# Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana (haha) 5-Year Review Summary and Evaluation

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office Honolulu, Hawaii

#### **5-YEAR REVIEW**

**Species reviewed:** Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana/ haha

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

GENERAL INFORMATION	3
Background:	3
RESULTS	20
Recommended Classification:	20
New Recovery Priority Number:	20
Listing and Reclassification Priority Number:	20
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE ACTIONS	21
REFERENCES	21
ATURE PAGE	<b>2</b> 4
	Reviewers

#### 5-YEAR REVIEW

Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana (haha)

#### 1.0 GENERAL INFORMATION

#### 1.1 Reviewers

#### **Lead Regional Office:**

Region 1, Endangered Species Program, Division of Recovery, Jesse D`Elia, (503) 231-2071

#### **Lead Field Office:**

Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office, Loyal Mehrhoff, Field Supervisor, (808) 792-9400

#### **Cooperating Field Office(s):**

N/A

#### **Cooperating Regional Office(s):**

N/A

#### 1.2 Methodology used to complete the review:

This review was conducted by staff of the Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), beginning on March 16, 2009. The review was based on final critical habitat designations for *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* and other species from the islands of Lanai, Molokai, Maui, and Oahu (USFWS 2003a,b,c,d) as well as a review of current, available information. The National Tropical Botanical Garden provided an initial draft of portions of the review and recommendations for conservation actions needed prior to the next five-year review. The evaluation of Samuel Aruch, biological consultant, was reviewed by the Plant Recovery Coordinator. The document was then reviewed by the Recovery Program Leader and the Assistant Field Supervisor for Endangered Species before submittal to the Field Supervisor for approval.

#### 1.3 Background:

### **1.3.1** Federal Register (FR) Notice citation announcing initiation of this review:

[USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2009. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; initiation of 5-year reviews of 103 species in Hawaii. Federal Register 74(49):11130-11133.

#### 1.3.2 Listing history

#### **Original Listing**

**FR notice:** USFWS. 1996. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; determination of threatened or endangered status for 14 plants from the Hawaiian Islands, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 61(198):52108-53124.

Date listed: October 10, 1996

**Entity listed:** Species

Classification: Endangered

Revised Listing, if applicable

FR notice: N/A
Date listed: N/A
Entity listed: N/A
Classification: N/A

#### **1.3.3** Associated rulemakings:

USFWS. 2003a. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 3 plant species from the island of Lanai, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(6):1219-1273.

USFWS. 2003b. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 42 plant species from the island of Molokai, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(52):12982-13141.

USFWS. 2003c. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 60 plant species from the islands of Maui and Kahoolawe, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(93):25934-26165.

USFWS. 2003d. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designation or nondesignation of critical habitat for 101 plant species from the island of Oahu, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(116):35949-35998.

Critical habitat was not designated for *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* on the island of Lanai (USFWS 2003a). Critical habitat was designated for *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in 1 unit totaling 2,133 hectares (5,272 acres) on the island of Molokai. This designation

includes habitat on State, Federal, and private lands (USFWS 2003b). Critical habitat was designated for *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in 1 unit totaling 921 hectares (2,273 acres) on the island of Maui. This designation includes habitat on State and private lands (USFWS 2003c). Critical habitat was designated for *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in 2 units totaling 2,964 hectares (7,320 acres) on the island of Oahu. This designation includes habitat on State and private lands (USFWS 2003d).

#### 1.3.4 Review History:

Species status review [FY 2010 Recovery Data Call (September 2010)]: Declining

#### **Recovery achieved:**

1 (1-25%) (FY 2007 Recovery Data Call – most recent year reported)

## 1.3.5 Species' Recovery Priority Number at start of this 5-year review:

6

#### 1.3.6 Current Recovery Plan or Outline

Name of plan or outline: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 1999. Recovery plan for multi- island plants. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Portland, Oregon. 206 pages + appendices.

Date issued: July 10, 1999.

Dates of previous revisions, if applicable: N/A

#### 2.0 REVIEW ANALYSIS

2.	Application of the	e 1996 Distinct Po	opulation Segmer	it (DPS) p	olicy

2.1.1	Is the species under review a vertebrate?  YesX_No
2.1.2	Is the species under review listed as a DPS?  YesX_No
2.1.3	Was the DPS listed prior to 1996? Yes No

	2.1.3.1 Prior to this 5-year review, was the DPS classification reviewed to ensure it meets the 1996 policy standards?  Yes No
	2.1.3.2 Does the DPS listing meet the discreteness and significance elements of the 1996 DPS policy?  Yes No
2.1.4	Is there relevant new information for this species regarding the application of the DPS policy?  Yes X_No
Rec	overy Criteria
	Does the species have a final, approved recovery plan aining objective, measurable criteria?
2.2.2	2 Adequacy of recovery criteria.
	2.2.2.1 Do the recovery criteria reflect the best available and most up-to date information on the biology of the species and its habitat?
	Yes No
	2.2.2.2 Are all of the 5 listing factors that are relevant to the species addressed in the recovery criteria?
_	B List the recovery criteria as they appear in the recovery a, and discuss how each criterion has or has not been met, citing rmation:
•	in the sis of the threats (Listing Factors A, C, D, and E) affecting this ies is presented in section 2.3.2 and Table 2. Listing Factor B

purposes) is not known to be a threat to this species.

(overutilization for commercial, recreational, scientific, or educational

Stabilizing, downlisting, and delisting objectives are provided in the multi- island plant recovery plan (USFWS 1999), based on whether the species is an annual, a short-lived perennial (fewer than 10 years), or a long-lived perennial. *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* is a short-lived perennial, and to be considered stabilized, which is the first step in recovering the species, the taxon must be managed to control threats (*e.g.*, fenced, weeding, etc.) and be represented in an *ex situ* (off-site) collection. In addition, a minimum of three populations should be documented on islands where they now occur or occurred historically. Each of these populations must be naturally reproducing and increasing in number, with a minimum of 50 mature individuals per population.

This recovery objective has not been met. There is no population of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* containing more than 50 individuals and all threats are not being managed.

For downlisting, a total of five to seven populations of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* should be documented on islands where they now occur or occurred historically. Each of these populations must be naturally reproducing, stable or increasing in number, and secure from threats, with a minimum of 300 mature individuals per population. Each population should persist at this level for a minimum of five consecutive years before downlisting is considered.

This recovery objective has not been met.

For delisting, a total of eight to ten populations of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* should be documented on islands where they now occur or occurred historically. Each of these populations must be naturally reproducing, stable or increasing in number, and secure from threats, with 300 mature individuals per population for short-lived perennials. Each population should persist at this level for a minimum of five consecutive years before delisting is considered.

This recovery objective has not been met.

#### 2.3 Updated Information and Current Species Status

#### 2.3.1 Biology and Habitat

## **2.3.1.1** New information on the species' biology and life history:

No new information.

2.3.1.2 Abundance, population trends (e.g. increasing, decreasing, stable), demographic features (e.g., age structure, sex ratio, family size, birth rate, age at mortality, mortality rate, etc.), or demographic trends:

Due to taxonomic changes (see Section 2.3.1.4), the taxon originally listed as endangered in 1996 as *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* currently includes (1) *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana*, (2) *Cyanea munroi*, (3) *Cyanea magnicalyx*, (4) *Cyanea mauiensis*, (5) *Cyanea cylindrocalyx*, and (6) *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *obatae* (Lammers 2004). The final taxon, *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *obatae*, was listed as a separate endangered species in 1994 and a 5-year review for this species was completed in 2007 (USFWS 2007b). The other five taxa are addressed individually below.

#### 2.3.1.2.1 Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana

On Oahu, *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* occurs in the Waianae Mountains. One population of three individuals and a single seedling was seen in 2000 in Mt. Kaala Natural Area Reserve, Puu Pane, on the north facing slopes of Mt. Kaala, in the Waianae Mountains at 671 meters (2,200 feet) elevation (Perlman 2009a; USFWS 1999). Another population of *Cyanea grimesiana* was reported from North Haleauau Gulch on the Schofield Barracks Military Reservation, last seen in 1992. In the back of Makaha Valley, in 2005, Steve Perlman of the National Tropical Botanical Garden, Ane Bakutis of the Plant Extinction Prevention Program, and Amy Tsuneyoshi of the Honolulu Board of Water Supply saw one individual without flowers or fruits at 689 meters (2,260 feet) elevation (Perlman 2009a).

Populations of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in Kaluaa Gulch and Pahole Gulch were last seen in 1992 to 1993 by Steve Perlman of the National Tropical Botanical Garden. In 2000, Perlman and Army Environmental personnel saw 10 individuals in West Makaleha Gulch (Perlman 2009a; USFWS 1999). However, since then, the populations of *Cyanea grimesiana* occurring at Kaluaa Gulch, Pahole Gulch, and West Makaleha as well as those at Palikea area have been identified as *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *obatae*, another listed taxon (USFWS 2007a).

Numerous historical occurrences were reported from the Koolau Mountains prior to 1969 (Hawaii Biodiversity and Mapping

Program 2009). Two populations comprising 10 individuals were seen in 1990 in Kului Gulch, but declined to a single individual last seen in 1994 (Perlman 2009a). In 2004, at Pia Gulch on the east side of Hawaiiloa Ridge, a single dying individual, about 2-meters (6.5-feet) in height containing a few leaves was observed at 616 meters (2,020 feet) elevation by Perlman, Susan Ching of the Plant Extinction Prevention Program, and Natalia Tangalin of the National Tropical Botanical Garden (Perlman 2009a). Three individuals were known from 1985 in Waialae Iki-Kapakahi on State and private land (Hawaii Biodiversity and Mapping Program 2009; USFWS 1999).

Lammers (2004) reported at least one population on Molokai that is still considered part of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana*, but its location and current status are unknown. Currently, no wild individuals of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* are known to exist on Molokai (Plant Extinction Prevention Program 2009).

#### 2.3.1.2.2 Cyanea munroi

On Molokai, one population of five individuals previously identified as *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* was known from Kukuinui Ridge on State land and another population of two individuals is known within the State's Olokui Natural Area Reserve (USFWS 1999). The latter population, in Wailua Valley on the sea cliffs of Olokui, is now identified as *C. munroi* (see taxonomic discussion in 2.3.1.4 below). In 2001, Ken Wood revisited the Wailau individual located at 550 meters (2,050 feet) elevation (Wood 2009). In October 2009, Perlman and Hank Oppenheimer, Maui Nui Plant Extinction Prevention Coordinator, searched unsuccessfully for this species on these sea cliffs. Much of the understory was dense thickets of the invasive introduced species *Clidemia hirta* (Koster's curse) that are 3-meters (13-feet) tall (Oppenheimer 2009).

On Lanai, Perlman regularly observed two individuals of *Cyanea munroi* at Awehi Gulch, north of Puhielelu Ridge between 1991 and 2008 from 869 to 969 meters (2,850 to 3,180 feet) elevation (Perlman 2009b). Perlman also observed two individuals at Waiakeakua south of Puhielelu Ridge, in 1994, at 853 meters (2,800 feet) elevation (Hawaii Biodiversity and Mapping Program 2009). Two plants still occur in the Awehi Gulch headwaters, within a fenced exclosure (Oppenheimer 2009).

In total, there are no known individuals on Molokai and two individuals on Lanai.

#### 2.3.1.2.3 Cyanea magnicalyx

Two populations from West Maui which were formerly classified as Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana are now classified as Cyanea magnicalyx (see taxonomic discussion below in section 2.3.1.4). Perlman saw one individual at each of several elevations from 469 to 549 meters (1,540 to 1,800 feet) elevation between 2004 and 2008, at Kaluanui Stream, a subgulch of Honokohau Valley (Perlman 2009c), which were still there in 2009 (Oppenheimer 2009). In Iao Valley, in a gulch to the north of Iao Needle, Perlman observed up to four individuals between 2004 and 2009 at 442 to 518 meters (1,450 to 1,700 feet) elevation (Perlman 2009c). There were three individuals in Iao as of February 2009; one of which was a juvenile (Oppenheimer 2009). In 2006, Ken Wood observed a clump consisting of perhaps two individuals in West Maui at Puehuehunui, in a small drainage south of Kauaula Rim (Wood 2009). In 2009, one individual remained at Puehuehunui (Oppenheimer 2009). In total, there are seven individuals in three populations on West Maui (Plant Extinction Prevention Program 2009).

#### 2.3.1.2.4 Cyanea mauiensis

Historical collections from Olowalu, West Maui, listed as Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana were placed under Cyanea mauiensis in a 1998 taxonomic revision (see taxonomic discussion below in section 2.3.1.4). Populations from Makawao on East Maui formerly known as Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana were reassigned to Cyanea mauiensis (Lammers 1998). These populations have not been reported recently. One population from Makawao Forest Reserve on East Maui seen in 2000 was attributed to Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana, but was later tentatively identified as Cyanea asplenifolia (H. Oppenheimer, Plant Extinction Prevention Program, pers. comm. 2010; Oppenheimer 2009). Two other historical populations of Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana on East Maui, at Nahiku and Kipahulu, apparently have not been reevaluated taxonomically. Both Cyanea mauiensis and C. magnicalyx were known to occur in Olowalu Valley, but Perlman and Oppenheimer searched unsuccessfully for this species in 2008 (Oppenheimer 2009). No individuals of this species are currently known.

2.3.1.2.5 *Cyanea cylindrocalyx* from the island of Hawaii is now considered extinct (Bernice P. Bishop Museum 1999).

## 2.3.1.3 Genetics, genetic variation, or trends in genetic variation (e.g., loss of genetic variation, genetic drift, inbreeding, etc.):

No new information.

#### **2.3.1.4** Taxonomic classification or changes in nomenclature:

In his 1990 treatment of Campanulaceae in the Manual of the Flowering Plants of Hawaii, Thomas Lammers considered C. grimesiana var. lydgatei, C. grimesiana var. mauiensis, C. grimesiana var. munroi, and C. lobata var. hamakuae synonymous with Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana (Wagner 1999). However, in a 1998 treatment, Lammers subsequently elevated these particular subspecies of Cyanea grimesiana except C. var. lydgatei, to the species level. Morphological differences between populations on Oahu, Molokai, Maui, and Lanai and previous assignment to species status by earlier botanists justified this revision. Cyanea grimesiana var. cylindrocalyx (considered extinct) from Waipio Valley, Hawaii Island, became Cyanea cylindrocalyx. Cyanea grimesiana var. mauiensis from Olowalu, Maui and Cyanea grimesiana var. lydgatei from East Maui both became Cyanea mauiensis. Cyanea grimesiana var. munroi from Molokai and Lanai became Cyanea munroi. The populations of C. grimesiana on Oahu remained divided into subspecies grimesiana and subspecies obatae (Lammers 1998). In 2004, Lammers further clarified Cyanea grimesiana as a species complex under which he grouped Cyanea mauiensis, Cyanea munroi, Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana, Cyanea grimesiana subsp. obatae, Cyanea cylindrocalyx, and Cyanea magnicalyx (Lammers 2004). Cyanea grimesiana subsp. obatae was listed as endangered as a separate species, and a 5-year review for this species was completed in 2007 (USFWS 2007b).

2.3.1.5 Spatial distribution, trends in spatial distribution (e.g. increasingly fragmented, increased numbers of corridors, etc.), or historic range (e.g., corrections to the historical range, change in distribution of the species within its historic range, etc.):

## 2.3.1.6 Habitat or ecosystem conditions (e.g., amount, distribution, and suitability of the habitat or ecosystem):

In the Waianae Mountains of Oahu, the habitat of Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana is Acacia koa (koa) – Metrosiderospolymorpha (ohia) – Dicranopteris linearis (uluhe) lowland mesic forest (Puu Pane), with associated native species that include Abutilon sandwicensis (no common name [NCN]), Antidesma pulvinatum (hame), Charpentiera ovata (papala), Cibotium spp. (hapuu), Clermontia kakeana (haha), C. persicifolia (oha wai), Coprosma foliosa (pilo), Cyanea angustifolia (haha), C. lanceolata (haha), Cyrtandra grandiflora (kanawao keokeo), Diospyros sandwicensis (lama), Diplazium sandwichianum (hoio), Flueggea neowawraea (mehamehame), Freycinetia arborea (ie ie), Gardenia mannii (nanu), Hibiscus arnottianus (kokio keokeo), Isodendrion longifolium (aupaka), Joinvillea ascendens (ohe), Labordia cyrtandrae (kamakahala), L. tinifolia (kamakahala), Leptecophylla tameiameiae (pukiawe), Melicope peduncularis (alani), Myrsine lessertiana (kolea lau nui), Nestegis sandwicensis (olopua), Ochrosia sp. (holei), Perrottetia sandwicensis (olomea), Pipturus albidus (mamake), Pisonia sp. (papala kepau), Pouteria sandwicensis (alaa), Psychotria hathewayi (kopiko), P. mariniana (kopiko), Psydrax odorata (alahee), Rauvolfia sandwicensis (hao), Sapindus oahuensis (lonomea), Scaevola gaudichaudiana (naupaka kuahiwi), Sicyos sp. (anunu), Syzygium sandwicensis (ohia ha), Tectaria gaudichaudii (iwa iwa lau nui), Urera glabra (opuhe), Viola chamissoniana (pamakani), and Xylosma hawaiiense (maua) (National Tropical Botanical Garden 2009; Perlman 2009a).

In the Koolau Mountains of Oahu, the habitat where *Cyanea* grimesiana subsp. grimesiana occurs is *Acacia koa* – Metrosideros polymorpha mesic forest with *Abutilon* sandwicensis, Antidesma pulvinatum, Charpentiera ovata, Cibotium spp., Clermontia kakeana, C. persicifolia, Coprosma foliosa, Cyanea angustifolia, C. lanceolata, Cyrtandra grandiflora, Dicranopteris linearis (uluhe), Diospyros sandwicensis, Diplazium sandwichianum, Flueggea neowawraea, Freycinetia arborea, Hibiscus arnottianus, Isodendrion longifolium, Joinvillea ascendens, Labordia tinifolia, Melicope sp., Myrsine lessertiana, Ochrosia

sandwicensis, Pipturus albidus, Pisonia sp., Psychotria hathewayi, Psydrax odorata, Rauvolfia sandwicensis, Sapindus oahuensis, Tectaria gaudichaudii, Viola chamissoniana, and Xylosma hawaiiense (Perlman 2009a).

On Lanai at Awehi Gulch, the habitat for *Cyanea munroi* is *Metrosideros polymorpha* lowland mesic forest with associated native plants including *Alyxia stellata* (maile), *Antidesma platyphyllum* (hame), *Diplazium sandwichianum*, *Doodia* sp. (okupukupu), *Freycinetia arborea*, *Labordia tinifolia*, *Microlepia strigosa* (palapalai), *Myrsine* sp. (kolea), *Pipturus albidus*, *Pouteria sandwicensis*, *Syzygium sandwicensis*, *Viola lanaiensis* (NCN), and *Xylosma hawaiiense* (National Tropical Botanical Garden 2009; Oppenheimer 2009).

On Molokai in Wailau Valley; on the ridge to Olokui, on the slopes above Waiehu; west of Wailau Stream in *Metrosideros* polymorpha lowland mesic to wet forest the habitat includes native species such as Alyxia stellata, Antidesma platyphyllum, Artemisia sp. (hinahina), Bidens sp. (kookoolau), Broussaisia arguta (kanawao), Cheirodendron trigynum (olapa), Cibotium glaucum (hapuu), Clermontia sp., Cyanea solenocalyx (pua kala), Cyrtandra grayi (keokeo haiwale), C. grayana (keokeo haiwale), C. lydgatei (keokeo haiwale), Deparia prolifera (NCN), Freycinetia arborea, Hibiscus arnottianus subsp. immaculatus (kokio keokeo), Ilex anomala (kawau), Kadua sp., Labordia hedyosmifolia (kamakahala), Lipochaeta sp. (nehe), Lysimachia sp. (NCN), Mecodium recurvum (ohia ku), Myrsine lessertiana, Nothocestrum longifolium (aiea), Psychotria mariniana, Tetraplasandra oahuensis (ohe mauka), Pneumatopteris sandwicensis (hoio kula), Touchardia latifolia (olona), *Urera* sp., and *Vandenboschia davallioides* (palai hihi) (Oppenheimer 2009; Wood 2009).

Cyanea magnicalyx occurs in West Maui at Puehuehunui, a small drainage to the south of the Kauaula Valley Rim, in a mixed mesic forest habitat with rich fern understory and at Kaluanui Stream, a subgulch of Honokohau Valley in Metrosideros polymorpha – Cibotium spp. mesic forest associated with Antidesma platyphyllum, Broussaisia arguta, Cheirodendron trigynum, Clermontia kakeana, Cyanea angustifolia, C. lobata (haha), Cyrtandra grayana, C. grayi, Dicranopteris linearis, Diplazium sandwichianum, Dodonaea viscosa, Freycinetia arborea, Ilex anomala, Kadua acuminata (au), Melicope hawaiiense (mokihana kukae moa), Myrsine

lessertiana, Nestegis sandwicensis, Syzygium sandwicense, Tetraplasandra hawaiensis (ohe), and Xylosma hawaiiense (ae) (Wood 2009). In Iao Valley, West Maui, the natural community is Pisonia sp. forest with Metrosideros polymorpha and associated native species including Antidesma platyphyllum, Asplenium nidus, Cyrtandra grayi, Charpentiera obovata, Cheirodendron trigynum, Claoxylon sandwicensis (poola), Freycinetia arborea, Kadua acuminata, K. affinis (manono), Nothocestrum longifolium, Perrottetia sandwicensis, Pisonia brunoniana (papala kepau), Pisonia sp., Pittosporum glabrum (hoawa), Pleomele auwahiensis (hala pepe), Pouteria sandwicensis, Psychotria mauiensis (opiko), and Xylosma hawaiiense (Oppenheimer 2009; Wood 2009).

#### 2.3.1.7 Other:

No new information.

## 2.3.2 Five-Factor Analysis (threats, conservation measures, and regulatory mechanisms)

## 2.3.2.1 Present or threatened destruction, modification or curtailment of its habitat or range:

Threats that modify habitat of these *Cyanea* species include feral ungulates that degrade the habitat, preventing natural regeneration. Pigs (*Sus scrofa*) and goats (*Capra hircus*) are a threat to *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in the Waianae Mountains. Pigs are a threat in the Koolau Mountains of Oahu. Axis deer (*Axis axis*) pose a threat to *Cyanea magnicalyx* and *C. munroi* on Maui and Lanai (Perlman 2009c; Wood 2009). Deer, goats, and pigs are threats on Molokai (Wood 2009). Pigs are a threat to *Cyanea magnicalyx* on West Maui (Oppenheimer 2009).

Invasive introduced plant species that degrade habitat and compete with *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana*, as listed, include *Ageratina adenophora* (sticky snakeroot), *Buddleia asiatica* (dog tail), *Bryophyllum pinnatum* (airplant), *Cinnamomum zeylanica* (cinnamon), *Clidemia hirta* (Koster's curse), *Grevillea robusta* (silk oak), *Lantana camara* (lantana), *Morella faya* (firetree), *Nephrolepis* sp. (NCN), *Psidium cattleianum* (strawberry guava), *Psidium guajava* (common guava), *Rubus rosifolius* (thimbleberry), *Schinus terebinthifolius* (Christmasberry), and *Toona ciliata* (cedar) (National Tropical

Botanical Garden 2009; Perlman 2009c; USFWS 1999; Wood 2009).

## 2.3.2.2 Overutilization for commercial, recreational, scientific, or educational purposes:

Not a threat.

#### 2.3.2.3 Disease or predation:

Slugs and snails of various species and rats (*Rattus rattus*) are believed to eat leaves and seeds of this listed taxon (Perlman 2009a). Slugs killed at least one individual in Iao Valley, West Maui (Perlman 2009c).

#### 2.3.2.4 Inadequacy of existing regulatory mechanisms:

No new information.

## 2.3.2.5 Other natural or manmade factors affecting its continued existence:

The introduced invasive plant species discussed in section 2.3.2.1 above are also a threat to *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* because they compete with the species for water, light, and nutrients.

Landslides are a threat to the Iao Valley population (Oppenheimer 2009). Fire is a threat to the Puehuehunui population. In early 2007, a fire came within a couple hundred meters of these plants (Oppenheimer 2009). Military training activity including troops, vehicles, and helicopter activity could impact this taxon on Oahu (USFWS 1999).

Climate change may also pose a threat to this species. However, current climate change analyses in the Pacific Islands lack sufficient spatial resolution to make predictions on impacts to this species. The Pacific Islands Climate Change Cooperative has currently funded climate modeling that will help resolve these spatial limitations. We anticipate high spatial resolution climate outputs by 2013.

In addition to all of the other threats, species like *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* that are endemic to small portions of a few islands are inherently more vulnerable to extinction

than widespread species because of the higher risks posed to a few populations and individuals by random demographic fluctuations and localized catastrophes such as hurricanes, landslides, flooding, and disease outbreaks. The extent of these natural processes on this taxon with very low numbers are exacerbated by anthropogenic threats, such as habitat loss for human development or predation by introduced species.

Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana, C. munroi, and C. magicalyx are being monitored by the Plant Extinction Prevention Program. Their plan for this species is to continue to attempt to collect seeds for genetic storage and reintroduction, and propagate and reintroduce the species into protected areas within suitable habitat (Plant Extinction Prevention program 2009).

In 2009, one million dollars in funds from the Federal Department of Interior's Cooperative Endangered Species Conservation Fund is being used on Molokai to help acquire a perpetual conservation easement that is more than 248 hectares (614 acres) of strategic watershed on the eastern end of the island. This property has several federally listed threatened or endangered species as well as critical habitat in and around the proposed easement area. Other federally listed species benefiting from this protection are *Bidens wiebkei* (kookoolau), *Canavalia molokaiensis* (awikiwiki), *Canavalia molokaiensis* (kokio keokeo), *Brighamia rockii* (puaala), *Cyanea dunbariae* (haha), *Gardenia brighamii* (nanu), *Pritchardia munroi* (loulu), and *Phyllostegia hispida* (NCN) (USFWS 2009; C. Rowland, USFWS, pers. comm. 2010). This area may provide suitable habitat for the reintroduction of this taxon in the future.

The National Tropical Botanical Garden has over 800 seeds of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* in storage (National Tropical Botanical Garden 2010). The Plant Extinction Prevention Program has outplanted individuals in Kupaua in the southern end of the Koolau Mountains, and as of 2010, three individuals remained. The site is fenced and weed control is ongoing (Plant Extinction Prevention Program 2010).

The Plant Extinction Prevention Program has outplanted *Cyanea magnicalyx* into three locations on West Maui. Slugs and rats killed many of these outplantings (despite trapping for rats), but about 20 individuals remain. A few have already begun to flower. Seeds have been collected from four of the five known

wild plants, but the fifth plant is still immature. Seeds are stored at Harold L. Lyon Arboretum. A small fenced exclosure was constructed around the Kaluanui individual in 2009. Pig control has been initiated there by Maui Land and Pineapple Company's Puu Kukui Preserve staff (Oppenheimer 2009). The Lyon Arboretum Micropropagation Laboratory has 5,010 seeds in storage from the Iao Valley population (Harold L. Lyon Arboretum Laboratory 2010).

Both individuals of *Cyanea munroi* on Lanai are in a fenced exclosure. The Plant Extinction Prevention Program inspects this annually, and repairs the fenced exclosure as necessary. Rat snap traps are reset when the site is visited. Seeds have been collected from both plants and are stored at the Harold L. Lyon Arboretum. One seedling is growing at the Olinda Rare Plant Nursery. Rat snap traps are also maintained at the Iao Valley population. Seeds have been collected from the individual at Puehuehunui and 299 seeds are in storage at the Harold L. Lyon Arboretum seed bank (Harold L. Lyon Arboretum Seed Bank 2010; Oppenheimer 2009).

#### 2.4 Synthesis

Stabilizing, downlisting, and delisting objectives are provided in the multi-island plant recovery plan (USFWS 1999), based on whether the species is an annual, a short-lived perennial (fewer than ten years), or a long-lived perennial. *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* is a short-lived perennial, and to be considered for stabilization, which is the first step in recovering the species, the taxon must be managed to control threats (*e.g.*, fenced) and be represented in an *ex situ* (off-site) collection. In addition, a minimum of three populations should be documented on islands where they now occur or occurred historically. For the species to be considered stable, each of these populations must be naturally reproducing and increasing in number, with a minimum of 50 mature individuals per population.

The interim stabilization goals for this species have not been met as there is no population of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* (including *C. magnicalyx*, *C. mauiensis*, *C. munroi*) containing more than 50 individuals (Table 1) and all threats have not been managed (Table 2). Therefore, *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* meets the definition of endangered as it remains in danger of extinction throughout its range.

Table 1. Status of *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana* from listing through 5-year review.

Date	No. wild indivs	No. outplanted	Stability Criteria identified in Recovery Plan	Stability Criteria Completed?
1996 (listing)	<50	0	All threats managed in all 3 populations	No
			Complete genetic storage	No
			3 populations with 50 mature individuals each	No
1999 (recovery plan)	<50	2	All threats managed in all 3 populations	No
			Complete genetic storage	Partially
			3 populations with 50 mature individuals each	No
2003 (critical habitat)	Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana - 16	Unknown	All threats managed in all 3 populations	No
	Cyanea munroi - 10			
	Cyanea magnicalyx- 6			
	Cyanea mauiensis - 0			
	Cyanea cylindrocalyx -0			
			Complete genetic storage	Partially

			3 populations with 50 mature individuals each	No
2010 (5-year review)	Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana - 0	3	All threats managed in all 3 populations	Partially (Table 2)
	Cyanea munroi - 2	0		
	Cyanea magnicalyx - 7	6		
	Cyanea mauiensis - 0	0		
			Complete genetic storage	Partially
			3 populations with 50 mature individuals each	No: no populations with over 10 individuals

Table 2. Threats to Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana.

Threat	Listing	Current	Conservation/ Management
	factor	Status	Efforts
Ungulates – habitat	A, D	Ongoing	Partially,
modification			Fenced on Lanai, Ungulate
			control on Maui
Landslides	A, E	Ongoing	No
Rats – herbivory	C	Ongoing	No
Slugs – seed predation	С	Ongoing	No
Invasive introduced	A, E	Ongoing	No
plants			
Climate change	Е	Increasing	No
Small population size	Е	Ongoing	Seed collection and small scale
			reintroduction, species still
			declining

#### 3.0 RESULTS

3.1	Recommended Classification:
	Downlist to Threatened
	Uplist to Endangered
	Delist
	Extinction
	Recovery
	Original data for classification in error
	$\underline{X}$ No change is needed
3.2	New Recovery Priority Number:
	Brief Rationale:
3.3	Listing and Reclassification Priority Number:
	Reclassification (from Threatened to Endangered) Priority
	Number:
	Reclassification (from Endangered to Threatened) Priority
	Number:
	Delisting (regardless of current classification) Priority Number:
	Brief Rationale:

#### 4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE ACTIONS

- Monitor known populations and collect any available seed for genetic storage and reintroduction.
- Maintain or build fences around existing populations to protect them from the negative impacts of ungulates.
- Control invasive introduced species around known populations.
- Develop and implement methods to control rats and slugs.
- Propagate to augment the existing populations.
- Establish additional populations within protected suitable habitat.
- Survey historical locations and appropriate remaining habitat for new individuals.
- Work with Hawaii Division of Forestry and Wildlife and other land managers to initiate planning and contribute to implementation of ecosystem-level restoration and management to benefit this species.
- Assess the modeled effects of climate change on this species, and use to determine future landscape needed for the recovery of the species.

#### 5.0 REFERENCES

- Bernice P. Bishop Museum. 1999. Hawaii's Extinct Species -- Plants. Available online at <a href="http://hbs.bishopmuseum.org/endangered/ext-plants.html">http://hbs.bishopmuseum.org/endangered/ext-plants.html</a>. Accessed 9 November 2009.
- Harold L. Lyon Arboretum Micropropagation Laboratory. 2010. Micropropagation database. University of Hawaii at Manoa. Unpublished.
- Hawaii Biodiversity and Mapping Program. 2009. Program database. Hawaii Biodiversity and Mapping Program, Honolulu, Hawaii.
- Lammers, T.G. 1998. New names and new combinations in Campanulaceae. Novon 8(1):31-35.
- Lammers, T.G. 2004. Five new species of the endemic Hawaiian genus *Cyanea* (Campanulaceae: Lobelioideae). Novon 14(1):84-101.

- National Tropical Botanical Garden. 2009. Living collections database. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. Unpublished.
- National Tropical Botanical Garden. 2010. Report on controlled propagation of listed and candidate species, as designated under the U.S. Endangered Species Act. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. 16 pages. Unpublished.
- Oppenheimer, H.L. 2009. *Cyanea grimesiana* 5-year review edits and comments. Plant Extinction Prevention Program, Lahaina, Hawaii. 17 pages. Unpublished.
- Perlman, S. 2009a. *Cyanea grimesiana* subsp. *grimesiana*. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. 4 pages. Unpublished.
- Perlman, S. 2009b. *Cyanea munroi*. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. 3 pages. Unpublished.
- Perlman, S. 2009c. *Cyanea magnicalyx*. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. 3 pages. Unpublished.
- Plant Extinction Prevention Program. 2009. Plant Extinction Prevention Program annual report: Fiscal Year 2009 (July 1, 2008-June 30, 2009). 115 pages. Unpublished.
- Plant Extinction Prevention Program. 2010. Plant Extinction Prevention Program annual report: Fiscal Year 2010 (July 1, 2009-June 30, 2010). 122 pages. Unpublished.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 1996. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; determination of threatened or endangered status for 14 plants from the Hawaiian Islands, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 61(198):52108-53124.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 1999. Recovery plan for multi- island plants. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Portland, Oregon. 206 pages + appendices.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2003a. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 3 plant species from the island of Lanai, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(6):1219-1273.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2003b. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 42 plant species from the island of Molokai, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(52):12982-13141.

- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2003c. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designations and nondesignations of critical habitat for 60 plant species from the islands of Maui and Kahoolawe, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(93):25934-26165.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2003d. Endangered and threatened wildlife and plants; final designation or nondesignation of critical habitat for 101 plant species from the island of Oahu, Hawaii; final rule. Federal Register 68(116):35949-35998.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2007a. Reinitiation of the 1999 biological opinion of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service for U.S. Army Military Training at Makua Military Reservation, island of Oahu. 639 pages + appendices.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2007b. *Cyanea grimesiana* ssp. *obatae* (Haha) 5-year review summary and evaluation. U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office, Honolulu, Hawaii. 9 pages. Available online at <a href="http://ecos.fws.gov/docs/five\_year\_review/doc1128.pdf">http://ecos.fws.gov/docs/five\_year\_review/doc1128.pdf</a>>.
- [USFWS] U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2009. Press release: Fish and Wildlife Service provides \$1 million in land acquisition funds to Hawaii. Honolulu, Hawaii. April 17, 2009.
- Wagner, W.L., D. Herbst, and S.H. Sohmer. 1999. Manual of the flowering plants of Hawaii, Revised Edition. University of Hawaii Press, Bishop Museum Press, Special Publication. 97:1-1918.
- Wood, K.R. 2009. *Cyanea munroi* and *Cyanea magnicalyx*. National Tropical Botanical Garden, Kalaheo, Hawaii. 5 pages. Unpublished.

#### **Personal Communications:**

- Oppenheimer, Hank. 2010. Maui Nui Island Coordinator, Plant Extinction Prevention Program, Lahaina, Hawaii. E-mail to Margaret A. Clark, National Tropical Botanical Garden, dated November 6, 2009. Subject: *Cyanea grimesiana*.
- Rowland, Craig. 2010. Conservation Partnerships Coordinator, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. E-mail to Marie Bruegmann, U.S Fish and Wildlife Service, dated April 16, 2010. Subject: RE: Additional information on status of Molokai easement.

#### SIGNATURE PAGE U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE

5-YEAR REVIEW of Cyanea grimesiana subsp. grimesiana (haha)

Current Classificat	ion: <u>E</u>
Pre-1996 DPS listin	ng still considered a listable entity? <u>N/A</u>
Recommendation r	esulting from the 5-year review:
	Delisting
	Reclassify from Endangered to Threatened status
X	Reclassify from Threatened to Endangered status No Change in listing status
<b>Review Conducted</b>	By:
Chelsie Javar	r, Fish and Wildlife Biologist
Marie Brueg	mann, Plant Recovery Coordinator
Jess Newton.	Recovery Program Lead
	ld Supervisor for Endangered Species
	10111
	1/2 / 1/1/1/2 8/2/11
Approved	Date //
Field Sup	ervisor, Pacific Islands Fish and Wildlife Office