

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION
+ + + + +
ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON REACTOR SAFEGUARDS
US-APWR SUBCOMMITTEE
+ + + + +
OPEN SESSION
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2008
+ + + + +

The subcommittee came to order in closed session at 11:55 a.m. in room T2B3 of White Flint Two, Otto L. Maynard, Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT:

OTTO L. MAYNARD CHAIRMAN

DENNIS C. BLEY MEMBER

CHARLES H. BROWN JR. MEMBER

WILLIAM J. SHACK MEMBER

JOHN D. SIEBER MEMBER

JOHN W. STETKAR MEMBER

NEIL COLEMAN DESIGNATED FEDERAL OFFICIAL

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

11:55 a.m.

1
2
3 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Is there anybody outside
4 that's from the public?

5 DFO COLEMAN: Neither outside nor
6 downstairs.

7 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay. We're in open
8 session now and I would like to just go around the
9 room and see if the members have any final comments or
10 anything. I'll start with Jack.

11 MEMBER SIEBER: I have no additional
12 comments.

13 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay, John?

14 MEMBER STETKAR: Nothing.

15 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay. Bill?

16 MEMBER SHACK: No.

17 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Dennis?

18 MR. BLEY: I think I've said everything I
19 wanted to, thanks.

20 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay, Charlie?

21 MEMBER BROWN: No.

22 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay. I'd just like to
23 express my appreciation to both the staff and to MHI
24 for the presentations and the interaction. I think
25 that helps give us a much better overview of the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 topical reports and these issues and I think it will
2 be beneficial to our review later on.

3 As I've said before, this really is not
4 something that constitutes any agreement,
5 disagreement, approval, disapproval, or anything.
6 This is informational briefing, still ongoing
7 interaction between you and the staff. We'll have to
8 talk internally, as to what our next actions are or
9 what we need to -- on any of these for the future and
10 that we'll be discussing that with the staff and
11 provide that. But again, informational for us at this
12 time.

13 I will ask if MHI or anybody has any
14 comments before we closed?

15 MR. BURKHART: This is Larry Burkhart. It
16 is possible to answer two questions that Mr. Stetkar
17 brought up yesterday, about the human factors
18 engineering topical report, concerning the third
19 methodology and the other methodology that came up?

20 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Sure.

21 MR. BURKHART: Mike and John were real
22 quick to answer. So, Mike and --

23 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: We'll take any answer.
24 Just don't ask us a question, but we'll accept
25 answers.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 MR. BURKHART: Just to re-cap, the question
2 was, from what I recall, is are we approving the
3 specific methodology as part of the HFE topical
4 report, i.e., the third methodology and another
5 methodology that is used to validate some numbers or
6 come up with some numbers in the topical report?

7 MR. JUNGE: Yes, I guess my understanding
8 was it's whether we were accepting third methodology.
9 It's an accepted method. It's one that's been out
10 there for a while.

11 We're not accepting it. I mean, we're not
12 endorsing it as part of the topical. What we'll do is
13 look at how they used it and make sure that's okay.

14 But I'm speaking from FHEM, probably
15 stepping outside my bounds a little bit because that's
16 the PRA/HRA people that should be answering it.

17 MEMBER STETKAR: Yes, my biggest concern,
18 to clarify it, was not -- was if the third methodology
19 is accepted within the context of this topical report,
20 however it's used for, verifying the HSI, because the
21 topical report seems to be inter-woven quite closely
22 with human reliability analysis in the PRA. But was
23 there, by implication approval of that methodology --

24 MR. JUNGE: For the PRA?

25 MEMBER STETKAR: In other words, your

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 evaluation of the topical report could say, well, we
2 believe that this methodology is okay for verifying
3 certain aspects of the human system interface design.

4 However, you're not making any decision on the
5 applicability of that particular methodology for the
6 human reliability analysis within the context of the
7 PRA.

8 MR. JUNGE: Yes, used for Chapter 19 of the
9 --

10 MEMBER STETKAR: Right, that's why I said I
11 was outside my bounds a little bit, because that is --

12 MR. JUNGE: The other question I had was,
13 because the two issues, both using a specific
14 methodology to essentially verify some sort of task
15 analysis, let's say, for the human system interface
16 design, that particular methodology might have some
17 use in that context and yet, there might questions of
18 its usefulness or applicability in the PRA, for
19 example, and by accepting it for this context, is
20 there by implication, an acceptance that it's also
21 applied for the HRA within the PRA --

22 MEMBER STETKAR: No.

23 MR. JUNGE: Okay, that's. That was my
24 concern.

25 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay, is there another

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 one or is that it? Okay. I'm going to keep the
2 record open until 12:00 p.m. in case some member of
3 the public does walk in at 12:00 p.m. But I will say,
4 do you have any closing comments or anything?

5 MR. SCAROLA: I just wanted to thank
6 everyone for such an interactive discussion. I think
7 you gave us very good feedback. We certainly have
8 issues that we will then, now go back and address,
9 based on your feedback. Thank you for the opportunity
10 to get your wisdom. It was very helpful.

11 CHAIRMAN MAYNARD: Okay, again, I'm going
12 to leave the record open here for a minute, but thank
13 you very much.

14 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
15 concluded at approximately 12:00 p.m.)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701