Peer Review Summary Document

(3/14/2012)

Peer Review Plan

http://www.usgs.gov/peer review/docs/rust fungus HI product2.pdf [78 KB PDF].

Title and Authorship of Information Product Disseminated

An Economic Approach to Assessing Import Policies Designed to Prevent the Arrival of Invasive Species: The case of *Puccinia psidii* in Hawai'i, By_Kimberly Burnett (University of Hawai'i Economic Research Organization), Sean D'Evelyn (University of Hawai'i Economic Research Organization), Lloyd Loope (U.S. Geological Survey), and Christopher Wada (University of Hawai'i Economic Research Organization).

Note: A Peer Review Summary Document for the previous publication of this product is found at <u>http://www.usgs.gov/peer review/docs/pr results summary rust fungus HI.pdf</u>.

Peer Reviewers Expertise and Credentials

Anonymous Peer Reviewer #1 – provided by the journal *Environmental Science and Policy*.

Charge Submitted to Peer Reviewers

The reviewer was asked to make an objective evaluation of the research.

Summary of Peer Reviewers Comments

Peer Reviewer #1: Overall, the reviewer found the analysis clear and straightforward. They questioned whether a more virulent strain of rust would arrive in Hawai'i, because the approach outlined implicitly assumes that a more virulent strain (for both Eucalyptus and 'ohi' [sic]) exists and will arrive, sooner or later. They also asked the authors to speculate on the assumption that the [quarantine] policy would be 100% effective.

Summary of USGS Response to Peer Reviewer Comments

The authors provided extensive data from the literature to support their response to Peer Reviewer #1 comments regarding potential risk of new strain introductions, and addressed the reviewer's interest in how less-than-100% quarantine effectiveness might be considered in the analysis.

The Dissemination

The published information product will be released in the open literature in the journal *Environmental Science and Policy*.