

**FLORIDA KEYS NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**Eco-Discovery Center, Key West, Florida  
December 12<sup>th</sup>, 2006**

**FINAL MINUTES**

**Members Present**

Chris Bergh	Don Kincaid
Jeff Cramer	Martin Moe
Jack Curlett	Krueger Nicholson
Todd Firm	Kathleen Patton
Dolly Garlo	Bruce Popham
Richard Grathwohl	Gary Randolph
Debra Harrison	Brad Simonds
David Hawtof	

**Alternates Present**

Peter Frezza  
Doug Gregory  
Bob Holston

**Call to Order/Approval of Minutes from October 17<sup>th</sup>, 2006/Adoption of Agenda for this Meeting/Introductions**

Chairman Bruce Popham called the meeting to order at 10:08. The minutes were approved as presented. The agenda was adopted as presented. Chair Popham recognized Glenn Patton, acting Executive Director for Sanctuary Friends of the Florida Keys. Regional Director Billy Causey welcomed everyone to the first advisory council meeting in the new facility. Superintendent CDR Dave Score welcomed distinguished guests from Korea Dr Won Duk Yoon of the National Fisheries & Research Development Institute, Ms. Yung Yong Ja of the Ministry of Marine Affairs & Fisheries, and Hong-Sing Yang, Maritime Affairs & Fisheries Division, Seoguipo City. Meeting participants introduced themselves. Bruce Popham drew attention to an article on council member Don Kincaid on the front page of the Key West Citizen. Cassandra Barnes, a NOAA intern conducting research on management plan experiences of council members, was introduced.

**Overview of the Cannon Project – John Halas (FKNMS)**

Mr. Halas gave a PowerPoint presentation on the raising, conservation and display of one of thirteen submerged historic cannons at the Key Largo Chamber of Commerce.

**Public Comment**

There was none. Deborah Harrison moved, seconded by David Hawtof that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council resolves that:

Whereas, H.T. Pontin has been a constant participant in the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Process since its inception; and

Whereas, H.T. Pontin has provided public comment to the Sanctuary Advisory Council for many years; and

Whereas, on this date H.T. Pontin was not in attendance to provide said public comment to the Sanctuary Advisory Council; and

Whereas, it came to the attention of the Sanctuary Advisory Council that this day was H.T. Pontin's 84<sup>th</sup> birthday which was the reason for his absence.

Therefore, the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council passed this resolution wishing H.T. Pontin a very Happy Birthday!

The motion passed unanimously upon roll call vote.

### **Awards**

Bruce Popham, on behalf of council members, Dave Score and Billy Causey presented outgoing council coordinator Fiona Wilmot with an original painting of Bahia Honda by Fran Decker, and a NOAA plaque for more than five years service. Mary Tagliareni was congratulated for being nominated a National Ocean Service Employee of the Year for nearly a decade of inter-agency efforts in coordinating the displays and signage at the Eco-Discovery Center. Officer Scotty LaRosa was awarded for outstanding contributions to law enforcement, particularly personal responsibility for one third of all violations during sport lobster season, and with Officer Tom Hill, 85 Area To Be Avoided violations in the last two years.

### **Sanctuary Superintendent's Report – CDR Dave Score (FKNMS, NOAA Corps)**

CDR Score presented apologies for absence from Cecelia Weaver of South Florida Water Management District, and gave a status update on the algae blooms in Florida Bay. Discussion concerned the request for a presentation at the meeting of pre-storm and post-storm discharge data from C-111 canal for the 2005 season.

Deborah Harrison moved, seconded by Jack Curlett, that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council requests sanctuary managers invite Cecelia Weaver to take an official seat for agency representation on behalf of the South Florida Water Management District on the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council. The motion passed unanimously upon voice vote.

Discussion concerned the Department of Environmental Protection response to Department of Transportation request to use debris from 18 Mile Stretch widening as fill at Carysfort. Further discussion concerned the Memorandum of Understanding between the Fish & Wildlife Conservation Commission and Department of the Interior.

### **Florida Department of Environmental Protection Report – Stephanie Bailenson (FDEP)**

Ms. Bailenson said that the sanctuary's annual report was favorably received by the Governor and Cabinet, and that Secretary Castille, who is retiring, sends thanks to all who participated in that presentation as well as the aides' meeting.

Deborah Harrison moved, seconded by Chris Bergh, that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council requests that sanctuary managers convey to Florida Department of Environmental Protection Secretary, Colleen Castille, a monumental THANK YOU for the leadership, commitment and dedication to securing the entirety of the Tortugas Ecological Reserve, from the mangrove fringe of Loggerhead Key through the nursery seagrass beds, beyond the country's most densely-covered corals and including the critical spawning areas of Riley's Hump. On behalf of this Council, our children and theirs, we express our deepest appreciation. The motion passed unanimously upon voice vote.

Ms. Bailenson reported on the Coastal and Aquatic Managed Areas All Hands meeting which focused on program planning and setting standards for aquatic preserves. She mentioned important legislation passing through congress, and that the Continuing Resolution has been extended until February 15<sup>th</sup>, 2007.

**U.S. Fish & Wildlife Report – Anne Morkill (USFWS)**

Ms. Morkill reported that the service is drafting a comprehensive conservation plan for three lower Keys refuges. There will be an agreement for managing refuge boundaries, with controlled access to some of the islands, where extreme public use is not compatible with preservation and protection. The agreement needs to be reviewed every five years.

**Fish & Wildlife Conservation Commission Report – Bob Glazer (FWRI)**

Mr. Glazer reported on a number of issues recently reviewed by the commission: lobster "casitas"; lobster trap reduction; anchorage in Pine Channel; capture of marine turtles for research and other uses; gillnet loophole provisions; Goliath Grouper stock assessment priority change; Red Tide; increase in recreational fishing license. He spoke of the recent Gulf and Caribbean Fisheries Institute (GCFI) meeting in Belize at which the Sanctuary and Sanctuary Friends hosted a Caribbean Connectivity workshop to provide a stronger and broader understanding of the processes affecting fish in the Florida Keys. As tribute to former Sanctuary Advisory Council member Peter Gladding, the United Nations Environmental Program, Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary and Environmental Defense have contributed to a Peter Gladding Memorial Award to bring outstanding fishermen to GCFI meetings. To date, Don DeMaria from the Keys and other exceptional fishermen from Colombia, Belize, Jamaica and Barbados have received the award.

Bob Glazer was presented with a plaque from the Southeastern Association of Fish and Wildlife Agencies, honoring him as Biologist of the Year, 2006 for his work on queen conch. The plaque, presented by fellow conch biologist Gabriel Delgado of FWRI, is the first to be presented to a marine biologist.

Discussion concerned allocation issues and artificial habitat in the lobster industry. The question of tagging arose.

Deborah Harrison moved, seconded by Richard Grathwohl, that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council requests that sanctuary managers ask the

FFWCC on its behalf for the opportunity to provide formal comment and consultation on any action that could result in the establishment of a pilot program on the legislation of the use of artificial habitats within, or affecting, the resources of the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary. The motion passed unanimously after discussion upon voice vote.

**Law Enforcement Report – LT Ed Maldonado (FWC)**

LT Maldonado said that Capt. Luher is back from medical leave and that there is a new Major, Mike Edwards in the Special Enforcement Area, in which Dade County will be involved with Monroe County. Officer Scotty LaRosa was recognized for outstanding contributions to law enforcement, particularly personal responsibility for one third of all violations during sport lobster season, and with Officer Tom Hill, 85 Area To Be Avoided violations in the last two years. Discussion concerned the out-of-county origin of the majority of violators.

**Ecosystem Restoration Working Group Report – Dr. Peter Frezza (SAC, Audubon)**

Dr. Frezza, reporting for Dr. Jerry Lorenz, commenced with a discussion of the removal of the Lake Surprise roadbed, indicating that there is no ecological need to remove it, since Lake Surprise supports a healthy seagrass ecosystem that is not in need of restoration. Barbara Culhane of Florida Department of Transportation (DOT) contributed with an explanation of the permitting process, which includes a requirement to facilitate boat movement. Information was exchanged between council members and DOT staff, and concerns were expressed regarding future bridge building plans. The upper Keys Guides Association expressed further concerns about disruption causing nutrient releases, particularly if the roadbed is removed before the C-111 canal has been made inactive. Consensus was reached among council members, sanctuary staff and DOT staff that long-term restoration goals need not be compromised by ephemeral processes.

Council members discussed representation of their constituency groups, and requested that when sanctuary staff send out meeting notices, all council members are listed with their seats and contact information in those notices.

The working group produced the following resolution, proposed by Martin Moe, seconded by Richard Grathwohl:

***Resolution Of The Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council Expressing Concern On Proposed Coal Fired Power Plants And The Implications For The Survival Of Our Coral Reefs And the South Florida Environment if IGCC Technology is Not Used In Future Plant Construction***

Whereas, power generation is the single most significant source of CO2 in the United States, accounting for nearly 40% of CO2 emission, and;

Whereas, coal is the most abundant, cheapest, and dirtiest fossil fuel available and the future of electrical generation is coal fired power plants, and;

Whereas, the United States Department of Energy says that 153 new coal fired plants will be built in the US by 2025, and;

Whereas, China will is expected to build 562 new coal fired plants and India is expected to build approximately 213 new coal fired plant over the next 8-25 years and;

Whereas, by 2012, the new coal plants in the US, China, and India combined will send an additional 2.7 billion tons of CO2 into the atmosphere each year, and;

Whereas, John Holden, Professor of Environmental Policy at Harvard, predicts that if all the coal fired plants scheduled to be built over the next 25 years are built, the CO2 emissions from these plants combined after 50 years will equal all the emissions from coal burning in all of human history to date, and;

Whereas, all this CO2 could trigger an average global temperature rise of 10 Degrees F by 2100, causing rise of sea levels of 1.5 feet during this century with the possibility of catastrophic rises of 20 feet due to rapid break up of land based polar icecaps, and;

Whereas, 1.5 degrees Celsius rise in ocean temperatures could cause 95 percent of corals to die and concomitant increasing ocean acidity could doom some of the ocean's smallest organisms which form the base of the marine food chain and cause dramatic changes to the coral reef ecosystem as we know it know, and;

Whereas, there is new clean, efficient base-load electric power generation technology for building coal fired electric plants called Integrated Gasification Combination Cycle (IGCC) which merges gasification with gas cleaning, synthesis gas conversion, and turbine power technologies to produce clean and affordable energy, and;

Whereas, this integration of energy conversion processes provides more complete utilization of energy resources, offering high efficiencies and ultra-low pollution levels and ultimately will be capable of reaching efficiencies of 60 percent with near-zero pollution, and;

Whereas, power plants with IGCC do not burn coal directly but they transform it to gas first and then burn the gas and virtually all the Mercury, Nitrogen oxide, and sulfur dioxide, and CO2 can be scrubbed and removed from the emissions of the plant, and;

Whereas, there 4 such power plants in the world today, the first ever of its kind is near Tampa, Florida, the Polk Power Station which began commercial operations in Sept. 1996 and was built in partnership with Tampa Electric Company and the U.S. Department of Energy, and;

Whereas, roughly the cost of capturing and sequestering CO2 is \$100 a ton, while the cost of removing 2.5 billion tons of CO2 would be 250 billion dollars (not an unreasonable amount considering the value of our environment), and;

Whereas, FP&L has proposed two new 980 MW coal-fired electrical generating units for a 4,900 acre site 5 miles northwest of Moore Haven in Glades County, the largest new coal-fired generating units in the United States and the first major coal-fired power plant in South Florida, and

Whereas, these proposed coal-fired generating units are not IGCC plants but will use super-pulverized coal with wet scrubbers for sulfur-dioxide control and selective catalytic reduction equipment for controlling nitrogen oxide emissions will emit in the range of 10 to 15 Million tons of CO<sub>2</sub> each year, and ;

Whereas, the two new coal-fired units would produce large quantities of emissions of Nitrogen Oxides, Sulfur Dioxides, Mercury, and Particulate Matter, each of which can cause unhealthy air and water pollution and reductions in visibility in Big Cypress and Everglades National Park, and;

Whereas, the two new coal-fired units would be the largest source of carbon dioxide emissions in Florida at a time when concentrations of CO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere are increasing dramatically making Florida particularly vulnerable to the dual effects of global warming, coral bleaching and death, sea level rise and more intense hurricanes, and;

Therefore, The FKNMS Advisory Council resolves that given the critical current situation that emissions of CO<sub>2</sub> by our civilizations pose to the climate and especially the sensitive environment of the Florida Keys and South Florida and that the FKNMS through the FKNMS and Protection Act has the responsibility to protect and preserve living and other resources of the Florida Keys marine environment, and that we have only a very short window of time to prevent total climate disaster and that there are current plans to place two new very large coal fired units in South Florida, that:

1. We request FP&L make a presentation to the SAC and explain how the development of future power plants can be designed and built to best safeguard our environment.
2. We strongly recommend that all coal fired power plants that are built in South Florida utilize IGCC technology and CO<sub>2</sub> sequestering to safeguard our terrestrial and marine environments.

- 1) Moved by Deborah Harrison, seconded by Chris Bergh, passed unanimously upon voice vote.

That the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council requests that sanctuary managers recommend to the Monroe County Board of Council Commissioners that they urgently consider the purchase of the Gulf Seafood site for the preservation of the commercial fishing industry and associated traditional way of life in Key West and the Lower Florida Keys.

After discussion, Dolly Garlo proposed a Friendly Amendment that “future” in recommendation (2) be replaced by “all”, and upon acceptance, the resolution passed unanimously upon roll call vote. Discussion concerned the Government Accounting Office assessment of climate change on federal holdings, and the group of states currently suing the Environmental Protection Agency in the Supreme Court.

**Education & Outreach Working Group – Martin Moe (SAC and Green Turtle Publications)**

Mr. Moe reported on the joint November 17<sup>th</sup> meeting with sanctuary staff and Sanctuary Friends concerning funding for educational programs, and future work on getting an oceans ethic into Florida’s Comprehensive Assessment Test.

Martin Moe proposed the motion, seconded by Chris Bergh that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council recognizes the great importance of the freshwater and marine aquatic resources of this region to our State and Nation and the contribution that the Florida Keys Initiative (FKI), an informal coalition of public non-profit environmental organizations and local, state and federal governments, has made to identify and prioritized water resource projects that are crucial to protect the unique Florida Keys environment. Thus I move that the FKNMS Advisory Council write a letter and urge the Florida Legislature to fund the water resource protection projects identified in the FKWRI’s 2007-2008 appropriations brief. The motion was passed unanimously upon voice vote.

**Water Quality Protection Program Outreach Working Group Report – Cheva Heck (FKNMS)**

Ms. Heck announced the new communications plan for the Water Quality Protection Program, which will be holding Water Quality Awareness Month in February 2007. This will be a coordinated inter-agency campaign with individual, local and regional impacts using a variety of media. It was agreed that advisory council members would benefit from professional media training, with input from program headquarters.

**Shifting Baselines in the Florida Keys:**

**Ecological Extinctions in the Oceans – Dr. Jeremy Jackson (Scripps Institution of Oceanography)**

**Florida Keys Coral Reef Fish Communities, Then and Now – Loren McClenachan (Scripps Institution of Oceanography)**

Dr. Jackson, followed by Ms. McClenachan, gave a PowerPoint presentation to a public audience in the new Eco-Discovery Center auditorium. Audience participation in the question and answer session was engaged and vigorous.

**Panel Discussion with Seasoned Keys Fishermen – facilitated by Doug Gregory (SAC and SeaGrant)**

Gary Sands of Key Largo, Billy Niles of Summerland Key and Tally Atwood of Key West shared memories of conditions past and techniques learned from their fathers, as well as providing a fascinating review of the different fisheries in the Keys during the past century. Discussion concerned the difficulties facing those same fisheries today.

Deborah Harrison moved, seconded by Chris Bergh that the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary Advisory Council requests that sanctuary managers recommend to the Monroe County Board of County Commissioners that they urgently consider the purchase of the Gulf Seafood site for the preservation of the commercial fishing industry and associated traditional way of life in Key West and the Lower Florida Keys. The motion passed unanimously upon voice vote.

**Adjourn 5:30 p.m.**

Submitted respectfully by

Fiona Wilmot