

Feinstein International Center, Tufts University
Impact assessments and reviews in Ethiopia
Updated January 2012

General approach:

- Review of project implementation and M&E data (where available)
- Development of an assumed causal framework, from activity to livelihoods impact
- Systematic use of participatory methods with data summary and analysis using conventional statistical tests (details at <https://wikis.uit.tufts.edu/confluence/display/FIC/Participatory+Impact+Assessment>)
- Use of control groups where possible
- Complemented with conventional benefit-cost analysis (BCA) where relevant/useful

A. Impact assessments before PLI (2000-2004)

Intervention (implementers)	Approach			Key findings/notes
	Participatory methods	Control groups	Benefit cost analysis	
Community-animal health care (FARM Africa), Afar Region	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Substantial reductions in livestock mortality relative to baseline Get report
Community-animal health care (SCUS), Somali Region	+	+	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Statistically significant reductions in disease impacts for diseases treated by CAHWs • CAHWs improved accessibility, acceptance and quality of service relative to other service providers. Get report Get copy of journal paper in <i>Tropical Animal Health and Production</i>

B. Impact assessments and reviews under the Pastoralist Livelihoods Initiative (from 2006)

Intervention (implementers)	Approach			Key findings/notes
	Participatory methods	Control groups	Benefit cost analysis	
Slaughter destocking (CARE), Borana	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Late implementation; lessons for rapid use of 'crisis modifier' • Some livelihoods impact Download report
Commercial destocking (SCUS, GoE, private traders), Moyale	+	-	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Substantial livelihoods impact arising from cash derived from cattle sales • Substantial benefit-cost ratio estimated at 41:1. Download PLI Policy Brief Get copy of <i>Disasters</i> journal paper
Livestock feed supplementation (CARE), Borana	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No conclusive findings; M&E data not available for triangulation Report not finalized/available
Livestock feed supplementation (CARE & FAO) Afar Region	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Herders already buying feed from private suppliers before CARE/FAO implementation • Assessment stopped as difficult to disaggregate impact of privately-supplied feed from aid-related feed. Report not finalized/available

Intervention (implementers)	Approach			Key findings/notes
	Participatory methods	Control groups	Benefit cost analysis	
Livestock feed supplementation (SCUS), Borana	+	+	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Late implementation; good livelihoods impact in terms of reduced mortality of core breeding stock, calf survival and milk off-take. Benefit-cost ratios from 1.6:1 to 1.9:1. Download PLI Policy Brief November 2007 Download PLI Policy Brief August 2008 Download report
Community-animal health care; restocking; water; conflict management (Mercy Corps), Somali Region	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mid-term review of implementation Get report
Livestock vaccination (various NGOs, FAO, GoE), Afar, Borana and Somali areas	+	+	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No impact of vaccination on mortality Mortality data indicated potentially positive benefit-cost ratio if vaccination strategies and implementation could be improved. Get report Get PLI guideline on vaccination Get a copy of Disasters journal paper
Livestock market construction (ACDI/VOCA), Afar, Borana and Somali areas	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only 20% of new market facilities being used High levels of livestock trading taking place outside the markets in 70% of locations Use of physical force by local police or militia plus new taxes hindered use of new markets No evidence of increased sales; limited benefit-cost expected. Get report
Human health care (SCUS), Somali Region	+	+	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Limited impact over 5 years on child vaccination coverage, breast-feeding behaviour and knowledge of HIV transmission. Health outcomes not measured in the project M&E system e.g. impact of trained TBAs. Good potential role of CHWs if clinical tasks expanded. Special problems of healthcare access for women and girls. Get report
Cash-for-work (Mercy Corps, SCUUK – RAIN), Somali Region	-	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mid-term review of levels of cash transfer combined with economic modelling Limited impact of RAIN CFW approach predicted, on asset protection, asset building, livelihoods diversification. Get report

Intervention (implementers)	Approach			Key findings/notes
	Participatory methods	Control groups	Benefit cost analysis	
Small-scale irrigation (CHF International), Somali Region	+	+	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Negative cost-benefit for aid-assisted pump-based irrigation in Gode. Get report
Livestock market construction (ACDI/VOCA), Afar, Borana and Somali areas	+	-	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Follow-up assessment to Sept 08. Limited impact – recommend to USAID no further investment in market infrastructure. Get report
Community-based rangeland enclosures Borana and Somali areas	+	-	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to critically examine benefits to poorer herders Far wider/stronger trend is private enclosures Get report
Privatized community animal health care after 15 years (various), Somali Region	+	+	-	In progress

C. Impact assessment of the PSNP Plus program

A longitudinal impact assessment in three regions of the PSNP Plus program, implemented by CARE, SCUK, CRS and REST. Uses control groups; various mid-term reports available.

Intervention (implementers)	Approach			Key findings/notes
	Participatory methods	Quantitative /Survey	Control groups	
Baseline and mid term in Doba	+	+	- (Constructed an ex post control by filtering data)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Significant decrease in assets due to rain-failure Project implementation delayed Rain dependent (on farm) interventions are risky for the poor and may increase debt and vulnerability Informal microfinance does not appear to build assets Livestock –key wealth indicator in highland areas –draft animals are linked to on farm productive capacity Download report
Baseline in Sire & Dodota	+	+	+	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Project implementation barely started Decrease in livestock assets due to drought Rescreening of PSNP participants Download report
Baseline and mid term assessment in Raya Azebo	+	+	+ -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Significant increase in livestock assets for intervention samples (although partly attributed to direct asset transfers) Asset increases largely attributed to project interventions Project affected by drought in 2009 Download report