

DRAFT  
WASHINGTON AS COMMEMORATION  
**Capital Cities Case Study Research Study**

**APPENDIX E**  
**ST. PAUL, MINNESOTA**

Developed by the National Capital Planning Commission,  
in conjunction with the National Park Service

September 2, 2010

## APPENDIX E: ST. PAUL, MINNESOTA

St. Paul has a current population of 287,151, making it the second largest city in Minnesota after Minneapolis. The Twin Cities metropolitan area is the 16th largest in the U.S. with a total population of 3.5 million.

### Commemoration Planning in St. Paul

In 1967, the Minnesota state legislature created the Capitol Area Architectural and Planning Board (CAAPB) to oversee planning and zoning in the 60-block area surrounding the capitol. Today, the Commission is comprised of 12 members, including the Lt. Governor who serves as Chair, two state house members, two state senators, four gubernatorial, and three City of St. Paul appointees.

The CAAPB maintains architectural and design authority regarding new buildings or renovations in the district and enforces the state law limiting the height of buildings surrounding the capitol. The zoning regulations controlling land uses, setbacks, height limitations and architectural elements are provided by Minnesota state statute. The CAAPB also prepares the area's comprehensive plan and approves the new location and design of new monuments in the capital area once the subjects have been authorized by the Minnesota legislature.

Most of the recent commemorations in St. Paul are located on the capitol grounds and its approaches, specifically the Capitol Mall, within the CAAPB's jurisdiction. There are currently nine memorials on the Mall with three that are in the planning stages. In May 1993, the CAAPB approved the *Commemorative Works in the Capitol Area: A Framework for the Initiation, Evaluation and Implementation of Commemorative Works in the Capitol Area of Saint Paul (Framework)* for works within its area of jurisdiction after recognizing that "renewed interest in memorials has accelerated to the point where it is necessary to develop an overall plan for orderly and appropriate development of future commemorative works in the Capitol Area."<sup>1</sup> The plan was developed in support of the area's comprehensive plan, prepared by the CAAPB in 1986, and amended in 2009.

The *Framework* was produced in-house with assistance from the CAAPB architectural advisors. The CAAPB approved the plan without extensive public outreach. Staff anticipates the plan will be updated within the next few years to address limited space remaining for new memorials and other issues.<sup>2</sup>

It should be noted that the City of St. Paul oversees the installation and maintenance of abundant public art throughout the rest of the city. Public art receives strong support from the community and active nonprofit advocacy organizations. Most of the new works under the city's jurisdiction constitute "art for art's sake" rather than commemoration.

### Commemorative Subject Matter and/or Thematic Analysis

The *Framework* identifies different locations on the Mall and capitol grounds for works based on theme:

- Executive, Legislative, Judicial – immediately surrounding the capitol building
- Minnesotans – John Ireland Boulevard; a radial street approaching the state capitol from the SW
- Military Veterans – Mall area south of the capitol
- Culture – Cedar Street; a radial street approaching the state capitol from the SE
- Area in Transition – University Avenue; east-west thoroughfare north of the capitol building<sup>3</sup>

Within these themes, commemorations are often grouped near other works with common subject matter. Governors, for example, are located together at the base of the steps of the capitol. Another example is the planned "Minnesota Memorial to Special Forces in Laos," which will be located near the Minnesota Vietnam Veterans Memorial since the conflicts were related.

Aside from the identification of themes, CAAPB does not take a position on the subject matter for new commemorations because those decisions are made by the legislature. The *Framework* presents a few policy guidelines that CAAPB usually enforces successfully by working with memorial proponents and legislators. Subject matter must have statewide significance and cannot be captured by works elsewhere in Minnesota, for example. In addition, individuals cannot be considered for commemoration in the first 10 years following death.

In cases where proposed monuments do not meet these conditions, planners work with the City of Saint Paul or other entities to locate commemorations on city-owned or private property, as was the case with the proposed memorial to Bob Hope.

### **Process to Establish New Works**

New commemorations on the Mall or elsewhere within CAAPB's jurisdiction may be authorized by the Minnesota state legislature. The CAAPB staff prefers that applicants discuss proposals with them first, but some bills are introduced without consultation so staff spend a significant amount of time following legislative news.

Early in the process, the applicant or the CAAPB conduct programming and feasibility studies to understand the scope and nature of the memorial and evaluate the proposal within the *Framework* guidelines. If the proposal meets the *Framework* requirements, the CAAPB proceeds with a site selection study, which considers the following questions in order to determine appropriate site selection criteria:

1. What is the symbolic significance of the site? Would the site reflect the level of significance of the commemorative work?
2. Does the commemorative work's site fit the thematic organization for commemorative works in the Comprehensive Plan, and is it suitable within the hierarchical organization of the Mall?
3. Will the commemorative work on this site provide an opportunity for urban design competition, that is, reestablish relationships with existing axes, vistas, entry points, and landmarks?
4. Is the site visible and accessible to the public? Are the levels of visibility and accessibility appropriate to the commemoration?
5. Will the utilization of this site interfere with, or encroach upon, any existing commemorative work?
6. Will selection of this site preserve and protect existing and proposed open space and its public use?<sup>4</sup>

The *Framework* also includes a set of design criteria for new works, which evaluates the following characteristics: legibility and meaning, approachability, size and scale, spatial envelopes, relationship to other commemorative works, setting, materials, visual context, climatic context, and evening illumination.<sup>5</sup>

The CAAPB Board must give preliminary approval to the site selection and criteria before the proponent can conduct a design competition or otherwise commission the work by an artist. Final design is approved by the CAAPB before construction can begin.

Memorial proponents often seek funding, usually a matching grant, from the Minnesota legislature. Sometimes state funding comes from lottery proceeds or vanity license plates authorized to support the memorial. While memorials vary in cost, recent works have ranged between \$200,000 and \$300,000. By law, projects exceeding \$1 million require a design competition; others may invite artists to compete or select a design team directly. All funding, including an additional 20% for maintenance must be raised before construction can begin.<sup>6</sup>

As available space on the Mall has dwindled, size has become a major consideration resulting in smaller works and the use of landscaping and other functional elements has become more popular. The Minnesota Woman Suffrage Memorial, for example, is designed as a garden with a decorative fence along a walkway with text tables (shown right).



*Minnesota Woman Suffrage Memorial*

The state also owns the copyright to all memorials, which gives CAAPB authority over the final design and completed work. Exercising this authority allowed the CAAPB to reject a proposed addition to the Vietnam Veterans Memorial and add an explanatory plaque to the Roy Wilkins Memorial.<sup>7</sup>

### **Selected Commemorations in St. Paul**

CAAPB staff note the acceleration of monument proposals since the 1980s. Of the 12 existing memorials in CAAPB's jurisdiction, nine have been constructed since 1982, including:

- Monument to the Living (1982) – dedicated to returning veterans from Vietnam
- Charles Lindbergh (1985)
- Minnesota Vietnam Veterans Memorial (1992)
- Roy Wilkins Memorial (1995) – Minnesotan civil rights leader
- Peace Officers Memorial (1995) – Minnesota law enforcement officers who died in the line of duty
- Korean War Veterans Memorial (1998)
- Minnesota Woman Suffrage Memorial (1999)
- World War II Memorial (2007)
- Minnesota Workers Memorial (2010)



*Minnesota Korean War Memorial*

In addition, three planned memorials that have also been sited: the Hubert Humphrey Memorial, Minnesota Firefighters Memorial and the Minnesota Memorial to Special Forces in Laos.

#### **a. Court of Honor**

The Court of Honor presents an alternative to permanent statues or memorials for military-related memorials on the Mall. The wall contains plaques honoring individuals and groups (sample plaque shown at right). Plaques must be approved by the state legislature and cost \$5,000, all of which must be privately funded. Only five spaces remain available, however.

An unwritten policy allows families to commemorate a deceased relative by planting a tree on the capitol grounds. No plaque or other identification is permitted.

#### **Photo Credits**

*Minnesota Woman Suffrage Memorial* – Kevin D. Hendricks,  
<http://www.flickr.com/photos/monkeyouttanowhere/2566305080/>

*Minnesota Korean War Memorial* – Joe Hoover,  
<http://www.geomyidae.com/index.php?RollID=pxstatecaptial&FrameID=capitolm08>

---

<sup>1</sup> Capitol Area Architectural and Planning Board (May 1993). *Commemorative Works in the Capitol Area: A Framework for the Initiation Evaluation, and Implementation in the Capitol Area of Saint Paul*. Printed in-house, p. 10.

<sup>2</sup> Mandell and Stark, personal interview.

<sup>3</sup> CAAPB planners anticipate future opportunities to expand commemorations along University Avenue as a light-rail line connecting Minneapolis and St. Paul is currently in the planning stages. The train would use the same corridor as the original streetcar.

<sup>4</sup> CAAPB, p. 14.

<sup>5</sup> CAAPB, p. 15-16.

<sup>6</sup> The *Framework* says 10% but CAAPB now requires 20% as a more accurate reflection of the maintenance costs, especially landscaping.

<sup>7</sup> The plaque on the Roy Wilkins Memorial helped to clarify the symbolism because the Minnesotan civil rights leader is carrying an African spear.