

## **SUMMARY MEETING REPORT**

### **MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

**Honolulu, HI**

**February 23-25, 2010**

The Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee (MAFAC or ‘the Committee’) met on February 23-25, 2010, in the Honolulu Room at the Sheraton Waikiki in Honolulu, HI. Dr. James Balsiger presided and represented Eric Schwaab, the new Assistant Administrator for NOAA Fisheries Service. This was the first meeting scheduled in calendar year 2010.

The agenda (**Attachment A**) covered three days of work, and was split into several major topic areas: the NOAA catch share draft policy, NMFS budget, recommendations for the new recreational fishing working group, and protected resources issues. Updates and briefings were also provided on mercury and seafood consumption; the Office of Inspector General report on NOAA Enforcement; upcoming actions in Sustainable Fisheries and Protected Resources; and MAFAC action items. Day 1 focused solely on the draft catch shares policy, including discussion of the full committee to identify concerns and directions for feedback on the draft policy. During the afternoon of Day 2, subcommittees met to further consider the information presented during Day 1 and the morning of Day 2 and to develop recommendations and action. Subcommittee reports were presented to the full committee for consideration and discussion on Day 3. Additionally, the committee discussed the renewed charter, and elected Tom Billy as Committee Chair and Heather McCarty as Vice Chair.

The meeting was open to the public in accordance with the provisions of Public Law 9-463, and a public comment period was offered. The following is a synopsis of the Committee’s discussions and actions (numbers in parentheses correspond to page numbers of the daily transcript, available online at [http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafac/meetings/2010\\_02/index.htm](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafac/meetings/2010_02/index.htm)).

#### **Committee members present:**

James Balsiger	Patricia Doerr
Mark Holliday, Executive Director	Ed Ebisui
Tom J. Billy, Committee Chair	Martin Fisher
Heather D. McCarty, Committee Vice-Chair	Catherine L. Foy
Terry Alexander	Ken Franke
Randy Cates	Steve Joner
Anthony Chatwin	George Nardi
Paul Clampitt	Tom Raftican
John Connelly	Keith Rizzardi
Pamela Dana	Larry Simpson
Bill Dewey	David H. Wallace

#### **Staff of the National Marine Fisheries Service providing presentations to MAFAC or staffing the meeting included:**

Anne Barrett, Deputy Director of the Office of Management and Budget

Heidi Lovett, Policy Analyst, Policy Office, Office of the Assistant Administrator  
Kari MacLauchlin, Knauss Sea Grant Fellow, Policy Office, Office of the Assistant Administrator  
Sam Rauch, Deputy Assistant Administrator for Regulatory Programs, Office of the Assistant Administrator  
Alan Risenhoover, Director, Office of Sustainable Fisheries

**Other invited presenters:**

Lee Anderson, School of Marine Science and Policy, University of Delaware  
Earl Comstock, Fisheries Consultant, Comstock Consulting LLC  
John Kaneko, M.S., DVM; PacMar, Inc and Hawaii Seafood Project  
Dorothy Lowman, Natural Resource Consultant and Member, Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council  
Bruce Turriss, Executive Director, Canadian Groundfish Research & Conservation Society

**Members of the public in attendance for all or a portion of the meeting were:**

John Lynham, Economics Department, University of Hawaii at Manoa  
Jim Cook, Commercial Longline Fisherman, Honolulu, HI  
Roy Morioka, Advisory Committee, Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council  
Asuka Ishizaki, Staff, Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council  
Sarah Pautzke, Staff, Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council  
Kitty Simonds, Executive Director, Western Pacific Regional Fishery Management Council

**Tuesday, February 23, 2010**

8:30 Meeting Convened

**A. Introductions and Opening Remarks** (Transcript, Day 1, p. 4)

Jim Balsiger welcomed the committee and invited speakers on behalf of Eric Schwaab, the new Assistant Administrator for NOAA Fisheries, who could not attend, and provided a brief overview of the meeting topics. Introductions around the table were made, and Tom Billy reviewed the meeting schedule and goal of each session.

**B. Draft NOAA Catch Shares Policy** (Transcript, Day 1, p. 19)

Mark Holliday provided a presentation on the draft NOAA catch shares policy, which was released on December 10, 2009, and is currently available for public comment through April 10, 2010. The presentation included a description of what constitutes a catch share program, overview of the draft catch share policy and its objectives; the reasons why NOAA is encouraging widespread consideration of catch share programs; steps of development of this policy; desired program features and the types of support that NOAA plans to provide for the development and monitoring of specific catch share programs. NMFS provided copies of the draft policy to the MAFAC and requested feedback and suggestions from the committee on how the draft policy could be improved. The presentation is available on the MAFAC website.

Following the presentation, the committee had a general discussion and expressed primary impressions of the draft policy. Several members voiced concerns and asked questions about the \$36M increase for catch shares requested in the President's FY11 budget, including why these funds were not being used for stock assessments first; if other programs will lose funding to support the catch shares funding; and the risk of making decisions based on requested but not yet approved appropriations. Another key topic

of discussion was whether or not the draft policy provides sufficient guidelines to determine when a catch share program is the appropriate tool for a specific problem, and the importance of having solid, current stock assessments prior to consideration of a catch share program. Members also discussed the duration of programs and the pros and cons of designing pilot or trial programs. Other raised issues regarding the need to consider all user groups when determining the economic value of a fishery (including the recreational sector); effects of catch share programs on other fisheries; effects of catch shares on other regulations and vice versa; leasing among quota holders; and provisions to keep shares in the hands of fishermen (versus other entities, such as NGOs, non-U.S. corporations, etc.).

Several committee members had experience with existing catch share programs around the nation, from the Gulf of Mexico Red Snapper IFQ program to the Gulf of Alaska Rockfish pilot program. These committee members included Terry Alexander, Paul Clampitt, Martin Fisher, Steve Joner, Heather McCarty, and Dave Wallace. Mark Holliday asked each of them and Patty Doerr to give a brief overview of the issues in their fisheries and lessons learned during the development and implementation of the catch share programs. Their comments included the following:

- A policy with guidelines will be very helpful
- Need guidelines for how to have accountability, e.g., observers, monitoring
- Startup costs for new entrants (additional cost of catch shares) is a problem
- There will be problems, but they can often be fixed with some changes
- There will always be some “losers”
- Catch shares can be effective in ending derby and improving safety
- Catch shares can be effective in improving ability of fishermen to plan their fishing effort and improve their performance
- Catch shares provide incentives for fishermen to reduce bycatch

Four external experts were also invited to the meeting to provide their knowledge and experience with catch share program design, implementation, and evaluation. Below are the main points that each described:

Lee Anderson, School of Marine Science and Policy, University of Delaware, commenting on the economics of catch shares programs:

- Programs need to set up catch shares so to mimic property rights as much as possible if management wants to achieve the incentives.
- There are unintended consequences with any regulations and restrictions; catch shares programs are no different.
- High rental (sale or lease price of shares) means success. Even though there is increased required capital for start-up, the value of the share is higher.

Earl Comstock, Comstock Consulting LLC, commenting on catch shares and the recreational sector:

- Allow the best use of the resource to be determined by the market.
- The policy needs to include economic analysis of the recreational sector of the fishery.
- Need a mechanism for transfer of catch shares between recreational and commercial sectors, such as through an NGO or angler pool.
- Accountability measures should be required to allow recreational sector to have access to available catch shares.

Dorothy Lowman, Fisheries Consultant, current member of the Pacific Fishery Management Council and former member of MAFAC, commenting on her experience with the catch shares in the Pacific Groundfish Trawl Fishery:

- Development of a catch shares program needs full support of the council.
- Have guidelines/requirements for monitoring set up earlier rather than later in the design phase, because it affects decision-making. Need to know upfront how the program will be monitored and evaluated.

Bruce Turris, commenting on his experience with the British Columbia halibut catch shares program:

- Safety was the most important concern for the fishermen (over economic and biological benefits of catch share program).
- Need other tools along with catch shares—it would not be successful without other regulations
- Greatest power in catch shares is with multispecies fisheries.
- The program has to provide stability and security to create the incentive structure that you want.
- All sectors must be considered.

Following the presentations, additional Committee discussion ensued until it was time to adjourn for the day. The topic was further pursued during the Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittee on Wednesday afternoon (see below).

### **Wednesday, February 24, 2010**

8:30 Meeting Re-Convened

#### **C. NMFS Budget Update** (Transcript, Day 2 morning, p. 6)

Anne Barrett, Deputy Director of the NMFS Office of Management and Budget, gave a presentation of the FY2011 President's budget, reviewed Administration priorities and discussed how priorities translate to NOAA and NMFS funding. NOAA is requesting a total of \$5.55 billion, an increase of 17% or \$806 M over the FY 2010 enacted budget. Of this, the NMFS request is \$992.4 M. A key line in the budget is for a national catch share program for \$36M. NOAA has also requested an increase of \$15.8M for protected species research and management; \$10.4M for community-based restoration; \$2.4M for aquaculture; and \$5M to implement the Chesapeake Bay Executive Order. The Pacific Coastal Salmon Recovery Fund (PCSRF) has a requested increase of \$15.4M along with \$0.4M for the Fishermen's Contingency Fund. Cooperative Research and the Southwest Regional Science Center had a decrease in requests at \$4.6M and \$1.0M, respectively. The President's budget reflects the Administration's commitment to safety, environment, science, and job creation. MAFAC members were provided with a "Bluebook" summary detail of the NMFS budget.

The Budget office is currently working on the President's FY2012 budget, which will be sent to NOAA in May.

#### **D. Seafood safety and mercury** (Transcript, Day 2 morning, p. 76)

John Kaneko of PacMar, Inc. and the Hawaii Fisheries Project spoke to the committee about seafood safety with a focus on mercury and selenium in fish. His presentation provided information about how mercury is found in low levels in open ocean fish, that selenium in fish help protect against the impact of mercury, and the studies suggesting benefits of seafood consumption to expectant mothers

outweigh any risk of effects from mercury. Mr. Kaneko concluded with suggestions that current recommendations aimed at pregnant women about fish consumption should be reconsidered and amended based on the new scientific understanding of the interaction between mercury and selenium, and the health benefits of seafood to mother and child during pregnancy.

After questions to Mr. Kaneko and some discussion, the committee **APPROVED** the following motion:

MAFAC urges the Secretary of Commerce to engage fully in interagency processes and the government debates about seafood and health issues. Specifically, the Secretary should communicate with the Secretary of Health and Human Services regarding the importance of seafood consumption and, in particular, the importance of engaging in revisions to the FDA advice on tuna consumption and mercury in seafood. In addition, the Secretary should fully engage in the Dietary Guidance for Americans process.

**E. DOC Office of Inspector General (OIG) Report on NOAA Enforcement** (Transcript, Day 2 morning, p. 125)

Sam Rauch, Deputy Assistant Administrator for Regulatory Programs, spoke about the OIG report on NOAA Enforcement released in January 2010. The report concluded that NOAA leadership and headquarters need to increase management and oversight of regional enforcement operations; NOAA should strengthen procedures and guidelines for enforcement operations to address industry perception of unfair and inconsistent penalty assessment; and that NOAA should assess workforce composition and evaluate if the current structure is the most effective.

The committee discussed the findings of the report following the presentation. Points of discussion included complexity of rules and regulations; inconsistency of penalties; and difference (or lack thereof) between a criminal offense and a regulatory offense. The committee also discussed how MAFAC could provide guidance or suggestions for the re-evaluation of NOAA Enforcement in response to the report, such as helping develop a penalty matrix and encouraging more transparency.

**F. Public Comment** ((Transcript, Day 2 morning, p. 172)

Mr. Jim Cook of Pacific Ocean Producers, and a former member of the Western Pacific Fishery Management Council provided some public comment to MAFAC. Mr. Cook wanted to inform MAFAC about problems faced by Hawaii's major fishery, the longline fishery. In particular, he noted that bigeye, the primary target species, is experiencing overfishing Pacific-wide, however, the Hawaii longline fishery is fishing within its quota and has observer coverage (87 percent of the total Pacific observer coverage). The U.S. is involved with two Regional Marine Fisheries Organizations (RMFOs) that dictate the U.S. quota, the Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission east of longitude 150, and the Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Commission (WCPFC) west of 150°. In particular, U.S. fishermen feel disadvantaged in the western and central Pacific, where most of their fishing occurs. Smaller island nations in the region with a "responsible fisheries development" have no quota. Thus, they are seeking various forms of relief to allow more quota for U.S. fishermen. More details regarding Mr. Cook's comments can be found in the full Transcript.

## **F. Subcommittee Sessions** (See individual transcripts available for Protected Resources and the Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittees, Day 2)

Three subcommittees met in break-out groups following lunch to discuss specific topics. The Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee met, chaired by Ken Franke, to discuss and make recommendations for appointees to the Recreational Fisheries Working Group. The Protected Resources Subcommittee, chaired by Catherine Foy, met to develop the topics it wishes to have staff from the Office of Protected Resources make presentations on for the next MAFAC meeting. Heather McCarty, chair, led the meeting of the Strategic Planning, Budget, and Program Management Subcommittee to discuss feedback on the catch shares draft policy, and to comment on NMFS budget issues.

Specific recommendations and outcomes of each break-out are provided in the reports presented on Day 3 (Thursday).

## **Thursday, February 25, 2010**

### **8:30 Meeting Convened**

## **G. Sustainable Fisheries/Protected Resources: Status and Upcoming Major Actions**

(Transcript, Day 3, p. 6)

Alan Risenhoover, Director of the Office of Sustainable Fisheries, presented upcoming fisheries management and protected resources actions pending in 2010, by region, that are aimed at:

- ending overfishing of fish stocks through the implementation of annual catch limits and accountability measures;
- rebuilding overfished fish stocks to productive levels;
- protecting endangered species from fishing activities and other threats; and
- protecting marine mammals from fishing activities and other threats.

Mr. Risenhoover noted that some of these actions will likely be controversial and may have significant economic impacts. Yet, NOAA is responsible for meeting the requirements and deadlines of the Magnuson-Stevens, Endangered Species, and Marine Mammal Protection Acts, and these requirements drive the need for the identified actions. He also reviewed the progress that has been made to date (such as 30 stocks (39%) are no longer overfished and 15 are now considered fully rebuilt), and explained the benefits to the nation that would ensue when fish stocks are fully rebuilt. It is estimated that the value of commercial landings would increase 54% equal to \$2.2 billion, recreational fishermen would be allowed higher bag or trip limits and longer seasons, and expenditures (*e.g.*, hotel, gear, food) associated with sport fishing would increase. Likewise, conservation and protection of marine mammals and endangered and threatened species maintains healthy and productive ecosystems which further supports commercial and recreational fisheries, tourism (*e.g.*, whale watching, scuba diving), and its esthetic value.

## H. Subcommittee Reports and Recommendations

### 1. Strategic Planning, Budget, Program Management Subcommittee Report (Transcript, Day 3, p. 58, later resumed on p. 177); Heather McCarty, Subcommittee Chair

#### Members in Attendance:

Heather D. McCarty, Subcommittee Chair  
James Balsiger  
Tom J. Billy  
Terry Alexander  
Randy Cates  
Anthony Chatwin  
Paul Clampitt  
John Connelly  
Pamela Dana  
Bill Dewey  
Patricia Doerr

Ed Ebisui  
Martin Fisher  
Catherine L. Foy  
Ken Franke  
Steve Joner  
George Nardi  
Tom Raftican  
Keith Rizzardi  
Larry Simpson  
David H. Wallace

#### NOAA Fisheries Staff in Attendance:

Mark Holliday, Office of Policy  
Heidi Lovett, Office of Policy  
Kari MacLauchlin, Office of Policy  
Alan Risenhoover, Office of Sustainable Fisheries

#### **a. NMFS Budget**

The Strategic Planning, Budget and Program Management Subcommittee discussed the implementation of the MAFAC group's intent to track and measure performance and progress in major priority areas identified in the *Vision 2020* report, focusing on budgetary allocations to these priorities. The purpose of this request is intended to provide MAFAC with information to advise on future agency budget priorities.

**RECOMMENDATION:** The subcommittee recommends the establishment of a template for a tracking system, going back several (perhaps five years) as well as moving forward. The intent is to track the total level of budgetary elements falling into these priority areas. A member suggested that it would be appropriate to establish and use a system of measuring performance. The subcommittee did not attempt to tackle a metrics system at this meeting, but recommends MAFAC have a discussion to give direction to the subcommittee and staff for future meetings.

The subcommittee recommends focusing on the following priority subject areas:

- Aquaculture development
- Bycatch reduction
- Catch shares
- Data collection, research and surveys
- Demand, quality and supply of US seafood – increasing safe supply to meet needs
- Protected resources

[APPROVED]

The committee also suggested that in subsequent presentations, funding for implementation of MSA management provisions be provided.

### **b. Draft NOAA Catch Share Policy**

The Subcommittee also discussed the draft NOAA Catch Share Policy and forwarded the following suggested comments to the full MAFAC group for discussion and possible adoption. The Subcommittee recommended that MAFAC's final comments be adopted in the form of a motion listing the suggested revisions and additions, and where possible and appropriate, their suggested location in the policy document. The subcommittee did not attempt a redline revision of the policy document.

### **High Priority Recommendations**

**RECOMMENDATION #1:** MAFAC recommends that NOAA provide answers to the outstanding questions on the application of the MSA LAP guidelines to the design of catch share program. [APPROVED]

**RECOMMENDATION #2:** The subcommittee recommends that the final policy document include the section "Catch share program features" on pages 3 through 7 as currently written, and include a comprehensive listing of catch share design elements. Thus, the MAFAC recommends the addition of the following features to that section:

- a. Identification and inclusion of all stakeholders in the design process
- b. Conservation considerations, including bycatch reduction, ecosystem management, adequate biological data collection
- c. Accountability and enforcement, including observer programs, financing
- d. Consolidation issues, including ownership caps, use caps, processing caps
- e. US ownership/sovereignty
- f. Impacts on other fisheries due to effort shifting
- g. Entry level opportunities, including new entrants, financing programs, eligibility requirements
- h. Prevention of "fishing for quota," including control dates
- i. Collection and consideration of adequate economic data from all sectors, including recreational fisheries –initial distribution of quota to participants of a catch share program
- j. Program evaluation

[PASSED, as modified with three opposed]

**RECOMMENDATION #3:** The subcommittee expressed the importance of the following sections listed in Table 1: 1.1, 1.2, 1.5, 2.5, 2.6, 2.7, 3.3, 4.2, 4.5. [APPROVED]

### **Catch Shares as a management tool**

**RECOMMENDATION:** MAFAC recommends that the agency add introductory language to the catch share policy that there are a number of tools that are part of traditional fishery management, and should remain important considerations. Continued science-based management, including adherence to TACs, remains crucial [APPROVED]



**RECOMMENDATION:** MAFAC would like to commend the catch share policy task force and Dr. Holliday for their dedication and work on the draft catch shares policy. [APPROVED]

## 2. Protected Resources Subcommittee Report (Transcript, Day 3, p. 143); Catherine Foy, Subcommittee Chair

Subcommittee Members in Attendance:

Catherine Foy  
Keith Rizzardi  
Tony Chatwin  
Terry Alexander  
Randy Cates  
Paul Clampitt

NOAA Fisheries Staff in Attendance:

Heidi Lovett, Office of Policy

The purpose of this Protected Resources (PR) Subcommittee meeting was to review the recommendations approved by the general committee at the November meeting, and to further clarify for staff the issues to address at the next meeting.

**RECOMMENDATION:** We of the PR subcommittee request a day on the agenda focused on PR issues. We ask Dr. Jim Lecky (Director, NMFS Office of Protected Resources) or appropriate staff to speak to the committee at the next meeting. These issues (following) are particularly relevant and timely considering the recent influx of coral species entering the consideration process for ESA listing and we believe would be of sufficient importance to merit consideration and discussion by the full committee.

### 1. Prioritization of resources allocation (funding, research and staff time):

- How does NMFS currently set resource allocation priorities for listing and designation of critical habitat, recovery planning, and status reviews?
- Is there currently a need for a master document or plan?
- What is the current workload of this office and how is effort partitioned between programmatic areas?

### 2. Climate change:

- What is the NMFS strategy for the avoidance of misdirected resources (directed by litigation for “pet species”)? For example FWS has a 4(d) regulation for polar bears that limits the responsibility of the FSW to localized impacts.
- Is NMFS planning an equivalent for all future and existing listed species (i.e. 82 coral species)?

### 3. Once recovered, how are listed species down or delisted?:

- What media strategies does NMFS have for celebrating an ESA success?
- What is the process and timeline for the delisting evaluation once recovery standards outlined by the ESA have been met? How can the public or specific user groups expedite or facilitate this process?

- We would like staff to address in particular the stalled progress of fin and sperm whale draft recovery plan in the North Pacific, as well as the Hawaiian stock of humpback whales and green sea turtles.
4. Use of Observer data:
- Increased fisheries observer coverage is expected, in part due to increased use of catch share programs. We request staff updates regarding use of observer data in management of PR. Are the data reliable and how can it be improved?

[APPROVED]

### Upcoming subcommittee topics:

**RECOMMENDATION:** Separate staff time is requested to discuss in subcommittee the possibility of streamlining scientific research permitting process (level B Harassment). In addition, interest was expressed requesting specific information on sea turtles, and we request space and staff time at the next subcommittee meeting be reserved to discuss/report to committee the findings of the NRC report. We also request an update on how/if technology sharing is being accomplished between regions, science centers, and federal agencies to improve ecological understanding of PR species and if the military (Navy in particular) has been approached regarding use of acoustic data to improve large whale stock assessments. Additionally, we request a discussion of how the PR Office is working with the Aquaculture Program on the permit consultation process.

[APPROVED]

### 3. **Recreational Fish Subcommittee Report** (Transcript, Day 3, p. 167); Ken Franke, Subcommittee Chair

#### Subcommittee Members in Attendance:

Pamela J. Dana  
 Patricia Doerr  
 Ken Franke, Chair  
 Tom Raftican  
 Dave Wallace  
 Larry Simpson (non-voting)

#### NOAA Fisheries Staff in Attendance:

Dr. Mark Holliday, Director, Office of Policy, NOAA Fisheries Office of the Assistant Administrator and MAFAC Executive Director  
 Kari MacLauchlin, Knauss Sea Grant Fellow, Office of Policy

### **HISTORY -- November 11, 2009**

The MAFAC presented a Terms of Reference for a new Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee. “Recreational Fisheries Working Group, to be comprised of newly identified external advisors to MAFAC, each of whom has some expertise or experience related to recreational fisheries.”

Specifically, the final recommendation that was approved by MAFAC was as follows:

1. MAFAC recommends to constitute the current Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee as a permanent Subcommittee of MAFAC.
2. MAFAC appoints a Recreational Fisheries Working Group (RFWG) of up to 25 people, for up to one year, to be extended at the discretion of MAFAC, to be charged with assisting with the planning and organization, along with the Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee, of a NOAA 2010 recreational fishing summit.
3. Further, building upon the recommendations and priorities articulated by the MAFAC Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee, the RFWG will advise MAFAC on issues of importance to the recreational fishing community, including, but not limited to: 1) the Ocean Policy Task Force report, 2) review and possible revision of the NOAA Recreational Fisheries Strategic Plan, 3) marine spatial planning, and 4) catch shares policy. This list may be modified over time by MAFAC.

The RFWG shall be composed of people with a specific interest in NOAA’s recreation related activities, appointed by MAFAC in consultation with NOAA. Members will be selected to represent the diversity of national, regional or sector perspectives; have a sound expertise in the science, management or business of recreational fishing; a well-informed background in recreational fisheries issues; and an operational knowledge of federal agencies and interactions with the Fishery Management Councils and/or regional and state partners.

#### **FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE**

Due notice was given in the Federal Register. A total of 56 persons submitted letters of interest. Letters of support were also accepted.

#### **ACTION TAKEN BY RECREATIONAL FISHERIES SUBCOMMITTEE – February 24, 2010**

The Subcommittee deliberated over the names submitted and arrived at a list of 17 persons. This was a diverse group of experienced recreational anglers representing angling venues from throughout the United States. Effort was made to seek persons with unique, informed, perspectives. This list will be supplemented by additional names selected by NOAA with the final group expected to number 25.

The list of recommended persons is as follows:

##### Pacific Islands

Ed Watamura,	Honolulu, HI	Wailua Boat Club, Recreational Angler
Craig Severance,	Hilo, HI	University of Hawaii, Recreational Angler

##### Alaska

William S Brown,	Juneau, AK	Angler, Alaska Board of Fisheries
Bryan Bondioli,	Homer, AK	Charter Boat Owner

##### Northwest Region

H. Lee Blankenship	Olympia, WA	Retired Research Scientist, Hatchery Expert
--------------------	-------------	---

##### Soutwest Region

Robert Fletcher	San Diego, CA	Angler, Retired Pres.of Sport Fishing Assoc.of CA
-----------------	---------------	---

Donna Kalez Owner,	Dana Point, CA	Women's Angling Club, Tackle Shop/fleet
-----------------------	----------------	---

#### Northeast Region

Bruce Freeman Association	Lavalette, NJ	Former MAFAC, Jersey Coast Anglers
Anthony DiLernia David Pecci	Brooklyn, NY Bath, ME	Former MAFAC, charter boat owner, educator Maine Assoc. of Charter Boat Captains President

#### Southeast Region

Richard Brame Jason Schratwieser Bob Zales Pres.	Wilmington, NC Dania Beach, FL Panama City, FL	Coastal Conservation Association International Game Commission National Association of Charter Boat Owners
Rodney Smith Terry Lacoss	Satellite Beach, FL Amelia Island, FL	Rec. Fish Author, founder Coastal Guides Assoc. Amelia Island Charter Boat Association President

#### Gulf Region

Patrick Fitzmorris Conrad Trascher	Madisonville, LA Baton Rouge, LA	Angler, Recreational Fisheries Research Institute CCA Director of Development
---------------------------------------	-------------------------------------	--

### **COMMENTS**

The following represents a list of comments summarizing points of fact to be considered as this process moves forward:

While great consideration was given to developing a diverse group from the list of eligibles, it was commented that there still were gaps from certain regions of the country. Texas and the Gulf of Mexico, *et. al.*, and their regional recreational fishing associations should be sought for representation.

Consideration should potentially be given to move any National Organizational leaders to the final 8 persons to be selected by NOAA, and backfill vacancies on the list with local selectees.

The list of eligibles was heavy with people from charter activity backgrounds. The subcommittee focused on persons that had other attributes to add to their experience suite. As this process moves forward to complete the list, additional consideration should be given to targeting grass roots anglers.

**RECOMMENDATION:** MAFAC recommends to submit the RFWG list to NOAA for continued group development by NOAA staff. [APPROVED]

### **I. New Business; Review of Action Items; Next Meeting** (Transcript, Day 3, p. 247)

Mark Holliday announced that the MAFAC charter revisions that were first proposed by MAFAC in 2007 were incorporated during the recent charter renewal process and were approved by NOAA and DOC and went into effect on January 22, 2010. The new charter has been posted to the MAFAC website, and is available on the web at: <http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov/ocs/mafac/charter.htm>.

One of the changes is that the Chairperson and Vice Chair of MAFAC will now be elected by a

majority vote of Committee member to serve a two year term, with the possibility of a one year extension. Prior to this change, NOAA leadership held those positions and a Committee member was designated as the “Committee Liaison”

**MOTION:** A motion was made and seconded to elect Tom Billy as Chairperson and Heather McCarty as Vice Chair of MAFAC. It was approved without objection.

Mark Holliday next noted that the updated Action Tracking Table was provided to all MAFAC members for their review. This is one metric for measuring the progress of recommendations made by MAFAC. He discussed that a meeting of MAFAC committee leaders with Secretary Locke was pending but there was no progress to report. He acknowledged that the Seafood Inspection Strategic Plan was overdue from NOAA but when it is finalized, he will brief MAFAC. The summary report from this meeting will be forwarded to NOAA and the Department of Commerce, and most importantly, the Recreational Fisheries Work Group nominations and recommendations will be forwarded immediately.

A request to staff was made to provide a longer lead time for updating the website with the meeting agenda, background materials, and other supporting information that is provided to help the Committee’s discussion and deliberation of the meeting topics.

Based on the approved recommendation of the Protected Resources Committee, a major portion of the next meeting will focus on protected resources issues. A suggestion was made that a potential speaker to invite is Dr. Pat Burchfield, who works on the successful, bilateral (U.S.-Mexico) Kemps Ridley Recovery Program. Other suggested meeting topics include an update on recreational fishing issues, and an update on the status of the aquaculture policy.

The next meeting is currently scheduled for June 29-July 1, 2010 (location to be determined, though there was a desire expressed by members to hold it in Alaska), and the third meeting of the year is tentatively scheduled for October 19-21, 2010 (location to be determined).

**The MAFAC meeting was adjourned at 3:25 p.m.**

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing meeting summary is accurate and complete.

Mark Holliday, Ph.D.  
Executive Director  
Marine Fisheries Advisory Committee

This meeting summary will be formally considered by the Committee at its next meeting, and any corrections or notations will be incorporated in the summary of that meeting.

**MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**February 23-25, 2010 ♦ Honolulu, HI**

**ATTACHMENT A**



**Sheraton Waikiki**  
 2255 Kalakaua Avenue, Honolulu, HI 96815  
 Phone: 808-922-4422  
 Reservations: 866-716-8109

<b>Day 1 - Tuesday, February 23, 2010</b>			
<b>Time</b>	<b>Min.</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Presenter</b>
8:30-8:40	10	<b>Introductions, Opening Remarks</b>	Jim Balsiger
8:40-8:45	5	<b>Agenda Review</b>	Tom Billy
8:45-10:00	75	<b>Draft NOAA Catch Shares Policy</b> Presentation and Committee Q&A on draft Policy	Mark Holliday
10:00-10:15	15	Break	
10:15-12:15	120	<p><b>CATCH SHARE PANEL DISCUSSIONS</b></p> <p>Goal: Identify pros/cons and suggestions for changes to the draft NOAA Policy</p> <p><b>Catch Shares – MAFAC Internal Panel Discussion</b></p> <p>Objective: Share internal knowledge &amp; experiences with catch share design, implementation and operations, — identify pros/cons, best practices. How well does the draft Policy address key issues; do suggested activities best support policy?</p>	<p><b>Internal Panelists:</b></p> <p>Martin Fisher                      Terry Alexander                      Heather McCarty                      Dave Wallace                      Patty Doerr                      Paul Clampett                      Others TBD.</p>
12:15-1:30	75	Lunch	
1:30- 4:30	180	<p><b>Catch Shares – External Panel Discussion</b></p> <p>Objective: Share external knowledge &amp; experiences with catch share design, implementation and operations, — identify pros/cons, best practices. How well does the draft Policy address key issues; do suggested activities best support policy?</p>	<p><b>External Panelists:</b></p> <p>Lee Anderson                      Earl Comstock                      Dorothy Lowman                      Bruce Turris</p>
4:30-5:00	30	<b>Public Comments</b>	
5:00		<b>Adjourn for the day</b>	

<b>Day 2 - Wednesday, February 24, 2010</b>			
<b>Time</b>	<b>Min.</b>	<b>Subject</b>	<b>Presenter</b>
8:30-10:00	90	<b>Budget Formulation and Development</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ FY 2011 President's Budget</li> <li>▪ Development of the 2012 budget</li> <li>▪ Planning for FY2013 and beyond</li> </ul>	Anne Barrett
10:00-10:45	45	<b>Mercury and Seafood Consumption</b>	Dr. John Kaneko
10:45-11:00	15	Break	
11:00- 12:00	60	<b>DOC Inspector General Report on NOAA Enforcement</b>	Sam Rauch
12:00- 1:00	60	Lunch	
		<b><u>Subcommittee Meetings</u></b>	<b><u>Subcommittee Chairs</u></b>
1:00-3:00	120	<b>Recreational Fisheries Subcommittee</b> Discussion and recommendations for Recreational Fisheries Working Group.	TBD
1:00-3:00	120	<b>Protected Resources Subcommittee</b>	Catherine Foy
3:00 – 5:30	150	<b>Strategic Planning, Budget, Program Management Subcommittee</b> Discussion of recommendations on catch shares policy.	Heather McCarty
5:30pm		<b>Adjourn for the day</b>	

**MARINE FISHERIES ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
 February 23-25, 2010 ♦ Honolulu, HI

**ATTACHMENT A**

<b>Day 3 – Thursday, February 25, 2010</b>			
Time	Min.	Subject	Presenter
5:00-7:30am		Hawaii Fish Auction & Group Breakfast	
8:30-9:30	60	<b>Sustainable Fisheries/Protected Resources: Status &amp; Upcoming Major actions</b>	Alan Risenhoover Sam Rauch
9:30-9:45	15	<b>Break</b>	
9:45-11:45	120	<b>Report Out: Strategic Planning, Budget, Program Management Subcommittee</b>	Heather McCarty
11:45-1:00	75	Lunch	
1:00-2:30	90	<b>Report Out: Recreational Fish Subcommittee</b>	TBD
2:30-3:30	60	<b>Report Out: Protected Resources Subcommittee</b>	Catherine Foy
3:30-4:00	30	<b>New Business; Review of Action Items; Next meeting</b>	Mark Holliday
4:00		<b>Adjourn</b>	