

# **Appendix B: Area of Critical Environmental Concern (ACEC) Comparison Tables**

Table B-1. Kigluaik ACEC and Mount Osborn ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table.	B-3
Table B-2. Western Arctic Caribou Herd Calving and Insect Relief Habitat ACEC– Alternative Comparison Table.....	B-6
Table B-3. McCarthy’s Marsh ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table .....	B-9
Table B-4. Kuzitrin River ACEC—Alternative Comparison Table .....	B-11
Table B-5. Nulato Hills ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table .....	B-13
Table B-6. Shaktoolik, Ungalik, and Inglutalik Watershed ACECs–Alternative Comparison Table.....	B-15



**Table B-1. Kigluaik ACEC and Mount Osborn ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Kigluaik Mountains as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (382,000 acres)* Under this alternative, the larger Kigluaik Mountains area would be designated.	Under this alternative, only the smaller Mount Osborn Area would be designated as an ACEC, and then only after conveyances are completed.	If sizable contiguous blocks of land remain in BLM ownership after conveyance, designate Mount Osborn as an ACEC (Map 2-21) (82,000 acres)*
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lb GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through activity plan.	Limited designation. Manage OHV use consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses (limits OHVs to vehicles under 1,500 lbs curb weight and staying on existing trails when possible).	Limited designation. Develop an OHV management plan which may implement limitations such as designated trails or seasonal closures.
<b>Recreation Management</b>	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis	Same as Alternative A	May limit # SRPs or #VUD and may require permits for transporters if conflicts occur.	Do not limit # SRPs or #VUD; do not require transporters to obtain permits.	May implement limits on #SRPs or VUD, or implement additional permitting requirements through activity plan.

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Fluid Mineral Leasing</b>	Mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to leasing subject to Leasing Stipulations and applicable ROPs.	Closed	Closed by segregations for State- and Native-selections.	Same as Alternative B
<b>Solid Mineral Exploration</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs except SS-4 would not apply.	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B except ROP SS-4 would apply.
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs except SS-4 would not apply.	Closed. Retain (d)(1) withdrawal until such time as a new withdrawal from mineral entry and location is completed for the area.	Closed by segregations for State- and Native-selections.	Same as Alternative B except ROP SS-4 would apply.
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPS	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Not allowed	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A
<b>Rights-of-way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	ROW avoidance area; limit communication site ROW to existing sites.	Consider on a case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Segregated due to selections or withdrawn under various PLOs; not currently identified as available for disposal.	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Segregated due to selections.	Retain
<b>Grazing</b>	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Closed	Open-reindeer grazing only	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designations	Mount Osborn VRM class II; remainder is VRM class III	Mostly VRM class II; small area VRM class III	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B

\*Under Alternative C, the entire Kigluaik Mountain Range would be considered for ACEC designation. Under Alternative D, only the Mount Osborn area would be considered for designation as an ACEC. Final acreage is dependant upon results of conveyance.

**Table B-2. Western Arctic Caribou Herd Calving and Insect Relief Habitat ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate calving and critical insect relief habitat for the Western Arctic Caribou Herd as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (2,893,000 acres*)	Designate approx. 868,000 acres of unencumbered BLM lands in the calving and critical insect relief habitat for the Western Arctic Caribou Herd as an ACEC. No ACEC designation on State- or Native-selected lands.	Following adjudication of all selected lands, adjust ACEC boundaries to incorporate additional unencumbered BLM lands, into the ACEC (Map 2-21) (1,529,000 acres*)
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lb GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through activity plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State’s Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lb GVWR yearlong.	Limited designation: cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lb GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limits may be developed through activity plans based upon resource values and management objectives. Limitations may included designated trails, seasonal restrictions or closures, or GVWR limits.
<b>Recreation Management</b>	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRP applications on case-by-case basis	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Fluid Mineral Leasing</b>	Closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs. Oil and gas leasing stipulations #6 and #7 would not apply.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to special stipulations and all ROPs; 300' NSO setback on Kivalina River; Develop habitat management plan before leasing.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
<b>Solid Mineral Exploration</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs.	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs except FW-3c and FW-7a would not apply.	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Same as Alternative B except all ROPS would apply; ROP-7a would apply to the Kivalina River. In addition, a mining plan of operations would be required.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPS	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of mineral materials from riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Not allowed	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A

Management Actions	Alternatives				
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
<b>Rights-of-Way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A; plus designate the Red Dog-Kuchiak Mine ROW Corridor.	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A. Plus develop measures to minimize impacts to caribou movements from ROW	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Segregated or withdrawn under (d)(1); not identified as available for disposal.	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Segregated due to selections	Retain
<b>Grazing</b>	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Closed	Same as Alternative C	Same as Alternative C
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designations	VRM Class IV	Mixture of VRM class II and class III	Mostly VRM class IV; VRM class II and III near Kivalina River.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
<b>Wildlife Management</b>	Consider impacts to wildlife habitat on project specific basis and develop appropriate mitigation measures	Same as Alternative A	Develop habitat management plan to mitigate impacts to caribou habitat from resource uses.	Same as Alternative C	Same as Alternative C

\* Final acreage is dependent upon results of conveyance and will be considerably less than indicated in this table.



**Table B-3. McCarthy's Marsh ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate McCarthy's Marsh as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (131,000 acres*)	No ACEC designation
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lb GVWR yearlong.
<b>Recreation Management</b>	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
<b>Fluid Mineral Leasing</b>	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs. 300' NSO setback on Fish River.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to special stipulations and ROPs.
<b>Solid Mineral Exploration</b>	Open	Open subject to applicable ROPs	Closed	Same as Alternative B
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to applicable ROPs.	Closed	Same as Alternative B
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Same as Alternative B

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A
<b>Rights-of-Way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Segregated or withdrawn; not identified as available for disposal	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>Grazing</b>	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	closed	closed
<b>Fire</b>	Manage per approved fire management plan	Develop fire management objectives through activity plan to protect lichen habitat.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designation	VRM class IV	VRM class II	VRM class III and IV

\*Final acreage may be less depending on results of conveyance.

**Table B-4. Kuzitrin River ACEC—Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Kuzitrin River as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (141,000 acres*)	No ACEC designation
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong.
<b>Recreation Management</b>	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Limit # VUD associated with SRPs and require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
<b>Fluid Mineral Leasing</b>	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs; 300' NSO setback on Kuzitrin River.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to special stipulations; 300' NSO setback on the Kuzitrin River.
<b>Solid Mineral Exploration</b>	Open	Open subject to applicable ROPs. ROP FW-7a would not apply.	Closed	Same as Alternative B, except ROP FW-7a would apply.
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Currently closed under a combination of d(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native-selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to applicable ROPs. ROP FW-7a would not apply.	Closed	Same as Alternative B except ROP FW-7a would apply.

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A
<b>Rights-of-Way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Segregated or withdrawn; not identified as available for disposal	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>Grazing</b>	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	closed	closed
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designation	VRM class IV	VRM class II	VRM class III

\*Final acreage may be less depending on results of conveyance.

**Table B-5. Nulato Hills ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Nulato Hills as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (2,044,000 acres)*	Designate N. Nulato hills as ACEC (Map 2-21) (1,080,000 acres)*
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State’s Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limitations may be developed through ACEC plan.
<b>Recreation Management</b>	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized ROS class and consistent with ROS table for the Extensive Recreation Management Area (Table 2-13)
<b>Fluid Leasable Minerals</b>	Northern part mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections; Southern part mostly open except for segregation of State-selected lands.	Revoke withdrawals; open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs; 300’ NSO setback on Ungalik, Inglutalik, and Shaktoolik Rivers.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to special stipulations. Develop habitat management plan before leasing.
<b>Solid Mineral Exploration</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs except FW-3e would not apply.	Closed	Open subject to ROPs. FW-3e would apply.

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Mostly open to locatable mineral entry and location; portions segregated due to State-selections.	Open subject to ROPs	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Open subject to ROPs and mining plan. Area specific ROP FW-3e would apply.
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPS	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of mineral materials from riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A
<b>Rights-of-Way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative C
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; Not identified as available for disposal.	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>Grazing</b>	Open to grazing; applications considered on a case-by-case basis	Open	Closed	Portion within existing grazing allotments would remain open: remainder closed.
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designation	VRM Class IV	VRM Class II	VRM Class IV
<b>Wildlife Management</b>	Buckland Valley Habitat Management Plan applies.	Same as Alternative A	Develop management plan for ACEC to mitigate impacts to caribou habitat from resource uses and address fire management in lichen habitats	Same as Alternative C

\*Boundary of ACEC varies between Alternatives. Under Alternative C, this ACEC includes the Ungalik, Inglutalik, and Shaktoolik watersheds. Final acreage will vary depending on results of conveyance.

**Table B-6. Shaktoolik, Ungalik, and Inglutalik Watershed ACECs—Alternative Comparison Table**

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Decision</b>	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	These watersheds would be included in the Nulato Hills ACEC	Designate Shaktoolik (234,000 acres), Inglutalik (466,000 acres), and Ungalik (264,000 acres) watersheds as ACECs* (Map 2-21)
<b>Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)</b>	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limitations may be developed through ACEC plan.
<b>Special Recreation Use Permits</b>	Issue SRP case-by-case	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
<b>Fluid Leasable Minerals</b>	Mostly open; some segregated due to State-selection	Open subject to ROPs and oil and gas leasing stipulations. Except ROP FW-7a would not apply.	Closed	Open subject to special stipulations; all ROPs and oil and gas leasing stipulations would apply; 300' NSO setback on all three rivers
<b>Solid Leasables</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs, except ROP FW-7a would not apply.	Closed	Same Alternative B, except ROP FW-7a would apply within 300 feet of all three rivers.

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
<b>Locatable Minerals</b>	Mostly open; some segregated due to State-selection.	Open subject to ROPs except ROP FW-7a would not apply.	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Open subject to ROPs and mining plan; ROP FW-7a would apply on all three rivers.
<b>Mineral Material Sales</b>	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of federally administered mineral materials from riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B
<b>FLPMA and R&amp;PP Leases</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A
<b>Rights-of-Way</b>	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A
<b>Disposal Actions</b>	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; Not identified as available for disposal.	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; retain after selections lifted.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
<b>Grazing</b>	Open to grazing; applications considered on a case-by-case basis	Open	Closed	Portion within existing grazing allotments would remain open; remainder closed
<b>VRM</b>	No VRM designations	VRM Class IV	VRM Class II	VRM Class II along Ungalik River; Class III remainder.

\*Final acreage will change depending on results of conveyance.