

Mr. Livingstone relayed that he assisted the President's mother, Virginia Kelly, and her bridge club by arranging transportation in Washington, D.C. during the Inauguration in January 1993.⁹¹

Mr. Livingstone stated that he may have made such statements for two reasons: first, he assumed the President and Mrs. Clinton were involved in hiring decisions;⁹² and, second, he may have told other OPS employees that the President and Mrs. Clinton had placed their confidence in him in an effort to impress upon them the importance of the OPS job and the sensitivity of the information they were charged with protecting.⁹³

C. Mr. Nussbaum Testified That He Was Unaware of a Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone Who Also Denied a Personal Relationship.

There is no documentary or other evidence to corroborate the existence of a personal relationship between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone, as suggested by the insert. Mr. Nussbaum testified that he was unaware of such a relationship, and both Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone denied that they had such a relationship.

⁹¹ Id. at 5.

⁹² Mr. Livingstone believed that Mrs. Clinton had a direct role in personnel decisions in that she had to "sign off" on all hiring decisions. Id.

⁹³ Id.

1. Mr. Nussbaum Testified That He Was Unaware of a Personal Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone.

Mr. Nussbaum stated that he has no knowledge of any member of Mr. Livingstone's family having a relationship with Mrs. Clinton and he did not recall ever hearing about such a relationship.⁹⁴ Mr. Nussbaum did acknowledge that there was a "general perception" within the White House that Mrs. Clinton was a "major force" with respect to personnel and policy decisions.⁹⁵ However, he stated he had no direct knowledge that this was true.⁹⁶

2. Mr. Livingstone's Mother, Gloria Livingstone, Denied Any Personal Relationship With Mrs. Clinton.

After the House Committee disclosed the insert, Gloria Livingstone, Mr. Livingstone's mother, issued a public statement that she and Mrs. Clinton "are not, and never have been, personal friends."⁹⁷ Mrs. Livingstone further stated that she "do[es] not know Hillary Rodham Clinton, . . . ha[s] never met Mrs. Clinton, and . . . ha[s] never spoken with Mrs. Clinton."⁹⁸

⁹⁴ Nussbaum 10/3/96 Int. at 2.

⁹⁵ Id. at 3.

⁹⁶ Id.

⁹⁷ G. Livingstone 7/25/96 Statement.

⁹⁸ Id.

In an interview with the OIC, Mrs. Livingstone stated that she has never met the President or Mrs. Clinton.⁹⁹ Mrs. Livingstone stated that she saw the President and Mrs. Clinton a couple of years earlier at the White House when she was assisting in decorating the White House for Christmas.¹⁰⁰ According to Mrs. Livingstone, the President and Mrs. Clinton stayed for a short period of time to take a photograph with Mrs. Livingstone and approximately 50 other people.¹⁰¹ Furthermore, Mrs. Livingstone stated that she has never discussed with her son who hired him, nor did he ever volunteer that information.¹⁰²

3. Mrs. Clinton Denied Knowing Mrs. Livingstone and Having Any Involvement in Hiring Craig Livingstone.

On January 14, 1998, Mrs. Clinton was specifically asked in an OIC interview if she had any conversations with Mr. Nussbaum, Mr. Foster, Mr. Kennedy, Ms. Mills, or Ms. Varney about hiring Mr. Livingstone.¹⁰³ Mrs. Clinton testified that she did not speak to these individuals about Mr. Livingstone.¹⁰⁴ Furthermore, she stated that she believed she heard Mr. Livingstone's name for the

⁹⁹ G. Livingstone 9/11/96 Int. at 1.

¹⁰⁰ Id.

¹⁰¹ Id.

¹⁰² Id. at 2.

¹⁰³ Clinton 1/14/98 OIC Depo. at 5-6.

¹⁰⁴ Id.

first time after Mr. Foster's death.¹⁰⁵ In addition, Mrs. Clinton stated that she has never met and does not know Mr. Livingstone's mother.¹⁰⁶

D. The Circumstances Surrounding the Preparation of the Insert Do Not Corroborate its Accuracy.

1. Agent Sculimbrene Had No Independent Recollection of the Interview with Mr. Nussbaum or Preparing the Insert.

Agent Sculimbrene had no independent recollection of conducting the interview with Mr. Nussbaum or preparing the insert, much less the details of the conversation.¹⁰⁷ Agent Sculimbrene believed that the statement he attributed to Mr. Nussbaum was accurate, because he would have had no reason to report it unless Mr. Nussbaum made the statement.¹⁰⁸

Agent Sculimbrene explained that there were no underlying notes because he routinely did not take notes when interviewing associates of the appointee during a background investigation.¹⁰⁹ He added that if the interview was conducted in his office or by

¹⁰⁵ Id. at 3-4.

¹⁰⁶ Id. at 3.

¹⁰⁷ Sculimbrene 9/4/96 Int. at 2; Sculimbrene 7/16/96 Int. at 1.

¹⁰⁸ Sculimbrene 9/4/96 Int. at 2-3; Sculimbrene 7/16/96 Int. at 1.

¹⁰⁹ Sculimbrene 9/4/96 Int. at 2. Agent Sculimbrene surmised that if he had taken notes of the interview with Mr. Nussbaum he would have routinely disposed of the notes a few months after the interview. Sculimbrene 7/16/96 Int. at 2.