Peer Review Summary Document

(12/22/2010)

Peer Review Plan

Channel change and bed-material transport in the Umpqua River, Oregon [50 KB PDF].

Title and Authorship of Information Product Disseminated

Channel change and bed-material transport in the Umpqua River, Oregon, by J. Rose Wallick, Jim E. O'Connor, Scott W. Anderson, Mackenzie Keith, Charles Cannon, and John Risley.

Peer Reviewers Expertise and Credentials

Peer Reviewer #1 – Phd Fluvial Geomorphologist with expertise in processes affecting steep-gradient rivers, hydraulics of mountain rivers, debris flows and the river's response to debris-flow input, the competence of a river to move large boulders, and long-term evolution of bedrock-controlled rivers, as well as the response of the aquatic ecology to different geomorphic settings.

Peer Reviewer #2 – Phd Candidate, Hydrologist, Fluvial Geomorphologist with specific expertise in geomorphic effects of dam removal and sediment transport.

Charge Submitted to Peer Reviewers:

The reviewers were asked to make an objective evaluation of the research.

Summary of Peer Reviewers Comments:

Reviewer #1 Summary
Reviewer #1 in general, indicated that the report is well organized and the analysis is scientifically sound. Minor issues with some of the conclusions were found. All suggested changes were minor and none involved major revision of the manuscript or significant reanalysis of the study. Further, Reviewer #1 commented that the gage analysis is sound and offers the required accuracy to draw the conclusions by using data from streamflow-gaging stations. The remaining comments from Reviewer #1 were editorial in nature and were offered as suggestions on how the presented material could be made more understandable.

Reviewer #2 Summary
Reviewer #2 had three major concerns primarily relating to the strength of the conclusions and internal data consistency throughout the report: 1) treatment of uncertainty in the measurement of bar area over time; 2) consistency in quantifying the effects of dams; and 3) internal data consistency.

The Dissemination

The published information product will be released in a USGS publication series and will be available at http://pubs.er.usgs.gov/.