PETER D. KEISLER Assistant Attorney General EUGENE M. THIROLF 3 Director, KENNETH L. JOST Deputy Director, Office of Consumer Litigation JOHN W. BURKE (VA BAR NO. 72780) 6 Trial Attorney, Office of Consumer Litigation Civil Division United States Department of Justice P.O. Box 386 Washington, D.C. 20044 Telephone: 202-353-2001 Facsimile: 202-514-8742 Email: josh.burke@usdoj.gov 10 Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America 11 12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 13 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, 14 Plaintiff, 15 COMPLAINT FOR CIVIL 16 PENALTIES, PERMANENT ADTERACTIVE, INC., doing INJUNCTION, AND OTHER 17 business as FreeGiftWorld.com EQUITABLE RELIEF and SamplePromtionsGroup.com, 18 Defendant. 19 20 Plaintiff, the United States of America, acting upon 21 22 notification and authorization to the Attorney General by the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), pursuant to 23 Section 16(a)(1) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 24 25 | 15 U.S.C. § 56(a)(1), for its complaint alleges: Plaintiff brings this action under Sections 5(a), 26 27 (5 (m) (1) (A), 13 (b), 16 (a) and 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C.  $28 \parallel SS 45(a)$ , 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b), 56(a), and 57b, and under Section Complaint Page 1 of 12

1 | 7(a) of the Controlling the Assault of Non-Solicited Pornography and Marketing Act of 2003 ("CAN-SPAM" or the "CAN-SPAM Act"), 3 | 15 U.S.C. § 7706(a), to obtain monetary civil penalties, a permanent injunction, and other equitable relief for defendant's violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and Section 5(a) of CAN-SPAM, 15 U.S.C. § 7704(a).

## JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this 2. matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), 1345, and 1355 and 15 U.S.C. §§ 45 (m) (1) (A), 53 (b), 56 (a) and 57b. This action 11 arises under 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 7706(a).
- Venue is proper in this District under 28 U.S.C. 13 §§ 1391(b) and (c), 1395(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 53(b).

7

8

10

12

14

15

17

18

19

23

25

26

27

28

## INTRADISTRICT ASSIGNMENT

The events giving rise to the United States' claims 4. occurred in substantial part in San Francisco County. 16 ll

### DEFENDANT

Defendant Adteractive, Inc. is a California corporation 5. with its principal place of business located at 303 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, 20 Suite 375, San Francisco, CA 94107. Adteractive does business as 21 FreeGiftWorld.com and SamplePromotionsGroup.com. Since June 1, 22 2004, Adteractive has formulated, directed, controlled, or participated in the acts and practices set forth in this 24 |complaint. Adteractive resides in the Northern District of California and transacts business within this District and throughout the United States.

### **DEFINITIONS**

6. "Electronic mail message" (or "email") means a message Complaint Page 2 of 12

- "Electronic mail address" means a destination, commonly 3 expressed as a string of characters, consisting of a unique user 4 name or mailbox (commonly referred to as the "local part") and a 5 reference to an Internet domain (commonly referred to as the "domain 6 | part"), whether or not displayed, to which an email message can be sent or delivered. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(5).
- "Commercial electronic mail message" means any email 8. 9 message the primary purpose of which is the commercial 10 advertisement or promotion of a commercial product or service (including the content on an Internet website operated for 12 commercial purposes). 15 U.S.C. § 7702(2).
- "Initiate," when used with respect to a commercial email 14 message, means to originate or transmit such message or to procure 15 the origination or transmission of such message. 15 U.S.C. 16 § 7702(9).
- "Landing page" means, in online marketing, a specific web 18 page that a visitor reaches after clicking a link or advertisement 19 | in an email or banner ad. This page usually showcases content that 20 is an extension of the link or ad.
- "Procure," when used with respect to the initiation of a 22 commercial email message, means intentionally to pay or provide other consideration to, or induce, another person to initiate such 24 |a message on one's behalf. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(12).
- "Protected computer" means a computer which is used in 12. 26 interstate or foreign commerce or communication, including a computer located outside the United States that is used in a manner that affects interstate or foreign commerce or communication of the

8

13

17

21

23

"Sender" means a person who initiates a commercial email message and whose product, service, or Internet website is advertised or promoted by the message. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(16).

2

3

5

6

10

11

17

18 l

22

27

# DEFENDANT'S MARKETING PRACTICES

- Since June 1, 2004, and continuing to the present, 7 using the names "FreeGiftWorld.com" or "SamplePromotionsGroup.com," Defendant has offered consumers supposedly free merchandise, such as digital cameras, laptop computers, and flat-screen televisions.
- Defendant advertises and markets its offers through 12 email and Web-based ads. Defendant's emails contain subject 13 lines such as: "Test and keep this Flat-Screen TV"; "Test it -14 Keep it - Microsoft® Xbox 360"; "Congratulations! Claim Your 15 Choice of Sony, HP or Gateway Laptop!"; or "Congratulations! 16 You've Been Chosen To Receive A Free \$1000 Check!"
- Defendant's Web-based ads feature, among other things, 16. trivia games or contests such as: "Who is this Celebrity? [Photo 19 of Angelina Jolie] Participate Now and You'll Receive a FREE SONY 20 PLAYSTATION 3." (Such products and items are referred to herein 21 as "promised free merchandise.")
- Defendant's emails and Web-based ads represent, 17. 23 expressly or by implication, that the consumer viewing the 24 message has won a contest, or has been specially selected as a 25 "secret shopper" to test new products that the consumer then can 26 keep.
- Defendant's emails and Web-based ads contain links 18. 28 that, when clicked on, take one to a landing page operated by Page 4 of 12 Complaint

1 Defendant or its affiliates. The landing page recapitulates and 2 expands upon Defendant's initial promised free merchandise offer. 3 For example, the landing page for Defendant's email offer 4 soliciting consumers to become "secret shoppers" by testing and 5 keeping a flat-screen TV states, "Get this gift FREE\*! Just for 6 Sampling Trial Offers." This is followed by a photo of the flat-7 screen TV, a list price of \$749 crossed out, and underneath in bold red letters is written, "FREE\*."

- 19. Defendant does not clearly and conspicuously disclose 10 that to obtain the promised free merchandise one must incur 11 expenses. A consumer must accept and pay for - in the 12 Defendant's parlance, "complete" or "participate in" - a certain 13 number of goods or services promoted by third parties to qualify 14 ||for the promised free merchandise that Defendant promotes in its 15 emails and Web-based ads. Moreover, Defendant does not clearly 16 and conspicuously disclose the costs and obligations associated 17 with participating in third-party promotions, such as applying 18 and qualifying for credit cards or automobile loans.
- 20. On its landing page, Defendant requests the consumer to 20 enter his or her email address, followed by his or her name and 21 mailing address. Defendant uses this information, in part, to 22 |send to the consumer a "welcome" email containing a password and 23 |information on how to access the consumer's account on 24 Defendant's website. A consumer must have access to his or her 25 account to obtain the promised free merchandise. However, in 26 | numerous instances, the consumer did not receive Defendant's "welcome" email because some consumers' email providers have 27 l 28 treated Defendant's email as spam, blocking it or filtering it so

Page 5 of 12

19

Complaint

that it never reached the consumer's inbox.

- 21. Once the consumer has submitted his or her personal information, Defendant leads the consumer through a series of web pages containing advertisements for various goods and services from third parties. However, defendant does not clearly and conspicuously disclose that these advertisements are an introductory tier of "optional" advertisements that do not qualify the consumer for the promised free merchandise.
- 22. After the consumer navigates Defendant's "optional" 10 promotions - often taking up five or six consecutive computer 11 screens, each with multiple offers - he or she eventually reaches 12 a link that, when clicked, takes the consumer to the first of 13 three tiers of offers in which the consumer must participate to 14 |obtain the promised free merchandise.
- Defendant assigns a "level" to each of its advertised 16 offers - the higher the "level," the more third-party promotions 17 a consumer must "participate in" to receive the promised free 18 merchandise. For example, for a "level 6" promised free 19 merchandise offer, such as a digital camera, laptop, or flat-20 screen television, the consumer must participate in two "silver" 21 third-party promotions, two "gold" third-party promotions, and 22 two "platinum" third-party promotions.
- Defendant's websites, email, and web-based ads 24 primarily promote "level 6" promised free merchandise. 25 allure of these premium promised free merchandise offers entice 26 consumers to participate in Defendant's program. However, for 27 all of Defendant's promised free merchandise offers, except for 28 lits "level 1" offers, consumers must expend money to qualify for

8

15

1 the promised free merchandise. For example, one of Defendant's 2 third-party "platinum" promotions (within a "level 6" promised 3 ||free merchandise offer) requires the consumer to subscribe to a year of satellite television at a cost of almost \$600. Other third-party promotions include DVD deliveries, CDs and music subscriptions, or instructional materials.

- Some of the offers have free trial periods, which require the consumer to participate for a minimum period of time to qualify for Defendant's promised free merchandise. Moreover, 10 some of these offers contain negative option components in which 11 the consumer who does not cancel will be billed automatically.
- In some instances, the consumer stops trying to qualify 13 for Defendant's promised free merchandise, either because of the 14 cost involved or the time and effort required. Although the 15 consumer has expended money or incurred other obligations in 16 pursuit of Defendant's promised free merchandise, because he or 17 she has not completed all of Defendant's required third-party 18 promotions, the consumer does not receive the promised free 19 merchandise.
- In most instances, it is impossible for the consumer to 21 qualify for Defendant's promised free merchandise without 22 spending money.

### DEFENDANT'S EMAIL PRACTICES

28. Since June 1, 2004, and continuing to the present, 25 Defendant has initiated the transmission of commercial email 26 messages to protected computers. The primary purpose of these 27 |commercial email messages has been the commercial advertisement 28 or promotion of Internet websites operated for a commercial

7

12

20

23

1 purpose by Defendant.

2

3

7

8

10

17

18

21

22

25

28

- Defendant is an "initiator" with respect to an email message when it has either originated or transmitted a message litself or has procured the origination or transmission of a message through payments or other consideration, or inducements, to others.
- 30. Defendant is a "sender" with respect to an email message when it has initiated a message and it is Defendant's websites that are being advertised or promoted by such message.
- In numerous instances, to induce consumers to open and 31. 11 read its commercial emails, Defendant has initiated commercial 12 email messages that contain subject headers that misrepresent the 13 |content or subject matter of the message, including, but not 14 ||limited to, false representations that consumers have won a 15 |contest, or that consumers can "test and keep" products such as 16 | laptops and digital music players.

## VIOLATIONS OF THE FTC ACT

As set forth below, Defendant has violated Section 5(a) 32. 19 of the FTC Act in connection with advertising, offering, 20 marketing, and promoting of promised free merchandise.

# COUNT I

- In numerous instances, Defendant has represented, 23 expressly or by implication, that Defendant's promised free merchandise is without cost or obligation.
- 34. Defendant has failed to clearly and conspicuously 26 disclose to consumers the material terms and conditions of its program, including: 27
  - that consumers must pay money or other

Complaint

Page 8 of 12

the costs and obligations for participating in Defendant's program.

As a result of the representation set forth in Paragraph 32, Defendant's failure to clearly and conspicuously disclose the material information set forth in Paragraph 33 is deceptive, and violates Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

## VIOLATION OF THE CAN-SPAM ACT

- The CAN-SPAM Act, 15 U.S.C. § 7701 et seq., became 36. 12 |effective on January 1, 2004, and has since remained in full force and effect.
- Section 5(a)(2) of CAN-SPAM, 15 U.S.C. § 7704(a)(2), 37. 14 15 states:

It is unlawful for any person to initiate the transmission to a protected computer of a commercial electronic mail message if such person has actual knowledge, or knowledge fairly implied on the basis of objective circumstances, that a subject heading of the message would be likely to mislead a recipient, acting reasonably under the circumstances, about a material fact regarding the contents or subject matter of the message (consistent with the criteria used in enforcement of section 45 of this title).

Section 7(e) of CAN-SPAM, 15 U.S.C. § 7706(e), states 38. 24 that in any action to enforce compliance through an injunction 25 with Section 5(a)(2) and other specified sections of CAN-SPAM, 26 the FTC need not allege or prove the state of mind required by such sections.

28

27

4

5

10

11

13

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Section 7(a) of the CAN-SPAM Act, 15 U.S.C. § 7706(a), 1 states: [T] his chapter shall be enforced by the [FTC] 3 as if the violation of this chapter were an unfair or deceptive act or practice 4 proscribed under section 18(a)(1)(B) of the [FTC Act] (15 U.S.C. 57a(a)(1)(B)). 5 6 COUNT II 7 In numerous instances, Defendant has initiated the 8 transmission, to protected computers, of commercial email messages that contained subject headings that would be likely to 10 mislead a recipient, acting reasonably under the circumstances, 11 about a material fact regarding the contents or subject matter of 12 the message. 13 Therefore, Defendant's acts or practices violate 41. 14 Section 5(a)(2) of CAN-SPAM, 15 U.S.C. § 7704(a)(2). 15 CONSUMER INJURY 16 Consumers throughout the United States have been 42. 17 injured as a result of Defendant's unlawful acts or practices. 18 Absent injunctive relief by this Court, Defendant is likely to 19 continue to injure consumers and to harm the public interest. 20 THIS COURT'S POWER TO GRANT RELIEF 21 Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), 43. 22 empowers this Court to grant injunctive and other ancillary 23 relief to prevent and remedy any violation of any provision of 24 law enforced by the FTC. 25 44. Section 5(m)(1)(A) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. 26 § 45(m)(1)(A), as modified by Section 4 of the Federal Civil 27 Penalties Inflation Adjustment Act of 1990, 28 U.S.C. § 2461, as 28

Page 10 of 12

Complaint

- 1 mended, and as implemented by 16 C.F.R. § 1.98(d) (1997), 2 authorizes this Court to award monetary civil penalties of not 3 more than \$11,000 for each violation of CAN-SPAM. Defendant's violations of CAN-SPAM were committed with the knowledge required by Section 5(m)(1)(A) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(m)(1)(A).
  - This Court, in the exercise of its equitable jurisdiction, may award ancillary relief to remedy injury caused by Defendant's violations of CAN-SPAM and the FTC Act.

## PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff requests that this Court, as authorized 11 by Sections 5(a), 5(m)(1)(A), 13(b) and 19 of the FTC Act, 12 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(m)(1)(A), 53(b) and 57b, and pursuant to 13 lits own equitable powers:

- Enter judgment against Defendant and in favor of 1. 15 Plaintiff for each violation alleged in this complaint;
- 2. Award Plaintiff monetary civil penalties from Defendant 17 for every violation of CAN-SPAM;
- Award Plaintiff such relief as the Court finds 19 necessary to redress injury to consumers resulting from 20 Defendant's violations of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. 21 \s 45(a), including, but not limited to, rescission of contracts, 22 |restitution, the refund of monies paid, and the disgorgement of 23 | ill-gotten monies;
- Enter a permanent injunction to prevent future 25 violations of the FTC Act and CAN-SPAM;
- Order Defendant to pay the costs of this action; and 26 5. 27 award Plaintiff such other and additional relief as the Court may 28 determine to be just and proper.

Complaint

6

10

14

16

18

1		*
1		
2	Dated: November 20, 2007	Respectfully submitted,
3	OF COUNSEL:	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA PETER D. KEISLER, JR. Assistant Attorney General
5	LOIS C. GREISMAN	Civil Division U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
6	Associate Director for Marketing Practices	EUGENE M. THIROLF
7	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION	Director, KENNETH L. JOST
8	Stephen L. Cohen Ethan Arenson	Deputy Director, Office of Consumer Litigation
9	Attorneys Federal Trade Commission	The what
10	600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Washington, DC 20580 PHONE: 202-326-3222; 326-	John W. Burke Trial Attorney
11	2204 FAX: 202-326-3395	Office of Consumer Litigation U.S. Department of Justice
12		P.O. Box 386 Washington, D.C. 20044
13		PHONE: 202-353-2001 FAX: 202-514-8742
14		EMAIL: josh.burke@usdoj.gov
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
21	·	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		