

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

PUBLIC WORKSHOP:
TECHNOLOGIES FOR PROTECTING PERSONAL INFORMATION:
THE CONSUMER EXPERIENCE

Wednesday, May 14, 2003

7:30 a.m.

Federal Trade Commission
Conference Center
601 New Jersey Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C.

For The Record, Inc.
Waldorf, Maryland
(301)870-8025

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

I N D E X

1

2

3

4 Welcoming Remarks -- Page 3

5

6 Panel 1: Consumer Tools for Managing the Collection and
7 Use of Personal Information -- Page 24

8

9 Panel 2: Consumer Tools for Managing Information
10 Security -- Page 99

11

12 Introductory Remarks for Afternoon Panels -- Page 164

13

14 Panel 3: Making Effective Use of Technology:
15 Understanding Consumer Behavior -- Page 170

16

17 Panel 4: Building Protections into the Architecture of
18 Identity Management Systems -- Page 249

19

20 Panel 5: Building Security into the Architecture for
21 Safer Computing -- Page 317

22

23 Closing Remarks -- Page 363

24

25

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - - - -

WELCOMING REMARKS

MS. LEVIN: Good morning. Welcome to the Federal Trade Commission's public workshop on "Technologies for Protecting Personal Information: The Consumer Experience." This is a first day of a two-day program. I hope you will return on June 4th to explore the business experience.

My name is Toby Levin. I am an attorney in the Division of Financial Practices, and in addition to being one of the moderators for today, I have the extended duty of making just a few administrative announcements.

First of all, I want to just point you to the exits that are behind you. And know that if, in the unlikely event there is an emergency of any sort, we will get back to you from the podium with the appropriate information, but just make you aware that there are exits behind you.

Secondly, please wear your badges throughout the day. If you exit the building for any reason, you will have to return through security, even if you have your badges on. So we recommend that you stay close by. We have refreshments for you for the morning here. And keep your badges on at all times.

1 And secondly, here is your first test, to see
2 how much of a technologist you really are. If you have a
3 cell phone, please turn it off now. That will make the
4 program more enjoyable for all of us.

5 Okay. With that, it's my pleasure to introduce
6 Howard Beales, the Director of the Bureau of Consumer
7 Protection.

8 MR. BEALES: Thank you, Toby. I am actually
9 here as a stand-in for Chairman Muris. As we begin a
10 workshop about technology, it's perhaps useful to
11 understand the limits of technology, because Chairman
12 Muris was supposed to be here by videotape, but instead,
13 here I am with Chairman Muris's remarks.

14 Usually I would have to say that the views are
15 my own, and not those of the Commission or any
16 commissioner, but I guess today they are the views of the
17 chairman, and not of any other commissioner or the staff.

18 But I want to welcome you, on Chairman Muris's
19 behalf, to the first day of the FTC's Public Workshop on
20 Technologies for Protecting Personal Information.
21 Although the chairman couldn't be with you in person,
22 technology was supposed to enable him to share with you
23 his strong interest in this forum, and his thanks to the
24 participants who have come to the Commission to share
25 their expertise and perspectives.

1 I also want to thank everyone in the audience,
2 whom we hope will carry back with them a better
3 understanding of the issues that frame today's full
4 agenda.

5 This is the latest in a series of FTC workshops
6 designed to explore the wide range of privacy issues
7 affecting consumers. Just two weeks ago, we held a
8 highly successful forum to examine the many challenges
9 presented by spam. Today, we turn to another topic of
10 interest in the privacy community: what role technology
11 plays in helping consumers and businesses protect
12 consumer information.

13 We have heard a lot about the promise of
14 technology for protecting privacy. We want to look more
15 closely at whether, and to what extent, consumers and
16 businesses are using these technologies. We will examine
17 technologies that are available to both consumers and
18 businesses.

19 The session today will focus on consumer
20 technologies, and our June 4th session will focus on
21 business technologies. During both sessions, we will
22 consider technologies designed to manage consumer
23 information, including technologies such as P3P, designed
24 to honor consumer privacy preferences.

25 We will also evaluate technologies designed to

1 keep consumer information secure. As part of the
2 discussion of security technologies, we also plan to
3 examine whether there have been advances in information
4 security since our workshop on this topic last year.

5 Our goal is more than listing the available
6 technology. We want to explore the potential and limits
7 of technology for both consumers and businesses. Have
8 privacy technologies, including those designed to keep
9 information secure, succeeded in the marketplace? Why,
10 or why not? What does research on consumer behavior tell
11 us about how consumers will likely use these
12 technologies? Are certain types of consumer technologies
13 more likely to succeed in the market than others?

14 For businesses, what role does technology play,
15 as opposed to policies and practices? What challenges
16 can and cannot be addressed by technology?

17 Today's workshop, in conjunction with the one
18 on June 4th, should shed some light on these questions.
19 It should give us greater understanding of the role of
20 technology in this important area. We have, today, some
21 of the finest researchers and technologists in the field.
22 We look forward to your participation, and thank you
23 again for joining us.

24 And now, it's my pleasure to introduce
25 Commissioner Orson Swindle, who has played a key role in

1 this workshop, and in our workshop on information
2 security, roughly a year ago. Commissioner Swindle.

3 COMMISSIONER SWINDLE: Thank you, Howard, and
4 thank you all for being here. Our audience is somewhat
5 smaller and perhaps less confrontational than one we had
6 a couple of weeks ago.

7 So, you are all the pros in the business, and
8 you're busy trying to find solutions, and we appreciate
9 not only your help in finding those solutions, but in
10 your help and your participation in this conference. And
11 I think, from each other, we should learn a lot of
12 things.

13 Bob Liscouski is going to be a real treat for
14 you. I just met Bob a couple of days ago. I found him
15 to be pleasant, a pro, and extremely well qualified for
16 the task that he has been assigned, and that's being
17 Assistant Secretary for Infrastructure Protection.
18 That's an extremely large title.

19 As I said, I found him pleasant, a
20 professional, and qualified. He has had a career in law
21 enforcement, criminal investigation, software
22 development, information management, consulting, and
23 perhaps the most important job he has had in his entire
24 life, it was for Coca Cola, a good George company which
25 I'm familiar with, as the director for information

1 assurance.

2 And we all know what a success that is. So
3 it's nice to have a guy walk in to a new job with awesome
4 responsibilities, and have those kind of qualifications.

5 He understands what we, at the FTC, understand,
6 that this whole concept of protecting the critical
7 infrastructure of this country is a multi-tiered process.
8 It's like a big triangle, and at the bottom of that
9 triangle are 200 or so million consumers in this country.
10 And they are using computers.

11 So, therefore, they are linked to the other --
12 the entire structure. They play a role, and if we think
13 in terms of the strong -- the chain being only as strong
14 as its weakest link, we have a lot of potential weakest
15 links out there. It's a target-rich environment, as we
16 know.

17 And I think, as many of you heard me say in the
18 past, the solutions to these problems that we face are
19 never going to be found. But we're going to solve many
20 problems en route. It's a journey, and not a
21 destination. There will be many leaders along that road,
22 that journey. You are some of them.

23 And for that, we always need people who can
24 inspire and cajole in government -- cajole those in the
25 private sector to do what they're most capable of doing,

1 finding the best solutions, as opposed to government
2 coming in and trying to do it itself.

3 One of the leaders in that effort, on behalf of
4 Secretary Ridge, is going to be Assistant Secretary
5 Robert Liscouski. Bob, thank you very much for coming
6 over.

7 (Applause.)

8 MR. LISCOUSKI: You might want to wait until I
9 talk. You might not like my speech, so just hold any
10 kind of applause. Orson, thanks for your invitation to
11 come here this morning. And importantly, also for the
12 opportunity to speak. I think it's real important.

13 And I think, when I listen to the introduction,
14 it sounds like I can't hold a job, but I think the
15 reality of it is kind of the way I got here this morning.
16 My function at DHS really allows me to understand the
17 connection at the local level.

18 And when Orson is talking about the foundation,
19 we've got 200 million users out there of computer
20 technology. Long before I ever got involved in the
21 computer world, my law enforcement experience allowed me
22 to recognize the fact that everything we do is local.
23 And while I represent a national strategy for securing
24 cyber space putting your finger on what cyber space is
25 all about is pretty difficult to do.

1 But when we talk about the connection between a
2 national strategy and the business community, and the
3 ultimate end-user relationship, that's why I go back to
4 my law enforcement experience at the local level. It's
5 all local. It all occurs at the keyboard.

6 I've got some prepared remarks, and I've got a
7 colleague of mine that's with me this morning that knows
8 that I often never pay attention to them. But I will use
9 them as a framework to kind of work from to allow you to
10 talk.

11 I want to talk to you about what DHS is doing,
12 and then what our role, not just within federal
13 government, but at the local level, is all about, trying
14 to generate interest and awareness for security, both
15 within the business community and at the consumer level.

16 So, a lot of my remarks are really going to be
17 geared at the efforts we're engaged in, and particularly
18 with Orson's group at the FTC, to raise the awareness
19 levels at the consumer level.

20 A little bit about my background. As Orson
21 indicated, I have been in the private sector. And it's
22 very apparent to me that with respect to the private
23 sector, we have the opportunity in the business community
24 of engaging in a way at the consumer level to not just
25 fulfill our responsibilities to ensure we've got the

1 right business process, and the right technologies, to
2 assure the consumer we can protect their privacy. We
3 have a responsibility to our shareholders to do the right
4 things as a company, to ensure we've got the right
5 competitive advantage to offer to consumers who have a
6 choice.

7 And I think that's probably where the nexus of
8 the private sector and the consumer really comes, as it's
9 all about choice. The consumer goes to any industry, I
10 don't care if it's a bank or if it's a credit card,
11 online shopping with American Express, or a small retail
12 store that's got an outlet on the web. The more aware
13 consumers are about what their capabilities are in making
14 choices, and how people can protect them from identity
15 theft and fraud, the more apt they are to make choices to
16 go with companies that are capable of providing that
17 assurance that they will protect them from fraud, that
18 they will protect their privacy.

19 So, that awareness level is really, from my
20 perspective, fundamental to everything we do to allowing
21 consumers to understand that the choices that they make
22 and with whom they do business is going to be a key
23 market driver for the industries, many of which you
24 represent today.

25 So, let me first give you an understanding

1 about what we do at DHS, and why it's really important
2 for us.

3 Post-September 11th, I think there is no
4 question we all understand how fundamentally different
5 the world in which we live is.

6 The Department of Homeland Security has been
7 created to help us meet the challenges we have within
8 security, not just at the federal level, as I indicated,
9 but also at the home. The homeland is in the backyard,
10 not at these sometimes innocuous federal buildings we
11 live in. It's everywhere.

12 The Department challenge was to integrate 22
13 separate agencies into one, taking responsibilities from
14 the Coast Guard, from the Customs Service and INS, other
15 organizations such as NIPC (National Infrastructure
16 Protection Center), the FedCIRC (Federal Computer
17 Incidence Response Center), all into one umbrella, to try
18 to coordinate our response at the national level. And we
19 have been doing that.

20 And within my directorate, specifically, the
21 Information Analysis and Information Protection
22 directorate, IAIP, we have done that by combining some of
23 those entities, as I indicated. The NIPC, the Critical
24 Infrastructure Assurance Office the CIAO, the FedCIRC,
25 the NCS, which is the National Communications System, the

1 Energy Security and Assurance Program Office. We have
2 created that.

3 And the challenge has been fairly daunting, to
4 be quite honest with you. I mean, when I came here from
5 Coke, I saw it as a challenge of starting something up
6 from the first time, an opportunity to potentially have a
7 positive impact.

8 I wasn't prepared for the enormity of the
9 challenges that we face. If you could imagine working in
10 a very positive way for a dot-com, in the heyday of high
11 investment, high expectations, a lot of activity going
12 on, all the energy of -- and the excitement that goes
13 along with that, that's one of the elements of it. It's
14 also a merger and acquisition, it's also a hostile
15 takeover, in some cases.

16 We have a lot of work ahead of us to create an
17 organization. And in the context of IAIP, we have not
18 inherited a legacy infrastructure to allow us to be able
19 to work off of. All this is brand new. So I have
20 engaged a significant amount of my time in organizational
21 development, building an organization, trying to bring
22 business processes together, identify the IT
23 requirements, making sure I know what business we're in.

24 You would think since we're in charge of
25 protecting the homeland, and the 13 critical

1 infrastructure components, and the 5 key asset areas it
2 should be pretty straightforward. But when you start
3 peeling away that onion, so to speak, you begin to
4 realize how difficult of a job it is.

5 So, to suggest that we even knew what business
6 we really were in at the end of the day, and we could
7 identify all the business processes that had to support
8 that, would be an assumption -- an incorrect one, because
9 we don't. We are really in the definition stage right
10 now.

11 And we are creating a culture. This notion of
12 a culture of security that we refer to all the time, also
13 needs organizational culture to be successful. We have
14 to create an identity and a brand around DHS that people
15 recognize and have a significant amount of confidence in
16 when they see it.

17 And when Secretary Ridge gets up in front of
18 the public, and he says, "Well, listen, we're raising our
19 alert from yellow to orange, but we're telling you that
20 because you need to be more aware of what's going on, and
21 we need your participation."

22 Well, if you didn't have confidence in what the
23 Department could do, you're not going to have confidence
24 in what the Secretary is doing, because the culture
25 hasn't been created, and the expectations haven't been

1 delivered upon yet. We have got to create all that, the
2 capability to do that. And public perception and
3 confidence are absolutely key for us to be successful.

4 So, we're working hard to bring in all the
5 various components we have inherited. We're working hard
6 at establishing the relationships with the private sector
7 and the industry and the consumers and the general public
8 because, as Orson indicated, this is foundational stuff.
9 These are the things we have to do to ingrain the notion
10 of a security culture that we actually have to create
11 within the general public, that they have a
12 responsibility for their own security.

13 I think no matter how good a government program
14 we have, no matter how strong and how confident Governor
15 Ridge is in addressing the nation, people must accept
16 responsibility to do what they have to do. We can't
17 reach down to them and do it for them. There is no way
18 we can protect every single individual in the United
19 States. If people don't accept what they have to do,
20 they're going to have to suffer the consequences. They
21 have to be responsible for their security.

22 Now, the government's responsibility in this is
23 that we have to enable them and provide them the right
24 tools and techniques and methodologies to do these
25 things. And again, that's the essence of what we're

1 trying to do and will discuss with you today.

2 I want to emphasize cyber security. I know
3 there are members of the press here who have been
4 probably writing about some of the concerns that the
5 industry has expressed about our lack of focus, or our
6 lack of leadership on the cyber security side.

7 Dick Clark and Howard Schmidt are evangelists
8 in this area. A significant amount of awareness-raising
9 should be attributed to them. They need a lot of credit
10 for what they have done in establishing the National
11 Strategy to Secure Cyber Space.

12 But it's a strategy. And as most good
13 thinking, it's only good thinking unless it becomes
14 implemented. And our role, as a DHS organization, within
15 the IP infrastructure, architecture, we're creating an
16 organization to step up to the leadership for cyber
17 security.

18 We're going to implement the national strategy,
19 we're going to put feet to it and actually work on the
20 deliverables. So I'm going to run this as a business --
21 as best we can, within the government architecture, to do
22 that. Focus on what can we do, what's immediate, what we
23 can deliver. And we're architecting that today.

24 We're creating a leadership capability within
25 the Department to be both outward facing, to assure the

1 industry we're doing the right things, as well as on the
2 execution side, to make sure we're actually doing the
3 right things.

4 So, we're really stepping up to that challenge,
5 we're working with Orson and others in the federal
6 government to bring the programs to fruition.

7 Let me emphasize the partnership aspect of it.
8 You have heard, probably, that 85 percent of our critical
9 infrastructure is owned by the private sector. That
10 means the government doesn't own it, we buy the things --
11 we all buy the things -- that are being produced by that
12 critical infrastructure, we all depend upon those things.

13 So, the government's ability to protect itself
14 and protect the nation, and particularly protect the
15 critical infrastructure, requires that close partnership
16 with the industries which own those infrastructures. And
17 that's where we're working hard to establish them.

18 You're familiar with the Information Sharing
19 Analysis Centers, the ISACs, the various industry groups
20 that are out there that we're working hard with. Those
21 are the key components that we're using to outreach, and
22 not dictate what has to be done. But more importantly,
23 working in collaboration with the industries, to ensure
24 the right security programs are being done.

25 But what are we doing for the consumer? Let me

1 just talk about the real reason we're here. We clearly
2 understand as the online world becomes more ubiquitous to
3 us, the opportunities we have to interact with technology
4 and the Internet, and virtually any commodity we want to
5 buy, we can buy across the Internet. The availability of
6 the technology, both at a personal level and a business
7 level is clearly the things that make this country a
8 great country. No question about that.

9 At the business level, the biggest challenge I
10 found in the Coca Cola environment was not getting
11 awareness around the need for information security, but
12 it was actually getting people to do the work, and
13 measure the work that was being done. So we could
14 measure -- we had effective programs.

15 That was a challenge. The challenge in the
16 business world is how much is the right level of
17 security, when do you stop investing -- when the return
18 doesn't become equivalent to the dollars invested? How
19 do you measure those things? And then how do you make
20 sure you've got the right things going on?

21 We did that through carefully crafted programs
22 relying very heavily upon our CEO, our senior leadership
23 in the company, to ensure that they sent the message out
24 that these things were absolutely critical for us to do.

25 We had good people, process, and technology

1 things going on. We weren't doing all those good things
2 all the time, but we engaged in processes by which we
3 could not just create structure, but spread the
4 responsibility for implementing those programs out across
5 the infrastructure.

6 We've got to do it again, the same thing. The
7 business community has a responsibility to do it, the
8 consumer groups have the responsibility to do it. And we
9 have got to get people to recognize, from an awareness
10 perspective, what the dangers of the online world are.

11 It hits home to me, not just at the information
12 assurance level, from my responsibilities at Coke. It
13 hits home for me on a daily basis: I'm the father of two
14 teenage kids, two girls, who are online all the time.
15 They're IM'ing, they're chatting with their friends,
16 they're doing their research, they're always exposing
17 themselves on the Internet. And it worries me to death.

18 I can tell you, as a former cop and homicide
19 detective, there are a lot of bad people out there, and
20 you see how they exploit people. We have a lot of faith
21 in the technology that we use. It's faceless to us when
22 we interact with a monitor we're looking at, we don't see
23 all the potential bad people that are out there, looking
24 to do us harm.

25 An example is the other day, my daughter, using

1 IM, you can put an "away" message on the message when
2 you're away from your terminal. So, for instance, you're
3 online, but obviously, you're going to be coming back.
4 So she puts her phone number on the "away" message. My
5 older daughter sees this, and she tries to act like the
6 mother, and of course they get into a fight.

7 She comes to me and tells me about it, and she
8 says, "I just want to let you know, you know, she's doing
9 this." And so I walk over, sure enough, and I said,
10 "What are you doing?" She goes, "Well, what do you mean?
11 What's the problem?" I said, "Well, let me tell you what
12 the problem is," and I go through this thing, and it's
13 like, I see the eyes roll and everything, and she doesn't
14 quite get it yet, but we have to begin it at that level
15 and earlier.

16 If we don't start ingraining the understanding
17 of the dangers of what the online world represents,
18 they're never going to grow up to be consumers that are
19 going to engage in the same process with any degree of
20 competence that we can think, as business people, do our
21 consumers know what they should be doing?

22 So, it's a behavioral change that really needs
23 to be effected. And that's what we, as a Homeland
24 Security Department, working with, again, FTC and others,
25 that we have to do. We absolutely have to do this. It's

1 not just a big, federal bureaucracy that has to stand up
2 before an audience and say, "You should be doing these
3 things." We have to have practical programs that people
4 can reach out to and engage with.

5 So -- and how are we doing that? We're doing
6 that in a variety of things. As I keep indicating,
7 collaboratively working with groups like -- with the FTC,
8 working with the National Cyber Security Alliance, the
9 Stay Safe Online Campaign. We have inherited a good
10 program. That was one of the benefits of the resources
11 we have had when we created DHS, was we have inherited
12 that program from NIPC. We're invigorating that.

13 We want to make sure we get the message out to
14 the absolute common denominator here. Anybody who puts
15 their hands on a keyboard, I don't care if they're a CEO
16 or if they're a kid in the fifth grade doing a research
17 project, they all need to understand it. It all affects
18 them. And that's our responsibility, as a federal
19 government, to put the word out there. And we are
20 working hard to do that.

21 I am getting away from my prepared remarks, and
22 I don't want to chew up into the time here. I think
23 probably less is more in most public speaking
24 engagements.

25 So, I think the message I really want to relay

1 here is the fact that DHS is not this large federal
2 organization that is going to just come up with a lot of
3 good ideas that we're just going to put up on a website
4 someplace and say, "Okay, here is our idea, and it's up
5 to you to do it." We are going to actively engage, we
6 are going to do a lot of outreach with the consumer
7 groups and private sector, to ensure we've got them
8 engaged.

9 We want to influence the industry to do the
10 right things, we want to talk to the industry leadership
11 about what their responsibility is to have good software
12 out there. You know, Microsoft, I think, is a leader in
13 this area -- talk about trustworthy computing -- and
14 their ability to provide good software out-of-the-box
15 that doesn't default to everything is open, that we have
16 good security defaults when people put operating systems
17 in they don't have to worry about doing all the little
18 switch settings, and what does that mean to me, as a
19 consumer? Am I going to break something by actually
20 going outside the default mode and putting something in a
21 more trusted way?

22 The industry has a responsibility, the
23 consumers have a responsibility, we have a
24 responsibility. We all have to step up to that. We're
25 going to engage, you will see more outreach, you will see

1 more practical programs. You will see more standards
2 coming out. As I indicated, it's not about regulating
3 the industry and passing more laws, it's about doing the
4 things and creating the awareness levels at all the right
5 levels, all the dimensions of this group, to ensure we've
6 got the right things going.

7 I really have departed from my prepared
8 remarks, but I have got to tell you, if I didn't believe
9 we could do this, I wouldn't have taken on the
10 responsibility. I know we can do it. We can do it at a
11 big enterprise level, we can do it at the consumer level.

12 I want to thank you for the opportunity of
13 addressing you. Orson, good luck to you on your workshop
14 today. I look forward to working with you in the future.
15 So, thank you.

16 MS. LEVIN: Thank you, Assistant Secretary.

17 (Applause.)

18