

# **Livestock & Poultry (L&P) Air Emissions Standardization Workshop**

---

**Hosted by:**

**USDA – Agricultural Air Quality Task Force**

**Location:**

**Environmental Protection Agency**

**Research Triangle Park, NC**

**September 27-28, 2010**

# L&P Subcommittee Members

---

- Gary Baise
- Robert Burns
- Paul Martin
- Wendy Powers
- Sally Shaver
- Bryan Shaw
- Doug Shelmidine
- Leon Weaver
- Eileen Wheeler
- Hongwei Xin
- Ben Weinheimer, Chr.

**NRCS staff:**

**Greg Zwicke**

# **Background Statement**

---

**Standardization of information collected/reported for livestock and poultry air emissions studies is needed.**

# Purpose

---

- **Engage:**
  - **Research, extension, industry, regulators & other interested persons**
- **Develop:**
  - **Guidance document or other document**

# Purpose (Continued)

---

- **Outline/define:**
  - **Data collection, emissions estimating methodologies, & reporting procedures for air emissions & mitigation practices**
- **Provide input:**
  - **NAEMS project/all livestock & poultry air emissions research**

# Principles of Standardization

---

- **Principle #1 – Recommended units for reporting emissions**
- **Principle #2 – Data collection**
- **Principle #3 – Methodologies & protocols**
- **Principle #4 – Consistency in reporting mitigation practices**

# **Principles #1 - #4**

## **Workgroup Chairpersons**

---

- **Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler**
- **Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin**
- **Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns**

# **L&P Subcommittee Recommendations to AAQTF**

---

- **Workshop materials (emailed to AAQTF members and included in notebooks)**
- **Agenda**
- **White Papers on Principles of Standardization**
- **Video/audio recording to be made publicly available by EPA/USDA**



# **Livestock and Poultry Air Emissions Standardization Workshop – Hosted by the USDA Agricultural Air Quality Task Force FINAL AGENDA**

**Monday, September 27, 2010**

**2:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.**

Environmental Protection Agency Headquarters  
Research Triangle Park, North Carolina  
Room C111 A-B-C

---

**2:00 p.m. – 2:05 p.m.**

**Welcome and Opening Remarks**

*Ben Weinheimer, Agriculture Air Quality Task Force Member,  
Afternoon Moderator*

---

**2:05 p.m. – 2:35 p.m.**

**The Importance of Standardization**

*Tom Hebert, Bayard Ridge Group*

---

**2:35 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.**

**Overviews and Recommendations for Principles**

Principles 1&2 *Dr. Ken Casey, Texas AgriLife*  
Principle 3 *Dr. Richard Gates, University of Illinois*  
Principle 4 *David Schmidt P.E., University of Minnesota*

---

**4:30 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.**

**NAEMS Data Analysis, Interpretation, and Emissions Estimating  
Methodologies Under Consideration**

*Larry Elmore, EPA*

---

**6:00 p.m.**

**Adjourn**

---

**Tuesday, September 28, 2010**

**8:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m.**

Environmental Protection Agency Headquarters  
Research Triangle Park, North Carolina  
Room C111 A-B-C

---

<b>8:00 a.m. – 9:00 a.m.</b>	<b>Discussion/Q&amp;A with EPA</b> <i>Sally Shaver, Shaver Consulting, Inc.</i>
<b>9:00 a.m. – 10:00 a.m.</b>	<b>Moderated Session for Principle 1 – Recommended Units for Reporting Emissions</b> <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
<b>10:00 a.m. – 10:30 a.m.</b>	<b>Break</b>
<b>10:30 a.m. – 11:30 a.m.</b>	<b>Moderated Session for Principle 2 – Data Collection</b> <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
<b>11:30 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.</b>	<b>Lunch on your own</b>
<b>1:00 p.m. – 2:00 p.m.</b>	<b>Moderated Session for Principle 3 – Methodologies and Protocols</b> <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
<b>2:00 p.m. – 3:00 p.m.</b>	<b>Moderated Session for Principle 4 – Consistency in Reporting Mitigation Practices</b> <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>
<b>3:00 p.m. – 3:30 p.m.</b>	<b>Break</b>
<b>3:30 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.</b>	<b>Wrap-Up and Next Steps – Identify Points of Agreement and Identify Where Additional Discussions are Needed</b> <i>Dr. Jerry Hatfield, ARS, and Dr. Brent Auvermann, Texas AgriLife</i>

---

# **L&P Subcommittee Recommendations to AAQTF**

---

- **National Air Emissions Monitoring Study**
  - **Update on EPA data analysis**
    - **Larry Elmore, OAQPS, EPA-RTP**
    - **Danny Greene, ERG (contractor)**
- **Moderated Discussion – Ms. Sally Shaver**

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
  - EPA shared where they are with data analysis for broilers, with intentions to publish a draft by Dec. 2010. In a stair-step manner, EPA/ERG will publish drafts on broilers, layers, swine and dairy.
    - *AAQTF is concerned that the timeline and stair-step approach outlined by EPA will NOT provide for adequate data analysis and public participation.*
    - *AAQTF recommends that final emission estimating methodologies be published at the same time for all NAEMS datasets.*

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
  - **EPA and ERG have not engaged stakeholders or technical experts.**
    - *AAQTF recommends that NAEMS-project funding organizations quickly establish species-specific advisory panels.*
      - *Industry stakeholders*
      - *Agricultural air quality experts*
    - *Advisory panels should initially meet with EPA/ERG by Nov. 1, 2010.*

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
  - **EPA presented preliminary data summary and analysis for broilers.**
    - *EPA failed to demonstrate appropriate analytical techniques in the approach presented.*
    - *AAQTF recommends that EPA/ERG develop and provide a written emissions estimating methodologies plan, that includes both data confidence intervals and model validation, subject to review by the advisory panels, prior to conducting any further data analysis.*

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
  - **EPA indicated that no progress has been made to define “facility” or “source.”**
    - *AAQTF recommends that the definitions for “facility” and “source” need to be publicly vetted and finalized, as they will be applied to agricultural operations.*

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **NAEMS Study – Issues to be Addressed**
  - **EPA has not established a process for including the results of other studies.**
    - *AAQTF recommends that EPA utilize other research studies, outside NAEMS, in developing and validating the emissions estimating methodologies, as directed by the advisory panels.*



# Principles of Standardization

---

- **Moderated session – Dr. Jerry Hatfield and Dr. Brent Auvermann**
- **Principle #1 – Recommended units for reporting emissions**
- **Principle #2 – Data collection**
- **Principle #3 – Methodologies & protocols**
- **Principle #4 – Consistency in reporting mitigation practices**

# Principles #1 - #4

## Workgroup Chairpersons

---

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

# Principles #1 - #4

## Workgroup Chairpersons

---

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- **Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin**
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

# Principles #1 - #4

## Workgroup Chairpersons

---

- Principle #1/#2 – Dr. Eileen Wheeler
- Principle #3 – Dr. Hongwei Xin
- Principle #4 – Dr. Robert Burns

# L&P Subcommittee Recommendations

---

- **White Papers**
  - **AAQTF recommends that the L&P Subcommittee and moderators develop a 2-4 page summary to be included with the three white papers:**
    - **Included in minutes of AAQTF meeting**
    - **Published as ASABE technical reference**
    - **Published through Livestock and Poultry Environmental Learning Center**
    - **Support development of a standardization framework proposal for future funding (David Schmidt to lead)**

# **Livestock & Poultry (L&P) Air Emissions Standardization Workshop**

---

**Hosted by:**

**USDA – Agricultural Air Quality Task Force**

**Location:**

**Environmental Protection Agency**

**Research Triangle Park, NC**

**September 27-28, 2010**