

FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR

**Independent Midterm Evaluation
of Combating Child Labor
Through Education in Morocco
(Project *Dima-Adros*)**

Management Systems International
Cooperative Agreement Number: IL-16568-07-75-K



2009

M INTERNATIONAL INC.
MACRO

This page left intentionally blank.

**FUNDED BY THE UNITED STATES
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR**

**Independent Midterm Evaluation
of Combating Child Labor
Through Education in Morocco
(Project *Dima-Adros*)**

Management Systems International
Cooperative Agreement Number: IL-I6568-07-75-K

2009

This page left intentionally blank.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report describes in detail the midterm evaluation, conducted during February and March 2009, of Combating Child Labor Through Education in Morocco (Project *Dima-Adros*). The report was prepared by Macro International Inc. according to agreements specified in its contract with the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT). The evaluation of Combating Child Labor Through Education in Morocco (Project *Dima-Adros*) was conducted and documented by Charles Tesar, an independent evaluator in collaboration with USDOL/OCFT staff, the *Dima-Adros* project team, and stakeholders in Morocco. Macro International Inc. would like to express sincere thanks to all parties involved in this evaluation: the independent evaluator, Management Systems International and its partners, and U.S. Department of Labor.



Funding for this evaluation was provided by the United States Department of Labor under Task Order number DOLB089K28215. Points of view or opinions in this evaluation report do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the United States Department of Labor, nor does the mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the United States Government.

This page left intentionally blank.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
LIST OF TERMS AND ACRONYMS	vii
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ix
I EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	1
1.1 Document Review.....	1
1.2 Field Visits.....	2
1.3 Interviews with Stakeholders.....	2
1.4 Debriefing with Project Stakeholders.....	3
1.5 Confidentiality	3
II FINDINGS.....	5
2.1 Child Labor in Morocco.....	5
2.2 <i>Dima-Adros</i> Description.....	6
III WORK PLAN.....	7
3.1 Direct Educational Services.....	7
3.2 Policy and Institutional Strengthening.....	8
3.3 Awareness/Mobilization	8
3.4 Research and Data Collection on Child Labor	8
3.5 Sustainability.....	9
IV DIMA-ADROS PROJECT DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTING STRUCTURE	11
V ACCOMPLISHMENTS TO DATE.....	13
5.1 Direct Educational Services.....	13
5.2 Policies and Institutional Strengthening	17
5.3 Awareness-Raising and Mobilization	18
5.4 Research and Data Collection on Child Labor	19
5.5 Sustaining Interventions.....	20
5.6 Lessons Learned.....	20
VI CONCLUSIONS	23
6.1 Program Design Issues.....	23
6.2 Program Implementation Issues.....	24
6.3 Partnership and Coordination Issues.....	26
6.4 Management Issues.....	28
6.5 Leveraging Nonproject Resources.....	29
6.6 Sustainability.....	29
6.6 Impact	30

VII	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	33
7.1	Project Design.....	33
7.2	Implementation	34
7.3	Partnership and Cooperation.....	34
7.4	Monitoring and Evaluation	35
7.5	Impact and Sustainability.....	35
VIII	SPECIFIC QUESTIONS POSED BY MSI/DIMA-ADROS.....	39

ANNEXES

- Annex A: List of Associations Visited During the Evaluation
- Annex B: *Dima-Adros* Project Documents Reviewed
- Annex C: Midterm Evaluation Debriefing *Dima-Adros*
- Annex D: List of Interviewees
- Annex E: Cross-Reference Chart for Responses to Specific USDOL Questions
- Annex F: Presentation from the Evaluation Debriefing
- Annex G: Terms of Reference

LIST OF TERMS AND ACRONYMS

<i>Dima-Adros</i>	(<i>Always Study</i> in Arabic) administered by MSI
Association	Local implementing organization of MSI
AED	Academy for Educational Development
CBO	Community-Based Organization
CPU	Child Protection Unit
DT	<i>Direction du Travail</i> (Directorate of Labor)
EI	Education Initiative
EU	European Union
GOM	Government of Morocco
ILO	International Labour Organization
INDH	National Initiative for Human Development
IPEC	International Programme for Elimination of Child Labour
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDSFS	Ministry of Social Development, Family and Solidarity
MEN	Ministry of National Education and Youth
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MSI	Management Systems International
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
OCFT	Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor and Human Trafficking
OFPPT	Office of Vocational Training and Work Preparation
ONDE	National Observatory for the Rights of Children
STS	Student Tracking System
TPR	Technical Progress Report
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USDOL	United States Department of Labor
WFCL	Worst Forms of Child Labor

This page left intentionally blank.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

This report describes the midterm evaluation findings for the *Dima-Adros* project, an education initiative (EI) that seeks to reduce exploitive child labor in Morocco. Management Systems International (MSI) has entered into a cooperative agreement with the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) with the collaboration of the Government of Morocco (GOM) to carry out the operation. The three-year, US\$3.5 million project began in 2007 and will terminate in 2010.

Dima-Adros is intended to demonstrate and validate interventions to reduce the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) through educational alternatives. This effort targets children who have been withdrawn from exploitive child labor, as well as victims of commercial sexual exploitation. In addition, the program seeks to mitigate the number of students who drop out of primary schools and entry into work. One crucial element is the provision of direct educational and support services. In addition, MSI is charged with improving regulations against child labor, raising awareness of the dangers of child labor, strengthening stakeholder institutions, and conducting action research and data collection. An overarching goal of *Dima-Adros* is to foster scale-up and sustainability of interventions that prove viable.

Goals of the midterm evaluation are to—

- Help individual organizations identify areas of good performance and areas where project implementation can be improved.
- Assist USDOL's Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) to learn more about what is or is not working in terms of the overall conceptualization and design of EI projects within the broad OCFT technical cooperation program framework.
- Assess the degree to which project objectives have been achieved.
- Assess project achievements in light of its initial objectives.
- Sense how different stakeholders view the project and how MSI could better partner with them to achieve desired results.
- Evaluate partners' and implementers' level of satisfaction in relation to project objectives, management, and achievements.
- Evaluate beneficiaries' degree of satisfaction with the project's programs and activities.

Methodology

In February and March 2009, Macro International Inc.'s independent evaluator, Dr. Charles Tesar, carried out the midterm evaluation of *Dima-Adros* programs and accomplishments to date. After a comprehensive review of documents, seven of nine project sites were visited and some 30 schools and classrooms were observed. Extensive interviews were held with beneficiaries (children), parents, teachers, school directors, GOM administrators, implementing organizations, stakeholders, and national and international project collaborators, along with officials of the U.S. Embassy. Findings of the evaluation were presented to a panel of national authorities and stakeholders in early March. The following issues are part of the evaluation findings.

Project Design

Few modifications have been made to the project's original design outlined in the cooperative agreement. In the early phase of implementation, one site was changed due to a lack of local participation. However, the targeted number of communities and beneficiaries remains the same. The project's original aim is to withdraw 4,000 children from work and enroll them in nonformal schools and to prevent 4,000 children from dropping out of school and entering work. Other efforts include providing support for a pilot child protection center in Marrakech. MSI relies on community-based organizations to implement the *Dima-Adros* project and seeks to install local and national capacities to sustain the effort.

Implementation

The *Dima-Adros* project works with some two dozen associations (implementing partners) to provide services in nine demonstration sites, mostly in rural Morocco. MSI collaborates with public ministries charged with delivering education and child protection services. Implementing associations are overseen by locally selected, independent caseworkers who contract directly with MSI. The advantages of this approach include flexibility, inclusion of a wide range of partners, multitiered monitoring, and the ability to raise capacity levels of partners to meet immediate and long-term project execution and reporting requirements. Drawbacks of this approach are the costs of installing administrative and reporting capacities among newly created partners lacking in capacities, and the challenge of scaling up and sustaining interventions.

Partnership and Coordination

All members of implementing associations who were interviewed feel that MSI is an excellent and supportive, though demanding, partner. They are appreciative of the consultative management style of MSI staff and feel that MSI has provided excellent technical assistance and training to develop capacities needed to administer the operation, although most consider project reporting requirements to be excessive. Challenges mentioned by association partners included the continuing high demand for services and the limitation of funds. As a result, a great many needy children and youth must be turned away from participation in *Dima-Adros* classes. Partner association officers also expressed a need to become more multivariate in scope, financing, and function.

As a member of the National Steering Committee on Child Labor, MSI plays a pivotal role in Morocco's public sector response to WFCL. While relevant public agencies in the capital city of Rabat express strong commitment to *Dima-Adros* goals, their actions in the rural and peri-urban countryside do not meet expectations. Since the scaling-up and sustainability of *Dima-Adros* interventions is directly dependent on public agencies, MSI will likely need to revisit plans for continuing and expanding the project after USDOL funds are depleted.

Monitoring and Evaluation

MSI has installed a detailed and effective reporting, monitoring, and evaluation scheme for the project. As a performance-driven operation, the project pays teachers (*animateurs*) according to data collected reporting the number of students served and retained in school, increasing the *animateurs*' motivation to succeed. During the evaluation, monitoring and evaluation (M&E) reports from MSI offices in Rabat were compared with actual attendance and performance at project sites; no discrepancies were noted.

The M&E system is based on precise definitions that meet USDOL's criteria for reporting WFCL. Individual case files are maintained for each beneficiary receiving support. The system generates systematic information on teachers, administrators, and implementing associations. Association reports are verified by independent MSI caseworkers, as well as Ministry of National Education and Youth (MEN) inspectors, school directors, and the MSI evaluation specialist. Reports are submitted to MSI on a monthly basis and entered into a digital database, where they serve as the basis for reimbursement of implementing association expenses. These expenses include paying *animateurs* based on the number of children enrolled in and attending classes.

Impact and Sustainability

Although the immediate and positive impact of *Dima-Adros* is palpable in project communes, concerns remain regarding scaling and sustainability. Given that the public sector is slow in meeting the basic human service needs of rural and peri-urban children, the nongovernmental organization (NGO) sector may offer an alternative for sustaining project interventions.

USDOL targets for enrollment in nonformal and formal education are being surpassed. The target number is 4,000 children withdrawn from WFCL and enrolled in nonformal education, and 4,000 at-risk students retained in formal schooling and prevented from entering WFCL. The project is on schedule to meet these expectations. Parents, students, teachers, and local officials express high satisfaction with classes; attendance in project-supported classes nears 95%.

The dropout rate for *Dima-Adros* classes is not a problem. Ninety percent of the original enrollees have remained in class since the program began in October 2008. *Animateurs* expressed very positive perspectives about their work as teachers and for the support and training received from MSI. Even though *animateurs* are paid only about one-fourth that of regular teachers and most have to travel to work in isolated villages, project administrators report little absenteeism and good performance. Beneficiaries, most of whom are enrolled in school for the first time, express satisfaction with instruction. For many *animateurs*, this is their first job, and they benefit from *Dima-Adros*/MEN professional development training.

Dima-Adros has had a major impact on 23 implementing associations, mostly small and newly formed. Participation in the operation has increased their capacities and given credibility by virtue of being partners in the project. For many, MSI is a first contractor, and this has helped attract other donors to support their work. An important impact is in association capacity-building via training in topics such as financial management and administration. Partners and beneficiaries are very enthusiastic about continuing to work with MSI and have requested technical assistance in strengthening, planning, generating revenue, and developing community-mobilization strategies. Officials from public ministries mention that MSI staff's experience and success in the field is critical for the advancement of the national education agenda and has helped efforts to eliminate WFCL. U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) and U.S. Embassy personnel are very positive about the impact of *Dima-Adros*.

Dima-Adros will continue for another 15 months, but a number of project elements have already had sustainable effects, such as nearly 4,000 beneficiaries served, an increased public awareness about the value of education, new legislation against child labor, a pilot child protection unit in the Marrakech region, and the established capabilities for partners. Association members note that the public awareness work done by *Dima-Adros* has made the public more sensitive to the laws regulating child work and heightened the culture's value of education.

Dima-Adros' implementing associations have developed effective practices for community-based schooling in nonformal education. Public schools benefit from the project's tutoring and support programs, which help retain children at risk of entering WFCL to remain in school. MSI's technical support, training, and material assistance for partner organizations (including computers, funds for office space, and communications equipment) has built their capacity and attracted additional donors. Over 200 nonformal and formal teachers are involved in improving pedagogical skills during the life of the project.

Good Practices and Lessons Learned

Reliance on an NGO-driven project infrastructure has been the key to the project's success. While Morocco's public educational system, despite massive investments in reform, continues to flounder in the near and medium term, *Dima-Adros* programs perform effectively. The design features include grassroots development of local strategies, competition among NGOs for the right to implement interventions, multiple layers of program oversight, and rigorous leadership with high expectations from MSI staff. This approach has fostered an effective organization that should surpass the goals and objectives outlined in the MSI cooperative agreement with USDOL.

Dima-Adros is managed by a competent and experienced MSI staff; all staff members have knowledge of every aspect of the program and are familiar with partner needs and weaknesses. Implementing associations are familiar with MSI staff, whose field visits inspire both *animateurs* and implementing associations to higher performance levels. A rigorous reporting and evaluation system has ensured that data are collected timely and accurately.

Systematic collaboration with GOM and international child labor program donors has been important for advocacy and awareness building at both the local and national levels. At the local level, grassroots campaigns, mostly carried out by implementing partners, have proved fruitful. MSI's work in the field has demonstrated best practices in tutoring and nonformal education.

Their management style—including openness, teamwork, and quick response—is much appreciated.

Dima-Adros project sites are dispersed throughout Morocco, largely in remote and often inaccessible villages. This distribution has added substantially to time and resource costs and limited classroom observations to no more than one or two schools a day. With some 200 nonformal and formal teachers involved in the project, this makes it difficult for MSI's three professional staff members to visit classrooms on a regular basis. Future operations should consider logistical costs when determining project sites.

Dima-Adros is reaching well beyond its original target of 8,000 children enrolled in nonformal education and tutoring classes. Although most project *animateurs* have only marginal preparation in instructional technology, their skill limitations are offset by a sense of accountability and pride, arising out of parental management. Local oversight of *Dima-Adros* classes is an important element in the project's success, just as the absence of parental involvement in formal, public schools may be a cause of system dysfunction.

MSI reimburses costs to implementing associations only for children completing nonformal and tutoring activities. This has been an effective approach to encourage teacher diligence, demonstrated by high rates of completion and excellent attendance. *Dima-Adros* has not, as yet, been able to mount an effective program to matriculate students into formal vocational training programs. Reliance on skills training sponsored by the Office for Vocational Training and Work Preparation and *Entraide Nationale* (National Solidarity)—both public vocational training agencies, and MSI partners—is of concern. Pilot programs offered to *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries by these institutes are quite weak and considered by staff and beneficiaries alike as irrelevant to securing employment. Consequently, *Dima-Adros* participant dropout in vocational training programs is high.

Conclusions

Dima-Adros, although limited in scope and breadth, is having an impressive impact on beneficiaries, educational institutions, the advancement of child labor laws, the development of child protection programs, capacity building for partners, and the national awareness-raising campaign on the problems of child labor and school dropout. *Dima-Adros* has expanded the capacity of NGOs and staff hired through direct experience and training sessions. MSI staff and their partners are meeting, and in many instances surpassing, project objectives with quality programming and with efficient, cost-effective management.

Dima-Adros has had a major impact in both withdrawing and preventing children from working. Beneficiaries and their parents are pleased with the project. Demand for project classes and support is at a high level. In some areas, parents would prefer their children leave poorly performing public schools for *Dima-Adros* nonformal classes. This trend, however favorably it reflects on MSI's performance, is not encouraged by the project. Instead, MSI supports the improvement of public schools to increase the rate of insertion of beneficiaries from nonformal programs.

High attendance and completion rates in nonformal education do not guarantee entry into formal or vocational education. These classes do not advance beneficiary academic skills to a level high enough to matriculate into Morocco's vocational training institutes. Nevertheless, even the rudimentary level of instruction offered by *Dima-Adros* programs has had a transformative impact on beneficiaries. The operation is withdrawing beneficiaries from WFCL and preventing dropouts.

MSI is on target to accomplish major goals in the cooperative agreement. An effective and reliable project infrastructure has been established. It is led by a highly competent management team and includes 23 implementing associations. Monitoring, evaluating, and reporting requirements appear to accurately reflect conditions in the field. Beneficiary data are detailed and well maintained, and expenditures are scrutinized by multiple cost control mechanisms.

At midpoint in the *Dima-Adros* project, half of targeted beneficiaries have been served, with expectations that objectives will likely be surpassed. Educational services for children withdrawn from child labor are being delivered by 90 project-trained and supported teachers. The tutoring program for children at risk of dropping out of school is underway, with approximately 90 additional teachers expected to be hired in the spring semester. Pilot child protection centers are withdrawing children from the street and from commercial sexual exploitation.

Regional initiatives have been fruitful in the Marrakech area, where *Dima-Adros* provided technical assistance to develop the action plan for the Marrakech Child Protection Unit (CPU). *Dima-Adros* has been working with the CPU to strengthen services. MSI has also played a supporting role in strengthening the Marrakech Educational Academy. Both are multiple-donor agencies that mobilize international contributors, public ministries, and the private sector to advance children's rights and protection. These initiatives are viewed as pilot demonstration efforts intended for scaling up to the national level.

Substantial capacities have been installed with implementing associations to mobilize parents and communities. Awareness of the dangers of child labor and school dropout has been heightened through local and national campaigns. In addition, MSI has played a major role in advancing legislation for child protection. A bill calling for the elimination of household child labor is advancing in the legislative process. It is highly anticipated that the bill will be enacted within the calendar year.

Enactment of legislation, however, does not automatically mean that its intent becomes a national reality. This will depend on enforcement where it counts the most: in villages throughout Morocco. Given the poor application of existing laws for obligatory school attendance and against child labor, expansion of regulations may only have a nominal impact on the occurrence of child labor. With this reality in mind, *Dima-Adros* has been successful in mobilizing community-based organizations to eliminate child exploitation and improve school attendance at the local and regional levels.

A number of challenges remain for the *Dima-Adros* project, particularly a need to deepen capacities among implementing associations. Given the systemic shortcomings, if not outright failure, of public ministries to deliver basic human services, MSI's expectations to scale up and

sustain interventions beyond present perimeters will likely be achieved through efforts to strengthen civil society partner institutions.

Recommendations

The U.S. Embassy should take the initiative to coordinate USDOL and USAID with the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) investments in primary and workforce education. USDOL should assume an aggressive role in collaborating with other international donor organizations, especially to link contractors such as MSI with International Labour Organization/International Programme for Elimination of Child Labour operations, which rely on USDOL funding. In addition, USDOL should determine funding based on GOM commitment to eliminating exploitive child labor.

MSI should provide technical and material assistance to their partner associations. This will strengthen the partner associations' capacity to generate revenue and increase their ability to meet current and future cost obligations. There is an urgent need to improve these associations' capabilities to enroll broader membership, articulate for expanded role in the local management of public services, and mobilize in support of economic and social development initiatives. The strategy for the remainder of the *Dima-Adros* project may best be served by expanding the membership base in associations, improving revenue generation, and crafting innovative cost recovery capabilities.

While coordination with the government has been advanced, MSI should intensify national awareness of school dropout and the ongoing crisis stemming from negligence of education and child protection. The project's success in mobilizing local implementing community-based organizations should be underscored as a model for decentralization of public sector services; the best prospects for widened impact and sustainability are with NGO partners.

The project should deepen and expand the quality of educational programs for children beyond current offerings. At best, *Dima-Adros* classes prevent beneficiaries from working and provide rudimentary literacy, math, and language skills. *Animateurs* and teachers need more training in multilevel classroom teaching and bilingual pedagogy as well as additional teaching resources and materials. Because workforce preparation is of such importance to *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries, MSI should join with the international donor community and vocational training agencies to improve prospects for high-risk and academically deficient students in vocational training schools.

This page left intentionally blank.

I EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

This evaluation is concerned with six substantive issues; each will be described in the following sections:

1. **Program Design Issues.** Assess overall fit of *Dima-Adros* with Moroccan government programs and support of child labor project goals. Evaluate the strategy, including any changes to the strategy, and whether the outputs are realistic and achievable.
2. **Program Implementation Issues.** Measure the project's progress toward reaching its goals and the accuracy of the monitoring and evaluation system.
3. **Partnership and Coordination Issues.** Assess the challenges and opportunities in the project's partnerships and coordination with the government and subcontractors.
4. **Management Issues.** Assess the challenges and successes in management, coordination with the U.S. government, and leveraging nonproject resources.
5. **Sustainability.** Evaluate the project's plans and viability with regard to sustainability.
6. **Impact.** Assess the project's impact at the local, partner, and government levels.

In keeping with expectations of the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL) terms of reference, the evaluation methodology consisted of the following activities:

- Desk/document review of all pertinent agreements and reports
- Field visits to project sites of Management Systems International (MSI) and its subcontractors
- Direct observation of project activities
- Focus group consultations with stakeholders
- Interviews with teachers, parents, community leaders, beneficiaries, U.S. Embassy personnel and USDOL/Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) policymakers at the national/local level

1.1 DOCUMENT REVIEW

Before the field visits, all documents pertinent to project design and implementation were reviewed extensively, including the cooperative agreement, technical progress reports (TPRs), status reports, project logical frameworks and monitoring plans, work plans, correspondences related to TPRs, management procedures and guidelines, and the *Dima-Adros* baseline study. (See Annex B for a detailed bibliography.)

1.2 FIELD VISITS

The evaluator, Dr. Charles Tesar, was accompanied by a local research consultant skilled in both French and Arabic. He met with all MSI *Dima-Adros* project personnel in Rabat and in seven of the nine project sites where most project activities are carried out. The sites were Rabat, Ait Adel, Kalâa, Marrakech, Skoura Lhadra, Sidi Issa Reragui, and Tassift. The Marrakech Child Protection Unit (CPU) shelter for child victims of sexual abuse was visited, as were two of three project-supported school boarding centers (*Dar Talib*) for rural girls attending secondary school.

Ten days total were devoted to field work in Morocco. During the visits to five of the six project communes, the evaluator visited classrooms; met with implementing association officials; observed project activities; reviewed beneficiary data files, including school and implementing partner records; scrutinized reports; and interviewed children, parent, and teacher focus groups and local/regional government officials.

- **Focus Groups.** Seven focus groups were conducted. Participants were chosen at random by the evaluator (with the support of *Dima-Adros* staff) from beneficiaries and stakeholders available at the time of site visits. Interviews were done without the presence of the directors, teachers, or other project personnel. The aim was to assess beneficiaries' perspectives regarding the quality and breadth of MSI-supported programs.
- **Focus Groups with Children.** The objective here was to identify the quality and value of educational and support activities and the beneficiaries' perception of them. Four focus groups were composed of 12 to 30 children benefiting from the project.
- **Focus Group with Parents.** The aim of parent focus groups was to identify their knowledge and appreciation of *Dima-Adros* activities and their perspectives toward child labor and school attendance. Three groups were composed of 5 to 18 parents.

1.3 INTERVIEWS WITH STAKEHOLDERS

Meetings with stakeholders were held both one-on-one and in groups. Stakeholders included those who have an interest in the *Dima-Adros* project, such as—

- USDOL/OCFT
- MSI staff
- Subcontracting associations/nongovernmental organizations (NGOs)
- Direct and indirect beneficiaries
- Community leaders and civil society representatives

- International donors, including the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF), the International Labour Organization’s International Programme for Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC), and the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID)
- Local and national government officials
- School teachers and school directors in formal and nonformal schools
- *Entraide Nationale* (National Solidarity) and the Office of Vocational Training and Work Preparation (OFPPT)
- Government of Morocco (GOM) ministry officials from—
 - Ministry of National Education and Youth (MEN)
 - Ministry of Labor
 - Marrakech CPU
 - Ministry of Social Development, Family and Solidarity (MDSFS)
- USAID and U.S. Embassy personnel

In addition to the one on one and group interviews, the evaluator observed beneficiary students and teachers in some 30 project and non-project schools and classrooms.

1.4 DEBRIEFING WITH PROJECT STAKEHOLDERS

Upon conclusion of the field visits, a debriefing was conducted for approximately three dozen implementing partners, stakeholders, and U.S. Embassy personnel. The meeting was used to present the major findings and emerging issues, as well as to solicit recommendations and any additional relevant information. Dr. Tesar led the meeting by presenting conclusions of the fieldwork and by reviewing issues that require further clarification. A copy of the presentation is attached as Annex F. The final meeting involved MSI’s *Dima-Adros* staff to discuss findings relevant to project management, personnel considerations, and reactions to the debriefing. MSI staff members were most helpful in arranging the meeting, as well as identifying fieldwork and providing any and all information requested throughout the evaluation mission.

1.5 CONFIDENTIALITY

The evaluation mission observed confidentiality conventions related to information and feedback elicited during individual and group interviews. To ensure maximum freedom of expression from interviewees, *Dima-Adros* personnel and implementing partner staff were not present during interviews. However, implementing partner staff did accompany the evaluator to make introductions where necessary, to guide and advise the evaluation process, and to make respondents feel comfortable.

This page left intentionally blank.

II FINDINGS

2.1 CHILD LABOR IN MOROCCO

With some 50% of Moroccans involved in subsistence agriculture on small plots, the carrying capacity on small and fragmented family farms has long since been surpassed. Consequently, youth, and in many cases entire families, must migrate to urban centers like Casablanca, Tangiers, Fez, and Marrakech to find work, often in its worst forms. According to research by ILO and UNICEF, this includes children working in the following sectors: agriculture, construction, auto mechanic work, trade, artisan jobs, and commercial sexual exploitation, as well as street children. MSI's baseline study, which was conducted in *Dima-Adros* project areas (selected with the collaboration of the National Steering Committee on Child Labor), confirmed that the majority of children at work are involved with agriculture. As a result, the project has primarily targeted rural areas for educational interventions—with the exception of child protective services, which are being supported in Marrakech.

The country's functional illiteracy rate has been estimated at around 50%, but may reach as high as 90% among rural girls. Although education in Morocco is free and compulsory through primary school (age 15), many children—particularly girls in peri-urban and rural areas—still do not attend school or they drop out at an alarming rate.¹ The poor performance of Morocco's public school system enrolling and retaining children in the primary cycle is aggravated by a shortage of schools in rural areas, high levels of teacher absence, high enrollment fees, and limited instructional assets.

For children who abandon primary schools or do poorly academically, there is little expectation for advanced learning. Less than one-third of Moroccan children go on to secondary or vocational education, where instruction is primarily in French. Since few rural children acquire French-speaking skills—even those who complete the primary cycle—enrollment in secondary or vocational training plunges to less than 20% of those eligible.

GOM's response to these systemic weaknesses has been noteworthy, but largely ineffective. The nation has ratified ILO Convention 182 against the worst forms of child labor (WFCL) and ILO Convention 138 on Concerning the Minimum Age for Admission to Employment. GOM has also created the National Initiative for Human Development (INDH) to pinpoint investments to reduce poverty. INDH supports a national network of training institutes—*Entraide Nationale* (a *Dima-Adros* partner)—that provides work preparation training to more than 150,000 youths, mostly girls, in about 1,000 centers throughout the nation. Most enrollees have never registered in, or failed to complete, primary school, and few come with even rudimentary academic skills. As a result, levels of dropout surpass 60%.

The Ministry of National Education and Youth—also a *Dima-Adros* partner—supports various initiatives in literacy and nonformal education. However, these programs are at best limited alternatives that obscure deeper systemic failures of the formal primary and secondary education

¹ World Bank. (2006, March 14). *Kingdom of Morocco Country Economic Memorandum* (Report No. 32948-MOR). Washington, DC: Author.

sector. There are simply not enough well-functioning schools in rural areas to hold back the tide toward child labor. Children of all ages who are not in school have little choice but to enter into child labor. Representatives of the Ministry noted that measures to be undertaken through the Emergency Program of the Ministry for 2009–11 are intended to ameliorate the shortcomings of rural education in the near term.

Clearly it is in the best interests of Morocco to educate and train youth so they can pursue fruitful and productive lives close to home. USDOL, MSI, and GOM have created the *Dima-Adros* project to sponsor innovative approaches to meeting that challenge.

2.2 DIMA-ADROS DESCRIPTION

The project intervenes along five central strategies consistent with USDOL child labor goals:

1. Withdraw or prevent children from engaging in exploitive child labor and provide them with educational opportunities.
2. Strengthen child labor policies and institutional capacity.
3. Mobilize parents and communities at a grassroots level to assume a sustainable role in addressing child labor and improving the quality of education.
4. Raise awareness of child labor by providing reliable information to the government and activists fighting against child labor, allowing them to make knowledgeable decisions regarding child labor and education.
5. Sustain and scale up successful project interventions with GOM assistance and supportive alliances among civil society organizations.

III WORK PLAN

The *Dima-Adros* project design and work plan supports all USDOL Education Initiative (EI) project goals. The central feature of MSI's approach is the implementation of the operation through local NGOs and community-based organizations (CBOs), with the collaboration of stakeholder public agencies. The work plan has met with USDOL approval and includes the services below.

3.1 DIRECT EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

Empower communities to guide direct services. These tasks include recruiting and training community committees, soliciting student input, and developing customized community-based plans. In addition, the project sets up community funds to reduce barriers to education.

Create vocational and literacy programs for withdrawn children. The *Dima-Adros* operation seeks to create partnerships with local players to deliver literacy and vocational training services to withdrawn children; organize training workshops for relevant individuals on the techniques for withdrawing children; and give training to literacy and vocational teachers (*animateurs*) in instructional technology and participatory teaching methods.

Support shelters for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation. MSI identifies and withdraws child victims of sexual exploitation to shelters with educational (tutoring), psychological, and juridical support. MSI also adapts nonformal education and vocational training programs to the special needs of child victims.

Equip and maintain classrooms for withdrawn children. The project provides support to classes that incorporate literacy, vocational, and pre-employment entrepreneurship modules to withdrawn children.

Supply formal education support/dropout prevention for at-risk children. This includes setting up partnerships with local players to deliver tutoring services to at-risk children, training tutoring teachers (both formal and nonformal) in pedagogy and participatory instructional methods, and implementing tutoring program and other dropout prevention strategies. In addition, MSI organizes training workshops for instructors on detecting potential dropouts and addressing their problems, establishes entrepreneurship training for middle school children in targeted areas, and works with teachers in formal schools to respond to the needs of children with disabilities.

Provide middle school support for at-risk rural girls. The *Dima-Adros* work plan calls for the introduction of boarding centers for rural girls as well as training for boarding staff.

3.2 POLICY AND INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING

Improve the legal environment. MSI has agreed to work with local government officials to execute the current, compulsory education law; to support advocacy efforts to pass a law on domestic labor and publish implementation mechanisms; and to organize seminars on the application of domestic labor laws. MSI seeks to support advocacy plans to strengthen regulations controlling labor trafficking and forced labor, advocate laws responding to sexual tourism, and set up an advocacy group for members of Parliament.

Encourage key stakeholders to include child labor in their policy programs. The cooperative agreement requires MSI to work with INDH and other agencies to improve their participatory and mobilization approaches and to mainstream gender and child labor considerations in plans.

Strengthen Child Protection Units. MSI is working to strengthen the capacity of CPUs to monitor child labor, assist the GOM in conducting regular surveys on child labor, and work with the Ministry of Labor to update the list of WFCL.

Establish school watchdog/dropout prevention committees. This includes developing regional models of watchdog committees, organizing training workshops for committee members, offering training for managing results and performance accountability in formal schools, and providing technical assistance to targeted formal schools on applying a school quality grid. For NGO partners, MSI seeks to raise their capacity to deal with child labor issues, establish an accreditation system for NGOs, and develop an action plan to strengthen their program execution capabilities.

3.3 AWARENESS/MOBILIZATION

Tasks to raise awareness include mobilizing parents and communities to improve the quality of education, and combating school dropout and child labor through participatory community-based meetings. The work plan also calls for MSI to involve children and community members to carry out a census of nonschooled children, coordinate awareness-raising days, organize campaigns on the domestic child labor law, and conduct media-activism workshops/networks for journalists to raise awareness about child labor.

The project would partner with community groups to develop effective messages on safe and healthy farm work and to conduct a public campaign against sexual tourism. Awareness-raising messages on healthy agricultural work for children will be inserted into school curricula to meet the needs of rural children.

3.4 RESEARCH AND DATA COLLECTION ON CHILD LABOR

MSI's work plan requires the administration of a baseline study of child labor, as well as an analysis of the impact of beneficiaries' experiences with the tutoring program.

3.5 SUSTAINABILITY

For the continuation and scaling-up of project interventions, MSI foresees a need to become integrated into government programming along with a need to set up regional models of school dropout watchdog committees. This includes (1) transference of the management and funding of vocational centers to local representatives; (2) seminars on the concept of using community funds to combat school dropout and child labor; (3) an action plan to help create networks to combat child labor; (4) encouragement of schools to celebrate World Day Against Child Labor; and (5) the creation and support of an umbrella NGO, alliances, and committees that specialize in combating child labor.

This page left intentionally blank.

IV ***DIMA-ADROS* PROJECT DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTING STRUCTURE**

The *Dima-Adros* project is based in Rabat and staffed by a director, an educational specialist, a financial specialist, and a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) specialist, with additional support staff. The project director, education specialist, and M&E specialist have each earned doctorates and meet or surpass qualifications mandated by USDOL for project management. They have extensive experience and involvement in donor-supported educational initiatives in Morocco, including oversight of the previous USDOL activity, the *Adros* project.

Dima-Adros is sanctioned by GOM through the Ministry of Labor's Work Directorate and collaborates with a wide array of international donor projects, public agencies, regional and local governments, and civil society organizations. MSI sits on the National Steering Committee for Child Labor, the principal organization advocating for child labor regulatory revisions and increased investments in education and child protection. Stakeholders meet with MSI on a regular basis to discuss strategies, review research, and coordinate advocacy efforts.

MSI has subcontracted with 23 local community-based and nongovernmental organizations (associations) in nine rural communes. Project communes were chosen in collaboration with INDH and MEN. Project sites were selected from zones with the highest poverty levels and are considered feeder/origins of child migration to labor in urban centers. On average, about 8 of every 10 school-age children in project communes between age 6 and 17 are working and not enrolled in school.

Implementing associations that were chosen have a high degree of local participation and wide consultations. As a first step to identifying and launching interventions using project targets and budget limitations as a guiding constraint, MSI met with regional officials to pinpoint which communes would be included in *Dima-Adros*. For the next step, local planning meetings were held with community leaders, parents, school personnel, and CBOs, and NGOs interested in participating.

For those communities expressing interest in *Dima-Adros*, MSI formed local committees to conduct assessments of school attendance and child labor conditions (the same parties were involved later for the formal baseline study). MSI then asked these committees to present a community plan of action. In addition, working committees identified local caseworkers (*points focaux*), who now serve a role coordinating and overseeing associations. Implementing partners were chosen from CBOs and NGOs based on a number of criteria: program and financial capabilities, local composition of membership, and level of interest and commitment to the project. Implementing associations possess varying degrees of financial and programmatic capacity. All associations are required to participate in MSI training. They receive ongoing technical and material assistance to meet project needs and the reporting, monitoring, and evaluation standards demanded by USDOL.

Once local partners were selected and strengthened, the next task was to raise community awareness of the consequences of child labor and identify children who were working and not enrolled in school as participants for nonformal education. At the same time, associations

recruited and hired *animateurs* who, although technically teachers, are also charged with canvassing households, enrolling students, and providing counseling to parents. Associations receive about US\$92 (per 10-month school year) for each student enrolled in the program. It is the responsibility of *animateurs* to maintain full classes (a maximum of 25 students). On average, *animateurs* are paid US\$150 per month, and they are rigorously supervised by parents, association members, caseworkers, MEN inspectors, and MSI staff.

MSI has opted to work with a pilot child protection unit in Marrakech. The unit combines funding from a number of local, national, and public sources, and accepts referrals of children in precarious situations from local governments, the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Labor, MEN, health ministries, police/*gendarmerie*, *Entraide Nationale*, and various civil society partners. The CPU served about 125 children in 2008. Beneficiaries include street and abandoned children, and those involved with abuse, commercial sexual exploitation, and other WFCL.

The *Dima-Adros* project design is consistent with USDOL goals and is being closely followed by MSI in its implementation. MSI has made only minor adjustments to the original design—selecting new project sites where local commitment was lacking. As with most USDOL EIs, the balance between delivering direct services to needy beneficiaries and installing permanent institutional capacities must be reconciled constantly. With the exception of concerns about sustainability, the design and approach have served USDOL and MSI expectations successfully.

V ACCOMPLISHMENTS TO DATE

5.1 DIRECT EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

MSI has established demonstration and education programs in nine rural communes in Morocco (out of 276 total). Project communes were chosen in collaboration with INDH and MEN, and represent the poorest zones in the country. Selected communes are characterized by exceptionally high levels of non-enrollment and school dropout, and are recognized as origins of child migration to exploitive labor in urban centers. Typically, about 8 of every 10 school-age children (age 6 to 17) in project communes are not enrolled in public school classes and work in agriculture, artisan activities, and domestic activities.

Local committees were created by mobilizing a mix of parents, local governments, and civil society organizations. Committees conducted local assessments of school attendance/dropout and child labor conditions (the same parties were involved later with the formal baseline study) and developed community plans of action. In addition, working committees identified local caseworkers (*points focaux*), who serve a role coordinating and overseeing implementing associations.

The 23 implementing associations were selected on a number of criteria: (1) program and financial capabilities; (2) local presence; (3) the composition of membership; (4) previous track record in executing projects (UNICEF played a pivotal role in recommending which NGOs should be considered on the basis of past performance); and (5) level of interest and commitment to the goals of the *Dima-Adros* project. In most project sites, there were a sufficient number of NGOs that met the criteria for selection. These NGOs competed to be awarded subcontracts. This process was overseen by MSI staff, in collaboration with local committees. In other project sites, because of a lack of civil society organizations, subcontracts were awarded to newly formed or undeveloped NGO partners, on the premise that their capacities would be built by the project and that *Dima-Adros* staff and *points focaux* would play a dynamic role in overseeing and supporting operations. Only in the most remote of project sites were subcontracts awarded on the basis of sole source. During the evaluation mission, there was no discernible difference noted in the performance of competed and sole-source contracted services.

All implementing associations are NGOs/CBOs with legal status recognized by GOM and varying degrees of financial and programmatic capacity. All association management teams have participated in MSI training and received technical and material assistance to raise capacities to meet project financial and program execution, as well as the reporting, monitoring, and evaluation standards demanded by USDOL.

Associations are responsible for raising community awareness of the consequences of child labor and the importance of education. They identify children who are working and not enrolled in school and those at risk of dropping out of school and entering work. Associations recruit, hire, manage, and pay *animateurs*.

With the programs for children withdrawn from work fully operational, the focus has shifted to preventing children from dropping out of formal school and entering work. After extensive

planning and preparation, the tutoring program was launched in *Dima-Adros* communes in the spring 2009 semester. The initiative involves school teachers, directors, parents, and students in identifying likely dropouts during the fall academic semester. Students must meet strictly defined criteria that include failing grades, difficulty keeping up with the curriculum, and high absenteeism, among other things. Beneficiaries are provided with daily, afterschool tutoring from teachers contracted by implementing associations. In addition, associations help with school supplies, backpacks, and—in some remote locations—transport. Associations are free to employ *animateurs* or formal teachers, so long as the latter are not teachers of record for beneficiaries. Cost for this program, which provides school supplies and a minimum of 60 hours of support, is approximately US\$32 per student.

Table 1 describes the direct educational initiatives being supported by *Dima-Adros* and the levels of participation and nature of support as of March 1, 2009.

Table 1: *Dima-Adros* Current Educational Initiatives, Level of Participation, and Nature of Financial Support

Current Program Initiative	Level of Participation	Nature of Support
1. Nonformal education for children not in school, who work or are at risk of working (all under age 17).	1,937 children served	Summary cost is US\$92 per child for 10 months of instruction
2. Tutoring school support/classes for children at risk of dropping out, mostly primary schools (all under age 17).	2,041 have been enrolled in programs since early 2009	Summary cost for tutoring and school supplies is US\$32 for 60 hours per year
3. Housing support for secondary-level students.	56 girls reside in three dormitories, co-financed by MSI	Room and board cost is US\$20 per month per participant for the academic year
4. Transport support for secondary-level students.	68 children are provided transportation (bus and bicycles)	Contribution to transportation fees: US\$25 monthly fee per student to pay for using a hired vehicle to transport targeted children to school in addition to a US\$5 monthly management fee for the local implementer for the academic year Bicycles for Kalâa region
5. Support for administrative costs of associations (NGOs).	23 NGOs and CBOs	20% of direct costs per pupil served
6. Support for children in vocational-technical education (OFPPT).	16 participants	MSI provides US\$51 for tuition and supplies per student for the 2008–09 academic year
7. Support for children in Ministry of Agriculture (MOA) training.	51 participants	MSI provides US\$60 for tuition in cost sharing with MOA agriculture for each month in the year 2009

8. Training for association directors on finance, M&E, and cost-share management.	23 participants	Travel and per diem
9. Training for <i>points focaux</i> on class monitoring and report preparation.	9 participants	Travel and per diem
10. Training for <i>animateurs</i> on methodology of nonformal education, participatory approach in pedagogy, and management of multilevel classes.	67 participants	Travel and per diem (co-financed by MEN)
11. Training for guardians of dormitories on conflict management, health and sanitation, and rights-based approach.	25 participants	Travel and per diem
12. Support and awareness-raising campaigns for pilot child protection centers in Marrakech.	48 street children and sex workers	Cost of seminars and public information campaigns

The paramount goals of *Dima-Adros* include the withdrawal of child beneficiaries from child labor; prevention of children who are performing poorly in primary school from dropping out and entering work; and provision of specialized education and support services to street children and those being sexually exploited. Both nonformal and formal school initiatives are designed to remove or prevent children from entering into WFCL.

The *Dima-Adros* project is nearing its midway mark. Despite having to create a new project infrastructure, conduct local action research, and install capacities in newly selected associations, MSI has already served nearly half (1,937) of the targeted 4,000 beneficiaries who have withdrawn from work. The majority of children have been withdrawn from agricultural, domestic, and artisanal work. Enrollment in the tutoring program includes some 2,041 beneficiaries as of March 2009.

At this point in the project, it is too early to assess the quality of *Dima-Adros* education programs, given that nonformal classes are in their fourth month and tutoring classes are just now beginning. However, based on the favorable evaluations of classes by parental and student focus groups, very limited classroom observations, and focus group interviews, the quality of instruction appears to meet the immediate needs of participants. In both initiatives, *animateurs* use standardized curricula and instructional materials provided by MEN.

Although MEN inspections are not common in the sites visited during the evaluation, reports indicate they are active in other project classes. MEN administrators interviewed were eager to express commitment to *Dima-Adros*. The level of instruction is rudimentary, but so are the

entry-level academic skills of beneficiaries. Class attendance is quite high, and if children regularly attend class, they are most likely not involved in WFCL.

MSI also supports some 200 rural, secondary school girls in three dormitories. The *Dar Taleb* program is aimed at poor adolescents who live too far from secondary schools for daily commuting. Parents are required to contribute to their daughters' expenses, but MSI contributes about US\$20 monthly for room and board. Given that these children are from the poorest of households and that many arrive to boarding schools with health, social, and psychological challenges, *Dima-Adros* is providing training to the dormitory managers. Where facilities are available, *Dar Taleb* girls are also enrolled in *Entraide Nationale* health and vocational training programs.

For protective services for street and abandoned children and those withdrawn from commercial sexual exploitation, MSI is working with the Marrakech CPU. The project contributes to the funding of the following activities:

- Strengthening the capacities of all involved, including the Child Protection Unit members.
- Providing accurate information on various aspects of exploitation of child labor in Marrakech.
- Raising awareness of parents and children on rights of children and on the dangers of child exploitation.
- Advocating for strengthening the capacity of children intervention teams and improving the capacity of shelters.
- Reinforcing the capacity of listening centers.
- Improving the quality of information exchange and internal communication between the different members of the local child protection committee.

Pilot programs have also been launched to enroll *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries in formal vocational training offered by the OFPPT and MOA training institute in Taza. This evaluation was unable to include the Taza operation, but included a visit to the OFPPT institutes in Chefchaouen and Marrakech. Although *Dima-Adros* lacks the normal prerequisites (secondary school certificates) for admission to OFPPT programs, beneficiaries are enrolled in basic-level skills courses in fields such as plumbing, sewing, and confection and hotel/restaurant trades.

The OFPPT pilot effort has not been especially successful; about half the students have dropped out of the institute as of the mid-academic year. According to the director of the OFPPT institute, several factors have contributed to this situation, including parental resistance to training for girls in fields dominated by males, poor academic preparation, and costs. However, given the high rate of abandonment for most OFPPT students, it is more likely that *Dima-Adros* students dropped out because of the poor quality of instruction and the poor employment prospects that await graduates. It is hoped that coming reforms supported by the U.S. Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC) will improve the success rates of high-risk students in OFPPT schools. In

the interim, MSI should engage OFPPT administrators to provide more systematic support and remedial services to *Dima-Adros* students.

Entraide Nationale offers vocational and health training for high-risk youth—mostly girls—throughout Morocco. According to the MSI sustainability matrix, this *Dima-Adros* partner has pledged to carry on vocational training for *Dima-Adros* students after the project lapses. In the two centers visited, young women were observed in sewing and confection classes. The classrooms had few, if any, instructional resources, including only a small number of foot-pedal sewing machines for several dozen students. Instructors had little pedagogical training or professional competencies, and directors report a dropout rate in excess of 60%. It should be noted that *Dima-Adros* students fare no worse than those not supported, who drop out before the midway point as well.

Language limitations, academic deficiencies, and instructional resources notwithstanding, the *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries enrolled in OFPPT, MOA, and *Entraide Nationale* programs expressed a near exuberant desire to have more resources and more effective vocational and health training. MSI would be well served by working with central ministry administrators and international donors—who support workforce education—to install institutional capacities for accommodating high-risk, illiterate, and language-deficient students.

5.2 POLICIES AND INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING

MSI has joined forces with MEN and MDSFS to foster a policy and regulatory climate that can eliminate child labor in Morocco. GOM has previously ratified major ILO conventions against child labor and trafficking, but still lacks local capacities to enforce policies on obligatory school attendance and prohibitions against child labor.

Dima-Adros is a member of the National Steering Committee on Child Labor, which coordinates regulatory efforts to combat child labor. MSI is closely allied with ILO-IPEC and UNICEF—also members of the Steering Committee—to advance legislation to regulate domestic child labor. In close collaboration with the Directorate of Labor (DT), leader of the National Steering Committee, MSI has sponsored a number of campaign events, media promotions, and parliamentary seminars to advance the household labor law, which is being considered for enactment.

MSI collaborates with the MDSFS in policy and awareness raising. With *Dima-Adros*, MDSFS has developed a National Action Plan for Children and is engaged in a national campaign against child domestic workers.

In spite of continuing delays, the household labor bill, which contains provisions to bar the use of children as domestic workers, has advanced through the legislative process to the government council. This is the final step before enactment and parliamentary ratification, which is expected by late 2009.

The household labor measure holds promise for the elimination of child domestic labor. However, other legislation—such as obligatory school attendance and ILO conventions—have for some time framed Morocco's child labor regulatory environment, but with little influence on

the high incidence of school dropout and premature entry into work. Without funding to fortify surveillance, enforcement, and prevention programs, such legislation may be of limited impact.

Perhaps more importantly, *Dima-Adros* associations are active in local efforts to enforce school attendance and regulations against child labor already in effect. Associations play a seminal role as school attendance watchdogs and are active in petitioning MEN to improve the delivery of formal school services in project sites. Surveillance strategies are contributing to a higher degree of accountability on the part of MEN staff, who report a renewed sense of parental involvement in children's schooling since the arrival of *Dima-Adros*. One school director praised *Dima-Adros* associations for having fostered higher performance standards in his school, since many students have voiced preferences for attending project-supported classes rather than staying in his school.

A critical MSI partner is MEN's Directorate of Nonformal Education. This agency provides nonformal education manuals free to *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries, and has inspectors to monitor *animateurs* in classroom performance (pedagogical practice, attendance, and student material support). Some inspectors are also involved with training *animateurs*; however, few of the implementing associations visited report having regular visits from education inspectors. Despite the absence of MEN school inspectors, *animateur* performance is closely monitored, supported, and documented by association officers and MSI caseworkers. In one isolated school in Tassift, for example, the association president walks an eight-kilometer trail to the school twice weekly to ensure classes are running.

MEN is the *Dima-Adros* partner for the tutoring program. They work with associations to identify at-risk students and provide instructional materials and school rooms for tutoring classes and, in some cases, for youth not attending school.

Entraide Nationale works with MSI to locate beneficiaries and has collaborated with MSI to admit girls into their vocational education classes. In some project sites, girls attend nonformal education classes for half a day and vocational classes (which for girls often means sewing) for the other half. However, *Entraide Nationale* programs are quite weak and are characterized by a high degree of student dropout.

5.3 AWARENESS-RAISING AND MOBILIZATION

The presence of *Dima-Adros* has made substantive gains in reducing dropout and withdrawing children from labor via the grassroots efforts carried out by implementing associations. In every project site visited, parents, association members, and local government officials boasted of the dramatic increase in formal school attendance and the decrease in dropouts and children at work.

MSI collaborated with INDH, MEN, and the Ministry of Labor to select project sites and involve CBOs, NGOs, and local governments in developing a plan of action for project investments. Implementing associations are charged with the immediate and ongoing task of elevating community awareness of the dangers of child labor and the need to enroll and retain children in school. This requires providing timely information to community and parent groups, and working with local and national government ministries.

An immediate and ongoing priority of *Dima-Adros* associations is to mobilize community members in identifying children at work and not enrolled in school for withdrawal from child labor. MSI requires continual local commitment to vigilance against child labor and active participation in guarding against dropout.

Besides mobilizing to prevent high-risk students from dropping out, the tutoring program has installed an awareness mechanism in *Dima-Adros* communes to conduct a routine review of the scholastic progress of all school children. In many instances, this process is a pioneering collaborative between parents and local officials. Interviews with school directors, teachers, and parents revealed that awareness of education, performance by both teachers and students, and concern over poor performing students have been greatly heightened.

MSI is also active in developing local and national media campaigns against the physical and social consequences of child labor. The project baseline study has encouraged local and national dialogue, just as local plans of action are being updated as a condition of participating in *Dima-Adros*. The baseline study has provided a benchmark against which to measure project progress, while local plans of action serve as a blueprint for initiatives, partnerships, and collaboration.

5.4 RESEARCH AND DATA COLLECTION ON CHILD LABOR

MSI completed a five-month baseline study of child labor in six *Dima-Adros* targeted communes in May 2008.² The door-to-door survey was conducted by the staff of implementing associations under the direction of a consulting survey expert. The study included some 4,400 parents and nearly 9,000 children.

Findings of the study corroborated earlier World Bank and United Nations research and confirmed that about 50% of school-age children had never enrolled in school or had dropped out by the third grade. Of those in school, more than half were at risk of dropping out and going to work. Children remain close to home and tend to work in some form of agriculture, although girls are generally consigned to domestic work in the home. More alarming, the household survey found that 93% of adult women and 72% of adult men are illiterate. The project plans to analyze the impact of children's experiences with the tutoring program and to conduct a separate study on children working in the handicraft industry.

Results of the baseline study were presented to stakeholders as a strategy and planning tool, and serve as the rationale for the two principal educational initiatives of *Dima-Adros*. Based on the study's findings, MSI is offering nonformal schooling to withdraw children from work and has launched the tutoring program with the intent of preventing children in school from dropping out and entering work.

MSI is compiling first-semester results from the nonformal classes, which began in October 2008. Implementing associations are also gathering summative evaluations from students who have been receiving school support and attending tutoring classes since these aids began in February 2009.

² MSI/Rabat. (2008, May). *Projet Dima-Adros: Etude de Base*. Rabat, Morocco: MSI.

5.5 SUSTAINING INTERVENTIONS

MSI prepared a sustainability matrix and submitted it to USDOL in May 2008. Virtually every element of the project depends on public sector agencies to take over, adopt, or manage *Dima-Adros* initiatives. Most of these assumptions are based on “informal pledges” from various ministries, secretariats, and agencies. Although the project is proceeding according to the work plan, MSI’s scaling and integration depend on public sector agencies adopting pilots and demonstration efforts into routine programming.

This premise should be reconsidered, as public sector institutional weaknesses and the limited, generic response of GOM to the needs of poor, rural and peri-urban children will make replication of the successes of *Dima-Adros* difficult. Although the level of investment in public education in Morocco ranks favorably in comparison to similar nations, primary and vocational education sectoral performance ranks Morocco among the poorest performers among middle-income nations.³ In the face of such systemic shortcomings, rapid population growth, and a resource-limited environment, MSI will likely need to involve NGOs and CBOs for the sustainability and scaling-up of operations.

5.6 LESSONS LEARNED

5.6.1 Engage the Public Sector as a Precondition to USDOL Funding

USDOL and potential beneficiaries do not benefit from financing pilot or demonstration operations that have few prospects of being incorporated into permanent government programming. Despite GOM pledges and commitment, and World Bank applause for INDH, this pivotal agency has collaborated only marginally in *Dima-Adros*. Moreover, government labor and education agencies are offering limited financial and program support—more marginal than substantive. These agencies are ill-equipped to meet project objectives, and appear indifferent to the challenges of sustaining and scaling them up.

This does not imply criticism of MSI management of *Dima-Adros*; on the contrary, project staff has successfully dealt with GOM sectoral shortcomings from the beginning. MSI has been required to foster the creation and strengthening of local partners, as well as bear the costs of all project interventions (except for MEN’s provision of instructional manuals and teacher training). MSI has played a critical role in further developing child labor regulatory measures that have been in development for years. Integration of innovative measures will require broad and multisectoral support and commitment in advance of project launch.

MSI has little if any political influence to shape national developmental strategies or encourage governmental implementation of best practices. This could be within the purview of USDOL or U.S. Embassy officials, and it should be ongoing, especially when having to deal with changes in government similar to that which occurred last year in Morocco. New ministers have come to *Dima-Adros* partner agencies and signaled shifts in investment priorities that do not include child

³ World Bank. (2008, September 24). *Morocco at a glance*. Retrieved from <http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/COUNTRIES/MENAEXT/MOROCCOEXTN/0,,menuPK:294565~pagePK:141132~piPK:141109~theSitePK:294540,00.html>.

education and child labor. MSI is an externally funded corporation, and as such must perform in a rapidly changing environment over which they have little control.

5.6.2 Strengthen NGOs and the Civil Sector

MSI's experience has demonstrated that NGOs can effectively deliver services normally delivered by the public sector. Partner associations have been most effective in implementing the *Dima-Adros* operation, but they will require substantive investments to expand and continue programs. Given the lack of civil society organizations in most project sites, some association partners were chosen on the basis of expediency. Whether they were sufficiently organized to carry out project programs and meet reporting requirements was of paramount importance in their selection. They require technical and material assistance to prosper, if not survive after *Dima-Adros*.

Significant strengthening of implementing associations is required if they are to sustain themselves as well as project operations. MSI funding may require a shift in priorities for the remainder of the project to meet project targets of direct services for 8,000 beneficiaries. Partner capacity development should assume renewed importance.

5.6.3 Engagement of Public Sector Partners

Although MSI is a recognized and appreciated partner with major public ministries and agencies that deal with child education and child labor, project management staff is wary of promises and pledges not met. In Morocco, like most developing nations, the tendency of upper-level ministry officials to underestimate problems and overstate successes is problematic. It was a refreshing departure from the norm to interview the National Director of *Entraide Nationale*, who was most concerned about the poor quality of instruction and limited capacities of institutes in his organization, confirming what was observed during evaluation site visits.

Other central ministry officials spoke of a commitment and desire to collaborate and a willingness to incorporate *Dima-Adros* results into routine programming. In reality, their services are poorly delivered and often nonexistent in rural Morocco. These conditions call for interim reality checks to ensure each partner is effectively meeting expectations.

5.6.4 Basic Education Should Prepare Students for Work

Children involved in *Dima-Adros* are largely from impoverished and uneducated households. In most households, preadolescents are treated as adults, and their earnings or work contribution is crucial to family existence. During focus group discussions, beneficiaries and their parents asserted that the decision to withdraw from child labor or remain in school was largely based on the children's ability to gain access to workforce training programs. Beneficiaries will likely continue to participate in *Dima-Adros* literacy training, and local commitment for education will grow so long as they perceive immediate and productive outcomes: namely, prospects for well-paying employment. Expectations are not for a more prosperous life. The need to work for survival may trump desires for classroom learning.

5.6.5 Untrained Teachers Need Professional Development and Ongoing Support

Dima-Adros and MEN have teamed up to provide four days of pedagogical training to *animateurs*. In many instances, this training was the participants' first exposure to teaching methods. But the challenges of meeting academic and social support requirements for beneficiaries are demanding. Systematic professional development along with the provision of counseling, materials, and other instructional resources is necessary to improve the quality of instruction.

VI CONCLUSIONS

6.1 PROGRAM DESIGN ISSUES

6.1.1 Fitting *Dima-Adros* with Overall GOM Programs and Support of Child Labor Project Goals

MSI has been overseeing USDOL-funded operations in Morocco since 2003 with the earlier *Adros* project. During this time, MSI developed effective collaboration protocols with (and earned the respect and admiration of) child protection and education agencies throughout the nation. Operating within the umbrella of the National Steering Committee on Child Labor, MSI staff members have been most prudent in engaging public sector partners.

Given the limited funding and scope of *Dima-Adros*, the project has made a formidable impression on agencies delivering human services, especially with the limited resources available. The project has a presence in 9 of more than 275 communes, but has fostered widespread interest at the national level and palpable pride among local government stakeholders. MSI has been proactive in support of broader child protection regulations, and according to parliamentary sources, the bill for comprehensive prohibitions of domestic child labor is nearing enactment.

MSI staff members work very closely with MEN (especially the Directorate of Nonformal Education) and with school personnel at the commune level. MEN supplies school materials to *Dima-Adros* students in nonformal and tutoring classes. *Entraide Nationale* provides older beneficiaries (age 15 to 17) with training in health and rudimentary vocational skills. The project has provided vital technical assistance to the Child Protection Unit in Marrakech, which provides safe haven services for children in extreme abuse circumstances.

MSI is involved in a pilot effort with OFPPT to provide formal vocational training. Here, older students (age 15 to 17) are enrolled in basic skills and work preparation programs. In addition, beneficiaries are matriculating in the MOA extension training center in Taza.

MSI has developed an extensive relationship with the Marrakech regional Academy for Education, which is a national demonstration consortium of education agencies, international donors, local governments, and the private sector. Among other goals, this organization seeks to decentralize educational programming to combat dropout, foster educational quality, and improve formal and nonformal school programming.

6.1.2 *Dima-Adros* Strategy, Changes to the Strategy, and Whether the Outputs are Realistic and Achievable

MSI holds to its central strategy to dedicate most financial resources to direct services for 8,000 beneficiaries (4,000 out-of-school/working children and 4,000 children at risk of dropout and premature entry into work) specified in the cooperative agreement with USDOL. At the halfway point in the project, a sound project infrastructure consisting of 23 implementing associations has been developed, strengthened, and mobilized.

The project design has been modified to ensure that associations and communes are fully committed to the project. Several implementing partners have left the project, but have been replaced by alternative groups. From direct and secondary observations conducted during the evaluation, *Dima-Adros* educational programming is on target to complete program objectives.

There is a high level of commitment on the part of parents and associations, which are typically composed of 10 (in smaller villages) to 150 general members. Associations are provided with funds to purchase a computer and maintain a small office. Every association staff person visited during the evaluation demonstrated knowledge of USDOL reporting procedures, procurement protocols, program expectations, and performance requirements of contracted *animateurs*.

The project is well on target to meeting outputs cited in the cooperative agreement for beneficiaries involved in nonformal education. Although the scholastic support program for at-risk students has only recently begun, given the performance of implementing associations and the number of beneficiaries submitted to *Dima-Adros* for approval, dropout prevention targets are expected to be met as well.

6.2 PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES

6.2.1 Measure the Project's Progress Toward Reaching Its Goals and Accuracy of the Monitoring and Evaluation System

Bearing in mind that civil society and CBOs are at early stages of development in Morocco, and basic human services, including education, are delivered within the context of a highly centralized and underperforming bureaucracy, *Dima-Adros* has done remarkably well in selecting and building the capacities of partner associations. MSI has established functional working relationships with collaborating ministries, but the project is limited in rendering the public sector more responsive to the needs of poor children.

Public primary education in the areas served by *Dima-Adros* can best be described as neglected. In three of the sites visited, one primary school was deserted and two were not in service for lack of teachers. The only functional primary school visited (in the Marrakech area) showed high levels of absenteeism from both teachers and students. The level and quality of instruction observed provided little assurance that the few students completing the primary cycle might go on to secondary schools.

On the other hand, every *Dima-Adros* classroom observed by the evaluation team was in operation, even those classes visited without advance notice. Pupils age 5 to 17 were uniformly able to read along with the text and voiced collective delight with being in the class. *Animateurs* were actively engaged with students and were able to demonstrate rudimentary use of student-centered instruction, although chalkboards dominate class activities. More important, teachers show up for classes, actively engage individual students, and monitor student performance. Teachers are well supervised by implementing partners.

Monitoring and evaluation performed by MSI complies to USDOL reporting requirements and is categorized according to performance indicators cited in the cooperative agreement. Since MSI

is now in its sixth year of successfully executing USDOL EIs, the M&E system is well established and meets all definitions and reporting requirements of USDOL.

The Performance Monitoring Plan reporting system captures information that is prepared and submitted by implementing partners. Reports must be verified and counter-signed by MSI-contracted, local caseworkers and MEN school inspectors. All *animateurs*, implementing associations, and counter-signatories report having received extensive MSI training in the use of the monitoring and evaluation system. Although they admit that reporting requirements are cumbersome, there were no complaints or reports of irregularities. All *Dima-Adros* staff (including the project driver) are knowledgeable about the M&E system and are vigilant of late reports and missing information. MSI staff members verify the accuracy of association reports while conducting site visits, which occur once a month on average.

Dima-Adros collects information on each student's original and current working status. Implementing partners must document that all students in nonformal classes have withdrawn from work and were not enrolled in school as a condition of participation. Individual beneficiary case records are maintained by association partners, and duplicate copies are kept in MSI files. Association reports, once approved, are entered into the MSI software database. Files at MSI Rabat contain beneficiaries' personal information, academic performance, work history, and family background. In addition, files hold class attendance records and student progress charts, as reported by *animateurs*. Teacher performance, classroom quality, and collective student performance (as reflected in assignment and test grades), as well as insertion into formal or vocational education, are gathered by association staff and verified by the *Dima-Adros* caseworker. Although project classes are in their first months, associations are also obligated to collect information on beneficiaries work activities after they complete nonformal and tutoring programs.

Payments to associations are made only after association officers have documented *animateur* and student attendance. *Dima-Adros* also has verifiable indicators to monitor the progress of awareness-raising and advocacy activities, but the majority of monitoring and evaluation data concerns student beneficiaries. MSI has submitted information to USDOL twice each year in the form of TPRs.

Animateurs must maintain class size and regular attendance to be paid. At times, they are responsible for locating children and trying to withdraw them from work, convincing parents to return their children to school, or enrolling children in tutoring classes. *Animateurs* are required to keep grade and attendance records, and occasionally visit students' homes if an extended absence is noticed. Teaching performance and classroom quality is reported by MEN nonformal education inspectors and MSI caseworkers. Under careful scrutiny and monitoring by association leaders, this compensation system is an effective motivational approach to eliciting performance and accountability among *animateurs*. Interviews with individual *animateurs* and several teacher focus groups noted a high level of enthusiasm for seeking out and enrolling students, and retaining them in class.

Instructional quality is evaluated by inspectors from MEN nonformal education (regional) delegations. They receive a stipend from MSI to observe classes for presented material, teaching style and quality, class rapport and discipline, and the physical classroom situation. These

inspectors are required to complete a checklist for reporting to MSI. This is an important program component, given that most *animateurs* are first-time teachers and lack substantive training in instructional technologies. Given the isolated nature and difficulty in accessing many nonformal classes, MEN inspectors will likely need close supervision to ensure that all classes are visited.

Considering the overall inadequacies of Moroccan public education and the limited service that school inspectors contribute to school performance in most developing nations, the likelihood of their having a significant and beneficial impact on *Dima-Adros* is debatable. Their presence in public schools has done little to advance learning in formal classes. Moreover, many *Dima-Adros* schools are in isolated villages, often requiring a full day of vehicle and foot travel to be reached, making inspector visits improbable. Parents, associations, and MSI staff are most active in monitoring classrooms.

In all five *Dima-Adros* sites/communes visited during the evaluation, caseworkers, association officers, and teachers were all knowledgeable of project recordkeeping, reporting, and documentation procedures. In every instance, they were able to produce the most recent reports and explain various categories and definitions of the monitoring and evaluation process. Data collection by MSI staff is kept current and, based on a sampling of documents, mostly accurate. During the evaluation mission, reports submitted to MSI by partner associations were compared with actual conditions in project sites; no inconsistencies or irregularities were found. This success has come with no small amount of commitment on the part of MSI staff and association partners.

6.3 PARTNERSHIP AND COORDINATION ISSUES

The *Dima-Adros* partnership is primarily between MSI and the 23 implementing associations. Associations were selected on the basis of evaluation criteria formed through extensive consultations with local governments, parents, school directors, teachers, and children. MSI has demonstrated prudence in dealing with implementing associations, ensuring that each has communications capacities, established internal governance procedures, and a local general assembly composed of parents. Association officers and staff have been trained by *Dima-Adros* staff and are in frequent telephone contact with MSI Rabat. The implementing partners are closely supervised by *Dima-Adros* independent caseworkers (*points focaux*), who must sign off on all reports, invoices, and disbursements.

MSI conducts training for association members to ensure that all USDOL reporting requirements and definitions are understood. Associations are reimbursed only when/if reporting requirements have been met and are satisfactory to project needs.

MSI maintains excellent working relations with the three principal Moroccan ministries (MEN, MDSFS, and DT) that are concerned with child protection, education, and workforce development, as well as INDH's *Entraide Nationale* and the Marrakech Academy of Education. These public agencies collaborate closely with *Dima-Adros* and, according to discussions during the evaluation, collectively hold MSI project management in high esteem. These organizations and 30 other agencies, ministries, and government partners attended the debriefing of this evaluation. In each instance, partners lauded the level of interaction and collaboration with MSI.

However, favorable reports of conditions from national partners are less evident in the field. In most *Dima-Adros* pilot communes, public education and child protection programming are not in the best state of delivery. The key player for child development—the public school system—is not available, accessible, functional, or effectively supported throughout most of rural and peri-urban Morocco. Many village children must travel long distances, often over foot paths, to reach a local school. Even when close by, schools tend to be in disrepair and poorly staffed. Poor school management permits exorbitantly high levels of absenteeism of teachers.

As in isolated rural areas in most developing nations, teachers commute from nearby urban centers to their designated schools. During inclement weather conditions (this year Morocco has had record rainfall and flooding, destroying many rural roads), teachers have no vehicular access to schools and do not hold classes. Even under favorable conditions, rural teachers often follow a pattern of beginning or ending classes midweek.

Although MEN provides texts and workbooks to children enrolled in schools, there are few other educational materials available for children. The language of instruction also presents problems. Many children in *Dima-Adros* sites (as across a wide swath of Morocco) speak a Berber dialect. The language of instruction, however, is Arabic, with a bilingual shift to French in upper grades. With few bilingual skills, spotty teaching services, and an absence of instructional support, most rural children are reluctant to stay in school, or simply never enroll.

The evaluation team visited some 30 classrooms. *Dima-Adros* classes, which are often held in private homes, were well attended in every instance observed. In formal schools visited, there was a high level of teacher and student absenteeism. In one school, an average of 15 students was in attendance in each of six classrooms, while the official rolls listed 33 students. Over half of students are regularly absent.

The public school personnel interviewed estimated that dropout and non-enrollment rates reach as high as 70% among children of primary school age in *Dima-Adros* project areas. These estimates were substantiated by interviews with student and parent focus groups in *Dima-Adros* schools. Among *Dima-Adros* students, only about 20% had ever enrolled in primary school. Parents in isolated, rural areas claim the non-enrollment rate to be as high as 95%. Both children and parents agreed that *Dima-Adros* classes are a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity. *Animateurs* and association members report that attendance in *Dima-Adros* is perceived by both parents and students as obligatory, and absenteeism is a rarity.

Similar shortcomings were found in classes offered by *Entraide Nationale*, which serves some 150,000 disadvantaged beneficiaries—primarily girls—in more than 1,000 centers. This agency provides employment skills training to older girls (age 14 to 17). However, in two rural centers visited by the evaluation team, there were prohibitively high levels of student dropout (60% on average), little or obsolete equipment, and few instructors, most with poor training.

The national director of *Entraide Nationale* admits to the organization being underfunded and underperforming. Although centers operate from spacious schools, few instructors have sufficient skills to transfer to students. Textiles, rug weaving, and dressmaking are the principal courses of study (along with health and literacy instruction), but there is little interest to complete training among students interviewed in these institutes.

Similarly, MSI has provided support to beneficiaries for a training project with OFPPT. Students are enrolled in rudimentary skills training curricula that would normally require successful completion of the primary cycle. While the faults of these type programs were highlighted in the U.S. MCC Compact with Morocco⁴ and slated for upgrading through that grant facility, OFPPT programs for academically deficient students remain unimpressive. About half of the *Dima-Adros* group (18 students) have dropped out. The OFPPT school director noted the reasons to be cultural and not for any lack of academic capacities. More likely, as with *Entraide Nationale*, the poor quality of instruction was the major cause of dropout.

The same limitations are evident in other GOM youth training programs. The Ministry of Handicrafts offers vocational training for disadvantaged, dropout, and poor youth at some 50 centers in Morocco. As in other institutes, curricula for girls focus on sewing/confection, carpet weaving, and hospitality jobs, few of which are taught to a level adequate enough for more than minimum, entry-level salaries. The quality of teachers, instructional resources, and equipment are rarely comparable even with other lower middle-income nations and grossly inferior to Western standards.

The major challenge going forward is in determining which organizations to rely on for scaling up and sustaining *Dima-Adros* project services. The implementing network of associations developed by MSI shows promise of fulfilling a larger role in this regard. *Dima-Adros* has partnered some effective NGOs and CBOs. Most are recently created and have scant experience with internationally funded projects. Nevertheless, the associations embody a grassroots enthusiasm and sufficient capacities to execute the stringent requirements of *Dima-Adros* programming and, with more installed capacities, might be the key to sustaining programs.

Association members are mostly parents of *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries. These memberships demonstrate the benefits that can be obtained through collective actions. The small amount of overhead/indirect costs (20% of the total contract) provided by MSI has been sufficient to establish associations as a social and developmental presence in their respective communities. Although they are financed primarily by MSI and their work is limited to implementing *Dima-Adros* programming, the network might be developed to replace flagging public sector services. Later in this report, we will recommend various strategies to strengthen association partners, so that they might serve a role in scaling and sustaining *Dima-Adros* interventions.

6.4 MANAGEMENT ISSUES

6.4.1 Challenges and Successes in Management in Coordination with the U.S. Government

MSI project managers have well-developed ties with the U.S. Consulate's political and economic attaché and USAID's education team leader. Both were interviewed and both attended the evaluation debriefing. The only other USAID-supported education project in Morocco—Advancing Learning and Employability for a Better Future (*ALEF*), under contract with the Academy for Educational Development (AED)—is nearing completion. Despite having different goals and geographic focus, MSI has maintained close working relations with the AED team,

⁴ MCC. (2007). *Millennium Challenge Compact: Artisan Training*. Washington, DC: Author.

especially with respect to fostering an improved regulatory framework for child protection and public education.

Dima-Adros and stakeholder ministries have had little interaction with the U.S. MCC and lack knowledge of resources to be disbursed in support of literacy and vocational training under the MCC Compact. MCA-Maroc is the implementing agency for the Compact, of some US\$34 million that is to be invested in improved access to literacy, secondary, and vocational training for the poorest quartile of Morocco's youth. While these funds remain in the design and tendering stage of implementation, they may foster reforms that will broaden youth opportunities for training throughout Morocco. The evaluation team made efforts to meet with MCA-Maroc personnel but without success.

Alignment of MCC funds with upcoming USAID education programs and USDOL's *Dima-Adros* initiative should become a high priority of the U.S. Embassy, USAID, and MSI. By leveraging these resources effectively, the *Dima-Adros* project and partner agencies might be able to orient educational investments toward programs for children at work or at risk of dropping out.

6.5 LEVERAGING NONPROJECT RESOURCES

As with any demonstration/pilot operation, there must be early consideration for scaling, replicating, and consolidating model interventions. MSI is in the very early stages of project implementation, and staff energy has focused on meeting immediate project goals, delivering services to 8,000 beneficiaries, strengthening institutions and policies, and raising awareness. The principal contributor to *Dima-Adros* programs is MEN, which provides material support to nonformal and tutoring beneficiaries. MSI has also involved the Marrakech Academy and CPUs in a co-financing matrix. Other than nominal relations with USAID's *ALEF* project and periodic meetings with ILO and UNICEF (neither of which has substantive program resources dedicated to education), MSI is not actively leveraging funds with any international donors. There are some prospects for leveraging resources with the European Union's MEDA program, the Government of Spain's *Escuela Taller* (Workshop School), and other initiatives funded by France and Luxemburg.

6.6 SUSTAINABILITY

At the midpoint of the *Dima-Adros* operation, strategies for scaling up and sustainability have yet to be effectively elaborated. To meet immediate project goals, the MSI staff has devoted its limited energies and finances to ensuring that pilot operations are installed and operational. Given the difficult geographic dispersal of project sites, the variety and requirements of implementing partners and stakeholders, the mixed record of government agency support, and rigorous reporting/accountability demands imposed by USDOL, MSI has faced many challenges to bring the *Dima-Adros* project to its present state of vitality.

The USDOL/MSI cooperative agreement calls for hand-off, scaling-up, and sustainability of interventions to government ministries and NGO partners. MSI has taken great pains to collaborate with GOM agencies and consolidate the operational and financial capacities of

implementing partners. However, neither project implementing associations nor public education and training ministries currently possess the capability to expand and continue the excellent efforts installed by *Dima-Adros*.

This premise should be reconsidered, as public sector institutional weaknesses and the limited, generic response of GOM to the needs of poor, rural, and peri-urban children will make replication of the successes of *Dima-Adros* difficult. Although the level of investment in public education in Morocco ranks favorably in comparison with similar nations, primary and vocational education sectoral performance ranks Morocco among the poorest performers among middle-income nations.⁵ In the face of such systemic shortcomings, rapid population growth, and a resource-limited environment, MSI will likely need to involve NGOs and CBOs for the sustainability and scaling-up of operations.

The alliance with MEN's nonformal education directorate has produced cost sharing for project operations, but without the active financial participation of implementing associations, classes for out-of-school youth may well fall into the same state of negligence that underlies the failure of formal education. After observing classes in two *Entraide Nationale* training institutes and interviewing the national director, it is apparent that this organization is grossly underfunded and overwhelmed with demand. As a consequence, program quality suffers, and dropout is high. Similarly, OFPPT training officials express little interest in matriculating high-risk, underperforming students into programs that are already overwhelmed with better-prepared students who are more likely to succeed.

Association partners express a high level of interest in scaling up and sustaining *Dima-Adros* programs, but these organizations have few staff resources, limited technical capacity, and even more limited finances, since most rely exclusively on MSI for funding and direction. Few of MSI's association partners could sustain support for out-of-school and in-school children without continuing USDOL funding.

6.6 IMPACT

As in many developing nations, Moroccan social and educational services are seen as originating from the government and trickling down to communities. This perspective appears to be especially prevalent in Morocco, where centralized programming rarely engages citizen inputs or places counterpart demands on local communities to participate in and support programs. Perhaps the most significant impact of *Dima-Adros* has been the mobilization of local officials, civil society, and parents to take action against child labor at the community levels. During site visits, it was gratifying to be received (often without advance notice) by a mix of teachers, parents, students, and local government functionaries, all of whom are most appreciative of *Dima-Adros* and the U.S. Government.

Dima-Adros began its site selection by calling for locally conducted assessments of the status of children and the formulation of a community plan of action that involved a broad cross-section of participants. The sense of empowerment and enthusiasm among parents and children—who have otherwise been excluded from civil society—for *Dima-Adros* programs was evident during visits to

⁵ World Bank. (2008, September 24).

project sites. Such a civil society foundation has been effectively tapped in a number of other countries, which have used USDOL or USAID funding to build local capacities. These will be discussed in the following section on recommendations. For the foreseeable term, however, there remains insufficient capacity among partner NGOs to carry on interventions after the life of project.

Dima-Adros classes and student support have achieved substantive results in matriculating first-time enrollees in nonformal education, and preventing formal school dropout and entry into labor. The project is having a transformative impact on more than 8,000 students and countless other children, parents, and local organizations. While the evaluator observed the broad impact of the project on basic literacy, numeracy, Arabic, and some rudimentary French, the course of study is short and limited. There is concern among local school administrators, shared by the evaluation team, that the quality of training provided in nonformal classes is not sufficient to permit fluid reinsertion into primary or secondary schools. This is especially the case for older teens, who would enter grade levels appropriate for preteens.

Most *Dima-Adros* students are teenagers and, given their academic deficiencies, will be hard-pressed to successfully reintegrate into any quality public school system. Although the project has had a major impact enrolling beneficiaries, their level of training in nonformal education is quite elementary. One year of schooling and support can have a transformative impact on individual beneficiaries in the short term, but one hopes for better prospects of pursuing formal and vocational/technical training that might be supported through additional funding.

A new corps of teachers has been created by *Dima-Adros*, which will support the employment of over 200 *animateurs* and teachers before the project is complete, but as noted earlier, their level of training is minimal, and classroom challenges are numerous with high-risk, academically deficient, and multi-aged students.

Although *Dima-Adros* and MEN have provided these *animateurs* with a few days professional development, much more is needed for them to reach the instructional quality levels required of most teachers in the public school system. Since they are not certified by MEN and are paid solely with project funds, *animateurs* are not likely to be integrated into routine MEN operations after the life of the project. Consequently, the sustainability of this approach must come into question, unless the expense of paying *animateurs* can be assumed through revenues generated by NGO partners.

Although the principal function of *animateurs* is to teach nonformal classes, they also serve as a community agent to deter child labor and raise awareness of the importance of school attendance. Their compensation depends on their credibility and capacity to deliver training that is perceived as valuable and relevant by parents and students alike. Without students, *animateurs* are not paid. MSI's approach imposes performance accountability squarely on the shoulders of the *animateurs* fostering high enrollment, attendance, and program quality.

This page left intentionally blank.

VII RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 PROJECT DESIGN

U.S. Government investments in primary and workforce education and child protection in Morocco could benefit from improved coordination and harmonization. USDOL, USAID, and MCC are all funding separate poverty reduction, child protection, and education programs through fragmented operations and a mosaic of outputs. The standalone nature of most bilateral donor funding can be understood, but not necessarily appreciated. The U.S. operations may prove more effective and efficient if conditioned on requirements for collaboration.

While MSI has made impressive strides to engender cooperation with GOM ministries for education and child protection, the U.S.-based corporation can hardly be expected to sway Moroccan public sector programming with its limited influence, especially with major changes in ministry leadership. We recognize that USDOL does not have the authority or the responsibility to coordinate or harmonize other donor funding, with ILO-IPEC, GOM ministries, or other organizations. However, MSI efforts could be well served with periodic USDOL dialogue with GOM interlocutors as to expectations of commitments and counterpart support.

Now that the *Dima-Adros* project is meeting short-term and midterm targets, it is time to assess whether prospects for scaling and sustainability must rest primarily with public sector partners. MSI may be expected to reexamine whether a renewed focus on NGO association development would be more productive than reliance on a handoff to indifferent and ineffective public agencies. As noted throughout this report, MSI's successes with NGOs and CBOs should be built upon as a foundation for the sustainability and scaling-up of operations.

This approach is based on the need to strengthen partner NGOs with revenue generation and cost recovery capabilities since, currently, most are reliant on USDOL/*Dima-Adros* funding. However, if equipped with alternate revenue streams, partner associations may be able to ensure nonformal education is continued by contracting with training suppliers (individual *animateurs*, formal teachers with free time, or even formal schools) to provide services.

If the MEN shortcomings in providing access to local schools persist, partner associations could provide support for the creation and maintenance of community-based schools, as has been done with World Bank support (EDUCO in El Salvador), with government support (Community Schools Program in Mali), or solely with village resources (FONHEP in Haiti). In each of these nations and many other developing countries, CBOs and NGOs have assumed a paramount role in establishing, operating, and supporting local schools.

With additional financial resources, NGOs could engage after-hour tutors outside schools, provide scholarships for youth work training, and offer supplies and supplementary materials to in-school children. Even without revenue streams, CBOs should remain active in preventing and raising awareness of truancy and dropout, the fundamental goals of *Dima-Adros*.

7.2 IMPLEMENTATION

Dima-Adros should expend substantial energy, resources, and investments to expand partner association capacities. Most MSI partner associations are newly created and possess only enough capacity to meet USDOL and project reporting requirements. MSI should seek out public and private partners, including INDH and international poverty reduction operations to extend technical assistance to these NGOs. They are especially in need of skills in revenue generation, strategies to expand and mobilize membership, techniques for cost recovery, improved internal governance, and tapping into other funding opportunities.

MSI and MEN should provide broader and deeper professional development for *animateurs* and teachers. Given their very limited academic and pedagogical training, *animateurs*, as well as formal teachers involved in the tutoring initiative, will benefit from exposure to instructional technologies, pedagogical practices for multigrade instruction, incorporation of community-based didactic materials, and recruitment and use of community teaching aids to help provide more individualized instruction and personal tutoring to students.

MSI should reexamine the role of MEN nonformal inspectors. Visits to *Dima-Adros* schools are lagging, and actions should be taken to correct their performance. If this program component continues to disappoint, other strategies should be used to extend monitoring and support to teachers, including the contracting of retired and qualified teachers or the provision of regular training and counseling by local master teachers.

7.3 PARTNERSHIP AND COOPERATION

While coordination with GOM must be pursued to the fullest extent possible, the best prospects for scaling and sustainability are with NGO partners. The goals of the *Dima-Adros* project may best be served by improving the programming and revenue generation capabilities of associations.

There are ample opportunities for MSI to create fresh dynamism to improve instructional quality for beneficiaries. Local *animateur* and tutor professional development training could also include teachers from surrounding public schools and establish a foundation for reinsertion of *Dima-Adros* children into formal education. The director of OFPPT's institute for sewing and confection in Marrakech expressed interest in offering (for very little cost) a competency-upgrading program for instructors of *Entraide Nationale* institutes, who require substantial development to meet the needs of *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries.

MSI would benefit from work with central ministry administrators and international donors who support workforce education to install institutional capacities to accommodate high-risk, illiterate, and language-deficient students. Significant funds are being invested in the primary, secondary, and vocational systems and civil society development by USAID, the European Union (EU), MCC, and other international and corporate donors. These operations could benefit from lessons learned and exemplary pilot efforts implemented by *Dima-Adros* and vice versa.

As for workforce training programs pertinent to *Dima-Adros* beneficiaries, the most important donors include (1) the EU, which funds the *Maroc des Competence* operation⁶ to train youth in tourism, textiles, and information technology; (2) U.S. MCC-Artisan and Literacy Training Program, which supports literacy, artisan, and workforce training in OFPPT and Ministry of Craft institutes, with particular emphasis on disadvantaged and rural youth;⁷ and (3) the Government of Spain—*Cooperación Española's Escuela Taller de Albañilería tradicional de Tetuán*. The *Escuela Taller* program has gained international prominence in training out-of-school youth in practical skills using nonformal educational centers and has a long and varied history working in Morocco.⁸ MSI should make every possible effort to reach out to these and programs for collaboration.

Local contributions in the form of municipal- and commune-level subsidies or parental/beneficiary counterpart support need to be more effectively used. This might include a tributary formula that would impose *ad valorum* taxes on properties, local value-added sales taxes dedicated to school support, or allocation of a percentage of local government budgets to educational services. As for parents, they have not been called on for substantive counterpart support, matching *Dima-Adros* financing with financial or in-kind contributions. There are any number of successful revenue-generation schemes that have proven successful in other USDOL operations to eliminate WFCL and other developmental operations that could be pursued.

7.4 MONITORING AND EVALUATION

The *Dima-Adros* reporting system has been refined to meet its optimal requirements. The MSI staff should be applauded for the fine monitoring and evaluation framework in place. It has come with no small amount of work and persistence. The project's reliance on local partner associations to monitor and gather data on child labor and school dropout has raised sensitivities to the consequences of WFCL and engendered community-wide support for better education. In each and every site visited by the evaluation team, parents, local government officials, and school administrators spoke of the project's influence on raising awareness of and concern for the high level of dropout and child labor. The evaluation mission queried associations and *animateurs* as to the validity and accuracy of reports submitted by associations and found no instances of irregular or false information. To MSI's credit, association representatives have been well trained to gather data and most willing to discuss problems and challenges encountered in reporting. Without the presence of local labor inspectorates or school truancy agents, there is no alternative but for partner associations to play a critical monitoring and evaluation role.

7.5 IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

Instructional interventions should be deepened and expanded. A curriculum based on a rudimentary literacy, math, and language manual, although most effective as a teaching guide

⁶ The €75 million effort runs through 2010. Contact: M. Abdelatif MOUNIR, OFPPT, 50, rue Driss Chbakou Aïn Bordja Casablanca, Phone: (212) 5 22 62 27 78, Email: mounir@ofppt.org.ma.

⁷ MCA–Maroc. *Alphabétisation fonctionnelle et Formation Professionnelle (32,8 millions de dollars)*. Retrieved from <http://www.app.ma/index.php?page=3-1-1-1-alphabetisation-fonctionnelle-et-formation-professionnelle>.

⁸ Famsi. *Escuela Taller de Albañilería tradicional de Tetuán (Marruecos)*. Retrieved from http://www.andaluciasolidaria.org/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=454&Itemid=215.

and resource, is only the foundation for more advanced learning. *Animateurs* and teachers need much more training in multilevel classroom teaching and bilingual pedagogy, as well as additional teaching resources and materials.

Partner associations and other potential CBOs should be provided technical expertise in revenue generation, membership development, and fundraising. The receipt of support should be on the condition that membership be expanded to more of the community. *Dima-Adros* associations should collaborate in a national network to seek out funds, install new programs, and share productive experiences. Just as the Marrakech Academy has become a clearinghouse for funding and supporting initiatives, a network of *Dima-Adros* and neighboring NGOs could collectively combine for a louder voice and stronger role in human development programming.

For example, one such movement in El Salvador led to the creation of a national consortium of NGOs (FEPADE),⁹ which has become the largest workforce-training organization in the country. Also in El Salvador, the Agape system has had sustained success in delivering a range of human services and vocational training.¹⁰ These networks emerged in the absence of effective public education programs and have created exemplary training models. Other initiatives that should be considered include the *Tostan* Initiative in Senegal;¹¹ the Ministry of Labor of Spain's *Escuela Taller* program;¹² the Songhai Center in Benin;¹³ and the BRAC Network of Bangladesh.¹⁴

These are but a few examples of innovative uses of the private sector, NGOs, and CBOs in meeting broader educational needs. NGOs could play a vital role in schooling if provided even minimal support or no government interference in their efforts at the very least. In Benin, USAID supports a CBO approach to fostering PTA efforts to improve girl's education, which has made substantial progress not only in advancing girls' enrollment and success, but in overall school performance as well. A pilot operation relying on regional NGOs to support the development and actions of village-based organizations has resulted in unprecedented levels of parental and student engagement in schooling, leading to dramatically increased enrollment, reduced dropout, and a higher level of school/teacher accountability.¹⁵

In Guatemala, the international donor community, charged with supporting implementation of UN-brokered peace accords, fostered legislation to create village educational cooperatives in support of primary and secondary schools. Funded through a tripartite arrangement of local government, parents, and the Ministry of Education, *Cooperativas en Educación Básica* are administered by locally elected boards that receive some public subsidies and whose operating budgets are augmented with revenue generated from locally incubated enterprises. Not only has

⁹ <http://www.fepade.org.sv/2009/site/index.php>.

¹⁰ <http://www.agapees.net/> and <http://www.itcha.edu.sv/>.

¹¹ <http://www.tostan.org/>.

¹² <http://www.inem.es/inem/en/ciudadano/etcote/origen.html>.

¹³ <http://www.songhai.org/songhai>.

¹⁴ <http://www.brac.net>.

¹⁵ Tesar, Charles & Codjia, Blandine. (2005, May). *Projet de Promotion de la Participation des Communautés pour une Education de Base pour tous PROBASE EVALUATION FINALE*. Washington, DC: USAID.

the effort increased the quality of educational services, but it has also helped increase family income, as well as local employment prospects for youth.¹⁶

To bolster prospects for scaling up *Dima-Adros* programs, implementing associations should be urged to hold intercommunity cultural events to foster similar activities in surrounding communes. In other nations, this takes the form of fairs or recognition ceremonies, which cite the good work of students, teachers, and parents. Surrounding communities are invited and are urged to mobilize against dropout and child labor, and adopt similar programs for out-of-school youth in their own communities. While gains of *Dima-Adros* may be modest on a national scale, program attributes can have the same transformative effect on neighboring individuals and communities as they do at project sites.

MSI should pursue the creation of a national community school program model that would provide government support for CBO-managed schools in rural and underserved areas. In other developing nations, such as Madagascar and Ghana, community-organized schools receive a combination of funds, supervision, curricular, and material support from central education ministries. Local organizations operate community schools and engage in enterprises that can offset school operational costs. CBO-managed schools could also receive financial support from local governments. Parents would contribute through a combination of school fees and/or participation in capital construct projects. This might involve work days for fabricating adobe or concrete bricks, classroom and toilet construction, building school desks, or lending instructional support to teachers with large classes.

No effective school mapping program exists for Morocco, but given the absence of schools and teachers in relatively accessible regions, there is most likely an enormous number of students out of school in isolated villages. If the *Dima-Adros* project could expand its delivery infrastructure to these and other unserved regions, MSI's impact might have a broad and transformative impact on child labor throughout the nation.

¹⁶ Information retrieved from the Final Evaluation of USAID Guatemala's Project for Bilingual and Bicultural Education.

This page left intentionally blank.

VIII SPECIFIC QUESTIONS POSED BY MSI/DIMA-ADROS

Q. What is the level of motivation of Dima-Adros' local volunteer caseworkers (points focaux)? What challenges do they face in doing on-the-ground work and how could the project help overcome them?

Five caseworkers (*points focaux*) were interviewed during the evaluation. During the interviews, all caseworkers demonstrated knowledge of all aspects of the project and were current on all personnel, reporting requirements, and program and financial issues. They displayed genuine enthusiasm about the purpose, goals, and expectations of *Dima-Adros*.

In light of the lagging performance of MEN school inspectors, MSI might consider ramping up instructional competencies of caseworkers to supervise *animateur* performance. Caseworkers are not trained educators, but with some intensive training, might serve as the first line of instructional oversight. They could confer with local MEN inspectors and/or draw the attention of MSI's educational specialist for urgent instructor needs. Because caseworkers are local personnel, costs for travel to commune schools would require only a slight increase in funding. Caseworkers could realistically visit classrooms and observe and guide teachers twice a month.

Q. How can one improve the involvement of local authorities, local elected officials, and ministries' representatives to achieve the project's desired results? What are their views of the project?

The evaluation process included numerous individual and group interviews—all without a single negative comment about MSI or project activities. Elected officials demonstrated a pride in participation and an ownership of *Dima-Adros*, even if their roles are largely peripheral to the operation. The baseline study and development of local plans of action generated wide awareness of the project and sparked local commitments for improved school attendance and the elimination of WFCL. The *Caid* (community mayor) of Ait Adel remarked that MSI has garnered enormous respect and admiration, and spawned community-wide enthusiasm to support its goals.

Q. How were the participatory planning sessions organized by the project in each region viewed by different stakeholders, including parents and children?

In discussions with association members, parents, and local officials, this is one of the more positive aspects of the project. MSI launched meetings over a number of days to explain the purpose of the project. These discussions led to the development of local community plans of action. At the project outset, MSI led extensive consultations with parents, children, local governments officials, and stakeholders, but these consultations have now been assumed by implementing associations. Besides a project plan of action, local individuals were asked to designate *points focaux* and to mobilize for the local baseline surveys. Data from these individual community research efforts provided the principal parameters for the project baseline study.

Q. How do parents and beneficiaries view the project? How can the project improve the services being delivered without increasing costs?

There is unanimous support and almost reverential appreciation for *Dima-Adros* among parents, students, and community leaders. Association officers learned of the evaluation mission, and the turnout to greet the evaluator was most impressive. The sense of pride and ownership in the project is most apparent, and parents are emphatic in their belief that *Dima-Adros* is a first and critical opportunity to educate their children. In the project commune of Ait Adel, for example, the original *Dima-Adros animateur* was a public school teacher hired to teach nonformal classes after school. His attendance patterns were poor, so the association fired him and replaced him with a recent high school graduate. The village agreed to provide the new *animateur* with housing, and when she arrived (during the midterm evaluation mission) more than a dozen parents came to greet her with much pride.

Given the level of poverty in project demonstration sites, parents are unable to meet even the most basic costs of education. In focus groups, parent and association members described the extreme economic hardships of subsistence life in rural Morocco and the inability to pay for any schooling. Among other factors, school fees were the reason their children never enrolled in or dropped out of public schools. Cost recovery from beneficiaries is not a likely solution to expansion and improvement of services. An immediate solution to improving the financial structure would be to create local community-managed schools that are subsidized by the GOM, as well as local governments.

Major challenges confronting *Dima-Adros* involve improvement and continuation of service. To date, there have been few efforts by implementing associations to enlarge memberships, generate revenue, or formulate any cost recovery mechanisms. With the exception of some fees for the girls' dormitory lodging and transport, most costs are borne by MSI, operating through associations. Clearly, the project cannot be sustained after USDOL funding is exhausted through these limited measures, so technical assistance to strengthen associations financially is of paramount importance in the coming months.

Q. What do the formal education teachers in the intervention areas know about the project and how do they view it?

During the evaluation, the focus was on *Dima-Adros* classrooms. Most of these are held in private homes or community buildings, with some in public primary schools after classes are finished at 1:30 p.m. Two public primary schools were visited in project sites. In both cases, directors and some teachers knew of *Dima-Adros* offerings and held the program in high regard. One director noted that some of his students were attending afterschool nonformal classes in lieu of coming to school. No reasoning was offered, as it is difficult to determine the motives of those students, but some possible reasons might be the poor quality instruction at public school, a preference to attend classes in the afternoon, being too far behind in regular classes to manage grade-level assignments, or even a preference to study closer to home or with close friends.

Q. How do nonformal education teachers view the way the project organizes teaching and class management? What challenges do they face in performing on-the-ground work and how could the project help to overcome them without increasing costs?

Animateurs seem to rely exclusively on the nonformal teaching guide and manual for first-time students provided by MEN, and follow national curricular standards for beginning literacy training. There are few instructional aids in *Dima-Adros* nonformal classrooms except for chalkboards. Classes observed during the midterm evaluation were mostly teacher-centered and chalkboard-based, and instruction seemed to adhere to student workbooks and instructor manuals. In all classrooms visited, attendance was quite high, and students were working in their individual manuals. In thumbing through student workbooks, assignments appeared to be current, and most students understood elements of the most recently completed lesson.

There is no question of the need for additional training and development for *animateurs*. Even those who have formal teacher training are weak on instructional capacities. The most professional instructor would be challenged to achieve high levels of student learning given that the overwhelming majority of *Dima-Adros* nonformal program students: (1) have never enrolled in school or dropped out in the early grades of poorly performing public schools; (2) range in ages from 5 to 17; (3) often speak a maternal language different from the languages of instruction (Arabic and French); and (4) come from households and communities with little or no media, academic, or language support.

It would benefit MSI to offer a sustained and expanded teacher training package to broaden and deepen competences. This should be done on a continuous basis, as there is some turnover in teachers, and all of them need extensive professional upgrading. Moreover, in the absence of MEN schools or teachers, MSI should consider collaborating with MEN to create a community-school finance and support model. In other nations where the public school system is ineffective, community-managed schools may be created through local initiatives. Often these schools qualify to receive financial support from the education ministry, NGOs, local governments, or parents, and may have minimal student fees. They hire, fire, and pay community teachers. With local control and teachers paid and supported by parents, accountability is much improved. Research indicates that students learn at higher levels at locally managed schools—financing levels being equal with formal education programs.

Q. How do local implementing organizations view their role in the project?

All association officials and members interviewed expressed a deep sense of commitment to eliminating WFCL in their communities and, in many instances, a first-time appreciation of the value of education of local children. *Dima-Adros* has become synonymous with innovation, community mobilization, and empowerment among most persons interviewed. Association members expressed strong feelings of indebtedness to MSI for their very existence, and are most eager to discharge program and reporting responsibilities required by project management.

Q. How could the project partner with implementing organizations to reinforce their capacity to withdraw children from child labor?

Aside from providing training and technical assistance on generating revenue to maintain program interventions, MSI should also help partner NGOs to expand their membership, embrace other dimensions of development, such as health, gender issues, and economic development, and advocate for the provision of better public services.

Dima-Adros has had an impact on community attitudes toward child labor and school attendance. Parents and association leaders are proud to point out that children are no longer exploited and that new community pressures are mounting to ensure that children register for formal schools (where available) or for *Dima-Adros* nonformal classes.

Animateurs have no doubt played a strong role in this shift in attitudes. As a condition of their salary, they must go door to door to recruit students, call on them at home in the case of prolonged absences, and convince parents and students alike of the importance of schooling and the dangers of child labor.

Q. What challenges do implementing associations face in doing work on the ground and how could the project help them overcome these obstacles?

As noted throughout this report, the ultimate sustainability of the *Dima-Adros* project will likely rest with broadening the capabilities of implementing partners to expand and continue projects. Demand for expansion of *Dima-Adros* interventions is exceptionally high given the rapid population growth and high dropout rate in Morocco. The prevention of WFCL and provision of basic education will require an innovative balance of community, public, civil society, and private investments. New school governance and financing models are imperative.

Project goals would be well served by installing simple revenue/job-generating measures among implementing partners and other CBOs and NGOs. A first step might include expanding associations' financial support from other government agencies, such as grants for literacy and health training, or even for community hygiene. The transfer of very simple income generation in agribusiness has proven to be fruitful in other developing nations.

Four such initiatives come to mind that might easily find root among Moroccan NGOs: beekeeping, chicken and egg production, aquaculture, and plant nurseries. These agriculture-related activities are easily undertaken as community-based enterprises and can help create jobs for youth and generate income for families (with a portion of profits allocated to NGO support). MSI's relationship with MOA might be tapped to provide association members with agricultural extension training and startup grants and technologies for small business development.

Q. How does the staff at the Marrakech CPU view the partnership with Dima-Adros? Has it been beneficial? How could both sides improve their partnership?

The leadership and staff of the Marrakech CPU are most impressive and have created an exemplary center for child rescue, one that would rival similar safe houses in richer nations. This municipal, regional, and national support model represents an important pilot step in installing

such centers throughout the nation. *Dima-Adros* support has been mainly for community awareness and mobilization, and that should continue.

Q. How do other donors' projects on the ground relate to the Dima-Adros project? How can the project better collaborate with them?

We have noted the need for a more balanced and coordinated approach that combines, at a minimum, U.S. funding from USAID, MCC, and USDOL. The other major contributors to poverty reduction and human development programs are the EU, Spain, France, and the Persian Gulf nations. Probably the most active donor with respect to *Dima-Adros* target groups is the Spanish Cooperation, which extends its hallmark vocational training program for at-risk and out-of-school youth, *Escuela Taller*, to various regions in Morocco, including a recent project in Chefchaouen. This program offers a wide range of construction-related training with the support of the Government of Spain, and should be included in any support matrix for expanding NGO capabilities.

Q. How do institutional partners on the provincial, regional, and national levels view the project's work? How can the project integrate their concerns and objectives better?

The evaluation included interviews across all sectors of provincial, regional, municipal, and national governments. The consensus among those interviewed is that MSI/*Dima-Adros* is in a unique position to help support media campaigns to call attention to the needs and advancement of child protection and education agendas. Since most of these organizations have a limited voice (as government agencies) in advocating for the needs of the target group, MSI and the U.S. Embassy could articulate media campaign strategies that are beyond the reach of stakeholders. Respondents suggest MSI engage the U.S. Embassy in a concentrated and systematic campaign to advance all components of the project.

Q. How does the Ministry of Labor appreciate the advocacy work carried out by Dima-Adros?

The Ministry of Labor's DT is the principal agency of the Ministry of Labor that serves as interlocutor of the MSI and USDOL program in Morocco. In this capacity and as Directorate of the Steering Committee on Child Labor, the DT is most familiar with the project's purpose and progress. This is also the lead agency in support of legislation on child labor, which is currently in the Council of Government before its hopeful enactment later in 2009.

The Minister of Labor, along with the Manager for International Cooperation is well apprised of *Dima-Adros* activities. Both expressed deep appreciation for the support provided by MSI for conferences, seminars, and roundtables that have mobilized Moroccan civil society and parliamentary deputies to combat WFCL. The DT hosted the debriefing of findings of this midterm evaluation at the Ministry of Labor offices in Rabat. Before and during the debriefing, the Minister and Manager reiterated their respect for MSI staff and admiration for *Dima-Adros*.

This page left intentionally blank.

ANNEXES

This page left intentionally blank.

ANNEX A: LIST OF ASSOCIATIONS VISITED DURING THE EVALUATION

Region	MSI-Dima-Adros Partner-Associations	Site Visits by the Evaluation Team
Sidi Issa Regragui	1. Association Lahssoudate pour le Développement Rural	
	2. Assoc. Regragua pour le Développement et la Coopération	✓
Tassift	3. Association Parents des Elèves de Tassift	✓
	4. Assoc. Citoyenneté et Développement	✓
Chefchaouen	5. Réseau des Associations d'Alphabétisation de Chefchaouen	✓
Salé	6. Association El Ouaha	
	7. Association Iklaa Pour le Développement	
	8. Association Amal Salé	
	9. Assoc. Nationale pour la Protection de l'Enfance et de la Famille	
Temara	10. Association Educatif du Développement Intégré et de Qualification Humaine	
Ain Aouda	11. Association of the First Greens	
Rabat	12. Assoc. Parents & Tuteurs d'élèves Ecole Hassan Al Youssi	
Ait Saghrouchen	13. Assoc. Taoumate pour le Développement et l'Environnement	
	14. Association Annahda pour Personne Handicapée	
	15. Association Ithri pour le Développement	
Skoura Lhadra	16. Association Al Falah pour le Développement et la Solidarité	✓
Ait Adel	17. Association Al Amal Ait Messaoud	✓
	18. Association Assaka Ouzzane pour le développement	✓
	19. Association Sidi Yaakoub pour le Développement	✓
Boujaad	20. Association Rihane pour le Développement et la Solidarité	
Kalâa	21. Association Sidi Moussa pour le Développement la Communication et l'Environnement	✓
	22. Association de Développement et de Solidarité Espace Associatif	✓
	23. Association Des Parents d' Elèves G.E Lakssour	

This page left intentionally blank.

ANNEX B: DIMA-ADROS PROJECT DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

Midterm Evaluation Docs

Cooperative Agreement Morocco FY07 (PDF)

Dima-Adros—USDOL Comments Responses—Sept 30 2008 (PDF)

Dima-Adros—Annex A – Logframe (submitted—May 2008) (PDF)

Dima-Adros—Etude de base principaux resultats—Sept 30 2008 (PPT)

Dima-Adros—Organizational Chart (submitted—May 2008) (PDF)

Dima-Adros—PMP Data Tracking Table (Annex E)—19dec08 (PDF)

Dima-Adros—PROJECT DOCUMENT—19dec08 (PDF)

Dima-Adros—Sustainability Matrix (submitted—May 2008) (PDF)

Dima-Adros TPR—Annex E—Work plan—Sept 30 2008 (PDF)

Dima-Adros TPR—Annex F—PMP Worksheet—Sept 30 2008 (PDF)

Dima-Adros TPR—March 31 2008—SUBMIT (PDF)

Dima-Adros TPR—Sept 30 2008 (PDF)

Morocco—Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labor in Morocco FY07 Dec 2008

Morocco *DIMA-ADROS* March 08 TPR—USDOL Comments

Morocco *DIMA-ADROS* Sept 08 TPR—USDOL Comments

This page left intentionally blank.

ANNEX E: CROSS-REFERENCE CHART FOR RESPONSES TO SPECIFIC USDOL QUESTIONS

The purpose of this annex is to guide readers to responses within the text of the report to specific questions posed by USDOL, according to six categories of issue:

Program Design Issues

1. How does the project's design fit into government programs developed by the Ministry of Labor and Ministry of Education to combat child labor and provide education for all? (Reference paragraphs 119-127)
2. Does the project design support the five child labor project goals? (Reference paragraphs 20, 73, 127) If not, which ones are not being supported and why not? (All are being supported, Reference paragraphs 51-75)
3. Has an effective and efficient monitoring and evaluation system been developed to measure performance indicators, including DOL common indicators? (Reference paragraphs 9-10,131-138) Can the system measure children's working status at regular intervals and during schools breaks and holidays? (Reference paragraph 133)
4. Are the project purpose and outputs achievable? (Reference paragraphs 26, 27, 32 and 34)
5. Is the work plan realistic? (Reference paragraphs 51-65)
6. Is educational quality also being pursued as part of the project strategy? (Reference paragraphs 145-150) Can it be measured and what has been its impact, if any, on efforts to reduce or eliminate WFCL in Morocco? (Reference paragraphs 81 and 82, 161-165)
7. What other major design issues should be brought to the attention of MSI, its subcontractors, and DOL? (Reference paragraphs 121-127)
8. Were the results of the project's baseline survey relevant to project design? (Reference paragraphs 104-106) What changes, if any, were made to the project design as a result of the baseline survey results? (Reference paragraphs 106)

Program Implementation Issues

1. Do project staff and subcontractors have a consistent understanding of DOL definitions of withdrawal and prevention of child beneficiaries from the Worst Forms of Child Labor (WFCL)? (Reference paragraphs 10, 24, 27 29)
2. Have project staff and subcontractor's been adequately trained in the use of the monitoring and evaluation system? (Reference paragraphs 131-138) What level of effort does the system place on staff and implementing organizations? (Reference paragraphs 131-136) Is the project able to verify the accuracy of the data it collects? (Reference paragraphs 136-138)

3. At mid-term, is the project on track in terms of meeting its stated purpose, outputs, and targets in the project document, including providing direct services to child beneficiaries, raising awareness, and improving child labor monitoring systems? (Reference paragraphs 81, 99, 120)
4. What other major implementation issues should be brought to the attention of MSI, subcontractors, and DOL? (Reference paragraphs 128-130, 153-155)

Partnership and Coordination Issues

1. What have been the major issues and challenges of initiating partnerships in support of the project? (Reference paragraphs 153, 156, 180)
2. What have been the major challenges and opportunities, if any, of implementing coordination with the host country government, particularly with the Ministries of Labor and Education? (Reference paragraphs 17-176, 193-184)
3. Assess the ability of MSI to identify subcontracts to supply services and provide support to its large number of geographically-diverse subcontractors. (Reference paragraphs 66-79)

Management Issues

1. What are the management strengths of this project? (Reference paragraphs 66-69)
2. What management areas could be improved? (Reference paragraphs 178-185)
3. How successful has the project been in leveraging non-project resources, such as community in kind contributions, local and national government assets, or international donor funds? (Reference paragraphs 156, 162)
4. How successful has the project been in coordinating project activities with the U.S. Government and international community's overall development agenda for Morocco? (Reference paragraphs 153-155, 166)
5. How has management used MSI resources to complement government resources in support of efforts to eliminate child labor? (Reference paragraphs 110, 115, 147-148)

Sustainability

1. What steps have been taken so far to promote sustainability and continuation of education strategies for combating child labor beyond the life of the project? (Reference paragraphs 167-170)
2. Has the project's initial strategy for sustainability proven to be adequate and appropriate thus far? (Reference paragraphs 167-170)

3. Has the project developed an exit strategy? (Reference paragraph 157) Will the project be prepared to handover responsibility for key activities to stakeholders or communities at the project's end? (Reference paragraphs 113, 116)

Impact

1. What appears to be the project's impact to date, if any, on (a) individual beneficiaries (children, parents, teachers, etc.); (Reference paragraphs Table I, 74-89) (b) partner organizations (local NGOs, community groups, schools, etc.); (Reference paragraphs 158-160, 161-168) and (c) government and policy structures in terms of system-wide change on education and child labor issues? (Reference paragraphs 159-160)

This page left intentionally blank.

Slide 3

Methodology

Visites/observations a 5 des 6 Communes

Discussions avec:

Responsables des associations d'implementation

Points focaux

Partenaires

Officials locaux et nationaux

Parents

Beneficiaires

Slide 4

Objectifs de Dima Adros

1. Services educatifs a 8 mil beneficiaires
infantes au dehor et dans ecoles
2. Renforcement institutionelle/ appui les
inititives politique
3. Sensibilization/mobilization
4. Recherche d'action/collect de donnes
5. Perrinization

Slide 5

1. Services éducatifs

- 6 communes désignés par INDH et MEN
- 70 animateurs formés en pédagogie NonF et employés par 16 ONGs= 4.000 bénéficiaires au dehors de l'école
- Soutien scolaire pour 4.000 en risque de désertion scolaire
- Accueil des enfants Marrakech

Slide 6

2. Renforcement institutionnelle/ appui les initiatives politique

- Meilleur environnement légal
- Collaboration avec stakeholders
- UPE Marrakech
- Renforcement de capacités des associations

Slide 7

3. Sensibilization/mobilization

- Developpement des plans d'actions a chaque commune
- Campagnes de media en appui de inscription des enfants et contra exploitation sexuel
- Mobilization des associations

Slide 8

4. Recherche et collect des donnees

- Execution de etude de line de base
- Chifres relevant a l'execution de Dima Adros

Slide 9

5. Perrenization

- Engagement des ministeres et agences relevants
- Fonds communataire de Soutien Socio-pedagogique (FCSS)
- Renforcement des O NGs/Associations

Slide 10

Resultats de l'evaluation

- 1 Services directes: tout est en ordre selon les plans
2. Politique nationale mis en marche
3. Sensibilization en bon etat aux niveaux locales. Mobilization des associations est encore faible au dela des services directes

Slide 11

Defis (generalization)

- lacunes de l'éducation formelle dans les communes rurales
au moins la moitié des écoles de non-fonctionnement
taux d'abandon est très élevé par rapport aux pays comparables

Slide 12

Defis-durabilité

- faiblesse des associations
- souvent de petites assemblées générales de moins de 10 personnes
- peu de capacités de développement
- manque des moyens pour générer des revenus de leur propre

Slide 13

Defis-impact

- faiblesse des compétences des animateurs en matière d'enseignement
- la mobilisation de la communauté
- contribution communautaire est limité
- besoin de plus de plaidoyer et la collaboration avec les agences comme Entreaide Nationale et OFPPT

Slide 14

Conclusions

- Dima Adros est la réalisation de tous les objectifs du project avec succès
- Mais la durabilité sera difficile face à l'éducation formelle limitée

Slide 15

Recommendations

la priorité devrait être donnée à la:

- généralisation
- perrenization
- approfondissement de l'impact des interventions
- élargir la collaboration et la qualité des programmes pour la préparation au travail ou la réinsertion

ANNEX G: TERMS OF REFERENCE

TERMS OF REFERENCE

for the Independent Midterm Evaluation of

Combating Exploitive Child Labor

Through Education in Morocco (Project *Dima-Adros*)

Cooperative Agreement Number:	IL-16568-07-75-K
Financing Agency:	U.S. Department of Labor
Type of Evaluation:	Independent Mid-term Evaluation
Field Work Dates:	February 16-March 5, 2009
Preparation Date of TOR:	January 2009
Total Project Funds from USDOL Based on Cooperative Agreement:	US \$3,000,000
Vendor for Evaluation Contract:	Macro International, Inc. Headquarters, 11785 Beltsville Drive Calverton, MD 20705 Tel: (301) 572-0200 Fax: (301) 572-0999

I. BACKGROUND AND JUSTIFICATION

The Office of Child Labor, Forced Labor, and Human Trafficking (OCFT) is an office within the Bureau of International Labor Affairs (ILAB) of the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL). OCFT activities include research on international child labor; administering and overseeing grant and contracts to organizations engaged in efforts to eliminate child labor; and raising awareness about child labor issues.

Since 1995, the U.S. Congress has appropriated over \$693 million to USDOL for efforts to combat exploitive child labor internationally. This funding has been used to support technical cooperation projects to combat exploitive child labor in more than 80 countries around the world. Technical cooperation projects funded by USDOL range from targeted action programs in specific sectors of work to more comprehensive programs that support national efforts to eliminate the worst forms of child labor as defined by ILO Convention 182. USDOL-funded child labor elimination projects seek to achieve five major goals:

1. Withdrawing or preventing children from involvement in exploitive child labor through the provision of direct educational services;
2. Strengthening policies on child labor and education, the capacity of national institutions to combat child labor, and formal and transitional education systems that encourage children engaged in or at-risk of engaging in exploitive labor to attend school;
3. Raising awareness of the importance of education for all children and mobilizing a wide array of actors to improve and expand education infrastructures;
4. Supporting research and the collection of reliable data on child labor; and
5. Ensuring the long-term sustainability of these efforts.

The approach of USDOL child labor elimination projects, to decrease the prevalence of exploitive child labor through increasing access to education, is intended to nurture the development, health, safety, and enhanced future employability of children engaged in or at-risk of entering exploitive labor. In the appropriations to USDOL for international child labor technical cooperation, the Congress has directed most of the funds towards two specific programs (with the exception of fiscal year 2007):

International Labour Organization's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC)

Since 1995, the U.S. Congress has earmarked some \$371 million to support ILO-IPEC, making the U.S. Government the leading donor to the program. USDOL-funded ILO-IPEC projects to combat child labor generally fall into one of several categories: comprehensive, national Timebound Programs (TBP) to eliminate the worst forms of child labor in a set time frame; Country Programs; sector-specific projects; data collection and research projects; and international awareness raising projects. In general, most projects include "direct action" components that are interventions to remove or prevent children from involvement in exploitive and hazardous work. One of the major strategies used by IPEC projects is to increase children's access to and participation in formal and non-formal education. Most IPEC projects also have a capacity-building component to assist in building a sustainable base for long-term elimination of exploitive child labor.

Child Labor Education Initiative

Since 2001, the U.S. Congress has provided some \$230 million to DOL to support the Child Labor Education Initiative (EI), which focuses on the elimination of the worst forms of child labor through the provision of education opportunities. These projects are being implemented by a wide range of international and non-governmental organizations as well as for-profit firms. The majority EI grants were awarded through a competitive bidding process.

EI projects are designed to ensure that children in areas with a high incidence of child labor are withdrawn and integrated into educational settings, and that they persist in their education once enrolled. In parallel, the program seeks to avert at-risk children from leaving school and entering child labor. The EI is based on the notion that the elimination of exploitive child labor depends,

to a large extent, on improving access to, quality of, and relevance of education. Without improving educational quality and relevance, children withdrawn/prevented from child labor may not have viable alternatives and could resort to other forms of hazardous work. EI projects may focus on providing educational services to children removed from specific sectors of work and/or a specific region(s) or support a national Timebound Program that aims to eliminate the worst forms of child labor in multiple sectors of work specific to a given country.

In addition to these two initiatives, in 2007, USDOL allocated \$60 million for child labor elimination projects not earmarked to ILO/IPEC or the EI program. As is the case with the EI, these funds were awarded through a competitive process. Finally, USDOL has supported \$2.5 million for awareness-raising and research activities not associated with the ILO/IPEC program or the EI.

Combating Exploitive Child Labor Through Education in Morocco

On September 30, 2007, Management Systems International (MSI) received a 3-year Cooperative Agreement worth \$3 million from USDOL to implement a child labor project in Morocco aimed at withdrawing and preventing children from exploitive child labor by expanding access to and improving the quality of basic education and supporting the five goals of the USDOL's Child Labor EI as outlined above. MSI was awarded the project through a competitive bid process. As stipulated in the cooperative agreement, the project targets 4,000 children for withdrawal, and 4,000 children for prevention from exploitive labor. Children are withdrawn and prevented from engaging in family and commercial agriculture, domestic labor, artisan workshops, mechanic and auto repair shops, street work, and commercial sexual exploitation. Geographically, the project targets the rural communes of Timezgadiwine, Sidi Issa Regragui, Aït Adel, Skoura Lhadra, Rbaâ, and Tassift, as well as the urban areas of Marrakech, Casablanca, Skhirat Temara, Mohamedia, and Rabat/Sale.

II. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF EVALUATION

The **scope** of the evaluation includes a review and assessment of all activities to date carried out under the USDOL cooperative agreement with MSI. The evaluation should assess the achievements of the project toward reaching its targets and objectives as outlined in the cooperative agreement and project document. The evaluation should consider all activities that have been implemented over the life of the project, addressing issues of project design, implementation, lessons learned, reliability and recommendations for future projects.

All child labor projects, which are funded through cooperative agreements, are subject to mid-term and final evaluations. The child labor project in Morocco began in September 2007 and is due for a mid-term evaluation in 2008/2009. The **goals** of the evaluation process are to:

1. Help individual organizations identify areas of good performance and areas where project implementation can be improved;
2. Assist OCFT to learn more about what is or is not working in terms of the overall conceptualization and design of EI projects within the broad OCFT technical cooperation program framework;
3. Assess the degree to which project objectives have been achieved.

In addition to these overarching goals, the following project-specific goals have been suggested by MSI staff:

- To get an external view of project achievements in the light of its initial objectives;
- To have a sense of how different stakeholders view the project and how it could better partner with them to achieve the desired results;
- To evaluate partners' and implementers' level of satisfaction in relation to project objectives, management and achievements; and
- To evaluate beneficiaries' degree of satisfaction with *Dima-Adros*' programs and activities.

The following project-specific questions have also been suggested by MSI staff:

- What is the level of motivation of *Dima-Adros*' local focal points (volunteer caseworkers)? What challenges do they face in doing work on the ground and how could the project help overcome them?
- How to improve the involvement of local authorities, local elected officials, and ministries' representatives to achieve project desired results? What are their viewd of the project?
- How were the participatory planning sessions organized by the project in each region viewed by different stakeholders, including parents and children?
- How do parents and beneficiary children view the project? How can the project improve the services being delivered without increasing costs?
- What do the formal education teachers in the intervention areas know about the project and how to they view it?
- How do non-formal education teachers view the way the project organizes teaching and class management? What challenges do they face in doing work on the ground and how could the project help to overcome them without increasing costs?
- How do local implementing organizations view their role in the project? How could the project partner with them to reinforce their capacity to withdraw children from child

labor? What challenges do they face in doing work on the ground and how could the project help them overcome these obstacles?

- How do beneficiaries of dormitory services evaluate the conditions in those shelters and whether the project contribution has in any way improved the way they are run? What do the parents think? What are their suggestions for improving the services without increasing costs?
- How does the staff at the UPE (*Unité de Protection de l'Enfance*) Marrakech view the partnership with *Dima-Adros*? Has it been beneficial? How could both sides improve their partnership?
- How does the staff of the BNLTE (Child Labor Unit) view the partnership with *Dima-Adros*? Has it been beneficial? How could both sides improve their partnership?
- How do other donors' projects on the ground relate to the project? How can the project better collaborate with them?
- How will the next communal elections in June impact work in the field? How are local politics affecting how different partners are behaving in relation to the project?
- How do institutional partners on the provincial, regional and national levels view the project's work? How can the project integrate better their concerns and objectives?
- How do the ministries of Labor and Justice appreciate the advocacy work carried out by *Dima-Adros*?

For the purpose of conducting this evaluation, Macro International, Inc. will provide a highly skilled, independent evaluator to conduct this evaluation to: a) determine if the project is achieving its stated objectives and explain why or why not, b) assess the impact of the project in terms of sustained improvements achieved, c) provide recommendations on how to improve project performance, and d) identify lessons learned to inform future USDOL projects. In addition, the contractor will provide recommendations to refine project-monitoring systems to ensure that project objectives and the measurement of results-based common indicators are being achieved across EI projects. The findings of the evaluation should assist USDOL and MSI to improve project oversight and to take corrective measures where necessary.

The contractor/evaluator will work with the staff of USDOL's OCFT and relevant MSI staff to evaluate the project in question. The OCFT management and project staff will use the evaluation results to inform the relevance of the approach and strategy that are being followed. The evaluation results should also be used by MSI, its partners, and subcontractors to enhance the project's effectiveness. Therefore, the evaluation should provide credible and reliable information in order to suggest how the project could improve its operations during the remaining period of performance and ensure the sustainability of project interventions.

Specific questions that the evaluation should seek to answer are below, according to six categories of issue:

Program Design Issues

1. How does the project's design fit into government programs developed by the Ministry of Labor and Ministry of Education to combat child labor and provide education for all?
2. Does the project design support the five child labor project goals? If not, which ones are not being supported and why not?
3. Has an effective and efficient monitoring and evaluation system been developed to measure performance indicators, including DOL common indicators? Can the system measure children's working status at regular intervals and during schools breaks and holidays?
4. Are the project purpose and outputs achievable?
5. Is the work plan realistic?
6. Is educational quality also being pursued as part of the project strategy? Can it be measured and what has been its impact, if any, on efforts to reduce or eliminate WFCL in Morocco?
7. What other major design issues should be brought to the attention of MSI, its subcontractors, and DOL?
8. Were the results of the project's baseline survey relevant to project design? What changes, if any, were made to the project design as a result of the baseline survey results?

Program Implementation Issues

1. Do project staff and subcontractors have a consistent understanding of DOL definitions of withdrawal and prevention of child beneficiaries from the Worst Forms of Child Labor (WFCL)?
2. Have project staff and subcontractor's been adequately trained in the use of the monitoring and evaluation system? What level of effort does the system place on staff and implementing organizations? Is the project able to verify the accuracy of the data it collects?
3. At mid-term, is the project on track in terms of meeting its stated purpose, outputs, and targets in the project document, including providing direct services to child beneficiaries, raising awareness, and improving child labor monitoring systems?
4. What other major implementation issues should be brought to the attention of MSI, subcontractors, and DOL?

Partnership and Coordination Issues

1. What have been the major issues and challenges of initiating partnerships in support of the project?
2. What have been the major challenges and opportunities, if any, of implementing coordination with the host country government, particularly with the Ministries of Labor and Education?
3. Assess the ability of MSI to identify subcontracts to supply services and provide support to its large number of geographically-diverse subcontractors.

Management Issues

1. What are the management strengths of this project?
2. What management areas could be improved?
3. How successful has the project been in leveraging non-project resources, such as community in kind contributions, local and national government assets, or international donor funds?
4. How successful has the project been in coordinating project activities with the US Government and international community's overall development agenda for Morocco?
5. How has management used MSI resources to complement government resources in support of efforts to eliminate child labor?

Sustainability

1. What steps have been taken so far to promote sustainability and continuation of education strategies for combating child labor beyond the life of the project?
2. Has the project's initial strategy for sustainability proven to be adequate and appropriate thus far?
3. Has the project developed an exit strategy? Will the project be prepared to handover responsibility for key activities to stakeholders or communities at the project's end?

Impact

1. What appears to be the project's impact to date, if any, on a) individual beneficiaries (children, parents, teachers, etc.); b) partner organizations (local NGOs, community groups, schools, etc.); and c) government and policy structures in terms of system-wide change on education and child labor issues?

III. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY AND TIMEFRAME

The following is the proposed evaluation methodology for the mid-term evaluation of the *Dima-Adros* project. In keeping with expectations of the USDOL Terms of Reference, the evaluation methodology will consist of the following activities and approaches:

The midterm evaluation will include:

1. Desk/document review;
2. Field visits to project sites of MSI and its subcontractors;
3. Focus group consultations with stakeholders,
4. Interviews with USDOL/OCFT, policy makers at the national/ local level, teachers, parents, and community leaders, beneficiaries, and US Embassy personnel;
5. Direct observation of project activities

1. Document Review

Pre-field visit preparation will include extensive documents review. This will include analysis of all documents pertinent to project design and implementation, including the Cooperative Agreement, Technical Progress and Status Reports, Project Logical frameworks and Monitoring Plans, Work plans, Correspondence related to Technical Progress Reports, Management Procedures and Guidelines, research or other reports undertaken (baseline studies, etc.), and project files (including school records) as appropriate.

2. Field visits

Accompanied by a local research consultant with skills in English, French, Arabic and Berber (Schlua), the evaluation team will meet with MSI *Dima-Adros* project personnel in Rabat and sites where most project activities are carried out. This will include: Rabat/Sale, Mohamedia, Skhirat, Casablanca and Marrakech, and time permitting Skoura Lhadra, Rbaâ, and Tassift. Shelters for child victims of sexual abuse and boarding centers for rural girls will be included in field visits.

A total of eight days will be devoted to site visits. During the visits the evaluator will observe the activities and outputs which the project has developed. At each site, focus groups will be conducted with children and parents, officers from local governments, NGOs, community leaders and teachers.

3. Focus groups

At least four focus groups will be conducted. Participants will be chosen randomly by the evaluator (with the support of *Dima-Adros* staff) from beneficiaries and stakeholders available at the time of site visits. These exercises will be done without the presence of the directors, teachers or other project personnel.

Focus Groups with Children

The objective of the focus group with the children is to identify the educational and productive activities which they are doing and their perception of them. The groups will comprise eight to twelve children benefiting from the project.

Focus Group with Parents

The objective of the focus group with parents is to identify the knowledge they have of the activities of the project and their perception of the education of their children and child labor. The groups will be formed of six to twelve parents.

4. Interviews with stakeholders

Details of the itinerary will be determined after consultations with *Dima-Adros* staff during the first week of field work in Morocco. Depending on availability, meetings with stakeholders will be one-on-one or in groups. Stakeholders comprise those who have an interest in the *Dima-Adros* project, including:

- USDOL/OCFT
- Direct and indirect beneficiaries,
- Community leaders and civil society representatives
- International donors, including UNICEF, MCC and IPEC;
- Local and national government officials, including members-of-parliament advocacy group;
- School teachers; school directors;
- *Entraide Nationale* and other subcontractor/sub-grantees;
- Relevant Government of Morocco (GOM) ministry officials, including the:
 - Ministry of Education and Youth;
 - Ministry of Labor, the Child Labor Unit (CLU);
 - Ministry of Craft Training (*Artisanat*);
 - National Initiative for Human Development (INDH);
 - Ministry of Social Development, the Family and Solidarity (MDSFS); and, the
 - Office of Vocational Training (OFPPT);
- US Embassy personnel.

5. Observations

The evaluation will occur during the academic calendar, permitting classroom observations of beneficiary students and teachers. Because so little time will be available for direct observation, a composite assessment instrument will be designed and administered by the evaluation team in approximately 10 classrooms.

6. Debriefing with project stakeholders

After field visits, a stakeholders' meeting will be conducted by the evaluator that brings together implementing partners, stakeholders and US Embassy personnel. These meetings will be used to present the major finding and emerging issues, as well as solicit recommendations and any additional, relevant information. The evaluator will lead the meeting by presenting the main findings and conclusions of the field-work to date, along with issues that require further clarification. A final, in-country meeting will involve MSI's *Dima-Adros* staff in order to discuss findings germane to project management, personnel considerations, and reactions to the evaluation findings. Afterwards, feedback from the project and DOL staff will be collected as written comments in the draft report.

Confidentiality

The evaluation mission will observe confidentiality conventions related to information and feedback elicited during individual and group interviews. To ensure maximum freedom of expression from interviewees, *Dima-Adros* staff, partners, stakeholders, and beneficiaries, implementing partner staff will not be present during interviews. However, implementing partner staff will accompany the evaluator to make introductions where necessary, to guide and advise the evaluation process and make respondents feel comfortable.

Timetable and Workplan

The tentative timetable is as follows.

Tasks	Dates
Desk Review of Project Materials and Interviews with OCFT staff	January/February
International Travel	February 15-16
Field Work	Feb 16-27
Brief Initial Conclusions to Project Stakeholders	March 3
International Travel	March 5
Draft Report	Due to Macro March 17 Due to USDOL March 20
Draft Released to Stakeholders	March 25
Comments Due from USDOL and Stakeholders	April 8
Revised Report	Due to Macro April 15 Due to USDOL April 20

IV. EXPECTED OUTPUTS/DELIVERABLES

The evaluator will submit to ILAB/OCFT an **evaluation report** that incorporates the results of the Tasks (outlined in Section III) in the format prescribed by ILAB/OCFT, which includes at minimum the following sections:

- a. Table of Contents
- b. Executive Summary, providing an overview of the evaluation and summary of main findings and recommendations
- c. List of Acronyms
- d. Evaluation Objectives
- e. Methodology of Evaluation
- f. Findings
- g. Lessons Learned and Good Practices
- h. Conclusions
- i. Recommendations
- j. Annexes, including list of interviews/meetings, site visits, documents reviewed, stakeholder workshop agenda and participants, summary TOR, etc.

The total length of the report should be a minimum of 30 pages, excluding annexes. The organizational format for the presentation of findings, lessons learned, conclusions, recommendations etc. is at the discretion of the evaluator.

The first draft of the report will be circulated to key stakeholders individually for their review. Comments from stakeholders will be consolidated and incorporated into the final reports as appropriate and the evaluator will provide a response to USDOL as to why any comments might not have been incorporated.

While the substantive content of the findings, conclusions, and recommendations of the report shall be determined by the evaluator, the report is subject to final approval by ILAB/OCFT in terms of whether or not the report meets the conditions of the TOR. **The first draft of the report is due to Macro after return from an evaluation mission on March 17, as indicated in the above timetable, and a final draft is due on April 15, after receipt of comments from ILAB/OCFT. All reports including drafts will be written in English.**

V. INPUTS

Macro International, Inc. will provide all logistical and administrative support for their staff and sub-contractors, including travel arrangements (e.g. plane and hotel reservations, purchasing plane tickets, providing per diem) and all materials needed to provide all deliverables. Macro International, Inc. will also be responsible for providing the management and technical oversight necessary to ensure consistency of methods and technical standards.