

Cumulative Hydrologic Impact Assessment
Of the
BHP Billiton Navajo Coal Company
Navajo Mine

Prepared By



Office of Surface Mining Reclamation and Enforcement
Indian Program Branch, Program Support Division
Western Region Office – Denver, Colorado
March 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	6
LIST OF TABLES	7
LIST OF APPENDICES	8
LIST OF ACRONYMS	9
1 INTRODUCTION	10
1.1 Regulatory Environment.....	12
1.1.1 CHIA Revision Rationale	13
1.1.2 Cumulative Impact Area	13
1.1.3 Material Damage to the Hydrologic Balance.....	13
1.1.4 Material Damage Criteria.....	14
1.2 Background.....	14
1.2.1 Climate.....	15
1.2.2 Regional Geology	15
2 DELINEATION OF CUMULATIVE IMPACT AREA.....	22
2.1 Surface Water Cumulative Impact Area	22
2.1.1 Cumulative Surface Water Impact Potential.....	22
2.1.2 Impact Potential to the San Juan River	26
2.1.3 Impact Potential to the Chaco River	30
2.1.4 Surface Water Impact Area.....	31
2.2 Ground Water Cumulative Impact Area	32
2.2.1 Ground Water Impact Area.....	32
3 WATER RESOURCE USES AND DESIGNATIONS	37
3.1 Direct Human Use.....	37
3.2 Industrial Supply Water	38
3.3 Irrigation Supply Water	39
3.4 Livestock Supply Water.....	40
3.5 Aquatic and Wildlife Habitat Water Supply	41
4 BASELINE HYDROLOGIC CONDITIONS.....	46
4.1 Surface Water.....	46
4.1.1 Surface Water Regulatory Requirements.....	46
4.1.2 Surface Water Regime	47
4.1.3 El Segundo Mine.....	47
4.1.4 Morgan Lake.....	47

4.1.5	Chaco River	50
4.1.5.1	Surface Water Quantity.....	50
4.1.5.2	Surface Water Quality.....	50
4.1.5.2.1	Methodology	50
4.1.5.2.2	Analysis	52
4.1.6	Historic Mining Area North of the BNCC permit	52
4.1.7	Navajo Mine.....	52
4.1.7.1	Surface Water Baseline Quantity	52
4.1.7.1.1	Morgan Lake-Chaco River Watershed	56
4.1.7.1.2	Chinde Wash Watershed.....	56
4.1.7.1.3	Chinde Wash-Chaco River Watershed	56
4.1.7.1.4	Coal Creek-Chaco River Watershed.....	57
4.1.7.1.5	Cottonwood Arroyo Watershed	57
4.1.7.2	Surface Water Baseline Quality	57
4.1.7.2.1	Baseline with NAPI	58
4.1.7.2.1.1	Chinde Wash.....	58
4.1.7.2.1.2	Cottonwood Arroyo	59
4.1.7.2.2	Baseline without NAPI.....	60
4.2	Ground Water.....	61
4.2.1	Ground Water Regulatory Requirements.....	61
4.2.2	Chaco River Alluvium	61
4.2.3	Historic Mining Area North of the BNCC permit	62
4.2.4	Navajo Mine.....	65
4.2.4.1	Alluvial Baseline Quantity.....	65
4.2.4.2	Alluvial Baseline Quality.....	66
4.2.4.3	Fruitland Formation Baseline Quantity.....	67
4.2.4.4	Fruitland Formation Baseline Quality.....	68
4.2.4.5	Pictured Cliffs Sandstone Aquifer Baseline Quantity.....	69
4.2.4.6	Pictured Cliffs Sandstone Aquifer Baseline Quality.....	69
5	HYDROLOGIC IMPACT ASSESSMENTS	73
5.1	Minimization of Impact	73
5.2	Monitoring Program.....	73
5.2.1.1	Monitoring Program Updates.....	74
5.3	Impact Assessment.....	76
5.3.1	Potential Cumulative Impact between BNCC and El Segundo Mine.....	79
5.3.2	Potential Impact of BNCC operations on NAPI	79

5.3.3	Potential Impact of BNCC Operations on Morgan Lake and APS	79
5.3.4	Chaco River	80
5.3.4.1	Surface Water Quantity.....	80
5.3.4.2	Surface Water Quality.....	81
5.3.4.3	Chaco River Alluvium	82
5.3.5	Historic Mining Area North of the BNCC permit	82
5.3.5.1	Surface Water.....	82
5.3.5.2	Alluvium	83
5.3.5.3	Fruitland Formation and PCS	84
5.3.5.3.1	CCB Disposal	85
5.3.6	Navajo Mine.....	88
5.3.6.1	Surface Water Quantity.....	88
5.3.6.1.1	Morgan Lake-Chaco River Watershed	89
5.3.6.1.2	Chinde Wash Watershed.....	90
5.3.6.1.3	Chinde-Chaco River Watershed	91
5.3.6.1.4	Coal Creek-Chaco River Watershed.....	92
5.3.6.1.5	Cottonwood Arroyo Watershed	94
5.3.6.2	Surface Water Quality.....	95
5.3.6.2.1	Chinde Wash.....	96
5.3.7	Groundwater	97
5.3.7.1	Alluvium	97
5.3.7.1.1	Alluvial Quantity	97
5.3.7.1.2	Alluvial Quality	99
5.3.7.1.2.1	Bighan Alluvium.....	100
5.3.7.1.2.2	Chinde Wash Alluvium	100
5.3.7.1.2.3	Cottonwood Arroyo Alluvium.....	103
5.3.7.2	Fruitland Formation Quantity	104
5.3.7.3	Fruitland Formation Quality	105
5.3.7.4	Pictured Cliffs Sandstone Quantity.....	107
5.3.7.5	Pictured Cliffs Sandstone Quality.....	108
6	MATERIAL DAMAGE.....	110
6.1	Cumulative Impact of BNCC and El Segundo Mine	110
6.2	BNCC Impact on NAPI	110
6.3	BNCC Impact to Morgan Lake and APS.....	110
6.4	Chaco River	110
6.5	Historic Mining North of the BNCC Permit.....	111

6.6	Navajo Mine.....	111
6.6.1	Material Damage Assessment.....	113
6.6.1.1	Surface Water.....	113
6.6.1.2	Alluvium	114
6.6.1.3	Fruitland Formation and PCS	114
6.6.2	Conclusion	114
7	WORKS CITED	115

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: BNCC Navajo Mine Areas.....	17
Figure 2: Navajo Mine Location Map.....	18
Figure 3: San Juan Basin Structural Geology	19
Figure 4: Navajo Mine and Surrounding Area Stratigraphy	20
Figure 5: Surface Geology Map, NW New Mexico	21
Figure 6: Primary Drainages and HUC 12 Watersheds	23
Figure 7: General location of coal mines within the San Juan Watershed.....	24
Figure 8: Historic and Existing USGS Gaging Stations, San Juan Watershed	27
Figure 9: San Juan River Discharge and Mine Operational Period Comparison (1931-2010).....	28
Figure 10: San Juan River TDS and Mine Operational Period Comparison (1957-2010).....	29
Figure 11: Surface Water CIA and Non-BNCC Surface Water Impoundments.....	34
Figure 12: Groundwater CIA and Non-BNCC use Wells.....	35
Figure 13: Non-BNCC Surface Water Impoundments within the vicinity of Navajo Mine.....	43
Figure 14: Select Tributary Irrigation Project Lands	45
Figure 15: PCS Potentiometric surface and Outcrop Location	49
Figure 16: Baseline Monthly Flow along the Chaco River.....	50
Figure 17: Surface Water Monitoring Locations	54
Figure 18: SEDCAD Routing Subwatersheds for the Chinde-Chaco River and Coal Creek Watersheds ..	55
Figure 19: Groundwater Monitoring Locations	63
Figure 20: Potentiometric Surface for the No. 3 Coal Seam.....	71
Figure 21: Potentiometric Surface for the No. 8 Coal Seam.....	72
Figure 22: Chinde Diversion and Monitoring Locations	77
Figure 23: Monthly Flow along the Chaco River	81
Figure 24: Custer Water Elevations	84
Figure 25: Approximate Historic CCB Disposal	87
Figure 26: Percentage of the Morgan Lake-Chaco River Watershed Managed by Impoundments.....	89
Figure 27: Percentage of the Chinde-Chaco River Watershed Managed by Impoundments.....	92
Figure 28: Percentage of the Coal Creek Watershed Managed by Impoundments	94
Figure 29: Percentage of the Cottonwood Arroyo Watershed Managed by Impoundments	95
Figure 30: Chinde and Bighan Alluvial Water Elevations.....	99
Figure 31: Chinde Alluvium Concentrations over Time.....	103
Figure 32: Post-Mining Potentiometric Surface in the PCS Aquifer (BNCC 2011)	109

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Navajo Mine – Material Damage Summary	11
Table 2: Mining History in the San Juan Watershed	25
Table 3: Surface Water Criteria	51
Table 4: Chinde-Wash Chaco River Sub-Watershed Details.....	56
Table 5: Coal Creek Sub-Watershed Details	57
Table 6: Proposed Chinde Alluvium Monitoring (BNCC 2012).....	76
Table 7: Impact Assessment and Designation Methodology.....	78
Table 8: Comparison of Pre-Mine and Post-Mine Peak Flows in the Chinde Wash Watershed (BNCC 2011).....	91
Table 9: Comparison of Pre-Mine and Post-Mine Peak Flows in Chinde-Chaco River Watershed.....	92
Table 10: Comparison of Pre-Mine and Post-Mine Peak Flows in Chinde-Chaco River Watershed.....	93
Table 11: Comparison of Pre-mine and Post-Mine Peak Flows in the Cottonwood Arroyo Watershed (BNCC 2011).....	95
Table 12: Material Damage Limits and Hydrologic Balance Thresholds.....	112
Table 13: Assessment of Material Damage for the Waters of the Navajo Mine	113

LIST OF APPENDICES

- Appendix A: USGS Data for the San Juan River
- Appendix B: Water Uses
- Appendix C: Navajo Mine Impoundments
- Appendix D: Surface Water Data Summary
- Appendix E: SEDCAD Modeling Reports
- Appendix F: Groundwater Data Summary
- Appendix G: Coal Combustion Byproducts Assessment

LIST OF ACRONYMS

%RSD	Percent Relative Standard Deviation
AOC	Approximate Original Contour
APS	Arizona Public Service
AST	Above-Ground Storage Tank
BIA	Bureau of Indian Affairs
BLM	Bureau of Land Management
BMP	Best Management Practice
BNCC	BHP Navajo Coal Company
CCB	Coal Combustion Byproduct
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
CHIA	Cumulative Hydrologic Impact Assessment
CIA	Cumulative Impact Area
CWA	Clean Water Act
FCPP	Four Corners Power Plant
HUC	Hydrologic Unit Code
LOM	Life-of-Mine
MAD	Median Absolute Deviation
MSL	Mean Sea Level
NAPI	Navajo Agricultural Products Industry
NHD	National Hydrologic Database
NIST	National Institute of Standards and Technology
NMEMNRD	New Mexico Energy Minerals and Natural Resource Division
NNEPA	Navajo Nation Environmental Protection Agency
NPDES	National Pollution Discharge Elimination System
OSMRE	Office of Surface Mining Reclamation and Enforcement
PAP	Permit Application Package
PCS	Pictured Cliff Sandstone
PHC	Probable Hydrologic Consequences
SMCRA	Surface Mining Control and Reclamation Act of 1977
TDS	Total Dissolved Solids
TOJ	Termination of Jurisdiction
TSS	Total Suspended Solids
USEPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency
USGS	United States Geological Survey
VWP	Vibrating Wire Piezometer