

WORKER DEATHS IN CONFINED SPACES

A Summary of NIOSH Surveillance and Investigative Findings

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES
Public Health Service
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health

January 1994

DISCLAIMER

Mention of the name of any company or product does not constitute endorsement by the
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health

This document is in the public domain and may be freely copied or reprinted.

Copies of this and other NIOSH documents are available from:

Publications Dissemination, DSDTT
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health
4676 Columbia Parkway
Cincinnati, OH 45226-1998
Fax (513) 533-8573

DHHS (NIOSH) Number 94-103

For further information about occupational safety and health, call **1-800-35-NIOSH**

CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	iv
LIST OF TABLES	v
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ix
INTRODUCTION	1
(Thomas R. Bender, M.D., M.P.H.)	

PART I

CONFINED-SPACE-RELATED FATALITIES

OVERVIEW OF CONFINED-SPACE HAZARDS	5
(Ted A. Pettit, M.S., R.E.H.S., and Richard Braddee, B.A.)	
EPIDEMIOLOGY OF CONFINED-SPACE-RELATED FATALITIES	11
(Anthony J. Suruda, M.D., M.P.H., Dawn N. Castillo, M.P.H., James C. Helmkamp, Ph.D. and Ted A. Pettit, M.S., R.E.H.S.)	
PREVENTION: ELEMENTS OF A CONFINED-SPACE PROGRAM	27
(Ted A. Pettit, M.S., R.E.H.S.)	
REFERENCES	29

LIST OF FIGURES

<i>Figure 1. Types of Confined Spaces</i>	5
<i>Figure 2. Number of Victims in Multiple Fatality Confined-Space Incidents Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=72)</i>	13
<i>Figure 3. Deaths in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF by Year, 1980-1989 (N=670)</i>	14
<i>Figure 4. Race/Ethnicity Noted on Death Certificates for Deaths in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=670)</i>	15
<i>Figure 5. Rates of Confined-Space Deaths Identified by NTOF by Industry, 1980-1989 (N=670)</i>	15
<i>Figure 6. Circumstances Noted on Death Certificates for Deaths in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=670)</i>	17
<i>Figure 7. Atmospheric Conditions Noted on Death Certificates for Deaths in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=373)</i>	17
<i>Figure 8. Loose Materials Involved in Mechanical Asphyxiations in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=227)</i>	18
<i>Figure 9. Trench Cave-in Deaths Identified by NTOF by Year, 1980-1989 (N=606)</i>	19
<i>Figure 10. Confined-Space-Related Fatalities Investigated by FACE, by Age Distribution of Victims, 1983-1993 (N=109)</i>	22
<i>Figure 11. Confined-Space-Related Fatalities Investigated by FACE, by Type of Training Received by Victim, 1983-1993 (N=109)</i>	24

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Confined-Space Classification	8
Table 2. E-Codes Assigned to Death Certificate Diagnoses for Deaths in Confined Spaces Identified by NTOF, 1980-1989 (N=670)	16
Table 3. Fatal Confined-Space Incidents Investigated by FACE, by Industry and Number of Victims per Incident, 1983-1993 (N=70)	20
Table 4. Fatal Confined-Space Incidents Investigated by FACE, by Industry and Type of Hazard, 1983-1993 (N=70)	21
Table 5. Fatal Confined-Space Incidents Investigated by FACE, by Industry and Training Procedures Implemented, 1983-1993	21
Table 6. Confined-Space-Related Fatalities Investigated by FACE, by Industry and Employment Sector of Victim, 1983-1993 (N=109)	23
Table 7. Confined-Space-Related Fatalities Investigated by FACE, by Confined Space Type and Reason for Entry, 1983-1993 (N=109)	23

PART II

FATALITY ASSESSMENT AND CONTROL EVALUATION (FACE) SUMMARY REPORTS

Atmospheric Hazards - Flammable/Explosive

FACE 85-05 Toluene tank, 2 fatalities	37
FACE 87-33 Wastewater Treatment Plant (WWTP) digester (methane), 2 fatalities	41
FACE 87-50 Truck tanker (paint thinner), 1 fatality	43
FACE 88-30 Truck tanker (gasoline), 1 fatality	46
FACE 89-38 Tank (epoxy spray paint), 1 fatality	48

Atmospheric Hazards - Inert Gases and Simple Asphyxiants

FACE 85-02 Gas well fracturing tank (natural gas), 2 fatalities	53
FACE 85-40 Water meter vault (methane), 1 fatality	55
FACE 86-13 Fermentation tank (carbon dioxide), 1 fatality	58
FACE 87-27 Tanker truck (nitrogen), 1 fatality	60
FACE 88-20 Furnace (argon), 1 fatality	63
FACE 89-44 Manure pit (methane), 2 fatalities	65
FACE 89-46 Manure pit (methane), 5 fatalities	68
FACE 91-14 Furnace (argon), 1 fatality	71

Atmospheric Hazards - Oxygen Deficient Air

FACE 86-37 Water valve pit, 2 fatalities	77
FACE 86-48 Drainage pit, 1 fatality	79
FACE 86-54 Sewer manhole, 1 fatality	81
FACE 87-06 Water valve vault, 2 fatalities	83
FACE 87-23 Water meter pit, 1 fatality	86
FACE 87-39 Grain silo, 1 fatality	88
FACE 87-57 Swimming pool pump manhole, 1 fatality	91
FACE 87-59 Water well, 1 fatality	95
FACE 87-64 Steam line vault, 1 fatality	97
FACE 88-01 WWTP filter bed manhole, 2 fatalities	99
FACE 88-36 Water valve manhole, 3 fatalities	103
FACE 88-44 Sewer manhole, 1 fatality	106
FACE 91-17 Water valve manhole, 1 fatality	108
FACE 92-17 Fracturing tank, 2 fatalities	114
FACE 92-29 Manure pit, 2 fatalities	117

Atmospheric Hazards - Solvents

FACE 85-09 Gasoline tank, 1 fatality	123
FACE 85-26 Gasoline tank, 1 fatality	126
FACE 85-33 Water valve vault (epoxy spray paint), 1 fatality	128
FACE 86-23 Conveyor pit (chloroform), 1 fatality	130
FACE 86-34 Degreasing tank (trichloroethylene), 3 fatalities	132
FACE 87-17 Degreasing tank (freon F-113), 1 fatality	135

FACE 89-05 Tank (xylene), 1 fatality	139
FACE 93-08 WWTP chlorination tank (toluene), 3 fatalities	142

Atmospheric Hazards - Toxic Gases

FACE 84-11 WWTP digester (carbon monoxide), 2 fatalities	149
FACE 84-13 Sewer line (carbon monoxide), 2 fatalities	155
FACE 85-23 Holding tank (hydrogen sulfide), 2 fatalities	160
FACE 85-27 Clarifier tank (acid fume), 1 fatality	162
FACE 85-31 Sewage pump station (hydrogen sulfide), 4 fatalities	166
FACE 85-44 WWTP sludge tank (hydrogen sulfide), 2 fatalities	168
FACE 86-38 Industrial septic tank (chlorine), 3 fatalities	171
FACE 87-20 WWTP digester unit (sewer gas), 2 fatalities	174
FACE 87-26 Acid storage tank (hydrogen sulfide), 1 fatality	177
FACE 87-45 Sewer manhole (sewer gas), 1 fatality	180
FACE 87-67 Sewer manhole (hydrogen sulfide), 2 fatalities	182
FACE 88-33 Plating vat (hydrogen cyanide), 5 fatalities	185
FACE 89-28 Sewer manhole (hydrogen sulfide), 2 fatalities	189
FACE 90-30 Well (carbon monoxide), 3 fatalities	192
FACE 92-28 Manure pit (hydrogen sulfide), 2 fatalities	197

Physical Hazards - Engulfment

FACE 86-19 Saw dust bin, 1 fatality	203
FACE 87-49 Grain bin, 1 fatality	205
FACE 89-33 Grain bin, 1 fatality	207
FACE 91-04 Saw dust silo, 1 fatality	210
FACE 91-12 Grain bin, 1 fatality	214
FACE 92-34 Feed storage bin, 1 fatality	219

Physical Hazards - Falls

FACE 87-46 WWTP wet well, 1 fatality	225
FACE 87-47 WWTP filter tank; 1 fatality	228
FACE 88-14 Municipal water tank, 1 fatality	231
FACE 90-12 Municipal water tank, 1 fatality	234
FACE 90-16 Manufacturing company water tank, 1 fatality	236

Physical Hazards - Electrocuting

FACE 88-16 Underground utility vault, 1 fatality	243
FACE 88-28 Underground utility tunnel, 1 fatality	246
FACE 90-32 Electric utility vault, 1 fatality	248

Physical Hazards - Drowning

FACE 87-05 Construction manhole, 1 fatality	253
FACE 90-14 Municipal sewer wet well, 1 fatality	256
FACE 90-17 Municipal sewer wet well, 1 fatality	260
FACE 91-23 WWTP recirculation pit, 1 fatality	263
FACE 93-17 Well cleaning, 2 fatalities	269

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors would like to express our gratitude to the following people for their contributions in the development of this Confined Space Report:

Fatality investigations and reports (in Part II of this document): Richard W. Braddee, Virgil J. Casini, Jan C. Manwaring, Paul H. Moore, and Ted A. Pettit, Division of Safety Research; and Dwayne L. Smith, Veterans Administration (formerly with the Division of Safety Research).

Technical review: Laurence D. Reed, Division of Standards Development and Technology Transfer; Richard M. Ronk, Thomas K. Hodous, M.D., Herbert I. Linn, and Timothy J. Pizatella, Division of Safety Research; and Michael R. Myers, Washington Environmental Training Resource Center, Auburn, Washington.

Word processing and document preparation: Norma J. Bolyard, Rebecca S. Bloom and Joyce A. Blosser, Division of Safety Research.

Graphic and document layout: Joyce R. Spiker, Division of Safety Research.

Graphics technical review: Alan R. Daniel, Division of Safety Research.

Editorial review: Herbert I. Linn, Linda L. Morton, and Paul R. Keane, Division of Safety Research.

Cover design: Herbert I. Linn, Division of Safety Research.

INTRODUCTION

Thomas R. Bender, M.D., M.P.H.

This monograph contains summary data and investigative reports of fatal incidents involving workers who entered confined spaces. These investigations were undertaken as part of the Fatality Assessment and Control Evaluation (FACE) program conducted by the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH). The FACE program was initiated in 1982 and directed from its inception by the NIOSH Division of Safety Research.

The program which was originally known as the Fatal Accident Circumstances and Epidemiology program was given its new name in 1992. FACE is a surveillance program for the identification and investigation of fatal occupational injuries. Currently, the investigations are conducted in four categories—falls from elevations, contact with electrical energy, entry into confined spaces, and machine-related incidents. These categories represent frequent causes of nonmotor vehicle-related, fatal occupational injuries.

The NIOSH Division of Safety Research conducts the FACE investigations to gather information on factors that may have contributed to traumatic occupational fatalities. The circumstances of a particular fatal injury can initially appear to be the result of random, or unpredictable, events. However, each incident can be determined to be the product of certain factors, which when analyzed may reveal the causal connection between a chain of events and the fatal outcome.

Derived from the research conducted by William Haddon, Jr. (the Haddon model), this approach reflects the public health perception that the etiology of injuries is multifactorial and largely preventable.¹ For each case, factors associated with the agent (mode of energy exchange), the host (the worker who died) and the environment are identified during the pre-event, event, and post-event time phases. These contributory factors are investigated in detail in each FACE incident, and are summarized in each FACE summary report, along with recommendations for preventing future incidents of a similar nature.

From December 1983, through September 1993, the deaths of 480 workers in 423 incidents were investigated. Seventy of these investigations involved confined spaces where 109 persons died. In 25 of the confined-space incidents, there were multiple fatalities, including those deaths which involved persons attempting rescue.

In addition to the individual FACE reports, a summary of information on the national incidence of fatal occupational injury within confined spaces, over the 10-year period, 1980 through 1989, is provided. This information is taken from the National Traumatic Occupational Fatalities (NTOF) surveillance system also maintained by our Division. It provides a comprehensive view of the national toll of fatal injuries from this cause, by industry, reason for entry, and other epidemiologically significant categorizations.

This document is intended to become a resource and case study manual for safety and public health professionals, safety and health instructors, research personnel, and public safety personnel. It joins various NIOSH Alerts,²⁻⁵ and the NIOSH document Criteria for a Recommended Standard: Working in Confined Spaces,⁶ and related publications,⁷⁻¹¹ developed to prevent the deaths of those who must work in confined spaces.

