

**MONTEREY BAY NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**FINAL
April 19, 2012
First Baptist Church
Salinas, CA**

The Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Advisory Council met on Thursday, April 19, 2012, in Salinas, California. Public categories and government agencies were present as indicated:

Agriculture: Kirk Schmidt
AMBAG: Lynn Robinson
At Large: Margaret "PJ" Webb
At Large: Cynthia Mathews

CA State Parks: Mat Fuzie
Conservation: Geoff Shester
Diving: Brian Nelson
Education: Simona Bartl

At Large: Richard Ely
Business & Industry: Cynthia Walter
CA Coastal Commission: Tami Grove – Absent
CA Dept. of Fish & Game: Paul Reilly
CA EPA: Russ Jeffries
CA Resources Agency: Amy Vierra - Absent

Commercial Fishing: Kathy Fosmark
Ports & Harbors: Steve Scheiblaue
Recreation: Gary Pezzi
Recreational Fishing: Rich Hughett
Research: Chris Harrold
Tourism: Bob Massaro

The following non-voting members were present as indicated:

Monterey Bay NMS - Paul Michel
Gulf of the Farallones NMS – Maria Brown
National Marine Fisheries Service – Steven Bograd

Alternates present in audience:
Conservation – Lauren Dockendorf

I. CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, AND MEETING MINUTES

Mayor Dennis Donohue welcomed the advisory council to the City of Salinas.

APPROVAL OF 2/16/12 DRAFT MEETING NOTES

The advisory council approved the February 16, 2012 meeting minutes with the following substantive changes:

- Page 2, under "Proposed Guidelines for Sanctuary Advisory Council Minutes", change the word "adding" in the second sentence to "removing".
- Page 4, under "Sanctuary Site Evaluation List Letter", add "and to follow the advisory council Charter and Protocols for member-generated items: that an analysis of the issue at hand accompany the draft letter." to the end of the motion.

MOTION: (Passed)

Motion introduced by Russ Jeffries, seconded by Richard Ely.
(Vote: 17 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions)

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE ELECTIONS

Secretary

Kirk Schmidt nominated Gary Pezzi as secretary. Gary accepted the nomination. There were no other nominations for secretary.

MOTION: (Passed)

Introduced by Russ Jeffries; seconded by Steve Scheiblaue
(Vote: 19 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstain)

Vice Chair

Steve Scheiblaue nominated Richard Ely as vice chair. Richard declined the nomination.

Cynthia Mathews nominated PJ Webb as vice chair. PJ accepted the nomination.

MOTION: (Passed)

Introduced by Russ Jeffries; seconded by Kirk Schmidt
(Vote: 19 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstain)

Chair

PJ Webb nominated Kirk Schmidt as chair. Kirk accepted the nomination. There were no other nominations for Chair.

MOTION: (Passed)

Introduced by Russ Jeffries; seconded by Steve Scheiblaue
(Vote: 19 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstain)

II. PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Amanda Wallner, Sierra Club, support examination of extending sanctuary boundaries.

Doug Kasunich, citizen of Monterey County, request sanctuary advisory committee become active concerning urban and agricultural runoff into MBNMS.

Ron Kabat – delivery of request for radio interview.

David Margulies, citizen, problems with tow surfing.

Scott Jarrett – PWC NOAA abuse

Tom Hafer, MBCFC, talk about sanctuary.

Sarah Hardgrave, City of Pacific Grove, harbor seals.

Eric Endersby, City of Morro Bay, is MBNMS commenting on PG&E's proposed Diablo Canyon offshore seismic testing?

III. ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS/AGENDA TOPICS/COMMENTS

Cynthia Mathews, Citizen At Large, announced the grand opening of the Sanctuary Exploration Center on July 23rd. She also announced there is still time to get your name on one of the donor benches in front of the Sanctuary Exploration Center.

Russ Jeffries, CA EPA, thanked Chris Harrold for his time chairing the advisory council over the last four years.

Geoff Shester, Conservation, announced that state assembly bill 1776 would designate the Pacific Leatherback sea turtle as the state reptile. There was a story in the LA Times this week showing some of the seafood fraud DNA testing that Oceana did finding over half of what was tested was mislabeled according to state and federal law. There is state senate bill 1486 that would help increase accurate labeling of seafood in the state. The PFMC on June 24th in San Mateo will be considering extending current protections on krill to some other similar, unmanaged forage species that are not subject to fisheries at this time. Oceana and MBNMS are finalizing a study about characterizing the hook and line based fishery for halibut in the sanctuary that is a result of some studies they did last summer.

Simona Bartl, Education, announced the Moss Landing Marine Laboratories Open House this weekend from 9 am-5 pm and it is free both days. Suggested topics for the future: water issues in the area, including desalination plants planned for the area at an upcoming meeting.

Paul Michel, MBNMS Superintendent, announced there will be an informational item on the August agenda regarding motorized personal watercraft. He emphasized that this item would be informational and that the rule is not up for review. He stated it was not appropriate for MBNMS to review the rule while there was an active enforcement. We also have a lot of new members who were not around during the seven-year discourse on that issue,

Paul also announced that Eric Schwaab, Assistant Secretary for NOAA, visited Monterey for a series of meetings. A Tourism breakfast was held in partnership with Ted Balestreri of the Cannery Row Company at the Portola Spa and Hotel. This breakfast has reenergized Paul's thinking of getting the business and tourism entities more involved. There was a resounding theme that there is a need for better connection to the sanctuary.

Also, Paul announced that the Sanctuary Currents Symposium was another success and highlighted the program for everyone. He noted there was only one advisory council member in attendance and that person traveled quite a distance. He encouraged advisory council members to attend this premier event next year.

Lastly, Paul echoed Russ' comments about Chris Harrold and his time as chair.

Chris Harrold, Research, stated it has been very gratifying to chair the advisory council these last four years. He commented that he received an 80-minute video called Ocean Frontiers and wanted to see about showing some of the movie during lunch. Paul Michel mentioned that the MBNMS was planning on showing the film the week before the BLUE Ocean Film Festival for the public. Chris also announced that the Annual SAC Summit was broken into two parts and the first part was a webinar that he attended. The gist of the webinar is that the ONMS office has a "Campaign of Engagement". The "Campaign of Engagement" idea is for ONMS to thrive nationally is that the program needs to be relevant to the issues of the day. Chris made a strong pitch that one of the ways ONMS can engage and be meaningful is to engage with the tourism and business community. Paul Michel also mentioned that it may be nice to have an agenda item

on the campaign to go over the elements of the campaign and what other sites are doing related to this.

Paul Reilly, CA Department of Fish and Game, our recreational Chinook salmon season opened a week ago. CDFG interviewed in Moss Landing 135 boats, 405 anglers, caught 544 salmon and released another 200. Department collected 174 heads that had a tag so they were tagged at a hatchery and can determine information about the fish. The fishery is doing really well. If any of you walk along Del Monte beach in the morning we are looking for volunteers to see if there are any grunion spawns.

Kathy Fosmark, Commercial Fishing, commented on the topic of Diablo Canyon seismic testing by PG&E. They are required to renew their permit for the power plant in that area. Fishermen are concerned about this process because the fish might not make it through the process.

Mat Fuzie, CA State Parks, last night was the first public meeting for the Carmel area general plan for state parks. We encourage your input in that process, which will be roughly a two year process culminating in an environmental impact statement and a general plan. Secondly, we continue to march towards a July 1st deadline for park closures. Parks in this area up for potential closure are Limekiln State Park, Garrapata State Park, Zmudowski State Beach and Moss Landing State Beach.

PJ Webb, Citizen At Large, the Sanctuary Currents Symposium was fantastic. The house was packed and it was great to see all these students participating. She congratulated the panel that put the event on. The comment period for the impacts statement on the PG&E acoustic seismic studies is today in San Luis Obispo, however written comments deadline is May 3rd. She would be happy to send anyone who is interested the link of where to send written comments. She encouraged everyone to review the impacts and provide a comment. The northern portion of the study that was in the sanctuary has been dropped, but the effects of the testing will spillover into the sanctuary. May 5th is Snapshot Day where volunteers go out and take water samples throughout the sanctuary and other parts of California. She also announced that she and others are gearing up for the Coastal Discovery Center Fair in July.

Rich Hughett, Recreational Fishing, commented that the opening of the Chinook salmon season was a great opening for recreational fishing. His only concern when they got into Monterey there was no one there. The F&G Department made a tape awhile back about the problems with wardens. We've lost a lot of wardens. If anyone would like a DVD to keep, let me know. It is really interesting to see what wardens are up against. Lastly, if you have not seen the movie, Bag It, you need to see it.

Steve Scheiblaue, Harbors, announced that his office went through the process of obtaining permits to dredge Monterey harbor. They bought their own dredge and trained a crew to run it. They finished the first phase of dredging. They accomplished dredging 10,000 cubic yards this winter. Paul Michel commented that we often hear, especially in the context of sanctuary expansion, that "you can't do anything in a sanctuary," and that is far from the truth. Here is an example of a harbor able to dredge despite the hyperbole to the contrary.

Bob Massaro, Tourism, announced the Pacific Grove City Council voted to support a desalination project.

Gary Pezzi, Recreation, announced that the Surfing Museum in Santa Cruz will be hosting festivities on April 27th and 28th to highlight the announcement of Santa Cruz as a world surfing reserve.

Cynthia Walter, Business/Industry, announced that her restaurant, Passionfish, will be having their second fundraiser with Plastic Pollution Coalition on May 3rd. The guest speaker will be the Green Shiek. This fundraiser will bring awareness to plastics and how it affects our ocean environment.

Brian Nelson, Diving, announced that he and Nicole Capps, Advisory Council Coordinator, would be manning a MBNMS booth and providing presentations at the Dive Expo on May 12th-13th at the Santa Clara County Convention Center.

Cynthia Mathews, Citizen At Large, effort in Santa Cruz to support the designation of the site of the original O'Neill Surf Shop as a state historical point of interest.

Lauren Dockendorf, Conservation, announced that this coming weekend is Earth Day. Save Our Shores is celebrating with beach cleanups from 10 am– 12 am. She also announced that Santa Cruz County and Monterey County have passed their plastic bag bans that will go into effect later this year. PJ Webb stated that San Luis Obispo passed a plastic bag ban as well.

IV. SITE EVALUATION LIST (SEL) LETTER

PJ Webb and Geoff Shester presented the letter they drafted regarding reactivation of the Site Evaluation List. After some discussion the advisory council agreed to make changes to the letter over lunch and bring the revised letter back for review after lunch.

Public Comment: (speaker cards)

Amanda Wallner, Sierra Club, supportive of sending letter and reactivating the list.

Jeremiah O'Brien, Morro Bay Commercial Fisherman's Organization, not in favor of bringing list back at this time and is in favor of removing Morro Bay from the list.

Eric Endersby, City of Morro Bay, City's opposition to SEL activation or sanctuary designation in SLO County waters.

Bill Blue, CCSGA, oppose reactivating SEL.

Rob Seitz, F/V South Bay, additional sanctuary is unnecessary. Could negatively impact my fishery. I am already fishing sustainably – 100% observer coverage, EFH's, RCA's MPA's.

Sarah Damron, Surfrider Foundation, Surfrider Foundation and 49 other national and local organizations, governments, and individuals across the U.S. support reactivation of the Site Evaluation List.

Tom Roff, taxpayer and Morro Bay fisherman, can we afford SEL?

Lori French, commercial fishing, job killer.

Bonnie VanHise, Representative Sam Farr's office, pro.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Advisory council member comments consisted of concerns over the budget for new sanctuaries and if the reactivation of the SEL meant that sanctuaries could be expanded.

Paul Michel clarified that sanctuaries could be expanded now and did not necessarily need reactivation of the SEL to happen before a sanctuary could expand. He also clarified that if the SEL was reactivated that the moratorium on new sites had to be lifted as well for new sanctuaries to be designated.

There were three motions to send this letter:

1st MOTION: (Continued)

To send the letter as presented to the advisory council by the drafters of the letter.

Introduced by PJ Webb; seconded by Geoff Shester
(8 in favor, 6 opposed, 5 abstentions)

2nd MOTION: (Passed)

Redraft the letter over lunch, using Secretary John Laird's letter, and bring back to the advisory council just after lunch.

Introduced by Cynthia Matthews, seconded by Gary Pezzi
(13 in favor, 2 opposed, 2 abstentions)

3rd MOTION: (Passed)

To send the revised letter in support of reactivation of the SEL to Secretary of Commerce John Bryson, NOAA Administrator Dr. Jane Lubchenco, and ONMS Director Dan Basta.

Introduced by Paul Reilly; seconded by Gary Pezzi
(Vote: 13 in favor, 2 opposed, 3 abstentions)

The approved letter and cover memo may be viewed at
<http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/sacact.html>

V. LUNCH

VI. FORAGE SPECIES

Julie Thayer, Farallon Institute, provided an informational powerpoint presentation on the importance of forage fish species in the California current. Ms. Thayer's presentation may be viewed at <http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/120419/agenda.html>

Geoff Shester, Conservation, provided an informational presentation on the Conservation Working Group's forage species white paper.

Public Comment: (speaker cards)

Nicholas Naccari, Long Marine Lab, handed out two letters 1) Forage Fish Management letter from Marine Biologist Hannah Nevins – Long Marine Lab and 2) letter from Molly Richardson with Native Animal Rescue.

Dave Hope, citizen, need for conservation.

Richard Parrish, retired NMFS, comparison of Lenfest data on California Current fisheries and elsewhere in the world.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Advisory council member comments consisted of cautions over the advisory council going down this path, caution over how the advisory council devotes its' resources towards fishing issues, and the encouragement to fishermen to establish a fishing working group.

VII. WORKING GROUP UPDATES

Conservation Working Group (CWG)

Geoff Shester requested the working group updates be moved directly after public comment in the morning.

Geoff handed out a statement to the advisory council covering topics from the last CWG meeting. The CWG is glad to see the forage fish species item on the advisory council agenda. At their last meeting the CWG covered the five-year review of Essential Fish Habitat by the Pacific Fishery Management Council. The CWG received an update from sanctuary staff regarding recent staff meetings with current participants in the bottom trawl fishery.

Advisory council members requested they receive all working group statements well in advance of advisory council meetings.

Sanctuary Education Panel (SEP)

Simona Bartl stated the SEP is still in the process of working on a survey for formal and informal educators to so the SEP can link with them and provide them with the best resources they can. The SEP has been rotating where they meet in Pacific Grove, the Sanctuary Exploration Center, and the Seymour Center. The next item on their agenda will be to look at storyboarding ideas for the Your Sanctuary TV series to see how the SEP can make that more relevant to give to educators. They will also discuss the High CO2 conference that will be held in Monterey, which Simona will send a link to the conference to advisory council members. The SEP is working on getting their agendas and minutes on the website.

Research Activities Panel (RAP)

Chris Harrold announced that the RAP held their last meeting at USGS in Santa Cruz. USGS has a lot of research programs and there is a California water science center. Their mission is for planning, use and management. The second program is the Biological Resources Division. The RAP received a brief update on Essential Fish Habitat and the gist of that was the Pacific Fishery Management Council deadline for review has been postponed and therefore the open house at the MBNMS was held on April 10th. They had a presentation from Phil Levin on the Integrated Ecosystem Assessment. The premise is there is all this data on ecosystem structure and fishery status, which data rich but analysis poor. There is an effort to synthesize this data.

VIII. SAN FRANCISCO EXEMPTION AREA

Maria Brown, Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) Superintendent, announced that the GFNMS looking at possibly including the San Francisco Exemption Area of the MBNMS into the sanctuary.

Advisory Council Member Discussion:

Advisory council member questions consisted of what specific role does staff anticipate the advisory councils playing in this process, has there been an increase in the San Francisco outfall since the sanctuary's been created, and has the City of San Francisco weighed in on this.

IX. ECOSYSTEM BASED MANAGEMENT INITIATIVE (EBMI)

Paul Michel announced that the EBMI would not longer move forward in the way it has been laid out to the advisory council at past meetings. MBNMS staff will still be working closely with the Pacific Fishery Management Council on the Essential Fish Habitat and will still be involved in NOAA's Integrated Ecosystem Assessment and the Natural Resource Assessment.

Advisory Council Member Comments:

Advisory council member comments showed mixed emotions for stopping the EBM Initiative. Advisory council members acknowledged the amount of time MBNMS staff invested in this process and did not want to see those efforts, along with that of the advisory council, lost. Staff was also advised to put together an EBMI report.

X. SUPERINTENDENT'S REPORT

Paul highlighted several items of interest that MBNMS staff has worked on since the last advisory council meeting. One major accomplishment was that the Your Sanctuary TV show taped a recent episode with Secretary of Defense Leon Panetta, who was a strong supporter of sanctuary designation. Paul also stated that MBNMS would amend the most recent office report to remove the item of the City of Pacific Grove and the harbor seal fencing based on the public comment provided earlier in the day.

XI. ADJOURN

Submitted by Nicole Capps, Sanctuary Advisory Council Coordinator
Meeting adjourned at 3:06 pm