

Livestock & Poultry (L&P) Air Emissions Standardization Workshop

Hosted by:

USDA – Agricultural Air Quality Task Force

Location:

Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC

September 27-28, 2010

L&P Subcommittee Members

- Gary Baise
- Robert Burns
- Paul Martin
- Wendy Powers
- Sally Shaver
- Bryan Shaw
- Doug Shelmidine
- Leon Weaver
- Eileen Wheeler
- Hongwei Xin
- Ben Weinheimer, Chr.

NRCS staff:

Greg Zwicke

Background Statement

Standardization of information collected/reported for livestock and poultry air emissions studies is needed.

Purpose

- **Engage:**
 - **Research, extension, industry, regulators & other interested persons**
- **Develop:**
 - **Guidance document or other document**

Purpose (Continued)

- **Outline/define:**
 - **Data collection, emissions estimating methodologies, & reporting procedures for air emissions & mitigation practices**
- **Provide input:**
 - **NAEMS project/all livestock & poultry air emissions research**

Principles of Standardization

- **Principle #1 – Recommended units for reporting emissions**
- **Principle #2 – Data collection**
- **Principle #3 – Methodologies & protocols**
- **Principle #4 – Consistency in reporting mitigation practices**

Principles #1 - #4

Workgroup Chairpersons

- **Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler**
- **Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin**
- **Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns**

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations to AAQTF

- **Workshop materials (emailed to AAQTF members and included in notebooks)**
- **Agenda**
- **White Papers on Principles of Standardization**
- **Video/audio recording to be made publicly available by EPA/USDA**

Livestock and Poultry Air Emissions Standardization Workshop – Hosted by the USDA Agricultural Air Quality Task Force FINAL AGENDA

**Monday, September 27, 2010
2:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.**

Environmental Protection Agency Headquarters
Research Triangle Park, North Carolina
Room C111 A-B-C

2:00 p.m. – 2:05 p.m.	Welcome and Opening Remarks <i>Ben Weinheimer, Agriculture Air Quality Task Force Member, Afternoon Moderator</i>
2:05 p.m. – 2:35 p.m.	The Importance of Standardization <i>Tom Hebert, Bayard Ridge Group</i>
2:35 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.	Overviews and Recommendations for Principles Principles 1&2 <i>Dr. Ken Casey, Texas AgriLife</i> Principle 3 <i>Dr. Richard Gates, University of Illinois</i> Principle 4 <i>David Schmidt P.E., University of Minnesota</i>
4:30 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.	NAEMS Data Analysis, Interpretation, and Emissions Estimating Methodologies Under Consideration <i>Larry Elmore, EPA</i>
6:00 p.m.	Adjourn

Tuesday, September 28, 2010

8:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m.

Environmental Protection Agency Headquarters
Research Triangle Park, North Carolina
Room C111 A-B-C

8:00 a.m. – 9:00 a.m.	Discussion/Q&A with EPA <i>Sally Shaver, Shaver Consulting, Inc.</i>
9:00 a.m. – 10:00 a.m.	Moderated Session for Principle 1 – Recommended Units for Reporting Emissions <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
10:00 a.m. – 10:30 a.m.	Break
10:30 a.m. – 11:30 a.m.	Moderated Session for Principle 2 – Data Collection <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
11:30 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.	Lunch on your own
1:00 p.m. – 2:00 p.m.	Moderated Session for Principle 3 – Methodologies and Protocols <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
2:00 p.m. – 3:00 p.m.	Moderated Session for Principle 4 – Consistency in Reporting Mitigation Practices <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
3:00 p.m. – 3:30 p.m.	Break
3:30 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.	Wrap-Up and Next Steps – Identify Points of Agreement and Identify Where Additional Discussions are Needed <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations to AAQTF

- **National Air Emissions Monitoring Study**
 - **Update on EPA data analysis**
 - **Larry Elmore, OAQPS, EPA-RTP**
 - **Danny Greene, ERG (contractor)**
- **Moderated Discussion – Ms. Sally Shaver**

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
 - EPA shared where they are with data analysis for broilers, with intentions to publish a draft by Dec. 2010. In a stair-step manner, EPA/ERG will publish drafts on broilers, layers, swine and dairy.
 - *AAQTF is concerned that the timeline and stair-step approach outlined by EPA will NOT provide for adequate data analysis and public participation.*
 - *AAQTF recommends that final emission estimating methodologies be published at the same time for all NAEMS datasets.*

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
 - **EPA and ERG have not engaged stakeholders or technical experts.**
 - *AAQTF recommends that NAEMS-project funding organizations quickly establish species-specific advisory panels.*
 - *Industry stakeholders*
 - *Agricultural air quality experts*
 - *Advisory panels should initially meet with EPA/ERG by Nov. 1, 2010.*

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
 - **EPA presented preliminary data summary and analysis for broilers.**
 - *EPA failed to demonstrate appropriate analytical techniques in the approach presented.*
 - *AAQTF recommends that EPA/ERG develop and provide a written emissions estimating methodologies plan, that includes both data confidence intervals and model validation, subject to review by the advisory panels, prior to conducting any further data analysis.*

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
 - **EPA indicated that no progress has been made to define “facility” or “source.”**
 - ***AAQTF recommends that the definitions for “facility” and “source” need to be publicly vetted and finalized, as they will be applied to agricultural operations.***

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
 - **EPA has not established a process for including the results of other studies.**
 - *AAQTF recommends that EPA utilize other research studies, outside NAEMS, in developing and validating the emissions estimating methodologies, as directed by the advisory panels.*

Principles of Standardization

- **Moderated session – Dr. Jerry Hatfield and Dr. Brent Auvermann**
- **Principle #1 – Recommended units for reporting emissions**
- **Principle #2 – Data collection**
- **Principle #3 – Methodologies & protocols**
- **Principle #4 – Consistency in reporting mitigation practices**

Principles #1 - #4

Workgroup Chairpersons

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

Principles #1 - #4

Workgroup Chairpersons

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

Principles #1 - #4

Workgroup Chairpersons

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

- **White Papers**

- **AAQTF recommends that the L&P Subcommittee and moderators develop a 2-4 page summary to be included with the three white papers:**

- **Included in minutes of AAQTF meeting**
- **Published as ASABE technical reference**
- **Published through Livestock and Poultry Environmental Learning Center**
- **Support development of a standardization framework proposal for future funding (David Schmidt to lead)**

Livestock & Poultry (L&P) Air Emissions Standardization Workshop

Hosted by:

USDA – Agricultural Air Quality Task Force

Location:

Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC

September 27-28, 2010