

**Quantitative Assessment of Relative Risk to Public Health from Foodborne
Listeria monocytogenes Among Selected Categories of Ready-to-Eat Foods**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contributors (2003 version).....	iv
Acknowledgments (2003 Version)	v
Contributors (2001 Draft Version).....	vi
Acknowledgments (2001 Draft version).....	vii
Executive Summary.....	viii
Table of Contents.....	xvi
List of Tables	xviii
List of Figures.....	xxi
Abbreviations and Acronyms	xxvi
Glossary	xxvii
I. Introduction	1
II. Hazard Identification.....	9
Listeriosis.....	10
Invasive Listeriosis.....	11
High Risk Individuals	12
Non-Invasive Listeriosis (Listerial Gastroenteritis)	13
Asymptomatic Carriage	14
Epidemiological Patterns of Listeriosis: Sporadic versus Outbreak-Associated Cases	15
Sporadic Listeriosis.....	16
Outbreak-Associated Listeriosis.....	17
III. Exposure Assessment.....	24
Food Category Identification	26
Food Consumption Data	29
Food Contamination Data	36
Growth Data.....	39
Modeling: <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Levels in Food at Retail	43
Results: Modeled Contamination at Retail.....	57
Modeling: Growth Between Retail and Consumption.....	60
Modeling: Interaction of Storage Times and Temperatures	66
Modeling: Thermal Inactivation.....	68
Results: Modeled <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Levels in Food at Consumption	71
IV. Hazard Characterization	76
Dose-Response Modeling	78
Comparison of the FDA/FSIS Revised Dose-Response Model to Other Dose-Response Models for <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i>	79
Dose-Response in Animal Surrogates.....	83
Data Collected from Animal Studies.....	83
Modeling: Dose-Response in Mice	86
Dose-Response Curves for Infection and Serious Illness.....	87
Variability in Virulence.....	89
Host Susceptibility	95
Modeling: Host Susceptibility.....	98
Dose-Response Scaling Factor.....	100
Results: Dose-Response Curves for Three Population Groups	106
V. Risk Characterization.....	112
Simulation Modeling.....	112
Results.....	115
Overview and Discussion of Food Categories.....	128
Summaries of the Food Categories	130

VI. ‘What if’ Scenarios 206

VII. Interpretation and Conclusions 227

New References 238

References 244

Appendices 273

 Appendix 1: Chronology of Technical and Scientific Reviews of the Revised FDA/FSIS *Listeria monocytogenes* Risk Assessment Document 274

 Appendix 2: Summary of Public Comments and FDA/FSIS’s Responses 277

 Appendix 3: An Overview of the Risk Assessment 325

 Appendix 4: The Foodborne Diseases Active Surveillance Network 338

 Appendix 5: Food Categories Modeled Distributions and Related Information 340

 Appendix 6: Software 436

 Appendix 7: *Listeria* Contamination of Food Categories Data Sets 442

 Appendix 8: Growth of *Listeria monocytogenes* in Foods 502

 Appendix 9: Using Outbreak Investigations in Quantitative Risk Assessment 513

 Appendix 10: Additional Risk Characterization Information 524

 Appendix 11: Research Needs 529

 Appendix 12: Cluster Analysis for Groupings of Food Categories 534

**Quantitative Assessment of Relative Risk to Public Health from Foodborne
Listeria monocytogenes Among Selected Categories of Ready-to-Eat Foods**

LIST OF TABLES

Summary Table 1. Relative Risk Ranking and Predicted Median Cases of Listeriosis for the Total United States Population on a per Serving and per Annum Basis	x
Table II-1. Incidence of Foodborne Pathogens in the United States	10
Table II-2. Reports of Outbreaks of Listerial Gastroenteritis	14
Table II-3. Isolation of <i>Listeria Monocytogenes</i> In Food Specimens Collected from the Refrigerators of Patients with Listeriosis.....	17
Table II-4. Outbreaks of Listeriosis in the United States (1970-2002) with Known Food Vehicle(s).....	19
Table II-5. Outbreaks of Listeriosis Outside the United States (1970-2000) with Known Food Vehicle.....	21
Table II-6. A Comparative Ranking of Types of Food Vehicles by Outbreaks and Cases with Combined United States and International Outbreak Data	22
Table III-1. Food Categories Used in this <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Risk Assessment	28
Table III-2. Estimates of the Total Number of Annual Servings of Foods Consumed in the United States by Population and Food Category	34
Table III-3. Percentiles of Serving Size Distributions for Each Food Category	35
Table III-4. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Contamination: Numbers of Qualitative and Quantitative Studies and Samples.....	37
Table III-5. Variation in Post-Retail Storage Times Assigned to the Food Categories.....	40
Table III-6. Refrigerated Storage Times for Frankfurters and Deli Meats in the Home	41
Table III-7. Frequency Distribution of Home Refrigerator Temperatures.....	42
Table III-8. Mean Exponential <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Growth Rates and Total Number of Samples From Growth Rate Studies for Each Food Category	43
Table III-9. Selected Studies Used to Characterize the Distribution of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> in Food at Retail	47
Table III-10. Standard Deviation Ranges for Each Food Category.....	48

Table III-11. Prevalence Reduction Ratios for <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Using Study Age.....	50
Table III-12. Estimated Storage Temperature and Duration Between Manufacture and Retail and Predicted Median Growth.....	52
Table III-13. Prevalence Studies of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> in Smoked Seafood.....	55
Table III-14. Modeled Percentage Distribution of Food Servings Contaminated with <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> at Retail.....	58
Table III-15. Cumulative Distribution of the Reduction (\log_{10}) of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> in Reheated Frankfurters.....	71
Table III-16. Modeled Percentage Distribution of Food Servings Contaminated with <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> at Time of Consumption.....	73
Table III-17. Number of Servings of Food per Year Containing Various Levels of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i>	75
Table IV-1. Characteristics of This <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Risk Assessment (FDA/FSIS) and Previously Conducted <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Risk Assessments that Contain Dose-Response Models for Listeriosis.....	82
Table IV-2. Parameters for the Statistical Distribution Models Used in the Probability Tree for the Mouse Dose-Frequency Relationship.....	87
Table IV-3. LD ₅₀ Values for Various <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Strains Following Intraperitoneal Injection in Normal Mice.....	92
Table IV-4. Effect of Route of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Administration (Intragastric vs. Intraperitoneal) on Mouse LD ₅₀	93
Table IV-5. Parameters for the Statistical Distribution Models Used in the Probability Tree for Variation in Strain Virulence.....	94
Table IV-6. Model Output for <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Strain Virulence.....	94
Table IV-7. Parameters for Variability Distributions for Host Susceptibility for Listeriosis.....	98
Table IV-8. Model Output for Variability Adjustment Factors for Host Susceptibility to Listeriosis.....	100
Table IV-9. Model-Dependence of the <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Dose-Response Scaling Factor Ranges for the Three Subpopulations.....	102
Table IV-10. Number of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Isolates by Patient Age and Year of Occurrence.....	104

Table IV-11. Reported and National Annual Projections for Severe Listeriosis, Based of FoodNet Reports	105
Table IV-12. Dose-Response with Variable <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Strain Virulence for Three Age-Based Subpopulations.....	110
Table V-1. Estimated Number of Cases of Listeriosis per Serving for each Food Category and Subpopulation.....	119
Table V-2. Predicted Relative Risk Rankings For Listeriosis Among Food Categories for Three Age-Based Subpopulations and the United States Total Population Using Median Estimates of Predicted Relative Risks for Listeriosis on a per Serving Basis.....	122
Table V-3. Estimated Number of Cases of Listeriosis per Annum for each Food Category and Subpopulation	125
Table V-4. Predicted Relative Risk Rankings for Listeriosis Among Food Categories for Three Age-Based Subpopulations and the United States Total Population Using Median Estimates of Relative Predicted Risks for Listeriosis on a per Annum Basis	127
Table V-5a. Criteria Used to Designate Parameter Ranges for <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Among the Food Categories	131
Table V-5b. Summary of Data Used to Model <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Exposure for Each Food Relative to Other Food Categories	132
Table V-6. Relative Risk Ranking and Predicted Median Cases of Listeriosis for the Total United States Population on a per Serving and per Annum Basis	133
Table VI-1. Estimated Reduction of Cases of Listeriosis from Limits on Refrigeration Temperatures.....	209
Table VI-2. Impact of Home Refrigerator Storage Times on the Number of Predicted Cases of Listeriosis Attributed to Smoked Seafood for the Elderly Subpopulation.....	214
Table VI-3. Scenario testing: Reducing the Estimated Consumption of Unreheated Frankfurters.....	216
Table VI-4. Comparison of Baseline and a High Prevalence Scenerio Risk per Serving for Fresh Soft Cheese for Two Subpopulations.....	221
Table VI-5. Impact of Excluding Non-U.S. and Chocolate Milk from the Pasteurized Fluid Milk Food Category on the Number of Cases of Listeriosis per Serving Basis.....	224
Table VI-6. Impact of Excluding Non-U.S. and Chocolate Milk from the Pasteurized Fluid Milk Food Category on the Number of Cases of Listeriosis per Annum Basis	225
Table VII-1. Results of Cluster Analysis at the 0.1 Level.....	229

**Quantitative Assessment of Relative Risk to Public Health from Foodborne
Listeria monocytogenes Among Selected Categories of Ready-to-Eat Foods**

LIST OF FIGURES

Summary Figure 1. Two-Dimensional Matrix of Food Categories Based on Cluster Analysis of Predicted per Serving and per Annum Relative Rankings	xii
Figure I-1. Overview of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Risk Assessment Document	8
Figure III-1. Components of the Exposure Assessment Model	25
Figure III-2. Example of the Contamination Curve for a Typical Food Category Showing Frequencies of Detectable and Nondetectable Samples	45
Figure III-3. A Lognormal Distribution for <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> in Smoked Seafood.....	46
Figure III-4. Modeled Contamination Data for Smoked Seafood Food Category	56
Figure III-5. Modeled Distribution of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Contamination Levels in Food Servings at Time of Retail	59
Figure III-6. Example of a Modified BetaPert Distribution	64
Figure III-7. Storage Time Distribution for Frankfurters and Deli Meats.....	65
Figure III-8. Three Dimensional Graph of the Modeled Distribution of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Levels of Contamination at the Time of Consumption for the Food Categories	74
Figure IV-1. Components of the Dose-Response Model.....	78
Figure IV-2. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Dose vs. Mortality in Mice	87
Figure IV-3. Dose vs. Frequency of Infection in Mice.....	88
Figure IV-4. Variation (Cumulative Frequency) of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Strain Virulences: Nine Distributions	94
Figure IV-5. 1999 FoodNet Estimates of Listeriosis Incidence, by Age.....	104
Figure IV-6. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Dose-Response for Mortality with Variable Strain Virulence for the Intermediate-Age Subpopulation.....	107
Figure IV-7. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Dose-Response for Mortality with Variable Strain Virulence for the Neonatal Subpopulation	108

Figure IV-8. <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Dose-Response for Mortality with Variable Strain Virulence for the Elderly	110
Figure IV-9. Dose Frequency Function for Elderly Population with a Single Strain of Unknown Virulence	111
Figure V-1. Components of the Risk Characterization Model	113
Figure V-2. Predicted Cases of Listeriosis (log scale) Associated with Food Categories for the Total United States Population on a per Serving Basis.....	120
Figure V-3. Predicted Cases of Listeriosis (log scale) Associated with Food Categories for the Total United States Population on a per Annum Basis	126
Figure V-4a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Smoked Seafood	136
Figure V-4b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Smoked Seafood	136
Figure V-5a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Raw Seafood	139
Figure V-5b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Raw Seafood.....	139
Figure V-6a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Preserved Fish ...	142
Figure V-6b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Preserved Fish ...	142
Figure V-7a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Cooked Ready-to-Eat Crustaceans.....	145
Figure V-7b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Cooked Ready-to-Eat Crustaceans.....	145
Figure V-8a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Vegetables	148
Figure V-8b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Vegetables	148
Figure V-9a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Fruits.....	151
Figure V-9b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Fruits.....	151
Figure V-10a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Fresh Soft Cheese.....	155
Figure V-10b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Fresh Soft Cheese.....	155

Figure V-11a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Soft Unripened Cheese	158
Figure V-11b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Soft Unripened Cheese	158
Figure V-12a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Soft Ripened Cheese	161
Figure V-12b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Soft Ripened Cheese	161
Figure V-13a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Semi-soft Cheese	164
Figure V-13b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Semi-soft Cheese	164
Figure V-14a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Hard Cheese	166
Figure V-14b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Hard Cheese.....	166
Figure V-15a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Processed Cheese	169
Figure V-15b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Processed Cheese	169
Figure V-16a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Pasteurized Fluid Milk	173
Figure V-16b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Pasteurized Fluid Milk	173
Figure V-17a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Unpasteurized Fluid Milk	177
Figure V-17b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Unpasteurized Fluid Milk	177
Figure V-18a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Ice Cream and Frozen Dairy Products	180
Figure V-18b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Ice Cream and Frozen Dairy Products	180
Figure V-19a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Cultured Milk Products.....	183

Figure V-19b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Cultured Milk Products.....	183
Figure V-20a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for High Fat and Other Dairy Products	186
Figure V-20b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for High Fat and Other Dairy Products	186
Figure V-21a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Frankfurters (Reheated).....	190
Figure V-21b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Frankfurters (Reheated).....	190
Figure V-22a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Frankfurters (Not Reheated).....	193
Figure V-22b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Frankfurters (Not Reheated).....	193
Figure V-23a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Dry/Semi-Dry Fermented Sausages.....	196
Figure V-23b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Dry/Semi-Dry Fermented Sausages.....	196
Figure V-24a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Deli Meats	199
Figure V-24b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Deli Meats	199
Figure V-25a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Pâté and Meat Spreads.....	202
Figure V-25b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Pâté and Meat Spreads.....	202
Figure V-26a. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Serving for Deli-type Salads	205
Figure V-26b. Rankings of Total Predicted Listeriosis Cases per Annum for Deli-type Salads	205
Figure VI-1. Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Population Attributable to Deli Meat as a Function of Maximum Storage Temperature	208
Figure VI-2. Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Population Attributable to Pasteurized Milk as a Function of Maximum Storage Temperature	209

Figure VI-3. Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Subpopulation Attributable to Deli Meats as a Function of Maximum Storage Time	211
Figure VI-4. Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Subpopulation Attributable to Pasteurized Milk as a Function of Maximum Storage Time	212
Figure VI-5. Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Subpopulation Attributable to Deli Meats as a Function of Maximum Storage Time and Maximum Storage Temperature.....	215
Figure VI-6. Cases of Listeriosis (per serving basis) for the Elderly Population as a Function of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Concentration at Consumption in Deli Meats	216
Figure VI-7. Reduction of Predicted Annual Mortality in the Elderly Subpopulation Attributable to Deli Meats as a Function of Log Kill Achieved by the Inclusion of a Lethal Intervention Prior to Retail	218
Figure VI-8. Predicted Mortality per Serving for the Elderly Subpopulation When Specific Concentrations of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> in Deli Meats at Retail are Allowed to Grow Before Consumption	220
Figure VI-9. Cases of Listeriosis (per serving basis) for the Elderly Subpopulation as a Function of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Concentration at Consumption for Deli Meat	222
Figure VI-10. Cases of Listeriosis (per serving basis) for the Neonatal Subpopulation as a Function of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Concentration at Retail for Deli Meat	223
Figure VI-11. Cases of Listeriosis (per serving basis) for Elderly Subpopulation as a Function of <i>Listeria monocytogenes</i> Concentration at Retail for Hard Cheese.....	223
Figure VII-1. Two-Dimensional Matrix of Food Categories Based on Cluster Analysis of Predicted per Serving and per Annum Relative Rankings.....	230