate certain aspects of plant development and lignification can also be manipulated to improve bioenergy-related traits (Rubinelli et al., 2013). It is clear that there are many biotechnological approaches that can be used to change lignin in cell walls given the large number of biosynthetic genes and regulators that are involved in lignin biosynthesis. Currently, we know more about the identity and functions of the lignin biosynthetic enzymes than the regulators of lignin biosynthesis. Several monolignol biosynthetic genes have been down-regulated in commercially relevant bioenergy crops to better understand their effect on lignin biosynthesis and saccharification (Table 1). Progress is being made towards identifying and characterizing the regulatory genes that might influence important bioenergy characteristics such as biomass yield and saccharification (Fu et al., 2012; Rubinelli et al., 2013; Weng et al., 2008b).

#### Manipulation of monolignol biosynthetic genes

Manipulation of genes in the monolignol biosynthesis pathway has a significant effect on total lignin and lignin composition. Depending on genes chosen for modification, part or all of the metabolite flux can be restricted for monolignol synthesis (Vanholme et al., 2012). A number of genes have been overexpressed or down-regulated in transgenic plants to understand their effect on lignin biosynthesis. The first enzyme of the phenylpropanoid pathway is PAL, and the general pathway ends with caffeoyl-CoA O-methyltransferase (CCoAOMT). Monolignolspecific biosynthesis starts with cinnamoyl-CoA reductase (CCR) (Figure 2). Down-regulation of genes that occur early in the phenylpropanoid pathway can reduce lignin content, but can also cause pleiotropic effects, such as stunted growth and collapsed vasculature (Bonawitz and Chapple, 2013). For example, in PALdown-regulated tobacco, the number and size of the vessels were reduced, which compromised vascular integrity of the transgenic plants (Korth et al., 2001). Allelic mutants of cinnamate 4-hydroxylase (C4H) had discrete effects on plant growth, lignin content, and the S : G monolignol ratio. The weakest Arabidopsis thaliana mutant not only had less lignin content, but also had the least yield penalty and was similar to wild-type plants (Schilmiller et al., 2009).

The lignin biosynthesis pathway enzyme 4-coumarate:CoA ligase (4CL) has been extensively studied. 4CL catalyses the conversion of *p*-coumaric and caffeic acids to their thio ester form in the phenylpropanoid pathway and takes part in the regulation of monolignol precursors, thereby controlling lignin content and composition (Saballos et al., 2012). 4CL down-regulation has been shown to have a positive, negative, or neutral effect on biomass production and can vary depending on the gene expression level and host species. For example, when 4CL was down-regulated in switchgrass, there was no change in biomass yield (Xu et al., 2011), whereas a negative relationship between the level of 4CL down-regulation and biomass production was observed in poplar (Voelker et al., 2010). In Populus tremuloides, the decrease in lignin as a result of 4CL down-regulation resulted in a relative increase in cellulose and enhanced growth (Hu et al., 1999). Decreases in lignin content caused by down-regulation of 4CL can be associated with increased saccharification efficiency in some species. For instance, in sorghum brown midrib2 mutants with mutations in the 4CL gene, an increase in glucose release efficiency of up to 17% was observed (Saballos et al., 2008, 2012). In 4CL-down-regulated switchgrass, transgenic plants yielded 57% more fermentable sugars than their controls following a dilute acid pretreatment (Xu et al., 2011).

Another series of conversions are catalysed by *p*-coumarate 3-hydroxylase (C3H) and *p*-hydroxycinnamoyl-CoA:quinate/shikimate *p*-hydroxycinnamoyltransferase (*HCT*). C3H catalyses the addition of hydroxyl groups at the meta-position of *p*-coumarate and is involved in the conversion of *p*-coumarate coA to caffeoyl coA. Hydroxycinnamoyltransferase catalyses the reactions before and after the addition of the 3-hydroxyl group (Hoffmann *et al.*, 2004). Hydroxycinnamoyltransferase down-regulation in alfalfa produced plants with stunted growth and decreased biomass production relative to their controls. Transgenic plants had lower lignin levels and altered lignin composition characterized by a decrease in both S and G units and an increase in *H* units (Shadle *et al.*, 2007). The recent identification of a rare natural mutant in

 Table 1
 A list of current and potential bioenergy crops in which lignin biosynthesis has been altered, leading to modifications to lignin content and/or composition and saccharification efficiency

Gene	Species	Lignin manipulation			Saccharification by enzymatic hydrolysis		
		Method of manipulation	Lignin content	S : G ratio	Pretreatment	Saccharification efficiency	References
4CL	Populus	AS	↓ 10%	Ļ	HW	NC	Voelker <i>et al.</i> (2010)
	Switchgrass	RNAi	↓ 17%–32%	$\downarrow$	DA	↑57%	Xu et al. (2011)
C4H	Alfalfa	AS	Ļ	Ļ	None DA	↑ ↑	Chen and Dixon (2007)
НСТ	Alfalfa	AS	Ļ	Î	None DA	↑ ↑	Chen and Dixon (2007)
СЗН	Alfalfa	AS	Ļ	Î	None DA	↑ ↑	Chen and Dixon (2007)
CCo-AOMT	Alfalfa	AS	Ļ	Î	None DA	NC ↑	Chen and Dixon (2007)
CCR	Populus	AS	↓ 5%–24%	NA	None DA A	↑ 14%–139% ↑ 19%–95% ↑ 11%–78%	Van Acker <i>et al.</i> (2014)
F5H	Alfalfa	AS	NC	Ļ	None DA	NC NC	Chen and Dixon (2007)
СОМТ	Alfalfa	AS	Ļ	Ļ	None DA	↑ ↑	Chen and Dixon (2007)
	Switchgrass (greenhouse-grown)	RNAi	↓ 6%–14%	$\downarrow$	None DA	↑ 29%–38% ↑ 17%–22%	Fu <i>et al.</i> (2011a)
	Switchgrass (field-grown)	RNAi	↓ 8%–15%	Ļ	HW	↑ 6%–34%	Baxter et al. (2014)
	Sugarcane (greenhouse-grown)	RNAi	↓ 4%–14%	$\downarrow$	None DA	↑ up to 29% ↑ 20%–34%	Jung <i>et al.</i> (2012)
	Sugarcane (field-grown)	RNAi	↓ 6%–12%	Ļ	DA	↑ 19%–32%	Jung <i>et al.</i> (2013)
CAD	Switchgrass	RNAi	↓ 14%–22%	$\downarrow$	None DA	↑ 19%–89% ↑ 19%–44%	Fu <i>et al.</i> (2011b)
	Switchgrass	RNAi	$\downarrow$	NA	А	↑2%-11%	Saathoff et al. (2011)
	Maize	RNAi	NC in stems, ↓ 6.4% in midribs	$\downarrow$	None	↑ 25% in stems, ↑ 16% in midribs	Fornalé <i>et al.</i> (2012)
MYB4	Switchgrass	OE	↓ 40%–50%	NC	None	↑ up to 250%	Shen <i>et al.</i> (2012)

Values represent per cent change relative to the control. ↑, increase and decrease.

AS, antisense-mediated down-regulation; RNAi, RNA interference-mediated down-regulation; and OE, overexpression; NA: not available; NC: no change; HW, hot water; DA, dilute acid; and A, alkaline; CAD, cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase; CCR, cinnamoyl-CoA reductase; COMT, caffeic acid O-methyltransferase; *C4H*, cinnamate 4-hydroxylase; *4CL*, 4-coumarate:CoA ligase; *C3H*, p-coumarate 3-hydroxylase; *CC-AOMT*, caffeoyl-CoA O-methyltransferase; *F5H*, ferulate 5-hydroxylase; *HCT*, p-hydroxycinnamoyl-CoA:quinate/shikimate *p*-hydroxycinnamoyltransferase; MYB4, myeloblastosis.

poplar with a premature stop codon in the HCT gene had a 17fold increase in H units over the wild type and showed no growth penalty. The G unit pool was significantly reduced in dormant, but not in actively growing, tissues (Vanholme *et al.*, 2013a). However, it is debatable whether these natural mutants can be utilized for modifying lignin without growth penalty, as the overall *H* unit content did not change due to the presence of the catalytic site leading to residual HCT activity.

The recent identification of an otherwise uncharacterized lignin biosynthesis gene, caffeoyl shikimate esterase (CSE), adds another step to the lignin biosynthesis pathway that can be manipulated (Vanholme *et al.*, 2013b). Studies with Arabidopsis cse T-DNA mutants suggest that CSE functions in the lignin biosynthetic pathway by catalysing the hydrolysis of caffeoyl shikimate to caffeate. Arabidopsis cse mutants had lower lignin levels and a higher proportion of H units which was associated with an increased saccharification efficiency of up to 75% over the wild type. One mutant exhibited a slower growth rate and reduced dry weight yield, while the other performed similar to the wild type. While manipulation of some genes in the general phenylpropanoid pathway can be associated with severe growth defects, identification and characterization of natural mutants can be useful in identifying novel genes that can be manipulated to reduce lignin content without significantly impacting biomass production. It is also important to consider that large increases in saccharification efficiency can compensate some losses in biomass production (Chen and Dixon, 2008).

Monolignol-specific pathway enzymes include CCR, F5H, caffeic acid *O*-methyltransferase (COMT), and cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase (CAD). Changes in the expression level of these genes directly affect the amount of lignin and/or the lignin composition (Boerjan *et al.*, 2003). The saccharification and/or ethanol yield of lignocellulosic biomass can be increased by down-regulating CCR, COMT, and CAD. For instance, down-regulation of CCR in poplar doubled the amount of cell wall sugars released by *Clostridium cellulolyticum* relative to the

nontransgenic parent (Boudet et al., 2003). Another study with poplar found that CCR down-regulation resulted in an ethanol yield increase of up to 161% in one line; however, a yield penalty was also observed, hypothesized to be a result of collapsed xylem vessels. Taking the yield decline into account, the increase in ethanol yield in this line was still 57% higher than the control (Van Acker et al., 2014). COMT is primarily involved in the synthesis of S-lignin, and its down-regulation is characterized by a decrease in total lignin content and a reduction in S units (Guo et al., 2001; Humphreys et al., 1999; Osakabe et al., 1999). Brown midrib mutant and transgenic grasses with suppressed COMT activity had improved saccharification efficiencies relative to controls, and in the case of switchgrass and bmr12 sorghum, higher ethanol yields (Dien et al., 2009; Fu et al., 2011a; Jung et al., 2012). Interestingly, COMT down-regulation can result in an incorporation of a novel monomer, derived from the COMT substrate 5-hydroxyconiferaldehyde, into the lignin polymer. In addition to the reduced lignin content and decreased S/G ratio, it is hypothesized that the incorporation of this monomer into the lignin structure may also contribute to the improved digestibility and/or saccharification that is often observed in COMT-downregulated plants through its effect on lignin cross-linking (Simmons et al., 2010). While yield reductions have been reported in COMT-deficient brown midrib mutants of maize (bm3) and sorghum (bmr12) (Lee and Brewbaker, 1984; Miller et al., 1983; Oliver et al., 2005), COMT down-regulation in transgenic switchgrass, maize, and perennial ryegrass (Lolium perenne) had no effect on growth or development (Fu et al., 2011a; Piguemal et al., 2002; Tu et al., 2010). In COMT-downregulated sugarcane, the transgenic line with the strongest reduction in lignin content (13.7%) exhibited a biomass yield reduction and thin stalks, whereas the transgenic lines with a moderate lignin reduction (3.9%-8.4%) showed normal growth and development compared with nontransgenic controls (Jung et al., 2012). The final step in the biosynthesis of monolignols is catalysed by CAD, which, when down-regulated, leads to an assimilation of hydroxycinnamaldehydes into the lignin polymer (Boerjan et al., 2003; Li et al., 2008). The involvement of CAD in lignin biosynthesis has been studied in several species including poplar, eucalyptus, switchgrass, maize, and Brachypodium (Bouvier d'Yvoire et al., 2013; Chabannes et al., 2001; Fornalé et al., 2012; Jackson et al., 2008; Lapierre et al., 2004; Ralph et al., 2001; Saathoff et al., 2011; Valerio et al., 2003). A reduction in CAD activity in transgenic and mutant lignocellulosic grasses resulted in reduced lignin content and modified lignin structure, which translated to improved saccharification efficiency in switchgrass and Brachypodium, and higher ethanol yield in maize (Bouvier d'Yvoire et al., 2013; Fornalé et al., 2012; Fu et al., 2011b; Saathoff et al., 2011). In the plants studied for downregulation of CAD, biomass production was not significantly affected. These studies signify the importance of down-regulating monolignol biosynthetic genes for reducing lignin content and improving saccharification efficiency. Unlike CCR, COMT, and CAD, manipulating the expression of F5H causes changes to the lignin composition without affecting the total lignin content. Some studies suggest that the lignin composition, specifically the S/G ratio, may be as or more influential than lignin content on the saccharification of pretreated biomass (Corredor et al., 2009; Li et al., 2010). F5H is a particularly important target for manipulating the S/G ratio as it controls partitioning between the synthesis of coniferyl and sinapyl alcohols and is the main enzyme responsible for S-lignin production. Consequently, overexpression

of F5H in poplar led to an increase in S-lignin and no change in total lignin content (Stewart et al., 2009), while the lignin of Arabidopsis mutants deficient in F5H was found to be comprised almost entirely of G units (Marita et al., 1999; Meyer et al., 1998). Although no change in total lignin content was observed, transgenic poplar with overexpression of F5H were more digestible and had improved pulping performance relative to control, which was attributed to the increased S monomer content (Huntley et al., 2003). Similarly, Arabidopsis plants with overexpression of F5H driven by a C4H promoter had lignin that was comprised of over 90% S units, resulting in an improved saccharification efficiency relative to the control following a hot water pretreatment. In alfalfa, down-regulation of F5H decreased the S/G ratio without affecting the lignin content, and no change in saccharification efficiency of pretreated biomass was observed (Chen and Dixon, 2007).

After monolignols are produced, they are oxidized and combined by coupling to form lignin polymers (Vanholme et al., 2008). Laccases have been suggested to play a role in this oxidation process. To better understand the role of laccases in lignification, Berthet et al. (2011) analysed lignin profiles of laccase T-DNA insertion mutants of Arabidopsis. Two genes, LAC4 and LAC17, were identified as playing a role in lignification in Arabidopsis. They observed that LAC4 and LAC17 mutants had lower lignin levels and that the deposition of G-lignin was influenced by a lac17 mutation. Interestingly, double mutants of lac4 and lac17 had significantly reduced lignin levels and no growth defects under normal growth conditions. The double mutants also had increased saccharification, even though saccharification efficiency of lac17 plants was similar to that of controls. Sugarcane laccase SofLAC was able to complement the Arabidopsis lac17 mutation and restore lignin levels to those comparable to wild-type plants (Cesarino et al., 2013). The results of this study suggest that manipulating the expression of laccases involved in lignification could provide another route for increasing cell wall saccharification (Berthet et al., 2011).

## Manipulation of transcription factors of lignin biosynthetic genes

Expression of genes in the monolignol biosynthetic pathway is regulated by R2R3-type transcription factors (TFs) which have the MYB DNA binding domain (Rogers and Campbell, 2004; Stracke et al., 2001). Manipulation of these transcription factors can have a dramatic effect on lignin content and composition as these TFs can regulate several genes at once. MYB TFs bind to AC elements in promoters, which are rich in adenosine and cytosine residues. Most monolignol biosynthetic gene promoters contain these AC elements, which allows for xylem-specific expression (Bell-Lelong et al., 1997; Bevan et al., 1989; Mizutani et al., 1997). The Arabidopsis F5H promoter does not contain AC elements and is not regulated by SND1 (Ohman et al., 2013), while Medicago F5H promoter contains AC elements and is regulated by SND1 (Raes et al., 2003; Zhao et al., 2010). Secondary cell wall biosynthesis is regulated by master switches early in the monolignol biosynthetic pathway (Figure 3). SND1 and SND2 are NAC domain proteins which act to initiate monolignol biosynthesis (Hussey et al., 2011; Zhong et al., 2006, 2007, 2010). Eucalyptus EgMYB2, Pinus PtMYB1, PtMYB, and PtMYB8, and Poplar PtrMYB3, and PtrMYB20 act as transcriptional activators, while Eucalyptus EqMYB1, maize ZmMYB31 ZmMYB42, poplar PttMYB21a, and switchgrass PvMYB4 act as transcriptional repressors (Zhao and Dixon, 2011). Besides these biofuel crops,



**Figure 3** Lignin and secondary cell wall biosynthesis transcriptional regulatory network. *SND, VND, NST,* and its homologous act as master switches of secondary cell wall biosynthesis in different tissues. *MYB* transcription factors bind to AC elements in lignin biosynthesis gene promoters to regulate lignin biosynthesis and also bind to SMRE elements. The secondary cell wall master switches also bind to SNBE elements to regulate xylan synthesis. Cellulose synthesis is regulated by the *SND* and *MYB* homologous. Abbreviations: *SND*, secondary wall associated NAC domain protein; *NST, NAC* secondary wall thickening promoting factor; *VND*, vascular-related *NAC* domain; *F5H*, ferulate-5-hydroxylase; *SNBE*, secondary wall *NAC* binding element; and *SMRE*, secondary wall *MYB* responsive element. This figure is an expanded version of a published model (Zhong and Ye, 2012).

transcriptional activators and repressors have been identified in other species. For instance, in *Antirrhinum, AmMYB308* and *AmMYB330* repress the activity of *4CL, CAD,* and *C4H* genes, and Arabidopsis *AtMYB46, AtMYB83, AtMYB58/63,* and *AtMYB85, AtMYB61* act as activators (Zhao and Dixon, 2011). Overexpression of repressors can increase saccharification efficiency, but can have negative consequences on growth similar to that of monolignol gene down-regulation. For example, transgenic switchgrass plants with overexpression of PvMYB4 had reduced lignin content and up to a 250% increase in saccharification efficiency and biofuel production compared with the nontransgenic parent, but had a 40% reduction in plant height (Shen *et al.,* 2012, 2013).

Other known transcription factors involved in monolignol biosynthesis are basic helix-loop-helix (bHLH) and LIM (Lin11, Isl-1 and Mec-3 homeodomain proteins) transcription factors. Yan et al. (2013) analysed 13 different Sorghum bicolor bmr mutants and found a bHLH transcription factor, SbbHLH1, to be associated with the low-lignin brown midrib phenotype. The expression of SbbHLH1 in Arabidopsis resulted in significantly lower lignin content, a reduction in the expression of multiple lignin biosynthetic genes, and an up-regulation of several MYB transcription factors: MYB46, MYB83, MYB58, and MYB63. It was hypothesized that the repression of the monolignol biosynthetic genes in the presence of SbbHLH1 could activate the expression of the MYB TFs. Alternatively, SbbHLH1 may have combined with the MYB activator to repress lignin synthesis (Yan et al., 2013). The LIM family of TF members have been known to regulate some genes in the monolignol pathway (Kawaoka et al., 2000). LIM TFs have a consensus cysteine-rich protein sequence known as the LIM domain which binds to AC elements of monolignol biosynthetic gene promoters. Studies with tobacco by Kawaoka et al. (2000) have shown that NtLIM1 acts as weak activator of lignin genes to maintain a basal level of gene expression in the monolignol biosynthetic pathway. Suppression of NtLIM1 did not produce any abnormal growth phenotype, and even with a 27% decrease in lignin content, vessels did not collapse. One of the most desirable phenotypes for lignocellulosic biomass has been demonstrated in transgenic rice by the overexpression of Arabidopsis TF SHINE under the CaMV 35S promoter, which increased the cellulose content by 34%, decreased the total lignin content by 45%, and reduced the G-lignin content by 54%, without decreasing the biomass of the transformed plants (Ambavaram et al., 2011). Although many studies have been conducted with constitutive promoters, TFs can be powerful tools to perturb the lignin biosynthetic pathway, but the TFs must be carefully regulated themselves, say, by the use of tissue-specific promoters, or they could lead to undesirable pleiotropic effects in transgenic plants.

## Manipulation of regulatory factors that affect lignin biosynthesis

MicroRNAs (miRNAs) regulate various developmental programmes of plants. They have been found to regulate the expression of transcription factors that influence biomass yield, lignin content and composition, cell wall recalcitrance, and other characteristics important for biofuel production (Fu *et al.*, 2012; Rubinelli *et al.*, 2013). One such miRNA encoded by the maize

Corngrass1 (Ca1) gene that belongs to the miR156 class, targets the SQUAMOSA PROMOTER BINDING LIKE (SPL) family of transcription factors, and supports the development of juvenile morphology with reduced lignification of cell walls (Rhoades et al., 2002). The Cq1 gene has been constitutively expressed in poplar and switchgrass, where it reduced the lignin content and also had significant effects on plant architecture, including increased branching and reduced stature, which correlated with increasing expression of Cg1 (Chuck et al., 2011; Rubinelli et al., 2013). In switchgrass, Cq1 overexpression produced plants that had 250% more starch than controls, resulting in a significantly higher glucose release (Chuck et al., 2011). Similar to Cg1 overexpression, the overexpression of the rice OsmiR156b precursor in switchgrass had dramatic effects on growth phenotype (Fu et al., 2012). Three classes of transgenic plant phenotypes were obtained from this study: high transgene overexpression resulted in severely dwarf plants, medium expressers had delayed flowering, less recalcitrance and more biomass, and low expressers of OsmiR156b had increased tillering but were otherwise similar to the nontransgenic parent switchgrass. Recently, an miRNA that targets laccases, miR397, has been identified in poplar. Twenty-nine PtrLACs were identified to be the PtrmiR397a. Overexpression of PtrmiR397a reduced lignin content without affecting the expression level of monolignol biosynthetic genes, suggesting that PtrmiR397 is involved in lignin polymerization (Lu et al., 2013).

To date, most bioenergy feedstock research targeting lignin has employed a single gene strategy, whereby genes were expressed or silenced using constitutive promoters. This research has been valuable to down select gene targets that might ultimately provide desired phenotypes, but no single experiment has yielded perfect phenotypes. It is clear that spatial and temporal regulation of multiple transgenes at 'sweet spot' expression levels will be needed to decrease or modify lignin in aboveground tissues for increased biofuel without negative pleiotropic effects. That said, constitutive promoter-driven transgenes have been heuristic for our increased understanding of the consequences of modifying lignin with regards to recalcitrance and plant performance.

#### **Consequences of lignin modification**

As shown above, there are numerous gene targets that can be manipulated to modify lignin biosynthesis and increase the saccharification efficiency, thereby producing plants that yield more biofuel per mass of feedstock. However, there can be negative effects associated with perturbing lignin in plants (Vermerris et al., 2010). For example, the high overexpression of PvMYB4 in transgenic switchgrass resulted in lower lignin and increased saccharification efficiency, but also led to shorter plant stature (Shen et al., 2012). Similarly, plants with reduced activity of C4H, C3H, HCT, or CCR are often dwarfed (Hoffmann et al., 2004; Reddy et al., 2005). Cell wall collapse in vasculature, which can lead to water conductance problems, might be one cause of dwarfism in lignin-altered plants. When linked with a significant enhancement in saccharification efficiency, moderate growth penalties might be tolerable, but extreme dwarfism or increased pest susceptibility would not be useful in agricultural fields.

The effect of lignin down-regulation on plant stress, such as response to pathogens, is just beginning to be understood. It is known that plants accumulate lignin and other related phenolics as a defence mechanism against pathogens (Hammond-Kosack

and Jones. 1996) and that its biosynthesis is strongly influenced by several biotic and abioic stresses (Moura et al., 2010). Recently, the role of specific monolignol genes in plant defence responses has been studied and several are hypothesized to be involved in disease resistance (Bi et al., 2011). For example, Tronchet et al. (2010) demonstrated that CAD-C and CAD-D, the primary CAD genes involved in Arabidopsis lignification, play an important role in the response of Arabidopsis to infection by the bacterial pathogen Pseudomonas syringae pv. tomato. While these studies suggest that lignin gene silencing could negatively impact disease resistance, a recent study demonstrated that this is not always the case. The down-regulation of the gene encoding HCT was associated with an increased tolerance to fungal infection and drought in alfalfa, which could possibly be due to crosstalk between lignin and salicylic acid biosynthesis (Gallego-Giraldo et al., 2011).

Clearly, we need to gain a better understanding of lignin's role in whole plant physiology in field settings. The generation of transgenic plants with a wide variety of lignin-associated transgenes will allow for transgene stacking using plant hybridization to better understand synergistic transgene effects, as will crossing transgenic plants into a variety of genetic backgrounds. Novel approaches are being developed to overcome some of the undesirable downstream effects of lignin modification, as demonstrated by a recent study in which the yield penalty was avoided using a tissue-specific promoter designed to decrease lignin content in fibre cells only, thus preventing vessel collapse (Yang et al., 2013). Tissue-specific promoters could also be used to regulate lignin production in tissues crucial for biofuel production, such as aboveground tissue in perennial grasses, while not perturbing lignin biosynthesis in roots. We also envisage the utilization of high-biomass germplasm which can be hybridized with low-lignin germplasm to decrease yield penalties associated with altering certain lignin biosynthesis genes. Certainly, biotechnology holds much promise to increase biofuel yield per hectare, but the fine-tuning of lignin biosynthesis will be needed to realize this promise.

#### Acknowledgements

This project was made possible through funding from USDA NIFA Biotechnology Risk Assessment Grants (BRAG) Program grant # 2010-39211-21699 and the BioEnergy Science Center, a Bioenergy Research Center supported by the Office of Biological and Environmental Research in the US Department of Energy Office of Science.

#### References

- Agbor, V.B., Cicek, N., Sparling, R., Berlin, A. and Levin, D.B. (2011) Biomass pretreatment: fundamentals toward application. *Biotechnol. Adv.* **29**, 675–685.
- Ambavaram, M.M.R., Krishnan, A., Trijatmiko, K.R. and Pereira, A. (2011) Coordinated activation of cellulose and repression of lignin biosynthesis pathways in rice. *Plant Physiol.* **155**, 916–931.
- Baxter, H.L., Mazarei, M., Labbe, N., Kline, L.M., Cheng, Q., Windham, M.T., Mann, D.G.J., Fu, C., Ziebell, A., Sykes, R.W., Rodriguez, M. Jr., Davis, M.F., Mielenz, J.R., Dixon, R.A., Wang, Z-Y. and Stewart, C.N. Jr. (2014) Two-year field analysis of reduced recalcitrance transgenic switchgrass. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, (in press), DOI: 10.1111/pbi.12195.
- Bell-Lelong, D.A., Cusumano, J.C., Meyer, K. and Chapple, C. (1997) Cinnamate-4-hydroxylase expression in *Arabidopsis* - Regulation in response to development and the environment. *Plant Physiol.* **113**, 729–738.

- Berlin, A., Balakshin, M., Gilkes, N., Kadla, J., Maximenko, V., Kubo, S. and Saddler, J. (2006) Inhibition of cellulase, xylanase and  $\beta$ -glucosidase activities by softwood lignin preparations. *J. Biotechnol.* **125**, 198–209.
- Berthet, S., Demont-Caulet, N., Pollet, B., Bidzinski, P., Cezard, L., Le Bris, P., Borrega, N., Herve, J., Blondet, E., Balzergue, S., Lapierre, C. and Jouanin, L. (2011) Disruption of *LACCASE4* and *17* results in tissue-specific alterations to lignification of *Arabidopsis thaliana* stems. *Plant Cell*, **23**, 1124–1137.
- Bevan, M., Shufflebottom, D., Edwards, K., Jefferson, R. and Schuch, W. (1989) Tissue-specific and cell-specific Activity of a phenylalanine ammonia-lyase promoter in transgenic plants. *EMBO J.* 8, 1899–1906.
- Bi, C., Chen, F., Jackson, L., Gill, B.S. and Li, W. (2011) Expression of lignin biosynthetic genes in wheat during development and upon infection by fungal pathogens. *Plant Mol. Biol. Rep.* **29**, 149–161.
- Boerjan, W., Ralph, J. and Baucher, M. (2003) Lignin biosynthesis. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 54, 519–546.
- Bonawitz, N.D. and Chapple, C. (2010) The genetics of lignin biosynthesis: connecting genotype to phenotype. *Annu. Rev. Genet.* **44**, 337–363.
- Bonawitz, N.D. and Chapple, C. (2013) Can genetic engineering of lignin deposition be accomplished without an unacceptable yield penalty? *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.* 24, 336–343.
- Boudet, A.M., Kajita, S., Grima-Pettenati, J. and Goffner, D. (2003) Lignins and lignocellulosics: a better control of synthesis for new and improved uses. *Trends Plant Sci.* **8**, 576–581.
- Bouvier d'Yvoire, M., Bouchabke-Coussa, O., Voorend, W., Antelme, S., Cézard, L., Legée, F., Lebris, P., Legay, S., Whitehead, C., McQueen-Mason, S.J., Gomez, L.D., Jouanin, L., Lapierre, C. and Sibout, R. (2013) Disrupting the cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase 1 gene (*BdCAD1*) leads to altered lignification and improved saccharification in *Brachypodium distachyon. Plant J.* **73**, 496–508.
- Cesarino, I., Araújo, P., Mayer, J.L.S., Vicentini, R., Berthet, S., Demedts, B., Vanholme, B., Boerjan, W. and Mazzafera, P. (2013) Expression of *SofLAC*, a new laccase in sugarcane, restores lignin content but not S: G ratio of Arabidopsis lac17 mutant. *J. Exp. Bot.* **64**, 1769–1781.
- Chabannes, M., Barakate, A., Lapierre, C., Marita, J.M., Ralph, J., Pean, M., Danoun, S., Halpin, C., Grima-Pettenati, J. and Boudet, A.M. (2001) Strong decrease in lignin content without significant alteration of plant development is induced by simultaneous down-regulation of cinnamoyl CoA reductase (*CCR*) and cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase (*CAD*) in tobacco plants. *Plant J.* **28**, 257–270.
- Chen, F. and Dixon, R.A. (2007) Lignin modification improves fermentable sugar yields for biofuel production. *Nat. Biotechnol.* **25**, 759–761.
- Chen, F. and Dixon, R.A. (2008) Genetic manipulation of lignin biosynthesis to improve biomass characteristics for agro-industrial processes. *In Vitro Cell. Dev. Biol. Anim.* 44, 528–529.
- Chuck, G.S., Tobias, C., Sun, L., Kraemer, F., Li, C.L., Dibble, D., Arora, R., Bragg, J.N., Vogel, J.P., Singh, S., Simmons, B.A., Pauly, M. and Hake, S. (2011) Overexpression of the maize *Corngrass1* microRNA prevents flowering, improves digestibility, and increases starch content of switchgrass. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **108**, 17550–17555.
- Converse, A.O., Ooshima, H. and Burns, D.S. (1990) Kinetics of enzymatic-hydrolysis of lignocellulosic materials based on surface-area of cellulose accessible to enzyme and enzyme adsorption on lignin and cellulose. *Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol.*, **24–5**, 67–73.
- Corredor, D.Y., Salazar, J.M., Hohn, K.L., Bean, S., Bean, B. and Wang, D. (2009) Evaluation and characterization of forage sorghum as feedstock for fermentable sugar production. *Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol.*, **158**, 164–179.
- Dien, B.S., Sarath, G., Pedersen, J.F., Sattler, S.E., Chen, H., Funnell-Harris, D.L., Nichols, N.N. and Cotta, M.A. (2009) Improved sugar conversion and ethanol yield for forage sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor* L. Moench) lines with reduced lignin contents. *Bioenergy Res.*, 2, 153–164.
- Espineira, J.M., Novo Uzal, E., Gomez Ros, L.V., Carrion, J.S., Merino, F., Ros Barcelo, A. and Pomar, F. (2011) Distribution of lignin monomers and the evolution of lignification among lower plants. *Plant Biol. (Stutt)*, **13**, 59–68.
- Fornalé, S., Shi, X., Chai, C., Encina, A., Irar, S., Capellades, M., Fuguet, E., Torres, J.-L., Rovira, P., Puigdomènech, P., Rigau, J., Grotewold, E., Gray, J. and Caparrós-Ruiz, D. (2010) ZmMYB31 directly represses maize lignin genes and redirects the phenylpropanoid metabolic flux. *Plant J.*, **64**, 633–644.

- Fornalé, S., Capellades, M., Encina, A., Wang, K., Irar, S., Lapierre, C., Ruel, K., Joseleau, J.P., Berenguer, J., Puigdomenech, P., Rigau, J. and Caparros-Ruiz, D. (2012) Altered lignin biosynthesis improves cellulosic bioethanol production in transgenic maize plants down-regulated for cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase. *Mol. Plant*, **5**, 817–830.
- Fu, C., Mielenz, J.R., Xiao, X., Ge, Y., Hamilton, C.Y., Rodriguez, M. Jr, Chen, F., Foston, M., Ragauskas, A., Bouton, J., Dixon, R.A. and Wang, Z.Y. (2011a) Genetic manipulation of lignin reduces recalcitrance and improves ethanol production from switchgrass. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **108**, 3803– 3808.
- Fu, C., Xiao, X., Xi, Y., Ge, Y., Chen, F., Bouton, J., Dixon, R. and Wang, Z.-Y. (2011b) Downregulation of cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase (*CAD*) Leads to improved saccharification efficiency in switchgrass. *Bioenergy Res.*, 4, 153– 164.
- Fu, C., Sunkar, R., Zhou, C., Shen, H., Zhang, J.-Y., Matts, J., Wolf, J., Mann, D.G.J., Stewart, C.N., Tang, Y. and Wang, Z.-Y. (2012) Overexpression of miR156 in switchgrass (*Panicum virgatum* L.) results in various morphological alterations and leads to improved biomass production. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, **10**, 443–452.
- Gallego-Giraldo, L., Jikumaru, Y., Kamiya, Y., Tang, Y. and Dixon, R.A. (2011) Selective lignin downregulation leads to constitutive defense response expression in alfalfa (*Medicago sativa* L.). *New Phytol.*, **190**, 627–639.
- Gross, G. (1980) The biochemistry of lignification. Adv. Bot. Res., 8, 25-62.
- Guo, D., Chen, F., Inoue, K., Blount, J.W. and Dixon, R.A. (2001) Downregulation of caffeic acid 3-O-methyltransferase and caffeoyl coA 3-O-methyltransferase in transgenic alfalfa: impacts on lignin structure and implications for the biosynthesis of G and S lignin. *Plant Cell*, **13**, 73–88.
- Hammond-Kosack, K.E. and Jones, J.D. (1996) Resistance gene-dependent plant defense responses. *Plant Cell*, **8**, 1773–1791.
- Herrero, J., Esteban-Carrasco, A. and Zapata, J.M. (2013) Looking for *Arabidopsis thaliana* peroxidases involved in lignin biosynthesis. *Plant Physiol. Biochem.*, **67**, 77–86.
- Hisano, H., Nandakumar, R. and Wang, Z.Y. (2009) Genetic modification of lignin biosynthesis for improved biofuel production. *In Vitro Cell. Dev. Biol. Plant*, **45**, 306–313.
- Hoffmann, L., Besseau, S., Geoffroy, P., Ritzenthaler, C., Meyer, D., Lapierre, C., Pollet, B. and Legrand, M. (2004) Silencing of hydroxycinnamoyl-coenzyme A shikimate/quinate hydroxycinnamoyl-transferase affects phenylpropanoid biosynthesis. *Plant Cell*, **16**, 1446–1465.
- Hu, W.J., Harding, S.A., Lung, J., Popko, J.L., Ralph, J., Stokke, D.D., Tsai, C.-J. and Chiang, V.L. (1999) Repression of lignin biosynthesis promotes cellulose accumulation and growth in transgenic trees. *Nature Biotechnol.*, **17**, 808– 812.
- Humphreys, J.M. and Chapple, C. (2002) Rewriting the lignin roadmap. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, **5**, 224–229.
- Humphreys, J.M., Hemm, M.R. and Chapple, C. (1999) New routes for lignin biosynthesis defined by biochemical characterization of recombinant ferulate 5-hydroxylase, a multifunctional cytochrome P450-dependent monooxygenase. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **96**, 10045–10050.
- Huntley, S.K., Ellis, D., Gilbert, M., Chapple, C. and Mansfield, S.D. (2003) Significant increases in pulping efficiency in C4H-F5H-transformed poplars: improved chemical savings and reduced environmental toxins. J. Agric. Food Chem., 51, 6178–6183.
- Hussey, S.G., Mizrachi, E., Spokevicius, A.V., Bossinger, G., Berger, D.K. and Myburg, A.A. (2011) *SND2*, a NAC transcription factor gene, regulates genes involved in secondary cell wall development in *Arabidopsis* fibres and increases fibre cell area in *Eucalyptus. BMC Plant Biol.*, **11**, 173.
- Jackson, L.A., Shadle, G.L., Zhou, R., Nakashima, J., Chen, F. and Dixon, R.A. (2008) Improving saccharification efficiency of alfalfa stems through modification of the terminal stages of monolignol biosynthesis. *Bioenergy Res.*, **1**, 180–192.
- Jones, L., Ennos, A.R. and Turner, S.R. (2001) Cloning and characterization of irregular xylem4 (irx4): a severely lignin-deficient mutant of Arabidopsis. *Plant J.*, **26**, 205–216.
- Jung, J.H., Fouad, W.M., Vermerris, W., Gallo, M. and Altpeter, F. (2012) RNAi suppression of lignin biosynthesis in sugarcane reduces recalcitrance for biofuel production from lignocellulosic biomass. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, **10**, 1067–1076.

- Jung, J.H., Vermerris, W., Gallo, M., Fedenko, J.R., Erickson, J.E. and Altpeter, F. (2013) RNA interference suppression of lignin biosynthesis increases fermentable sugar yields for biofuel production from field-grown sugarcane. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, **11**, 709–716.
- Kawaoka, A., Kaothien, P., Yoshida, K., Endo, S., Yamada, K. and Ebinuma, H. (2000) Functional analysis of tobacco LIM protein Ntlim1 involved in lignin biosynthesis. *Plant J.*, **22**, 289–301.
- Keating, J.D., Panganiban, C. and Mansfield, S.D. (2006) Tolerance and adaptation of ethanologenic yeasts to lignocellulosic inhibitory compounds. *Biotechnol. Bioeng.*, **93**, 1196–1206.
- Korth, K.L., Blount, J.W., Chen, F., Rasmussen, S., Lamb, C. and Dixon, R.A. (2001) Changes in phenylpropanoid metabolites associated with homology-dependent silencing of phenylalanine ammonia-lyase and its somatic reversion in tobacco. *Physiol. Plant.*, **111**, 137–143.
- Kumar, P., Barrett, D.M., Delwiche, M.J. and Stroeve, P. (2009) Methods for pretreatment of lignocellulosic biomass for efficient hydrolysis and biofuel production. *Ind. Eng. Chem. Res.*, **48**, 3713–3729.
- Lapierre, C., Pilate, G., Pollet, B., Mila, I., Leple, J.-C., Jouanin, L., Kim, H. and Ralph, J. (2004) Signatures of cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase deficiency in poplar lignins. *Phytochemistry*, **65**, 313–321.
- Lee, M.H. and Brewbaker, J.L. (1984) Effects of brown midrib-3 on yields and yield components of maize. *Crop Sci.*, **24**, 105–108.
- Lee, D., Yu, A.H.C., Wong, K.K.Y. and Saddler, J.N. (1994) Evaluation of the enzymatic susceptibility of cellulosic substrates using specific hydrolysis rates and enzyme adsorption. *Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol.*, **45–6**, 407–415.
- Lee, Y., Rubio, M.C., Alassimone, J. and Geldner, N. (2013) A mechanism for localized lignin deposition in the endodermis. *Cell*, **153**, 402–412.
- Li, X., Weng, J.K. and Chapple, C. (2008) Improvement of biomass through lignin modification. *Plant J.*, **54**, 569–581.
- Li, X., Ximenes, E., Kim, Y., Slininger, M., Meilan, R., Ladisch, M. and Chapple, C. (2010) Lignin monomer composition affects Arabidopsis cell-wall degradability after liquid hot water pretreatment. *Biotechnol. Biofuels*, **3**, 27.
- Lu, S., Li, Q., Wei, H., Chang, M.J., Tunlaya-Anukit, S., Kim, H., Liu, J., Song, J., Sun, Y.H., Yuan, L., Yeh, T.F., Peszlen, I., Ralph, J., Sederoff, R.R. and Chiang, V.L. (2013) Ptr-miR397a is a negative regulator of laccase genes affecting lignin content in *Populus trichocarpa*. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **110**, 10848– 10853.
- Lynd, L.R., Laser, M.S., Bransby, D., Dale, B.E., Davison, B., Hamilton, R., Himmel, M., Keller, M., McMillan, J.D., Sheehan, J. and Wyman, C.E. (2008) How biotech can transform biofuels. *Nat. Biotechnol.*, **26**, 169–172.
- Marita, J., Ralph, J., Hatfield, R.D. and Chapple, C. (1999) NMR characterization of lignins in Arabidopsis altered in the activity of ferulate-5-hydroxylase. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, 96, 12328–12332.
- Martone, P.T., Estevez, J.M., Lu, F.C., Ruel, K., Denny, M.W., Somerville, C. and Ralph, J. (2009) Discovery of lignin in seaweed reveals convergent evolution of cell-wall architecture. *Curr. Biol.*, **19**, 169–175.
- McCann, M.C. and Carpita, N.C. (2008) Designing the deconstruction of plant cell walls. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, **11**, 314–320.
- McLaughlin, S.B., De La Torre Ugarte, D.G., Garten, C.T., Lynd, L.R., Sanderson, M.A., Tolbert, V.R. and Wolf, D.D. (2002) High-value renewable energy from prairie grasses. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, **36**, 2122–2129.
- Meyer, K., Shirley, A.M., Cusumano, J.C., Bell-Lelong, D.A. and Chapple, C. (1998) Lignin monomer composition is determined by the expression of a cytochrome P450-dependent monooxygenase in Arabidopsis. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **95**, 6619–6623.
- Miller, J.E., Geadelmann, J.L. and Marten, G.C. (1983) Effect of the brown midrib-allele on maize silage quality and yield. *Crop Sci.*, **23**, 493–496.
- Mizutani, M., Ohta, D. and Sato, R. (1997) Isolation of a cDNA and a genomic clone encoding cinnamate 4-hydroxylase from Arabidopsis and its expression manner in planta. *Plant Physiol.*, **113**, 755–763.
- Mosier, N., Wyman, C., Dale, B., Elander, R., Lee, Y.Y., Holtzapple, M. and Ladisch, M. (2005) Features of promising technologies for pretreatment of lignocellulosic biomass. *Bioresour. Technol.*, **96**, 673–686.
- Moura, J.C.M.S., Bonine, C.A.V., De Oliveira Fernandes Viana, J., Dornelas, M.C., Mazzafera, P. (2010) Abiotic and biotic stresses and changes in the lignin content and composition in plants. J. Integr. Plant Biol., 52, 360–376.

- Novo-Uzal, E., Pomar, F., Gómez-Ros, L.V., Espiñeira, J.M. and Barceló, A.R. (2012) Evolutionary history of lignins. *Adv. Bot. Res.*, **61**, 311–350.
- Öhman, D., Demedts, B., Kumar, M., Gerber, L., Gorzsás, A., Goeminne, G., Hedenström, M., Ellis, B., Boerjan, W. and Sundberg, B. (2013) MYB103 is required for ferulate 5-hydroxylase expression and syringyl lignin biosynthesis in Arabidopsis stems. *Plant J.*, **73**, 63–76.
- Oliver, A.L., Pedersen, J.F., Grant, R.J. and Klopfenstein, T.J. (2005) Comparative Effects of the Sorghum-6 and-12 Genes. *Crop Sci.*, **45**, 2234–2239.
- Osakabe, K., Tsao, C.C., Li, L., Popko, J.L., Umezawa, T., Carraway, D.T., Smeltzer, R.H., Joshi, C.P. and Chiang, V.L. (1999) Coniferyl aldehyde 5-hydroxylation and methylation direct syringyl lignin biosynthesis in angiosperms. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **96**, 8955–8960.
- Perlack, R.D. and Stokes, B.J. (leads). (2011) U.S. Billion-Ton Update: Biomass Supply for a Bioenergy and Bioproducts Industry. U.S. Department of Energy. ORNL/TM-2011/224. pp. 227. Oak Ridge, TN: Oak Ridge National Laboratory.
- Piquemal, J., Chamayou, S., Nadaud, I., Beckert, M., Barriere, Y., Mila, I., Lapierre, C., Rigau, J., Puigdomenech, P., Jauneau, A., Digonnet, C., Boudet, A.-M., Goffner, D. and Pichon, M. (2002) Down-regulation of caffeic acid o-methyltransferase in maize revisited using a transgenic approach. *Plant Physiol.*, **130**, 1675–1685.
- Propheter, J.L. and Staggenborg, S. (2010) Performance of annual and perennial biofuel crops: nutrient removal during the first two years. *Agron. J.*, **102**, 798–805.
- Raes, J., Rohde, A., Christensen, J.H., Van de Peer, Y. and Boerjan, W. (2003) Genome-wide characterization of the lignification toolbox in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol.*, **133**, 1051–1071.
- Ralph, J., Lapierre, C., Marita, J.M., Kim, H., Lu, F.C., Hatfield, R.D., Ralph, S., Chapple, C., Franke, R., Hemm, M.R., Van Doorsselaere, J., Sederoff, R.R., O'Malley, D.M., Scott, J.T., MacKay, J.J., Yahiaoui, N., Boudet, A.M., Pean, M., Pilate, G., Jouanin, L. and Boerjan, W. (2001) Elucidation of new structures in lignins of CAD- and COMT-deficient plants by NMR. *Phytochemistry*, **57**, 993–1003.
- Reddy, M.S.S., Chen, F., Shadle, G., Jackson, L., Aljoe, H. and Dixon, R.A. (2005) Targeted down-regulation of cytochrome P450 enzymes for forage quality improvement in alfalfa (*Medicago sativa* L.). *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **102**, 16573–16578.
- Rhoades, M.W., Reinhart, B.J., Lim, L.P., Burge, C.B., Bartel, B. and Bartel, D.P. (2002) Prediction of plant microRNA targets. *Cell*, **110**, 513–520.
- Rogers, L.A. and Campbell, M.M. (2004) The genetic control of lignin deposition during plant growth and development. *New Phytol.*, **164**, 17–30.
   Rubin, E.M. (2008) Genomics of cellulosic biofuels. *Nature*, **454**, 841–845.
- Rubinelli, P.M., Chuck, G., Li, X. and Meilan, R. (2013) Constitutive expression of the *Corngrass1* microRNA in poplar affects plant architecture and stem lignin content and composition. *Biomass Bioenergy*, **54**, 312–321.
- Saathoff, A.J., Sarath, G., Chow, E.K., Dien, B.S. and Tobias, C.M. (2011) Downregulation of cinnamyl-alcohol dehydrogenase in switchgrass by RNA silencing results in enhanced glucose release after cellulase treatment. *PLoS ONE*, 6, e16416.
- Saballos, A., Vermerris, W., Rivera, L. and Ejeta, G. (2008) Allelic association, chemical characterization and saccharification properties of brown midrib mutants of sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor* (L.) Moench). *Bioenergy Res.*, **1**, 193– 204.
- Saballos, A., Sattler, S.E., Sanchez, E., Foster, T.P., Xin, Z., Kang, C., Pedersen, J.F. and Vermerris, W. (2012) Brown midrib2 (Bmr2) encodes the major 4-coumarate:coenzyme A ligase involved in lignin biosynthesis in sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor* (L.) Moench). *Plant J.*, **70**, 818–830.
- Schilmiller, A., Stout, J., Weng, J., Humphreys, J., Ruegger, M. and Chapple, C. (2009) Mutations in the cinnamate 4-hydroxylase gene impact metabolism, growth and development in *Arabidopsis. Plant J.*, **60**, 771–782.
- Schmer, M.R., Vogel, K.P., Mitchell, R.B. and Perrin, R.K. (2008) Net energy of cellulosic ethanol from switchgrass. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **105**, 464–469.
- Shadle, G., Chen, F., Srinivasa Reddy, M.S., Jackson, L., Nakashima, J. and Dixon, R.A. (2007) Down-regulation of hydroxycinnamoyl CoA: shikimate hydroxycinnamoyl transferase in transgenic alfalfa affects lignification, development and forage quality. *Phytochemistry*, **68**, 1521–1529.
- Shedletzky, E., Shmuel, M., Trainin, T., Kalman, S. and Delmer, D. (1992) Cell Wall Structure in Cells Adapted to Growth on the Cellulose-Synthesis

Inhibitor 2, 6-Dichlorobenzonitrile: a Comparison between Two Dicotyledonous Plants and a Graminaceous Monocot. *Plant Physiol.*, **100**, 120–130.

- Shen, H., He, X., Poovaiah, C.R., Wuddineh, W.A., Ma, J., Mann, D.G., Wang, H., Jackson, L., Tang, Y., Stewart, C.N. Jr, Chen, F. and Dixon, R.A. (2012) Functional characterization of the switchgrass (*Panicum virgatum* L.) R2R3-MYB transcription factor *PvMYB4* for improvement of lignocellulosic feedstocks. *New Phytol.*, **193**, 121–136.
- Shen, H., Poovaiah, C.R., Ziebell, A., Tschaplinski, T.J., Pattathil, S., Gjersing, E., Engle, N.L., Katahira, R., Pu, Y., Sykes, R., Chen, F., Ragauskas, A.J., Mielenz, J.R., Hahn, M.G., Davis, M., Stewart, C.N. Jr and Dixon, R.A. (2013) Enhanced characteristics of genetically modified switchgrass (*Panicum virgatum* L.) for high biofuel production. *Biotechnol. Biofuels*, 6, 71.
- Simmons, B.A., Loqué, D. and Ralph, J. (2010) Advances in modifying lignin for enhanced biofuel production. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, **13**, 312–319.
- Stewart, J.J., Akiyama, T., Chapple, C., Ralph, J. and Mansfield, S.D. (2009) The effects on lignin structure of overexpression of ferulate 5-hydroxylase in hybrid poplar. *Plant Physiol.*, **150**, 621–635.
- Stracke, R., Werber, M. and Weisshaar, B. (2001) The R2R3-MYB gene family in *Arabidopsis thaliana. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, **4**, 447–456.
- Tronchet, M., Balague, C., Kroj, T., Jouanin, L. and Roby, D. (2010) Cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenases-C and D, key enzymes in lignin biosynthesis, play an essential role in disease resistance in *Arabidopsis. Mol. Plant Pathol.*, **11**, 83– 92.
- Tu, Y., Rochfort, S., Liu, Z., Ran, Y., Griffith, M., Badenhorst, P., Louie, G.V., Bowman, M.E., Smith, K.F., Noel, J.P., Mouradov, A. and Spangenberg, G. (2010) Functional analyses of caffeic acid O-methyltransferase and cinnamoyl-CoA-reductase genes from perennial ryegrass (*Lolium perenne*). *Plant Cell*, **22**, 3357–3373.
- Uzal, E.N., Ros, L.V.G., Pomar, F., Bernal, M.A., Paradela, A., Albar, J.P. and Barcelo, A.R. (2009) The presence of sinapyl lignin in *Ginkgo biloba* cell cultures changes our views of the evolution of lignin biosynthesis. *Physiol. Plant.*, **135**, 196–213.
- Valerio, L., Carter, D., Rodrigues, J.C., Tournier, V., Gominho, J., Marque, C., Boudet, A.M., Maunders, M., Pereira, H. and Teulieres, C. (2003) Down regulation of cinnamyl alcohol dehydrogenase, a lignification enzyme, in *Eucalyptus camaldulensis. Mol. Breed.*, **12**, 157–167.
- Van Acker, R., Leplé, J.C., Aerts, D., Storme, V., Goeminne, G., Ivens, B., Légée, F., Lapierre, C., Piens, K., Van Montague, M.C.E., Santoro, N., Foster, C.E., Ralph, J., Soetaert, W., Pilate, G. and Boerjan, W. (2014) Improved saccharification and ethanol yield from field-grown transgenic poplar deficient in cinnamoyl-CoA reductase. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **111**, 845–850.
- Vanholme, R., Morreel, K., Ralph, J. and Boerjan, W. (2008) Lignin engineering. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol., 11, 278–285.
- Vanholme, R., Demedts, B., Morreel, K., Ralph, J. and Boerjan, W. (2010a) Lignin biosynthesis and structure. *Plant Physiol.*, **153**, 895–905.
- Vanholme, R., Ralph, J., Akiyama, T., Lu, F., Pazo, J.R., Kim, H., Christensen, J.H., Van Reusel, B., Storme, V., De Rycke, R., Rohde, A., Morreel, K. and Boerjan, W. (2010b) Engineering traditional monolignols out of lignin by concomitant up-regulation of F5H1 and down-regulation of COMT in Arabidopsis. *Plant J.*, **64**, 885–897.
- Vanholme, R., Storme, V., Vanholme, B., Sundin, L., Christensen, J.H., Goeminne, G., Halpin, C., Rohde, A., Morreel, K. and Boerjan, W. (2012) A systems biology view of responses to lignin biosynthesis perturbations in *Arabidopsis. Plant Cell*, **24**, 3506–3529.
- Vanholme, B., Cesarino, I., Goeminne, G., Kim, H., Marroni, F., Acker, R., Vanholme, R., Morreel, K., Ivens, B. and Pinosio, S. (2013a) Breeding with rare defective alleles (BRDA): a natural *Populus nigra* HCT mutant with modified lignin as a case study. *New Phytol.*, **198**, 765–776.
- Vanholme, R., Cesarino, I., Rataj, K., Xiao, Y., Sundin, L., Goeminne, G., Kim, H., Cross, J., Morreel, K., Araujo, P., Welsh, L., Haustraete, J., McClellan, C., Vanholme, B., Ralph, J., Simpson, G.G., Halpin, C. and Boerjan, W. (2013b)

Caffeoyl shikimate esterase (CSE) is an enzyme in the lignin biosynthetic pathway in Arabidopsis. *Science*, **341**, 1103–1106.

- Vermerris, W., Sherman, D.M. and McIntyre, L.M. (2010) Phenotypic plasticity in cell walls of maize brown midrib mutants is limited by lignin composition. *J. Exp. Bot.*, **61**, 2479–2490.
- Voelker, S.L., Lachenbruch, B., Meinzer, F.C., Jourdes, M., Ki, C., Patten, A.M., Davin, L.B., Lewis, N.G., Tuskan, G.A., Gunter, L., Decker, S.R., Selig, M.J., Sykes, R., Himmel, M.E., Kitin, P., Shevchenko, O. and Strauss, S.H. (2010) Antisense down-regulation of *4CL* expression alters lignification, tree growth, and saccharification potential of field-grown poplar. *Plant Physiol.*, **154**, 874– 886.
- Vogel, J. (2008) Unique aspects of the grass cell wall. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.*, **11**, 301–307.
- Weng, J.-K. and Chapple, C. (2010) The origin and evolution of lignin biosynthesis. *New Phytol.*, **187**, 273–285.
- Weng, J.-K., Banks, J.A. and Chapple, C. (2008a) Parallels in lignin biosynthesis: a study in *Selaginella moellendorffii* reveals convergence across 400 million years of evolution. *Commun. Integr. Biol.*, **1**, 20–22.
- Weng, J.-K., Li, X., Bonawitz, N.D. and Chapple, C. (2008b) Emerging strategies of lignin engineering and degradation for cellulosic biofuel production. *Curr. Opin. Biotechnol.*, **19**, 166–172.
- Xu, Z.Y., Zhang, D.D., Hu, J., Zhou, X., Ye, X., Reichel, K.L., Stewart, N.R., Syrenne, R.D., Yang, X.H., Gao, P., Shi, W.B., Doeppke, C., Sykes, R.W., Burris, J.N., Bozell, J.J., Cheng, Z.M., Hayes, D.G., Labbe, N., Davis, M., Stewart, C.N. and Yuan, J.S. (2009) Comparative genome analysis of lignin biosynthesis gene families across the plant kingdom. *BMC Bioinformatics*, **10**, S3.
- Xu, B., Escamilla-Trevino, L.L., Sathitsuksanoh, N., Shen, Z., Shen, H., Zhang, Y.H.P., Dixon, R.A. and Zhao, B. (2011) Silencing of 4-coumarate:coenzyme A ligase in switchgrass leads to reduced lignin content and improved fermentable sugar yields for biofuel production. *New Phytol.*, **192**, 611–625.
- Yan, L., Xu, C., Kang, Y., Gu, T., Wang, D., Zhao, S. and Xia, G. (2013) The heterologous expression in Arabidopsis thaliana of sorghum transcription factor *SbbHLH1* downregulates lignin synthesis. *J. Exp. Bot.*, **64**, 3021–3032.
- Yang, F., Mitra, P., Zhang, L., Prak, L., Verhertbruggen, Y., Kim, J.S., Sun, L., Zheng, K., Tang, K., Auer, M., Scheller, H.V. and Loque, D. (2013) Engineering secondary cell wall deposition in plants. *Plant Biotechnol. J.*, **11**, 325–335.
- Ye, Z.H., Kneusel, R.E., Matern, U. and Varner, J.E. (1994) An alternative methylation pathway in lignin biosynthesis in *Zinnia. Plant Cell*, 6, 1427– 1439.
- Zhao, Q. and Dixon, R.A. (2011) Transcriptional networks for lignin biosynthesis: more complex than we thought? *Trends Plant Sci.*, **16**, 227– 233.
- Zhao, Q.A., Wang, H.Z., Yin, Y.B., Xu, Y., Chen, F. and Dixon, R.A. (2010) Syringyl lignin biosynthesis is directly regulated by a secondary cell wall master switch. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **107**, 14496–14501.
- Zhong, R. and Ye, Z.H. (2012) MYB46 and MYB83 bind to the SMRE sites and directly activate a suite of transcription factors and secondary wall biosynthetic genes. *Plant Cell Physiol.*, **53**, 368–380.
- Zhong, R.Q., Demura, T. and Ye, Z.H. (2006) SND1, a NAC domain transcription factor, is a key regulator of secondary wall synthesis in fibers of Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell*, **18**, 3158–3170.
- Zhong, R.Q., Richardson, E.A. and Ye, Z.H. (2007) Two NAC domain transcription factors, SND1 and NST1, function redundantly in regulation of secondary wall synthesis in fibers of *Arabidopsis. Planta*, **225**, 1603–1611.
- Zhong, R.Q., Lee, C.H., Zhou, J.L., McCarthy, R.L. and Ye, Z.H. (2008) A battery of transcription factors involved in the regulation of secondary cell wall biosynthesis in *Arabidopsis. Plant Cell*, **20**, 2763–2782.
- Zhong, R., Lee, C. and Ye, Z.-H. (2010) Functional characterization of poplar wood-associated NAC domain transcription factors. *Plant Physiol.*, **152**, 1044–1055.