

# Table of Contents

|              |   |
|--------------|---|
| Preface..... | i |
|--------------|---|

## Chapter I: Executive Summary..... 3

|   |    |
|---|----|
| A. Overview.....  | 3  |
| B. Technology Overview (Chapter II).....  | 4  |
| C. Risk Assessment Methodology (Chapter III) .....  | 5  |
| D. The Implications of Epigenetic Reprogramming for Clones and their Progeny<br>(Chapter IV)..... | 8  |
| E. Risks to Animals Involved in Cloning (Chapter V).....  | 9  |
| F. Food Consumption Risks (Chapter VI) .....  | 11 |
| 1. Two-Pronged Approach to Identifying and Characterizing Food Consumption<br>Risks.....          | 11 |
| 2. Conclusions Regarding Potential Food Consumption Risks .....                                   | 11 |
| a. Cattle Clones.....   | 11 |
| b. Swine Clones .....   | 13 |
| c. Sheep Clones.....  | 14 |
| d. Goat Clones.....   | 14 |
| e. Clone Progeny.....   | 14 |
| G. Concluding Statements (Chapter VII) .....  | 15 |

## Chapter II: Technology Overview: Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer and Other Assisted Reproductive Technologies..... 19

|  |    |
|--|----|
| A. What is Cloning?.....   | 20 |
| B. Continuum of Reproductive Technologies .....                              | 21 |
| 1. Natural Service.....  | 21 |
| 2. Artificial Insemination and Synchronized Estrus .....                     | 22 |
| 3. Embryo Transfer .....   | 25 |
| 4. <i>In vitro</i> Fertilization .....                                       | 26 |
| 5. Embryo splitting.....   | 27 |
| 6. Blastomere Nuclear Transfer .....   | 28 |
| 7. Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer (SCNT).....                                 | 29 |
| a. Donor cell.....   | 30 |
| b. Oöcyte.....   | 31 |
| c. Fusion.....   | 31 |
| d. Transfer to recipient.....  | 32 |
| C. Critical Biological Events in SCNT.....                                   | 33 |
| D. Outcomes Observed in ARTs .....   | 35 |
| E. Future of Reproductive Technologies in Modern Agricultural Practice ..... | 36 |

### **Chapter III: Developing the Risk Assessment Methodology..... 41**

|           |   |    |
|-----------|---|----|
| <b>A.</b> | Charge.....   | 41 |
| <b>B.</b> | General Discussion of Risk/Safety Analyses.....               | 41 |
| <b>1.</b> | Risk and Safety.....  | 41 |
| <b>2.</b> | Risk Assessment vs. Risk Management.....                      | 42 |
| <b>C.</b> | Risk/Safety Assessment of Cloning.....                        | 42 |
| <b>D.</b> | Transgenic Animal Clones.....                                 | 44 |
| <b>E.</b> | Methodology Development.....                                  | 45 |
| <b>1.</b> | Hazard Characterization.....                                  | 46 |
| <b>2.</b> | Potential Risks.....  | 47 |
| <b>3.</b> | Proposed Approaches.....                                      | 48 |
| <b>a.</b> | Animal Health Risks.....                                      | 48 |
| <b>b.</b> | Food Consumption Risks.....                                   | 49 |
| <b>F.</b> | Two-Pronged Approach to Assessing Food Consumption Risks..... | 50 |
| <b>1.</b> | Critical Biological Systems Approach.....                     | 51 |
| <b>a.</b> | Overview.....   | 51 |
| <b>b.</b> | Evaluation Nodes.....   | 52 |
| <b>G.</b> | The Weight of Evidence Approach.....                          | 54 |
| <b>H.</b> | Limitations of the Risk Assessment.....                       | 55 |

### **Chapter IV: Epigenetic Reprogramming: Implications for Clones and their Progeny ..... 59**

|           |  |    |
|-----------|--|----|
| <b>A.</b> | Overview of Epigenetic Reprogramming in Early Embryonic Development.....   | 61 |
| <b>1.</b> | Preimplantation Reprogramming.....   | 63 |
| <b>a.</b> | Fusion and Cleavage.....   | 63 |
| <b>b.</b> | Demethylation and Remethylation in Early Embryos.....  | 66 |
| <b>c.</b> | Epigenetic Reprogramming in Later Development.....   | 70 |
| <b>d.</b> | Studies of Gene Expression and Development in Clones and Animals Produced by Other ARTs.....   | 73 |
| <b>e.</b> | Studies of Technical Contributions to Epigenetic Variability in Clones and Other ARTs.....   | 78 |
| <b>2.</b> | Gametogenic Reprogramming.....   | 79 |
| <b>3.</b> | Mitochondrial Heteroplasmy.....  | 81 |
| <b>4.</b> | Conclusions from Studies of Epigenetic Reprogramming.....  | 82 |
| <b>B.</b> | Phenotypic Evidence for Gametogenic Reprogramming.....   | 83 |
| <b>1.</b> | Phenotypic Anomalies Observed in Mouse Clones.....   | 83 |
| <b>a.</b> | Utility of Mouse Model.....  | 83 |
| <b>b.</b> | Pregnancy (Developmental Node 1).....  | 84 |
| <b>c.</b> | Perinatal Period (Developmental Node 2).....   | 86 |
| <b>d.</b> | Juvenile Period to Reproductive Maturity (Developmental Nodes 3 and 4).....  | 86 |
| <b>e.</b> | Maturity and Aging (Developmental Node 5).....   | 88 |
| <b>2.</b> | Conclusions from Phenotypic Studies of Gametogenic Reprogramming in Mouse Clones and their Progeny for Reprogramming in Domestic Livestock Clones and their Progeny..... | 90 |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| C. Implications of Epigenetic Reprogramming for Animal Health and Food Consumption Risks ..... | 91 |
|--|----|

## **Chapter V: Animal Health Risks ..... 95**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| A. Potential Hazards and Risks to Animals Involved in Cloning.....  | 95         |
| B. The Critical Biological Systems Approach to the Analysis of Clone Animal Health: Cattle, Swine, Sheep, and Goats ..... | 96         |
| 1. Pregnancy and Parturition (Developmental Node 1).....  | 96         |
| 2. Perinatal Period (Developmental Node 2).....   | 98         |
| 3. Juvenile Developmental Node (Developmental Node 3) .....   | 99         |
| 4. Reproductive Development and Function Node (Developmental Node 4).....   | 100        |
| 5. Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging (Developmental Node 5).....   | 101        |
| a. Telomere Length as an Indicator of Aging.....  | 101        |
| C. Data on Animal Health by Species .....   | 105        |
| 1. Cattle.....  | 105        |
| a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....   | 109        |
| b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....  | 123        |
| c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....   | 135        |
| d. <b>Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function.....</b>  | <b>145</b> |
| e. Developmental Node 5: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....   | 150        |
| f. Progeny of Bovine Clones .....   | 153        |
| g. Summary for Health of Bovine Clones and Their Progeny .....  | 156        |
| 2. Swine.....   | 157        |
| a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....   | 158        |
| b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....  | 159        |
| c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....   | 163        |
| d. Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function .....  | 165        |
| e. Developmental Node 5: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....   | 166        |
| f. Progeny of Swine Clones.....   | 166        |
| g. Summary for Health of Swine Clones and Their Progeny .....   | 167        |
| 3. Sheep.....   | 168        |
| a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....   | 169        |
| b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....  | 172        |
| c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....   | 174        |
| d. Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function .....  | 175        |
| e. Developmental Node 5: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....   | 175        |
| f. Progeny of Sheep Clones.....   | 176        |
| g. Summary for Health of Sheep Clones .....   | 176        |
| 4. Goats .....  | 176        |
| a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....   | 177        |
| b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....  | 178        |
| c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....   | 179        |
| d. Development Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function.....   | 180        |
| e. Developmental Node 5: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....   | 180        |
| f. Progeny of Goat Clones.....  | 180        |
| g. Summary for Health of Goat Clones .....  | 181        |
| D. Conclusions.....   | 181        |

**Chapter VI: Food Consumption Risks ..... 187**

- A. Potential Hazards and Food Consumption Risks Associated with Food Products from Animal Clones and their Progeny ..... 187**
  - 1. Assumptions..... 187
  - 2. Critical Biological Systems Approach to Clones of Cattle, Swine, Sheep, and Goats ..... 188
    - a. Bovine Clones..... 188
    - b. Swine Clones ..... 243
    - c. Sheep Clones..... 260
    - d. Goat Clones..... 264
  - 3. Compositional Analysis Method..... 268
    - a. Overview..... 268
    - b. Nutritional Risk..... 269
    - c. Characterization of Milk from Cow Clones..... 278
    - d. Characterization of Meat from Clones and Their Progeny..... 288
- B. Drawing Conclusions Regarding Risks Associated with Consumption of Food Products from Animal Clones..... 309**
  - 1. Approaches for Decreasing Uncertainties ..... 309
  - 2. Bounding the Risk Space ..... 310
  - 3. Developing Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks..... 310
  - 4. Weight of Evidence Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks for Clones and their Progeny ..... 312
    - a. Cattle Clones..... 312
    - b. Swine Clones ..... 316
    - c. Sheep Clones..... 317
    - d. Goat Clones..... 318
    - e. Clone Progeny..... 319
  - 5. Summary of Risk Hypotheses..... 319
    - a. Additional Issues..... 320
  - 6. How Much (Information) Is Enough?..... 323

**Chapter VII Summary and Conclusions ..... 327**

- A. Methodology..... 327**
- B. Conclusions Regarding Risks to Animal Health ..... 328**
- C. Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks ..... 329**
- D. Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks from Clone Progeny..... 330**
- E. Weight of Evidence Evaluations..... 330**

|                       |            |
|-----------------------|------------|
| <b>Glossary .....</b> | <b>333</b> |
|-----------------------|------------|

|                        |            |
|------------------------|------------|
| <b>References.....</b> | <b>349</b> |
|------------------------|------------|

## **Appendices**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Appendix A: Risk and Safety Assessment Primer for Animal Cloning<br/>.....</b> | <b>425</b> |
|---|------------|

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>A. How has Risk Assessment Evolved? .....</b> | <b>425</b> |
| <b>B. Thinking About Risk.....</b>               | <b>426</b> |
| <b>C. How Do We Think About Safety?.....</b>     | <b>428</b> |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Appendix B: Overall Reproductive Efficiency and Health Statistics for<br/>US Animal Agriculture.....</b> | <b>431</b> |
|---|------------|

|                             |            |
|-----------------------------|------------|
| <b>A. Dairy cattle.....</b> | <b>431</b> |
| <b>B. Beef Cattle .....</b> | <b>433</b> |
| <b>C. Swine.....</b>        | <b>436</b> |
| <b>D. Sheep.....</b>        | <b>437</b> |
| <b>E. Goats .....</b>       | <b>439</b> |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Appendix C: Comparisons of Outcomes Among Assisted Reproductive<br/>Technologies (ARTs).....</b> | <b>443</b> |
|---|------------|

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>A. Successes and Failures of AI, IVP, and ET .....</b>    | <b>449</b> |
| <b>B. Outcomes for BNT, Fetal- and Adult-Cell SCNT .....</b> | <b>453</b> |
| <b>C. Conclusions regarding outcomes for ARTs.....</b>       | <b>454</b> |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Appendix D Transgenic Clones .....</b> | <b>457</b> |
|---|------------|

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>A. Issues.....</b>                                   | <b>457</b> |
| <b>B. Cattle.....</b>                                   | <b>458</b> |
| <b>C. Swine.....</b>                                    | <b>460</b> |
| <b>D. Sheep.....</b>                                    | <b>462</b> |
| <b>E. Goats .....</b>                                   | <b>463</b> |
| <b>F. Conclusions Regarding Transgenic Clones .....</b> | <b>466</b> |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Appendix E: The Cyagra Dataset .....</b> | <b>471</b> |
|---|------------|

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>A. Response to CVM Data Requests.....</b> | <b>471</b> |
| <b>B. Cyagra Dataset.....</b>                | <b>472</b> |

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| 1. | Description of Clones .....  | 474 |
| 2. | Evaluations Performed.....   | 476 |
| 3. | CVM's Analysis of Cyagra Data: Method.....   | 477 |
| 4. | CVM's Analysis of Cyagra Data: Results .....                                       | 479 |
| a. | Comprehensive Veterinary Examinations .....  | 479 |
| b. | Conclusions from Veterinary Examinations.....                                      | 480 |
| c. | Laboratory Values: Selection of Most Appropriate Comparator.....                   | 481 |
| d. | Conclusions Regarding Clone and Comparator Population Cohorts in<br>Aggregate..... | 482 |
| e. | Animal and Analyte Specific Analyses .....   | 484 |
| f. | Animals with Measurements at Different Developmental Nodes .....                   | 487 |
| 5. | Charts and Tables.....   | 500 |
|    | Cyagra Data Chart Interpretations .....  | 501 |
|    | Cyagra Raw Data .....  | 523 |

## **Appendix F: The ViaGen Dataset ..... 571**

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| A. | Background.....   | 571 |
| B. | Experimental Design.....  | 571 |
| 1. | Study 1: Clones vs. Comparators.....  | 573 |
| a. | Animal Health, Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis.....  | 574 |
| b. | Boar Semen Evaluation.....  | 574 |
| c. | Farrowing Rate.....   | 574 |
| 2. | Study 2: Progeny of Clone Boars vs. Progeny of Conventional Boars .....   | 575 |
| a. | Statistical Analysis.....   | 575 |
| b. | Specific Methods for the Analysis of Animal Health, Hematology, Clinical<br>Chemistry, and Urinalysis Data .....      | 578 |
| c. | Meat Composition, Carcass Characteristics, and Meat Quality Assessments<br>for Clones, Comparators, and Progeny ..... | 578 |
| C. | Results.....  | 579 |
| 1. | Study 1 .....   | 579 |
| a. | Survival.....   | 579 |
| b. | Animal Health, Growth, Blood Clinical Chemistry, Hematology, and<br>Urinalysis .....                                  | 580 |
| c. | Carcass Characteristics .....   | 588 |
| d. | Meat Composition Analysis for Clones and Comparators .....  | 589 |
| e. | Semen and Breeding Evaluation.....  | 591 |
| f. | Farrowing Rate.....   | 592 |
| 2. | Study 2: Progeny of Clones vs. Comparators .....  | 594 |
| a. | Survival.....   | 594 |
| b. | Growth, Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis.....   | 600 |
| c. | Carcass Characteristics .....   | 608 |
| d. | Meat Composition from the Progeny of Clones and Comparators.....  | 609 |
| D. | Conclusions from the ViaGen Dataset.....  | 614 |
| 1. | Study 1: Clones vs. Comparators.....  | 614 |
| a. | Animal Health.....  | 614 |

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| b. | Food Safety .....  | 615 |
| 2. | Progeny of Clone Boars vs. Progeny of Comparator Boars ..... | 615 |
| a. | Animal Health .....  | 615 |
| b. | Food Safety .....  | 616 |
| E. | Addendum .....   | 617 |
|    | ViaGen Data Chart Interpretations .....                      | 621 |
|    | ViaGen Raw Data .....  | 695 |

## **Appendix G: Unpublished Data ..... 857**

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| A. | Perinatal Development in Cattle Clones (Node 2).....                  | 857 |
| B. | Juvenile Development in Cattle Clones (Node 3).....                   | 859 |
| C. | Reproductive Development and Function in Cattle Clones (Node 4) ..... | 865 |
| D. | Post-pubertal Maturation in Cattle Clones (Node 5) .....              | 867 |
| E. | Summary of Cloning Studies at University of Tennessee .....           | 868 |
| 1. | Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....                  | 868 |
| 2. | Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....                           | 869 |
| 3. | Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Period.....                            | 869 |
| 4. | Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function .....     | 869 |
| 5. | Developmental Node 5: Post-pubertal Maturation and Aging.....         | 870 |
| F. | Perinatal Development in Swine Clones (Node 2) .....                  | 870 |
| G. | Conclusions for unpublished data.....                                 | 872 |

## **Appendix H: The Comprehensive Veterinary Examination ..... 877**

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| A. | Introduction to the Comprehensive Veterinary Examination .....                       | 877 |
| B. | The Importance of Species-Specific Standards .....                                   | 878 |
| C. | How a Veterinarian Performs a Comprehensive Veterinary Examination .....             | 878 |
| 1. | Specific Considerations for Neonatal CVEs.....                                       | 880 |
| 2. | Specific Considerations for Juvenile CVEs.....                                       | 881 |
| 3. | Specific Considerations for Mature Animal CVEs.....                                  | 881 |
| 4. | Specific Consideration for Reproductive Stage Examinations .....                     | 881 |
| a. | Males.....   | 881 |
| b. | Females .....  | 882 |
| D. | Interpreting the Comprehensive Veterinary Examination for Animal Clones .....        | 883 |
| E. | Parameters Evaluated in the Comprehensive Veterinary Exam for a Risk Assessment..... | 883 |

## **Appendix I: Investigation on the Attributes of Cloned Bovine Products ..... 895**