DOTUS Department of TransportationPHMSAPipelines and Hazardous Materials Safety AdministrationOPSOffice of Pipeline Safety
Central Region

Principal Investigator	MNOPS/James Bunn/Karen Butler		
Region Director	Allan Beshore		
Date of Report	11/14/2014		
Subject	Failure Investigation Report – Northern Natural Gas Co (NNG) – Natural Force Damage		

Operator, Location, & Consequences

Date of Failure	05/23/2008		
Commodity Released	Natural Gas		
City/County & State	Beaver Bay / Lake, Minnesota		
OpID & Operator Name	13750 Northern Natural Gas Co		
Unit # & Unit Name	903 Carlton [IA] (NNG) (NNG)		
SMART Activity #	124375		
Milepost / Location	MP 59.5, Reserve Mining Branch Line MNB72701		
Type of Failure	Natural Force Damage, crack in a dent		
Fatalities	0		
Injuries	0		
Description of Area impacted	Rural, Class 1, Non-HCA		
Total Costs	\$530,000		

Failure Investigation Report – Northern Natural Gas Co – Natural Force Damage

Failure Date 05/23/2008

Executive Summary

On May 23, 2008, an instrumented aerial leak survey was in progress by a contracted service for Northern Natural Gas Company (NNG). During this leak survey, a leak was discovered in the Reserve Mining Branch Line (MNB72701) at approximately 2:57 p.m. CDT. Local field personnel were notified directly from the contracted leak survey service. The NNG control center was contacted by field personnel and began to reduce operating pressure (405 psig to approximately 275 psig). This pipeline serves the Reserve Mine and three additional towns in Minnesota. The leak was physically located at approximately 7:00 p.m. CDT by NNG field personnel at MP 59.5 in Lake County, Minnesota, approximately 1.1 miles northeast of the intersection of County Road 3 and County Road 4. The leak was not located in an HCA. There were no reported evacuations, road closings, fires, injuries or fatalities as a result of the leak. The state partner, Minnesota Office of Pipeline Safety (MNOPS), investigated the release on-site. The leak originated at a 1-inch long crack that was located in a dent on the bottom of the pipe. The pipe was found to be resting on a sharp piece of granite. The original construction of the pipeline was in 1961. Ground subsidence was reported to have caused the dented pipe to fail. Weather and contract resource availability delayed the installation of a 16-inch Type B repair sleeve. The pipeline repair work was completed on June 3, 2008. The operator has estimated the cost of this incident to be \$530,000.

After the incident, NNG ran High Resolution MFL and Caliber tools on the Reserve Mining Branch Line and discovered six dents with metal loss. MNOPS completed a follow-up inspection in 2009 and confirmed that all six dents with metal loss were scheduled for repair by May of 2010. All repairs have been completed.

System Details

The Northern Natural Gas Pipe Line system consists of approximately 15,000 miles of pipelines and storage facilities. The system transports natural gas from the gathering fields in New Mexico, Texas, Oklahoma and Kansas to market areas in the upper Midwest. The Reserve Mining Branch Line is part of the Northern Branch System and provides natural gas to the mine as well as three towns including Beaver Bay and Silver Bay, Minnesota. The portion of the pipeline containing the failure was composed of 16-inch diameter by 0.219-inch wall thickness, API 5L X52, low frequency ERW line pipe manufactured by Republic Steel with coal tar enamel as the external coating and was cathodically protected. The pipeline was installed in 1961.

Events leading up to the Failure

The maximum allowable operating pressure (MAOP) of the pipeline is 425 psig, which corresponds to a hoop stress level of 30 percent of the specified minimum yield strength (SMYS) of the pipe. The pressure at the time and location of failure was 405 psig, which corresponds to a hoop stress of 29 percent (95 percent of MAOP). The MAOP for the Reserve Mining pipeline was reported to be established in accordance with 192.619 (a) (4), the pressure determined by the operator to be the maximum safe pressure after considering the history of the segment.

Emergency Response

The pressure in the line at the time of detection of the leak was 405 psig. When the Control Center was notified of the potential leak, actions to reduce line pressure were implemented. The pressure in the pipeline was ultimately reduced to a pressure of approximately 275 psig. The area around the leak was secured until repairs could be made. NNG reported the incident to the NRC at 6:27 p.m. CDT on May 23, 2008.

Return to Service

Between May 23, 2008, and May 29, 2008, delays to repair activities occurred due to weather and contract resource availability. On May 29, 2008, NNG began excavation activities in order to install stopple fittings. After the fittings were installed, a bypass was constructed around the leak area. The section of the line that contained the leak was blown down and the line was excavated to expose the leak. The pipe was resting on a piece of granite at the leak location. A dent had formed in the pipe where it was resting on the rock. The dent was approximately 11 inches long, 7 inches wide and 0.903 inches deep. The bottom of the dent contained a thru-wall crack that was approximately 1 inch long. The repair to the failed section of pipe was made with a 16-inch Type B weld sleeve approximately 24 inches long. On June 3, 2008, repair work was completed and the pipeline returned to normal service.

Investigation Details

Angel Service ITT was conducting an aerial leak survey on the Reserve Mining Branch Pipeline on March 23, 2008. The aerial leak survey contractor identified a potential leak site on the pipeline route and notified NNG personnel at the NNG Carlton Compressor Station of the findings at approximately 2:57 p.m. CDT. Carlton personnel notified the NNG Control Center of the potential leak and the Control Center began to reduce the pressure in the line. NNG dispatched a crew to the site of the potential leak with a flame ionization unit. When the crew reached the area of the leak, the leak was confirmed when an area of dead vegetation was observed and a reading of 5 percent Lower Explosive Limit was measured. NNG secured the site and continued to monitor the atmosphere until a stopple bypass could be installed and the leak site could be excavated. After the line was excavated it was found to be resting on a sharp piece of granite at the leak location. A dent had been formed in the pipe body where the pipe was resting on the granite. A 1-inch long thru-wall crack was found in the bottom of the dent. The repair to the failed section of pipe was made with a 16-inch Type B weld sleeve approximately 24 inches long. On June 3, 2008, repair work was completed and the pipeline returned to normal service.

In February of 2009, NNG completed High Resolution MFL and Caliber tools on the Reserve Mining Branch pipeline. MNOPS reviewed the information associated with the Inline inspection (ILI) during an inspection in May of 2009 (inspection was called the Welcome audit). The ILI run determined that there were no immediate repairs required, 28 scheduled repairs, and six dents with metal loss (wall loss less than or equal to 5 percent). All six dents were reported by the operator as occurring outside of a High Consequence Area and were repaired by May of 2010.

Findings & Contributing Factors

The failure origin was a 1-inch crack located in a dent in the pipe body. The crack was located in the

Failure Investigation Report – Northern Natural Gas Co – Natural Force Damage

Failure Date 05/23/2008

bottom of a dent that measured approximately 11 inches in length, 7 inches circumferentially and 0.903 inches deep. A rock that was impinging on the pipeline at the 6 o'clock position caused the dent. Ground subsidence, combined with the impinging rock, caused the dented pipe to fail.

Appendix	Description
А	Maps and Photographs
В	NRC Report
С	Operator's Incident Report

Appendix A Map Removed File Available at PHMSA



Wide-angle image showing impinging rock

Closeup of impinging rock





Hilly area leading up to failure site

Additional broad view of site



Excavation site



Alternate angle



Constructing bypass



Bypass from alternate angle



Area after rain



Closeup of damage to pipe wall



Hand excavation



Completed repair



NATIONAL RESPONSE CENTER 1-800-424-8802 *** For Public Use *** Information released to a third party shall comply with any applicable federal and/or state Freedom of Information and Privacy Laws

Incident Report # 871912

INCIDENT DESCRIPTION

*Report taken at 19:27 on 23-MAY-08 Incident Type: PIPELINE Incident Cause: UNKNOWN Affected Area: The incident was discovered on 23-MAY-08 at 17:30 local time. Affected Medium: AIR /ATMOPSHERE

SUSPECTED RESPONSIBLE PARTY

Organization:

County: LAKE

NORTHERN NATURAL GAS COMPANY OMAHA, NE 68124

Type of Organization: PRIVATE ENTERPRISE

INCIDENT LOCATION

City: SILVER BAY State: MN *** CALLER HAD VERY LITTLE INFORMATION***

RELEASED MATERIAL(S)

CHRIS Code: ONG Official Material Name: NATURAL GAS Also Known As:

Qty Released: 0 UNKNOWN AMOUNT

DESCRIPTION OF INCIDENT

CALLER IS REPORTING THAT NATURAL GAS RELEASED FROM AN UNDERGROUND PIPELINE DUE TO UNKNOWN CAUSES.

INCIDENT DETAILS

Pipeline Type: TRANSMISSION DOT Regulated: YES Pipeline Above/Below Ground: BELOW Exposed or Under Water: NO Pipeline Covered: UNKNOWN

		Ī	DAMAGES	
Fire Involv	ed: NO	Fire Extinguished:	UNKNOWN	
INJURIES:		Hospitalized:	Empl/Crew:	Passenger:
FATALITIES:		Empl/Crew:	Passenger:	Occupant:
EVACUATIONS	: NO	Who Evacuated:	Radius/Area:	
Damages:	NO			
losure Typ	•		Length of	Direction of
		escription of Closure	Closure	<u>Closure</u>
Air:	N			
Road:	N			Majo Arte
Naterway:	N			
rack:	N			
Passengers !	Transfe	erred: NO		

N

Environmental Impact: NO Media Interest: NONE Community Impact due to Material:

LOWERING PRESSURE ON THE LINE Release Secured: YES Release Rate: Estimated Release Duration:

WEATHER

REMEDIAL ACTIONS

Weather: OVERCAST, °F

ADDITIONAL AGENCIES NOTIFIED Federal: NONE NONE State/Local: State/Local On Scene: NONE State Agency Number: NO REPORT # NOTIFICATIONS BY NRC ATLANTIC STRIKE TEAM (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 USCG ICC (ICC ONI) 23-MAY-08 19:33 DOT CRISIS MANAGEMENT CENTER (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 U.S. EPA V (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:37 FLD INTEL SUPPORT TEAM DETROIT (COMMAND CENTER) 23-MAY-08 19:33 MN BUREAU OF CRIMINAL APPREHENSION (OPERATIONS CENTER) 23-MAY-08 19:33 MN DEPT OF HEALTH (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 MN U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE (ATTN: CARL WAHL) 23-MAY-08 19:33 NTL ENVMTL EMERG CENTRE CANADA (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 NATIONAL INFRASTRUCTURE COORD CTR (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 NOAA RPTS FOR MN (MAIN OFFICE) 23-MAY-08 19:33 SECTOR SAULT ST MARIE (MSO DULUTH) 23-MAY-08 19:36 MSD ST. PAUL (CGIS) 23-MAY-08 19:33 SURFACE TRANS SECURITY INSPECT PROG (COMMAND CENTER) 23-MAY-08 19:33 USCG DISTRICT 9 (COMMAND CENTER) 23-MAY-08 19:33

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION CALLER HAD NO ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

*** END INCIDENT REPORT # 871912 ***

Appendix C - Operator's Incident Report

	· · · · ·	9 USC 1678. OMB No. 2137-0522
S. Department of Transportation		Report Date Jun 05, 2008
esearch and Special Programs GATHERING	G SYSTEMS	No. <u>20080058 4441</u> (DOT Use Only)
INSTRUCTIONS <i>mportant:</i> Please read the separate instructions for constructions for construction requested and provide specific can obtain one from the Office Of Pipeline	examples. If you do not have	e a copy of the instructions, you
ART A – GENERAL REPORT INFORMATION Check one or m	ore boxes as appropriate:	
	eport X Supplemental Rep	oort 🛛 🗶 Final Report
a. Operator's 5-digit Identification Number (when known) / 1	<u>3750 /</u>	
b. If Operator does not own the pipeline, enter Owner's 5-digit Ide	ntification Number (when known)	
c. Name of Operator NORTHERN NATURAL GAS	CO	
d. Operator street address 1111 SOUTH 103RD STR	EET	
e. Operator address OMAHA, DOUGLAS, NE,	68124	
City, County or Parrish, State and Zip Code		
. Time and date of the incident / <u>1457 /</u> / <u>05 /</u> / <u>23 /</u> / <u>2008/</u>		al number of people: //
hr. month day year	Employees: <u>I</u>	
. Location of incident	Non-employee Contractors:	
a. APPROXIMATELY 1 MILE WEST OF LA Nearest street or road	 b. Injury requiring inpatient hospitalization Tot 	al number of people: / 0 /
b. BEAVER BAY LAKE	Employees: 0 1	General Public: / 0 /
City and County or Parrish	Non-employee Contractors:	
c. <u>MN 55601</u> State and Zip Code	c. X Property damage/loss (e	stimated) Total \$ <u>530000</u>
d. Mile Post/Valve Station APPROX 59.5		00 Operator damage \$ 51420
e. Survey Station No.		damage \$0
f. Latitude: <u>47.27101</u> Longitude: <u>-91.34526</u> (if not available, see instructions for how to provide specific location)	d.	
g. Class location description Onshore: ● Class 1 ◯ Class 2 ◯ Class 3 ◯ Class 4	g. Evacuation (general publ	lic only) / 0 / people
Offshore: Class 1 (complete rest of this item)	Reason for Evacuation:	
Area Block #	Emergency worker or p Threat to the public	oublic official ordered, precautionary
State / / or Outer Continental Shelf	 Elapsed time until area was m 	
h. Incident on Federal Land other than Quter Continental Shelf	/ 1 / hr. /	
	7. Telephone Report	<u>,</u>
i. Is pipeline Interstate • Yes O No		<u>/ 05 / / 23 / /2008/</u>
. Type of leak or rupture	/ 871912 / NRC Report Number	month day year
• Leak: OPinhole Connection Failure (complete sec. F5)	8. a. Estimated pressure at point	t and time of incident:
Puncture) diameter (inches) 1	405	PSIG
Rupture: Circumferential – Separation	b. Max. allowable operating pr	ressure (MAOP): <u>425</u> PSIG
C Longitudinal – Tear/Crack, length (inches)	c. MAOP established by 49 C	
Propagation Length, total, both sides (feet)	☐ 192.619 (a)(1) ☐	192. 619 (a)(2) 192. 619 (a)(3)
◯ N/A ◯ Other:	_ (/// _	□192. 619 (C) occur relating to the incident?
•		
ART B – PREPARER AND AUTHORIZED SIGNATURE		
PVPON H WOOD	<u>.</u>	(402) 398-7396
BYRON H. WOOD ype or print) Preparer's Name and Title	Are	a Code and Telephone Number
BYRON.WOOD@NNGCO.COM		(402) 398-7606
reparer's E-mail Address	Are	a Code and Facsimile Number
	Date Are	a Code and Telephone Number

Appendix C - Operator's Incident Report

PART C - ORIGIN OF THE INCIDENT				
1. Incident occurred on 3 ● Transmission System	. Material involved (pipe, fitting, or other component) Steel 			
◯ Gathering System	\bigcirc Plastic (If plastic, complete all items that apply in a-c)			
◯ Transmission Line of Distribution System	Plastic failure was: a.ductile b.brittle c.joint failure			
2. Failure occurred on ● Body of pipe	C Material other than plastic or steel:			
G Joint 4	 Part of system involved in incident ● Pipeline C Regulator/Metering System 			
◯ Component	C Compressor Station			
O Other:	Year the pipe or component which failed was installed: / 1961 /			
PART D – MATERIAL SPECIFICATION (if applicable)				
	1. Area of incident			
1. Nominal pipe size (NPS) / 16 / in. 2. Wall thickness / .22 / in.	C Under pavement C Above ground			
3. Specification <u>5LX</u> SMYS / <u>52000</u> /	Under ground QUnder water			
4. Seam type <u>ERW</u>	C Inside/under building			
4. Ocan type HIN	2. Depth of cover: <u>38</u> inches			
5. Valve type				
6. Pipe or valve manufactured by <u>REPUBLIC</u>	in year <u>/</u> _/			
PART F – APPARENT CAUSE cause of the incident. Check one	ered causes in this section. Check the box to the left of the primary e circle in each of the supplemental items to the right of or below the ructions for this form for guidance.			
F1 – CORROSION If either F1 (1) External Corrosion, or F	1 (2) Internal Corrosion is checked, complete all subparts a – e.			
a. Pipe Coating b. Visual Examina				
1. C External Corrosion C Bare C Localized P				
└\ Coated O General Co				
○ Other:	C Microbiological Stress Corrosion Cracking			
	○ Other:			
	~			
2. C Internal Corrosion C No C Yes How long prior	area of corrosion? to incident: <u>// years</u> // months			
F2 – NATURAL FORCES				
3. Earth Movement => Earthquake Subsidence	C Landslide C Other:			
4. C Lightning 5. C Heavy Rains/Floods ⇒ C Washouts C Flotation	C Mudslide C Scouring C Other:			
6. C Temperature => O Thermal stress O Frost heave	C Frozen components C Other:			
7. C High Winds				
F3 - EXCAVATION				
8. \bigcirc Operator Excavation Damage (including their contractors) / Not 7	Third Party			
 C Third Party Excavation Damage (complete a-d) a. Excavator group 				
\bigcirc General Public \bigcirc Government \bigcirc Excavator other t				
b. Type: C Road Work C Pipeline C Water C Electric	Sewer C Phone/Cable C Landowner C Railroad			
c. Did operator get prior notification of excavation activity?				
○ No ○ Yes: Date received: / / mo. / / day / / yr. Notification received from: ○ One Call System ○ Excavator ○ Contractor ○ Landowner				
d. Was pipeline marked?				
 ○ No ○ Yes (If Yes, check applicable items i – iv) i. Temporary markings: ○ Flags ○ Stakes ○ Paint 				
ii. Permanent markings:	Not Accurate			
iv. Were marks made within required time? OY				
F4 – OTHER OUTSIDE FORCE DAMAGE				
10. C Fire/Explosion as primary cause of failure => Fire/Explosion	cause: 🔾 Man made 🛛 C Natural			
11. C Car, truck or other vehicle not relating to excavation activity damaging pipe				
12. C Rupture of Previously Damaged Pipe				
13. 🔿 Vandalism				

Form RSPA F 7100.2 (01-2002)

Page 2 of 3

E5 – N	ATERIAL AND WE						
	erial						
	C Body of Pipe	=>	Q Dent	◯ Gouge	C Wrinkle Bend	◯ Arc Burn	O Other:
14.	C Component	=>	Q Valve			C Extruded Outlet	O Other:
		=>	Gasket		-		
16.	C Joint	=>	Gasket	C O-Ring	C Threads		◯ Other:
Wel	d						
17.	⊂ Butt	=>	O Pipe	◯ Fabrication			Other:
18.	⊂ Fillet	=>	O Branch	🔾 Hot Tap	○ Fitting	C Repair Sleeve	◯ Other:
19.	○ Pipe Seam	=>	🔾 LF ERW	◯ DSAW	○ Seamless	◯ Flash Weld	
			◯ HF ERW	⊂ saw	Spiral		◯ Other:
Con	plete a-g if you	indic	ate any cause	e in part F5.			
	a. Type of failure	:			_		\wedge
	C Construe	ction D	Defect => 🔾 P	oor Workmanship	C Procedure r	not followed C Poor	Construction Procedures
	C Material	Defec	t				
	b. Was failure du	e to pi	ipe damage sust	ained in transportati	on to the constructior	n or fabrication site?	CYes Q No
	c. Was part whic	h leak	ed pressure teste	ed before incident of	ccurred? 🔾 Yes, d	complete d-g C No	
	d Data of toat:	,	1 ma 1	/ day /	1.50		
	d. Date of test:	1	<u>/</u> mo. <u>/</u>	<u>/</u> day /	<u> </u>		
	e. Test medium:	0	Water 🔾 Na	tural Gas 🔾 Iner	t Gas 🔾 Other:		
	f. Time held at te	st pres	ssure: /	<u>/</u> hr.			
	g. Estimated test	press	ure at point of in	cident:	$ \longrightarrow (c $	PSIG	
E6 E	QUIPMENT AND C					\rightarrow	
							Other
	Malfunction of Co			-		Pressure Regulator Machanical Counting	
	Threads Stripped				s Valve Threads	C Mechanical Couplin	ngs 📿 Other:
22. (Ruptured or Leak	ing Se	al/Pump Packing		$\geq (0) >$		
23. (Incorrect Operation	on		_			
	a. Type: 🔾 Ina	adequa	ate Procedures	O Inadequate Safe	ety Practices 🛛 🔾 Fa	ilure to Follow Procedur	es 🔾 Other:
	b. Number of em	ployee	es involved who f	ailed post-incident c	Irug test: /	/ Alcohol test: /	<u>/</u>
	c. Were most senior employee(s) involved qualified? C Yes O No d. Hours on duty: //						
	THER			$\overline{}$			
	Miscellaneous, de Unknown	escribe	*	\sim			
20.	C Investigation	Comp	olete C Still	Jnder Investigation	(submit a supplemen	tal report when investiga	ation is complete)
PART	PART G – NARRATIVE DESCRIPTION OF FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO THE EVENT (Attach additional sheets as necessary)						
	ON MAY 23, AT APPROXIATELY 14:57 THE CARLTON LOCATION WAS NOTIFIED BY ANGEL SERVICE ITT CORP, THAT THEY HAD						
							HAT THERE WAS A DETECTION
							BRANCH LINE ON THE ILLEPOST 59.5. NORTHERN
PERS	ONNEL PROCEEDE	D TO	REDUCE THE P	RESSURE FROM 40	5 TO 300 PSIG A	ND SENT PERSONNEL	TO THE SITE TO UTILIZE
PORTABLE LEAK DETECTION EQUIPMENT TO VERIFY IF THERE WAS A LEAK. A LEAK WAS DETECTED @ THE APPROXIMATE LOCATION INDICATED. A STRONG HYDRO CARBON SMELL WAS DETECTED, A READING OF 5% LEL WAS INDICATED AND A PATCH							
OF DEAD VEGETATION APPROXIMATELY 15 FT IN DIAMETER WAS NOTED. ACTIONS WERE TAKEN TO ACQUIRE THE SERVICES OF A							
CONTRACTOR AND ARRANGE FOR NORTHERN'S STOPPLE CREW TO PROCEED TO THE SITE. AN 8-INCH STOPPLE AND BYPASS WAS INSTALLED AROUND THE LEAK AREA, THEN THE SECTION OF LINE WAS BLOWN DOWN AND EXCAVATED. A ROCK WAS FOUND TO							
HAVE IMPINGED ON THE PIPELINE AT THE 6 O'CLOCK POSITION. THE IMPINGMENT RESULTED IN A DENT MEASURING							
APPROXIMATELY 11 INCHES LONGITUDINALLY, SEVEN INCHES CIRCUFERENTIALLY AND 0.903 INCHES DEEP. THERE WAS A CRACK LOCATED AT THE BOTTOM OF THE DENT MEASURING APPROXIMATELY 1-INCH LONG. IT WAS DETERMINED THAT THE LEAK							
COULD BE REPAIRED BY INSTALLATION OF A 2-FOOT BY 16-INCH TYPE B PRESSURIZED CONTAINING SLEEVE. INSTALLATION							
	OF THE SLEEVE WAS COMPLETED ON JUNE 3. ALL WELDS WERE INSPECTED USING MAGNETIC PARTICLE AND ULTRASONIC THICKNESS METHODS. THE PIPELINE BETWEEN THE STOPPLE FITTINGS WAS PURGED, PRESSURE TESTED AND RETURNED TO						
NORMAL 405 PSIG SERVICE. THERE WAS NO FIRE, NO INJURIES AND NO LOSS OF SERVICE TO ANY CUSTOMERS. THE ROOT							
	CAUSE OF THE LEAK WAS A ROCK IMPINING ON THE LINE AND GROUND SUBSIDENCE. A FINAL REPORT WILL BE COMPLETED UPON DETERMINATION OF THE TOTAL COST OF REPAIRS.						
SUPP	SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT: IN THE NARRATIVE IT WAS INDICATED THAT THE LINE NUMBER WAS MNB69801, WHICH IS INCORRECT						
	AND SHOULD INSTEAD BE MNB72701.						

Form RSPA F 7100.2 (01-2002)

Page 3 of 3