

Question 11

1. Does the description of adaptive management (Chapter 6) clearly present steps necessary to translate monitoring results into changes in management at different planning levels and on different temporal and spatial scales? What steps or concepts are missing?

Reviewer	Comments
Bisson	<p>The general approach seemed straightforward enough. The main pitfalls almost invariably have to do with people and institutions. See Table 3-5 (page 85) in Lee (1993) ...</p> <p>As well as the problems institutions have in processing “bad news”: .. Bella 1997 ...</p> <p>These thoughtful papers are worth reading by managers looking for support to make hard, occasionally unpopular decisions.</p>
Forsman	<p>You say on page 5-2 that monitoring efforts will provide feedback that will then be used to manage in an adaptive manner. Monitoring of key sensitive species like owls, tree voles, and murrelets costs money and requires a commitment for as long as the plan is in effect. Furthermore, the monitoring needs to begin before the plan is implemented so you can monitor the long-term effects of the plan. In my experience with the Forest Service and BLM, their dedication to a monitoring plan lasts for a very short time after the plan is implemented, and then, as soon as money gets tight they try to drop, or greatly reduce, their monitoring efforts. Is there reason to believe that this will not happen with the Elliot State Forest Plan?</p>
Gresswell	<p>The description of adaptive management is adequate for this point in the plan process; however, it fails to identify when formal monitoring will begin and how it will be financed. These are not trivial issues, and if not addressed in the planning stages, it is highly unlikely that the adaptive management plan and associate monitoring plan will be effective.</p>
Ohmann	<p>The cover letter requested I review Chapters 4 and 5, so I have not read Chapter 6 carefully enough to comment here. If you haven't already done so, I recommend finding reviewers to focus specifically on these sections.</p>