

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS  
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL WORKSHOP  
2, September 2009, 9:00 am- 4:00 pm  
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room  
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Meeting Minutes

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members:

Isabella Abbott (Native Hawaiian for Buzzy Agard); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Cindy Hunter (Research); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission for David Laist); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Linda Paul (Conservation); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard); Don Schug (Research); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Susan White (US, Fish and Wildlife Service); 'Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)).

*Absent:* Louis "Buzzy" Agard (Native Hawaiian); Margaret Akamine (NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Kelly Finn (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS)); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism).

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Athline Clark (State of Hawaii for Tim Johns); Tammy Harp (Native Hawaiian for William Aila) via teleconference; Joe Paulin HIHWNMS for Naomi McIntosh); Bill Friedel (HIHWNMS for Naomi McIntosh)

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Kimo Carvalho; Andy Collins; Hoku Johnson; Kaylene Keller; Andy Collins;

[Monument Staff]:

[Members of the Public]: Takiora Ingram; Marti Townsend (KAHEA); Stephanie Fried; Teresa Datson

PURPOSES OF THE MEETING:

- 1) Update and discussion on Monument evaluation strategies
- 2) Update and discussion on Monument Alliance development
- 3) Update and discussion on World Heritage

#### 4) Presentation and discussion on Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Management Plan

##### I. CALL TO ORDER (JOHNS)

Council Chair Tim Johns called the meeting to order and Linda Paul took roll and the participants introduced themselves.

##### II. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (JOHNS)

Mr. Johns reviewed the agenda for the day.

##### III. APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS RAC MEETING MINUTES (PAUL)

The group reviewed the minutes of the 9-10 June 2009 RAC meeting. Linda Paul motioned to amend the minutes to not change Kelly Finns edits to Margaret Akamine's comment regarding WESPAC providing information on the effects of fishing on sea birds. Cindy Hunter seconded the motion and all present RAC members voted unanimously to change and finalize the minutes.

The group then reviewed the minutes of the 10 August 2009 meeting. Linda Paul motioned to amend the minutes and include Kelly Finns edits to her own comments on Topic B: Monument Alliance Recommendations. Additionally, Linda Paul motioned to amend the recommendation letter to spell out all acronyms under Recommendation 3 regarding the Monument Alliance, and to change the Recommendation 4 Leadership bullet to read "The Alliance should be led by a chair and vice-chair." Cindy Hunter seconded the motion and all present RAC members voted unanimously to change and finalize the minutes.

Kimo Carvalho shared that edits will be made and posted on the [www.Papahanaumokuakea.gov](http://www.Papahanaumokuakea.gov) website under the Reserve Advisory Council section once completed.

##### IV. TOPIC A: MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE AGENCY UPDATES (WHITE, CLARK, WILHELM)

Susan White, FWS Superintendent provided a PowerPoint update for FWS during the months of June – July only. On Midway Atoll, Mrs. White shared that an epizootic outbreak of botulism has killed several Laysan ducks. Midway staff is responding by removing dead or sick birds, cleaning out the bottom muck from most problematic seeps, and removing vegetation from the wetland edges. Dead birds are being treated with antitoxin and released once symptoms disappear. Since the outbreak, approximately 40 ducks have died. Managers are continuously monitoring the outbreak and are seeing the number of affected birds decrease significantly since the outbreak.

In June, Midway Atoll Wildlife Biologist jumped aboard the *R/V Hi'ialakai* with a chainsaw to assist the State Wildlife Sanctuary in removal of the last of invasive ironwood trees on Kure Atoll. Mrs. White highlighted this as a great example of the partner agencies working together in resource management.

Maintenance continues on Tern Island and Midway Atoll. On Tern Island, staff is dealing with a septic/sewage disposal problem. The Acting Tern Island Manager is currently working with

FWS Engineers on long term options for Tern Islands' sewage and wastewater, with input on potential impacts on sea turtles from the National Marine Fisheries Services. On Midway Atoll, a fuel barge arrived to deliver 140,000 gallons of fuel since water entered one of the barge fuel compartments damaging truck filters. Also, since the last discovery of high amounts of lead-based paint at Midway's historic officers' quarters, further environmental testing is being done in advance of restoration of the building structure.

Habitat management continues on Laysan, French Frigate Shoals and Midway. The NOAA/USFWS turtle camp has completed its annual monitoring season with a total of 270 nesting females documented on East Island. Albatross banding is also completed for this season with over 3,000 Laysan and Black-footed chicks identified. In June, 23 monk seal pups were born, 10 pups weaned, 9 nursing and 4 deceased on Tern Island. On Laysan Island, 28 pups born, 20 weaned and 7 nursing, bringing the total overall population to approximately 1,200 individuals. In July, 27 pups were born, 15 weaned, 6 nursing and 6 deceased at French Frigate Shoals. And 30 more pups, 20 weaned and 7 nursing were counted on Laysan Island. Monk Seal monitoring is still occurring on each island. Additionally, two species of introduced plants – Morton Bay fig and a cactus – were eradicated from Midway in June.

As for visitors, Mrs. White shared with RAC members that F/A-18 jets flying from Wake Island had an emergency landing on Midway. Planes normally land for refueling only, however since this was an emergency; the crew stayed longer and were considered "visitors." Linda Paul asked about the amount of money FWS makes each year off visitors (for the purpose of making revisions within the 5 year management plan review for visitor services). Mrs White shared that Midway is expensive, but is not a money making business. Linda Paul also asked what the limits are to visitors on Midway. 'Aulani Wilhelm mentioned the management plan limits how many people are allowed to be on Midway at once. Susan White added that FWS can only fit 15 people on each plane, and are also limited to the amount of beds available. Linda Paul mentioned she would someday like the RAC to visit Midway since they are helping to make decisions for this place. Cindy Hunter added the RAC can also set the example to appreciate a place from afar.

Mrs. White continued by sharing that FOMA visitors arrived in June to help with marine debris, habitat restoration, and bolus collection. Conservation International also visited Midway for a Hawaii marine conservation initiative. In early June, Midway Atoll residents and guests gathered to commemorate the anniversary of the Battle of Midway. And in July, Tracy Ammerman hosted the World Heritage evaluators while on their voyage throughout the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands.

Mrs. White mentioned that staffing is increasing. On Laysan Island, FWS has hired a full-time biological technician in order to avoid incremental hiring and trainings for constant new hires. FWS are continuing to work with contractors and the FWS radio/communications branch to replace the Honolulu-based radio system. In July, the U.S. Coast Guard and FWS enhanced their commitments for ongoing cooperation, such as assisting in the translocation of Nihoa millerbirds, marine debris, contaminant remediation, and transportation and logistical support. FWS is also working with the PMNM Data Integration Group to develop its evaluation strategy.

Mrs. White also mentioned there are listings on [volunteers.gov](http://volunteers.gov) for volunteers to explore opportunities in the NWHI.

Athline Clark, State of Hawaii Superintendent, provided the RAC with an update for the months of June – August 2009.

Mrs. Clark began by sharing highlights from Kure Atoll's field camp. A green sea turtle nested four times on Green Island, which is the first documented nests on Kure in decades. NMFS will be collecting tissue samples for DNA analysis to see which stock the turtles came from. Also, 17 monk seals were born at Kure this year and are doing well.

The U.S. Coast Guard has been working with the State to remove 2 cubic yards of PCB contaminated soil from the scrap metal from when the U.S. Coast Guard once occupied the island. They initially conducted soil testing last year. This year, they're bringing soil back to Honolulu where it will be tested with a type of fungi able to break PCBs into non-toxic substances. And if successful, the State will be able to clean up Kure's contaminated scrap metal dump.

Coast Guard is also involved in removing marine debris on the island. In August, they removed about 400 pounds, and will make its last big effort to remove about 2,000 pounds in September. The U.S. Coast Guard has totaled its collection of marine debris to weigh 2,560 pounds so far this year.

The Boodlea composite algal bloom in the lagoon is subsiding. Many areas have cleared leaving behind live corals showing no signs of stress. Gail Grabowsky asked if the Algal bloom has any anthropogenic effects. Athline shared that scientists believe the bloom is being induced by climate change, particularly the warming of sea temperature. The U.S. Coast Guard is doing testing for near-by contaminants that could possibly be part of the effects, but most likely will not find any.

Shorebirds are beginning to arrive from their winter habitats, which also indicates that the field season is coming to a close. The NOAA R/V Hi'ialakai will pick up DLNR-DOFAW team members on the next RAMP cruise and take them to Midway and fly them back to Honolulu. This is another great example of the partnership between the three co-trustees.

Mrs. Clark continued to share that DLNR was fully engaged in planning all aspects of the World Heritage evaluators' site visit this August. Between June and September, DLNR coordinated a total of 9 permits that were presented to the DLNR Board and approved. And for future activities, DLNR will be providing extensive support to NOAA on the next RAMP cruise scheduled to take off in early October.

Aulani Wilhelm, NOAA Superintendent, provided a PowerPoint on key activities from June-August 2009.

Mrs. Wilhelm shared outcomes from the Capitol Hill Ocean Week Volunteer of the Year Award. This year, the National Marine Sanctuaries Foundation awarded Kamala Anthony for her

exceptional volunteer efforts at the Monument's Mokuapapapa Discovery Center. 'Aulani shared that Kamala was able to meet the Hawaii Congressional delegation in Washington D.C., where she impressed Congresswoman Mazie Hirono who brought Kamala to Midway with her on a recent visit. Additionally, Congresswoman Hirono asked Kamala to participate via phone at a conference she recently hosted in Washington D.C.

Mrs. Wilhelm encouraged all RAC members to visit the Ahahui Alakai blogs online. It provides interesting reflections on the participants' experience in the Monument. Additionally, participants are building unique curriculums and education projects. Mrs. Wilhelm continued to acknowledge that this is a group worth tracking and monitoring.

Regarding Native Hawaiian topics, Mrs. Wilhelm shared that the Native Hawaiian Research Plan has been delayed due to the Cultural Working Group's agenda. NOAA has been working with OHA for funding with the Native Hawaiian community. This is a year 2 activity, so NOAA still has time to work towards this. Additionally, NOAA has continued its ongoing partnership with the National Institute for Water and Atmosphere (NIWA). Every year NOAA convenes a staff exchange with this group about indigenous research. NIWA employees are the leaders in the area. Canada and the Arctic are now also mimicking bridging indigenous and western sciences. Darren King from NIWA was able to come to Hawaii this year for the Hawaii Conservation Conference to discuss climate change and indigenous science. On an exciting note, Uncle William Aila was honored the Edward Kaanana Umu Kai Award this year. The RAC applauded Uncle William for all his life's work and successes.

Since the last RAC, there have been 5 new permit applications, 4 renewals. Hoku Johnson was able to share details about these later in the RAC meeting.

Mrs. Wilhelm updated the RAC that NOAA has worked with partners in developing a results chain process for its evaluation strategy. Kaylene Keller was able to provide further details on this strategy during the second half of the day.

Mrs. Wilhelm shared information about NOAA's involvement in the Hawaiian Conservation Alliance. The office was involved again this year in organizing a forum on indigenous knowledge, values and people in addressing climate change. There was also a symposium in integrating native Hawaiian and western sciences to better understand the environment of Hawaii. This symposium was led by the Hu'ula class students who shared lessons from their experience. And lastly, the office partnered with HIMB to conduct an all day symposium on building scientific and management tools to addressing climate change in the NWHI. This symposium allowed for different projects to come together, communicate, and see across from each other how they are contributing to an overall picture.

Regarding science, Mrs. Wilhelm shared that NOAA is currently in the middle of its field season. A summary presentation on field season activities will be scheduled at our next RAC meeting to discuss the lessons and highlights from these three cruises. Additional research projects include our ongoing effort on our Natural Resources Science Plan, Impacts of derelict fishing gear re-surveys at Midway, and Historical ecology of the Hawaiian Islands. Jeremy Jackson from Scripps is working with PMNM on providing a historical context, historical

populations, and trends in order to explain what has happened in our oceans prior to scientific data.

Regarding enforcement, Mrs. Wilhelm mentioned that the Astara case resulted in 61K fine. There are 2 active cases and now 2 additional cases in preparation. People are paying based on their failure to notify.

Mrs. Wilhelm mentioned that existing threat assessment information is supposed to give PMNM managers a field of data to use and look at existing threats. However, NOAA staff does not have clearance to view that information, therefore, are waiting for a full-time federal employee to be part of the policy team.

Mrs. Wilhelm shared that World Heritage evaluators spent three weeks in Hawaii to assess PMNM's nomination as a mixed site. Aulani mentioned she would provide more information in a later PowerPoint, but wanted to mention that the Coast Guard celebrated its 219<sup>th</sup> birthday during their visit and proudly mentioned the NWHI during its talk with the evaluators.

As for Strategic Initiatives, its team is currently working on a World Heritage Book to capture the language used in the World Heritage application that was not mentioned anywhere else. Mrs. Wilhelm asked that if any RAC members wanted to mention anything in this book, to please send the strategic initiatives team those submissions ASAP. Kamehameha schools have agreed to publish the book and help sell and distribute once completed. The strategic initiatives team is also taking on Climate Change and pushing on this focus. The team will highlight PMNM as a sentinel site since the Monument is different from most MPAs. NOAA is developing a monitoring tool on Ecosystem carbon management and contributing to large marine ecosystems in climate mitigation.

After the Hawaii Conservation Conference, Mrs. Wilhelm mentioned there was a leadership summit where agencies talked about integrating science, communities, research, pilot projects, education, monitoring, etc. into Climate Change management. The Hawaii Conservation Alliance is looking to make recommendations to the State Climate Change Task Force. Additionally, NOAA is looking to make climate change an interdisciplinary approach and synergizing across all programs. Mrs. Wilhelm also requested a recommendation to help design this sort of climate change initiative and plan in our efforts Archipelago-wide

Pacific Partnerships are another aspect of strategic initiatives. The ONMS will sign a partnership in Tahiti with French this November. The two agencies will focus on issues of marine management. For PMNM, it means we will now begin focusing on strategies on western/colonist marine management. PMNM will provide a cultural emphasis. There will be a full report at the next RAC meeting.

#### V. TOPIC B: HIHWNMS Management Review (WALTERS, PAULIN, FRIEDL)

Friedl started by explained to the RAC that the HIHWNMS is currently going through its management review process. They've decided they are not going to re-invent the Sanctuary. They are trying to get their heads into the position of what the management challenges will be in

5-10 years from now. Therefore, they have formed a “Change Solutions” working group to address those challenges. A lot of work is being done over the phone. They want to look at expanding the scope of the management plan to include other species, but want to be careful about not stepping on the toes of other agencies.

Jeff Walters provided a follow-up PowerPoint to go over the current context of the HIHWNMS management plan. He discussed that the management plan review is an opportunity to identify people they are not talking to in their communities and reach out to stakeholders. It’s also an opportunity to review current management challenges, current collaborations and what the next steps to its management are. Managers want to keep its focus on Humpback Whales, but want to consider other species such as monk seals, green sea turtles, dolphins, etc. to be part of the sanctuary.

Joe Paulin followed up with a second presentation about the commonalities between the Main Hawaiian Islands (MHI) and the Northwestern Hawaiian Islands (NWHI). He pointed out that in the NWHI, shark attacks are the issue, whereas in the MHI’s, it’s human interactions. This is why the HIHWNMS is seeking the help of the RAC to engage communities they represent. There are concerns with engaging communities and impacts. The RAC may be able to help figure out the best way to engage these communities.

Questions arose regarding boundary revisions. Mr. Paulin explained that boundaries are on the table for discussion and are being considered. Don Schug expressed that there are many whales outside of existing boundaries. Jeff Walters continued by describing that since animals have similar protections outside the boundaries as they do inside, there are existing rules to work off of. However, speed zones may be set in the Sanctuary that may provide additional support to these endangered animals. Aulani Wilhelm continued the discussion by mentioning that since the NWHI-Coral reef Ecosystem Reserve was first being considered under the National Marine Sanctuaries Act (NMSA), it was focused on zones, and spatial dimensions. When talking to the HIHWNMS, and their process, Mrs. Wilhelm began to think that it was more like a re-designation since it would change from the single species focus. Some constituencies may not be interested in changing from single species, but if these communities knew what NMSA could do for them within the boundary of the Sanctuary, they may be more interested, so they may be looking at sub-zoning.

Tim Johns raised the question regarding a timeline and the State of Hawaii’s role in this process. Joe Paulin responded that the best case scenario will take 3 years. Athline Clark added by saying that whomever the new State Governor will be, that person will have the opportunity to opt in or out. The State will always be a component of the discussion since 80% is in State waters. Additionally, whomever the new Governor’s candidate will be for the new co-manager, we need to be on their radar. Jeff Walters will no longer be the co-manager as of September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2009. Dave Nichols will be taking Jeff’s place till then.

Tim Johns raised the question of what the HIHWNMS would like from the RAC. Joe Paulin responded by saying that if any RAC member is aware of specific communities or stakeholder groups they need to outreach to, then the RAC should let them know, and/or offer an introduction. Any advice is welcomed.

Aulani Wilhelm continued the discussion by mentioning that since the Monument is a sister-site, the RAC needs to be better cross-informed and connected. The NWHI did not do as good a job to extend its network through the HIHWNMS SAC during its designation. So it would be good if the RAC could be better connected with the HIHWNMS Management Plan Review, and reciprocate the support via a letter of support.

## VI. TOPIC C: ENFORCEMENT (ROBERTS, QUITGUA)

Due to time, the enforcement update was moved up the agenda. Eric Roberts (USCG) provided a document to the RAC that highlighted several updates for the months of June – August. In June, routine law enforcement patrol noticed a US fishing vessel in SPA around Gardner Pinnacles. Enforcement action is currently in place for the incident. In July, Mr. Roberts also mentioned that the U.S. Coast Guard was also proud to host the World Heritage evaluators. The U.S. Coast Guard Admiral, as well as the Chief of Strategic Programs "Chiefs of Response, Enforcement, and Prevention", attended the Waikiki event. The Admiral invited the World Heritage evaluators, as well as Aulani and Athline to the lunch the next day. In August, C130 patrols took Representative Hirono and the USFWS personnel to Midway. Additionally, a large cutter went through the entire west boundary of the Monument going north to a high seas driftnet patrol.

Charles Quitugua (USFWS) provided an update to the RAC mentioning that he has been taken with enforcement to the NWHI Monument and Rose Atoll. He typically works hand-in-hand with the U.S. Coast Guard, so no new enforcements. Mr. Quitugua did mention one exciting update, which was that a new law enforcement officer will be stationed on Midway Atoll in November. Susan White mentioned that this is important to have this person due to the increase in visitors to Midway.

Becky Homman asked about the USCG's work with the Navy. Mr. Roberts explained that USCG staff have gone on Navy vessels for drug patrols, but now for the first time, USCG fisheries enforcement folks have travelled on Navy vessels. One group was recently on a Navy ship. They found some violations on this recent cruises – violations of EEZ by foreign vessels. This is a big cost saving to have these folks on Navy vessels.

## VII. TOPIC D: PERMITS (JOHNSON)

Following the lunch break, Hoku Johnson provided the RAC with the new permit update for the months of June – August. Mrs. Johnson shared that 60 applications were received for 2009 (34 research, 13 special ocean use, 4 conservation/management, 4 native Hawaiian, 4 education, and 1 recreation). The permit deadline for 2010 was September 1<sup>st</sup>, 2009. So far there are 8 applications received (5 renewals). Permit application summaries will be posted on the website on September 11<sup>th</sup>, 2009.

Following the permitting update, the RAC discussed its role in the permitting process and that it should be incorporated into the LAN Boards permitting process. Athline Clark shared that State permitting process allows public the ability to share thoughts about permits via open mic. There is also opportunity for comment online. The difference with the LAN Board process is that the



decision maker is there to hear testimony and wrestle issues with public, whereas our federal process, people apply for permits, which are accepted based on criteria put forth ahead of time. Mrs. Clark mentioned she would send the group submittals to view so that the RAC can decide if they want to make recommendations to the State.

#### VIII. TOPIC E: WORLD HERITAGE (WILHELM)

PMNM just held its evaluation mission for World Heritage Nomination. The big question Mrs. Wilhelm raised to the RAC is if the Monument should or should not we recent its application if not inscribed as a mixed site.

Mrs. Wilhelm showed the RAC images of the evaluators, including John Parks from National Parks Service and his role in trying to build capacity in the U.S. The evaluators were looking for management effectiveness, stakeholder and local support, field operations effectiveness, threats to the site and conservation measures, and maps and boundaries. Mrs. Wilhelm mentioned that both evaluators were amazed and widened their view of large marine protected areas. 300+ constituents, over 60 staff across 7 agencies and 4 partners we involved in this month-long process. Mrs. Wilhelm walked the RAC through their agenda of what they did throughout their stay here in Hawaii and explained how PMNM staff organized activities based on the 5 aspects PMNM was being evaluated on. Mrs. Wilhelm also shared with the RAC that the evaluators left with a solid impression of PMNM.

Regarding next steps, the evaluators are currently writing their reviews. IUCN will have desk reviews in Fall 2009. Reviews will all be compiled and passed along to an overall reviewer. There will be one last Q&A session in early 2010. This will be the best opportunity to evaluate our gaps and judge our status as a mixed site. In May 2010, the WH committee will receive recommendations from ICAMOS/IUCN. The WH committee will make their final recommendation to the public in June 2010 and the meeting decision and inscription will be in July 2010.

#### IX. TOPIC F: MONUMENT EVALUATION STRATEGY (KELLER)

Mrs. Keller mentioned that the overall plan was not to just say, “We’ve implemented the plan,” but how we implemented the plan. The evaluation strategy is designed to track and evaluate within each agency. Regarding tracking, this is a web-based system allowing agencies to track activities, status and products. Currently PMNM is working with the MMB to define the content and reporting needs. Regarding the evaluation section, we needed to see how the activities we pursued actually met our goals, hence the method of a results chain. The method was tested with staff during a 2-day workshop, which was well-received. PMNM is now implementing this on the Marine Debris program to develop result chains for the Marine Debris Action Plan.

Mrs. Keller described the results chain as how our actions are going to reach a goal. There is a diagram that says, “If we do this, then this will happen.” Conservation Measures Partnership is pulling this sort of evaluation strategy together, so one bonus is that we are part of a bigger picture. TNC is looking to help judge this process. PMNM is looking for others from the general public.

Tim Johns asked if the Alliance will participate in this process in order to revise the MMP. Aulani Wilhelm described that it would be a valuable role for the Alliance to help in the second phase of the evaluation strategy for MMP activities. HIIWNMS doesn't have an evaluation strategy; therefore the SAC doesn't provide input. But an advisory body would be very useful. Mr. Johns mentioned that perhaps an evaluation subcommittee has a continuing role throughout the transition from the RAC and the Alliance. Mr. Johns wants to know how often the Alliance should be involved. Kem Lowry suggested there be regular monitoring of the strategy. In regards to the metrics, however, RAC could be helpful in sharing how successful managers are doing by picking an ideal number.

Once all four activities are evaluated, and after the cultural working group runs through these evaluation phases, PMNM will evaluate the next steps, and perhaps work with a RAC working group as an outsider perspective.

Mrs. Wilhelm requested from the RAC that they provide two recommendations:

1. Tell us who you'd recommend as experts to help with the evaluation
2. Tell us the non-experts to look at them as a continuous outside review

**ACTION:** Management Plan Review Committee is established and will work with PMNM staff to work on the Monument Evaluation Strategy. Members of the committee will include:

Kem Lowry (Chair)

Gail Grabowski

Cindy Hunter

Don Schug

Bill Gilmartin

Linda Paul

## X. TOPIC G: MONUMENT ALLIANCE (COLLINS)

Andy Collins reviewed the management plan components of what the Alliance should become. Right now, the co-managers are not anticipating an alliance be formed by the end of this year. A tentative timeline of what should be accomplished by early 2010 to become an alliance was then shared with the group. Mr. Collins then shared the differences between the RAC, MMB and what the Alliance should be. Mr. Collins provided the RAC on what the tasks for development should be. Those included 1. Defining detailed Monument Constituencies, 2. Developing an application and selection process, 3. Clarify OMB criteria for the applications based on the Paperwork Reduction Act, 4. Draft a charter, 5. Finalize the alliance charter, 6. Solicit applications, and 7. Conduct a selection process.

Aulani added that the Reauthorization of NMSA will be introduced this month (Sept.). There may be some language about new marine Monuments. This may affect FACA. Mrs. Wilhelm also added that ONMS is on-board to continue working with the RAC until an Alliance is formed. But its main priority is to work on the charter.

## XI: PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Marti Townsend (KAHEA) acknowledged that these RAC meetings are very helpful. She recommends that a working group instead of a sub-committee be formed in order to have the public included in developing a charter.

Mrs. Townsend continued by mentioning that there isn't enough public participation on permitting processes and no opportunity for public to participate. Few steps (ideas) are to open MMB meetings to public, a RAC rep at the meetings to review permits, sending list-serve emails about submitting comments on applications in a fair amount of time, and soliciting public testimony and encouraging people in the process. Also Mrs. Townsend recommended that managers include a lifespan of permits to let the public know that different opportunities exist on website. Public participation will help engage with public resource owned by all of us.

Stephanie Fried added that RAC reports are premature. Mrs. Fried mentioned that she would like to see the RAC continue in existence and not to move forward on an Alliance. Mrs. Fried also shared that working groups are much more useful than RAC sub-committee groups. A sub-committee group would mean there is no public participation.

Tammy Harp recommends "Malama Puuhonua" be the name of the Coast Guard Cutter.

**ACTION:** Bill Gilmartin motioned to establish a working group on the charter for the Alliance and that the working group determines who its non-RAC members will be. Linda seconded the motion. Through discussion, Kem Lowry raised the question about decision making in saying that only those who are on the RAC should be allowed to vote. All approved the motion unanimously.

## XII. ANNOUNCEMENTS:

RAC coordinators will work with the RAC to schedule its next meeting.

## ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Johns adjourned the meeting at 4:00pm