



## **SUMMARY MEETING REPORT**

### **MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE Seattle, Washington · May 22-24, 2012**

The Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee (MAFAC or 'the Committee') met May 22-24, 2012, at the Sheraton Seattle Hotel in Seattle, WA. Keith Rizzardi, Chair, presided at this first in-person meeting in calendar year 2012.

This meeting covered three days of work, covering a range of topic related to coastal and living marine resources (agenda attached). At the outset, seven new members were welcomed to their first Committee meeting. These included:

- Julie Bonney (Kodiak, Alaska)
- Richen (Dick) M. Brame (Wilmington, North Carolina)
- Michele Longo Eder (Newport, Oregon)
- Elizabeth (Liz) Hamilton (Oregon City, Oregon)
- Micah McCarty (Neah Bay, Washington)
- Robert Rheault (Wakefield, Rhode Island)
- Pamela Yochem (San Diego, California)

On Day 1, MAFAC received status updates on the 2012 legislative outlook and NMFS' 2013 budget outlook, major issues handled by the Northwest Fisheries Science Center and Northwest Regional Office, and national and Washington State aquaculture initiatives.

The Committee also received informational briefings on fisheries certification and sustainability; working waterfronts and the National Working Waterfront Network; and the announcement of the notice of proposed rulemaking on National Standard 1 which deals with preventing overfishing.

On the morning of Day 2, MAFAC received briefings on proposed revisions to *Vision 2020*, the committee's report of the future vision of fisheries; NOAA's ongoing process to evaluate 82 species of coral from the Caribbean and Pacific for listing under the Endangered Species Act (ESA); issues related to endangered species jeopardy determinations and their impact on fisheries; and the GAO study on the potential merger of NMFS into the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

During the afternoon of Day 2 and early morning of Day 3, five MAFAC subcommittees and one working group met to further consider the information presented and to develop recommendations and actions. The subcommittees that met were Strategic Planning, Budget & Program Management; Commerce; Ecosystems; Protected Resources; Recreational Fisheries; and the Vision 2020 Ad Hoc Working Group.

On Day 3, Subcommittee reports were presented to the full Committee for consideration and discussion. The meeting was open to the public in accordance with the provisions of Public Law 92-463, and a public comment period was offered. The meeting adjourned at 3:43 p.m. on May 24, 2012.

The remainder of the report is organized into three sections:

- A. Identification of all meeting participants
- B. Summary of Findings and Recommendations
- C. Meeting Agenda

Numbers in parentheses below correspond to page numbers of the daily transcript, available online at: [http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafacs/meetings/2012\\_05/index.html](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafacs/meetings/2012_05/index.html).

## **A. MEETING PARTICIPANTS**

### **Committee members present:**

Mark Holliday, Designated Federal Officer	Michele Longo Eder
Alan Risenhoover, Acting Deputy Assistant Administrator for Fisheries ( <i>ex officio</i> member)	Edwin Ebisui
	Martin Fisher
Keith Rizzardi, Committee Chair	Randy Fisher ( <i>ex officio</i> member)
Terry Alexander	Ken Franke
Julie Bonney	Elizabeth Hamilton
Dick Brame	Micah McCarty
Randy Cates	Julie Morris
Anthony Chatwin	George Nardi
Paul Clampitt	Henry Sesepasara
Patricia Doerr	David Wallace
Phillip Dyskow	Pamela Yochem

### **Staff of the National Marine Fisheries Service, including those providing presentations to MAFAC:**

Linda Chaves, Senior Advisor, Seafood Industry Issues, NMFS  
Russell Dunn, NMFS National Policy Advisor for Recreational Fisheries  
Laura Hoberecht, Regional Aquaculture Coordinator, NMFS  
Debra Lambert, Fishery Policy Analyst, NMFS Office of Sustainable Fisheries  
Heidi Lovett, Policy Analyst, NMFS Office of Policy  
Jim McCallum, Policy Analyst, NMFS Office of Policy  
Kate Naughten, Acting Director, NMFS Office of Communications  
Michael Rubino, Director, NMFS Office of Aquaculture  
Lance Smith, Protected Resources Branch Chief, NMFS Pacific Island Regional Office (via phone)  
John Stein, Director, NMFS Northwest Fisheries Science Center  
Will Stelle, Regional Administrator, NMFS Northwest Regional Office  
Bob Williams, NOAA contractor; Recreational Fisheries Specialist

### **Others in the audience for all or a portion of the meeting were:**

Manny Duenas, Chair, Council Coordinating Committee  
Bill Dewey, Public Affairs Manager, Taylor Shellfish Company, Inc.  
Nicole Faghin, Coastal Management Specialist, Washington State Sea Grant  
Pete Granger, Program Lead, Marine Advisory Services, Washington State Sea Grant  
Jennifer Hagen, Quileute Indian Tribe  
Steve Joner, Chief Biologist, Makah Fisheries Management, Makah Tribe

## **B. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **1. NMFS Budget** (*Transcript Day 1, p. 215; Transcript Day 3, p. 25*)

MAFAC received a presentation about the FY 2013 NMFS budget request and discussed the type of input most beneficial for helping NMFS set budget priorities into the future, for FY 2015 and beyond. Using the 11 broad activity areas that MAFAC has been monitoring over time, a table was developed to document and compare the percentage of the total NMFS budget that goes to each of these areas currently (FY 2012) and in the proposed 2013 budget. It also included the FY 2013 Senate and House ‘Marks’ (the current appropriations bills being considered).

MAFAC members agreed to provide what they consider to be appropriate percentages for each activity area for three different potential future scenarios – level funding, a 20 percent decrease in funding, or a 10 percent increase in funding. This input will be submitted to the Strategic Planning Subcommittee by the end of June. The Subcommittee will tabulate and summarize the input, send it back to all MAFAC members for comments, and develop a final document that articulates MAFAC budget priorities to be shared with leadership.

The 11 activity areas are MAFAC follows are:

- protected resources
- fisheries management
- bycatch reduction
- catch shares
- data collection, research, and surveys
- enforcement
- habitat conservation and restoration
- aquaculture development
- demand, quality, and supply of U.S. seafood
- other activities

### **2. Aquaculture** (*Transcript Day 1, p. 238; Transcript Day 3, p. 164*)

MAFAC received an update about national aquaculture efforts, learned about the Washington State Initiative, and many members participated in a day-long field trip to aquaculture facilities in southern Puget Sound in the Shelton area. MAFAC discussed the seafood demands of a growing population and trends of increasing per capita consumption. To meet these needs, members believe significant increases in cultured seafood production will be required.

Aquaculture can provide jobs and economic development in rural coastal communities, help preserve working waterfronts, and reinvigorate underutilized processing and distribution infrastructure. Recent investments in research have helped develop sustainable culture practices and MAFAC would like to ensure that the benefits of these investments are reaped domestically.

MAFAC recommends that “NOAA substantially increase the resources directed towards programs designed to increase sustainable domestic aquaculture production,” noting that currently NOAA spends less than one-percent of its budget on aquaculture programs.

### **3. National Standard 1** (*Transcript Day 1, p. 238; Transcript Day 3, p. 245*)

MAFAC received a presentation about the history of NS1, how it is currently implemented, and discussed the eleven topics that have been suggested for potential changes. The Agency published an advance notice of potential rulemaking in the Federal Register notice on May 3, 2012. MAFAC endorsed the NMFS proposal to consider potential rulemaking for NS1 to re-examine the current implementation of the 11 issues described. However, MAFAC recommends that three issues be

given the highest priority: ACLs and optimum yield; mixed stock fisheries and optimum yield; and data poor stocks.

MAFAC finalized a recommendation with its rationale for prioritizing these three issues and this will be submitted to NMFS during the ANPR public comment period.

#### **4. Seafood Certification** (*Transcript Day 1, p. 320; Transcript Day 3, p. 120*)

MAFAC discussed recent seafood certification issues, noting the number and wide variety of certification programs; the disparity in criteria and the confusion it can cause for customers; some are limited to wild harvest or certain farmed species and is not available for all producers; and costs can be prohibitive to small fishermen or farming operations.

MAFAC decided to develop a framework for a NOAA certification mark/or other acknowledgment that certifies sustainability and origin for use on or with domestic fishery products whether commercially wild harvested or produced through sustainable aquaculture meeting U.S. national standards and regulations. If established, the goal would be for NOAA to promote and communicate its effort to the public and industry through FishWatch or other suitable communication tools.

Staff will assist the Commerce Subcommittee by providing background materials for discussion, identifying additional NMFS staff to engage on the topic, and to help form a joint MAFAC-NMFS work group.

#### **5. Working Waterfronts** (*Transcript Day 1, p. 377; Transcript Day 3, p. 117*)

MAFAC received an introductory briefing on working waterfront issues, learned about the past national symposia and the National Working Waterfront Network, and was informed about the next national symposium scheduled for March 2013 in Tacoma, WA. MAFAC decided to invite experts to future meetings that have expertise on the range of issues associated with this topic, so that the committee can determine how MAFAC can best provide future advice on this important topic.

#### **6. Vision document** (*Transcript Day 2, p. 6*)

MAFAC agreed to continue work on revisions of its *Vision2020* document to incorporate new issues, document recent trends, and revise its recommendations as needed. The Committee agreed to work on this project over the summer, established a timeline for completing the revisions, and requested assistance from an internal NOAA technical editor. The goal is to have a revised *Vision2020* document ready as a communication tool to inform new members of Congress, other elected leaders and staff during the political transition at the end of 2012.

#### **7. Coral Status Review Report and Coral Management Report** (*Transcript Day 2, p. 101; Transcript Day 3, p. 196*)

MAFAC received a briefing about NOAA's ongoing process to evaluate 82 species of coral from the Caribbean and Pacific for listing under the Endangered Species Act (ESA). MAFAC developed comments to submit during the public comment period for both the scientific Status Review Report and draft Management Report.

The comment letter on the Status Review Report will include these points:

- The threat ranking does not appear to be based on clear criteria.
- The definition of the foreseeable future (2100) needs further justification.

- Focus the status review only on those coral species that we are certain occur in US EEZ waters.
- Ensure that research on coral adaptation to ocean warming and acidification changes is included in the status review.
- Use the warranted but precluded category for coral species that occur primarily in foreign waters.

The comment letter on the Coral Management Report will make these points:

- Utilize multi-species management approaches when possible.
- Encourage an analysis of the effectiveness of current regulations and management actions in actually protecting coral.
- Whether there is any protective benefit to invoking the ESA regulatory process could be one criterion for listing decisions for coral species.

**8. ESA and MMPA** (*Transcript Day 2, p. 63; Transcript Day 3, p. 181*)

MAFAC discussed the recent meeting of the Council Coordinating Committee (CCC), its discussion of Endangered Species Act (ESA) jeopardy determinations in fisheries management, and its recommendation or “outcome statement” forwarded to NMFS. MAFAC appreciated the opportunity to work with the CCC, Councils, and NMFS on an evaluation of jeopardy issues. However before the Committee engages, it requested background information and a future briefing devoted to the topic. It proposed a webinar sometime between June 15 and July 15, 2012, to present different case studies. In listening to the case studies, the subcommittee will be looking for best practices and considering three potential areas for improvements: laws, regulations, and guidance that prescribe how jeopardy is determined; the science and analysis used in the biological opinion; and how the process of the biological opinion and jeopardy determination were integrated into the fishery management decision process (transparency). Based on these case studies, the Subcommittee will attempt to agree on a set of issues that could benefit from MAFAC’s advice.

**9. GAO feasibility study on moving NMFS into US FWS** (*Transcript Day 2, p. 157; Transcript Day 3, p. 7*)

The Senate Subcommittee on Federal Financial Management, Government Information, Federal Services, and International Security has asked GAO to review the feasibility of moving the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) into the Fish and Wildlife Service (FWS). The preliminary research objectives are:

1. How would federal fisheries and protected species management potentially be affected by moving NMFS into FWS?
2. What factors should be considered if Congress were to move NMFS into FWS and what management practices could facilitate such a move?

MAFAC deliberated over the terms of reference for the GAO study on the feasibility of such a move, and found that such a move would not improve, and may indeed hinder, NMFS ability to fulfill its mission of providing stewardship of the nation’s living marine resources and their habitat. NOAA is the nation’s leading civilian ocean agency and NOAA’s infrastructure is essential to NMFS’ mission, and in MAFAC’s view, moving NMFS into the Fish and Wildlife Service is not cost effective. MAFAC recommended that the Secretary of Commerce forward MAFAC’s findings opposing the move to the GAO as input to their study.

**10. National Ocean Policy (NOP) update** (*Transcript Day 2, p. 212; Transcript Day 3, p. 42*)

MAFAC discussed prior comments on the development of the NOP and its implementation documents, the most recent of which was in February 2012.. Although MAFAC members believe their comments did not generally influence the final NOP documents, they noted that the Fishery Management Councils, which originally did not have an official seat on the Regional Planning Bodies (RPBs), now will have a seat on the RPBs.

A Motion was approved at the full Committee discussion: “Transmit past MAFAC comments to the identified NOAA staff engaged in NOP activities (Regional Representatives, Deputies’ Council). Additionally, transmit these comments to the GCC. This is part of a goal to establish a working relationship for future engagement.”

**11. Recreational Fisheries** (*Transcript Day 3, p.84*)

The Recreational Fishing Subcommittee met and discussed strategic planning and planning integration with the NOAA Recreational Fishing Action Plans, the appointment of NOAA Regional Recreational Fishing Coordinators, and protocols for agenda development and preparation for future MAFAC meetings. In the future, the Subcommittee requested a progress report on the socioeconomic studies currently being completed by NOAA staff, and status reports on establishment of a budget line item for the Recreational Fishing Coordinator; establishment of a communications network with constituency groups at the Regional Coordinator level; and a Recreational Fish Summit update.

The Subcommittee applauded NOAA’s efforts to involve the public in addressing the issue of barotrauma in all pertinent fish species. The Subcommittee considered the barotrauma workshops held on the east and west coasts over the past few months well attended and very successful. In light of this, MAFAC approved the following motion: “NOAA is encouraged to continue their work on barotrauma, with particular attention to post release recovery of species.”

With regard to the Recreational Fishing Working Group, the Subcommittee recommends they be re-empanelled. It is recommended that the Regional Recreational Coordinators be assigned in an advisory role to the group for the purposes of networking on local issues and identifying trends that can be targeted for evaluation and recommendations by MAFAC.

**12. Other Administrative MAFAC Actions** (*Transcript Day 3, p. 262*)

Staff were asked to prepare a list of member actions/staff actions in advance of the 30-day written report; finalize the date and location for the fall 2012 meeting; and work with the MAFAC Chair and Subcommittee Chairs to schedule meetings and assist with various work products and efforts throughout the summer.





7

**C: Meeting Agenda**  
**MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**May 22-24, 2012 ♦ Seattle, Washington**

**Sheraton Seattle Hotel**

1400 Sixth Avenue, Seattle, WA 98101 \* Direct Line: (206) 447-5564

---

**Mon., May 21: Field Trip to Taylor Shellfish Farms/Bill Dewey's aquaculture operation (voluntary)**

Approximate time: 7:30 a.m. - 5:00 p.m. (day long)

**Tues., May 22: Early AM Reports – Standing Meeting Items**

- 8:00-8:15 Openings & Introductions/Welcome New Members
- 8:15-8:30 NMFS Director Report (Alan Risenhover)
- 8:30-8:45 MAFAC Executive Director Report (Mark Holliday)  
Update on status of prior MAFAC outputs; discussion on subcommittee membership
- 8:45-9:15 MAFAC Chair /Executive Subcommittee report (Keith Rizzardi)  
Update on between meeting activities; discussion of new meeting format/process/Executive Committee reforms
- 9:15-10:00 MAFAC Consultant Reports (Atlantic, Pacific & Gulf Commission Directors)  
Joint update on common trends/issues from the different coasts

***BREAK***

- 10:15–11:00 NMFS NW Regional Administrator & NW Science Director Presentations
  - John Stein, Director, Northwest Fisheries Science Center, NMFS
  - Will Stelle, Administrator, Northwest Region Office, NMFS

**May 22: Late AM Reports - Selected regional, legal, legislative, or budget topics, as needed**

- 11:00-11:45 Legislative update: focus on Saltonstall-Kennedy Grant Program overview (prior meeting action item) & review of recently introduced legislation [Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittee]
- 11:45-12:30 Budget update (Alan Risenhover)  
Foundational discussion for Day 2 (Wed) effort by Strategic Planning Subcommittee

***LUNCH BREAK 12:30-1:30***

**May 22: PM Workshops (Informational and foundational for anticipated future action, or related to meeting location)**

- 1:30-2:15 Aquaculture update & Washington State aquaculture initiative (tentative: Bill Dewey/Michael Rubino)

**C: Meeting Agenda**  
**MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**May 22-24, 2012 ♦ Seattle, Washington**

8

How could this initiative be replicated nationally? How does it relate to the NOAA & DOC policies? [Commerce Subcommittee]

2:15-3:00 National Standard 1 Discussion (Debra Lambert)  
Discussion/foundational for on-going MAFAC engagement [Ecosystem Subcommittee]

***BREAK***

3:15-4:15 Certification of sustainability; Fishwatch upgrade; NMFS/government role in advising public on fisheries sustainability (Holliday) [Commerce Subcommittee]

4:15-5:00 Working Waterfronts (University of Washington Sea Grant speaker-tentative)  
NOTE: This is to set up topic for Commerce and RecFish Subcommittees summer and future meeting work

- Pete Granger, Program Lead, Marine Advisory Services, Washington State Sea Grant
- Nicole Faghin, Coastal Management Specialist, Washington State Sea Grant

**Wed., May 23: AM Action Items (Items intended to lead to future outputs)**

8:00-9:00 *Vision 2020* briefing on updates and vote (Martin Fisher, Ad Hoc Subcommittee Chair)  
Goal: Discuss final draft document (posted in advance), present to MAFAC to approve-- If no omissions and no-rewrite, action is complete. Otherwise, Ad Hoc *Vision 2020* group will meet later in day or Thursday to complete modifications before a re-vote.

9:00-10:00 Protected resources briefing  
Sea turtles and coral issues [Protected Resources Subcommittee]

- Keith Rizzardi, Chair, MAFAC
- Lance Smith, Protected Resources Branch Chief, Pacific Islands Regional Office (by phone)

***BREAK***

10:15-11:15 NMFS-FWS Reorganization briefing (Mark Holliday)  
Discussion of GAO Study on NMFS merger into FWS.

11:15-12:00 2020 Conclusion (as needed).

***LUNCH***

**May 23 PM. Subcommittee Meetings**

1:30-3:15 *Strategic Planning, Budget and Program Management* (Anthony Chatwin, Chair)  
TOPIC 1: Budget  
TOPIC 2: Reorganization



**C: Meeting Agenda**  
**MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**May 22-24, 2012 ♦ Seattle, Washington**

9

Goal: discussion, draft document, schedule teleconferences, discuss with MAFAC, generate final output, meet with GAO? Report for October meeting, possibly include broader organizational options?

- 1:30-3:15 Ecosystem Subcommittee (Dave Wallace, Chair)  
TOPIC 1: Revisit /redirect past MAFAC recommendations on National Ocean Policy, Deepwater Horizon & Gulf Coast Task Force  
Goal: complete content document, target recipients, obtain approval of MAFAC plan, MAFAC member appearances at appropriate meetings  
TOPIC 2: Workplan for NS1
- 3:30-5:30 Protected Resources Subcommittee (Julie Morris, Chair)  
TOPIC 1: Sea turtles  
Goal: Plan response to CCC request.  
TOPIC 2: Coral Species Status Report  
Goal: Discussion submission of comments to submit to NOAA by July 31.
- 3:30-5:30 JOINT Commerce Subcommittee (George Nardi, Chair) **AND**  
Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee (Ken Franke, Chair) for TOPIC 1
- TOPIC 1: Working waterfronts  
Goal: develop work plan for summer/October meeting/future  
TOPIC 2: Certification/sustainability  
TOPIC 3: Aquaculture
- Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee (Ken Franke, Chair)  
TOPIC 1: Recreational Fishery Working Group  
Goal: Decision on future.

**Thu., May 25: Subcommittee Follow-Up, MAFAC Actions**

- 7:30-9:00am Open for unfinished business / subcommittees can finalize work products  
(e.g., Ad Hoc Vision 2020 Work group, if needed)  
Public comments: 8:30-9:00
- 9:00-10:00 Strategic Planning Subcommittee Report & MAFAC Action
- BREAK**
- 10:15-11:15 Ecosystems Subcommittee Report & MAFAC Action
- 11:15-11:45 Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee Report & MAFAC Action
- LUNCH**
- 1:00-2:00 Commerce Subcommittee Report
- 2:00-3:00 Protected Resources Subcommittee Report
- 3:00-4:00 General MAFAC administration: teleconferences, next meeting discussion, other business, etc.
- 4:00 p.m. **ADJOURN**