

# RECRUITMENT AND HIRING: CHALLENGE OR OPPORTUNITY FOR CHANGE?

RAND CENTER FOR QUALITY POLICING  
RECRUITMENT AND HIRING SUMMIT  
ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA  
JUNE 2008

Ellen Scrivner, Ph.D.  
Director  
John Jay Leadership Academy  
John Jay College of Criminal Justice  
New York, NY

# GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF SESSION

- Stimulate Thinking About Creating Models That Correspond to Changes in the Industry.
- Identify Recruitment & Hiring Programs that Embrace Change (COPS Funded Programs).
- Highlight Innovations and “Lessons Learned”.
- Illustrate Impact of Change on Other Organizational Processes.
- “Wake Up Call” to the Industry.

# CURRENT RECRUITMENT CHALLENGES

- INTENSE COMPETITION FOR A SHRINKING POOL OF APPLICANTS.
- UNPRECEDENTED INCENTIVES.
- AGENCIES CAN'T FILL POSITIONS.
- OTHER OPPORTUNITIES AND LESS INTEREST IN BEING A COP.
- CONCERNS ABOUT TAKING "LESS QUALIFIED".
  
- WHATEVER HAPPENED TO THE "CREAM OF THE CROP"?
- NEW MODELS NEEDED-- CONSISTENT WITH INDUSTRY CHANGE.
- NEED TO MARKET THE LAW ENFORCEMENT CAREER.
- COPS FUNDED PROGRAMS EXEMPLIFY CHANGE AND RESPOND TO THESE CHALLENGES.

# CHANGES IN LAW ENFORCEMENT INDUSTRY

- Homeland Security Responsibilities.
- Immigration Issues.
- Technology Advances: Intelligence-Led Policing.
- Enhanced Accountability—Transparency.
- Sharper Focus on Integrity/Character: Department and Officers—Legitimacy Questioned.
- Changes Related to Community Policing—Collaborative Partnerships.
- Involvement in Social Justice Issues such as Prisoner Reentry or Responding to the Homeless Mentally Ill.
- Growth in Management/Executive Sophistication.

# NEW SKILL SETS NEEDED

- Stronger focus on strategic thinking.
- Ability to collaborate.
- Capacity to use technology.
- Complex cognitive skills-problem solving and intelligence-based policing.
- Analytical thinking-crime patterns.
- Use of data and information to shape responses.
- Cultural competence and valuing diversity.
- Emotional Intelligence.

# SHIFT IN FOCUS: NOT JUST SKILLS--NEW "MIND SETS"

- Focus on Service—Goldstein's Work (1977).
- Confirmed by Recent Research.
- Focus on Values of Policing.
- A Call to Serve-Prevention AND Enforcement.
- No Longer Just the Number of Arrests You Make....Multiple Components of a Public Safety Orientation.
- Outputs Versus Outcomes—How Hard You Work Versus Results You Achieve.

# CONFRONTING CHANGE AND CHALLENGE

- Using Old Recruiting Techniques in a New Recruiting Environment.
- Candidates Lack Knowledge about Policing.
- Not Focusing on New Skill Sets...Police Officer Role is Now More Interesting and More Complex.
- Creating a "brand" and Market as Career.
- Communicating with Potential Candidates.
- Face Competition from Better Opportunities....Need to Move Quickly.
- Recruitment for Service Needs to Address Community Expectations for Policing.
- Door Now Opened for Trying New Approaches.
- Acknowledge That Solving Recruitment Will Impact Overall Selection Process.

# CANDIDATES FROM THE 70's & 80's

- "Responsibility Absorbers"
- Prior Military Experience
- Education Through Department
- Reactive-Incident Driven Policing
- "Maintaining the Edge"
- Respond-Control-Back in Service
- Distance from the Community But Passion for Law Enforcement
- The Baby Boomers of Policing--Now Retiring and Losing Their Experience



# Candidate of Today

- New Generation—Changing Values about Jobs, Better Educated--Knowledge Workers; Balance Work & Family; Also, Experience with Drug Use, Obesity and Debt. Need to be Convinced.
- FBI “Whole Person” Approach (Woska, 2006).
- California POST Survey (Switzer, 2006).
  - Desire to Serve most powerful reason to seek law enforcement career. Edged out excitement and adventure, and salary and benefits.
  - Reputation of Agency and Variety of Assignments most compelling reasons for accepting employment.

# WAKE UP CALL TO THE INDUSTRY

- Develop Recruitment Strategic Plan.
- Create Advertising Plan.
- Re-tool Selection Process Where Needed.
- Develop External Partnerships to Improve Diversity.
- Personalize Recruitment Process.
- Revisit Promotion Policies (Involve Unions at Outset).
- Create Worker Friendly-Family Friendly Policies.
- Focus on Enhancing Supervisor/Management Understanding of Changing Work Force.
- Enhance Organizational Communication.
- Engage in Succession Planning.

# COPS FUNDED PROJECTS HIRING IN THE SPIRIT OF SERVICE (HSS)

- Hillsborough County Sheriff's Department (FL)
- City of Detroit Police Department (MI)
- Sacramento Police Department (CA)
- King County Sheriff's Department (WA)
- Burlington Police Department (VT)

# NEW COMPETENCIES IDENTIFIED BY HSS

- Problem Solving and Judgment
- Empathy/Compassion
- Capacity for “Multitasking”
- Courage
- Responsible
- Resourceful and Initiative
- Assertiveness
- Integrity
- Teamwork

# TRADITIONAL SELECTION MODELS

- ENTRY LEVEL WRITTEN KNOWLEDGE TEST
- PHYSICAL AGILITY TESTING
- DRUG SCREEN
- BACKGROUND INVESTIGATION
- POLYGRAPH (MAYBE)
- MEDICAL EXAMINATION
- PSYCHOLOGICAL ASSESSMENT
- ORAL INTERVIEW
- HIRING DECISION

# Good Job: Communicating What the Organization Does Not Value

- No Crooks, Drug Use, Unfit, Liars, or People with Mental Problems.
- Contrast with Valuing Critical Thinking, Breadth of Human Experience, Appreciation of Community, Motivated to Make a Difference, Passion for Career.
- Hiring in the Spirit of Service Markets Those Values and Communicates that Message.

# FINDING THE RIGHT PEOPLE— KEEPING THEM

- Traditional approaches—job fairs, college campuses, newspaper ads.
- Advertisements vs. marketing.
- Web-based approaches.
- Learning from the consumer.
- Community-based approaches.
- Recruitment Focus Groups.
- Recruiting Ambassadors.
- Cadet programs.
- Mentoring programs.

# IMPACT ON SELECTION MODELS

- Use of Traditional Selection Methods.
- “Multiple Hurdles” Approach vs “Whole Person”.
- Selecting Out--Selecting In: “What is Wrong” with the Candidate?
- Command and Control Focus.
- Reactive vs. Proactive Enforcement.
- Arrest as Primary Response.
- Homogenized vs. Enhancing Diversity.
- Where Can Change Occur?



# MAJOR CHANGES FROM HSS

## Citizen Involvement: Recruitment and Hiring.

- Had to be more than window dressing or cosmetic value.
- Direct involvement in changing the selection infrastructure....assisted in defining traits and requisite competencies
- Citizens nominated recruits. Community Recruiter Programs.
- Served as voting members of Oral Boards.
- Assisted in crafting the message—"brand".
- Citizen feedback on recruit performance.

# HSS IMPACT ON SELECTION INFRASTRUCTURE

- New Job Analyses with Community Input.
- Identified "Service" Core Competencies.
- Competencies Drive Occupational/Psychological Screening.
- Link Test Scales to Competencies.
- Expanded Characteristics.
- Marketing the Department "Brand" Identifies Type of Candidates Sought.
- Manages Message You Present to the World.

# HSS LESSONS LEARNED

- Commitment From the Top is Essential.
- Internal-External Balance Critical to "Buy-in".
- At Outset Develop a Broad Based Steering Committee.
- Use of Personnel Data Needs to be Treated Carefully,
- New Hiring Models Take Time to Develop and Require Longitudinal Validation.
- Involving the Community-Not As Easy As It Sounds.
- Use of Focus Groups-Complex Process.
- Issues with Web-based Recruitment and Hiring.
- Enhancing Diversity: More than Identifying Diverse Applicant Pool—Keeping Candidates in Process is Equally Important.
- Need to Rely on Community to Assist with This.
- Always Walking Fine Line—Communicating Relevant Information Without Violating Confidentiality and Privacy.
- Changes Did Not Produce Less Qualified Applicants.

# LESSONS LEARNED CTD.

- Marketing--Manages the Message—Defines Who You Are Rather Than Letting Others Define You.
- Affects Whole Department not Just Potential Candidates.
- Build the Base for Change—Create a Critical Mass of Relevant Constituencies.
- Changes in Hiring Affects Other Systems.
- Glossy Brochures Attract Candidates
- In the End It Is What Happens When They Walk Through the Door That Retains Them.
- Opportunity to Get Right People on the Bus—Good to Great.

# CONTACT INFORMATION

Ellen Scrivner, Ph.D.

Director, John Jay Leadership Academy

John Jay College of Criminal Justice

New York, New York

(212) 237-8619