

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL WORKSHOP
18-19 March 2009, 9:00 am- 4:00 pm
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Meeting Minutes
Day 1

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Margaret Akamine (NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Athline Clark (State of Hawaii for Tim Johns); Kelly Finn (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Cindy Hunter (Research); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission for David Laist); Linda Paul (Conservation); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard); Don Schug (Research); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Susan White (US, Fish and Wildlife Service); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER)).

Absent: Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS)); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism)

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Brian Bowen;

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Keeley Belva; Kimo Carvalho; Hoku Johnson; Kaylene Keller; Randy Kosaki;

[Monument Staff]: David Weingartner (State of Hawaii); Dani Carter (State of Hawaii); Cynthia Vanderlip (State of Hawaii); Kelly Sage (ONMS);

[Members of the Public]: Lisa White; Charles Haman (DOI); Takiora Ingram; Marti Townsend (KAHEA)

PURPOSES OF THE MEETING:

- 1) Receive updates on Monument efforts following the finalization of the management plan
- 2) Discuss and provide initial recommendations on Natural Resources Science Plan
- 3) Discuss Native Hawaiian Research Plan and process for involvement
- 4) Discuss and plan for the transition between the RAC and the Monument Alliance

I. CALL TO ORDER (PAUL)

Council Vice-Chair Linda Paul called the meeting to order and Don Schug took roll and the participants introduced themselves.

II. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (PAUL)

Ms. Paul reviewed the agenda for the next two days.

III. APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS RAC MEETING MINUTES (PAUL)

The group reviewed the minutes of the previous Reserve Advisory Council meeting on 18 December 2008. Rick Gaffney moved to approve the minutes and Cindy Hunter seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

IV. TOPIC A: MONUMENT CO-TRUSTEE AGENCY UPDATES (WILHELM, CLARK, WHITE)

Aulani Wilhelm, NOAA Superintendent, explained that the Monument superintendents will be giving updates to the RAC more regularly. She reviewed highlights from her report on NOAA's priorities for 2009 and recent accomplishments. There was discussion in further detail on the enforcement cases including updates from Jeff Pollack, NOAA Office of Law Enforcement, and the PAA education program. There was interest in the Native Hawaiian topics of incorporating traditional knowledge and western science. The group was interested in the UH – Hilo course that went to Midway in November.

Kaylene Keller, information specialist for the Monument, gave a presentation on the developments of a new data information system. Some of the new tools included a spatial bibliography, a data discovery tool, and a species database. Some of these tools are for management, however many have public use applications. Dr. Keller demonstrated the spatial bibliography, which is nearly completed.

Athline Clark, State of Hawaii Superintendent, updated the group on the World Heritage process and discussed some of the work that is going on at Kure Atoll. She reviewed the contents of the World Heritage application and supporting documentation. CDs of the application are available and the application is posted on the Monument website. Ms. Clark discussed the designation process and some of the advantages of having World Heritage status.

Cynthia Vanderlip, manager of Kure Atoll, gave a quick update about “trash and weeds” on Kure. She talked about their efforts in supplementing work with monk seals and seabirds. She said that they are beginning to find that boluses from albatross on Kure have ten times more plastic than those at Kaena Point. The Kure team is also helping to supplement marine debris efforts. She also said that they are upping the verbesena removal efforts and increasing the native out-plantings. The RAC thanked Ms. Vanderlip for her continued work at Kure. She also mentioned that there is a non-profit that has been started, information can be found at www.kureatollconservancy.org.

Susan White, FWS Superintendent, gave the group her written report and highlighted some of the FWS efforts taking place in the Monument. Ms. White provided a staff chart and shared what the staff members do. She pointed out that many of the Monument employees for the FWS

are actually out in the field. Many of the staff that are here in Honolulu are actually not specific Monument staff.

Ms. White discussed some of the activities taking place including albatross counts over the winter. They are gearing up for the field season and she explained that one of the outcomes of the Monument is the coordination of logistics for both of the refuges in the Monument. She discussed some of the priority maintenance issues at Midway. Ms. White also reminded the group about the Hawaiian Islands National Wildlife Refuge 100-year anniversary. She talked about the anniversary event that took place in February. Their volunteer activities have been posted on www.volunteer.gov. There were questions about tourism activities on Midway and what the status of black-footed albatross is. Kelly Finn, of WPRFMC, mentioned that the numbers seem to be increasing with the new fishing gear requirements. There was discussion on the removal of lead paint at Midway. Ms. White has explained that they plan to finish up phase one of removal and will begin phase two depending on funding. She explained that the program is level funded this year, but that Midway has its own specific budget that includes keeping the airport open for emergencies.

V. TOPIC C: PERMITS

This topic was moved up in the agenda to adjust for timing. Hoku Johnson discussed the permit summary that was provided. She summarized the 17 new activities and 22 of the applications will need to be heard before the State Board of Land and Natural Resources.

She followed up with the group that the ship reporting system had 44 reports in January and 22 in December.

VI. TOPIC D: SCIENCE & RESEARCH

Report: Research Subcommittee Meeting on March 11 (Gilmartin)

Bill Gilmartin provided a written report and highlighted a few of the discussions at the meeting.

Presentation: NOAA Research Update (Kosaki)

Randy Kosaki, research coordinator and deputy superintendent for NOAA gave a brief presentation about some of the research efforts for the Monument. He discussed some of the research projects from the Hawaiian Institute of Marine Biology partnership with ONMS. He also highlighted some of the deep-water work being conducted with submersibles and time-lapse photography. Dr. Kosaki discussed the new research in the mesophotic ecosystems of the Monument, which will be targeted this field season, and provided a status update of ongoing projects.

Presentation: PMNM Natural Resources Science Plan (Kosaki)

Randy Kosaki provided a timeline for the development of the science plan. He reminded the group that this would supplement the HAMER plan that was released. He discussed the comments gathered during the public scoping meeting in November 2007 and explained that the plan was then put on hold until the Monument management plan was completed. He explained the prioritization of the research activities into high, medium, and low rankings. The target date for release of the draft plan is mid-May for public review and comments. Included in that will be two public meetings. The final will likely be released this summer.

Dr. Kosaki suggested looking at permitted research activities and referencing them to the management plan to look for gaps. The RAC Research Sub-committee will meet tomorrow and can discuss this more. There was discussion as to how to get results from the research in a timelier manner. There was further discussion on who to plan for field season activities.

New Business: Discussion on Process for Natural Resources Science Plan
There was no new business at this time.

VII. TOPIC B: SAC SUMMIT

Linda Paul reviewed the agenda for the 2009 SAC Summit (previously the Advisory Council Chairs and Coordinators Meeting). She talked about some of the previous topics and topics on the agenda for the 2009 meeting. Ms. Paul explained that there is an opportunity to discuss topics with Dan Basta at a chairs dinner. There was discussion on the idea of a National SAC and what that may mean. Discussion topics may be voted on later in the meeting.

VIII. TOPIC F: NATIVE HAWAIIAN CULTURAL INITIATIVES

Report: Native Hawaiian Working Group updates since December (Aila)

William Aila provided updates from the working group members, but pointed out that the working group has not actually met since the last meeting. He said that the members have provided input on the World Heritage application. He said that the working group is putting together a video of the cultural briefing to supplement the cultural education presentation. There was discussion on the purpose of and audience for the video.

ACTION: Show the Cultural Briefing at the June RAC meeting if available.

Presentation: PMNM Native Hawaiian Cultural Research Plan (Johnson)

Hoku Johnson discussed the coordination on the Native Hawaiian Cultural Research Plan. Staff is working closely with the working group to begin planning process for this plan. `Aulani Wilhelm added that it is a challenge trying to fit a cultural plan into a government planning framework. There was a question about how activities would be prioritized.

New Business: Initial discussion and potential recommendation(s) on Native Hawaiian Cultural Research Plan

There was no new business at this time.

IX. TOPIC E: NAVIGATING CHANGE

Matt Limtiaco, Navigating Change coordinator gave a presentation on the Navigating Change educational program. He told the group about the community event that is being planned in May.

X. PUBLIC COMMENT

- Marti Townsend (KAHEA)—Ms. Townsend said that for the cultural research plan that they'd like to encourage everyone to incorporate other cultures into all activities. She asked everyone to consider all of the effects that the activities are having. She encouraged having a system or a plan in place. She asked about rodent eradication activities happening in the

NWHI and asked about prevention of runoff side effects. The research sub-committee should get together to provide comments into the NRSP. The permit application process could be improved by incorporating a permit tracking system. She suggested having a permit application as well as a permit, permit report, etc. posted on the website. She asked for an invitation to any subcommittee meetings. KAHEA is concerned about the World Heritage process and the effects it may have on tourism.

XI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Day 2 of the meeting will begin at 9:00 am tomorrow.

ADJOURNMENT

Ms. Paul adjourned the meeting at 4:30pm.

***NORTHWESTERN HAWAIIAN ISLANDS
CORAL REEF ECOSYSTEM RESERVE ADVISORY COUNCIL WORKSHOP
18-19 March 2009, 9:00 am- 12:00 pm
ONMS Pacific Islands Region Conference Room
Hawaii Kai, Hawaii***

Meeting Minutes
Day 2

ATTENDEES

Advisory Council Members: Louis “Buzzy” Agard (Native Hawaiian); William Aila (Native Hawaiian); Margaret Akamine (NMFS for Mike Tosatto); Athline Clark (State of Hawaii for Tim Johns); Kelly Finn (WESPAC for Kitty Simonds); Rick Gaffney (Recreational Fishing); Bill Gilmartin (Research); Gail Grabowsky (Education); Becky Hommon (U.S. Navy); Cindy Hunter (Research); Kem Lowry (Citizen-At-Large); Lloyd Lowry (Marine Mammal Commission for David Laist); Naomi McIntosh (Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary (HIHWNMS)); Linda Paul (Conservation); Eric Roberts (US Coast Guard); Don Schug (Research); Laura Thompson (Conservation); Susan White (US, Fish and Wildlife Service); ‘Aulani Wilhelm (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands Coral Reef Ecosystem Reserve (NWHI CRER));

Absent: Carlos Andrade (Native Hawaiian); Alexandra Curtis (U.S. Department of State); Bobby Gomes (Commercial Fishing); Tim Johns (State of Hawaii); David Laist (Marine Mammal Commission); Kitty Simonds (Western Pacific Fishery Management Council (WPFMC)); Philip Taylor (National Science Foundation); Mike Tosatto (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), National Marine Fisheries (NMFS)); Jessica Wooley (Conservation); Matthew Zimmerman (Ocean-Related Tourism)

Alternate Council Members (not representing voting members): Brian Bowen; Joe Paulin (HIHWNMS)

[NWHI CRER Staff]: Keeley Belva; Kimo Carvalho; Hoku Johnson; Kaylene Keller; Randy Kosaki;

[Monument Staff]: David Weingartner (State of Hawaii); Dani Carter (State of Hawaii); Cynthia Vanderlip (State of Hawaii); Kelly Sage (ONMS); Takiora Ingram;

[Members of the Public]: Lisa White; Charles Haman (DOI); Marti Townsend (KAHEA); Jeff Walters (HIHWNMS)

XII. CALL TO ORDER (PAUL)

Council Vice-Chair Linda Paul called the meeting to order and Don Schug took roll and the participants introduced themselves.

XIII. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF AGENDA (PAUL)

Ms. Paul reviewed the agenda for the day.

XIV. MONUMENT ALLIANCE (Belva)

Presentation: Key issues to consider in developing recommendations for establishment of the Monument Alliance (Belva)

Presentation: Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council (Walters)

Jeff Walters, HIHWNMS Co-Manager, gave an overview of the Sanctuary Advisory Council. He discussed the makeup of the SAC representatives and which members are voting and non-voting. He discussed how the committees and working groups meet—usually in between meetings and on a conference call. He asked about the purpose of the Alliance—is it a focus group, board of directors, reactive, proactive, conduit to management, conduit to stakeholders, etc. He asked about the composition of members—is it stakeholders, representatives, government or non-government. He talked about the number of members—staffing requirements, administrative costs, group dynamics. He discussed recruiting and participation—directed versus passive recruitment, selection criteria. There was discussion on how selection occurs. Naomi McIntosh discussed that half of the government members are up for selection every year. They then have a selection committee to recommend members that will be approved first by the superintendents, and then by NOAA. They asked about the term limits and vetting process. Dr. Walters pointed out that there is a potential for conflict of interest. There was discussion about how the councils and the sites have evolved. There was discussion about authority and what that means, how advisory is defined—clarity in the definition would help. Take the time to work it out—spend time up front. A group that goes back to the community to gain support for the Sanctuary. The council members feel like they are participating in what is going on, and can be used as an early warning system. Opportunity for stakeholders to bring issues to the management. Advocacy group. Naomi—investment in the group is worth it—members have a higher understanding and can have better conversations in the communities. Cindy—how to better work together. Quarterly meetings at airport (people fly in), then annual retreat to plan and do team building for relationship building. The RAC has had some contention because of stakeholder views, because of who the representative is representing, because of personalities. There was discussion about how to look more nationally—maybe a working group that is national, but the council made up of local representatives.

New Business: Facilitated discussion to develop recommendations for the Monument Alliance (Belva)

The group participated in an exercise that asked about the key elements in developing a new advisory-type body. There was discussion on the purpose of the Alliance, what the membership would look like, and what operating procedures would potentially be. Following this lengthy discussion, the group decided to create a subcommittee that would further address details and work to develop a recommendation from the RAC.

XV. PUBLIC COMMENT

Marti (KAHEA)—submitted written comments and provided comments about the alliance discussion. Contention and differing perspectives will help the process. Missing elements—public resources, purpose of the alliance would be to protect these resources. Body should be made up on right-holders; disagrees with how the SAC is run—should speak on behalf of the

resources. Alliance should provide oversight and accountability, needs people who are do not have a conflict of interest. Thinks that resolutions provide a good formalization of the discussion. Disappointed in lack of public participation—means that public has been cut out. Who is the decider of alliance membership? Likes that there are 3 positions for each category on the RAC. Important to have own charter and own rules and regulations. Should look at the vision, mission, and goals of the MMP to drive the decision on who should speak.

Lisa White (Public)—Learned a lot about the Monument in the last couple of days. Thought that having a youth member on the alliance is important, maybe a youth member that is a young professional. There are younger people who have been to the NWHI that could be considered.

XVI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

There was discussion about the committee and working group meetings.