# Excited meson spectroscopy and radiative transitions from LQCD 

## Christopher Thomas, Jefferson Lab

thomasc@jlab.org

DAMTP, Cambridge, September 2010

With Jo Dudek, Robert Edwards, Mike Peardon, David Richards and the Hadron Spectrum Collaboration

## Outline

- Introduction and motivation
- Excited spectra from LQCD - method outline
- Results - isovector spectra
- Photocouplings - charmonium
- Summary and outlook


## Motivation

Renaissance in excited charmonium spectroscopy
BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c, ...
Upcoming experimental efforts (in charmonium and light meson sector)
GlueX (JLab), BESIII, PANDA, ...

## Motivation

Renaissance in excited charmonium spectroscopy
BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c, ...
Upcoming experimental efforts (in charmonium and light meson sector)
GlueX (JLab), BESIII, PANDA, ...

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\text { Exotics }\left(J^{P C}=1^{-+}, 2^{+-}, \ldots\right) ?-\text { can't just be a } q \bar{q} \text { pair } \\
\text { e.g. hybrids, multi-mesons }
\end{array}
$$

## Motivation

Renaissance in excited charmonium spectroscopy
BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c, ...
Upcoming experimental efforts (in charmonium and light meson sector)
GlueX (JLab), BESIII, PANDA, ...

## Exotics $\left(\mathrm{J}^{\mathrm{PC}}=1^{-+}, 2^{+-}, \ldots\right)$ ? $\quad$ can't just be a $q \bar{q}$ pair

## e.g. hybrids, multi-mesons

Two spin-half fermions: $\quad{ }^{2 S+1} L_{J}$
Parity:

$$
P=(-1)^{(L+1)}
$$

Charge Conj Sym: $C=(-1)^{(L+S)}$


$$
\mathrm{JPC}^{\mathrm{PC}}=0^{-+}, 0^{++}, 1^{--}, 1^{++}, 1^{+-}, 2^{--}, 2^{++}, 2^{-+}, \ldots
$$

## Motivation

Renaissance in excited charmonium spectroscopy

> BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c, ...

Upcoming experimental efforts (in charmonium and light meson sector)
GlueX (JLab), BESIII, PANDA, ...


## Exotics $\left(J^{\mathrm{PC}}=1^{-+}, 2^{+-}, \ldots\right) ? \quad$ can't just be a $q \bar{q}$ pair <br> e.g. hybrids, multi-mesons

Photoproduction at GlueX (JLab 12 GeV upgrade)

## Motivation

Renaissance in excited charmonium spectroscopy

> BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c, ...

Upcoming experimental efforts (in charmonium and light meson sector)
GlueX (JLab), BESIII, PANDA, ...


## Exotics $\left(\mathrm{J}^{\mathrm{PC}}=1^{-+}, 2^{+-}, \ldots\right)$ ? $\quad$ can't just be a $q \bar{q}$ pair e.g. hybrids, multi-mesons <br> Photoproduction at GlueX (JLab 12 GeV upgrade)

Use Lattice QCD to extract excited spectrum...
... and photocouplings (tested in charmonium)

## QCD on a Lattice

Discretise on a grid (spacing = a) - regulator


Finite volume $\rightarrow$ finite no. of d.o.f.

## QCD on a Lattice

Discretise on a grid (spacing = a) - regulator


Finite volume $\rightarrow$ finite no. of d.o.f.
Quarks fields on lattice sites $\quad \psi(x) \rightarrow \psi_{x}$
Gauge fields on links $A_{\mu}(x) \rightarrow U_{x, \mu}=e^{-a A_{x, \mu}}$

## QCD on a Lattice

Discretise on a grid (spacing = a) - regulator


Finite volume $\rightarrow$ finite no. of d.o.f.

Gauge fields on links $\int A_{\mu}(x) \rightarrow U_{x, \mu}=e^{-a A_{x, \mu}}$

Path integral formulation
$\int \mathcal{D} \psi \mathcal{D} \bar{\psi} \mathcal{D} U f(\psi, \bar{\psi}, U) e^{i S[\psi, \bar{\psi}, U]}$

## QCD on a Lattice

Discretise on a grid (spacing = a) - regulator


Finite volume $\rightarrow$ finite no. of d.o.f.

Quarks fields on lattice sites

$$
\psi(x) \rightarrow \psi_{x}
$$

Gauge fields on links $A_{\mu}(x) \rightarrow U_{x, \mu}=e^{-a A_{x, \mu}}$

Path integral formulation

Euclidean time: $\mathrm{t} \rightarrow \mathrm{i} \mathrm{t}$

$$
\int \mathcal{D} \psi \mathcal{D} \bar{\psi} \mathcal{D} U f(\psi, \bar{\psi}, U) e^{i S[\psi, \bar{\psi}, U]}
$$

$$
\int \mathcal{D} \psi \mathcal{D} \bar{\psi} \mathcal{D} U f(\psi, \bar{\psi}, U) e^{-\tilde{S}[\psi, \bar{\psi}, U]}
$$

Do fermion integral analytically then use importance sampling Monte Carlo

## Spectroscopy on the lattice

Calculate energies and matrix elements ("overlaps", Z's) from correlation functions of meson interpolating fields

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

## Spectroscopy on the lattice

Calculate energies and matrix elements ("overlaps", Z's) from correlation functions of meson interpolating fields

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

$$
O(t)=\sum_{\vec{x}} e^{i \vec{p} \cdot \vec{x}} \bar{\psi}(x) \Gamma_{i} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{j} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{k} \ldots \psi(x) \quad(\mathrm{p}=0)
$$

More about operators later...
'Distillation' technology for constructing on lattice PR D80 054506 (2009)

## Spectroscopy on the lattice

Calculate energies and matrix elements ("overlaps", Z's) from correlation functions of meson interpolating fields

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

$$
O(t)=\sum_{\vec{x}} e^{i \vec{p} \cdot \vec{x}} \bar{\psi}(x) \Gamma_{i} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{j} \overleftrightarrow{D}_{k} \ldots \psi(x) \quad(\mathrm{p}=0)
$$

More about operators later...
'Distillation' technology for constructing on lattice PR D80 054506 (2009)

$$
Z_{i}^{(n)} \equiv<0\left|O_{i}\right| n>
$$

$$
C_{i j}(t)=\sum_{n} \frac{e^{-E_{n} t}}{2 E_{n}}<0\left|O_{i}(0)\right| n><n\left|O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

## Variational Method

Large basis of operators $\rightarrow$ matrix of correlators

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

Generalised eigenvector problem:

$$
C_{i j}(t) v_{j}^{(n)}=\lambda^{(n)}(t) C_{i j}\left(t_{0}\right) v_{j}^{(n)}
$$

## Variational Method

Large basis of operators $\rightarrow$ matrix of correlators

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

Generalised eigenvector problem:

$$
C_{i j}(t) v_{j}^{(n)}=\lambda^{(n)}(t) C_{i j}\left(t_{0}\right) v_{j}^{(n)}
$$

Eigenvalues $\rightarrow$ energies

$$
\lambda^{(n)}(t) \rightarrow e^{-E_{n}\left(t-t_{0}\right)} \quad\left(t \gg t_{0}\right)
$$

## Variational Method

Large basis of operators $\rightarrow$ matrix of correlators

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

Generalised eigenvector problem:

$$
C_{i j}(t) v_{j}^{(n)}=\lambda^{(n)}(t) C_{i j}\left(t_{0}\right) v_{j}^{(n)}
$$

Eigenvalues $\rightarrow$ energies

$$
\lambda^{(n)}(t) \rightarrow e^{-E_{n}\left(t-t_{0}\right)} \quad\left(t \gg t_{0}\right)
$$

Eigenvectors $\rightarrow$ optimal linear combination of operators to overlap on to a state

$$
\Omega^{(n)} \sim \sum_{i} v_{i}^{(n)} O_{i}
$$

$Z^{(n)}$ related to eigenvectors

$$
Z_{i}^{(n)} \equiv<0\left|O_{i}\right| n>
$$

## Variational Method

Large basis of operators $\rightarrow$ matrix of correlators

$$
C_{i j}(t)=<0\left|O_{i}(t) O_{j}(0)\right| 0>
$$

Generalised eigenvector problem:

$$
C_{i j}(t) v_{j}^{(n)}=\lambda^{(n)}(t) C_{i j}\left(t_{0}\right) v_{j}^{(n)}
$$

Eigenvalues $\rightarrow$ energies

$$
\lambda^{(n)}(t) \rightarrow e^{-E_{n}\left(t-t_{0}\right)} \quad\left(t \gg t_{0}\right)
$$

Eigenvectors $\rightarrow$ optimal linear combination of operators to overlap on to a state

$$
\Omega^{(n)} \sim \sum_{i} v_{i}^{(n)} O_{i}
$$

$Z^{(n)}$ related to eigenvectors

$$
Z_{i}^{(n)} \equiv<0\left|O_{i}\right| n>
$$

Var. method uses orthog of eigenvectors; don't just rely on separating energies

## Spin on the lattice

On a lattice, 3D rotation group is broken to Octahedral Group

In continuum:
Infinite number of irreps: $\mathrm{J}=0,1,2,3,4, \ldots$

## Spin on the lattice

On a lattice, 3D rotation group is broken to Octahedral Group

## In continuum:

Infinite number of irreps: $\mathrm{J}=0,1,2,3,4, \ldots$

On lattice:
Finite number of irreps: $A_{1}, A_{2}, T_{1}, T_{2}, E \quad$ (and others for half-integer spin)

| Irrep | $\mathrm{A}_{1}$ | $\mathrm{~A}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{~T}_{1}$ | $\mathrm{~T}_{2}$ | E |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\operatorname{Dim}$ | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 2 |


| Cont. Spin | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | $\ldots$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Irrep(s) | $A_{1}$ | $T_{1}$ | $T_{2}+E$ | $T_{1}+T_{2}+A_{2}$ | $A_{1}+T_{1}+T_{2}+E$ | $\ldots$ |

## Spin and operator construction

Construct operators which only overlap on to one spin in the continuum limit

$$
\begin{array}{|ccc}
\Gamma \times \mathrm{D} \times \mathrm{D} \times \ldots & \text { (up to } 3 \text { derivs) } \quad \text { Couple using SU( } \\
\langle\mathrm{O}| O^{J, M}\left|J^{\prime}, M^{\prime}\right\rangle=Z^{[J]} \delta_{J, J^{\prime}} \delta_{M, M^{\prime}} \quad \text { definite JPC }
\end{array}
$$

Couple using SU(2) Clebsch Gordans

## Spin and operator construction

Construct operators which only overlap on to one spin in the continuum limit

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
\hline \Gamma \times \mathrm{D} \times \mathrm{D} \times \ldots & \text { (up to } 3 \text { derivs) } & \text { Couple using SU(: } \\
\langle\mathrm{O}| \mathcal{O}^{J, M}\left|J^{\prime}, M^{\prime}\right\rangle=Z^{[J]} \delta_{J, J^{\prime}} \delta_{M, M^{\prime}} \text { definite JPC }
\end{array}
$$

Couple using SU(2) Clebsch Gordans
'Subduce' operators into lattice irreps ( $\mathrm{J} \rightarrow \Lambda$ ):

$$
\mathcal{O}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{[J]}=\sum_{M} \mathcal{S}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{J, M} \mathcal{O}^{J, M}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \langle 0| \mathcal{O}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{[J]}\left|J^{\prime}, M\right\rangle=\mathcal{S}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{J, M} Z^{[J]} \delta_{J, J^{\prime}} \\
& \text { e.g. } \quad \mathcal{O}^{[2]} \rightarrow T_{2} \text { and } \mathcal{O}^{[2]} \rightarrow E
\end{aligned}
$$

Up to 26 ops in $\Lambda^{\mathrm{PC}}$ channel

Given continuum op $\rightarrow$ same Z in each $\Lambda$ (ignoring lattice mixing)

## Spin and operator construction

Construct operators which only overlap on to one spin in the continuum limit

## $\Gamma \times \mathrm{D} \times \mathrm{D} \times \ldots$ (up to 3 derivs) Couple using SU(2) Clebsch Gordans

$$
\langle 0| \mathcal{O}^{J, M}\left|J^{\prime}, M^{\prime}\right\rangle=Z^{[J]} \delta_{J, J^{\prime}} \delta_{M, M^{\prime}}
$$

definite JPC
'Subduce' operators into lattice irreps $(\mathrm{J} \rightarrow \Lambda$ ):

$$
\mathcal{O}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{[J]}=\sum_{M} \mathcal{S}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{J, M} \mathcal{O}^{J, M}
$$

$$
\langle\mathrm{O}| \mathcal{O}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{[J]}\left|J^{\prime}, M\right\rangle=\mathcal{S}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{J, M} Z^{[J]} \delta_{J, J^{\prime}}
$$

e.g. $\quad \mathcal{O}^{[2]} \rightarrow T_{2} \quad$ and $\mathcal{O}^{[2]} \rightarrow E$

Up to 26 ops in $\Lambda^{\mathrm{PC}}$ channel

Given continuum op $\rightarrow$ same Z in each $\Lambda$ (ignoring lattice mixing)
(1) Look for 'large' overlaps with $\mathcal{O}_{\Lambda, \lambda}^{[J]}$
(2) Compare Z's of same cont. op. subduced to different irreps

## Spin and operator construction

Construct operators which only overlap on to one spin in the continuum limit

(2) Compare Z's of same cont. op. subauced to different irreps

## Calculation details

- Dynamical calculation. Clover fermions
- Anisotropic $\left(a_{s} / a_{t}=3.5\right), a_{s} \sim 0.12 \mathrm{fm}, a_{t}^{-1} \sim 5.6 \mathrm{GeV}$
- Two volumes: $16^{3}\left(\mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{s}} \approx 2.0 \mathrm{fm}\right)$ and $20^{3}\left(\mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{s}} \approx 2.4 \mathrm{fm}\right)$


## Calculation details

- Dynamical calculation. Clover fermions
- Anisotropic $\left(a_{s} / a_{t}=3.5\right), a_{s} \sim 0.12 \mathrm{fm}, a_{t}{ }^{-1} \sim 5.6 \mathrm{GeV}$
- Two volumes: $16^{3}\left(\mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{s}} \approx 2.0 \mathrm{fm}\right)$ and $20^{3}\left(\mathrm{~L}_{\mathrm{s}} \approx 2.4 \mathrm{fm}\right)$

Lattice details in: PR D78 054501, PR D79 034502

- Only connected diagrams - Isovectors (I=1) and kaons
- As an example: three degenerate 'light' quarks ( $\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{f}}=3, \mathrm{M}_{\pi} \approx 700 \mathrm{MeV}$ )
- Also $\left(\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{f}}=2+1\right) \mathrm{M}_{\pi} \approx 520,440,400 \mathrm{MeV}$
$\sim 500$ cfgs $x 9$ t-sources


0.6



## $Z$ values






This operator $\sim\left[D_{i}, D_{j}\right]$


This operator $\sim\left[D_{i}, D_{j}\right]$





## $Z$ values - spin 4

$$
\langle 0| o_{\left.\lambda,|,|]^{\prime}, M\right\rangle}^{[\mid]}=s_{\lambda, \lambda}^{J, M} Z^{[]]_{J, J^{\prime}}}
$$

Given continuum op $\rightarrow$ same $Z$ for each subduced irrep










## Lower pion masses



## Lower pion masses





## Exotics summary



## Exotics summary



## Multi-particle states?



## Multi-particle states?



## Charmonium

"Hydrogen atom" of meson spectroscopy

Potential models, effective field theories, QCD sum rules, ...

New and improved measurements at BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c

## Charmonium

"Hydrogen atom" of meson spectroscopy

Potential models, effective field theories, QCD sum rules, ...

New and improved measurements at BABAR, Belle, BES, CLEO-c

New resonances not easily described by quark model

Theoretical speculation: hybrids, multiquark/molecular mesons, ...

As yet, no exotic J JPC observed $\left(1^{-+}, 0^{+-}, 2^{+-}\right)$

## Charmonium radiative transitions



Below DD threshold radiative transitions have significant BRs

## Charmonium radiative transitions



Below DD threshold radiative transitions have significant BRs

Meson - Photon coupling


## Charmonium radiative transitions



Below DD threshold radiative transitions have significant BRs

Meson - Photon coupling


## Photocouplings

Charmonium (quenched) - testing method

$$
C_{i j}\left(t_{f}, t, t_{i}\right)=<0\left|O_{i}\left(t_{f}\right) \bar{\psi}(t) \gamma^{\mu} \psi(t) O_{j}\left(t_{i}\right)\right| 0>
$$



## Photocouplings

Charmonium (quenched) - testing method

$$
C_{i j}\left(t_{f}, t, t_{i}\right)=<0\left|O_{i}\left(t_{f}\right) \bar{\psi}(t) \gamma^{\mu} \psi(t) O_{j}\left(t_{i}\right)\right| 0>
$$

Conventional vector - pseudoscalar transition


## Photocouplings



Much larger than other $1^{--} \rightarrow 0^{-+} \mathrm{M}_{1}$ transitions
$\Gamma\left(J / \psi \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma\right) \sim 2 \mathrm{keV}$

Spectrum analysis
suggests a vector hybrid (spin-singlet)
c.f. flux tube model $30-60 \mathrm{keV}$

## Photocouplings



Much larger than other $1^{--} \rightarrow 0^{-+} \mathrm{M}_{1}$ transitions
$\Gamma\left(J / \psi \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma\right) \sim 2 \mathrm{keV}$

Spectrum analysis
suggests a vector hybrid (spin-singlet)
c.f. flux tube model $30-60 \mathrm{keV}$

- Usually $\mathrm{M}_{1} \rightarrow$ spin flip (e.g. $\left.{ }^{3} \mathrm{~S}_{1} \rightarrow{ }^{1} \mathrm{~S}_{0}\right) \rightarrow 1 / \mathrm{m}_{\mathrm{c}}$ suppression
- Spin-singlet hybrid $\rightarrow$ extra gluonic degrees of freedom
$\rightarrow \mathrm{M}_{1}$ transition without spin flip $\rightarrow$ not suppressed


## Exotic meson photocoupling



## Exotic meson photocoupling


Same scale as many measured conventional charmonium transitions
BUT very large for an $\mathrm{M}_{1}$ transition
$\Gamma\left(J / \psi \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma\right) \sim 2 \mathrm{keV}$

Suggests a spin-triplet hybrid

## Exotic meson photocoupling



Same scale as many measured conventional charmonium transitions

BUT very large for an $\mathrm{M}_{1}$ transition
$\Gamma\left(J / \psi \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma\right) \sim 2 \mathrm{keV}$

Suggests a spin-triplet hybrid

- Usually $\mathrm{M}_{1} \rightarrow$ spin flip (e.g. ${ }^{3} \mathrm{~S}_{1} \rightarrow{ }^{1} \mathrm{~S}_{0}$ ) $\rightarrow 1 / \mathrm{m}_{\mathrm{c}}$ suppression
- Spin-triplet hybrid $\rightarrow$ extra gluonic degrees of freedom


## Exotic meson photocoupling



Same scale as many measured conventional charmonium transitions

BUT very large for an $M_{1}$ transition
$\Gamma\left(J / \psi \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma\right) \sim 2 \mathrm{keV}$

Suggests a spin-triplet hybrid

- Usually $\mathrm{M}_{1} \rightarrow$ spin flip (e.g. ${ }^{3} \mathrm{~S}_{1} \rightarrow{ }^{1} \mathrm{~S}_{0}$ ) $\rightarrow 1 / \mathrm{m}_{\mathrm{c}}$ suppression
- Spin-triplet hybrid $\rightarrow$ extra gluonic degrees of freedom
$\rightarrow \mathrm{M}_{1}$ transition without spin flip $\rightarrow$ not suppressed


## More charmonium results

Tensor - Vector transitions $\quad \chi_{c 2}, \chi_{c 2}^{\prime}, \chi_{c 2}^{\prime \prime} \rightarrow J / \psi \gamma$
Identify $1^{3} P_{2}, 1^{3} F_{2}, 2^{3} P_{2}$ tensors from hierarchy of multipoles $E_{1}, M_{2}, E_{3}$

Vector - Psuedoscalar $J / \psi, \psi^{\prime}, \psi^{\prime \prime} \rightarrow \eta_{c} \gamma$
Scalar - Vector $\quad \chi_{c 0} \rightarrow J / \psi \gamma \quad \psi^{\prime}, \psi^{\prime \prime} \rightarrow \chi_{c 0} \gamma$
Axial - Vector $\quad \chi_{c 1}, \chi_{c 1}^{\prime} \rightarrow J / \psi \gamma$

## Summary and Outlook

## Summary

- Our first results on light mesons - technology and method work
- Spin identification is possible using operator overlaps
- First spin 4 meson extracted and confidently identified on lattice
- Exotics (and non-exotic hybrids)
- Isovectors and kaons


## Summary and Outlook

## Summary

- Our first results on light mesons - technology and method work
- Spin identification is possible using operator overlaps
- First spin 4 meson extracted and confidently identified on lattice
- Exotics (and non-exotic hybrids)
- Isovectors and kaons

Outlook - ongoing work

- Multi-meson operators - resonance physics
- Disconnected diagrams - isoscalars and multi-mesons
- Baryons
- Photocouplings
- Lighter pion masses and larger volumes


## Extra Slides

## Kaons

Lower the light quark mass $\left(\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{f}}=2+1\right)-\mathrm{SU}(3)$ sym breaking


## Kaons

Lower the light quark mass $\left(\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{f}}=2+1\right)-\mathrm{SU}(3)$ sym breaking

| $M_{\pi} / \mathrm{MeV}$ | 700 | 520 | 440 | 400 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $M_{\mathrm{K}} / \mathrm{M}_{\pi}$ | 1 | 1.2 | 1.3 | 1.4 |

c.f. physical
$M_{K} / M_{\pi}=3.5$

No longer is C-parity a good quantum number for kaons (or a gen. of C-parity)

Combine $\mathrm{J}^{\mathrm{P}+}$ and $\mathrm{J}^{\mathrm{P} \text { - operators }}$

Physically, axial kaons [ $\left.\mathrm{K}_{1}(1270), \mathrm{K}_{1}(1400)\right]$ are a mixture Suggested mixing angle $\approx 45^{\circ}$ (combination of exp and models)

But...

## Kaons



## Kaons - Operator Overlaps

$16^{3}$
$M_{\pi} \approx 520 \mathrm{MeV}$
$M_{\mathrm{K}} / \mathrm{M}_{\pi} \approx 1.2$
$\left(\begin{array}{l}16^{3} \\ M_{\pi} \approx 400 \mathrm{MeV} \\ M_{K} / M_{\pi} \approx 1.4\end{array}\right.$


## Kaons - Operator Overlaps



## Kaons - Operator Overlaps



## Kaons - spectrum



## Kaons - Various pion masses



## Kaons - Various pion masses

$$
\begin{array}{ccc|}
\hline K^{\star}\left(1^{-}\right)
\end{array}
$$

