



National Transportation Safety Board

Washington, D.C. 20594

Safety Recommendation

Date: July 6, 1999

In reply refer to: H-99-22 through -24

See Distribution

In 1999, the National Transportation Safety Board initiated a special investigation as a result of its findings from four accidents in 1998 and 1999 involving “nonconforming buses,” that is, vehicles for student transportation that meet the Federal definition of a bus¹ but not the Federal occupant crash protection standards of school buses.² In the subject accidents, summarized below, 9 people were killed, and 36 were injured.

On March 25, 1998, in Sweetwater, Florida, a 15-passenger van hired by parents to take children to and from school collided with a transit bus. Three children were ejected and sustained head injuries. On March 26, 1998, in Lenoir City, Tennessee, a 25-passenger specialty bus³ taking children from a school-related activity collided with a truck tractor semitrailer. Two people, one of whom was ejected, were fatally injured. On December 8, 1998, in East Dublin, Georgia, a 15-passenger van transporting children to a Head Start program collided with a pickup truck. One child was ejected and fatally injured. On February 16, 1999, in Bennettsville, South Carolina, a 15-passenger van transporting children home from an after-school church program was struck by a tow truck. Three children were ejected, and a total of six children were fatally injured.

The nonconforming buses involved in these accidents did not and were not required to meet Federal school bus occupant crash protection standards, which require that all school buses transporting children to and from school or school-related activities have roof rollover protection, energy-absorbing seats, and greater body joint strength than most other types of vehicles. Enactment of these Federal standards in the 1970s stemmed, in large part, from safety recommendations issued to the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) by the Safety Board as a result of its investigation of a number of catastrophic school bus accidents. In these tragic cases, many children were killed or severely injured when the buses structurally collapsed or suffered joint failure during the accident sequences.

¹ FMVSS (CFR 571.3) defines *bus* as a motor vehicle designed to carry more than 10 persons and *school bus* as a bus that carries students to or from school or school-related activities.

² For additional information, refer to Special Investigation Report—*Pupil Transportation in Vehicles Not Meeting Federal School Bus Standards* (NTSB/SIR-99/02).

³ *Specialty bus* is the industry term for the small buses that are commonly used as shuttle or tour buses. No Federal standard defines the names and configurations for buses of these sizes and types.

The Federal school bus crashworthiness standards have had an enormous impact on the safety of student transportation. According to a NHTSA fact sheet on school buses, the number of school bus passenger fatalities nationwide averages fewer than 10 each year out of approximately 10 billion student trips.⁴

NHTSA's Safety Program Guideline 17, *Pupil Transportation Safety*, establishes minimum recommendations for a State highway safety program for pupil transportation. Guideline 17 recommends that buses meeting the Federal structural standards for school buses be used for transporting children to and from school or school-related activities. A 1997 NHTSA interpretation letter states that because Head Start facilities are primarily involved with the education of preprimary school children, the buses used to transport children to and from the facilities "are considered school buses...and must meet all Federal school bus safety standards." A 1998 NHTSA interpretation letter regarding the use of buses transporting children between schools and publicly or privately owned day care centers states that if the bus is "used significantly"⁵ to transport children to or from school or a school-related event, the vehicle must meet the Federal school bus safety standards.

The States, which are responsible for enforcing the use of school buses, in most cases, require that children be transported to and from school only on buses meeting Federal school bus crashworthiness standards. Some States, however, by statutory exclusion or exception either allow or do not prohibit the use of nonconforming buses to school-related activities, including Head Start programs and day care facilities. The guidelines to the States and to the transportation industry from Federal agencies and national associations clearly state that vehicles built to school bus standards should be used for these activities.

For its special investigation report, the Safety Board reviewed a February 1999 survey conducted by the National Association of State Directors of Pupil Transportation Services (NASDPTS). Of the 32 directors responding, only 26 directors said that their States prohibit the use of nonconforming vans to transport children to and from school; 6 directors said that their States had no such prohibitions. Regarding the transport of children to and from school-related activities, 19 States prohibit the use of nonconforming vans, and 13 do not. Twenty States currently permit the use of nonconforming vans for Head Start transportation, while eight do not.⁶ Twenty-three States allow the use of vans in day care centers, and six do not.

NASDPTS states in a recent position paper, "We believe that it is appropriate to require higher levels of safety in vehicles that transport children to and from school and school-related activities." NASDPTS further states that "school children should be transported in school buses which provide them with the highest levels of safety, not in vans which do not meet the stringent school bus safety standards issued by the Federal Government."

⁴ The number of student trips was obtained from a January 1999 position paper of the National Association of State Directors of Pupil Transportation.

⁵ In the case that resulted in the letter of interpretation, the van was transporting students (not necessarily the same students) 5 days a week.

⁶ The total number of responses to some questions varies because some State directors did not answer all survey inquiries.

The Safety Board is disturbed by the trend toward using nonconforming vehicles rather than school buses in pupil transportation. When States and various school systems allow children to be transported in vehicles not meeting Federal school bus construction standards, they put children at greater risk of fatal or serious injury in the event of an accident. The Safety Board is firmly convinced that the best way to maximize pupil transportation safety is to require the use of school buses or buses built to equivalent occupant crash protection standards.

In February 1999, based on testing that it had conducted, NHTSA published *Guideline for the Safe Transportation of Pre-school Age Children in School Buses*, which recommends that preschool-age children be transported in child safety restraint systems. The Safety Board agrees that the use of child restraint systems can improve the survivability and lessen the chances of severe injury for students in small buses. All bus operators who transport preschool-aged children should therefore be made aware of and encouraged to comply with NHTSA's guideline.

The Safety Board recognizes that, although safety-conscious schools and organizations will increasingly replace nonconforming buses with school buses, vehicles not meeting the occupant crash protection standards of school buses will be used for pupil transport until laws stipulate otherwise. It is therefore particularly essential that operators of all vehicles equipped with occupant restraints ensure that students wear the age-appropriate restraint. In the three accidents mentioned earlier involving 15-passenger vans, had the passengers been wearing appropriate restraints, most of those who died probably would have survived and most of those who were injured probably would have sustained less severe injuries.

The Safety Board reviewed the current seat belt laws of several States and noted that some have allowable exclusions or exemptions pertaining to safety restraint use in buses for pupil transportation. These allowable exclusions and exemptions put students at great risk of fatal or serious injury in the event of an accident.

The Safety Board therefore recommends that the States, Territories, and the District of Columbia:

Require that all vehicles carrying more than 10 passengers (buses) and transporting children to and from school and school-related activities, including, but not limited to, Head Start programs and day care centers, meet the school bus structural standards or the equivalent as set forth in 49 *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 571. Enact regulatory measures to enforce compliance with the revised statutes. (H-99-22)

Review your State and local laws and, if applicable, revise to eliminate any exclusions or exemptions pertaining to the use of age-appropriate restraints in all seat belt equipped vehicles carrying more than 10 passengers (buses) and transporting school children. (H-99-23)

Adopt the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration's *Guideline for the Safe Transportation of Pre-school Age Children in School Buses*, distribute the guideline to all school bus operators transporting preschool-age children to and

from school or school-related activities, and encourage those operators to implement the guideline. (H-99-24)

Also, the Safety Board issued Safety Recommendations to the Department of Health and Human Services, the National School Boards Association, the National Association of Independent Schools, the National Conference on School Transportation, the National Parent Teacher Association, the National Association of Child Care Professionals, the National Child Care Association, the National Head Start Association, the Young Men's Christian Association, the Young Women's Christian Association, the national headquarters of 14 major churches, and the Community Transportation Association of America.

The National Transportation Safety Board is an independent Federal agency with the statutory responsibility "to promote transportation safety by conducting independent accident investigations and by formulating safety improvement recommendations" (Public Law 93-633). The Safety Board is vitally interested in any action taken as a result of its safety recommendations. Therefore, it would appreciate a response from you within 90 days regarding action taken or contemplated with respect to the recommendations in this letter. Please refer to Safety Recommendations H-99-22 through -24 in your reply. If you need additional information, you may call (202) 314-6444.

Chairman HALL, Vice Chairman FRANCIS, and Members HAMMERSCHMIDT, GOGLIA, and BLACK concurred in these recommendations.

By: Jim Hall
Chairman

Distribution

State and Territory Governors

Honorable Donald Siegelman
Governor
State of Alabama
State Capitol
600 Dexter Avenue
Montgomery, Alabama 36130

Honorable Tony Knowles
Governor
State of Alaska
Post Office Box 110001
Juneau, Alaska 99811-0001

Honorable Jane Dee Hull
Governor
State of Arizona
State Capitol
1700 W. Washington
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Honorable Mike Huckabee
Governor
State of Arkansas
250 State Capitol
Little Rock, Arkansas 72201

Honorable Gray Davis, Jr.
Governor
State of California
State Capitol
Sacramento, California 95814

Honorable Bill F. Owens
Governor
State of Colorado
136 State Capitol
Denver, Colorado 80203-1792

Honorable John G. Rowland
Governor
State of Connecticut
210 State Capitol
Hartford, Connecticut 06106

Honorable Tom Carper
Governor
State of Delaware
Tatnall Building
William Penn Street
Dover, Delaware 19901

Honorable John Ellis "Jeb" Bush
Governor
State of Florida
The Capitol
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-0001

Honorable Roy E. Barnes
Governor
State of Georgia
203 State Capitol
Atlanta, Georgia 30334

Honorable Benjamin J. Cayetano
Governor
State of Hawaii
State Capitol
235 S. Beretania Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Honorable Dirk Kempthorne
Governor
State of Idaho
State Capitol
Post Office Box 83720
Boise, Idaho 83720-0034

Honorable George H. Ryan
 Governor
 State of Illinois
 State Capitol, Room 207
 Springfield, Illinois 62706

Honorable Frank O'Bannon
 Governor
 State of Indiana
 206 State Capitol
 Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Honorable Tom Vilsack
 Governor-Elect
 State of Iowa
 State Capitol
 Des Moines, Iowa 50319-0001

Honorable Bill Graves
 Governor
 State of Kansas
 State Capitol, Second Floor
 Topeka, Kansas 66612-1590

Honorable Paul E. Patton
 Governor
 State of Kentucky
 State Capitol
 700 Capitol Street
 Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Honorable Mike Foster
 Governor
 State of Louisiana
 Post Office Box 94004
 Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70804-9004

Honorable Angus S. King, Jr.
 Governor
 State of Maine
 State House Station 1
 Augusta, Maine 04333

Honorable Parris N. Glendening
 Governor
 State of Maryland
 State House
 100 State Circle
 Annapolis, Maryland 21401

Honorable Argeo Paul Cellucci
 Governor
 State of Massachusetts
 State House, Room 360
 Boston, Massachusetts 02133

Honorable John Engler
 Governor
 State of Michigan
 Post Office Box 30013
 Lansing, Michigan 48909

Honorable Jesse Ventura
 Governor
 State of Minnesota
 130 State Capitol
 75 Constitution Avenue
 St. Paul, Minnesota 55155

Honorable Kirk Fordice
 Governor
 State of Mississippi
 Post Office Box 139
 Jackson, Mississippi 39205

Honorable Mel Carnahan
 Governor
 State of Missouri
 State Capitol, Room 216
 Jefferson City, Missouri 65102

Honorable Marc Racicot
 Governor
 State of Montana
 Governor's Office
 Post Office Box 0801
 Helena, Montana 59620-0801

Honorable Mike Johanns
 Governor
 State of Nebraska
 Post Office Box 94848
 Lincoln, Nebraska 68509-4848

Honorable Kenny Guinn
 Governor
 State of Nevada
 State Capitol
 Carson City, Nevada 89710

Honorable Jeanne Shaheen
 Governor
 State of New Hampshire
 Office of the Governor, Room 208
 Concord, New Hampshire 03301

Honorable Christine T. Whitman
 Governor
 State of New Jersey
 125 W. State Street
 Post Office Box 001
 Trenton, New Jersey 08625

Honorable Gary E. Johnson
 Governor
 State of New Mexico
 Office of the Governor
 State Capitol, Suite 400
 Santa Fe, New Mexico 87503

Honorable George E. Pataki
 Governor
 State of New York
 State Capitol
 Albany, New York 12224

Honorable James B. Hunt, Jr.
 Governor
 State of North Carolina
 State Capitol
 116 West Jones Street
 Raleigh, North Carolina 27603

Honorable Edward T. Schafer
 Governor
 State of North Dakota
 600 E. Boulevard Avenue
 Bismarck, North Dakota 58505

Honorable Robert A. Taft II
 Governor
 State of Ohio
 77 South High Street, 30th Floor
 Columbus, Ohio 43266

Honorable Frank Keating
 Governor
 State of Oklahoma
 State Capitol Building, Suite 212
 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73105

Honorable John A. Kitzhaber
 Governor
 State of Oregon
 254 State Capitol
 Salem, Oregon 97310

Honorable Tom Ridge
 Governor
 State of Pennsylvania
 225 Main Capitol Building
 Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120

Honorable Lincoln Almond
 Governor
 State of Rhode Island
 State House
 Providence, Rhode Island 02903

Honorable James H. "Jim" Hodges
 Governor
 State of South Carolina
 Post Office Box 113829
 Columbia, South Carolina 29211

Honorable William J. Janklow
Governor
State of South Dakota
500 E. Capitol
Pierre, South Dakota 57501

Honorable Don Sundquist
Governor
State of Tennessee
State Capitol
Nashville, Tennessee 37243-0001

Honorable George W. Bush
Governor
State of Texas
Post Office Box 12428
Austin, Texas 78711

Honorable Michael O. Leavitt
Governor
State of Utah
210 State Capitol
Salt Lake City, Utah 84114

Honorable Howard Dean, M.D.
Governor
State of Vermont
Pavilion Office Building
109 State Street
Montpelier, Vermont 05609

Honorable James S. Gilmore III
Governor
State of Virginia
State Capitol
Richmond, Virginia 23219

Honorable Gary Locke
Governor
State of Washington
Post Office Box 40002
Legislative Building
Olympia, Washington 98504-0002

Honorable Cecil H. Underwood
Governor
State of West Virginia
State Capitol Complex
Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0370

Honorable Tommy G. Thompson
Governor
State of Wisconsin
State Capitol
Post Office Box 7863
Madison, Wisconsin 53707

Honorable Jim Geringer
Governor
State of Wyoming
Office of the Governor
State Capitol Building, Room 124
Cheyenne, Wyoming 82002

Honorable Anthony A. Williams
Mayor, District of Columbia
One Judiciary Square, NW
Suite 1100S
Washington, D.C. 20001

Honorable Tauese P. F. Sunia
Governor of American Samoa
Executive Office Building
Pago Pago, American Samoa 96799

Honorable Carl T.C. Gutierrez
Office of the Governor
Post Office Box 2590
Agana, Guam 96910

Honorable Pedro P. Tenorio
Governor of Northern Mariana Islands
Caller Box 10007
Saipan, M.P.
Northern Mariana Islands 96950

Honorable Pedro J. Rosselló
Governor of Puerto Rico
La Fortaleza
San Juan, Puerto Rico 00901

Honorable Charles W. Turnbull
Governor of U.S. Virgin Islands
Government House
Charlotte Amalie
St. Thomas, Virgin Islands 00802