MEMORANDUM REPORT ON REVIEW OF CENTER FOR TECHNOLOGY ENTERPRISE, INC. (CITE) **BOWLING GREEN, KENTUCKY**

TELECOMMUNICATIONS REGIONAL INITIATIVE PROJECT

ARC Grant Number: KY-14118

Grant Period: October 1, 2001 through December 31, 2004

CAUTION: Certain information contained herein is subject to disclosure restrictions under the Freedom Information Act, 5 U.S.C. 522 (b) (4). Distribution of this report should be limited to Appalachian Regional Commission and other pertinent parties.

Report Number: 08-11

Date: June 23, 2008

MEMORANDUM REPORT ON REVIEW OF CENTER FOR TECHNOLOGY ENTERPRISE, INC. (CITE) BOWLING GREEN, KENTUCKY

TELECOMMUNICATIONS REGIONAL INITIATIVE PROJECT

ARC Grant Number: KY-14118

Grant Period: October 1, 2001 through December 31, 2004

Prepared By:

Tichenor & Associates, LLP Certified Public Accountants 304 Middletown Park Place, Suite C Louisville, Kentucky 40243

TICHENOR & ASSOCIATES, LLP

CERTIFIED PUBLIC ACCOUNTANTS and MANAGEMENT CONSULTANTS

304 MIDDLETOWN PARK PLACE, SUITE C LOUISVILLE, KENTUCKY 40243

> Business: (502) 245-0775 FAX: (502) 245-0725

E-MAIL: WTICHENOR@TICHENORASSOCIATES.COM

TO:

Appalachian Regional Commission (ARC)

Office of Inspector General (OIG)

FROM:

Tichenor & Associates, LLP

Louisville, Kentucky

REPORT FOR:

The Federal Co-Chairman

ARC Executive Director OIG Report Number: 08-11

SUBJECT:

Memorandum Review Report on Center for Technology

Enterprise, Inc. (CITE), Telecommunications Regional Initiative

Project, ARC Grant Number: KY-14118.

<u>PURPOSE</u>: The purpose of our review was to determine if (a) the total funds provided to CITE (formerly known as Center for Information Technology Enterprise, Inc.) for its Telecommunications Regional Initiative Project grant were expended in accordance with the ARC approved grant budget and did not violate any restrictions imposed by the terms and conditions of the grant; (b) the accounting, reporting, and internal control systems provided for disclosure of pertinent financial and operating information; and (c) that the objectives of the grant are being met.

BACKGROUND: ARC awarded Grant Number KY-14118 to CITE for the period October 1, 2001 through September 30, 2002. The ARC Project Coordinator approved Amendment Number 1 to the Grant Agreement on July 20, 2002 extending the period of performance through December 31, 2002. Total ARC funding for this period was for an amount not to exceed \$249,994 or approximately 58.4% of actual, reasonable, and eligible project costs. ARC required that the grant be matched with \$178,000 or 41.6% in cash, contributed services, and in-kind contributions, as approved by the ARC. Tichenor & Associates, LLP previously reviewed this period in a report dated February 6, 2003 (OIG Report 03-06).

The ARC approved Amendment Number 2 to the Grant Agreement on September 30, 2002 extending the period of performance to December 31, 2003. This amendment also increased total ARC funding of the project to a sum not to exceed \$499,994 or approximately 39% of actual reasonable and eligible project costs. ARC required that the

grant be matched with \$782,000 or 61% in cash, contributed service, and in-kind contributions, as approved by the ARC.

The ARC approved Amendment Number 3 to the Grant Agreement on September 12, 2003 extending the period of performance to December 31, 2004. This amendment also increased total ARC funding of the project to a sum not to exceed \$776,994 or approximately 37.3% of actual reasonable and eligible project costs. ARC required that the grant be matched with \$1,306,000 or 62.7% in cash, contributed service, and in-kind contributions, as approved by the ARC.

The purpose of the grant was to provide an initial assessment in Appalachian Kentucky, to determine who uses the internet and for what purposes, how the internet performs and identify access problems. As a result of this project the State of Kentucky will be able to develop better deployment plans for broadband service. All sectors of the local economies will benefit from the results of the project as it relates to expansion of telecommunications services.

SCOPE: We performed a program review of the grant as described in the Purpose above. Our review was based on the terms of the grant agreement and on the application of certain agreed-upon procedures previously discussed with the ARC OIG. Specifically, we determined if the tasks described above were being performed, if the accountability over ARC funds is sufficient as required by applicable Office of Management and Budget (OMB) Circulars, and if CITE was in compliance with the requirements of the grant agreement. In addition, we discussed the program objectives and performance with CITE personnel. Our results and recommendations are based upon those procedures. These review procedures were performed in accordance with applicable Government Auditing Standards.

<u>RESULTS</u>: The following results are based on our review performed at CITE in Bowling Green, Kentucky, on March 5, 2007 through March 16, 2007.

A. Incurred Costs

CITE's financial records report total program costs of \$3,643,258 for the grant period. Of these costs, \$776,994 (21.3%) was attributed to ARC expenditures, with the remaining \$2,866,264 (78.7%) attributed to matching and in-kind expenditures. See Appendix A for a Schedule of Costs Budgeted and Incurred.

During the course of the audit, we reviewed the direct, indirect, and in-kind costs claimed and determined that the funds had been expended as shown in the financial records.

B. Internal Controls

During the course of the audit, we reviewed CITE's system of internal controls. One area of weakness was identified that could have affected the accountability of costs or compliance with the terms of the grant agreement.

1. Under-reporting of Actual Costs Incurred

During the course of the audit, we noted that CITE's final SF-270, Request for Advance or Reimbursement, dated November 18, 2004, under-reported actual costs incurred by \$1,821,629:

	Reported	<u>Actual</u>		
ARC Costs	\$ 776,994	\$ 776,994		
Matching Costs	1,044,635	_2,866,264		
Total Program Costs	\$1,821,629	\$3,643,258		

CITE management stated that because the grant was for Appalachian Kentucky, but the program was expanded to be a statewide project, they only included 50% of total program outlays in their reporting.

Recommendation:

We recommend that ARC require CITE to correct and resubmit its final SF-270, Request for Advance or Reimbursement.

ARC's Response:

Concurrent with our review of KY-14118, we also reviewed CITE's ARC grants KY-14974 and KY-15056-05 (see OIG Report Numbers 08-12 and 08-13, respectively). ARC provided a written response to those two draft reports but did not comment on this recommendation.

Auditor's Comment:

ARC has not commented on the recommendation. As a result, we continue to make this recommendation.

C. Program Results

Our review of CITE's Telecommunications Regional Initiative Project grant indicated that the specific objectives identified in the grant were achieved.

Tichenor & Associates, LLP

Dicheng & Associates, HAP

Louisville, Kentucky

November 2, 2007

APPENDIX A SCHEDULE OF COSTS BUDGETED AND INCURRED

Schedule of Costs Budgeted and Incurred

October 1, 2001 through December 31, 2004

		Budget nal Amendment 2 Amendment 3 Total					Costs	
	Original	Amendme	nt 2	Amen	Amendment 3		tal	Incurred
ARC								
Personnel	\$ 32,625	\$ 13	1,149	\$	148,238	\$ 3	12,012	\$ 348,281
Fringe Benefits	6,851	2	6,230		25,168		58,249	68,324
Travel	4,250		7,500 10,		10,000	21,750		22,426
Equipment	26,438	26,		26,438	33,823			
Supplies	1,080	1,08			1,080	2,964		
Contractual	162,450	5	7,500		40,000	2	59,950	215,295
Indirect Cost					53,594		53,594	43,709
Other Approved Line Items	16,300	2	7,621	43,921		43,921	42,172	
Totals	249,994	25	250,000 277,000 776,				76,994	776,994
Matching								
Personnel		21	8,581		148,237	3	66,818	933,159
Fringe Benefits		4	3,716		25,167		68,883	163,621
Travel		1	2,500		10,000		22,500	64,054
Equipment		3	0,000				30,000	33,823
Supplies		1	5,000				15,000	2,964
Contractual	178,000	20	9,500		273,445	6	60,945	1,195,001
Indirect Cost		67,151 67,15		67,151	381,293			
Other Approved Line Items		75,379 75,379		75,379	92,349			
Totals	178,000	604,676 524,000 1,306,676				2,866,264		

Total Grant								
Personnel	32,625	34	9,730		296,475	6	78,830	1,281,440
Fringe Benefits	6,851	6	9,946	50,335 127,132		27,132	231,945	
Travel	4,250	2	20,000 20,000 44		44,250	86,480		
Equipment	26,438	30,000 56,4		56,438	67,646			
Supplies	1,080	l	5,000				16,080	5,928
Contractual	340,450	26	7,000		313,445	9	20,895	1,410,296
Indirect Cost					120,745	1	20,745	425,002
Other Approved Line Items	16,300	10	3,000			į	19,300	134,521
Totals	\$ 427,994	\$ 85	4,676	\$	801,000	\$ 2,0	83,670	\$3,643,258

^{***} Amendment No. 2 increased the matching requirement by \$604,000. The detailed budget included with this Amendment totaled \$604,676.