## MEDICAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION FINDINGS AND DECISION

Type of Requestor:       (X) HCP       () IC       Response Timely Filed?       (X) Yes       () No         Requestor:       Surgical and Diagnostic Center, LP       MAR Tracking No.:       M4-05-4369-01       MAR Tracking No.:       M4-05-4369-01         Type of Gequestor:       TWCC No.:       Injurd Employee's Name:       Marcon Contracting LP       Injurd Employee's Name:       McMahon Contracting LP         Respondent       American Zurich Insurance Co.       McMahon Contracting LP       Insurance Carrier's No.:       2720049304         PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND ENDINGS         OPERCIPATION SUMMARY         OPERCIPATION SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND ENDINGS         Amount in Dispute         Amount in Dispute         States of Service         OPERCIPATION SUMMARY         OPERCIPATION SUMMARY         Amount in Dispute         Amount in Dispute         Amount in Dispute         Out of diar and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges, Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART HI: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY <td colspan="4" dimenticate<="" th=""><th colspan="7">PART I: GENERAL INFORMATION</th></td>	<th colspan="7">PART I: GENERAL INFORMATION</th>				PART I: GENERAL INFORMATION						
Surgical and Diagnostic Center, LP 729 Bedford Ealess Road West, Ste. 100 Hurst, TX 76053  Reepondent American Zurich Insurance Co. Rep. Box # 19  American Zurich Insurance Co. Rep. Box # 19  Attributer Carrier's No.:  PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS  PART II: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMMARY  Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85–100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.  PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY  The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	Type of Requestor:	(X) HCP () IE (	) IC	Response Timely Filed? (X) Yes () No							
729 Bedford Euless Road West, Ste. 100       TWCC No.:         Hurst, TX 76053       Injured Employee's Name:         Respondent American Zurich Insurance Co.       Date of Injury:         Employer's Name:       McMahon Contracting LP         Insurance Carrier's No.:       2720049304         PART 11: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         OPART 11: SUMMARY         OPART 11: SUMMARY         OPART 11: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         OPART 11: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         OPART 11: SUMMARY         OPART 11: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY         Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable paymen		Center, LP		MDR Tracking No.: M4-05-4369-01							
Respondent American Zurich Insurance Co. Rep. Box # 19       Date of Injury:         Employer's Name:       McMahon Contracting LP         Insurance Carrier's No.:       2720049304         PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS       4mount in Dispute         Amount Due       From       To         93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy billed with procedure code 80.6       \$1682.54       \$0.00         1nsurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       <\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMMARY       South and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY       The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor				TWCC No.:							
American Zurich Insurance Co.         Rep. Box # 19       Employer's Name:       McMahon Contracting LP         Insurance Carrier's No::       2720049304         PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         Optical CPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute       Amount Due         From       To       93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy       \$1682.54       \$0.00         3-9-04       3-9-04       Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       \$1682.54       \$0.00         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY       Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       \$\$2257.50>       \$\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY       Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Worker's 'Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY         The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	Hurst, TX 76053			Injured Employee's Name:							
Employer's Name: McMahon Contracting LP         Insurance Carrier's No.:         2720049304         PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         Dates of Service       CPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute         Dates of Service       POPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute         From       To       Popt diled with procedure code 80.6       \$	1	nce Co.		Date of Injury:							
2720049304         PART II: SUMMARY OF DISPUTE AND FINDINGS         Dates of Service       CPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute       Amount Due         From       To       93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy billed with procedure code 80.6       \$1682.54       \$0.00         3-9-04       3-9-04       Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       \$1682.54       \$0.00         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY         Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Worker's Compensation carrier's are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY				Employer's Name: McMahon Contracting LP							
Dates of Service       CPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute       Amount Due         From       To       Pamount Due       Amount Due         3-9-04       3-9-04       93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy billed with procedure code 80.6       \$1682.54       \$0.00         Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       Insurance carrier's payment       <\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY       Vertice and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Worker's Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMARY       The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor											
Dates of Service       CPT Code(s) or Description       Amount in Dispute       Amount Due         From       To       Pamount Due       Amount Due         3-9-04       3-9-04       93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy billed with procedure code 80.6       \$1682.54       \$0.00         Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       Insurance carrier's payment       <\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARY       Vertice and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Worker's Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMARY       The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	DADT II. SUMMADV OF DISDUTE AND FINDINGS										
FromToAmount in DisputeAmount Due3-9-04To93005, 93010, knee arthroscopy billed with procedure code 80.6\$1682.54\$0.003-9-04Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)<\$2257.50>PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMARYOur charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMARYThe billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor											
FromToImage: Constraint of the second	Dates of	Dates of Service		<b>CPT</b> Code(s) or Description		Amount Due					
3-9-04       3-9-04       billed with procedure code 80.6       \$1082.54       \$0.00         Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       Insurance carrier's payment       <\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMMARY         Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY         The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	From	То			-						
Insurance carrier's payment (subtracted)       <\$2257.50>         PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMMARY          Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.         PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY         The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	3-9-04	3-9-04			\$1682.54	\$0.00					
Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.           PART IV:         RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY           The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor						<\$2257.50>					
Our charges are fair and reasonable based on another insurance companies determination of fair and reasonable payments of 85 – 100% of our billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation claims.           PART IV:         RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY           The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	PART III: REQUESTOR'S POSITION SUMMARY										
The billing in dispute has been paid at a fair and reasonable rate in accordance with TWCC guidelines, policies and rules, and the Texas Labor	billed charges. Workers' Compensation carriers are subject to a duty of good faith and fair dealing in the process of worker's compensation										
	PART IV: RESPONDENT'S POSITION SUMMARY										
PART V: MEDICAL DISPUTE RESOLUTION REVIEW SUMMARY METHODOLOGY AND/OR EXPLANATION											

This dispute relates to services provided in an Ambulatory Surgical Center that are not covered under a fee guideline for this date of service. Accordingly, the reimbursement determined through this dispute resolution process must reflect a fair and reasonable rate as directed by Commission Rule 134.1. This case involves a factual dispute about what is a fair and reasonable reimbursement for the services provided.

On 3-9-04, claimant underwent knee arthroscopy with meniscectomy .

After reviewing the documentation provided by both parties, it appears that neither party has provided convincing documentation that sufficiently discusses, demonstrates, and justifies that their purported amount is a fair and reasonable reimbursement (Rule 133.307). After reviewing the services, the charges, and both parties' positions, it is clearly evident that some other amount represents the fair and reasonable reimbursement.

During the rule development process for facility guidelines, the Commission had contracted with Ingenix, a professional firm specializing in actuarial and health care information services, in order to secure data and information on reimbursement ranges for these types of services. The results of this analysis resulted in a recommended range for reimbursement for workers' compensation services provided in these facilities. In addition, we received information from both ASCs and insurance carriers in the recent rule revision process. While not controlling, we considered this information in order to find data related to commercial market payments for these services. This information provides a very good benchmark for determining the "fair and reasonable" reimbursement amount for the services in dispute.

Signature of Insurance Carrier: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

To determine the amount due for this particular dispute, staff compared the procedures in this case to the amounts that would be within the reimbursement range recommended by the Ingenix study (from 213.3% to 290% of Medicare for 2004). Staff considered the other information submitted by the parties and the issues related to the specific procedures performed in this dispute. Based on this review and considering the similarity of the various procedures involved in this surgery, staff selected a reimbursement amount in the medium end of the Ingenix range. Based on this review, the original reimbursement exceeds the high end of the Ingenix range. The decision for no additional reimbursement was then presented to a staff team with health care provider billing and insurance adjusting experience. This team considered the decision and discussed the facts of the individual case.

Based on the facts of this situation, the parties' positions, the Ingenix range for applicable procedures, and the consensus of other experienced staff members in Medical Review, we find that no additional reimbursement is due for these services.

## PART VI: COMMISSION DECISION

Authorized Signature

Based upon the review of the disputed healthcare services, the Medical Review Division has determined that the requestor is not entitled to additional reimbursement.

Findings and Decision by:

Elizabeth Pickle, RHIA

August 16, 2005

Typed Name

Date of Order

## PART VII: YOUR RIGHT TO REQUEST A HEARING

Either party to this medical dispute may disagree with all or part of the Decision and has a right to request a hearing. A request for a hearing must be in writing and it must be received by the TWCC Chief Clerk of Proceedings/Appeals Clerk within 20 (twenty) days of your receipt of this decision (28 Texas Administrative Code § 148.3). This Decision was mailed to the health care provider and placed in the Austin Representatives box on \_\_\_\_\_. This Decision is deemed received by you five days after it was mailed and the first working day after the date the Decision was placed in the Austin Representative's box (28 Texas Administrative Code § 102.5(d)). A request for a hearing should be sent to: Chief Clerk of Proceedings/Appeals Clerk, P.O. Box 17787, Austin, Texas, 78744 or faxed to (512) 804-4011. A copy of this Decision should be attached to the request.

The party appealing the Division's Decision shall deliver a copy of their written request for a hearing to the opposing party involved in the dispute.

Si prefiere hablar con una persona in español acerca de ésta correspondencia, favor de llamar a 512-804-4812.

## PART VIII: INSURANCE CARRIER DELIVERY CERTIFICATION

I hereby verify that I received a copy of this Decision and Order in the Austin Representative's box.