

MINUTES
Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee Meeting
November 2-4, 2010
Santa Barbara, CA

TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 2, 2010

The meeting convened at 8:45 A.M with a traditional Chumash welcome from tribal representatives Stephen Franco and Ray Ward.

Meeting Opening and Committee Business

Eugenio Piñeiro-Soler, Chair of the MPA Federal Advisory Committee gave a warm welcome to the Committee, followed by welcoming remarks by Vice Chair, Lori Arguelles. Kara Yeager, Designated Federal Official and Communications and Outreach Coordinator for the MPA Center, opened the Marine Protected Areas Federal Advisory Committee (FAC) meeting and called roll. Three FAC members, Gary Davis, David Hyrenbach, and John Frampton, who were unable to attend the April 2010 meeting, introduced themselves to the full committee and provided a brief bio.

Vic Mastone moved to approve the minutes from the April 2010 meeting. It was seconded by the Vice Chair and the minutes were approved. National System Coordinator, Lauren Wenzel, updated the committee on the MPA FAC charter which was up for renewal. Upon the request of the Department of Commerce, the FAC will transition from a 30-member committee to a 20-member committee, effective October 31, 2011. The MPA Center will soon issue a Federal Register notice calling for nominations for six new members to replace the outgoing members for Fall 2011.

Subcommittees Meet 9:25 A.M. - 12:30 P.M.

12:30 P.M. -1:45 P.M. Lunch

National System Updates

Joseph Uravitch, Director of the National Marine Protected Areas Center, gave an update of FY2010 activities and the status of the FY2011 budget. The Center is operating under a Continuing Resolution and expecting the FY2011 budget sometime after the New Year. It is possible the Center will be appropriated similar funds as FY2010 with a working budget of \$3 million. Mr. Uravitch discussed recent staffing changes at the MPA Center, most notably his retirement as of January 1, 2011.

Looking forward, the national system will continue to evolve and strengthen by reaching out to new MPAs, states, and tribal entities. Additionally, the MPA Center is prepared to engage in the Administration's National Ocean Policy and will continue to follow the development of Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning (CMSP).

Lauren Wenzel discussed the FY2011 priorities for the national system, which include capacity building, defining and implementing the Cultural Heritage component, integrating national system activities with agency wide CMSP and climate change initiatives, and continuing to engage stakeholders and the public. In Spring 2010, sites were initially nominated to the system

during the second round of nominations. Twenty-nine sites were admitted, bringing the total to 254 member sites. The national system now includes federal MPA programs from 28 states and territories, 13 National Marine Sanctuaries, 29 National Parks, 106 National Wildlife Refuges, five National Estuarine Research Reserves, and one national monument. Lauren noted that the term “MPA” remains controversial and additional public outreach and agency inreach is necessary. Additionally, the MPA Center will continue to engage the tribes through government to government consultation. The third round of nominations is currently underway, and four National Marine Fishery Service sites have been nominated. If accepted, these will be the first federal fishery MPAs to be members of the national system. These nominations are a product of close coordination between NOAA Fisheries and the Mid Atlantic Council. The fourth round of nominations will close on Nov. 19, 2010.

The 2nd annual National System Partners retreat was held this past June in California. Discussions focused on MPA effectiveness, community-based MPAs, and stakeholder engagement.

Lauren gave a brief recap of the Cultural Heritage meeting that took place in Suquamish, WA this past October, which included tribal and indigenous representatives from all over the country. The meeting was successful in sharing information about the national system and helped to inform the ongoing work of the Cultural Heritage Resources Workgroup (CHRWG).

The MPA Center’s training partnership with the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries and NOAA’s Coral Reef Conservation Program conducted two training sessions in 2010, addressing climate change adaptation and developing MPA networks. The partnership is identifying new priorities for training by building on existing training efforts and enhancing the coastal and marine components, and developing a capacity assessment for national system partners. Additionally, the Center is expanding its communications materials and products. There is an increased focus on integrating multi-media into the MPA.gov website, making data more accessible in the form of web based tools, and developing a thematically focused newsletter and webinar series.

The MPA Partnership Fund, established with the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation, was created to support coordination and stewardship among members of the national system. This year the Center awarded its first five partnership grants. Requests for proposals for the 2011 grant cycle are currently on the MPA.gov website.

The MPA Center is refocusing its ecological gap analysis to work within the broader national CMSP context. The Center is conducting a spatial resource assessment for the California coast and, expanding the MPA Inventory to include additional resource and management information. Future steps include mapping ecological resources, linking those resources to the national system’s priority conservation objectives, and assessing the spatial coverage of those resources inside and outside existing MPAs.

Lauren briefed the Committee on the requirement in Section 5 of Executive Order 13158 (EO) for federal agencies to avoid harm to the natural and cultural resources that are protected by a national system MPA. The MPA Center has been working closely with NOAA’s MPA programs on NOAA Guidance for the avoid harm provision, which may serve as a model for implementation by other federal agencies. The

policy has been distributed to the federal agencies and Fishery Management Councils for review and is in the final stages of revision.

Finally, the MPA Center continues to work closely with the North American MPA Network (NAMPAN) and remain involved with the Specially Protected Areas and Wildlife in the Wider Caribbean Protocol (SPAW). NAMPAN has partnered with the International Commission on the Exploration of the Sea (ICES) and is preparing for a scientific workshop to develop guidelines for designing MPA networks in light of expected climate change impacts.

Coordination of the National System and the Integrated Ocean Observing System (IOOS)

Rondi Robinson of the MPA Center and Charles Alexander from NOAA's IOOS Program updated the Committee on the National System/IOOS Task Team. This interagency team was convened to address the 2008 committee recommendations on linking the national system and ocean observing systems. Both systems have a national footprint. IOOS collects oceanographic data and the national system could potentially provide sites for monitoring. The task team was charged with identifying specific end user products MPA managers need to evaluate the effectiveness of MPAs and MPA networks. This includes identifying the most important environmental parameters for MPA managers and recommending steps to expand the IOOS environmental reference network by adding marine sites. The Task Team convened an expert workshop in August 2010 to discuss ocean monitoring parameters, develop a proof of concept observing activity, list key considerations for the integration of MPAs as potential sites into the IOOS, and develop recommendations for expanding the climate reference network to include marine sites.

Discussion

Elliott Norse of the Marine Conservation Biology Institute asked the presenters if pH had been considered in the climate monitoring parameters discussed. Rondi replied it is as a parameter that should be regularly monitored. Joe Schumacker noted that the Pacific Northwest tribes have a solid working relationship with IOOS and look to the organization for oceanographic information.

Subcommittees Meet 2:50 P.M. – 4: 30 P.M.

Public Comment

The Chair introduced the public comment period by explaining the role of the committee as a non-regulatory body that advises the Departments of Commerce and the Interior.

Sarah Abramson from Heal the Bay, thanked the MPA FAC for visiting California, noting it is inspiring for the local grassroots conservation effort. Heal the Bay has been very involved with MPAs, serving on the regional stakeholder group during the Marine Life Protection Act (MLPA) process and currently by sitting on the MLPA statewide interest group. They have also worked very closely with the angling community. Sarah applauded the MPA FAC for its work and encouraged the Committee to go back and fill in holes in the network in the context of CMSP and to ensure a more comprehensive network of MPAs.

Kristy Birney, representing the Environmental Defense Center, was active in the establishment of MPAs in the Channel Islands and the MLPA process. She explained the proposed MPAs for

the South Coast of California do not meet the minimum size and spacing guidelines. Kristy urged the MPA FAC to continue to support science based processes in MPA design.

Jenn Eckerle, from the Natural Resources Defense Council, thanked the MPA FAC for all its hard work. She has been involved in the MLPA process and noted the success of community involvement. Jenn explained that strong science guidelines were integral to the MLPA process and were useful in facilitating negotiations between user groups.

Greg Helms, representing the Ocean Conservancy, encouraged the MPA FAC to look at the Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary and National Park as models of strong federal leadership. They are also good examples of the positive social impacts of MPAs. Local communities are benefiting from the Park and other MPAs.

Christine Fancher, representing herself, expressed her concern over land development and the impacts to sacred Chumash sites. These sites are extremely vulnerable and there is a lack of action from City Commissioners and Supervisors.

WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 3, 2010

8:40 Call to order

Panel: Resilient Coastal Communities and MPAs

Dr. Charles Wahle, Acting Senior Scientist for NOAA's Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning (CMSP) Program, discussed the National Social Science Strategy that was developed by the MPA Center in 2003. He explained that social science is critical to successful MPA management. Social science research is recognized as a critical part of MPA design and implementation but timely integration into the MPA process remains difficult. As an example, social science is often brought into the design process to late and continues to be overshadowed by ecological issues. Dr. Wahle noted that although the MPA Center's social science initiative lost funding, key concepts from the Strategy were used to develop the work of the Ocean Uses Atlas.

Comments:

Joe Schumacker asked how the Social Science Strategy involved the tribes. Dr. Wahle explained that traditional and local ecological knowledge is very important information for MPA planning processes and should be incorporated. Andrew Gude asked if Dr. Wahle thought the MPA community has a done sufficient job at incorporating social science research into design processes. Dr. Wahle acknowledged that practitioners and managers are much more aware of the issues but there is still more work to be done.

Dr. Bob Pomeroy, Sea Grant Fisheries Specialist at the University of Connecticut, discussed the social implications of MPAs based on work he has done in the Philippines. Understanding the social impacts, community perceptions and attitudes, and the socioeconomic environment of the community are necessary to gain successful buy-in and community ownership of an MPA. Every community is different in culture, how local residents adapt to risk, and the incentives that drive

their decision making. All of these elements shape the local success of a community managed MPA.

Dr. Matthew Lauer, an anthropology professor at the San Diego State University, presented the findings of a participatory GIS project that integrated indigenous ecological knowledge, and artisanal fishing data to inform the design of MPAs in the Solomon Islands. Since 2001, 30 small MPAs have been established in the research area. There is very little baseline marine science data in the area and the establishment of most MPAs was driven by social science projects involving local communities. Local fishermen were asked to interpret aerial photographs of the lagoon. Their visual assessments were later incorporated into GIS, and benthic surveys were completed to validate the local fishermen's knowledge. In the Solomon Islands local knowledge is embedded in an activity, such as fishing. This type of research encourages us to explore the many different forms of knowing that may be ignored in conventional scientific thinking yet could be important to the success of an MPA.

Report out from the Land and Sea/Communities Subcommittee (LSCS)

Dr. Sarah Robinson, Vice Chair of LSCS and lead on the resilient communities component, reviewed the Subcommittee charge. This past summer the Subcommittee met in Monterey and discussed, at length, many different definitions of community. The Subcommittee agreed that a case study approach was needed to better understand the issues. Six case studies were drafted on MPAs and their interactions with associated communities in preparation for the FAC meeting. The Subcommittee will continue to discuss the case studies and use them as a reference as it moves towards a white paper and recommendations in the Fall of 2011.

Phil Renaud, Vice Chair of LSCS and lead on the land/sea component, reviewed the current Large Marine Ecosystem (LME) approach to land/sea interactions. MPA examples were identified in four LMEs illustrating different management regimes at the land/sea interface. The Subcommittee is identifying ways in which natural and cultural resources are affected by land/sea interactions, and plans to draft a white paper with recommendations on their findings for the Fall 2011 meeting.

Panel: Coastal and Marine Spatial Planning

Dr. Charles Wahle, Acting Senior Scientist for NOAA's CMSP Program, discussed the National Ocean Policy. To improve national coordination and leadership, the policy establishes a National Ocean Council (NOC) to be led by the White House's Council on Environmental Quality and the Office of Science and Technology Policy. The NOC is made up of 27 federal Cabinet level agencies that coordinate actions to achieve the policy's goals. In addition to the Department of Commerce, NOAA has its own seat on the Council given its unique and important role in coastal and ocean research, planning and management. The policy calls for the establishment of nine Regional Planning Bodies to develop coastal and marine spatial plans. NOAA will also participate on all nine Regional Planning Bodies and bring the coordinated cross-NOAA expertise to bear through its existing Regional Collaboration Teams. The President's FY2011 Budget Request includes a request for \$20M for competitive Regional Ocean Partnership Grants to help support CMSP and, regional ocean governance priority actions. The MPA FAC has

already submitted a letter to the DOC and DOI that highlights past work that relates to CMSP and current tools and analyses that will be helpful in the future.

Jessica Hamilton Keys, Natural Resources Policy Advisor to Governor Ted Kulongoski of Oregon, presented a west coast perspective on regional ocean partnerships and CMSP. In 2006, the governors of Washington, Oregon, and California signed the West Coast Governors' Agreement (WCGA), which laid out a plan to cooperatively address threats to marine resources across the three states. The WCGA is driven by seven priorities and 26 actions, some which were highlighted as being linked to the National Ocean Policy and CMSP. Ms. Keys also discussed some common goals that the WCGA shares with the National CMSP Framework, namely: promoting resilient ecosystems, providing public access of the coast and offshore waters, reducing user conflicts and environmental impacts, supporting sustainable uses, and enhancing interagency, intergovernmental and international communication and collaboration. In order to move forward with the WCGA and regional CMSP, additional and sustained resources for the regions and states are critical. This includes both direct support for states and regions to conduct CMSP activities prioritized by the regions as well as indirect support from federal agencies in the form of engagement and technical assistance. National guidance and activities should continue to reflect the flexibility needed by states and regions in approaching CMSP. National guidance should also acknowledge, reflect, and involve regional/state/local expertise in developing any national criteria or launching CMSP related activities. The WCGA has not received funding for FY2011 but is anticipating a budget of around \$1million. The west coast region will submit proposals along with other regions for part of the \$20 million in the President's budget for Regional Ocean Partnership grants in December for FY2011.

Dr. Pricilla Brooks, Director of the Ocean Conservation Program at the Conservation Law Foundation, discussed the development of the Massachusetts Ocean Plan. Massachusetts was the first state to develop and release a comprehensive ocean management plan for their state waters. The initiative was driven by an increase in the use of coastal waters, including alternative energy projects, and concern that the state did not have the capacity to adequately manage such diverse uses. The Massachusetts Oceans Act of 2008 gave the state 18 months to develop and release a comprehensive ocean plan. State legislation required that the plan be implemented through existing legislation and all state licenses, permits and approvals needed to be consistent with the plan. Eleven types of "special, sensitive, and unique" areas were mapped and helped guide site areas suitable for renewable energy, cables, pipelines, and other uses. The development of the Massachusetts Ocean Plan was funded through a public-private partnership between the state and the Gordon and Betty Moore Foundation.

12:15 Lunch

Subcommittee business: CMSP Letter

David Blazer, CMSP Subcommittee Vice Chair, presented a letter that was drafted by the CMSP Subcommittee to inform the Secretaries of DOC and DOI of the knowledge and experience of the FAC and to encourage the use of the FAC as a resource throughout the CMSP process. Gary Davis asked David to clarify the desired outcome of sending the letter. David explained that the intended outcome would be that the agencies would be aware of the MPA FAC's relevant work

products and experience as well as recognize the important role of MPAs and the National System in regional CMSP plans and in the larger CMSP process. Victor Mastone moved to adopt the letter. Lori Arguelles seconded the motion. The letter was adopted unanimously.

Cultural Heritage Resources Workgroup

Victor Mastone, Co-chair of the Cultural Heritage Resources Workgroup, asked Joe Schumacker to give a brief summary of the meeting of tribal and indigenous representatives that took place in Suquamish, Washington this past October. Vic noted that during the tribal meeting, some revisions were suggested for the Framework. The Workgroup and tribal representatives discussed moving beyond the criteria listed in the National Register of Historic Places and suggested additional tribal/indigenous language to augment and/or replace some of the current language used in the Framework. The committee discussed new language about cultural landscapes, and made some edits to the Workgroup's recommendations. Jesús Ruiz moved to adopt the amended recommendations to the Framework. Bob Wargo seconded the motion. The recommendations were passed unanimously.

Subcommittees Meet 3:15 P.M. - 4:15 P.M.

Will McClintock, Director of the MarineMap Consortium

Will McClintock gave a brief description of MarineMap, a web based, participatory decision support tool. This tool was designed to visualize social and ecological attributes of coastal areas, draw and assemble networks of prospective MPAs, specify regulations, and generate reports that assess MPAs according to scientific guidelines as well as social and economic impacts. MarineMap was used extensively throughout California's Marine Life Protection Act process as a means for stakeholder input to be organized and incorporated.

Mimi D'Iorio, GIS database manager at the MPA Center, added that the MPA Center has developed a web-based MPA mapping tool. The tool allows the user to query by state, management agency, and level of protection. Michelle Ridgway inquired whether the MPA Center GIS staff could provide a more hands-on demonstration or workshop on the new GIS web tools being developed; Mimi affirmed that this would be considered for a future meeting.

Background Presentation on The Channel Island National Marine Sanctuary/National Park

Chris Mobley, Superintendent of the Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary and Russell Galipeau, Superintendent of the Channel Islands National Park, gave the FAC a brief presentation on the Sanctuary and Park in preparation for tomorrow's field trip to the Santa Cruz Island.

Committee Business

Kara Yeager thanked the FAC members for all of their hard work throughout the meeting. Kara mentioned that the FAC will hear from the MPA Center in the next few weeks to confirm dates for the next meeting and about follow up work with the Subcommittees.

The Committee adjourned at 5:15 P. M.

Committee members present:

Ms. Lori Arguelles, Vice Chair
Mr. David Blazer
Dr. Pricilla Brooks
Dr. Gary Davis
Mr. John Frampton
Mr. Rick Gaffney
Ms. Karen Garrison
Mr. George Geiger
Dr. David Hyrenbach
Mr. Victor Mastone*
Ms. Melissa Miller-Henson
Dr. Elliott Norse
Mr. Alvin Osterback
Mr. Eugenio Piñeiro-Soler, Chair
Dr. Robert Pomeroy
Dr. Hans Radtke
Captain Philip G. Renaud, USN (Ret.)
Ms. Michelle Ridgway
Dr. Sarah Robinson
Mr. Jesús C. Ruiz*
Mr. Joe Schumacker*
Dr. Della Scott-Ireton *
Mr. Bruce A. Tackett
Mr. Robert Wargo
Mr. David H. Wallace

*Also a member of the Cultural Heritage Resources Workgroup.

Cultural Heritage Resources Working Group members present:

Dr. Hans Van Tilburg
John Wilson
Dr. Brian Jordan
Victor Mastone
John Foster
Joe Schumacker
Dr. Della Scott-Ireton
Jesús Ruiz
Dr. John Jensen

Ex Officio members/ representatives present:

Mr. Andrew Gude, DOI/US Fish and Wildlife Service
Mr. Bret Wolfe, US Fish and Wildlife Service
Mr. Steven Tucker, US Coast Guard/ Department of Homeland Security

Mr. Cliff McCreedy, US Parks Service

Ms. Heather Sagar, NOAA National Marine Fisheries Service

NOAA National Marine Protected Areas Center staff:

Mr. Joseph A. Uravitch, Director

Dr. Charles Wahle, Acting Senior Scientist, NOAA's CMSP Program

Ms. Lauren Wenzel, National System Coordinator

Ms. Abby Gray, Program Analyst

Dr. Valerie Grussing, Cultural Resources Coordinator

Ms. Kara Yeager, Communications Coordinator and Designated Federal Official

Ms. Julia Townsend, Program Analyst

Ms. Rondi Robison, Conservation Planner

Dr. Mimi D'Iorio, GIS Database Manager

Ms. Jackie Sommers, Administrative Assistant

Dr. Robert Brock, Senior Marine Biologist