



**GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS)
ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING**

GGNRA Headquarters
San Francisco
9:30 a.m. – 3:45 p.m.
Thursday, November 10, 2011

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA

Advisory Council Chair, Richard Charter, called the meeting to order at 9:48am.

Copies to:

Bill Douros ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Review Agenda

Joint Meeting with Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council– The council will have a joint meeting with Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) Advisory Council as necessary, or once every other year. Superintendent Brown, or her alternate, will attend MBNMS council meetings, and be placed on the council meeting agenda. GFNMS will also put the MBNMS staff on their council meeting agenda.

Swearing-In of New Council Member – Chris Andrews is no longer with the Cal Academy of Sciences and is therefore declining the education alternate seat. GFNMS will be doing another seat recruitment in the near future.

Superintendent's Report –

Permits –

- An education permit was issued to John Dresser of Wacky Jacky for eco-tours to the Farallones. Passengers will be topside only. There will be no cage diving.
- An education permit was issued to Jane Reifert of Incredible Adventures for eco-tours to the Farallones. Ms. Reifert is currently making a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request for all GFNMS permits and has indicated that she plans to appeal her current permit. Ms. Reifert had originally requested a research permit, and wanted to attract sharks. This issue will be addressed in the Programmatic Environmental Assessment currently being drafted.
- An education permit was issued to James Moskito of Great White Adventures for eco-tours to the Farallones.
- A permit for salvage and recovery was issued to Stefan Galvez-Abadia of Cal-Trans for the Tomales Bay storm drainage project on Highway 1. Activities that may occur in the

sanctuary include the use of handheld equipment (such as wheelbarrows) on the tidal flats during low tide.

- An education permit has been issued to Chris Duba of Silver Fox for eco-tours to the Farallones. Passengers will be topside. There will be no cage diving.
- A research permit was issued to Brad Hanson from NMFS for orca research in the shipping lanes off of Point Reyes. Mr. Hanson will be installing a mooring to determine the occurrence of cetaceans, particularly southern resident killer whales, in the sanctuary near Point Reyes. The research is part of a larger effort to answer key questions on the southern resident killer whale movements and habitat use as needed for Critical Habitat designation mandated under the Endangered Species Act (ESA).
- Riley Smith from San Francisco State University will study the effect of natural and artificial outflows on sea stars in the shipping lanes off of Point Reyes. The sanctuary determined that a permit was not needed for this activity.
- A research permit is under review for Mischon Martin from Marin County Parks for invasive cord grass removal in Bolinas Lagoon using tarps.
- A research permit is under review for Barbara Block from Stanford University to maintain acoustic receivers that record data from tagged white sharks at the Farallon Islands, Año Nuevo, Tomales Point and Point Reyes. The Tagging of Pacific Predators (TOPP) permit expires Dec. 31, 2011. This request is to amend the existing permit to keep the acoustic receivers in the sanctuary while the Programmatic Environmental Assessment is being developed.
- Maria clarified that the use of chum and scent is prohibited in the sanctuary for attracting sharks for ecotours. There is no current use of either for these purposes in the sanctuary.

Media Reminder –

When advisory council members speak to media, they may not represent the council unless it has been agreed by the council that you will represent the group in an official capacity. If you are mentioning the advisory council it needs to be in relation to an action that has been decided by all council members, and you cannot allude that your opinion is the opinion of the entire council. If you speak to the media as an individual, you must tell the media that you speak only for yourself as a citizen.

Overflight Regulations

Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) overflight regulations are due out in December. Maria will forward that to council members once it has been released.

Events

- Heavenly Bodies and Harbor Lights kayak trip at Pillar Point Harbor on December 10th
- Sanctuary Lecture Series: Squid Soirée with Dr. Gilly from Stanford was a huge success. The event, held at the Randall Museum, was sold out.
- Mavericks surf contest window runs from December 1st to March 31st. This year, the contest is being led by Jeff Clarke. The sanctuary met with Jeff Clarke to notify him that permit issuance will be contingent upon the organizers communicating accurate information regarding sanctuary Motorized Personal Watercraft regulations. Harbor



Commission has approved a permit but has not been issued the permit yet. The sanctuary will not issue a permit until all the other agency permits are issued.

Bolinas Lagoon Restoration-

Restoration work on Bolinas Lagoon has begun on Highway One.

Our Coast-Our Future-

- Two workshops were held in August 2011 for managers to evaluate potential support tools for sea level rise adaptation and mitigation.
- Our Coast-Our Future was awarded a \$900,000 grant to extend the project into the San Francisco Bay.
- Welcome to the Benet Duncan. A new post doc with the sanctuary who is coordinating the development of a set climate change indicators for the region and a subsequent monitoring plan which will serve as the Research and Monitoring chapter of the Ocean Climate Initiative Action Plan.
- The Cal Academy Nightlife event featuring the 2010/11 California King Tide Initiative photos will be November 10, 2011.

Beyond the Golden Gate Research Symposium-

The research symposium had 160 participants. The website with all abstracts and power points from the presentations can be found at:

<http://www.sfbaynerr.org/ctp/beyondthegoldengate/index.php?pageid=28>

Council member questions - comments

- George Clyde inquired about current enforcement issues within NOAA. Maria provided information on two ship groundings within the sanctuary, as well as the US Coast Guard (USCG) Port Access Route Study (PARS) progress.

Member Reports –

- Jackie Dragon – The Joint Working Group on Vessel Strikes and Acoustic Impacts discussed asking the council to write a letter to the USCG encouraging them to implement the PARS recommendations. AB1112, the Oil Spill Preparedness was signed by Governor Brown. The bill provides increased funding to California for every barrel of oil that comes into the state. However, the bill has a sunset of three years
- Dominique Richard- Dominique gave an update on the science at the Beyond the Golden Gate Research Symposium. He also attended a presentation on the Marine Life Protection Act (MLPA) at Red Barn in Point Reyes. Several Beachwatch volunteers were also present.
- Dan Howard – Sanctuaries have entered into discussions with the National Park Service about creating a joint park/sanctuary displays and exhibits at the lighthouse. Laura Rodgers Bennett is working the harmful algal bloom along Sonoma coast. There has never been an abalone die off event like this, and there is a possibility that this was a toxic event rather than an anoxic event. More information can be found on the KWMR podcast at <http://cordellbank.noaa.gov/education/radiopodcast2011>. Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS) Advisory Council is recruiting for education and

fishing and Marin County At-Large seats. Additionally, the research coordinator position at Cordell is open and will be on USA Jobs in the coming months. Finally, CBNMS has a new PhD doing work on bottom habitat along the continental shelf.

- Pat Rutten- NOAA has a grant solicitation for collecting oral histories from fishing ports and marinas. He plans to use the sanctuary communication network to make contacts. Also, Pat will be attending a two day meeting on Blue Carbon with the idea to create a carbon tax credit to fund wetland restoration in the future. NMFS is in the final phase of COSCO BUSAN public comments and hoping that restoration funding will be available soon.
- George Clyde- George does a news program on KWMR that's often related to the sanctuary. George suggested making mitigation fees a condition of permitting. Superintendent Brown stated that ONMS is working on this.
- Frank Dean- Kelly's Cove surf competition had requested to use jet skis for the event. There is currently a prohibition on jet skis in park waters. The park did not allow jet skis in the water for the event, rather they were standing by if help was needed. Frank stated that all the organizers of the event were professional and understanding of the situation. The Park is working in parallel with the sanctuaries on FAA overflight regulations, particularly regarding touring overflights. Caltrans requesting to widen Highway 1 between Stinson and Muir Beach and the park is meeting with them to discuss the topic further. There have been two recent boat groundings at Baker Beach. The Park will be meeting with the USCG to discuss and try to get them more involved. Superintendent Brown added that the GFNMS would like to partner with the park on that item. The park is actively engaged with the city of SF and the event organizers for the America's Cup.
- Richard Charter- Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Foundation came to Bodega Bay and partnered with the Sonoma county group, Stewards of the Coast and Redwoods, and held a training for trainers on the Marine Life Protection Act. The five year (2012-2017) offshore drilling plan was announced by the Obama Administration. The proposal does not include any new sales off the Pacific coast.
- Cicely Muldoon- Point Reyes National Seashore is working on a project to increase on-site housing for researchers in the park. They are also discussing how to include Tomales Bay as part of Point Reyes National Seashore. The National Seashore is currently in its public comment period for Drakes Bay Oyster Company and should have the final Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) out in summer of 2012. But in November 2012, the oyster company's permits expire.
- Jaime Jahncke- PRBO Conservation Science has begun a study related to the mouse eradication project in the Farallones. The study will assess the effects of various eradication methods, as well as the ecological consequences of "no action."
- Bob Wilson - Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association (FMSA) has received an \$80,000 grant for overhead. However, FMSA continues to grow and consequently need more funds. FMSA is also currently reorganizing their board.
- Peter Grenell -April or May 2012, there will be salmon smolt pens in Pillar Point Harbor, to assist migrating salmon. December 10th is the Pillar Point boat lighting festival. Crab season starts November 15th.

Advisory Council Business (Possible Council Action)



Motion to approve the Aug 2011 Key Meeting Outcomes:

Motion: Bob Wilson

Second: Peter G.

Vote: Unanimous

SAC West Coast Regional Quarterly Report (Taylor Nairn):

You can read the entire West Coast Region Advisory Council Actions report at:

http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/sac_report.html

SAC Challenge 2012 (Maria Brown)

Members shared their current methods for communicating amongst their constituencies.

Youth Involvement Subcommittee update (Maria Brown)

Youth involvement goals:

The GFNMS Advisory Council will engage young people to create an empowered, influential youth voice in the management of marine resources and provide youth perspective and input into Sanctuary policies and decisions.

Participating youth will:

- serve as advisors to the Sanctuary superintendent and liaisons to the community regarding Sanctuary issues
- work alongside role models that are professionals and leaders in their fields
- hold responsibility and make decisions that shape the future of the Sanctuary (*this is to be determined; see below*)

Recommendations:

1. There will be a primary and an alternate youth voting seat on the advisory council, aged 14-17.
2. There will not be a separate working group, as this requires more oversight and administration than can be offered by staff or advisory council.
3. One student will be from south of bridge and one from north of bridge.
4. The students will be generalists, not representing particular interests.
5. Each student will be assigned a SAC member who volunteers to be his or her mentor.

The mentor would assist the student:

- before each meeting to prepare the student by reviewing meeting materials, discussing transportation to meeting or other logistics, etcetera.
- during meetings to ensure that student understands the issues and is included socially, etcetera
- between meetings regarding Sanctuary-related activities as appropriate, etcetera
- to prepare initiatives for consideration and vote by SAC members, including related presentations.



6. GFNMS staff and SAC mentor will provide orientation.
7. Selection considerations:
 - o Highly motivated
 - o Interested but not necessarily experienced in the mission of the marine sanctuaries
 - o Venue/ mechanism for communicating the work of GFNMS to other youth
 - o Ability to make commitment for two-year term

Motion: Bob Wilson moves to have a youth seat

Second: Peter Grenell

Vote: All in favor.

Request Subcommittee for Policy on Fisheries Issues-

Superintendent Brown requested that the council form a subcommittee for policy on fisheries issues.

Motion: Bob Wilson moves to establish a subcommittee on fisheries policy issues

Second: Peter Grenell

Vote: 6 for, none opposed

Potential Membership: Barbara Emley, Jackie Dragon, Peter Grenell, Richard Charter, Mick Menigoz (?). A note was made that members who are absent should be given a chance to volunteer.

MBNMS Superintendent, Paul Michel, update:

Superintendent Michel gave an update on:

- Aggregations of whales in Santa Cruz and the resource protections issues involved with keeping the public at a safe distance from the animals.
- Ecosystem Based Management Initiative for MBNMS and Integrated Ecosystem Assessment that is ongoing in the sanctuary.
- SS Montebello tanker grounded in MBNMS and there was an effort to determine if there was oil onboard. No oil was detected, but it was deduced that the oil had been released at a previous time.
- Lost fishing gear detection and removal
- Loss of the Twin Otter at California sites
- MBNMS will be sending their dive boat up to OCNMS, but will still have use of the Fulmar
- Climate Change Adaptation Workshop in partnership with Stanford and Center for Ocean Solutions
- Santa Cruz Visitor's Center is making great progress and will be finished by the summer of 2012
- Local television show, "Your Sanctuary"
- Motorized Personal Watercraft regulations
- Annual Joint Meeting between MBNMS and GFNMS



For more information on MBNMS, see their Office report for December 2011:

<http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2011/111208/111207sacoff.pdf>

Public Comment

Names: William (Bill) Keener and Isidore (Izzy) Szczepaniak

Affiliation: Golden Gate Cetacean Research (GGCR)

Comment: Mr. Keener spoke about his research on the Harbor Porpoise in San Francisco Bay. He stated that the waters are incredibly productive and clean, and that marine life is flourishing in the area. Mr. Keener suggested that GFNMS expand the sanctuary to take up the “donut hole” exclusion zone. He offered to return to the next council meeting and give a presentation on the research GGCR has been conducting. For example, GGCR is finding porpoises, dolphins, stellar sea lions and common murre. Mr. Szczepaniak stated that there is a discrete population of Harbor Porpoise living in the San Francisco Bay, which should be protected. Mr. Keener stated that bottlenose dolphins are very rare and they use waters in the exclusion zone. He stated that the area is a “world class wildlife observatory”.

Discussion:

Superintendent Brown stated that closing the “donut hole” is in the MBNMS Management Plan. She explained that boundary expansion could be achieved either statutorily (through Congress) or administratively. The administrative process would require a full NEPA analysis and public scoping process.

Richard Charter expressed concern about pursuing two boundary expansion initiatives (northerly and the exclusion zone) simultaneously.

Bob Wilson brought up the potential of forming a working group or subcommittee to address this issue.

Superintendent Brown explained that the “donut hole” goes from Pedro Point to Point Bonita. It was not included in the sanctuary at the time because of sewage discharge from Pacifica, Daly City and San Francisco as well as dredge disposal. At this time, the sewage outfall is now treated and is clean.

Richard Charter brought up the issue that closing the “donut hole” would integrate some prohibited activities going on in a sanctuary and GFNMS would want to ensure that they not undermine the extreme protections we have for sanctuaries.

Peter Grenell expressed concern that this project may be too much for the council and GFNMS to take-on right now. Is there a strong reason to expand the sanctuary? He would like to hear more information on the biological significance of the exclusion zone.

Superintendent Brown invited GGCR and others with important information to the next council meeting on Feb 23.



Council requested a staff report on the Site Evaluation List, how we would go about expanding boundaries, as well as background information.

Taylor Nairn expressed Amber Mace's regrets at not being able to attend the meeting today. Richard Charter requested that a copy of the OPC Strategic Draft plan be distributed electronically to the council.

LUNCH

Determining North-Central California Coast Climate Change Indicators (Benet Duncan)

PPT available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_08/Duncan_111011.pdf

Discussion:

Council members suggested various experts, publications and ideas for enhancing Dr. Duncan's project.

Deep Sea Coral Cruise (Jan Roletto)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_08/Roletto_111011.pdf

PUBLIC COMMENT

Sanctuary Boundary Expansion Resolution (Richard Charter)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_08/Charter_111011.pdf

Richard Charter presented a draft resolution for the consideration of the council. It was approved with the addition of an amendment by Kellyx Nelson.

Motion: Bob Wilson

Second: George Clyde

Vote: 6-0 0 1 abstention

BREAK

Vessel Spills JWG Update (Irina Kogan, Pat Rutten)

The JWG is interested in learning more about the toxicity of dispersants and will focus on this at their next meeting. There will be an emphasis on the science of dispersants, as opposed to the policy.

Joint Working Group on Vessel Strikes and Acoustic Impacts Update (Jackie Dragon)

Presentation Available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/11_08/Dragon_111011.pdf



Discussion: Richard Charter suggested that the JWG also comment upon the impacts of seismic surveys.

Adjourn. Time: 3:29

Attendance Roster

NAME	SEAT	P/A
Dominique Richard	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	A
Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	A
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	A
Brian Baird	CA Resources Agency	A
Amy Vierra	CA Resources Agency Alternate	A
Sec. Linda Adams	CA EPA	A
Cindy Tuck	CA EPA Alternate	A
Richard Charter [Council Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	A
Bob Wilson [Council Secretary]	Conservation	P
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Breen	Education	A
<i>Vacant</i>	Education Alternate	
Barbara Emley [Council Vice-Chair]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	A
Peter Grenell	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	P
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	A
George Clyde	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	A
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	P
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	P
Mendel Stewart	USFWS	A
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Elisa Garrity	USCG	A
<i>Vacant</i>	USCG Alternate	
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	P



Gulf of the Farallones
National Marine Sanctuary
Advisory Council Notes

Natalie-Constantino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	P
Kaitlin Graiff	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	P
John Hunt	MBNMS [non-voting]	A