FEDERAL DEPOSIT INSURANCE CORPORATION

+ + + + +

ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC INCLUSION (ComE-IN)

+ + + + +

MEETING

+ + + + +

THURSDAY FEBRUARY 5, 2009

+ + + + +

The Advisory Committee convened at 8:30 a.m. in the Board Room at the FDIC Headquarters, 550 17th Street, N.W., Washington, D.C., Diana L. Taylor, Committee Chairman, presiding.

PRESENT

DIANA L. TAYLOR, Committee Chairman

SHEILA C. BAIR, FDIC Chairman

MARTIN GRUENBERG, FDIC Vice Chairman

KELVIN BOSTON, PBS's Moneywise with Kelvin Boston

MARTIN EAKES, Self-Help/Center for Responsible Lending

LAWRENCE K. FISH, RBS America and Citizens Financial Group

REV. DR. FLOYD H. FLAKE, The Greater Allen A.M.E. Cathedral of New York

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

PRESENT: (CONT.)

- ESTER R. FUCHS, Columbia University School of International and Public Affairs
- RONALD GRZYWINSKI, ShoreBank Corporation of Chicago
- WADE HENDERSON, Leadership Conference on Civil Rights
- ALDEN J. McDONALD, JR., Liberty Bank and Trust Company
- JOHN W. RYAN, Conference of State Bank Supervisors

PETER TUFANO, Harvard Business School

ELIZABETH WARREN, Harvard Law School

DEBORAH C. WRIGHT, Carver Bancorp, Inc.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Item Page
Welcoming Remarks4
Update Since Last Meeting8
FDIC Unbanked Survey13
Bank Successes in Reach the76 Underserved
Alliance for Economic Inclusion138 Strategies and Successes in Today's Economic Environment
Facilitated Discussion194
Next Steps, Concluding Remarks258
Adjourn

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

4 1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S 8:48 a.m. 2 MS. TAYLOR: Good morning everybody 3 and thank you all for coming. Our topic for 4 today's session is strategies to 5 increase access to the financial mainstream. Anyway, 6 today people might wonder if that is actually 7 a good thing. 8 (Laughter.) 9 10 MS. TAYLOR: Anyway, that is basically what we here trying to do, 11 are getting people into the financial mainstream. 12 13 And as you all know, have heard, or read, the underserved population is huge as far as the 14 15 banking sector is concerned. There are 16 estimates all the place, but over they that at least ten million 17 basically say households throughout the country, which is 18 19 ten percent of the U.S. population, don't have a bank account. 20 And in New York City that's about 21 the same thing, too. The estimate is that 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

there are about 800,000 people in the city of 1 2 New York that are underserved by the banking sector out of a population of eight million. 3 So I've never really discovered where those 4 numbers came from, but everybody seems to sort 5 6 of say the same estimates. And many of these 7 households that are underbanked continue to alternative financial relv on service 8 providers for their financial needs and as we 9 10 all know that is often at a very high cost. It costs a lot more to use that sort of 11 service in regard to those banks. 12

13 And the sheer size of the alternative financial services industry with 14 300 billion dollars 15 than in more revenue transacted annually, this should be 16 а tremendous incentive for 17 banks to pursue underserved consumers. It is a great untapped 18 19 revenue source, one would think. In addition to prospects of extending their customer base 20 and doing good in their communities, 21 that would be a great incentive for banks to try to 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 lure some of these people, this underserved 2 population into their system. Banks are driven by a profit and you think there was a 3 lot of profit there, so one of the things I'm 4 going to be interested in hearing today is 5 what are the barriers to banks actually going 6 7 after this population and are there things that we can do to try and break some of those 8 down? 9 10 So anyway our first panel today is

going explore exactly how banks 11 to are reaching out to underserved populations. 12 The panel will feature a preliminary overview of 13 the FDIC survey of banks efforts to serve the 14 15 underbanked and unbanked population that 16 intended to identify the challenges that banks face in serving the customers and highlights 17 on the general strategies banks can use. 18

The second panel features several banks that have participated in the survey and they will discuss specific products they have used.

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 The third panel represents a group of bankers and not-for-profit organizations 2 most of whom are active in the FDIC's Alliance 3 for Economic Inclusion or AEI effort. 4 The AEI is a grass roots initiative of banks, not-for-5 profits, government agencies, public 6 7 companies, philanthropic and faith-based groups, and others in eleven markets across 8 the country that is intended to improve access 9 10 to the financial mainstream. The AEI effort has been tremendously successful so far with 11 nearly 1,000 members and more than 85,000 new 12 13 bank accounts opened to date. This panel is a great opportunity for this committee to link 14 up with the AEI members on the ground so we 15 can hear firsthand of the kinds of products 16 strategies 17 and that have been proven banks, successful for bank partners 18 and 19 underserved consumers.

The afternoon session, after lunch we will build on the outcomes from the morning session and we will draw on the experience of

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

this committee to help the FDIC staff identify and amplify the most effective strategies for reaching underserved consumers.

1

2

3

As usual, a few housekeeping items: 4 please remember that only committee members 5 and the panelists themselves are permitted to 6 7 speak during the presentations and that this meeting is being webcast, everybody remember 8 that, live, and being recorded for anybody who 9 wants to listen to the words of wisdom that we 10 talked about today. 11

am going to I turn the 12 So now presentation over to Chairman Bair who will 13 take a few moments to update us on items or 14 15 things that have transpired since our last meeting. 16

CHAIRMAN BAIR: Right. I just want 17 to say thank you all and thank you Diana for 18 19 your tremendous leadership for this committee. I have a very good statement here that would 20 probably take me about 20 minutes 21 to qo through, so I'm going to just provide some 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

highlights but perhaps we could hand it out for the public record because it really is a good summary of what this advisory committee has accomplished so far. But just to give you an update.

Our first initiative, our first 6 7 meeting was the Small Dollar Loan pilot recommending that the FDIC launch a 8 Small Dollar pilot program and that I think has been 9 10 going on very well. We have 31 banks in the pilot. About 12,000 Small Dollar Loans have 11 been made since the pilot began and most are 12 13 profitable or at least breaking even. I think most of the banks participating feel that even 14 15 if it is not turning a profit, it is good for 16 relationship-building and so hopefully the experiences that they have gained there will 17 help us convince more banks to offer this very 18 19 important product, especially as the economy becomes more challenging. There will be an 20 increasing need for responsibly-priced Small 21 Dollar Loans. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

www.nealrgross.com

1	Money service businesses and some
2	of the issues associated with banks doing
3	business with money service businesses and
4	what an MSB is and what the regulatory
5	requirements are. There has been a lot of
6	confusion there. And that has, I think,
7	impaired the ability of banks in the low- and
8	moderate-income communities to fully serve
9	those who need financial services. I think we
10	have made some progress with FinCEN in getting
11	more clarity on what an MSB is and that work
12	continues but I am optimistic that is going to
13	resolve itself fairly soon.
14	We also had a forum on low- and
15	moderate-income mortgage lending as you
16	recall. It was a tremendously successful
17	forum. A lot of very prestigious speakers who
18	shared a lot of good ideas about what
19	responsible, sound, sustainable mortgages
20	designed for the LMI community look like or
21	should look like going forward. We had some
22	tremendous ideas. We put that together in a

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

11

financial institution letter that we sent out to all of our institutions and a number of the ideas are being implemented and the banks are participating in our Alliance For Economic Inclusion.

Finally on loan modifications, this 6 7 committee also was an early advocate for wide scale restructuring of troubled mortgages. 8 We pioneer 9 were able to а systematic loan 10 modification protocol at IndyMac bank which so far we have completed 10,000 loan mods and 11 several more in the pipeline. We are taking 12 13 them down to a 31 percent debt-to-income ratio through combination of interest 14 а rate 15 reductions, extended amortization, and 16 principal forbearance. We have also put a Mod website 17 in а Box on our so that other servicers can use this. Ιt is 18 а very 19 simplified protocol, how to do it at the NPV The investors obviously require that 20 test. you do a net present value test of the loan 21 modification over closure value, so we have a 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

simplified process for doing that as well and
 I think it has been helpful.

Since then Fannie and Freddie have 3 announced somewhat similar protocols. 4 Bank of America, J.P. Morgan Chase, I think, and I 5 hope we migrating towards a national 6 are 7 standard with at least a 31 percent debt income ratio. I think the affordability, the 8 meaningful payment reduction, is really key to 9 10 making sure that those and making it a lifelong. No more payment shocks are really key 11 to making sure that the folks can continue to 12 13 pay on their restructured mortgage. So I am very optimistic about the future of loan mods 14 15 certainly the administration and new has 16 indicated a very strong commitment to getting these and 17 loans restructured preventing foreclosures and spending real money to do 18 19 that. So I have high hopes that we will be gaining real momentum on this. 20

Finally on asset building, I think we had again some wonderful ideas on how to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 facilitate savings, more savings among the LMI 2 community and truly in a category of taking a lemon and making lemonade. We've been working 3 with Peter and others on perhaps mirroring 4 savings with lotteries. So I think there's a 5 lot of good progress there and thank you, 6 7 Peter, for all of your work and those of your students in trying to get something going 8 there through FDIC partnerships and certainly 9 10 to the extent banks can play a responsible role in facilitating those savings accounts 11 linked to lottery participations. 12 I think 13 that would be a very helpful thing. So finally, we have this wonderful 14 15 unbanked survey that was spearheaded by Vice 16 Chairman Gruenberg and Barbara Ryan which we are going to be hearing about now and I read 17 it but I'm looking forward to the presentation 18 19 as well. And before I think the panel starts, 20 Marty, would you like to say anything? Barbara why don't you go ahead and take it 21

22 away.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	MS. RYAN: Thank you Chairman Bair.
2	Good morning everyone. I am Barbara Ryan,
3	Deputy to Vice Chairman Gruenberg. I'll be
4	moderating this panel discussion on the FDIC
5	survey of bank's efforts to serve the unbanked
6	and underbanked and, as Chairman Bair
7	mentioned, I've also been managing this
8	project for the FDIC.
9	I'd like to begin by introducing my
10	fellow panelists. Ed Bachelder, to my
11	immediate right is director of research at
12	BlueFlame Consulting and until recently was
13	director of research at Dove Consulting which
14	the FDIC retained in 2007 to help us design an
15	administrative survey effort. Ed oversaw
16	Dove's work on this project and has also
17	contributed to over 230 research studies while
18	at Dove Consulting including many involving
19	banking and payments topics.
20	To Ed's right is Michael Barr,
21	professor of law at the University of Michigan
22	Law School. And Michael is a well known

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

expert, as many of you know, on financial matters, author of many notable publications concerning financial services and low- to moderate-income households, and Professor Barr serves as an advisor to the FDIC and Dove Consulting on this survey effort. Both of their bios are in your materials.

I'm looking for my slides now. I'm 8 So over the next few minutes I am 9 sorry. 10 going to quickly review some background on the Ed is going to share with us some of 11 survey. the results from the survey and then Professor 12 Bar will share some of his thoughts on the 13 implications and the recommendations related 14 15 to the findings of the survey. And we will 16 also have time for some Q and A.

So by way of background, the FDIC 17 conducted this survey in response to a mandate 18 19 under the Federal Deposit Insurance Reform Act of 2005 which requires the FDIC to conduct bi-20 the efforts of secured 21 annual surveys on institutions unbanked. The 22 to the serve

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

www.nealrgross.com

statute asks the Chairman of the FDIC to report to Congress on the results and findings of the survey including recommendations for legislative or administrative action as the Chairman deems to be appropriate.

Okay, so the Reform Acts lists a 6 7 number of factors and questions for the FDIC to consider in conducting the survey. But it 8 actually left pretty wide latitude in terms of 9 10 the design of the survey. So to take a step back, while we don't have concise estimates of 11 the numbers of the unbanked, which is defined 12 13 as those who rarely if ever have held an account at an insured institution, we do know 14 15 it is substantial and that there are that 16 millions of Americans without bank accounts. We also know that an even larger number of 17 Americans are underbanked. They have a bank 18 19 account but they also rely on non-bank financial service providers 20 such as check cashers and early on, the decision was made to 21 focus the FDIC survey efforts not only on the 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

www.nealrgross.com

unbanked as the statute requires, but the underbanked and -- because many of the issues confronted by the unbanked also are faced by the underbanked.

FDIC conducted the first 5 So the bank study during 2008. This survey 6 was 7 designed to address factors and questions that were raised in the statute. Broadly speaking 8 the goals of the survey were to identify the 9 10 extent to which banks are serving the banking needs of the unbanked and the underbanked, to 11 identify challenges affecting the ability of 12 13 banks to serve them, and identify innovative efforts that banks use to serve the unbanked 14 15 and the underbanked.

16 The Reform Act also asked the FDIC to provide a fair estimate of the size and 17 worth of the unbanked market. This isn't 18 19 really a question that can be easily asked of Many do not know the answer to that 20 banks. So the FDIC is addressing this 21 question. issue with separate effort, 22 а survey а

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

household survey, being conducted jointly with 1 2 the Bureau of the Census. After a lengthy planning process, just three weeks ago the 3 actually conducted 4 Census а supplemental its monthly current 5 population survey to 6 survey on behalf of the FDIC. That survey was 7 designed to identify the number of unbanked and underbanked households in the U.S., their 8 demographic characteristics and the factors 9 10 hindering their use of banks. The survey was administered to about 50,000 households. 11 Ιt will provide the first reliable national and 12 13 regional estimates of the number of U.S. households that are unbanked and underbanked 14 related information that 15 and the we are 16 seeking. And we expect to release the results of that survey later this year. 17

Now back to the bank survey. It was composed of a mail-in survey questionnaire sent to about 1,300 banks in three different size classes. The surveys were mailed out in the Spring of 2008 by Ed and his team at Dove

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 Consulting. Participation was voluntary and 2 685 completed questionnaires were returned, resulting in a 54 percent response rate. The 3 survey also involved 16 case studies on banks 4 in order to highlight innovative efforts to 5 serve the unbanked and the underbanked. And 6 7 these banks were chosen based on a variety of criteria, including demonstrated evidence of 8 their efforts and their successes. 9 The survey 10 instrument asked a lot of questions regarding the bank's education and outreach obstacles, 11 account opening issues, products and 12 access 13 services offered by banks that might appeal to the unbanked and underbanked. 14

is going to review some key 15 Ιt survey findings in detail at a very, very high 16 To set the stage, this is what the 17 level. survey revealed. Again, I want to emphasize 18 19 that the survey, this tremendous amount of data that we received and we still need to 20 analyze a lot of this data, but at just a very 21 high level what we found is that most banks, 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

the results revealed that most banks are aware 1 2 that opportunities there are to serve underbanked and unbanked individuals in their 3 Yet relatively few have made 4 areas. it a priority and there is a tremendous untapped 5 opportunity out there. While many banks do 6 provide basic financial education materials --7 certain types of efforts of outreach were 8 identified as most effective by the industry 9 10 and these such as educational sessions, outreach partnerships fewer banks 11 _ _ participate in those types of efforts. We are 12 13 going to hear more about some banks that have been very highly successful in those efforts 14 in the next session when we get into the case 15 16 studies.

We also found that most banks offer 17 basic accounts, checking accounts, savings 18 19 accounts to all customers. These are basic fewer offered the 20 accounts, but sorts of products that are specifically tailored to the 21 unbanked and the underbanked. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	And finally, in terms of the
2	challenges, many banks are concerned about the
3	profitability of serving unbanked and
4	underbanked individuals. And they are also
5	concerned about perceived regulatory issues
6	and impediments including anti-money
7	laundering regulations. So there's a lot more
8	in the survey results. The report is over 300
9	pages long. But before I turn to Ed I do want
10	to recognize the 16 case study banks that were
11	profiled in the study for their innovative
12	efforts to serve this segment. I don't have
13	time to go over the details of each of these
14	case studies but they are grouped here under
15	the category most closely matching their
16	efforts.
17	Not exclusively, but 16 are listed
18	on the slide. Descriptions of each bank's

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

case

detailed report prepared by Dove Consulting,

studies

efforts are in the FDIC executive summary that

will be released very shortly as

written

(202) 234-4433

complete

19

20

21

22

www.nealrgross.com

well as

the

in

are

those of which will be available on the FDIC website. And you'll hear from the four banks identified in red on the slide since they are here with us today and they are going to share their experiences in the next panel discussion.

And now I am going to turn this over to Ed and he'll provide a more detailed review of the survey results.

10 MR. BACHELDER: Thank you Barbara. I'm Ed Bachelder. Ι appreciate the 11 opportunity to address this committee and all 12 13 the good work that it does and I'm delighted and honored to work on this national survey of 14 15 bank's efforts to serve the unbanked and 16 underbanked.

Before I get started, I just want to give a little bit of background in terms of methodology. The survey went out, as Barbara mentioned, to around 1,300 banks. For those who speak statistics, the sample frame had about 1,287 FIs that we ended up surveying out

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

of the 7,487 banks that had retail offered 1 2 that would have branch operations for people, who might come in off the street. We broke 3 them out in terms of three tiers. 4 Tier one were the top 25 banks. Tier two were banks 5 that were over a billion but not a top 25. 6 And tier three were banks with assets of less 7 than one billion. 8

In terms of the results we had 685 9 participants but because of the stratified 10 sample design, even though we have a smaller 11 sample, we had a very high participation rate, 12 13 96 percent of the top 25 banks. That gave us a much better representation of the industry 14 15 than if it was a random sample. And our 16 response rates, and Professor Barr encouraged me to mention this, is -- our response rate of 17 54 percent overall is about double what you 18 19 would typically find in a commercial survey. And if you just want to think very loosely 20 about it, approximately 70 percent of insured 21 22 bank assets were covered by the banks who

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

participated and responded to this study. But the percentages and numbers you will see in the report are weighted percentages that would reflect banks across the industry. So think about it as banks. But in terms of the coverage, be aware of that.

I don't know if people can see but 7 if we go to slide ten and there should be a 8 handout with color so people can see it. 9 As 10 Barbara mentioned, one of the first things that jumps out of the survey is that 11 the majority of banks are aware that there are 12 unbanked and underbanked individuals in their 13 Specifically the tier one banks 14 market areas. 15 they all said we don't. The tier two, 90 16 percent, the tier two banks have 71 percent. There are some who don't know but in general 17 the larger banks seem to be very aware of the 18 19 unbanked existing. Yet despite that, if you go across the industry study, you'll see that 20 only 18 percent of banks have identified 21 expanding 22 services to these groups as а

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

www.nealrgross.com

1

priority of their business strategy.

We had a number of questions 2 in this asked, very long survey and 3 we we 4 developed certain themes in different ways. But one of the areas that we explored is what 5 was effective. What methods were working? 6 7 And we had a very simple question that you can probably read faster than I can say, 8 but essentially we were asking banks to rank or 9 10 sort different types of programs as what was the most effective to less effective. And the 11 one ranking was providing financial 12 number education sessions as having - providing a 13 benefit that leads to account relationships. 14 The second one was participation with other 15 organizations outside of the bank. Outreach 16 going out to employers and community centers. 17 And then financial education materials were 18 19 the fourth and targeted marketing. Targeted marketing is a challenge because you don't 20 necessarily know where they live or who the 21 customers of challenging 22 are. Α lot

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

demographics, so that could be understood, and then "other". So if you think about it, those are the top methods.

If you turn to the next slide. The 4 banks have indicated what they thought 5 was effective but if you look at what banks are 6 7 actually able to do and do commonly is most provide financial education materials. But 8 they tend to do, tier 1 banks tend to provide 9 10 the types or forms of education outreach viewed as most effective. So, for example, 11 the left pie, does your bank provide financial 12 education materials aimed at the unbanked or 13 underbanked, 63 percent do. That could be a 14 15 passive method, some literature or brochure. 16 On the right hand side: do you teach literacy or education sessions, the more active method. 17 You can see that 47 percent of banks don't. 18 19 And in terms of where it does occur, 35 percent are off-premise and many banks have 20 described the challenges of getting sessions 21 in their own facilities so typically they have 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

www.nealrgross.com

to go out somewhere or a combination. So it is kind of, I think it is a challenge that banks face at that level. But, in any event, tier 1 banks are using that more effective method by their own results.

The next slide. Looking at some of 6 7 the challenges for banks that serve the unbanked and underbanked, we asked them to 8 rank what they were. On the top of 9 list 10 profitability, followed by regulatory, fraud concerns, high cost of customer acquisition 11 and down at number five was competition from 12 other service providers, which is kind of 13 interesting when you think about the unbanked 14 15 and underbanked, especially the underbanked, where somebody might have an account at a bank 16 but chooses to cash a paycheck at a check 17 cashing or facility is a very interesting 18 19 thought. So the banks aren't reading that as top barrier. 20 а And 40 percent of banks perceive regulatory issues as impeding their 21 ability to serve this market. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 When asked, we had a question that 2 asked about what are banks doing, what have they done to try and become more accommodating 3 4 and modify their operations, retail operations, branches to serve the unbanked and 5 underbanked. 64 percent of banks reported 6 7 that they have modified their retail branches to make them more welcoming or convenient to 8 the unbanked or underbanked, but the method 9 10 that was used as I think with branches were including operations is the top thing that was 11 mentioned was internet and mobile banking and 12 13 that's a timely topic in financial services world. Mobile banking, we have to realize 14 15 this, for some banks includes a van or going 16 out to a facility. So it is not necessarily the cell phone that you might think about it. 17 It isn't the cutting edge, it is the going 18 19 out to the retirement area or the factory or location like that to provide services 20 at specific times. 21

Adding ATMs, extending branch hours

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

www.nealrgross.com

1 is very common. Many banks have extended 2 their hours and there many that are use supermarkets and other facilities that 3 are 4 open longer. But when you go down toward the bottom, you'll see new branches in LMI areas. 5 6 Actually really changing the branches or That is 7 looking at non-traditional locations. used much less. Fewer banks have made efforts 8 9 that way. 10 Next slide. So if we sort of think about what banks services are, then the first 11 challenge for a bank is when you walk in the 12 13 door, I don't know whether you are banked or unbanked. I don't know. All I know is you 14 15 are not a customer. So for many banks it is 16 either customer or non-customer. If you are a customer I know something about you and I have 17 a lot less worry. If you are a non-customer, 18 19 I have a lot of concerns that I need to take Therefore, typically the services to 20 care of. non-customers, the top of the list is I'll 21 cash a check that is drawn on my bank. 22 So

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 banks will do that whether you are a customer 2 However, if you come to that bank or not. with a local payroll check, for example, this 3 will be mentioned later but 32 percent of 4 banks won't cash a local payroll check unless 5 6 it is drawn on their bank. So you have to 7 think about not competing with an alternative financial services provider. I think that is 8 an important issue to think about. And then 9 10 in terms of making payments, 37 percent of banks won't do bank checks or money orders for 11 people who don't have a relationship with that 12 13 bank. They are concerned at that level and offer only international 14 six percent 15 remittances for non-customers. So Ι think 16 that follow up or continuation in services think 17 makes sense when you about the regulatory issues and the Patriot Act. 18 19 So then the other big challenges for 20 banks serving the non-customers, identification. Typically it is going to 21 depend upon some sort of government issued 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

photo ID. So 92 percent take their driver's 1 2 license. And then as you drop down to other types of licenses, and this is spelled out in 3 4 a lot more detail in the report, but you get down to 20 percent will take the matricula and 5 38 percent will accept ITINs to cash a check. 6 7 And I mentioned the regulatory issues. slide. Next So, say you 8 are unbanked or underbanked. Now you have to look

9 10 at I want to become a customer. There are policies and procedures I have to go through 11 in order to become a customer. 12 And some of 13 these policies and procedures wellare founded, good management but 14 they present 15 obstacles for somebody opening an account. So, for example, if you have a blemished 16 17 credit history, you are going to end up probably going through a third party credit 18 19 check or debit risk management program like It is going to look and 20 the check systems. see do you have any derogatory information 21 about your background. And if so, banks will 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 tend to, at that point, choose not to open an 2 account or will go through a process. So lot of hurdles if you have had 3 there's а trouble in the past getting back in. 4 And then the other one is identification because the 5 bank wants to make sure they know who you are, 6 7 you know, so they can track you down. So it goes back to government issued IDs as the key 8 So if you don't have that you will have 9 item. 10 a harder time using the bank. One of the key areas of the study 11 what kind of products and services do 12 was 13 banks offer for unbanked and underbanked individuals? And it really comes 14 down to essentially most banks are going to offer a 15 basic deposit account that doesn't require a 16 minimum balance. Sixty-two percent offer a no 17 minimum balance account and that will include 18 19 free check writing in their most basic So if you see the pie chart, you'll 20 account.

22

21

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

see there is 62 percent that have no minimum

balance required. Eight percent will take no

(202) 234-4433

1 minimum if you have direct deposit and then 2 another 30 percent will require a minimum But 30, I quess the key point is 99 3 balance. 4 percent of these accounts have overdraft charges that will go with it. So somebody who 5 has minimal funds and isn't up on their 6 7 account statements has а qood chance of encountering overdraft charges which can be an 8 obstacle to maintaining a bank account. 9 10 Next slide please. In terms of is probably a very products, this sleepy 11 But as you start going through the 12 chart. 13 different types of products that banks offer, when you start getting down to those tailored 14 15 that might be very unique to the unbanked and 16 underbanked, the IDAs, eight percent of banks offer those and typically when a bank offers 17 those, you don't count those and really don't 18 19 count those in thousands. You may count them in dozens or hundreds. 20 Workplace based programs, going out 21 and working at an employer site. 22 We are

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

NEAL R. GROSS

www.nealrgross.com

1 working at the volunteer tax assistance. They 2 trying help people siqn are to for up Ι think Professor will 3 accounts. Barr 4 probably want to comment about that. But I think the issue you want to really think about 5 is for somebody who's not doing well in their 6 7 check system screen, what does the bank do? And only 25 percent of the banks in the study 8 reported having an option - an account that 9 10 they could then queue up for somebody to do. Today one of the panelists for one of the case 11 study banks, their bank actually has something 12 13 that's not called a second chance but an opportunity checking 14 account where they 15 minimize the amount of ATM withdrawals and 16 deposits, no overdrafts allowed, to really constrain the account to get people on track 17 before they let them graduate or move up to a 18 19 more traditional account.

20 Next please. And then in terms of 21 the services provided when we were asking what 22 banks efforts are in terms of branch

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

strategies to serve unbanked and underbanked 1 2 in the market areas, and the most popular item was check cashing. That was 49 percent of 3 4 banks who use that as a strategy and money Both of those are pretty big cards. 5 orders. So this is really trying to look at what 6 7 financial service providers offer and what do the banks offer. And you can see that your 8 numbers would be very different in terms of 9 10 who the competition is for banks within this market segment. 11 So, one of the key 12 There we go.

13 challenges as we talked about, whether you are able to cash a check or not is whether you get 14 15 cash when you come in with a check. If you 16 look at the survey responses, you'll see that funds availability for checks is 17 the in compliance with federal regulations but is 18 19 pretty slow for many people relative to nonbank check cashing services. So, for example, 20 36 percent of -- if you can follow the segment 21 the green and the yellow, 22 you see so 64

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 percent. So the majority of banks will give a personal check or business check drawn at that 2 bank immediate funds availability and still 3 cash that check. Other ones are going to wait 4 5 So you may not get your money. a day. Now what is interesting is these are for people 6 7 who have an account at that bank. So these aren't just walking in off the streets. So 8 these are for their customers, established 9 10 customers. And I believe an "established customer", it meant they had an account for 11 more than 30 days. So they have already had a 12 13 cycle. Government checks, 48 percent. When you start going to payroll checks, you can see 14 that for many banks they don't give immediate 15 availability to their own customers. And then 16 you can work your way through different types 17 of checks that would have more and more risk 18 19 potentially. These are for checks under \$2,500 and are local. 20 So I think that's probably one of 21

22 || the key things to consider. That is, what is

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

the availability and the reason I bring that up is these are rules that were established many years ago before Check 21 and the check clearing and forwarding. So the technology has moved ahead in banking and the rules are the same. So I just suggest this might be an area for exploration.

And then the next slide. In terms 8 of credit products, we found that banks offer 9 few advanced products. 10 So for example, if I want to get an advance on my paycheck or an 11 scheduled direct deposit 12 advance а on or 13 credit card - it is targeted on individuals so there aren't that many banks that offer 14 15 products like that. Fewer than six percent will give an advance on funds or against an 16 anticipated direct deposit and that 17 would include things like government and payroll. 18 19 And I guess the final point here is that twothirds of banks, 69 percent, offer closed and 20 up to \$5,000 but unsecured loans for 21 the requirements make it harder for an individual 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

www.nealrgross.com

38 1 to, an unbanked or underbanked customer, to 2 these to avoid more costly payday access loans. 3 So I moved right through these and 4 there are some recommendations, but would you 5 like to --6 7 MR. BARR: Do you want to talk about the FDIC recommendation first or do you 8 want me to comment first? 9 10 MS. RYAN: I'll mention that. MR. BARR: Great. 11 MS. RYAN: And then you can take 12 13 it away. As I mentioned a few minutes ago, the requires that 14 statute а report be 15 transmitted to Congress and it also suggests 16 that the Chairman of the FDIC make recommendations for legislative 17 or action administrative she deems 18 as 19 appropriate. And there is one recommendation that the FDIC is suggesting, that you just put 20 out there, which is to consider defining a 21 goal, shared national government 22 industry **NEAL R. GROSS**

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

qoal, to lower the number of unbanked 1 and 2 underbanked households in the United States. This is not a problem that is uniquely the 3 4 industry's or the government's. It is а shared problem and so that's an idea to put 5 6 out there. It could involve, for example, 7 creating a national task force to provide oversight and guidance, suggestion for doing 8 such a thing. And of course any such goal 9 would need to be based on reliable statistics 10 which, as many of us know, don't currently 11 exist, but hopefully we will have some better 12 13 statistics soon on this to provide a tracking So that's one suggestion. 14 measurement. Ι 15 know that Professor Barr has thought about 16 this a great deal and maybe has some more. So let's move into this session. 17

MR. BARR: Thank you very much, Barbara, and I just wanted to say thank you to Chairman Bair and to Vice Chairman Gruenberg and to the chair of the committee, Diana Taylor, for inviting me to participate in this

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

project overall and also for inviting me this 1 2 morning. The FDIC's leadership on this issue, I think, is really extraordinary. I don't 3 have to tell any of you that, but you take a 4 step back and look at the range of issues 5 6 facing the FDIC over the last few years. The fact that Chairman Bair has decided to make 7 this a central part of her leadership I think 8 is quite extraordinary so I'm thankful for 9 10 that on behalf of everybody. I also want to thank Barbara. It has been just 11 а real work with the FDIC 12 pleasure to and with 13 Barbara and her team on this project. It is just an extraordinary group of people and 14 15 working with Ed Bachelder again has just been a delightful experience too. Ed and I first 16 worked together more than a decade ago when 17 the federal government was tasked with the 18 19 idea of making benefit payments electronically under the electronic funds transfer program, 20 the EFT 99. Ed was instrumental in deepening 21 our understanding at the Treasury at the range 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

of issues facing unbanked federal benefit recipients, very much shaped the nature of the program that was instituted as a result of that. So it is a delight to be working with him again.

I want to make a couple of comments about highlighting a few things that both Ed and Barbara said, and then suggest for conversation a handful policy ideas building on the FDIC's recommendation.

Ι think there are, the central 11 level of finding that I want to really focus 12 13 on with respect to this study, which I should say also is, both this study and the CPS study 14 15 that has just been done a real, scientific 16 improvement. I think that one of the key findings from this report is that while many 17 banks are engaged in lots of activity there is 18 19 not a real focus on the kind of activity that is tailored particularly to the needs of low-20 and moderate-income households. So I think, 21 in thinking about the next kinds of steps that 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

www.nealrgross.com

1 we would hope that the banking sector comes 2 to, there would be a set of steps that are based on a deeper understanding of what works 3 and what doesn't in financial education, for 4 And what works and what doesn't in 5 example. 6 the development and offering of products that 7 are specifically tailored to the needs of lowincome households. So these would be, for 8 example, a safe and affordable bank account. 9 So the basic bank account product that most 10 institutions offer is a checking account with 11 high risk of overdraft and high fees. 12 And 13 that kind of product doesn't work well for low- and moderate-income households. So I 14 15 think we need to channel more of our energy 16 away from the idea of any basic account and any financial education is an improvement and 17 toward what is it particularly that financial 18 19 institutions can do to offer low-income households a safe and affordable bank account. 20 An account without checking perhaps. 21 An account without overdraft in it. An account 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

lets them receive their income from a 1 that 2 variety of sources, electronically and easily from federal benefits to state benefits to 3 4 income from work. So having an efficient mechanism for low-income people to receive 5 their income means it is less likely they are 6 7 going to have to pay a lot of money to go to a check casher. We need a system that makes it 8 easy for low-income people to save. 9 I'm not 10 talking about for long term purposes or retirement. I mean to build a cushion for in 11 the case of emergencies. Too much of our 12 13 conversation about savings is focused on long term goals and not enough on the need for 14 short term emergency cushions. We need to 15 build into our financial products automatic 16 savings plans that help people build a cushion 17 in their bank accounts. 18

And the third issue, which Chairman Bair already highlighted, is the need for a safer, lower cost credit product that can be built into these kinds of accounts. Financial

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

institutions are able to do that at lower costs than the non-banking industry, but have not really pursued this as a strategy in meeting the needs of low-income households in this way.

So I think there's enormous potential that is embedded in these survey findings to redirect some of the energy in the financial sector.

10 Let me suggest, that in addition to what the private sector can do, a number of 11 government focused ideas for discussion. 12 One 13 of them, Ed has already highlighted. That is with respect to funds availability policy. 14 Our funds availability policies for banks are 15 16 a real impediment to getting more people, the low-income people in the financial system. 17 And with the advances in technology we've seen 18 19 in the last several years and with check authority should 20 truncation we really seriously reevaluate, at least for the largest 21 institutions that are able now technologically 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

www.nealrgross.com

to do better, requirements for greater speed
 and funds availability.

The second initiative that I think 3 take 4 that can is with respect to we encouraging a direct deposit. Direct deposit 5 has become relatively commonplace for large 6 7 institutions in their interactions with large banks for their employers. It is much less 8 common for smaller banks to offer as an easy 9 10 service for firms they do business with and for smaller firms to offer to their employees. 11 And a real focus on direct deposit, I think 12 13 would bring more low-income people into the banking system and reduce their costs of using 14 15 non-banks for check cashing services.

A third idea is to expand on the 16 work that the states have already done with 17 electronic benefits transfers. to 18 respect 19 There's been enormous progress in reducing the cost for states of getting state benefits onto 20 a debit card. There has not been very much 21 energy put into the incredible functionality 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	that card could have for low- and moderate-
2	income people. If we view it not as just a
3	means of transferring income payment but also
4	as a means of getting other income from non-
5	state sources, developing automatic savings
6	plan, providing other kinds of products and
7	services that low-income people need. So
8	there's a lot of action that could happen at
9	the state level.
10	An idea also with respect to really
11	moving to the level of the federal government
12	there are I think three initiatives might be
13	useful or in order for discussion. One of
14	them is with respect to greater attention
15	under the Community Reinvestment Act to
16	positive innovation and services. There's not
17	been very much attention paid in the services
18	test at all under CRA. And in general when
19	that attention is paid, it is the question,
20	was there a bank branch opened or closed?
21	Which is really not that relevant to is a low-
22	income person getting access to a financial

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

product that works for them? So I think a
 greater focus on that would help.

And two ideas in the tax area. One 3 is that the IRS right now if I'm a low-income 4 person receiving the earned income tax credit 5 and I don't have a bank account, I have to 6 7 wait six to eight weeks longer than a banked person to get my refund check. It puts 8 enormous pressure on low-income people to take 9 10 out expensive refund anticipation loans, which If the IRS were to direct deposit they do. 11 their tax refund into an account that the IRS 12 13 itself made available to a low-income person through the private banking industry, that is 14 15 under roster of banks that а agree to 16 participate, banks get more customers, lowincome people get into the banking system, we 17 reduce the incidents of refund anticipation 18 19 lending, and people get their money faster. So it is a way right now to get through the 20 IRS much greater entrance into the banking 21 system. idea 22 And the last may not be

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

especially politically popular in the current 1 2 environment, but it is to provide financial institutions with a tax credit for offering 3 low cost, safe and affordable accounts to low-4 and moderate-income consumers. 5 Our studies suggest that profitability is one of the key 6 7 barriers to serving low- and moderate-income If we were to offset the affixed people. 8 amount of the cost of opening an account for 9 low-income households, we might be able to 10 rather efficiently make a big difference to 11 the provision of those accounts. 12 And I think the dollars involved do not need to be too 13 high. 14 15 that's quite a long list of So 16

ideas. It is really designed to start a conversation and I again want to thank Barbara and Ed for their partnership on this and Chairman Bair for her leadership on this issue.

17

18

19

20

(202) 234-4433

21 MS. RYAN: Thanks Michael. I 22 would like to open this up for discussion and

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

1 before I do that I just have one thing I would 2 like to mention that, in addition to it being a tremendous pleasure to work with Ed at Dove 3 Consulting and Professor Barr, we've had a 4 team here at the FDIC that's put a lot of work 5 into this over the past two years. Yasmine 6 7 Osaki, Susan Burhouse, Katherine Samolyk, Luke Reynolds, Angelisa Harris, Leneta Gregorie and 8 David Chapman have all been working here with 9 me and very involved in this issue which we 10 are all quite passionate about. So with that, 11 I would like to open it up for any questions 12 13 or comments. VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: I have. 14 CHAIRMAN BAIR: Vice Chairman 15 Gruenberg would like to make a few comments 16 then. 17 VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: I didn't 18 19 preempt these guys at the offset want to because they have really done the work and I 20 really think they have done, provided us with 21 an outstanding piece of work here does break 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 new ground in this area. I think this is a 2 issue that certain extent has biq to а received less attention than it should have. 3 to financial services for 4 Access lowand moderate-income people is 5 huqe economic а 6 issue both in terms of the cost of those 7 services and the quality or reliability. And the way in which those services are provided 8 have a real economic opportunity and income 9 10 consequences for lowand moderate-income And there has been a lack of careful, people. 11 reliable information in simply understanding 12 13 how those services are being provided and the obstacles that are presented to people 14 in 15 getting access to services on a responsible 16 basis. I think the real purpose here, and in part it was the opportunity that was created 17 by this statutory requirement and the deposit 18 19 insurance reform law was really to build a base of reliable information to try to develop 20 what we hope will be more effective strategies 21 I think this survey in a sense in this area. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 is the first step in trying to get a handle on 2 what banks actually doing are and in particular the case studies we are going to 3 hear about in terms of innovative programs the 4 financial institutions have implemented. 5 Т think quite importantly is this survey that 6 7 the Census is conducting in collaboration with the FDIC which will be really the first 8 reliable national survey of who's unbanked and 9 10 underbanked in the United States. Diana referred to it in her opening remarks. 11 We have general numbers that are thrown around 12 13 based on a variety of studies that have been done, none of which are really as reliable or 14 15 far-reaching as we would like. I think with 16 this survey which will be on a very large national sample and we'll get into some depth 17 in terms of the services people used and the 18 19 obstacles that they confront. We will really be able to get on a national regional even 20 state-by-state and perhaps a metropolitan area 21 basis who's unbanked and the issues that they 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 confront in terms of getting access to 2 So think we really have services. Ι an opportunity here both develop 3 to the 4 information and come up with some responses that will have an impact and I just wanted to 5 make that comment and again thank the people 6 7 here at the table and the outstanding team at that's really helped put the FDIC this 8 together. 9 10 MR. McDONALD: Thank you. I would like to first of all congratulate you on the 11 information you have provided us today from 12 13 And in listening to your survey. your presentation and listening to how you 14 went 15 about the survey, one piece dawned on me that 16 I'd like to ask whether or not you took into consideration some effort toward looking at 17 In other words, we have the preventive side? 18 19 a number of people coming into the system of unbanked and underbanked and those individuals 20 are coming in because of some factors. 21 And when I was listening to the presentation from 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 a preventive side, if we can at all possible 2 look at how we could implement some type of educational piece into our education system, a 3 lot of banks, a lot of agencies are doing 4 financial education after the fact. 5 So I was 6 wondering whether or not during your survey or 7 looking at alternatives whether or not some type of preventive piece was thought about and 8 how we should go about it? That is question 9 10 one. Would you like a MR. BACHELDER: 11 quick answer? 12 13 MR. McDONALD: Yes. BACHELDER: did 14 MR. We ask 15 questions around the educational outreach how 16 to do it, what types of approaches to do to educate people, on what levels and approaches. 17 also had We had questions. We on the 18 19 analysis side, we did a lot of qualitative open-ended questions where banks would comment 20 both about what they have to do to bring 21 people into the bank as well as what they 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 might do to retain people who are having, who 2 might have their account closed for costs because of having bounced too many checks. 3 So programs that some banks have to try and help 4 bring people back to an account where they can 5 manage and stay in the system. So there is 6 7 some comment information. So both the education part and some of the retention. 8

MR. McDONALD: I think where I was 9 10 going with this was whether or not we could look at the educational system, whether it is 11 in high school, whether it is in junior high 12 13 school because what we need to do is get to the individuals before they develop these 14 15 habits. the banking business In we are 16 beginning to see a lot of problems beginning to come about with college students. 17 They are getting into a financial problem early on with 18 19 credit cards, which is affecting their FICO score, which is affecting what type of credit 20 they can get, whether or not they can open an 21 account. So, if we had that early education 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 and I know the banks have been doing their 2 part and the agencies, such as the FDIC, and the whole educational component. But maybe if 3 we could look at an overall universal effort 4 begin having the education 5 system to to incorporate something into its curriculum 6 7 early on to begin getting these individuals to understand the pitfalls. That would at least 8 begin to slow down the number of individuals 9 10 qoinq to the unbanked and underbanked category. 11 MR. BARR: Let me just add two 12 13 quick things to what I had already said. Ι think you are right. We need to do better at 14 15 financial education earlier. I think one

16 significant barrier to that is the lack of science around actually 17 what works in financial education. We spend a lot of money. 18 19 We all put out tons of brochures. We teach it in the schools and I don't think we have 20 very good studies about the science and an 21 effective education and finance. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	And the second point acceptance
2	in particular areas. The second thing I would
3	say is I also think we don't want to put all
4	of our weight on financial education as
5	opposed to looking at the way in which we
6	construct financial choices for our consumers
7	to make. If we construct choices in such a
8	way that it is really easy to make a bad
9	choice and really hard to make a good one, all
10	the financial education in the world is not
11	going to be enough.
12	MS. RYAN: I would like to just
13	add another point which is that the survey
14	results revealed that a lot of banks are doing
15	financial providing financial materials
16	
	and this survey revealed that pretty clearly
17	and this survey revealed that pretty clearly that we still have this problem. So I think
17 18	
	that we still have this problem. So I think
18	that we still have this problem. So I think that speaks to a certain extent by itself. It
18 19	that we still have this problem. So I think that speaks to a certain extent by itself. It is also very difficult to evaluate the

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

doing. We found I believe that most banks are 1 2 not measuring the effectiveness of it. Now to give credit, those that answered affirmatively 3 that they are, most of them felt like it was 4 effective. But that was a minority. 5 By and 6 large, most banks are doing this and we don't 7 know. They are not measuring whether it is working or not and like I say, the starting 8 point is the problem still exists. 9 So it 10 speaks to a need for something. MR. McDONALD: My second point and 11 observation, because I had two. 12 On the tax 13 incentive, I think that's а very qood incentive that if you can pull something 14 15 together, even if you had a credit against 16 your FDIC fees. It is something I believe that would begin motivating the financial 17 institutions. It would at least get rid of 18 19 the thought of them having it as a cost factor

21

20

22

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

and perhaps they could look at it as an income

might want to give some serious consideration

So it might be something that you

(202) 234-4433

factor.

www.nealrgross.com

1 to -- some type of tax incentive. I know you 2 tacked it on in the end and said maybe this is far-fetched, but I think if we are going to 3 4 change behavior on a large scale, I think the tax incentive route or some type of incentive 5 route would be the most effective way to 6 change the behavior of financial institutions. 7 REV. FLAKE: Thank you. First of 8 all let me commend you on the survey. 9 Just a 10 point and that is in the survey of the banks and the analysis of what they perceive as the 11 issues related to the persons coming in and 12 13 taking advantage of what banks have available. In a climate in many communities where there 14 15 is a growing industry as it relates to check cashing, payday lending, and other kinds of 16 sources, would it have been possible to do an 17 analysis by studying some of those customers 18 19 to find out why they used that particular entity as opposed to a bank? 20 And I think some things that stick out to me is number one, 21 they are accessible, they are open 24 hours a 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 day. They, secondly, and the big point is 2 they are not worried about their money being held because they get their money the instant 3 they take their check into those entities. 4 The question then for me is, is it possible to 5 go back and take a good look at how you can, 6 7 by identifying in some measure, even if it means putting some persons at those places at 8 certain times particularly the first of the 9 10 month, to find out why they do that. What makes you spend more in terms of cashing a 11 check at one of these places as opposed to 12 13 going to the bank where the cost is much Money you saved on it? 14 cheaper? Or even put 15 yourself that practice of continuing into qoing to the payday lender knowing that 16 ultimately you risk losing everything? 17 Т mean, how do we sell the safety element of the 18 bank as opposed to the possibility of loss by 19 virtue of how these institutions that 20 are unregulated are able to function? 21

MR. BARR: Maybe I could just say

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

22

1 a word about this. So prior to this study I did an analysis at the household level asking 2 the kinds of questions that you just described 3 for 1,000 families in the Detroit metropolitan 4 area not a national sample of the kind that 5 FDIC is doing, but I was able to drill down 6 7 much more in depth because of the location to really have an hour and a half conversation 8 with people about those kinds of choices. 9 10 First of all I am happy to make that available to you to look at. And second I think that it 11 is important in thinking about this, that it 12 13 is not just a focus on the cost of the nonbanking side of the equation but also on the 14 15 other sets of alternatives to the equation. 16 So if a low-income person is not -- can't cash their checks in a bank, or the bank is going 17 to wait to pay them, or if they have a bank 18 19 they are going to get а lot of account 20 overdraft fees, we need to compare that to the non-financial sector. And I guess I would 21 argue we have significant problems 22 on both

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

sides of that equation, both in the banking and the non-banking and, if we are going to solve this, we have to look across the entire industry, not by sector.

MR. RYAN: I would agree with that 5 and I have follow up to that: one, a comment 6 7 and two, a request for the group. But as obviously we are interested in creating 8 incentives here. But we do need to think 9 10 about other policies or attempts to address these efforts and how certainly at the state 11 level and at the federal level how this policy 12 13 in of some of these may get the way objectives. So as an example, as you all 14 15 pointed out funds availability is an issue as 16 we have heard at previous meetings. There is a reason that low-income people want the cash. 17 There are economic reasons. They avoid fees. 18 19 It is an efficient way for them to manage their funds. There are economic decisions 20 being made into trying to get cash. 21 So, one of the things at the state level, the state 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

www.nealrgross.com

has tried to do is institutions, this came up 1 2 in Texas, were denying the ability to cash "on us" checks, payroll checks, so the state tried 3 to require that the banks honor those checks. 4 And then they were preempted under federal 5 law from doing that. And then another example 6 7 is the funds availability issue and in my own experience I have noticed that, ironically, 8 Check 21 was exacerbated as that float becomes 9 10 a much more obvious thing, many are taking advantage of it. So for a low-income person 11 where funds availability is really a critical 12 13 issue, and they need it now and they are trying to avoid fees. We need to look at how 14 15 these policy decisions at the federal level 16 have been made and how they fit together to at least from our perspective pull this back from 17 trying to address this issue. This might not 18 19 have been the right way to address this issue but there was no debate about what was driving 20 the state to do this. It was just a decision 21 doesn't apply. that would 22 that So be my

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 request for the group is how do we create 2 mechanisms at the federal level that one is -for instance in the 3 states, we, are 4 identifying issues and trying to address them, but they are not the right fix and what can we 5 do to the federal policy to address that 6 7 issue?

MR. EAKES: I would like to have the 8 panelists just comment on the tension between 9 10 having a national goal of having less unbanked and underbanked and the prevalence of 11 overdraft fees. It seems like to me if 12 we 13 said we want to have people have access to homeownership but said that the only tool you 14 could use would be subprime, exploding arm 15 16 loans. Knowing what we have just recently we probably wouldn't feel good about 17 seen, that overdraft that. We know fees 18 are 19 anywhere between 20 and 35 billion dollars per year and at three or four times the entire 20 payday lending industry fees. And so I 21 am just curious how do we actually 22 make an

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

initiative because it seems like to me I can't legitimately at least in my little arena, I can't ask people to sign up for a checking account knowing that it is going to perhaps end up hurting them more than it helps them.

CHAIRMAN BAIR: Yes, I wanted --6 7 that's а qood question. Your first recommendation was requiring banks to have a 8 safe and affordable checking account. 9 Ι 10 wonder if you will explain a little more what you think an account like that would look like 11 and maybe those goals need to be combined 12 13 somehow. You are right because the last thing we want is for the government to be pushing 14 15 folks into accounts where they are spending 16 several hundred dollars a month on overdraft which we fees 17 know is occurring in some places. 18

19 MS. TAYLOR: Actually I can just before 20 add one thing you address that One of the big fights that we had 21 question. which I don't remember, when I was banking 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

1	superintendent in New York was we had a rule
2	in New York that you could not have charge
3	fees, certain fees for overdrafts. And the
4	state chartered banks came to us and said well
5	the feds allow it so we have to, to be able to
6	be competitive and people want that service.
7	So it is an issue that is both a federal and a
8	state issue and one thing that I would say
9	that it is important for whatever to come up
10	with this in this area to be applied across
11	the board.
12	MR. BARR: First of all I think,
	MR. BARR: First of all I think, Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if
12	
12 13	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if
12 13 14	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a
12 13 14 15	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a low-income person, I would not advise them to
12 13 14 15 16	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a low-income person, I would not advise them to open a checking account. And so I think all
12 13 14 15 16 17	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a low-income person, I would not advise them to open a checking account. And so I think all of our energy has to be around the creation of
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a low-income person, I would not advise them to open a checking account. And so I think all of our energy has to be around the creation of the fostering of safe and affordable bank
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Martin, you are exactly right. So I would, if I were sitting down across the table with a low-income person, I would not advise them to open a checking account. And so I think all of our energy has to be around the creation of the fostering of safe and affordable bank accounts. Then we can have a goal more people

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

that would be a significant mistake. And its 1 2 partly on the overdraft side which is a big It is partly on the funds availability 3 deal. It is partly on the other issues of 4 side. fraud and control and other things. So I think 5 need absolutely what we is а safe and 6 7 affordable account. The key elements I think of a safe and affordable account are that it 8 be -- not a checking account -- an account 9 10 that is electronically based, debit card based; that it not have overdraft facility in 11 I think that at the very minimum the Fed 12 it. 13 ought to be treating overdrafts as a Truth in Lending issue and not a Truth in Savings issue 14 15 which would significantly change the way we 16 think about the problem. I think that the FDIC's overdraft report, there is a way of 17 providing a lot more light on this problem and 18 19 the FDIC has shown a lot of leadership on the overdraft area under Chairman Bair. 20 So what should this account look like? It needs to be 21 electronically based. It needs to be debit 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 card based. No checking account. No 2 overdraft. It should have a way of receiving income electronically through direct deposit, 3 state benefits, federal benefits and income 4 Ideally it would have an automatic 5 received. savings feature so you sign up in advance. 6 7 Every month I am going to put \$5 of my income or \$10 or \$100, whatever that amount is, into 8 a separate savings pocket in that account on 9 10 that card that is somewhat harder to access than the other funds and build up savings in 11 that fashion, and it could have a Small Dollar 12 13 Loan product. So, instead of going to a payday lender for a short term two week loan, 14 15 which I know I am not going to be able to repay in two weeks, I have in my bank account 16 the possibility of getting a six-month self-17 amortizing loan with a decent interest rate 18 19 because the bank is not facing very much risk. I have direct deposit into the account. 20 They could direct debit out of the account. 21 I can get a much lower cost product to the customer 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

lower risks at the financial institution. 1 at 2 I think on each of those dimensions --So transactions, savings and credit -- there is a 3 4 way of creating a safer, more affordable product for low-income people than financial 5 institutions could do now. 6 7 MR. GRZYWINSKI: This may be heresy in this group but it seems as though we are 8 asking the question from the point of view of 9 banking, okay. I guess my question would be whether either in this survey, or Michael, in

10 11 the other work you have done or any other work 12 13 anybody has done, have we ever looked at a from the point of view of the 14 question 15 In other words is the consumer consumer? 16 making enlightened and correct self an interest decision? When Martin commented at 17 the beginning, you used financial services 18 19 instead of the word banking, okay. It just seems that if we are going to be honest with 20 all of ourselves, we ought to think about what 21 is the correct language here and should we be 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

thinking about ways in which banks do provide services through Wal-Mart, or through other kinds of providers and is that an additional vehicle? So I guess the question is, is there any good data anywhere that anybody here or anybody else has done that looks at this question from the consumer product.

VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: Ron, if 8 I could comment and then perhaps Barbara would 9 10 want to expand. In the sense of this survey that we are undertaking, there are a range of 11 the questions that both qo to financial 12 13 services people are utilizing including the alternative financial service providers. 14 So 15 you ask the question from the consumer's point 16 of view, that's really the other side of the coin of this bank survey that we have done. 17 We are going to try to get some detailed 18 19 national information on the services people utilize, why they are utilizing them, and the 20 obstacles they find to utilizing financial 21 institutions to try to gain some perspective 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

www.nealrgross.com

on that issue which is really key informationto get.

MR. BARR: Just to follow up. 3 Ι think that national site is going to be a huge 4 improvement on what we know. In the Detroit 5 area study I did, I spent a long time trying 6 7 to address that question from the consumer point of view and across the banking and non-8 banking sector. So, the approach that I took 9 was consistent with what you described. 10 Let's see what people do and why they do it not 11 study why they are doing this or that in and 12 13 out of the banking system. And they do often make quite good choices. So we need to decide 14 15 how do we give them their constrained choice set? That is, give them the lack of good 16 products that they have. So I'd like to see 17 us look at how do we change the products that 18 19 they can choose among so that they can choose something, you know they are making the best 20 The choices are bad choice because choice. 21 they are only bad choices to make. I don't 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

think we have solved the problem. One aspect 1 2 that I want to particularly highlight because Ed and I did it together and this is really 3 Ed's pioneering work in that area of consumer 4 choice methodology. We did a study in this 5 Detroit population of what kinds of particular 6 7 products and services do low-income consumers want when given realistic tradeoffs among 8 So we looked at different kinds of 9 products. 10 debit cards, payroll cards, payment cards, And by varying the features bank accounts. 11 across these different accounts we were able 12 13 to see what would be the hypothetical take How much desire is there for different 14 rater. kinds of products and features 15 amonq the unbanked and I'd be happy to share that with 16 the FDIC and to make it publicly available at 17 any financial institution that wants to use 18 19 the model. MR. TUFANO: To pick up on Martin --20 21

well on this past discussion. We have done a national survey, 22 dimensions of financial

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

www.nealrgross.com

1 activity. And it is interesting. You cannot 2 study anyone at any one time. So somebody who is a payday lender, conditional on being a 3 4 payday lender, being a refund anticipation quite different. 5 borrower is So there actually are types and so we can't actually 6 7 think of them one at a time.

Tim Martin's point, we actually did 8 a study on overdraft, specifically on people 9 10 who bounced out of the system and it is to understand that the important 11 consumer level who that is, specifically it 12 is over 13 represented by women who are heads of household. It is over represented in minority 14 15 communities. It is overrepresented in the 16 young and in the old, less so in the middle-It is also overrepresented in certain 17 aqed. banking environments. So you can see the 18 19 banks are playing a role here too.

20 And then a question for Ed, because 21 I wanted some clarification. In some of the 22 work that we have done, we found this curious

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

thing -- because the checking account is the 1 2 entry point for a bank product, that folks are denied savings accounts who don't 3 want 4 checking accounts, just straight up want savings accounts and are willing to forego the 5 checking part, but they are denied savings 6 7 accounts because of check systems.

MR. HENDERSON: Because of what?

MR. Since the bank 9 TUFANO: 10 procedures won't allow them to have a checking account because of check systems problems. 11 They are also denied the right to have a 12 13 savings account. And we found that every time we sample, we seem to find that is true. 14 But 15 I could never get a sense of whether that is a 16 common phenomenon. Do you have from your survey any insight on that? 17

MR. BACHELDER: We did ask that and analyzed that direction because there were lots of things to look at to be explored for the data that was gathered in terms of that crossing. But I guess, if you think about the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

8

www.nealrgross.com

1 kinds of concerns we should get to is the 2 difference the banks have in terms of how long they will tolerate somebody in an overdraft 3 state and we had a specific question on that. 4 And the answers were basically from within a 5 month, you know, within a month we are going 6 7 to close your account to 180 days. So a real long range. Some banks had programs to help 8 you finance your overdraft fees for a longer 9 10 period of time to help you get back on track and would downshift you to a more limited 11 account to retain you. But I think that entry 12 13 point and if you just look at the customer proposition and these are self positions, but 14 15 if you were to think about somebody shows up and they have a choice. Who do I want to do 16 business with? You may look at one of these 17 segments of demographics and I don't know if 18 19 Barbara could slide back to slide 19, but if the alternative 20 you look what service I mean what is it that they providers show. 21 Most all of them do check cashing. 22 do? Most

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

all of 1 them will do money orders. They 2 definitely want to do bill point payment. They are big marketers for prepaid cards where 3 banks have much more restrictive policies on 4 prepaid cards for example. So there is a lot 5 of demographic overlay that basically if you 6 7 pull everything up and flip it over you start to see the market difference because of banks' 8 regulations, approaches and business model. 9 10 Maybe it isn't worthwhile for each bank to pursue all of these various, but it is enough 11 12 qet that front end part of the to 13 transactional services that people need to do everyday and if you are a cash based consumer 14 15 that you were describing that is how I do my 16 budgeting. I have no more money in my pocket, no more spending. But I think if you really 17 look at how banks are not making this easy to 18 19 do the transactional payments in a safe way, I think that would be one area to explore that 20 might overlap the segments. 21

MS. TAYLOR: I am going to cut

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

discussion off because we are already 1 this 2 about 45 minutes behind. You guys are going to be at lunch, right? So we can continue 3 this discussion over lunch. I know that there 4 is a lot to say on this but I think we need to 5 hear from the banks to learn what is actually 6 7 happening from that point of view. just want to say thank you so Ι 8 This has been really enlightening and much. 9 10 it is a great study. I am looking forward to reading it in detail and Barbara, thank you 11 for your work. Thank you so much. 12 13 So let's go on to the next panel. I think it is also yours Barbara. 14 MS. RYAN: As I mentioned a little 15 bit earlier, a very important component of the 16 FDIC's unbanked survey was a development of 16 17 case studies that highlight various strategies 18 19 that financial institutions have employed to reach the unbanked and the underbanked. 20 And we did these to demonstrate that opportunities 21 in fact exist for banks to serve these 22 do

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

markets both profitably and effectively. 1 The case study banks themselves demonstrated an 2 array of approaches. In fact, in the unique 3 4 perspectives of their own market areas, each case study bank has targeted a customer base 5 6 and has developed a strategy and the banks, 7 among the 16, they represented a variety of sizes, geographic locals and demonstrate that 8 different types of banks 9 can successfully 10 serve the unbanked and the underbanked. So this morning, four of the 16 case study banks 11 are going to share their approaches. 12 These 13 particular institutions were chosen. They reflect a variety of types and sizes, types of 14 15 approaches, sizes of banks. Our first 16 panelist is from Mitchell Bank, James Maloney. Mitchell Bank is small independent 17 а located on institution the south side of 18 19 Milwaukee, Wisconsin. Mr. Maloney is president of the bank and chairman of 20 the board of the Mitchell Bank Holding Corporation 21 and Mr. Maloney is also a member of the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1

Alliance for Economic Inclusion task force.

2 second panelist, Our Peter Mosbacher is from Amalgamated Bank, the 3 Nation's only union-owned bank. Amalgamated 4 has branches in New York City and four other 5 states across the county. Peter Mosbacher is 6 7 the bank's senior vice president responsible for developing and managing the community 8 And this includes development department. 9 10 identifying the banking and credit needs of the communities that the bank serve, working 11 with the bank's senior management to identify 12 retail 13 branch locations, bank products, programs and services that respond to those 14 15 needs.

third panelist is from 16 Our Citibank. Victor Ramirez is a 17 community officer for relations that bank and is 18 19 responsible for developing and managing relationships with non-profit organizations in 20 underserved areas of Los Angeles, 21 Orange County and the Inland Empire. He also serves 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

as a subject matter expert for Citibank on various economic development topics including asset building strategies and he is a member of the Los Angeles Alliance for Economic Inclusion.

Our fourth panelist is from Monroe 6 7 Bank and Trust, a community bank that operates 25 full service branches in Southeastern 8 Michigan. Mary Jane Town, is the bank's 9 10 senior vice president and director of responsible marketing, for product 11 development, public relations, 12 corporation 13 communications, advertising and promotion.

And with that, I look forward to hearing from our first case study bank, Mr. Maloney and Mitchell Bank.

MR. MALONEY: Good morning. First of all thank you for the invitation to come here today and let me also commend the FDIC and the Alliance for Economic Inclusion for maintaining the focus on these issues in these difficult times. As a small bank you have no

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

idea what your support does when we approach 1 2 the directorate and shareholders with regard various ideas that have for 3 to we new 4 products. From your support and your focus on these issues is very important to us 5 at а small bank and we rely on you for that and we 6 7 thank you for it.

We at Mitchell Bank are part of the 8 small dollar loan pilot. FDIC's That 9 is 10 really where I am going to speak about most this morning because that is 11 our current We offer a whole suite of products 12 product. to non-customers and to the unbanked and they 13 have all been successfully received. 14 But the pilot consists of 31 financial institutions in 15 16 which we are all offering small dollar loans and we are sharing our experiences in the 17 profitability of the product. We are also 18 19 very concerned with the issues of safety and soundness of the product. Sheila Bair and the 20 for Economic Inclusion have been Alliance 21 working on this pilot for over a year and 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 Chairman Bair has been at it for many years. 2 Chairman Bair, and now the FDIC, has been a consistent champion of the idea that banks can 3 profitably offer 4 competitively and small dollar loans to compete directly with payday 5 6 lenders. This goes back to her days at the 7 University of Massachusetts at Amherst and, if you ever want to get a real understanding of 8 low cost alternatives to payday loans, I would 9 10 ask each of you look back at the June of 2000 study of the Annie E. Casey Foundation. 11 A lot of this stuff is written and people don't 12 13 really read it. In preparing for my remarks here today, I went back and reread this and I 14 15 have to tell you that it is still very 16 relevant. It identifies the issues. Ιt involves the payday lending. It is 17 small dollar loans and the opportunities that small 18 19 dollar loans present to community banks is, 20 even though it is four years old, it is informative and it discusses all of 21 the Chairperson Bair has been in current issues. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

(202) 234-4433

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1	the forefront of the issue and has
2	consistently pointed out to banks that every
3	user of a payday product has a checking
4	account in the financial institution. They
5	are our customers. They are bringing our
6	customers bank postdated bank checks to our
7	bank and cashing them and charging their
8	interest rate. Now, the existence of a bank
9	account is a requirement to even get a payday
10	loan. We are not mining our data in our banks
11	to determine which of our customers are using
12	payday lenders so we can directly target them
13	with the alternatives.
14	Last June the FDIC issued its
15	guidelines and recommendations for small
16	dollar loans and again that is listed on the
17	website. And I have to tell you that what we
18	have tried to do is incorporate every one of
19	these recommendations and guidelines in our
20	small dollar loan product. In your materials
21	I have also given you a complete, which is a
22	detailed description of our product. Our

82

(202) 234-4433

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

product has evolved over time. We had to make changes and we've reached out to non-customers with this product because we were limiting it to our customers and that became too limited.

So feel free to look and use the 5 description. We have spent a lot of time on 6 7 it and it is has been evolving over the last year and a half. We still don't know if this, 8 how this will perform and whether or not it 9 10 can be profitable as a stand alone product. We have made a number of loans and all of them 11 have performed extremely well, much better 12 13 than we ever imagined. We've only had one loan go bad, not bad, 30 days past due or 60 14 days past due and, when we looked into it, it 15 16 was because of a mistake that CSR made in issuing the loan. That performance on the 17 small dollar loans that was issued has been 18 19 extremely helpful because in rolling out the 20 program Ι have to tell you that the directorate and manager of the bank is very 21 skeptical of whether or not this can be done. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

www.nealrgross.com

1 So, now we believe that we are starting to 2 develop information and a track record that indicates that it can be done in a safe and 3 So the FDIC believes that the 4 sound manner. product can be created in a cost effective, 5 safe and sound manner, and it also presents 6 7 financial institutions with an opportunity to address the longer term financial needs of 8 their own customers. It also provides us with 9 10 an entry point for savings encouragement. We need to break the cycle of repetitive rolling 11 The basic purpose of a small over of debt. 12 13 dollar loan as we see it is to break the debt trap and the reoccurring cycle of escalating 14 loans which is part of a payday lender's 15 business model. One of the things that we and 16 I think the FDIC are pretty firm about is that 17 these small dollar loans cannot be fee-based 18 19 overdraft or bounce protection programs. The 20 rates for those programs many times exceed the APRs charged by even payday lenders. 21 They create a product we believe that is no better 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 and at times is worse than payday lending. 2 The programs are pointed to, those programs are pointed to by the payday industry to 3 4 justify their own APRs. This is particularly true where financial institutions allow people 5 fee-based overdraft protection and actually 6 7 allow people to make cash withdrawals using ATM cards over their balance, and where you 8 make a mistake and a cup of coffee costs you 9 10 \$35 to \$40 on that point of sale using a debit card. So what we need to do is to offer small 11 dollar loans, fully amortizing, that people 12 13 can pay without having to face the cliff of the two-week loan. 14 MR. FISH: Could you just help us 15 orient your comments, Mr. Maloney. Could you 16 just tell us how many loans you've made and 17 what the dollar amount of the 18 assets 19 outstanding are? The total dollars 20 MR. MALONEY: right now, what has happened is that when we 21 started we limited our first got loans 22 to

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

who have been with us 1 customers for six 2 That proved to be very limiting. months. So what we did is we recently opened it up to 3 4 non-customers and ITIN borrowers which is a big part of our population. Sixty to 70 5 percent of our existing customers are ITIN 6 7 borrowers. We are now up to about 25 to 30 We've had no defaults and the dollar loans. 8 amounts are basically what we see is everyone 9 10 borrows \$1,000. Our loan goes from \$300 to \$1,000, six or twelve months --11 FISH: I understand. 12 MR. So the 13 credit history is less than a year? MR. MALONEY: Yes it is. But the 14 six month loans that we've had have all paid 15 on time and paid off. 16 MR. FISH: Right, I understand. 17 Also what we do is MR. MALONEY: 18 19 we allow a savings, we require a savings Ten percent of the loan has to be 20 component. placed into a designated savings account. 21 We give it a favored interest rate, higher than 22 **NEAL R. GROSS**

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 our normal rate for our savings account. That 2 account can remain open after you pay off the You can add any funds to that account. 3 loan. You will always have an account at our bank 4 that has a higher interest rate than 5 the normal accounts. So what we are looking at is 6 7 a fully amortizing term loan not based on overdraft or fee based protection. We need to 8 really streamline our underwriting 9 in the 10 process making because we need to mimic what the people want from the payday industry. 11 We want someone to be able to walk into our bank 12 13 and get a loan within 15 minutes, which means at most we pull a credit report, look to make 14 15 sure that they have a \$1,000 of income and the customer service representative is authorized 16 to issue the check or the cash on the spot 17 based upon that credit score. 18

As I said when we first got started we were limiting it to customers. Now what we do is we open it to non-customers, the ITIN borrowers, which gives us the opportunity to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

bring someone in. They need a loan. We will make them the loan. They have to open an account and they have to have direct deposit into that account. And we also reduce the interest rate if they allow us to do automatic transfers from that account.

7 A couple of issues have arisen because people don't have -- necessarily have 8 credit scores. What we've done is we just 9 10 arbitrarily said that if you don't have a credit score we are going to presume -- if you 11 don't have a bad credit score, but you have no 12 13 credit score, we will presume that you have a middle level credit score because not having 14 15 credit isn't bad credit. The payday -- we do 16 look at the credit scores. As we look here, these are basically the breakdown of 17 the credit scores that we use and we escalate the 18 19 rate based upon the credit scores. The payday industry tells us that whether or not somebody 20 has a 499 credit score or a 528 credit score 21 really doesn't make any difference. 22 It is a

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

www.nealrgross.com

1 risky loan regardless. But so far we haven't 2 had any problems even with the loans with very low credit scores. So, one of the things, 3 too, is that the credit report does not track 4 what people's use of payday lenders have done, 5 what payday loans they have outstanding. We 6 7 will allow people to borrow money to pay off a payday loan. So, now if you have a credit 8 score of below 570, we initially require that 9 financial 10 you qo through three education classes before you got the loan. Well no one 11 is going to do that and so what we did, we 12 made one referral for one-hour session with a 13 consumer credit counselor and you establish a 14 15 budget and we will make а loan to you regardless of your credit score. 16

So in the end, all of these people are our customers. And we can complain about the payday industry and what they don't offer but unless we have something to offer them, we have no right to complain. What we've learned about the unbanked is that they may be banking

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 financially illiterate but they know how to 2 get their financial services, and they know the way they like to get them, and they are 3 willing to pay for them. 4 So, it is a burden to try and overcome some of those issues but I 5 6 think it is something that we can do. There 7 is a variety of issues with regard to Truth in Lending and things that we have that we've 8 struggled with a little bit that makes it a 9 10 little more costly for us to do this other than the payday lenders and with the consumer 11 credit and the collection issues, but they are 12 13 all issues that can be overcome. We are very high on the small dollar loans. We think that 14 is a great initiative and it 15 this is the 16 current product that we are focusing on at this point. So, with that I think, is my time 17 18 up? 19 MS. TAYLOR: If the other panelists here could limit their remarks to as quickly 20 as they possibly can because we are really 21 behind schedule. I hate to do that. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	MS. RYAN: Let's move on.
2	MR. MOSBACHER: Thanks Diana for
3	that added pressure. You can see glimpses of
4	our Depression-Era art there. Running through
5	the slides clues you in. For those of you
6	that don't know, we are the nation's only
7	union-owned bank remaining going back to 1923.
8	We are based in New York City and as of early
9	2006 under new leadership with Derrick Cephas
10	as president and CEO of the bank. He hired
11	myself and a whole bunch of other new senior
12	team managers over the past two and a half
13	years to really help transform in a short
14	period of time to an urban community bank
15	going into low/moderate working class
16	neighborhoods both in New York City and
17	nationally without losing sight of our history
18	which is serving unions and union members,
19	most of whom are immigrants and working class
20	people.
21	We are still relatively small,
22	retail-wise, although we have an institutional
	COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 trust division and commercial banking, real 2 estate banking etc. So we are truly full service. But retail banking, have 13 3 we branches in New York City. 4 We are also in Lyndhurst, New Jersey, Pasadena, California, 5 6 one branch in Washington, D.C. I would be 7 curious to know how many of you all have seen it or been in there. And three supermarket 8 Vegas 60,000 9 branches in Las where the culinary workers reside and have asked us to 10 come in because they have a toehold or 11 а foothold, whatever you want to call it, into 12 13 the Vegas market. We had to buy three supermarket branches from Nevada State Bank 14 15 and our hope now is we will open a full 16 service bank there in a short time. We are in a growth mode and Derrick has ambitious plans 17 despite the severe recession to continue 18 19 opening branches both in New York City and other markets. A lot of our branch expansion 20 in New York City, we've been in partnership 21 Taylor and the New York State with Diana 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

Banking 1 Department, New York City 2 Comptroller's Office and York New State Comptroller's Office. Ι believe New York 3 State is still the only state that offers the 4 special banking development districts 5 and 6 other states are looking at them. We found it 7 to be a phenomenal incentive for us to locate low-income, underbanked, underserved 8 into So over the past two to two-and-a-half 9 areas. 10 years we've opened four branches, one in the South Bronx, one in Long Island City, Queens, 11 and another in Bed-Stuy, Brooklyn and another 12 13 in Sunset Park, Brooklyn. We do get low market rate deposits for both the city and 14 15 From my perspective, the advantages state. 16 have been the partnerships and the introductions that have been made through the 17 banking development district process 18 19 meeting with local government agencies, 20 meeting with local community-based organizations -to get their buy-in and 21 approval for this. And they in turn say, well 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

fine, but these are the things we are looking for as you are coming into our community. So the plan that we produce and submit to the regulators incorporates many of the ideas the community gives us.

Again, given the bank's roots, serving working class people, we've always offered totally free checking, low minimum balance, no charges --

10MR. BOSTON: Peter you may want to11hit your slide.

MR. MOSBACHER: I'm sorry?

13MR. BOSTON: You may want to hit14your slide?

15 MR. MOSBACHER: Yes, thanks. So again this is something that many 16 Sorry. banks are offering these days. I guess what 17 is more exciting is that we recently launched 18 19 a second chance account for either checking or savings accounts to help people who may have 20 had some minor issues in the check system get 21 back into the banking system. We do this in 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

6

7

8

9

12

1 strong partnership with а lot of our 2 community-based organizations. We find that they are best qualified to identify potential 3 clients for these second chance accounts. 4 So some of the highlights of the program are the 5 minimum of a cent to open checking and a 6 7 minimum of \$5.00 to open a savings, no minimum balance after the opening. However, only an 8 ATM card will be issued and there is 9 no 10 balance protection. We strongly prefer direct This then migrates people into a deposit. 11 full banking including financial 12 program 13 education and eligibility for a \$50 bonus to help them establish an open-end account. 14 15 MR. FISH: What is no bounce protection? 16 MR. MOSBACHER: We offer that with 17 other products but with this one we would not. 18 19 But if there is an overdraft that there would be no protection on that or a check bounce 20 rather. 21 MR. FISH: I still don't understand. 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

96 If you issue a check 1 MS. TAYLOR: 2 against your account and there is not enough money in it, it just bounces. They don't pay 3 4 it. MR. MOSBACHER: Right. We don't 5 cover, right. 6 MR. FISH: So no overdraft fee but 7 the check doesn't clear. 8 MS. TAYLOR: You do get charged 9 10 for a bounced check. But again, it is a MR. MOSBACHER: 11 stepping stone to get people back into the 12 13 system that normally wouldn't have the opportunity to get back into the system. 14 And 15 then it is a stepping stone for them to go 16 into a more traditional account. MR. FISH: I'm trying to understand 17 what is special about this account. 18 19 MR. MOSBACHER: The fact that it is offered to folks and they do in fact appear 20 on check systems and who most banks would not 21 checking and/or 22 allow to open savings а **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

	97
1	account.
2	MR. FISH: Okay, but it wouldn't be
3	that different from a checking account at a
4	bank if a person could open the account.
5	MR. MOSBACHER: If they could.
6	MR. FISH: I understand, okay. The
7	account itself isn't different. It is the
8	population.
9	MR. MOSBACHER: Yes, I mean the
10	account features are the same.
11	MR. FISH: I got
12	MR. MOSBACHER: I wouldn't brag
13	too much about the account features because
14	clearly no bounce protection is not something
15	I am proud of but we put it in there. The
16	minimum to open the account, the minimum
17	balance after opening etc. and again only
18	having an ATM card. But the main issue here
19	is really there are so few institutions that
20	are even giving check systems a look to really
21	peel back the layers and say what are the
22	issues here. If it is not outright fraud,
	NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

there is so many other things that put people in the check systems and disqualify them from opening any type of account. So I think that is a strong way to start to open up that door.

This is a fairly new -- the second 5 chance account is a fairly new thing for us 6 7 and we are rolling it out immediately in California where the State of California has 8 opened up the Bank of California to bring in 9 10 the unbanked and underbanked and they have descriptions product that they 11 some were requiring banks to participate in and I think 12 13 the second chance account did beautifully with their only signed 14 program, but we the 15 agreement on this about a month ago. So 16 unfortunately I have no hard data to give you as to how we are doing. I am optimistic we 17 are off to a good start. We are very proud of 18 19 our in-house financial education program, which we brand, Money Sense. 20 It was done in partnership with a very strong New York City 21 based non-profit called the Coalition for 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

There is a very 1 Debtor Education. strong 2 focus on behavioral finance, the psychology of money, in terms of how money affects behavior 3 4 and how behavior affects money, important for all of us regardless of income 5 issues level, but particularly for low- to moderate-6 7 income people. So it does put a different twist on financial education and we do this 8 in-branch. We do this at community centers, 9 10 churches, etc. We do put in, we offer upon completion of the classes a \$50 coupon that 11 can be redeemed to establish a new savings 12 13 account but it has to be redeemed after maintaining an account in good standing for at 14 15 least one year.

With our union members we offer Group Advantage Banking, discounts of products and services, including direct deposit and payroll and lunchtime, what we call Lunch and Learn, financial education seminars tends to be very well received both by employer and employee.

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 Very quickly, some of the 2 highlights of Group Advantage Banking. It is direct deposit, payroll, free checking, 3 no minimum balance, and savings and money market 4 accounts, online banking, bill pay. 5 We are part of the Allpoint Network so again no fee, 6 7 ATM banking and reduced rates on various loan as I mentioned earlier, products and, the 8 Lunch and Learn program. The partnership, the 9 10 very strong partnership we have with our union in New York City DC 37, most of whom or all of 11 them are municipal employees with New York 12 13 City residency requirements. The union, the bank, York City, [Department 14 New HPD of 15 Housing Preservation and Development] and NHS 16 [Neighborhood Housing Services] of New York City formed a partnership about five years ago 17 to assist these union members in saving for 18 19 affordable housing in New York City. It has 20 been a very, very strong program. It is a place-based program operating out of 21 union headquarters cooperation with leqal 22 in

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

services. It has put hundreds, if not thousands of working class city employees, into affordable housing in New York City. It does provide five percent of units in citysponsored lotteries for their homes and up to six percent through HPD.

7 And last but not least in Las Vegas, again we are relative newcomers to that 8 market but working with the unions, they want 9 10 to migrate more direct deposit of paychecks so we launched a payroll card product for them. 11 alternative to deposit 12 Ιt is an а while 13 meeting direct deposit requirements. And then we put in an ATM at the union's headquarters 14 15 for payroll card customers to pay a reduced 16 surcharge to withdraw the funds. And again this 17 serves as entry point for an transitioning the unbanked and underbanked 18 19 union members into mainstream banking activities. 20

21 And last but not least, real quick, 22 the last strong partnership we have is with

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

1 New York City Housing Authority and our 2 Banking Development District Branch in Long Island City which is surrounded by the largest 3 New York City Public Housing projects anywhere 4 in the city, probably anywhere in the country 5 for that matter, totally underbanked area. 6 7 Most of the housing project folks were victims of expensive check cashers, very little access 8 to traditional banking product services. 9 So 10 we did qo in and have formed а nice relationship with NYCHA [New York City Housing 11 Authority] and with a strong local non-profit 12 13 called ERDA, East River Development Alliance to offer financial education as well as 14 а 15 special program where NYCHA allows now unbanked residents to pay their rent at the 16 They can accept payments in cash for a 17 bank. small fee, process payments for 18 remote 19 capture, and transfer the payments to the So that is for like \$2.00 20 housing authority. a transaction as opposed to previously they 21 were going to check cashers and paying \$5.00, 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 \$6.00 or \$7.00 a transaction. At the same 2 time we can migrate them into starter accounts or the second chance account or we can offer 3 financial 4 them the Money Sense education 5 program. 6 MR. FISH: Peter on the second 7 chance account, how long have you had it and what's been your charge-off experience? 8 MR. MOSBACHER: The second chance 9 10 account is about three months old. MR. FISH: Okay. 11 So unfortunately MR. MOSBACHER: 12 13 no -will MR. Ιt 14 FISH: be very 15 interesting I think for the FDIC in time to 16 understand the charge off experience on that account versus a normal checking account. 17 MR. RYAN: I would be interested to 18 19 see what you are seeing in bounced checks versus other accounts that you have. 20 I kind of like that there is no overdraft here 21 because there are consequences to bouncing a 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

check but there aren't overdraft that may in itself be enforcing financial literacy.

MR. morning RAMIREZ: Good 3 to 4 Chairman Bair and to the members of the advisory committee, the other panelists 5 and audience. It is a pleasure and honor to be 6 7 here and to be selected among the various local AEI working groups to be able to share 8 some of the leadership role that the city and 9 10 United Way has played in making a difference in the community. I'm so happy to be here 11 although my luggage did not arrive. 12 So please 13 excuse me for my attire. It is great to be here. 14

A couple of years ago I heard a 15 spin national panel and 16 а on we were discussing ideas on helping working families 17 to save part of their tax refund. And to use 18 19 it as seed money for developing long-term relationships at financial institutions. 20 And there were two issues that we wanted to really 21 address. One was really how to increase the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

national household savings rate and also how to bank the unbanked and how to become a part of the financial mainstream.

walked 4 So Ι away from the conference with four main questions in mind. 5 What kind of new model and approach do we need 6 7 to promote financial inclusion for a]] Second, what policy options are Americans? 8 worth pursuing in partnership with regulators 9 10 and others at the federal level? Third, what community organizations do to effect 11 can And fourth, what is the role of the change? 12 13 private sector or financial institutions in providing products and services that address 14 15 consumer needs? And because each of us 16 independently by ourselves cannot really make the kind impact 17 of that we can collaboratively, it is obvious there needs to 18 19 be a value in order to be a value and effect, there needs to be a private, public and non-20 profit collaboration. So the work of a local 21 AEI building committee 22 asset is а prime

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

1 example of such а type of collaboration 2 city, United Way of Greater between Los Angeles, regulators and a lot of non-profits. 3 It helped us to identify the community need 4 to help develop a model and to implement 5 innovative savings programs such as the Ramp-6 7 Up program which is now -- I am going to share with you in a moment. 8

So I think on a daily basis we need 9 10 to ask ourselves what can financial institutions do to make a community impact. 11 There are a lot of questions we ask ourselves 12 13 on a daily basis. What is our role in community impact? There are many things that 14 15 we could do to effect change in the community, 16 I want to focus on two main areas where banks can make a difference. One of them is 17 in helping develop products and services and by 18 19 providing resources to support community organizations that really help effect that 20 change. The city has invested resources in 21 developing products such as the CitiEscrow 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 product that is highlighted there. Ιt is 2 really the platform that we use online to help lot of non-profits support а around 3 our 4 individual development accounts. We have thousands of accounts right now nationwide. 5 We also have developed an innovative access 6 7 account that has been recognized by regulators because at a low cost, very flexible checkless 8 account for entry level individuals into the 9 10 banking system. We also invested resources to financial develop city education 11 our own 12 program partly inspired by the FDIC's own 13 Money Smart program. So, we have a great resource. It has a manual about this big. 14 We call it the bible for financial education, CD-15 ROMs and a lot of online resources. And also 16 highlighting the collaborative 17 we will be relationship with United Way of Los Angeles to 18 19 develop the actual Ramp-Up account program.

20 Other resources that Citi has been 21 able to provide is financial resources, human 22 resources as well as intermediary resources

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	for capacity building: financial resources in
2	terms of grants and contributions to support
3	the capacity and non-profits; human resources
4	volunteerism, conducting financial
5	education, even doing tax preparation services
6	at the volunteer income tax assistance
7	programs so training, technical assistance,
8	board service; and then, through the
9	intermediaries, we provide some funding for
10	training for non-profits in the communities.
11	Now I like using this slide because
12	it shows a simple model of asset building. I
13	like to call it the cycle of asset building to
14	combat the cycle of poverty. And it basically
14 15	combat the cycle of poverty. And it basically shows the importance of building a continuum
15	shows the importance of building a continuum
15 16	shows the importance of building a continuum of services in the community that creates
15 16 17	shows the importance of building a continuum of services in the community that creates linkages between various asset building
15 16 17 18	shows the importance of building a continuum of services in the community that creates linkages between various asset building programs by leveraging various resources. So
15 16 17 18 19	shows the importance of building a continuum of services in the community that creates linkages between various asset building programs by leveraging various resources. So if we invested resources to help individuals

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

they are going to be able to save more money and build additional assets. So that is that in a nutshell.

So our goal in Los Angeles, to make 4 sure that working individuals leverage as many 5 community resources as possible so that they 6 7 have it available to them. For an example, if an individual comes in and learns about the 8 Earned Income Tax Credit, for example, 9 the 10 marketing campaign, a grassroots effort, they would be able to be referred to a provider 11 site and get their taxes prepared for free. 12 13 At the provider site they would be able to get bank account to directly deposit 14 а their refund so they don't have to use a 15 rapid refund and then, hopefully, be referred over 16 to an IDA program for financial education. 17 So we want to make sure that no matter where an 18 19 individual goes into this continuum of services, they will be able to benefit from 20 the various different services that 21 we are talking about. 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

1 An example of this time of 2 collaboration of connecting the different pieces, connecting the various dots is our 3 work with United Way of Greater Los Angeles. 4 Since 2007, we have been working with United 5 Way on various programs and projects and these 6 7 include funding the Unbanked Problem in Los Angeles report that helped us develop some 8 strategies specific to Los Angeles on how to 9 10 overcome some of the banking to the unbanked barriers to Los Angeles, and we've been able 11 to use this as part of our Bank on LA campaign 12 13 that we are working with the mayor's office as well other efforts. also 14 as We helped 15 establish and fund the Asset Building 16 Collaborative. We call it the ABC and partnership with the Federal Reserve and it is 17 a convening, a convening of practitioners, 18 19 lenders and researchers on asset building specifically 20 topics to Los Angeles that address our unique needs. We also funded the 21 online development building 22 of an asset

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 directory. This is a user-friendly online 2 database where individuals can type in their address and also their main area of focus, for 3 4 example, first time homeownership and they would be listing, getting a list of all the 5 various providers in the area. The various 6 7 topics include financial education, small business development, foreclosure prevention 8 and free tax preparation services. 9 Also, 10 United Way of Los Angeles has recently housed the Los Angeles Earned Income Tax Credit 11 and Citi has had 12 campaign partnership the 13 pleasure of chairing that partnership for the last four years. 14

15 And then we will be getting into 16 the Ramp-Up accounts that we have partnered with United Way and network of their agencies. 17 And we are working in 2009 in the future. 18 We 19 are working with the City of Los Angeles, Federal Reserve, FDIC and a collaborative of 20 other partners for launching the Bank on LA 21 That was modeled after the Bank on campaign. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

Central campaign and many others, Bank of New
 York, etc.

We are also developing something we 3 asset building specialist 4 are calling the certification program. This is a training for 5 individuals in the community from non-profits 6 7 on how to leverage and how to identify various programs that individuals can qualify for. So 8 it is a 15-week program individuals will go 9 10 through and they will be able to refer people when they come into their agency. And so this 11 would be a long term relationship that we are 12 13 working with the various organizations and the City of Los Angeles. 14

And then finally one of our goals, long term goals is to be able to replicate the rapid account and various markets served by Citi and United Way.

19 just wanted to give you a brief Ι 20 history of how the Ramp-Up account was developed. Citi has also supported other 21 United Way programs such as the Saving for the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

15

16

17

18

1 American Dream program. Ιt is their 2 individual development account. Ιt was launched in 2001 and it is one of the nation's 3 4 largest IDA programs with about 1,700 It is the only IDA collaborative in 5 accounts. Los Angeles and it currently has 18 county-6 7 wide partners. They are all focused on homeownership, micro enterprise and post-8 secondary education. Their role at United Way 9 10 is to provide program and financial support to other local non-profits to make sure that they 11 compliance monitoring of the federal 12 have 13 grant so they collect all the data and report to the federal government. 14 it over They provide quality assurance training to the non-15 16 profits and capacity building for the organizations. And this project has been used 17 as a national model by other United Ways and 18 19 to build other local IDA programs. Some of the outcomes that come out 20

20 Some of the outcomes that come out 21 of this collaborative. This is data from the 22 middle of 2008. There have been 85 homeowners

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

in Los Angeles County, 376 businesses have started or expanded, and 20 educational investments have been made. And an important note, that 28 percent of all accounts that have been opened have resulted in actual asset purchases. So it is a very good number.

7 In our discussions with United Way, we wanted to address some of the challenges 8 with general savings programs and IDA. 9 For 10 general savings programs, we realize that we needed to come up with an effective savings 11 program for opening new accounts. 12 Some of the 13 things that we did before, a couple of years ago, we were giving bonuses for new accounts 14 15 that were opened through Citi of \$25. What we 16 found out is individuals would use the account for directly deposit receiving their account, 17 they would take their refund and the \$25 and 18 19 never use the account again. So this frontloading of the incentive wasn't working. 20 We were trying to figure out more of a back-end 21 incentive and this is what actually led to the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

Ramp-Up account. We saw as a result of these 1 efforts, they created a lot of unfunded or 2 inactive savings accounts and there were also 3 4 very inconsistent savings patterns. We wanted to see how we could create long term savings 5 relationships with financial institutions. 6 7 When we looked at the IDA accounts we saw that this is the model that United Way was using --8 was a high cost model. 9 It was high cost 10 because the cost of management of each account was pretty expensive when you looked at per 11 There was also high touch, requiring 12 account. 13 a lot of case management -- individuals doing follow-ups, doing a lot of case 14 а lot of 15 It also had а low tech management. IDA 16 structure. There was no online management system for looking at all of the accounts and 17 trying to see who is saving at what rate. 18 We 19 were also concerned about something we called discouragement factor. 20 the This was for individuals who completed the entire 21 IDA They did the financial education. program. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 They did the savings for two years to three 2 At the end of the day unfortunately years. they were not able to actually purchase their 3 4 assets for various reasons, either lack of credit, lack of capital, or in the case of Los 5 Angeles a couple of years ago, lack of 6 7 affordable housing. The housing costs had gone too high. We were also concerned about 8 unused federal and non-federal 9 any match 10 dollars that were raised that were being All of this money was being left on 11 unused. the table so we had to come up with a solution 12 13 of what to do with this unused money. We didn't want to lose all this community equity 14 15 then give it back the federal and to 16 government as unused match dollars so we had to come up with another alternative. And then 17 finally some of the guidelines that 18 were 19 surrounding the IDA program were too We wanted to be more flexible 20 restrictive. with the income guidelines, asset test etc. 21 So we were very interested in looking at a new 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

116

(202) 234-4433

1 model that addressed a lot of these 2 challenges.

And that leads us to our Ramp-Up 3 4 account. The bank partnership with United Way and the leadership of Ed at the United Way we 5 were able to come up and identify a product 6 7 that is a low cost, flexible, no strings attached savings program that provides an 8 accelerated interest rate. It is a highly 9 10 subsidized interest rate of up to 21 percent APR. And this provides an incentive for 11 consistent long term savings. The savings 12 13 sector was about 15 months. It could be extendable for beyond that depending if the 14 15 individual wants to save a little bit more. 16 There was no minimum balance requirement, nor minimum monthly deposit requirement and the 17 rate of interest ranges from 15 percent to 21 18 19 percent based on the initial deposits and also the monthly deposits that they are making. 20 Α very important point is that the subsidy, the 21 interest subsidy, is tax-free because the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 funding is actually paid by United Way. They 2 use their own fund-raising efforts to raise for the subsidy and so it is the money 3 4 considered а grant or а match to the participant, so it is tax-free. 5 So really that 21 percent could be compared to a 30 or 6 7 35 percent when you look at the tax-free Individuals can withdraw the full features. 8 for whatever 9 savings at any time reason 10 without any penalties. Purchases do not have to be limited to asset specific purchases such 11 homeownership, business expenses 12 as or 13 education. It is very, very flexible. They can be transferred to other savings investment 14 products such as under the IDA account or an 15 IRA or a CD. Financial education is highly 16 encouraged, but it is not a requirement for 17 them to receive the subsidy as opposed to the 18 19 IDA program where you need to do ten hours of financial education in order to qualify for 20 this subsidy. Currently we are using the 21 CitiEscrow account platform which is an online 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

bank account opening product as the main
 platform for opening accounts.

I wanted to share this basic grid. 3 It shows the savings and interest rate and 4 model for the actual different abilities for 5 people who save. Since we are trying 6 to 7 promote this currently during tax season, we are encouraging individuals to make an initial 8 \$500 deposit from their tax refund into this 9 10 account. Then they make a commitment to save over a period of the next 14 months, \$40 a 11 They will then receive an APY of 19.35 12 month. 13 percent and at the end of their savings goal, they would have accumulated savings 14 and 15 interest of \$1,312. And you see right below 16 that, a different model if somebody decides to have a larger initial deposit of \$700. 17 The interest rate is a little lower, 15.1 percent 18 19 but at the end they end up saving \$1,659. 20 MR. FISH: So could I open this account? 21 No, everybody asks 22 MR. RAMIREZ: **NEAL R. GROSS**

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

that. I wish I would be able too. You have 1 2 to LMI so we are looking at 60 percent of area meeting income for Los Angeles. 3 So they qualify for the Earned Income Tax Credit they 4 automatically qualify for this. 5 6 MR. FISH: I wasn't being cute about 7 that. I'm trying to understand how you overcome a lot of legal issues that that 8 9 presents. 10 MR. RAMIREZ: Legal issues in terms of --11 MR. FISH: Discrimination. 12 MR. RAMIREZ: For income levels? 13 MR. FISH: Yes. 14 15 MR. RAMIREZ: Well since it is a grant program --16 MR. FISH: You feel legally that you 17 are on good ground that say a person earning 18 19 \$62,000 a year walks into this branch and wants to open that account that you can say 20 21 no. RAMIREZ: I think because of 22 MR. **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 the purpose of the programs to help build assets for --2 FISH: I am asking a legal 3 MR. question. 4 MR. RAMIREZ: We haven't had the 5 opportunity to think about that. That is 6 something we can definitely come back and 7 consider, in terms of discrimination, right? 8 You have faced no MR. HENDERSON: 9 10 challenges so far. And it has been a MR. RAMIREZ: 11 small pilot program. The funds 12 very are provided by United Way, raised by money for 13 helping --14 15 MS. FUCHS: It is the United Way 16 piece that covers you. Right, we are not 17 MR. RAMIREZ: paying the subsidy. 18 19 MR. FISH: Why is that? MS. FUCHS: 20 Because they are a charitable not-for-profit and they can create 21 any kind of standards they want in giving out 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

122 their money. 1 2 MR. RAMIREZ: It is part of their mission. 3 MR. FISH: Oh, I see. 4 MR. RAMIREZ: Yes. 5 MR. FISH: Okay, thank you. 6 7 MR. RAMIREZ: But a good question. The interest rate is 8 MR. RYAN: scalable downward based on the numbers so the 9 10 19.5 and 15.1 on the larger amount. It is scalable MR. RAMIREZ: 11 there is only 12 because maximum savings а 13 incentive that we can provide per account. It is about \$250, so the higher the initial 14 15 deposit, the lower the interest rate, so we 16 don't overpay anybody. The next couple of 17 MR. RAMIREZ: slides are going to show you a side-by-side of 18 19 the Ramp-Up accounts with the IDAs. MS. Since I think 20 TAYLOR: everybody has this so we can sort of look at 21 the comparisons ourselves. 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

	123
1	MR. RAMIREZ: Okay.
2	MS. TAYLOR: If they have
3	questions about it, they can ask. So if you
4	could wrap up that would be great.
5	MR. RAMIREZ: Okay.
6	MS. TAYLOR: Okay, thank you.
7	MR. RAMIREZ: The only thing I
8	wanted to say about this is that Ramp-Up
9	accounts are by no means supposed to replace
10	IDAs. They are suppose to compliment them and
11	maybe as an alternative for those who cannot
12	use IDAs or aren't ready for an IDA.
13	The Ramp-Up account structure is a
14	very flexible and customizable design to fit
15	the needs of the community. We've tried
16	various programs where we co-enrolled somebody
17	with an IDA account so they had a Ramp-Up
18	account and at the same time an IDA account.
19	We call that a hybrid Ramp-Up account.
20	Individuals who aren't able to qualify for the
21	IDA asset match, they can still qualify for
22	the incentive. And you are very flexible

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

depending your eligibility criteria based on 1 local area income, purchase requirements etc. 2 There is a lot of flexibility in this program. 3 And the main highlight I wanted to focus on is 4 some of the outcomes from this program. 5 The pilot program was launched in 2007 in June and 6 it was in effect for about 12 months. 7 Our goal was to actually open up 40 accounts. 8 We over-enrolled with 42 just to make sure that 9 10 we could make up for the possible attrition According to the accounts that were 11 rate. 12 opened in the first two months, participants 13 were co-enrolled in the IDA program. Within the first 90 days of the program, there were 14 over \$12,000 in deposits, average of \$300 in 15 an account. After the first 180 days there 16 were \$23,970 in cumulative deposits. 17 Some of the numbers that we looked at was that 80 18 19 percent of the individuals made regular monthly deposits and there were actually 28 20 percent more savings in the Ramp-Up account as 21 compared to an IDA saver, an IDA account using 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

the same population and during the same time period. So we had a control group to try to compare that. With that comparison with the control group, we also saw that only nine percent attrition rates for the Ramp-Up accounts versus 26 percent attrition rate for IDA savers.

And then for the second page of the 8 program in the last year tax season, we opened 9 10 up 29 accounts at the VITA sites, average \$500 tax refund used to seed the accounts. We did 11 not offer the co-enroll into the IDA program 12 13 but many were interested. The reasons we wanted to see if the IDAs had any effect on 14 15 people enrolling in Ramp-Ups. We wanted to 16 offer it as a separate account to look at And then in the first 90 days over 17 that. \$10,470 were made in total deposits and as of 18 just a few weeks ago total cumulative deposit 19 was about \$29,610. And so far there have been 20 two homeownership purchases that have been 21 made using this savings account. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

then finally for our 1 And third 2 phase of expansion, which is what we are doing currently right now with this VITA season. 3 We expanded into four new sites for VITA and one 4 five total of 5 existing site, а so new 6 locations. So we made it throughout the whole 7 county of Los Angeles. In trying to look at various neighborhoods of Boyle Heights, East 8 Pacoima, Koreatown, Pasadena 9 LA, very culturally diverse communities -- so we are 10 trying to see if there is -- trying to measure 11 any variations in outcomes in the communities 12 13 that are served. We have a goal of 175 accounts that should be opened by June 2009. 14 15 Again, encouraging the use of \$500 opening 16 deposit using the tax refund and we'd like to replicate this as the next step throughout the 17 whole state and hopefully have the federal 18 19 government consider this а national as demonstration project in the future. 20 Thank 21 you.

MS. TAYLOR: Thank you.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

www.nealrgross.com

1 MS. TOWN: Hi, thanks for having us. 2 I'd like to give you a little bit of background on Monroe Bank and Trust. We are a 3 one and half billion dollar community bank. 4 We were founded in 1858 in the back of a 5 drive-in store when James Buchanan 6 was 7 president. So we very proudly celebrated our 150th anniversary last year. We have been 8 trading on NASDAQ since 2003 9 and currently 10 operate 25 branch locations. In October of this year, we acquired 86 million dollars in 11 audits from Main Street Bank in Northville, 12 13 Michigan. We just completed a conversion of those customers to MBT. And we operate under 14 15 a slogan that we like to use, MBT banking. We 16 diligently work to try to provide products and services to folks in our area that meet the 17 needs of our market collaboratively. 18 We are 19 headquartered in Monroe, Michigan, which is Toledo, Ohio 20 about halfway between and Detroit. Our branches are in suburban and 21 agricultural areas. Sadly, you probably know 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

Detroit automotive 1 is the heart of the 2 industry and our state has been in a recession for over five years. We have a 10.6 percent 3 4 unemployment rate statewide -- I know that number is low and will be readjusted when the 5 New York bureau's numbers come out -- 9.6 6 7 percent in Monroe and that's compared to a national unemployment rate of 7.2. I think 8 our high school 9 the worst in some ways, 10 dropout rate in Monroe is reportedly over 20 percent. We have a 53 percent market share in 11 12 Monroe County, less than a percent in Wayne 13 And in terms of our CRA assessment County. 14 areas in Monroe, we serve one low, one moderate, two minority, and in Wayne County 15 two low and two moderate. 16

developed second 17 We а chance checking product. We recognize the need to 18 19 help people in our communities re-establish good financial banking practices if we could 20 or to help them improve their banking history. 21 And we also wanted to maintain consistency in 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

our branch, our front line personnel at the time of account opening, especially for those people with financial challenges.

So we were -- actually introduced 4 second chance checking 5 the concept of the product at a trade show. We decided to 6 7 research it via our product and pricing team internally. We did design and watch a pilot 8 February of 2008. It's design is a stepping 9 10 stone product. The end goal is to graduate after 12 months the customer of solid 11 financial management into a more traditional 12 13 product such as free personal checking. This product seems like its features are pretty 14 15 similar to those in Peter's. No minimum 16 balance, \$50 minimum to -- or I'm sorry, no minimum balance required, \$50 minimum to open. 17 There is a \$10 monthly service fee. There is 18 19 an ATM debit charge but no deposit capability on the card and available withdrawal limit of 20 \$300. We've had with the 21 some success We had 49 accounts opened. 22 account. We are

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

www.nealrgross.com

maintaining a 70 percent retention rate on those accounts and the average balance account is \$194.57.

In April of this coming year, we 4 plan -- or this year -- we plan to try to 5 reach another segment with our launch of a 6 7 young adult checking product. Again, the goal would be to graduate the young adult customer 8 into a more traditional product at their 25th 9 10 birthday. Again, \$50 minimum balance, \$20 worth of free ATM fees each month, ATM debit 11 card with deposit capability and a \$100 debit 12 13 reward points in a rewards program that we have internally at account opening. 14

15 think, however, that We the 16 critical elements for reaching us our customers are our financial outreach efforts 17 coupled with our products. We have 18 19 historically operated a number of programs including our Partnership in Education bank at 20 school program that operates in 37 elementary 21 schools in our markets. Our branch personnel 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

1 literally come in and assist children and 2 parents and open student savings accounts and the students actually serve as the branch 3 4 managers, customer service reps, security 5 personnel etc. And currently we have 7,286 accounts on our books, average balance of \$551 6 for a total of a little over 4 million dollars 7 in student accounts. We also offer \$15,000 8 college scholarships annually for graduating 9 10 seniors. Those seniors are selected by school However, the scholarship winner's personnel. 11 household income cannot exceed 80 percent of 12 13 the assessment area median family income, in this case \$52,960. Our branch managers as 14 many of the banks seem to do also conduct bank 15 at work programs in area businesses for 16 example. We do conduct one regularly at the 17 Global Engineering Manufacturing Alliance 18 19 plant in Dundee where our managers go onsite to assist with account opening and financial 20 We are also absolutely happy to 21 advice. assist other of our clients, customers, such 22

NEAL R. GROSS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 as IDA schools as an example, with opening 2 things like health savings accounts for their employees when they offer high deductible 3 4 health programs. Internally we are launching a program which we are calling MBTID, which 5 stands for Inclusion and Diversity. We think 6 7 that we could stand to become more diverse as an organization and we think that we need to 8 better understand the needs of our communities 9 as they change. We also utilize bank-wide a 10 relationship/sales process both 11 to our internal and our external customers we refer 12 13 to as CARE, which standards for communicate, ask questions, refer when appropriate, and 14 enjoy the results. 15

We are most proud of our ENLIST 16 25^{th} now celebrating its 17 volunteer program The acronym stands for Employees Now 18 year. 19 Linked In Service Together. It started with a reward for top employees for volunteering 20 their time and energy to serve non-profits and 21 organizations with their manpower needs. Over 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

and above our annual contributions of about 1 2 \$250,000 corporate sponsorships, in our employees donate over 9,000 hours each year, 3 4 serving over 100 groups. We have over 85 percent employee participation and just last 5 month ENLIST presented a check to a local non-6 7 profit organization for over \$10,000 in additional funds that 8 the qroup raised throughout has 9 the year. ENLIST been 10 recognized by the Michigan Bankers Association, Shining Star Award, 11 а as а finalist and the American Banker's Association 12 13 Community Service Award category and we just recently received the Presidential Volunteer 14 15 Service Award from the President's Council on 16 Service and Civic Participation.

excited about 17 Т am very this particular initiative. This month we are 18 19 launching MBTTeach or I'm sorry MBTeach, which extension of ENLIST 20 is an our volunteer We have launched this or designed 21 program. this to be a little more formal and strategic 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 in our approach to financial literacy 2 programming in our communities. We are using the FDIC Money Smart curriculum. 3 We are 4 training and certifying our MBTeachers fact, there 5 internally. In is public а speaking class going on as we speak. And we 6 7 have been scheduling courses with non-profits, community organizations, etc. as requested and 8 at completion of those courses we hope to open 9 10 accounts for those individuals who attend and then to provide ongoing financial assistance. 11 We project that we will reach over 12 1,000 students in 2009. 13 The final initiative that I would 14 15 like to point out is The Learning Bank, which 16 is tremendous collaborative opportunity. In April of 2008, we closed the branch that did 17 operate historically unprofitably in a low-18 19 income area. And we transferred the deposits to our main branch that was less than three-20 quarters of a mile away. We didn't want to 21

22

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

abandon or lease the building.

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

So we looked

1 for alternatives and our president/CEO, Doug 2 Chaffin had a vision for this. He was aware of a collaborative effort between Huntington 3 Bank and Grand Rapids Community College called 4 The Learning Corner at Wealthy. So we thought 5 we could do something similar and bring in the 6 7 partners in our community to create a similar So we conducted about six months of model. 8 community meetings with faith-based community 9 10 organizations, government, the community college, intermediate school district, local 11 non-profits and we also looked at all of the 12 13 community research and data that was available and reached an overwhelming consensus that all 14 15 parties agreed to form a collaborative to support an educational outreach center in this 16 facility, which will start providing GED prep 17 and testing, particularly for the over 24 age 18 19 group who are a little more difficult to find COMPASS testing to assist people with 20 for; transition into college 21 or job training; provide programs offered 22 access to by

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 organizations such as the United Way, the 2 Salvation Army, the Monroe County Opportunity Program; and of course we will be offering our 3 financial literacy courses via MBTeach. 4 And the State of Michigan Department of Labor and 5 Economic Growth is meeting this afternoon and 6 7 hopefully they will approve a \$300,000 grant to fund this project. 8

So I think this is in your packet. 9 10 We were very pleased. It was getting very, positive support in the 11 very community. Obviously we like positive PR as well as the 12 13 next quy, but it was a very, very valid effort. 14

So in conclusion we think that we need multiple approaches in the communities that we serve and we think that we need to concentrate on literacy and support literacy with products.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you. Since we 21 are so far behind right now, what I would like 22 to do is limit people's questions to specific

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

2 program and take a quick break and come back.
3 I want to make sure that we have enough time
4 for discussion. So thank you very much.
5 Anybody have specific questions? Martin?

MR. EAKES: Mine is not a question. 6 7 I just wish everybody in America could hear your story. You know they think of banks as 8 being the bad guys and really what you have 9 10 described is just so incredible and I know particularly for Mr. Maloney, I have worked 11 with a lot of immigrant communities all over 12 13 the county and you probably wouldn't even know how inspiring your bank has been to those 14 communities for all the leadership you have 15 done on ITIN over the years. I just want to 16 say thank you publicly and to Victor. 17 I've done a lot of work recently with Eric Eave and 18 19 Kevin Thurn and others at Citi who have really taken beyond the call of duty trying to figure 20 out how to modify mortgage loans and I just 21 want to thank you. It is amazing what you are 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

1 doing.

2	MS. TAYLOR: Having been on the
3	other side of some of the remarks that is high
4	praise. Anybody else before we take a quick
5	break. All right. Why don't we take a ten
6	come back at like 20 after. That would be
7	great and then we can get going again.
8	(Whereupon, the above-entitled
9	matter went off the record at 11:12 a.m., and
10	resumed at 11:26 a.m.)
11	MS. TAYLOR: For the new panel, if
12	people could keep their formal remarks to a
13	minimum because I really would like to have a
14	discussion after this. Bob the floor is
15	yours.
16	MR. MOONEY: We have here
17	representatives of very successful Alliance
18	for Economic Inclusion coalitions from around
19	the country. As you pointed out, our
20	alliances, we now have more than 1,000
21	organizations that are members in eleven
22	cities. They have been able to open banking

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

relationships for almost 1,000 individuals.

2 I think this morning it would be important for us to look at the strategies 3 develop 4 they used to those banking relationships. We believe that the more 5 6 flowers in the garden that bloom the better. 7 And we have here today a bouquet of success.

So, let me introduce our panel, 8 starting with Mr. Jim Young. He is president 9 10 and CEO of Citizens Bank and Trust. He is a very active, productive member of our AEI in 11 the Black Belt area. Next to him is Charles 12 Charles is the CRA officer at M&T 13 Martin. Bank in Baltimore and a very active member of 14 15 our AEI Black Belt area.

16 Charles is going to address how the coalition of banks AET in Baltimore 17 are jointly a developing small dollar loan 18 19 program. So it is a different take on the individual program. 20

21 Bruce Gotschall is the executive 22 director of NHS of Chicago and he's not --

(202) 234-4433

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

1 there he is. Bruce is going to discuss 2 foreclosure efforts as well as a remarkable loan pool that is funded by local banks to 3 address that issue and how they are addressing 4 vacant housing. Now the reason he is going to 5 talk about that relative to the Alliance for 6 7 Economic Inclusion is that most of our alliances across the country are participating 8 in foreclosure prevention efforts within their 9 community very actively. 10 And for Bruce's program, the FDIC is providing information as 11 to how that qualifies for CRA credit and the 12 13 importance of foreclosure prevention relative to the bank's entire program. 14

Mary Dupont is with us. 15 We are 16 delighted to have Mary. Mary has long been a leader of community development for the State 17 of Delaware and she will overview their EITC 18 19 campaign. Remarkably, she has unrolled that across 22 locations in the State of Delaware 20 and as an innovative strategy here because it 21 includes the provision of cash cards 22 to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 participants and for the refunds.

2	And finally, last but not least is
3	Dora Brown, who is Senior Vice President of
4	the International Bank of Commerce. Dora is
5	going to discuss a very successful Texas
6	has a robust Alliance for Economic Inclusion -
7	- a very successful bank school partnership to
8	reach not only consumers but underserved
9	families as well.
10	I think we will allow for about
11	five minutes each and that will give us time
12	for questions and so I think Dora, let's
13	start.
14	MS. BROWN: I really want to get to
15	this program. First, thank you for allowing
16	me to be here because I could be at home with
17	73 degree weather and not a -2 but it is a
18	pleasure to be here. I'll get right to it. We
19	will be talking about a school and how we take
20	part in the schools. One of the ways is for
21	over 12 years now we have been involved in the
22	schools. There is this Sam Houston

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Elementary, and you will see the kids at a PTA 2 meeting and talked to the parents about PTA and then our employees become the babysitters 3 so that the people can attend the PTA meetings 4 and we talk to them about being able to obtain 5 credit and loans and checking accounts and 6 7 savings. This school is very unique because we have the mayor and the IBC bank president, 8 the young lady is a more -- look at the smile 9 10 on her face. She is the president of the bank. And she and along with the mayor of the 11 and commissioners 12 city who have the mayor 13 welcome you to the school when you come in when we have programs. Here at this time I 14 15 was having, I held a conference for several 16 banks to come in. I invited several banks to come in so they could start the same program 17 because I can't do it all. And here you see 18 19 the tellers, they actually have bank а president, the tellers all the way down to the 20 security guards. And the supervisors on the 21 other side are telling you what a debit and a 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 credit is, how to be a teller and the ins and 2 outs of being a teller. Here you actually see the kids at work. These are the tellers. 3 The 4 math teachers love this program because it teaches the kids how to not only read and 5 write, but they can do the math as far as 6 7 adding, subtracting and they have to do it quick because as you can see on the other side 8 they got customers waiting. So they got to do 9 10 it real quick. So the kids do their own They add their deposits 11 ledgers. and 12 everything goes on. As you can see again you 13 see the kids in line and at the back you will see the customers that we have invited or the 14 15 parents in the community, we have invited to 16 come in. And the other side they are about to So, this is something that goes on 17 close. every day and it is very exciting for the 18 19 kids. The attendance has increased The teachers say the kids want 20 tremendously. to school because they have 21 to come an obligation. They have a responsibility. 22 So

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

they have to go to work, yes they have to go to work so they don't want to miss school even if they are real sick.

They also have other areas. 4 Not only a bank, they have a Target, a Wal-Mart, a 5 H-E-B grocery store also. They have IRS and 6 7 the newspaper. And here is the kids, these are the IRS kids. And it is really cute 8 everything that they do. But these are very 9 10 serious people. Here I am talking to the parents at the PTA meeting and telling them 11 about the program that we are all very excited 12 about and how we are teaching the kids to 13 14 save.

15 And then the other businesses that 16 I just talked about. They have the mail as you see up there. This young lady at 17 the bottom, she's one of the Target managers and 18 19 she was so excited to be accepted there. We also have Channel 5, which is the TV station 20 over and the radio station and the kids make 21 all the announcements every day through the 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 radio station.

2	This is really a very exciting
3	school. They have a slogan that says "you
4	earn it, we save it." They came with their
5	own slogan for that. This is not a little
6	play school. This is actually a school where
7	the kids learn how to become bankers. And not
8	only do they just teach the kids there, they
9	go back and they teach their parents. They
10	are very successful at this. This is a very
11	low-income area where 90 percent of the kids,
12	or the families rather, are very low-income
13	and don't speak any English. The kids then
14	teach the parents how to speak English.
15	But we go into the schools, talk to
16	the PTAs and we counsel them. We become
17	counselors to those people and teach them on
18	how to be able to keep a savings account. I
19	could go on and on about this but since you
20	only gave me five minutes. The parents
21	eventually open up accounts and I don't have
22	all the numbers but I will tell you that we go

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 in as I say, we don't just tell them open a 2 free checking account. We actually counsel the parents and tell them what they can and 3 4 cannot do to be able to save money and to not have any fees and all of that in there because 5 we don't want to get them in any more trouble 6 7 than they probably already have. But we have found the parents who open checking accounts 8 said that they actually were able to 9 save just cashing a check and 10 money instead of having it at home and have \$5 for this and \$5 11 12 for that and have accountability of no So in that sense, we have had a 13 anything. really good success. 14

The kids there just love it, like I 15 said. I wish we had been able to show you a 16 video that they have because the kids tell you 17 their own job descriptions of what they are. 18 19 This time we were not allowed to do that because of Texas problems. But I am very much 20 involved in all the schools. We went to all 21 the high schools. I have the ability to talk 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 to the superintendents. I have a really good 2 rapport with all the superintendents. So we go to the high schools and teach the high 3 school students especially about credit cards, 4 how not to get in trouble with credit cards. 5 I always make the example that my daughter got 6 7 a \$10,000 pre-approved credit car when she was in high school and we got a \$1,000. We talked 8 to the kids about try not to get involved with 9 10 this. Tear those things up right away because you will get in trouble. You go get your 11 degrees and all that, then you want a job. Ιf 12 13 you have bad credit, you won't be able to get job, especially not in financial 14 а а institution. So we try very hard and talk to 15 them on a one-to-one basis on it. 16 So, there is a lot of things, IBC 17

is involved. We have throughout corporation, we are involved in a lot of the going into the schools and doing presentations in different areas to talk to the people in the underbanked areas and underserved areas on the things that

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 we could do for them. We have gotten a lot of awards, a lot of free press and everything 2 where IBC is actually going out there, rolling 3 their sleeves up and helping the people. 4 Before you all leave I would like 5 for you to take, this is different brochures 6 7 that we have. This is from the school, how they work and other things. Their life skills, 8 how they earn their money and this would kind 9 10 of show you also. If anybody has any questions on how 11 to get started and would like to get going on 12 13 this program, I would love for you to give me I put my number I think everywhere 14 a call. and we would love to get -- my goal was to 15 have all this program in the McAllen schools 16 because our corporate FIO has requested that 17 he would like this program, he is so much into 18 19 and gives us a lot of support that he would really like this to be in all our markets and 20 we are in over 102 markets. So we've already 21 got started on this so now we are not only 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 going to be in McAllen, Texas, which is a 2 great city to be in, but we are going to be in Austin, McAllen, rather Houston, Oklahoma. 3 So, we are in San Antonio and different areas. 4 really passionate 5 about this So we are But also we I guess you saw that. 6 program. 7 give a lot of free guotes and as people have said, we've got this right here. This is from 8 the -- it came in the magazine and I just 9 condensed it from one of the programs that I 10 did and actually a story that Texas bankers 11 did also the American 12 and Bankers on us 13 Association did another story. It has been all over the newspapers in different areas. 14 Ι 15 have the brochures on how to get started and 16 then the bank on what our duties are. Thank you very much. 17 Dora, thank you and MR. MOONEY: 18

IBC and Dora have been very active in the Texas AEI, so we thank you very much and we are going to share your information with other alliances around the country because we want

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	to move into high schools. Mary?
2	MS. DUPONT: Okay, well good morning
3	everybody. It is a pleasure to be here. I'm
4	another person who is very excited about the
5	work that we are doing in Delaware. By the way
6	I'm not related just in case you thought it
7	was quite a coincidence.
8	(Laughter.)
9	MS. DUPONT: I passed these red
10	folders here. You can read the background
11	information me my Gateway Community
12	Development Corporation and the Delaware
13	Earned Income Tax Credit campaign which is on
14	the first page here. And in the folder there
15	is a green piece of paper that shows you our
16	statistics from last year. To sum it up, our
17	organization runs a statewide earned income
18	tax credit campaign which is the free-tax
19	preparation bundled with a whole array of
20	financial services. My interest in getting
21	this started was really on the financial
22	service side and what I recognized eight years

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 ago was that the organizations in the country 2 that at that time were most successful at reaching potential IDA customers were those 3 who were involved in this free tax prep. 4 So the whole idea is to use the tax sites as a 5 front end to attract the market and then once 6 7 they are there to capture the money moment and to offer them a whole array of be able 8 financial services. 9

10 The IRS really made our job a lot easier three years ago when they introduced a 11 new strategy to be able to split the refund. 12 13 So now you can directly deposit your refund into as many as three accounts by using the 14 15 Form 8888. So before we were simply opening up savings accounts to have a direct deposit 16 in partnership with PNC Bank in Delaware and 17 then once the 8888 came along we can now offer 18 19 our customers an opportunity to save in more long term type vehicle. So put out an RFP to 20 the banks and I guess I am not using 21 my I will just tell you the story. slides. 22 We

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 put out an RFP asking Delaware banks to create a specific product which would be a CD, six 2 months minimum deposit of \$250. Basically we 3 designed a product that would be easy for our 4 customers and appeal it to our customers to 5 get into. And then we also designed a new job 6 7 for our volunteers because as you know free programs based on volunteer 8 tax are 9 participation. We created the tax 10 coordinator. So we have the tax preparer who does the taxes and the cash coordinator, oh 11 And we trained our volunteer there we go. 12 13 cash coordinators to talk to our customers about the products we offer. We offer savings 14 accounts -- and this is all in partnership 15 with local banks savings accounts, 16 _ _ certificates and certificates of deposit. 17 And by the way, we have no bankers on site. 18 We 19 are able to offer the products at all of our tax sites either using -- we started out with 20 an 800 number and now we just do it online. 21 We developed a secure website where we can go 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

up and just open up an account right online. 1 2 and then we also last started Last year partnership with D2D, Peter's brainchild, to 3 4 offer savings bonds. So it started getting really complicated. 5 Now we've got savings accounts, CDs, savings bonds, and we also 6 7 offer free merged credit reports with a score. And this year we are offering a new product 8 which is a convenient cash card. And I'm very 9 10 excited about that. I'm trying to keep an eye on the time here. 11

Т think rather than describing 12 13 everything because you are all bankers so you know what this stuff is. I think I should talk 14 15 about the lessons learned. One is you can 16 open accounts without a banker present. So a lot of programs around the country are limited 17 in terms of using tax sites as a front end 18 because they say that local banks don't have 19 enough support to be able to send somebody out 20 all of these tax sites 21 to to open the In Delaware we have been able to do accounts. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

it. I'm not a legal person. I'm not a banker. But they figured out how to do it legally in spite of the Patriot Act and all of those other limitations that we hear about all the time.

Number two, the savings accounts 6 7 were a flop. We've opened up a lot of them and we've had three different banking partners 8 and this is for unbanked taxpayers. 9 We've 10 opened up probably about 1,000 savings accounts over the past eight years and I would 11 say that 90 percent of them were closed or 12 13 they remained opened with \$5 in them. And the big bulk of them were overdrawn. So not only 14 15 were they closed but people ran into problems 16 by overdrawing and they ended up worse than they started. So Ι don't like 17 savings accounts. We still offer them because people, 18 19 some people want them. So we try to provide people with what they want. 20

21 The CDs, they have to be an 22 interesting product. Last year I was able to

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

convince one of our banks to reduce the term 1 2 to three months and the minimum to \$50. They decided they didn't want to do that again this 3 So we now offer \$250 at a minimum term 4 year. And we do have some interest 5 of six months. in the CDs. It actually conceived from our 6 7 money menu. This is what everybody gets when they come in. So when they enter, they are 8 introduce 9 qiven the money menu, we the 10 products. We have decided to label the CDs. We have Christmas CD, vacation CD, back-to-11 school CD, dream purchase, and debt repair. 12 13 So we try to suggest these are things that you might want to use the money for later this 14 15 And that really helps people year. to 16 visualize what you might want to do in six months with \$250. 17

Another lesson learned, everybody wants to know what their credit score is. Everybody knows that there is a problem that follows them around and that prevents them from gaining access to financial services,

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

7	isha all binda of things in life. Quadit
1	jobs, all kinds of things in life. Credit
2	scores are what I call your report card for
3	life. And we have done, I only can afford
4	2,500 a year. We'll do somewhere between
5	15,000 and 18,000 returns, but I have to pay
6	for these of course because they have the
7	score. So there really is no free credit
8	report. But we have developed a whole program
9	just on credit, a financial education program
10	called the money show and that combines
11	theater and financial education. We do it for
12	high school, college and adults. It is
13	described in our brochure.
14	Another lesson learned is that
14 15	Another lesson learned is that and this has really been a tough one for me.
15	and this has really been a tough one for me.
15 16	and this has really been a tough one for me. I've been trying to work with banks for many
15 16 17	and this has really been a tough one for me. I've been trying to work with banks for many years. I started out in micro lending and now
15 16 17 18	and this has really been a tough one for me. I've been trying to work with banks for many years. I started out in micro lending and now I've been doing all this consumer stuff. And
15 16 17 18 19	and this has really been a tough one for me. I've been trying to work with banks for many years. I started out in micro lending and now I've been doing all this consumer stuff. And it seems to me that banks don't really have

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 of product that our customers need which is 2 un- and underbanked consumers. So I'm really excited because I met up with some quys who 3 used to be with H&R Block. 4 They just started their own company called Advent 5 Financial 6 Services. Their market is my market. They 7 know how to create a product that doesn't You can't -- that's the main thing 8 overdraw. It has direct you can't bounce the account. 9 10 deposit. Ιt is this cash card. Ιt is described here. calling it the 11 We are convenient cash card and we are piloting it 12 13 this year. It can receive a direct deposit from payroll, 14 the tax return, from from 15 benefits. If Michael Barr is still in the room, I was jumping up and down because what 16 the ultimate financial 17 he was saying is transactional product that people need, this 18 19 is it. Plus not only is it ideal for transactions and people cannot fall into the 20 kind of traps that they will 21 same with traditional financial services, it is 22 also

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 going to have a savings pouch and a credit 2 line. if you are using it for your So Ι established payroll. have 3 you an 4 relationship, you can get a line of credit. You don't need a payday loan. So basically it 5 is the trinity card. It has three in one. It 6 7 can do everything. So hopefully I'm not being overly optimistic about it but I'm pretty 8 excited because it is what I have been looking 9 10 for, for a long time. So I think that is it. I could go 11 on and on and tell you more and more but look 12 13 at our money menu. You don't have to give it back even though we do ask for them back at 14 our tax sites. 15 MR. MOONEY: Thank you Mary. 16 Bruce? 17 GOTSCHALL: Glad to be here. MR. 18 19 The FDIC has been such a great partner in both brokerage intervention work and loan improved 20 development and so forth and you can see from 21 the title of this slide serving more low-22 **NEAL R. GROSS**

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 income neighborhoods and actually a few years would have been serving low-income communities 2 on the mend. We will stress because of the 3 4 foreclosure and vacate properties, it is a whole different situation. 5 I won't spend a lot of time on the background on Neighborhood 6 7 Housings Services but I have a couple of slides in there. I won't spend a lot of time 8 on there but we have three particular areas. 9 10 One is foreclosure and prevention work through our lending services which is the loan pool 11 and making loans for a range of activities and 12 13 then the redevelopment corporation which is a community development corporation, real estate 14 development, on neighborhood housing. 15 The activity of NHS is really neighborhood 16 Foreclosure prevention is what I 17 focused. will focus today. Homeownership 18 on 19 Preservation Initiative which we started in 2003 has significant results but because we 20 didn't keep up with the extreme increase in 21 foreclosures and the negative impact. 22 Just to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 give you some recent activity and the growth of that activity, this is partly due to the 2 growth of the problem but it is also due to 3 federal money has assisted us to capacity as 4 well as foundations and others have stepped up 5 some. We have a lot more activity, a lot more 6 7 education, a lot more connections. It is not increasing as rapidly as the connection to the 8 Some of that is time. It still takes 9 people. 10 three to six months just to get through the process of trying to get a saved or corrected 11 mortgage situation, but it is very difficult. 12 13 On the loan modification front, a lot of discretion there actually. Modifications from 14 our experience, we see only a third of them 15 actually lower the monthly payment. They keep 16 the payment the same or they add principal to 17 the end and we readjust and so it really is a 18 19 modification in change of terms but it doesn't improve the situation for the borrower. 20 So that we think is why the discretion in mods 21 demonstrates that they are not performing 22

160

(202) 234-4433

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

well. But we think they are not performing well because of all of the information is not calculated and the borrower situation is not taken into consideration.

1

2

3

4

5 The money announcements which we think are great in terms of the new programs, 6 7 from our experience, they have not yet reached the borrower level to really create more 8 volume of saves and less mitigation efforts 9 10 that are sustainable. We could talk about why mods aren't sustainable, what are the issues? 11 Many people have talked about those. These 12 13 are interpretations of what some of the causes The securities themselves, we think 14 might be. 15 the second one is a great big one and that data that is available to the service or they 16 don't get full, accurate data information. 17 We think help fill that gap and really do in 18 19 situations where we get cooperation. So there is a number of current situations that are, I 20 think, making it difficult still to move on 21 the modification and sustainable mod. 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

One kind of disturbing piece of new 1 2 information in terms of people that we are seeing -- when you look at the total expenses, 3 4 the average person we are counseling, that is coming to us, is -- 37 percent of their income 5 goes toward expenses. It is just and it is 6 7 gotten to the point where that is as big or bigger problem than the loan terms and so 8 forth or the original underwriting. 9 We think 10 streamlined mods can help a good portion of A second tier really needs the segment. 11 significant intensive counseling and budget 12 working with significant 13 work and also modifications of the terms of the loan to 14 15 lower payments. Some current we have talked 16 about before, a critical ingredient is the connection between the counselor 17 and the servicer. BestFit is one tool that we use and 18 19 other counseling organizations use to connect with loss mitigation people, the services that 20 they have. Get away from the facts as they 21 get to work-based connections which many, many 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

163

counselor organizations are now using this. We don't yet have as much acceptance from the services as we would like to see. It is something that I think is making some progress.

1

2

3

4

5

Moving quickly to neighborhood 6 services, 7 lending which is our licensed mortgage bank that provides lending for a 8 range of leads to close the gap of lending and 9 10 also combined public money with the private lending source to make deals work that could 11 not work without public subsidies for 12 the 13 range of what we call buy, fix and keep their The borrowers that we serve and have 14 homes. 15 served over the years, you can see the 16 demographics and income and so forth and then ITINS are part of our process also. 17 Low- and moderate-income have a significant portion of 18 19 that. Over the last six years, five or six we've had loan pools have generated 20 years, about 150 million in loans and over time you 21 can see the new, developing a new loan pool 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 currently right now. 150 million, a new piece 2 of it is the third bullet, the loss reserve. Although our loans have performed very well 3 over the last five or six years, in order to 4 get our investors comfortable, we have set a 5 premium, the loans to the lenders and some of 6 7 that premium goes toward the reserve and then the MacArthur Foundation has stepped up to 8 help the loss reserve --9 10 MR. FISH: Who are your investors? MR. GOTSCHALL: We've got 20 and 11 I've a slide here that shows those, currently 12 13 who we have. And just as composition and refinance, when you look at 14 product mix, 15 purchase and home improvement, 2003-2006 you 16 see 12 percent of our lending rights for our In 2007 it was 53 projecting going 17 re-fis. forward. Actually we a very slight 18 see 19 decline in refinances over the years but this is as we project, what we've done and what we 20 project going forward to be lending about 45 21 50 million a year for those kinds 22 to of

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

improvements or those kinds of loans.

-	
2	This is just a slide that we use
3	with our potential investors describing why it
4	is important to invest to the low- and
5	moderate-income borrowers, the geographies
6	that you had to get to, investment that
7	couldn't be done without this kind of
8	partnership from public funds.
9	Investors here, we have about 20
10	investors. We have two other pools in the
11	past and many repeats and a few new, still in
12	progress. During this month we will be
13	finalizing and closing at the end of month.
14	MR. FISH: So they are all banks?
15	You don't have any non-bank?
16	MR. GOTSCHALL: No.
17	MR. FISH: And you don't have any
18	financial you don't have check cashing
19	companies? You don't have
20	MR. GOTSCHALL: As investors?
21	MR. FISH: As investors.
22	MR. GOTSCHALL: No, no.
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
	(202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

	166
1	MR. FISH: Payday lenders, you have
2	no payday lenders as investors?
3	MR. GOTSCHALL: No. We've
4	historically worked with what we call
5	conventional lenders.
6	MR. FISH: And why do you think that
7	is that banks are your investors?
8	MR. GOTSCHALL: Well because
9	historically Neighborhood Housing Services has
10	been a partner with existing financial
11	institutions, I think their focus on the
12	communities plus I think CRA is a benefit that
13	is something that is worthwhile. We did
14	actually have long discussions with Goldman
15	and Morgan Stanley this year but we haven't
16	gotten them yet. But eventually I think we
17	will.
18	CHAIRMAN BAIR: They are banks
19	now.
20	MR. GOTSCHALL: So that is the
21	lending front. Our redevelopment corporation,
22	which is Neighborhood Housing Services
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
	1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 particularly what I wanted to focus on today 2 was our NeighborHomes activity with buying buildings reselling vacant and those 3 properties in targeted neighborhoods. 4 Just as an example, this happened to be two years ago 5 we did work. There was a block that had six 6 7 vacant properties. They were actually FHA at These properties we purchased and that time. 8 rehabbed with some city assistance, but also 9 10 privately financed in terms of the sale of the properties at the end. Of course the current 11 purchase/rehab/resale market 12 and issues are 13 significant. The market -- and we all know the market and credit -- the overall sales and 14 15 all of these are very, very difficult today in 16 terms of taking a building, buying it, fixing it and selling it to new owners. So the ideas 17 of rent to single families, lease-to-purchase 18 19 options, those things that are things that need to be considered on how those can add 20 resources to work on the problem. I think 21 that reality, different from a number of years 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 ago, used to be at the foreclosure sale there 2 would be some investors bought the loan out of the foreclosure sale. Now almost nobody; 97 3 4 percent of the properties go to the lender with no investors paying off the mortgage as 5 there was before. Of course huge inventories, 6 some REO lenders, you know, the attitude of 7 give me an offer or what can I do? Give me an 8 neighborhood in 9 idea of а terms of the 10 straight on the market, the third bullet point, and this a neighborhood which 11 was interestingly is in the neighborhood President 12 13 Obama use to organize outside of Chicago. This is 47 listed at under \$30,000 and been on 14 15 the market 157 days. There were none in 2005 and 2006 and ten properties listed 16 on the listing service for under \$15,000. 17 So the market is just flooded with properties. 18 19 Putting a presentation without a map. This is 20 map over а three year period and the neighborhood in Chicago. You can see if you 21 look on one of those blocks that we had these 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 properties that were in foreclosure -the 2 negative impact that it has on that geography. So just to summarize the whole situation and 3 NHS over the last number of years has done 50 4 5 100 properties in terms of to а year purchase/rehab/resale in targeted 6 our 7 neighborhoods. We are working with the city with the neighborhood strategy program, the 8 federal government's funds for vacant building 9 10 rehab, resale and rental that we hope can close the gap of appraisal and market with the 11 total costs of rehab and so acquisition prices 12 13 are coming down for REO and other kinds of things but the rehab process is still high and 14 15 the markets are soft. So, that's kind of the 16 situation as we see it today and the range of things that we are working to do to -- I guess 17 one of the words is we are trying to include 18 19 people but we are also trying to sustain people in the situation. 20 Those are the things we are about. Thank you. 21

MR. MOONEY: Bruce, thank you.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

The FDIC is working with the Alliance for Economic Inclusion to get its bank members to include the program. They were anyway because of you. Charles?

5 MR. MARTIN: How you doing. are Good morning everybody. I know we are coming 6 7 up on lunch. I promise to go guick, okay. You guys have a pretty nice dining room. Ι 8 would like to thank Chairman Bair and also 9 10 thank Bob Mooney and Barry Wings for guiding us and the FDIC in this effort. Thanks to the 11 participating banks, the foundations and the 12 13 not-for-profit community in Baltimore. This truly been a collaborative effort in 14 has 15 Baltimore where we have all come together to 16 try to develop a product in which we combat some of the predatory or payday lending that 17 is going on. 18

What I think I would like to do is go right to the history slide here because a lot of the information you have heard before. Again, we began our campaign in probably

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

2007. We started off with over 40 different 1 tried to break it off into 2 members. We different committees and you heard a lot this 3 morning about data collection and research and 4 so forth. One of our committees was actually 5 a research and data collection committee. It 6 7 was funded by one of the foundations. The work was actually done by one of the not-for-8 profits in Baltimore. It was under the on-9 10 the-ground footwork. People standing out in front of check cashers trying to figure out 11 why do you use this check casher and why do 12 13 you use this particular check casher as opposed to the one a block away from here and 14 why don't you use banks for this particular 15 16 purpose? So we gathered that information and as a result of some of that, we decided we are 17 going to focus on certain target areas 18 in 19 Baltimore where this is pretty prevalent and come up with a small dollar loan program. 20 The loan model -- and this is similar to what you 21 heard this morning --there is an application 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 process. The loan ranges from \$300 to \$1,000. 2 We figured it would be repaid over 12 months. The APR here is actually wrong. I think got 3 excited and put an extra one in there. 4 That should really be 7.99 and not 17.99, okay. 5 We do have a savings component added to this so 6 7 that as people repay their loan they actually portion of their qet -- a payment 8 gets deposited to a savings account. We are coming 9 10 up with a match strategy so that we match one of the dollars for one in terms that the 11 MR. 12 people save. FISH: So where 13 does that match come from? MR. MARTIN: We are debating that 14 15 now whether we are going to get that from the 16 foundation for banks or just where that match That is still an item to be will come from. 17 worked out and I actually have a slide. The 18 19 last slide will talk about things that we are still going through. 20

Again, when I say we put banks together to do this, banks are cautious. So

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

we put a bunch of cautious banks together. 1 2 Financial education, there is а financial education component to this. 3 We believe that financial education is definitely 4 a key component to people understanding why it 5 6 is important to save. But also when you are 7 doing things with payday lending, you also have to change the mind set of the person in 8 terms of paying on a monthly basis as opposed 9 10 to paying every time I get my paycheck. So a little bit of education has to go on that. 11 about foundation Aqain, talk 12

13 We actually approaching support. are foundations for loan loss reserves. 14 They were 15 instrumental in doing focus groups for us and 16 doing surveys in terms of doing check cashing surveys and also surveys in terms of what 17 banks in the area had to offer as it relates 18 19 these types of programs. They to were in 20 instrumental marketing. One thing we recognize is that if we do come up with a 21 program, a workable program, it has 22 to be

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

advertised. People have to know about it in order to understand how to utilize it and they have been instrumental in doing that, grants for payroll and also grants for the loan pool.

Our non-profit support partner, we 5 chose NHS of Baltimore because we recognize 6 7 that, as a group of banks, we probably would never get this done by ourselves. We needed a 8 non-profit partner that we could all work with 9 and who we all were currently working with 10 that could actually make this product work for 11 us. Again, NHS, great name of Baltimore, great 12 13 name in many other cities -- the charter NeighborWorks, certified CDFI 14 member of _ _ centrally located and 15 they are that is important because people have got to be able 16 Convenience is one of 17 to get there. the reasons people use check cashers. They are on 18 19 every corner. They are very, very convenient 20 and everybody knows where they are. And the in the check cashing operation know 21 people So NHS is similar to this. They 22 them.

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1	service the population that we are trying to
2	reach. They are centrally located, easy to
3	get to. Parking is obviously an issue because
4	it is in a city and that is one of the things
5	we have got to work out. They have got name
6	recognition and they have a history of
7	community outreach. And the other thing we
8	noticed when we got in there is they have a
9	lending platform that really makes this work
10	for all of us. Because of the things that
11	they do on the loan side, the platform that
12	they have will make this product work for us.
13	Current financial partners and
14	these partners have committed time effort and
15	money to this particular project again it
16	is not just banks up here. It is also credit
17	unions that are also joining in this effort to
18	make this thing work.
19	This is the flow chart and if you
20	would like you can't see it this far back, but
21	in terms of how this process works. A
22	borrower comes in, what happens, how the
	NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

application flows. Who does what in order for the person to get the money because we are trying to make this convenient, efficient and quick in terms of making it happen.

Some issues to be resolved? 5 Many of the banks and credit unions that 6 are 7 contributing to this effort are doing it through contributions which reduces the cost 8 to the loan pool and not necessarily to zero 9 10 but it reduces the cost. So we are still in discussions about a more affordable interest 11 rate and how do we make that work. 12 Because the interest earned off of the loans will go 13 back into the pool to help fund the programs. 14 So we can't make it too low but then again we 15 16 can't make it too high. Maximum savings amount that qualifies for the match -- we got 17 the issue of someone taking out a loan and 18 19 then depositing the money in there and then looking for a huge match which would make us 20 run out of matching dollars quickly. 21 So we got that issue in terms of how we go about 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

Loan repayment -- monthly versus 1 that. 2 That depends on how the people get biweekly. paid and some other issues that are in there. 3 Limit on the number of loans a borrower can 4 We are looking at limiting the maximum 5 take? amount that you can have out there at any one 6 7 time. Bank accounts set up because all the banks are participating and different banks 8 take different of 9 IDs in terms opening 10 accounts. We are trying to figure out a way that could work so all the banks benefit from 11 setting up the accounts. 12 13 The incentives. You heard a lot of talk about completing the educational program. 14 15 recognize that there has We to be an

incentive there for a person to complete that 16 educational program. Just how do we go about 17 that, whether that delivering is in the 18 19 beginning, the end or where that goes? And also the question of processing a cash payment 20 -- NHS is not set up to accept cash payments. 21 How do we accept someone who maybe doesn't 22

> **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

	178
1	have a checking account yet and does need to
2	make a payment on their loan? How could we
3	process that? Okay.
4	MR. FISH: How many loans have you
5	made?
6	MR. MARTIN: We are still in the
7	process of getting set up. So to date we have
8	not made any.
9	MR. MOONEY: It is my pleasure
10	and honor to introduce Mr. Jim Young who is
11	the president and CEO of Citizens Bank and Jim
12	if you could just update us on what's going on
13	in the Black Belt Area of Alabama and
14	elsewhere.
15	MR. YOUNG: I am very leery as well
16	because I guess I'm the last person before
17	lunch. It is good to be back in the city.
18	Two weeks ago I promised myself and my wife I
19	wouldn't be here again until the cherries
20	blossomed or 70 degrees, whichever came first,
21	but I'm happy to be back here.
22	My bank is Citizens Trust Bank in
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 Atlanta, Georgia. It was founded in 1921 with 2 people with amazing foresight. It was founded to serve the underserved back in 1921 and they 3 were obviously very proficient in what they 4 were doing. The bank has survived a lot of 5 turmoil, including the Great Depression, World 6 7 War Two, social upheaval and a lot of other things that I'm sure people predicted the 8 demise of the bank the day after it 9 was 10 started. But it had been there stock-in-We have 10 branch locations in a trade. 11 multi-state environment. I became president 12 13 in 1998 as a result of a merger and we acquired since a failed savings and loan as 14 15 well as an ongoing institution which was a 16 thrift in Birmingham, Alabama that had been founded by the well known A. G. Gaston. 17 Part. of what A. G. Gaston had built including a 18 19 thrift in Birmingham to provide housing, he also opened a branch very near his hometown in 20 Utah, Alabama. I don't know how many people 21 were living there then. There are only 1,800 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 there now. We had a branch in Utah, right in 2 the heart of the Black Belt of this country, the poorest of this country. We had options, 3 4 obviously when you make that kind of acquisition to be more efficient you eliminate 5 those branches that are not profitable. You 6 do not have the critical mass. You do not 7 have the potential to ever be profitable for 8 For us, because of our founding, we 9 you. 10 decided that was not the case. We would keep that branch open modest 11 even across some 12 market products and services amount. We 13 through them. The majority of the people African-American 14 there are and poverty 15 stricken. So we felt it very important to 16 keep that branch there even if it were not the highest yielding branch that we had in our 17 network. 18

We got involved and always had an interest in helping those who were underserved. My bank has an outstanding CRA rating and those of you who think that would

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 assume that a minority bank would. Believe me, it is very, very difficult these days to 2 get an outstanding CRA rating. I don't care 3 4 what your heritage is or where your branches 5 are located. We are very proud and take it From the very seriously. things we do 6 7 everyday, I don't have an income with slides and income with any additional pieces. Ι 8 wanted to be able to talk to you directly 9 10 about what we do. I did not want to send my I did not want to send my 11 CRA person. I did not want to send my marketing person. 12 public relations person. 13 The reason we are doing a small dollar loan program is because 14 it is important to me. It is important to me 15 because we were asked to consider being one of 16 the banks that would develop a small dollar 17 loan program. We were happy to try to do so. 18 19 We started and the thing that struck me about thing and because our involvement was 20 this that we have a branch in Columbus, Georgia, 21 which is the base for Fort Benning, Georgia. 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 And there was discussion from the Department 2 of Army that their soldiers, they felt had security risks and could 3 become not be 4 assigned to certain tasks by larger numbers simply because they had fallen prey to payday 5 6 lenders. And the fact that their credit was 7 so weak that they had to utilize it that it eliminated what they could do in the service 8 in the name of national security. 9 And so we 10 felt that if we could offer a program where they did not have to go to payday lending and 11 find themselves in a spiral, where the more 12 13 they paid, the more they owed, that we could help eliminate that. Well we were a bit naive 14 15 about penetrating, I guess, the fort. It was 16 very difficult to get our product. had We advertising on radio in Columbus, Georgia. 17 We had gone to the base and hoped we could get 18 19 in, in order to market that product. It was a small dollar loan product up to \$1,500. 20 There was an element of savings there. 21 We could We did about two loans. The program had 22 not.

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	major benefits if we looked at our market. We
2	also recognized that there were very few, if
3	any, and I didn't find any and I don't know
4	today where you can walk into a bank,
5	particularly a major bank, walk into a bank
6	and say I'd like to borrow \$1,500. You can't
7	do it. It is and I understand why. They
8	are simply not interested in. Before the ink
9	is dry on the paperwork, they have lost money.
10	You simply can't, if you are going to produce
11	the kind of document that consumer compliance
12	regulators would expect you to have, you have
13	lost money.
14	And so it is a very, very tough
15	thing to do. But nevertheless, I look at this
16	as an opportunity. Years ago when I started
17	in banking, I was assigned to the financing
18	and leasing companies division at the Chase
19	Manhattan Bank, my first assignment out of
20	training. And I had companies like Household
21	and those kinds of large finance companies.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 bulk that they loaned out in smaller pieces. 2 And I knew that there was a possibility to do this, but it was dependent upon volume. 3 And were determined then that we would 4 so we continue and we opened what we called the 5 community relief loan. I had to refrain from 6 7 calling it a main street relief loan. That was in line to let the American consumer know that 8 somebody cared at least in our market that no 9 10 matter what was happening in Congress, no matter what was happening, that we were going 11 to use, whether we got taught or not, what 12 13 resources we had to touch those. A lot of people who had suffered foreclosure got on a 14 15 slippery slope simply because at some point in 16 their time they only needed enough for one mortgage payment to bridge the time until they 17 could get something else. But nobody was 18 19 making those kinds of loans. They would tell you to go find your friends and family. 20 further decided then that it 21 Ι would give opportunity to 22 me an tap the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 enthusiasms of younger people in my 2 organization. So I stripped the program down and asked them to create this program. 3 How 4 would they respond to it? What would they like to see and what did they think was fair? 5 How should we approach it? So they spent the 6 7 summer of last year developing a program. So we have in fact implemented the program. A 8 \$1,500 minimum loan, and I have signed for 9 10 more than that on occasion for those who have a further need. It is a one-year maturity 11 requiring monthly payments that is 12 loan, 13 obviously a lot less than if you have to pay back the full balance of a loan every time you 14 15 get paid at a significant interest rate. No annual fee. The debt ratio cannot be higher 16 there percent. know 17 than 50 Ι is some leniency there considering debt ratio. 18 We 19 looked for cross selling opportunities in CDs, free check. 20 savings accounts, We do require an automatic debit. We do not require 21 direct deposit. They are still free to pick 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 any bank they want. We simply want to have 2 the direct deposit. We advertise heavily on this digging the 3 program, program file 4 financially more and more in the hole but we knew we had to advertise to get the message 5 out. And we began to be bombarded with 6 7 applications. We wanted to make it a simple process in which a decision could be made in 8 And we have been successful in doing 9 one day. that. We have had 400 applications. 10 We have accrued 90 loans and this is since November 11 when we finally rolled the program out in all 12 13 of our markets. And yes Utah is an active participant in this program as well. 14 So we 15 have rolled this program out and we have some 16 15 pending applications and it continues to grow. Are we making money on it? No. What do 17 we get from it? It has been a training 18 19 vehicle for some of my people who thought that their role in the bank was simply to take 20 deposits and cash checking. We've been able 21 to tap that and to give them an opportunity 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

and actually create a product. So they have a vested interest in the product and a vested interest in selling the product. I have not had much success in collaborating with nonprofits and things of that sort. It simply has not been a consistency there.

7 Over the years we have taught the Money Smart program. We were one of the few 8 that began teaching the Money Smart program. 9 10 Non-profits and churches of faith-based institutions would invite us in to teach and 11 it was not consistent. We set up school banks 12 13 and that was not consistent. Change and yearto-year, it was not consistent. 14

felt whatever activity we 15 So we were going to do in this area, we were going 16 to need to control and do ourselves. We would 17 have to use our money and hopefully we would 18 19 draw other people. And so to date, we have 20 this program. It has been very, very helpful It has been very, very helpful to the 21 to us. people we serve. We get an opportunity to sit 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

1 and talk with them. We had a second chance 2 program and I didn't want to be а second I wanted the customer base to 3 chance program. feel that any time they walked into any one of 4 our locations, if they happened to have had a 5 6 bad encounter with check systems, even had a 7 second chance with a bank, you have a human being to talk to, to explain your situation. 8 I was the final arbiter on 9 In many cases 10 whether somebody would get another chance. The reason because I was not a large bank to 11 And part of what we sell that major 12 do that. 13 banks cannot sell, everybody has access to all of my people in the bank including me. 14 Ιt 15 keeps me there longer hours but there is not 16 someone in Atlanta or in Columbus or in Birmingham who says they want to speak to the 17 president of the bank or the chief operating 18 19 officer of the bank and did not have an opportunity to speak with him and make their 20 The way banking was perhaps the way 21 case. banking ought to be. So we've been successful 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 in that. To take 500 applications and comply 2 in consumer compliance, it takes a lot of effort and it takes an energy that you cannot 3 4 pay for. You have to have а stronger commitment. 5 And is little SO ours а different. We think we had the responsibility 6 to do it and not wait until all the stars 7 aligned in the sky before we take action. 8 So it is working well for us. 9 Now I have not 10 done the equation to see what critical mass I have to get to break even. And I know that's 11 an anathema to a lot of people who manage and 12 13 run banks but that is the way I run this program. I don't want that focus to be there. 14 15 You know the total of outstanding is probably \$100,000 to \$120,000. We can run this program 16 and we certainly don't expect to lose any part 17 of that and, since November, the 18 economy 19 started -- we have not had one default in this program. We have done every loan, but we have 20 not had one default. But someone who was 21 going to -- we've outlawed payday lenders in 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Georgia. They have been replaced by title 2 lending. And so people begin to realize that what they are giving up when they do that. 3 Now it is not just the interest rates that you 4 Now you are subject to lose the equity 5 pay. in your automobile which is significantly more 6 7 than the interest rates and the value in those automobiles simply because you cannot make the 8 payment in two weeks. So this is set up just 9 10 like any other normal loan. But the banking system has gotten to the point that even some 11 community banks is simply not attractive to 12 13 make a loan at the levels at which you ask. And perhaps that is why when you hear from 14 15 people who are in this program and asked to 16 contribute and asked to create small dollar loan program, why they have had difficulty 17 launching them and getting them off the 18 19 ground. Because somewhere, and I don't know where, if it is the CFO or the CEOs and say we 20 can't make money, I'm sorry. With me, it is a 21 believe different Ι that will 22 case. we

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

ultimately win. And you know, like a lot of people I have relatives, maybe distant relatives who would benefit from such a program. Either the bank lends them the money or I lend them.

1

2

3

4

5

They must be gainfully employed. They 6 come to us with six months of evidence of 7 having been employed. We like to see six 8 months of consistent employment. There are a 9 10 lot of people who are employed and found themselves just short of a mortgage payment, 11 just short of an auto payment. 12 But if that 13 continues, it creates a problem. But if they that in the bud, it solves 14 can nip the 15 problem. At least that is an improvement for 16 us.

I'm going to take one minute and mention one other thing I feel passionately about and am trying to promote. And that is this thing of financial literacy. Whether the FDIC Money Smart, Operation Hope and all of these things are going on, and there is a

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

NEAL R. GROSS

1 requirement for, in many cases when we were doing the mortgage business, first-time home 2 buyers, we would have a first-time home buyers 3 We would work them 4 training program. in Fannie Mae and we would come and give those 5 lessons. It occurred to me as we began the 6 7 talk about the bailout, TARP, a trillion dollars or 800 billion dollars and I've looked 8 at it and looked at No Child Left Behind for 9 10 the last four years and always wondered that if we can teach phys ed and require phys ed in 11 our public schools. If we can teach home 12 economics and I'm not -- if we can do those 13 things, why is it we cannot require as part of 14 15 the curriculum that our young children learn 16 about financial literacy rather than hoping than a non-profit will pick it up and someone 17 else will do it for a fee. Why not allocate 18 19 part of that money or someone with a voice that can be heard, why not take a piece of 20 this money that they are debating now over on 21 the Hill and allocate to ensure that when our 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

kids come out of school, if they don't come 1 2 out with credit card debt as someone down here mentioned, they come out with а savings 3 4 account with money in it. They come out with an understanding of how the mortgage business 5 works. They come out with an understanding of 6 7 how the stock market works. They come out with an understanding of having been in an 8 investment club and perhaps come out with a 9 10 stake in life at 18 years old. We are turning out people who, it is cards, and we've all 11 suffered and accepted blame for cards and the 12 13 mortgage problem. Everybody with every bank was not at fault. There were people who knew 14 15 they were buying more than they could afford. 16 They couldn't believe it themselves but if it was being sold it had to be legal so they were 17 going to take it without any concern about the 18 19 implications for them.

So having done what we do, we will 20 continue to do, but there are many of you who 21 have a voice on the Hill. Ask them to modify 22

> **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

the curriculum so that our children don't come 1 2 out with a lack of understanding. They come out with a full understanding and a stake in 3 America before they even go to college. 4 It is a simple thing in my mind. So I thank you for 5 the opportunity. Mr. Mooney knows how to 6 7 reach me and my program. I'm a fairly simplistic guy. I don't like getting bogged 8 down with a lot of collaborative things that 9 10 is going to require we meet every third Thursday and we'll come up with something when 11 you have the full capacity to do something. 12 Ι 13 really think we all ought to be the change we'd like to see. 14 15 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you. Does anybody have any questions comments? 16 MS. WRIGHT: Amen. 17 MS. TAYLOR: Amen, yes. 18 19 CHAIRMAN BAIR: I unfortunately have some meetings up on the Hill and another 20 agency this afternoon. I couldn't control the 21 scheduling. I may not be able to be back for 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

the discussion but a couple of areas where I 1 2 really would like some input from the group. Apropos the excellent presentations we have 3 had this morning is that I think we are having 4 increasing success in our small dollar loan 5 6 pilots and whether it is time to take that to 7 the next step and see if we could provide further incentives for banks to start offering 8 those types of products more broadly. 9

10 I am intrigued by Michael Barr's notion of a safe transaction account, whether 11 in combination with setting goals for reducing 12 13 the unbanked or underbanked population that there should be an affirmative requirement 14 15 that banks provide that type of account. 16 Maybe they do it already. It would be interesting to find out. Maybe that would be 17 the next step. How many banks do it already 18 19 and what the costs and success are? So those And then also this check 20 are two areas. I've heard this a lot. 21 system issue. It came again on the survey data. do 22 up Ι not

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 understand why. Certainly it is prudent to 2 through checks and maybe run customers to exclude them from a conventional checking 3 4 account but why not a savings account? Ιt why shouldn't everybody be 5 seems to me -getting a savings account. So maybe there are 6 7 other barriers there or not and maybe that's another area where regulators should step in 8 and say affirmatively yes, you can train for a 9 10 checking account but not for а savings So I very much would like input on 11 account. those specific issues and obviously anything 12 13 you would like to recommend to us. We are getting a good additional baseline with our 14 15 small dollar pilot, as well as this wonderful that Marty Barbara have 16 survey and 17 spearheaded, Ι think to make some policy judqments that could lead 18 now to more 19 definitive regulatory steps. So, I hope I can get back this afternoon but, if not, I look 20 forward to getting a report about what your 21 reviews are. We'll be talking over lunch too. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 Thank you.

2	MS. TAYLOR: Anybody else?
3	MS. DUPONT: The one thing that I
4	forgot to mention about this card is that it's
5	a bank product. It's currently, the bank
6	that's offering it is Bancorp. But any bank
7	here could offer it. So if we'd like to have
8	discussions, I could connect you. So it's
9	really, the card is a process just like these,
10	and MasterCard is a process. It's just
11	designed for this market so they don't fall
12	into some of the traps. So it is a financial
13	product, and it is FDIC-insured.
14	MS. TAYLOR: Okay. We have lunch
15	upstairs on the 7 th floor. And if everybody
16	could be back in their seats by 1:30 so that
17	we can have some good discussion this
18	afternoon, that would be great. And panelists,
19	thank you very much.
20	(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
21	went off the record at 12:32 p.m., and resumed
22	at 1:44 p.m.)
	NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 MR. MOONEY: Okay. What we do 2 follow wanted to was to up the on Chairman's request before she left, and also 3 to get reactions to what we heard earlier. 4 Т heard three 5 MS. MILLER: things. How can we increase success in the 6 7 small dollar loan programs? Are there any incentives that 8 other we could perhaps And the Chairman indicated that she 9 provide? 10 was sort of intrigued by this idea of having an affirmative requirement for some sort of 11 limited 12 access account or account being targeted to one bank. And then what are the 13 next steps that we need to take? Where do we 14 need to take the empirical information and 15 16 findings of small dollar loan pilots and the unbanked survey, both the one we've got in 17 front of us, and then the one forthcoming on 18 19 the consumers? Those were the three things I heard. 20 MS. FUCHS: Just a quick suggestion 21 on the survey. I mean I just remembered that 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 the table about the perceptions of the bankers, and their perceptions about why they 2 can't serve this community had to do with 3 4 profitability, and regulatory barriers, and fraud, and high cost of customer acquisition. 5 When I used survey data like that in other 6 7 contexts, it's a really useful thing to do to match up perceptions with other indicators of 8 the empirical circumstances of the reality. 9 10 So it would be good to really understand whether or not there really are problems of 11 profitability and problems, regulatory 12 13 barriers, and that are these real things that don't fit in with the business plans that 14 have, and if they are, then you're 15 banks dealing with a different problem in terms of 16 the kinds of solutions you'd want to put out 17 there then if it's simply perceptions, and in 18 19 fact, they can make a profit, and there really aren't great regulatory barriers. So you know, 20 and on and on and on. So I think to the 21 extent that you can provide some empirical or 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 objective indicators out there that you rank 2 alongside the perceptions, you'll actually have a better capacity to make suggestions 3 along the lines of what kinds of incentives 4 and what kinds of regulations do we have to 5 really put into place, and whether banks have 6 7 to change, or are we asking banks to change their business plans essentially as it relates 8 to profit for this constituency. 9 10 MS. TAYLOR: And can we do that? FUCHS: And can we do that? MS. 11 I mean, that's a decision that has to Right. 12 13 be made. MS. MILLER: In terms of the 14 15 perceptions, of course the case study banks are going to sort of debunk some of those 16 perceptions, and that was a part of the reason 17 why there was the case study banks in there, 18 19 and why we have these presentations here You know, some objections are going to 20 today. be perceptions, and then also some banks just 21 aren't really going to want to pursue this 22

NEAL R. GROSS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

line of business. But that's the whole idea
 of having case study banks and presentations
 of this sort.

4 MR. HENDERSON: Thank you. First, Madam Chair, I have a question which really I 5 to you and to the suspect goes broader 6 7 committee, but it's based on the conversations we had this morning. Let me say I found this 8 to be a very enlightened set of presentations, 9 10 very informative. And as someone who is not either a banker or directly involved in the 11 regulation of banks, but who has an interest 12 13 in the impact of these programs and policies on the constituencies that we represent, I 14 15 thought that this was an extremely helpful set 16 of presentations. I think the survey that the FDIC has undertaken of the unbanked or the 17 underbanked, and as my friend, Larry Fish, 18 19 refers to them, the alternatively-banked - he doesn't see that as being either unbanked or 20 underbanked - but I thought that 21 was very informative, and obviously there 22 is more

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 information that needs to be gathered. Ι 2 think your pilot project with the Census Bureau is really guite innovative. You should 3 commended for 4 be it. We have lots of could delve 5 questions that into, we but there's a larger issue, which I think looms 6 7 over this conversation, and I wanted to get your advice, Madam Chair. And that is the 8 question of the role of the Advisory Committee 9 10 in helping to develop recommendations that actually impact policy that is being 11 now developed right here in Washington. 12 I mean, I 13 don't have to state the obvious. We are in greatest financial crisis facing 14 the the 15 country in the last 50 years. But in that crisis, there are also seeds of opportunity. 16 Virtually a trillion dollars in income 17 is being spent in one form or another 18 to 19 completely restructure a financial system as 20 we know it today. And there are opportunities within that restructuring to make significant 21 gains, I believe, on some of the issues which 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 have been the subject of this advisory 2 committee and its role. The question is whether the kinds of information that is being 3 4 generated has been put in some sort of broader context so that we can inform the appropriate 5 policymakers on Capitol Hill, the banking and 6 7 finance committees of the Treasury Department, and those in the White House who are actually 8 shaping these policies, and I fear that, if we 9 10 take too long to develop a more comprehensive assessment of recommendations, that we would 11 make -- we'll miss that opportunity. 12 And so 13 the issue is whether the kinds of things that are being discussed here are assembled in a 14 way that become digestible for that broader 15 body, and whether there is any intent to try 16 to use this information to affect the policy 17 decisions that are being made right now. 18 19 MS. TAYLOR: I think the short

21

20

22

maybe

(202) 234-4433

you

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

speak

answer to that is absolutely yes, and Marty

I'm just going to say a few words, and then

for

the

can

www.nealrgross.com

Chairman,

1 chairwoman, as to what is actually being done 2 with the information from we get these The subject matter of each of the 3 sessions. 4 sessions I think has been thought through a an accident that this 5 lot, and it's not 6 session is happening right, now because it 7 really goes to the crux of some of the problems that have been inherent in the system 8 which have sort of trickled, I believe up, and 9 10 caused some of the problems that we're in today. So I think our role, from my point of 11 view, is to elicit information, discuss among 12 13 ourselves what we think some of the policy implications of that could be, some of the 14 15 things that the FDIC could do with that 16 information as far policy construction as And I think we've seen some very good -17 qoes. - heard some really good ideas here, and our 18 19 job is to figure out what it is that the FDIC and regulators could do to promote some of 20 those ideas, and to give the FDIC 21 and the chairwoman and Marty, the co-chair 22 or vice

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

chair the ammunition and information that they 1 2 need to go and advocate those ideas with the current administration and the powers that be, 3 because the chairwoman has been very much 4 involved in all of these discussions. 5 And the more information that she has from groups, 6 7 such as the people that we've been talking to here, and the benefit of the discussion that 8 we had, which is a very, very diverse group, 9 10 she is much better, and has а lot more ammunition to go and --11 MR. HENDERSON: Can Ι qive 12 13 specific follow though, because it goes to point, all 14 your and not at to be 15 argumentative. agree with exactly what Ι 16 you're saying. First of all, we are an advisory committee to 17 the FDIC. So the information that we provide presumably will 18 19 arm our chair, Sheila, and our vice-chair, 20 Marty, and perhaps prepare them better to advance a broader agenda within the circles in 21 which they function. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 Having said that, I question whether, even as the chair and the vice-chair 2 of the FDIC, they have sufficient political 3 4 power unto themselves to influence the policy at the highest level simply by taking forth 5 our recommendations and putting them forward. 6 7 My own experience has been that, unless there is an echo chamber created outside of the 8 official body in which you're operating, your 9 10 ability to have influence on some of these broader policy issues is quite limited. 11 Ι think Madam Chair has 12 already encountered 13 challenges with respect to her intervention around the home foreclosure issue. She has 14 15 been admirable in her advocacy. But her voice is a voice in the wilderness, unable to 16 influence the process entirely on her own. 17 And what I'm suggesting is that we represent a 18 19 much more diverse, and to some degree 20 influential, body as an advisory committee than simply providing recommendations to the 21 FDIC alone. Case in point: I listened this 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

morning to the discussion of the survey that 1 2 was undertaken. I thought it was tremendous, informative, very helpful. I asked Marty, and 3 4 Marty can talk with us about it, I asked whether there had been a definitive case made 5 for banking the unbanked. What was missing in 6 7 the discussion this morning is not the survey, and that wasn't the purpose of that 8 But it was a broader context in 9 presentation. making the case for why federal policy should 10 encourage banking those who are unbanked, or 11 underbanked, alternatively-banked. 12 or 13 Thinking of strengthen ways to the presentation so that ability to 14 your have 15 impact in the appropriate venues where this conversation is taking place can be amplified 16 beyond what the FDIC can do. And I fear that, 17 notwithstanding the wisdom of the 18 19 recommendations or, you know, the probity or the thoughtfulness of the presentation, there 20 is a limited impact that these recommendations 21 will have if they are voiced exclusively by 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

	208
1	our chair or vice chair.
2	MS. TAYLOR: I'm so glad you
3	brought that up.
4	MR. HENDERSON: Good.
5	MS. TAYLOR: This committee was
6	formed by the FDIC.
7	MR. HENDERSON: Yes, absolutely.
8	MS. TAYLOR: So our duty is to
9	advise and inform the FDIC of what goes on,
10	and what we decide to discuss here. However,
11	what members of this committee do with the
12	information, which is also very public, is
13	entirely outside of the purview of this
14	committee. So if people wanted to
15	individually go and advocate, as I know that
16	many of us are very able to do, this committee
17	has no control over what they might do with
18	that. So I would say
19	MR. HENDERSON: I will make one
20	last comment, then I'm done. I appreciate
21	that. Look, we I worked as head of a
22	coalition that operates by consensus, and so
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

nature of that process, as you 1 the could 2 imagine, is challenging on many issues. But there would seem to be a consensus on 3 some recommendations that would come off of this 4 advisory body that could have real impact as 5 Congress is debating these issues. Obviously 6 7 not everybody will reach the level of consensus, nor should we seek to advance a 8 broad set of policies. But I certainly think 9 10 that а targeted set of recommendations, prepared by a well respected, diverse group 11 like this advisory body, and given voice at a 12 13 time when the Treasury Department, the White House and the Hill are debating these issues, 14 15 could have some influence. And so I'll close 16 simply by saying I hope that, as we consider how we can be helpful to the FDIC, that we 17 consider a broad range of options. 18 19 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you for that,

MS. TAYLOR: Thank you for that, and I think that's something that we should consider very closely, because it's a really good idea. I'm not sure where it goes --

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	MR. HENDERSON: I'm not either.
2	MS. TAYLOR: but I think it is
3	a really good idea. Thank you for that. Ron?
4	MR. GRZYWINSKI: If I may, with
5	all due respect, I would like to say what Wade
6	has said in slightly different terms, if I
7	may. The feeling here, my feeling to be
8	precise, is like there's a revolution going on
9	over there. As the President pointed out
10	yesterday, we had an election, and the people
11	spoke. And there is a revolution that is
12	getting started. It feels like we're here
13	having tea and crumpets while that revolution
14	is getting started. This committee is about
15	economic inclusion, okay? And there is going
16	to be legislation on new regulatory mechanisms
17	that's going to come out of the House or
18	wherever it's going to come out of, okay? Is
19	anybody thinking that any part of that ought
20	to deal with how providers of services to low-
21	income people are part of that legislation,
22	okay? If we have people in treasury saying,

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

NEAL R. GROSS

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

you know, 2,000 community banks are going to 1 fail, don't worry too much about it, okay? 2 We're going to make sure that the big banks, 3 the same people who brought us our problems 4 are going to survive and continue, okay? 5 Whereas the capacity to service the people 6 7 that we're talking about and inclusion rests more with the smaller banks, the community 8 banks, etc. You know, I don't hang out in 9 10 this town, okay? So I don't really know what goes on here. But the point is --11 MS. FUCHS: You're just a country 12 13 lawyer. MR. GRZYWINSKI: Pardon? 14 FUCHS: You're just a country 15 MS. lawyer. 16 I'm 17 MR. GRZYWINSKI: just а country boy from the South Side of Chicago. 18 MS. FUCHS: We knew that. 19 Born and raised. 20 MR. GRZYWINSKI: So it feels like we're just, this is an 21 important moment, okay? These next several 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

211

(202) 234-4433

1 months are important times, and it feels like we do have a mandate as a committee, okay, of 2 the FDIC, okay? You know, if most of these 3 small banks are marketing towards your clients 4 of the FDIC, if I was going to lose --5 But if I was going to lose a fourth 6 7 of my market, okay, I might have an opinion about that. So it seems like it's within our 8 mandate, but we're not quite coming to grips 9 10 with it the way we should at what I think is a

I quess I'm more of MR. McDONALD: 12 13 a direct person. I agree with everything that's been said, and I would like to suggest 14 strongly that the recommendations, or some of 15 16 the recommendations that we've heard over the last four to six meetings, I mean, we've got a 17 lot of information here over the last four to 18 19 six times that we've met. And I think it is our duty and responsibility to perhaps look at 20 gathering this information, and coming up with 21 a number of policy decisions that we should 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

historic moment.

11

ask the chair and the vice-chair of the FDIC 1 2 to put forth as policy issues for this new administration to consider. I agree with the 3 fact that, first of all, if we are looking at 4 this huge number of unbanked individuals that 5 all of these banks, large and small, 6 are 7 dealing with, if we take a look at the subprime market, the sub-prime market is a result 8 of the community not being properly educated 9 10 on the financial side of this economy. So it does affect the FDIC. It affects the Federal 11 It affects the entire economy in Reserve. 12 13 which we live in today. So I think it's very, very important for us to look at some of these 14 overriding issues and come out with a few 15 policies that we should suggest. So I said 16 earlier that I'm more direct, and I don't 17 think we should let this opportunity pass us. 18 19 MS. TAYLOR: Can Ι just say I totally agree with you, and as 20 something? chair of this august 21 the group, and а consensus builder, I think it would be really 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

interesting if we could work with the FDIC 1 2 staff to come up with some recommendations, not just - I think you're absolutely right -3 just for the FDIC, which is what we've 4 not been doing up until now, things have been 5 happening within the FDIC, but in the greater 6 And if we could -- I think we've 7 context. heard a lot of really good policy ideas here, 8 and I can envision working with the FDIC staff 9 10 to come up with a letter that we could all sign and send to the appropriate members of 11 12 Congress and the Treasury and Regulatory 13 Committee. So, and I'm hoping -- I think for the most part we are enough on the same page, 14 15 and obviously everybody isn't here. And I'd 16 like to have the chair's input also on this, which I think is very important. But I think 17 that's a really good idea. 18 19 MS. WRIGHT: I came in a little I may have missed some 20 late, so important context, but having served in government 21 _ _

how do I say this appropriately?

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 214

(202) 234-4433

22

1 MS. TAYLOR: Just come out with 2 it. MS. WRIGHT: There are things, well, 3 4 when Ι reported to, when Ι was Housing Commissioner, I reported to Mayor Guiliani the 5 notion of my own commission coming up with 6 7 some recommendations that may or may not be on reservation would 8 the not have been And so there are some things --9 appreciated. this is an official relationship between us 10 and the FDIC, and there are some things that 11 the FDIC can recommend, but there are also 12 13 things that would be better recommended by individuals that have a strong point of view. 14 15 And so there may well be, to be fair to our 16 chair and the folks here at FDIC, I think there may be a line beyond which they are not 17 appropriately to go, and it doesn't mean that 18 19 we can't go further. But I think we should be respectful of that. 20 MR. RYAN: I don't know if this is 21 something that the FDIC would be looking to 22 **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 do, but being in this town I sort of sense 2 that, I don't feel the revolution yet. There are a lot of things going on right now in the 3 4 reshaping of our financial industry, but 5 they're putting out fires, and maybe not necessarily thinking of the consequences of 6 7 some of the things they're doing. You know, from where I sit in the bank regulatory world, 8 consolidating industry that 9 we're an may 10 result in a much larger swath of unbanked or inadequately banked individuals that's an even 11 more global guestion. What I would ask is, 12 13 perhaps as Bob Steel had appeared before this group, that maybe we would be able to have a 14 15 dialogue to discuss with Treasury or some of 16 the administration, and be able to share some of our thinking. And again, I fully respect 17 that that may not be the function of this 18 19 group, what the FDIC is looking or to accomplish, but --20 MS. TAYLOR: There's this group, 21 and then there are the individuals who are a 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

part of this group, which will do what we see fit.

MR. HENDERSON: Let me say, first 3 of all, Deborah, I completely agree with you. 4 I mean, the nature of consensus is such that 5 anyone can object. And therefore consensus is 6 7 not achieved, and you can be blocked from doing anything. Certainly nothing I would 8 propose would be done independent of the chair 9 10 and the vice-chair. They would have to weigh They would have to consider it. this. 11 They would have to determine whether this 12 was 13 appropriate from their perspective, whether they were comfortable with it. Obviously, if 14 we were to make recommendations as an advisory 15 16 committee, it would reflect on their leadership, and they obviously have to take 17 that into account in determining whether it's 18 19 appropriate or inappropriate, and to whom, with whom it would be communicated. Certainly 20 as individuals we can all make recommendations 21 regarding policy, and you'll have that kind of 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

1 impact.

2	But I guess my point is this.
3	First of all, I think it's a question that
4	they should consider, and I'm proposing that
5	they do so, so that's number one. Number two,
6	anything that is objectionable, I mean, if
7	there is no consensus, there isn't. So we
8	would not do something as the collective body,
9	but I think we would have made a mistake not
10	to discuss it, which is why I wanted to
11	present it here in the context of a
12	conversation. You know, we in the civil
13	rights community, which has obviously a
14	broader interest, we share national concerns,
15	but we are not specialized professionals in
16	the banking world. And yet I am clear that
17	there needs to be an opportunity impact
18	assessment of every expenditure that is being
19	made now, under TARP and under the stimulus
20	plan, that speaks to the concerns that we
21	share in common of the constituencies we
22	represent. When the dust clears, if left to

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

(202) 234-4433

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 its own devices, I'm convinced that the 2 constituencies we represent will have the short end of the stick on almost every issue 3 where a policy question is placed on the table 4 about who pays, who's responsible for helping 5 dig us out of this mess. And I have, you 6 7 know, without disparaging any of the leaders who are currently in positions of 8 responsibility, I'm very confident that they 9 10 share the concern that we share about making certain that the country is righted in an 11 I think the opportunity is 12 appropriate way. 13 too great to ignore, and so again, I'm simply suggesting that perhaps, in an appropriate 14 15 setting, there be some discussion about the 16 kinds of things that either we can recommend or the chair or the vice chair can recommend 17 on behalf of the FDIC, but we're seeking to 18 19 amplify our voices, their voices, and so that's really the purpose behind it. 20 MS. McINERNY: Madam Chair, I don't 21

22

NEAL R. GROSS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

know if it would be helpful. I don't want to

(202) 234-4433

interrupt the discussion, but I was thinking in terms of just the advisory committee charter, and what it says about the goals of the committee and so forth.

1

2

3

4

5 MS. TAYLOR: No, I think that 6 would be entirely appropriate, because the 7 topic of this discussion right here is -- it 8 facilitates a discussion on how to amplify and 9 promote, so I think that's very much on point.

10 MS. McINERNY: Looking at the charter, the charge of this committee is to 11 provide advice and recommendations to the FDIC 12 13 on initiatives to expand access to banking services by underserved populations 14 _ _ SO 15 advice and recommendations. There's nothing 16 in the charter that says the advice has to be consensus advice. So if the committee members 17 decide that they want to provide some sort of 18 19 advice on a document, or options, or anything in writing, that's certainly something you 20 could do if the committee were to decide that. 21 And under the charter also, FDIC staff is 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

able to facilitate and provide support in terms of helping you all communicate, and things like that, typing things up, things like that.

As a start, I think 5 MS. TAYLOR: it would be very helpful for FDIC staff to, as 6 7 I'm sure they're going to do anywise, compile what we've heard today in terms of 8 recommendations and serving the underserved, 9 10 and maybe fashion it into something that we could all sign and send to the appropriate 11 people on the Hill, for starters, and I'm sure 12 13 that there are a lot of other ways that we could do this. Do you have anything you want 14 to say? 15

VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: Well 16 first, I mean, I don't want to preempt the 17 Chairman, but I don't think I am here. 18 You 19 know, we set up an advisory committee to get ideas from the advisory committee. 20 So the notion that all would 21 you want to make recommendations is not -- so it strikes me 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	what you're suggesting is entirely appropriate
2	and consistent with the charter creating the
3	advisory group. And you know, it's an
4	exceptional group of people with a wide array
5	of backgrounds and expertise that you could
6	bring to the subject, and I don't see why we
7	wouldn't want the group to develop a set of
8	recommendations that you could provide to us,
9	and let us provide to a broader audience, as
10	well. So that's I guess the Chairman would
11	agree with that, but I don't want to
12	MS. TAYLOR: I'm sure she would.
12 13	MS. TAYLOR: I'm sure she would. MR. TUFANO: I think one of the
13	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the
13 14	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is
13 14 15	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is that there's no line out there that says, FDIC
13 14 15 16	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is that there's no line out there that says, FDIC here, and the rest of the world there. So
13 14 15 16 17	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is that there's no line out there that says, FDIC here, and the rest of the world there. So we've seen, you know, when we talked about
13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is that there's no line out there that says, FDIC here, and the rest of the world there. So we've seen, you know, when we talked about mortgages, that some of the problems in the
13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MR. TUFANO: I think one of the things we've seen in the six or so meetings is that there's no line out there that says, FDIC here, and the rest of the world there. So we've seen, you know, when we talked about mortgages, that some of the problems in the mortgage area were not in FDIC banks, but

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 businesses, as well. So as we think about 2 these recommendations, to the extent that we're going to be thinking broadly in terms of 3 affecting policy, I think one can be focused 4 just on the FDIC, but I think that would be a 5 missed opportunity, because if our focus is on 6 7 the underserved, starting from the consumer's perspective, then you'd want to think across 8 those businesses. So for example, we heard 9 10 today that when payday lending goes away, title lending pops These all 11 up. are interconnected businesses, and the more that 12 13 we can give -- to the extent that it's appropriate to give policy advice, which I 14 15 think it is, then we should try to make sure 16 that we're not parochially, you know, just focused on bank related policy advice. 17 Now whoever hears this advice is free to discard 18 19 it. But on the other hand, I think that's the appropriate way to think. Think in terms of 20 functions, and then think of the policies with 21 respect to functions. So as an example of 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 that, you might say, we believe that everyone 2 should have access to a low cost, low risk payment system alternative. And that could 3 come through an FDIC bank, or through a credit 4 union, or perhaps through a non-bank entity. 5 But I think if we're making clear what we're 6 7 trying to achieve, then it might frame some of these policy things better, because we need 8 consistency across policies. 9 10 MR. BOSTON: I want to follow up on your point, but first I want 11 to say, if there's a revolution going on, Sheila is 12 at 13 the head of it. We should keep that in mind,

in a good way. So I think a lot of things are
happening, and a lot of the things that we
talked about are being discussed at other
places, and we're all proud of her work.

But one of my concerns is that many 18 19 of the people who are banked today may be unbanked tomorrow. So I think we should also 20 in mind about the 21 keep new unserved or underserved that are about to be created. 22 And

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1	so we just cannot think about those we call
2	low-, moderate-income, and think they're the
3	only ones that we should be protecting. We
4	have millions of people who are so-called
5	middle class who are going to be low class or
6	unemployed or whatever you want very quickly,
7	and this will impact the banking community.
8	So when we're thinking about our policies,
9	let's not say it's just for those folks over
10	there. It's for all Americans who are at
11	risk, and today that's millions of Americans.
12	So I just want to keep that in mind.
12 13	So I just want to keep that in mind. MR. MOONEY: In response, this
13	MR. MOONEY: In response, this
13 14	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the
13 14 15	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the Chairman asked before she left, which was to
13 14 15 16	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the Chairman asked before she left, which was to increase the success of small dollar loans
13 14 15 16 17	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the Chairman asked before she left, which was to increase the success of small dollar loans with more incentives. Two, she was intrigued
13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the Chairman asked before she left, which was to increase the success of small dollar loans with more incentives. Two, she was intrigued by an affirmative requirement for basic
13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MR. MOONEY: In response, this discussion seems to be aligned with what the Chairman asked before she left, which was to increase the success of small dollar loans with more incentives. Two, she was intrigued by an affirmative requirement for basic savings and checking accounts. So we are

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

staff could research. You're right. There's not a plethora of recommendations out there concerning unbanked programs relative to the federal programs we're seeing now, but there are some that cross my desk. And even if we collate those, and present them for consideration, that would be useful.

MS. TAYLOR: I think it's bigger 8 I think it's, you know, the big 9 than that. 10 issue is underserved populations, and how do you serve them in financial services, in the 11 financial services arena, which brings 12 in 13 everything from protection against fraud, to education, to the actual services that are 14 15 offered, to -- and that's fraud from within and without the system, too. The thing that 16 we were discussing before is that, you know, 17 there are some victims, but some of these 18 19 victims weren't really victims. They were victims of their own egregious actions trying 20 to take advantage of a system which finally 21 stopped housing prices 22 when mortgages or

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

1 stopped going up. So I think that we can 2 with the recommendation start regarding underserved populations, or to be underserved 3 populations and their interaction within the 4 financial services 5 sector, and then what financial institutions can do to alleviate 6 7 that, and what the regulators can do to assist the financial institutions in alleviating some 8 of those problems, and bringing services that 9 10 people can actually use based on real data and information. And one of the things that we 11 were discussing before, it is very interesting 12 13 to hear what some people had to say about I mean, savings accounts 14 savings accounts. 15 have been sort of the holy grail. Everybody 16 should have a savings account. Well, maybe, 17 maybe not. Maybe it works, and maybe it doesn't. So you know, I think that we've got 18 19 some more research to do there, too, or a recommendation would be to research that some 20 21 more.

MR. McDONALD: I would like to just

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

expand on what Kelvin said at that end. 1 With effort to perhaps enhance 2 the thought an gathering information, processing, the 3 statement basically made reference 4 Kelvin's to, that is not only the unbanked/underbanked 5 to that -- tomorrow, it's going to be middle 6 7 America, because they are unemployed. So when I think in terms of just that statement alone, 8 it brings me back to a comment that I made 9 10 earlier, and Jim Young also made the comment, and we had no discussion on this. As a matter 11 of fact, he wasn't even here when I made the 12 13 comment about how do we get it into the education system. And from a broad point of 14 view, the sub-prime market is a result, and 15 that crossed all lines, middle America, etc., 16 because of a lack of education on the issue of 17 finance. Jim Young made the comment that, if 18 19 we taught home economics or whatever in the school system, why not have this to be part of 20 the curriculum? We've had individuals to lose 21 money in the investment community where they 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

thought they were part of this whole billion 1 dollar investment company, and it was because 2 perhaps of a lack of education in some sense. 3 4 So this goes across the entire spectrum. So my point is, from a broader perspective, and 5 from a policy point of view, looking at the 6 7 issues that we've been faced with just by about the underbanked talking and the 8 unbanked, this issue is much broader. 9 It goes 10 to the whole community. So from a policy point of view, perhaps we should talk in terms, or 11 look at the possibility of having something 12 13 put in the education system, which is beyond And when we talk about -- that the FDIC. 14 15 perhaps recommendations on how the FDIC could 16 encourage banks to help people who are not banked to be banked, I think it's 17 а much broader issue. So Ι just wanted to re-18 19 emphasize the fact that we're talking about broader policies, and I wanted to at 20 least give that as an example as to perhaps how far 21 our thought process should go in developing 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	some of the recommendations, some of the
2	observations, because the staff in the last
3	five or six meetings, and Bob, the number of
4	people you had to present. It's a wealth of
5	information, a wealth of information and
6	there's some common denominators, and one
7	common denominator is the educational aspect.
8	MR. BECK: If I could comment on
9	that, since I represent that financial
10	education community. I was very struck by a
11	couple of things this morning. First of all,
12	I applaud the banks that presented. And if
13	you look at the financial education programs
14	that are out there, there's a really wide
15	range of quality. And what I appreciated
16	about the banks today was that they were
17	volunteering their time to enhance the
18	experience in the classroom in supporting a
19	teacher. That is a long way from passing out
20	a brochure. So I think you saw some best-in-
21	class today. But I want to throw in a couple
22	of cautions. And this is just from our world.

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 It's a lot more than just a class. There are 2 very good high school programs that are available from the non-profit 3 community, 4 including the program from the FDIC. There's high quality things 5 out there that some 6 schools can adopt and are adopting and without the banks and the credit unions' support, that 7 wouldn't happen. There's an interesting 8 couple of statistics for you. There's roughly 9 40 states that have some sort of financial 10 There's less than ten that education mandate. 11 far 12 anything about it as as trying to do 13 measure the quality. The one thing they all have in common is they have no funding. 14 So, 15 recommendations from my world, including the 16 President's Counsel on Financial Literary, is to create a mandate for schools to make sure 17 included, because it can be that this is 18 19 included in a lot of different categories. But the caution I think we have to throw out 20 in pursuing this, which is I think a great 21 idea, is that one class is not an inoculation. 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

1 And just because you've finished that class 2 doesn't mean you're good to go for the rest of your life. So it's a foundation that I happen 3 to think is critical. So I strongly support 4 But it's an ongoing process if we really 5 it. want people to avoid having the problems we're 6 7 seeing. So one class won't do it. But a the continuous process from financial 8 community, from the FDIC, lot 9 from а of 10 different points, will help keep people out of This is not something that stops trouble. 11 when you finish 12th grade. So just a word of 12 13 caution that I wish it was that easy that we could just send somebody out of high school 14 15 saying, you're good. The rules will never 16 change during your economic life. So don't worry about it. 17 MS. TAYLOR: Ester? 18 19 MR. FUCHS: Yes, I just wanted to go back to Alden's general point. 20 I know he used education as an example. I just think that 21 the whole idea also that this is 22 а **NEAL R. GROSS**

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

> > WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 particularly critical moment in which we can 2 have an impact is very important. And what I would like to see happen in this effort to 3 4 come up with proposals is essentially а linkage between the issues that we've been 5 discussing over the last year of the 6 ___ 7 underserved community -- and the ones that are now being dealt with in the broader financial 8 crisis out there. This is an opportunity to 9 put this problem and this issue sort of center 10 stage. It's not really peripheral. It's just 11 -- it now can be viewed as symptomatic. 12 You 13 know, as you pointed out, there's going to be a lot more people underserved, a lot more 14 with this problem that usually is 15 people viewed as a sideline, or a sidebar, or it's 16 just a sort of special group of people who are 17 interested in this population. It's not a 18 19 sidebar anymore. It's really the main event. And a lot of the proposals that have been 20 discussed in this committee really relate to 21 larger issues of what will regulatory 22 the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

look like, what kinds of 1 reform incentives 2 will we put on the table over the long term for banks and other financial institutions to 3 their behavior at 4 change the neighborhood So I would like to see this structured 5 level? 6 linking, this question of the what do we do 7 for this population, with how this is part of the larger fix to the financial crisis that 8 we're in. And I think that we would have 9 10 better traction that way, and of course that's, insofar as Sheila can use this, I 11 12 think, as part of what her agenda has been 13 coming out of the FDIC, I think everybody understands that the FDIC is not going to be 14 15 the implementer of all of the solutions to the 16 current problem. But it is, she has been, and the FDIC has been a very important voice now, 17 and Ι think can help reinforce the 18 we 19 credibility that they already have in that debate by creating this kind of linkage, 20 and not sort of staying as a sidebar 21 to the conversation. 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

1 MS. WARREN: Thank you. I apologize for having to miss the whole morning. 2 I had to testify, and I was assured it would be very 3 4 short. It was not. But this is important, and that's why I wanted to come back and be 5 here, and especially for this meeting. I just 6 7 want to make one point as we start drawing this together, and that is, we talk about what 8 are, in effect, the discreet recommendations. 9 10 They may be open-ended when we talk about education, but we're talking about a series of 11 I think we, fairly discreet recommendations. 12 13 because you rarely get this many good people together, really need to spend a minute on the 14 15 notion that there's a systemic problem here. 16 I think back to, I think it was our first meeting, and PROSPER presented to us. 17 Do you remember? And the whole notion of maybe there 18 19 would be this new form that would intersect with small loan lending, and what could that 20 mean, and people-to-people, and I'm sure most 21 of the people in this room know it's been shut 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

down, as have its two competing entities, business models, by the SEC, because it turns out there was an argument that this was an investment vehicle, rather than the way we saw it, which was people-to-people small loan access.

MS. TAYLOR: I see no one is making a comment on where the SEC ought to be spending their time.

10 MS. WARREN: I thought it was, I felt safer knowing that PROSPER had been shut 11 down at the very time that Bernie Madoff was 12 13 still going forward. But I think back to our early meetings on foreclosure. I think back 14 15 to the data and the warnings, and frankly, I 16 think how quaint they look even six months terms of how very serious 17 later in this problem has turned out to be. I think about 18 19 Kelvin's point on what job loss is going to do to people, what losing homes is going to do to 20 people, and how that intersects with financial 21 services, and how financial services will be 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1 called on in ways that had not been called on before, how people who had been able to manage 2 under financial services, 3 one consumer financial services regime, may not be able to 4 manage under a new regime. So all of this 5 6 reminds me that it is a dynamic process out 7 there. It's moving, and it's moving very, I think that Esther's point's very fast. 8 The window may be open for a brief 9 right. 10 period of time to do something here, but I just want to be clear, there's no one who 11 advocates on behalf of consumers, on financial 12 13 products on a systematic basis. There is no one whose portfolio, when you open it up, says 14 15 right up at the top, consumers, customers, 16 people, families are the first thing we have to worry about, and we have some ability, some 17 agenda to look at different financial products 18 19 across the spectrum, because families don't silos 20 live these, in the of regulatory agencies. 21

22

Checking accounts in one silo, and

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 237

(202) 234-4433

1 fee for services in another, and mortgages 2 somewhere else, they just don't work that way. And so I just suggest that there's been a 3 4 real advantage to the fact that we have an Environmental Protection Agency that attracts 5 the people who are interested in this issue, 6 7 who have a broad portfolio to go forward on behalf of environmental issues, whether it's 8 air, whether it's whether 9 water, it's 10 particulates, whether it's -they have а it. really broad way to look 11 at Ι am heartened by the fact that we have a Food and 12 13 Drug Administration that does this. T am heartened by the fact that we have a Consumer 14 15 Product Safety Commission that does this, and 16 I just want to say, at some point, we need to think about this question of whether there 17 should be something similar for consumers when 18 19 we're thinking about financial products. Consumers are left naked in this world 20 in someone to think and advocate on 21 terms of their behalf in a systemic way. And God bless 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

Sheila, 1 the regulators, like who have 2 certainly moved them up in the portfolio. But the bottom line is, it's fractured oversight, 3 4 it's regulatory competition that creates forms caused effective 5 of arbitrage that have regulation to become a null set, in some 6 7 cases. And this is our moment, statutorily speaking, and if we spend it advocating for 8 ten specific changes, and then congratulate 9 10 ourselves that we made a difference, and it will make some difference, but it's a short 11 term, non-systemic difference. 12 And that means 13 that all the changes will keep occurring, and five years from now, ten years 14 from now, 15 twenty years from now, if we have someone as 16 interested as Sheila, our successors will be back in this room talking about a whole new 17 set of problems that have emerged, and no 18 19 one's been there to watch out for the just wanted to put on 20 consumer. So I the table that should be thinking 21 we about systemic change, not just discreet changes. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

(202) 234-4433

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 Thank you.

2	MS. TAYLOR: If you want to, and
3	Marty, you know a lot more about how these
4	things work than I do, but to do something
5	such as you're talking about, which I think is
6	an absolute fabulous idea, which is I think
7	what you're saying basically is create a
8	federal agency, or cabinet position, or
9	whatever you want to call it, for consumers in
10	the financial services arena.
11	MS. WARREN: Yes.
12	MS. TAYLOR: And I think that
13	that's definitely worth advocating for. I
14	don't know how fast it would happen, but I
15	think there's some things that you can do to
16	almost create the same thing without, you
17	know, waiting for somebody to create a cabinet
18	position. And one of the things that I worked
19	on very hard when I was a banking
20	superintendent was, you know, we saw what was
21	going on in the mortgage industry, which was -
22	- and you know, when I first started there,

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 like two weeks later, the Comptroller of the 2 Currency basically advocated all state lending and depository rules for banking institutions. 3 Just a little bit of a shock. 4 And so you could see right there that there were a lot of 5 6 things that were going to fall through the 7 cracks that had to do with consumers. You know, the whole mortgage industry, check 8 cashing, money transmitting, all the rest of 9 10 it that had very, very uneven regulation, but huge impacts the most vulnerable 11 had on So what we did, I went to the 12 consumers. 13 Treasury Secretary at the time, which was John Snow, and said, look, you know, there's all 14 15 this stuff that's going to fall through the 16 cracks, why don't you, Mr. Treasury so Secretary, put together a committee which has 17 the top of each of the agencies that touches 18 19 financial services in it meet on a regular basis to talk some of the issues through, 20 because if one of these entities is convinced 21 to issue a regulation on something, it really 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 doesn't matter, because there are all these 2 other institutions that don't have to worry about this one agency. So why don't we come 3 up with some things that all the agencies can 4 do together? And I don't know what happened 5 to that. I don't think it lasted very long. 6 7 MR. RYAN: The first time Т 8 mentioned mortgage brokers, they never met again. 9 10 MS. TAYLOR: Yes, okay. Fine. MR. RYAN: And that's something, 11 that's a lesson that I think we need to, in 12 13 this dialogue to consider, that Washington has its own issues, and you cannot expect it to 14 15 answer everything. It becomes so compromised, 16 someone who's spent 20 years on all of as And the more you consolidate this 17 this. industry, the more compromised it gets. 18 And 19 we have an FTC. We have things that have been gutted, and you have to think of the history 20 of those things. 21 22 MS. WARREN: The answer can't be, we

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

can't make things better, because if the answer is, we can't things better, I'm going to go do something else. I'm not going to spend the rest of the afternoon here.

No, the thing is, 5 MS. TAYLOR: though, that there are ways to do this, and we 6 7 need to figure out -- I think we're all agreed that we need to do something here, and what we 8 need to discuss now is how to do it, and the 9 10 probabilities of success, and how do you get people on board, and advocate for it, and that 11 sort of thing. So I think there are a bunch 12 13 of different ways. I think your ideas are really fair minded. So we need to figure out 14 how to work it. 15

MR. HENDERSON: Well Madam Chair, 16 first of all thank you for entertaining this 17 conversation. It's useful, and 18 your 19 leadership in providing us with a forum where we're comfortable about having a discussion 20 like this is much appreciated, so thank you. 21

MS. TAYLOR: However --

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

22

1

2

3

4

1 MR. HENDERSON: No, no, it's not a 2 Secondly, again I think that we are however. given a unique opportunity. I mean again, the 3 challenge, the crisis is certainly real, and 4 it's there, it's palpable, people see it, and 5 it's actually deepening. It's getting worse 6 7 in many respects. То have an advisory committee named for economic inclusion to have 8 been created by the FDIC is really quite 9 fortuitous in terms of being able to consider 10 a range of options. I think, without making a 11 commitment to any particular course of action, 12 13 to give us a charge of being expansive in our thinking so that we take advantage of the 14 15 assembled work and experience of this very 16 diverse group, it seems to create many 17 opportunities. Now Ι happen to like Elizabeth's recommendation, because I think it 18 19 makes sense, and having seen lesser efforts, you know, there's something within the civil 20 rights arena, an Office of Coordination and 21 It's in the Department of Justice. Review. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 It is given the responsibility of coordinating 2 various civil rights enforcement activities among a variety of agencies. It's been an 3 4 utter failure. Now part of it has of course been the responsibility of who is in charge. 5 So who, the decider, makes a difference, okay? 6 7 So without, you know, spending a lot of time on that, there has to be another way of 8 institutionalizing of 9 а set changes and 10 recommendations that could be helpful. So without, you know, reaching any conclusions, I 11 this is simply think conversation worth 12 13 having. I think there are a variety of could that be the table, 14 proposals on 15 certainly Elizabeth's is one, and I think it's a sufficiently large idea, such that it speaks 16 to the value of a group like this. I think the 17 recommendations of the staff, in terms of 18 19 thinking through a set of proposals that fall, or recommendations that fall under that would 20 be very helpful. And you have a broad charge. 21 And again, I think this issue of 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 consensus, Deborah, I want to go back to that, because nothing that has been proposed is 2 intended to foreclose the fact that we won't 3 agree on everything. And if we don't, I think 4 we should be frank about that, and as you 5 said, Roberta, thank you, we don't have a 6 7 consensus requirement, but I think amonq You know, as people of integrity, ourselves. 8 should respect the differences that 9 we we 10 have. I think consensus is a very useful It takes a long time sometimes to tool. 11 achieve that result, but I think you get a buy 12 13 in and support that enables us to take those voices and amplify them many times over. 14 So 15 that I know, as Elizabeth is carrying out her responsibilities with TARP, as I'm meeting 16 with various, you know, offices within this 17 area, I bring a different perspective, as do 18 19 my colleagues. We can be, you know, we can amplify the impact of the FDIC's work from the 20 advice that we might provide in ways that I 21 think will be very useful. So that's really, 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 I think, the charge.

2	MR. RYAN: And I would fully agree
3	with Peter's comments in taking a broad look
4	at the industry. Someone who comes from the
5	state side, I think we do need to look at all
6	those components, what's the appropriate role
7	of federal rules, how they mesh together, and
8	how we provide an adequate, comprehensive
9	consumer protection. I strongly advocate for
10	that.
11	MR. EAKES: So I wanted to just add
12	to the systemic some very specific proposals,
13	and see whether that would be something that
14	made sense. We talked about whether or not,
15	to make lifeline accounts, or something that's
16	a very low cost account mandatory, which seems
17	hard. I mean, it's hard to figure out how to
18	do that exactly, but what you could do is FDIC
19	by itself could publicize a list of the banks
20	that had the highest percentage of their total
21	checking accounts that met this low fee, low
22	transaction cost model, and you know, we're

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 all competitive. We want to be at the top of 2 whatever list gets done, and I think that we'll have a -- there's some way we could use 3 4 that, you know, whether it's CRA credit, or publicizing, or carrots and sticks, I think 5 that comparing it to the other accounts, 6 7 assuming that we're not yet able to get rid of some of the fees that I'd like to get rid of, 8 which is the second proposal, and that is -9 10 Michael Barr mentioned it - the proposal to have overdraft fees counted under Truth in 11 Lending, which was a proposal that the Federal 12 13 Reserve looked at. They specifically reserved the right to come back and look at it again. 14 15 It's been long enough that this committee and 16 the FDIC weighing in could make real а difference. 17

very specific proposal Α third 18 19 would be that we recommend an expansion of the rate ceiling was 20 36 percent interest that adopted two or three years ago for military 21 families under the Talent-Nelson Amendment. 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 You know, as Wade has pointed out a dozen 2 times to me, if you have military members who were unable to be deployed because they were 3 considered a security risk because they had 4 payday loans that were putting them under 5 stress, the same kind of issue applies for 6 7 policemen, and teachers, and firemen, and nurses, and folks who are under stress because 8 they've got these very high interest loans. 9 10 And you know, there are bills being discussed. This was something during the FDR period that, 11 you know, there was a movement to put 12 an interest rate ceiling, 13 and once you have something like that, then all of the 14 15 institutions are put on a level playing field so that they actually, if it makes sense to 16 say a checking account really should have a 17 \$3.00 or \$4.00 a month monthly fee, 18 that 19 that's what it really does cost, rather than advertising that we have free checking, 20 and the ten percent at the bottom of the pay every 21 month end up paying all of the costs from 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1 penalty fees on overdrafts. We could change 2 the financial services environment with that proposal very, very quickly. Title lending 3 4 would have to conform on car loans. Payday lending would have to conform to a lower rate. 5 And it seems like we might be able to get all 6 7 three of those done. So mine are much more pedestrian than Elizabeth's, but it might 8 supplement by having very specific things --9 10 those three things I think we could do, and would make a real difference. 11

Actually, another 12 MS. TAYLOR: 13 concrete thing, too, which we talked about several years ago, if you recall, John, is 14 15 having sort of a consumer national 311 number, 16 where anybody who had a question about а financial services question could call, and 17 somebody there would tell them where they 18 19 could go to get the answer. Because as the of 20 superintendent the Estate Banking Department, it's incredible how many people 21 didn't know who -- and why would they -- who 22

> COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

NEAL R. GROSS

(202) 234-4433

1	the supervisor for their particular financial
2	institution is. So I mean that would go I
3	mean, I think that would go a long way,
4	because people could then, they would have one
5	place that they could go and get the
6	information that they needed to make
7	intelligent decisions about things.
8	MR. EAKES: Being a pedestrian, if
9	you don't own a car is okay.
10	MS. TAYLOR: Deborah?
11	MS. WRIGHT: I think just putting
12	Elizabeth's proposal on the table would create
13	such incredible national dialogue, which is
14	what we need to have to put the consumer right
15	on the table, and have to have every part of
16	Washington respond to that, because that's
17	really what needs to happen. We've been
18	having these conversations in silos and,
19	whether it happened in that forum or not, I
20	think it would force everybody to deal with
21	the issue.
22	I had a smaller question on your
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

1	proposal, and there's no doubt you know the
2	answer to this: what does the Consumer
3	Protection Agency do? Because undoubtedly,
4	you're going to have a series of people, maybe
5	me included as the taxpayer, so the last thing
6	we need is another agency. So what do they do
7	now, and is it possible to reform? I think
8	we're going to have to think about sort of the
9	little "p" politics of how we'll actually get
10	something done as opposed to just a dialogue.
11	MS. WARREN: The Consumer Product
12	Safety Commission right now does physical
13	products. So basically, between the Consumer
14	Product Safety Commission, the Department of
15	Agriculture, the Food and Drug Administration,
16	maybe a couple more, literally everything you
17	touch, everything you taste, everything you
18	smell, is checked for safety at some level.
19	Not always perfectly. We know there have been
20	some terrible problems with underfunding. But
21	the point is, there's someone there who has it
22	as their first responsibility, and someone to

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

hold accountable if they fail to do it. 1 That 2 is not so with financial products. And I think the time for that -- I just want to make 3 4 one other just very small point. In this 5 context, we put the Consumer Product Safety Commission in effect back in the 70s, and the 6 7 Nixon Administration was the first administration that embraced it, and said, 8 we're going to have this thing together at a 9 10 time when we had usury laws that were solid and strong at the state level. There were 11 some state variation, but they were effective 12 13 at the state level all across the country. And so it would be quite reasonable to say we 14 15 found another deal with way to consumer financial products. We have usury laws in 16 effect. We kicked the tent pole out on usury 17 It's gone. And so the center thing 18 laws. 19 that held us up and said, nobody's going to go 20 above whatever was your state usury law all in, so that there wasn't a reason to do these 21 long deceptive contracts, because you 22 just

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 never could get above where the usury cap was. 2 Once you kick that out, and don't put anything else in its place, that's how we end 3 up with what we've got. And so I just mention 4 it by way of kind of the history. I think if 5 we'd been in the 1970s where we are today on 6 7 financial products, I think at the same time we did a consumer physical product safety 8 commission, we probably would have done 9 а 10 consumer financial product safety commission. Wether they would have been separate, whether 11 they would have been the same agency, I don't 12 13 know. But I don't think anybody looked around and said, gee, we don't care about your money, 14 we only care about these other issues. 15

MR. BOSTON: I just want to say, I 16 17 support your proposal, but Ι support it because, right now, with all the 18 new 19 regulation, and everything that's coming 20 about, and there's going to be а lot of relates to what's 21 changes as it going on. Most of 22 us are trying to put the

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

www.nealrgross.com

(202) 234-4433

1 responsibility on the consumer. No one is 2 asking any financial institution to be more responsible about what they present to the 3 4 consumer. Nor are we asking our government to make sure that we have responsible products 5 given. Part of our problem right now is that 6 7 many people thought that what they were being sold was something that was indeed backed up, 8 9 supported in some by the Federal way 10 Government. That they allowed -- this product would not be available to us as a consumer 11 unless somebody in the Federal Government has 12 13 said it was okay to be provided. So I think think about making sure that 14 we must our 15 financial institutions as a body, not banks 16 per se, but that we have responsible financial think that I support what 17 products, and I you're saying, because I think this will help 18 19 us get those types of responsibilities. In all fairness, I 20 MS. TAYLOR:

21 think that the individual regulators try to do 22 that with their regulated institutions. The

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

problem is that there are some that fall through the cracks, and some are better at doing it than others. But that -- I think, you know, in all fairness, that is something that regulators try to do. However, effectively is a different story.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7 MR. RYAN: And I think that's where you need some of the checks and balances, and 8 something that's been helpful, imperfect as it 9 10 is, but at the state level, is we have a regulatory functions. But there's an AG who 11 investigations, 12 in, do take can come 13 enforcement actions. And what I've seen evolved at the federal level is, for instance, 14 the FTC had broad authority, but the banking 15 16 regulators got to carve out bank customers as to the purview of the bank regulator. And we 17 saw the bank regulators, to your point on the 18 19 usury laws, preempt, allow the lowest state law to preempt all the other state laws. 20 So it's -- I share your objective. 21 I come at this with some trepidation and a little bit of 22

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 cynicism about how, when you have one king, 2 know that is and Ι not what you are suggesting, but the challenges that 3 that 4 poses. MR. EAKES: There's no reason that 5

it has to be preemptive federal decision that states are left to be concurrent.

MR. RYAN: Absolutely not, but we've 8 seen it evolve over time, and so it's that 9 10 experience, once again, where these things were not supposed to be preemptive. We had --11 little pedantic here, 12 qet but with а 13 interstate banking and branching, that was clearly in the law. It says, this does not 14 15 preempt state consumer protection laws. And 16 that's where Ι see Washington working in certain ways that, when the spotlight's not 17 on, are troublesome. And you need some checks 18 19 on that. And so that is not a reason not to do anything, and not to try to address what we 20 all agree are serious problems. 21

22

6

7

MR. GRZYWINSKI: At the risk of

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 not saying anything that hasn't been said, 2 there's a saying, there's a quotation that people like to throw around in Chicago, which 3 4 goes back about 100 years or more, although probably more, from Daniel Burnham. 5 Make no small plans. Then you have the power to move 6 7 men's minds in the language of the day. But think of the -- if I may, think of key words 8 of our situation right now. Economic crisis, 9 10 okay, which means opportunity for change. from the electorate, okay, 11 Mandate means A president who is leading, okay? 12 momentum. 13 A committee here that says economic inclusion, says economic inclusion for 14 okay? It the FDIC. The FDIC is at the center of 15 the nation's economic system of banks, okay? 16 The FDIC has a leader who has been ahead of the 17 game at risk to herself, okay, and is leading 18 19 the charge, okay? We should be doing 20 everything we can to support and better arm that leader. We should seize the momentum, 21 okay, on behalf of the American family. 22 We

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

> > 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealrgross.com

should not think small thoughts, okay? 1 We 2 should not be satisfied with the leavings of the day, okay? We are talking about 3 the American middle class, everybody, okay? 4 And what we have in front of us is an opportunity 5 to try to create an economic safety net for 6 7 the American family. And while I'm not the expert, I would say, lastly, that the law 8 The Community Reinvestment Act 9 exists. is 10 written very, very broadly. The legislation is very broad, and there is a mandate here, I 11 would argue. More would argue perhaps against 12 13 But I think the pieces are there, the me. time is there, the need is there, and we ought 14 to think big enough thoughts. 15

MS. TAYLOR: If I could add one 16 thing to that, too. People talk about, as part 17 of financial markets today, that we have a 18 19 crisis of confidence, and the FDIC is all about confidence in the banking system, which 20 I would just add to what you just said, but 21 So I think that's just that we're here 22 yes.

> **NEAL R. GROSS** COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

1 to be used.

2	VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: Well, we
3	picked you guys because you are interesting
4	and provocative, and you haven't let us down.
5	(Laughter.)
6	VICE CHAIRMAN GRUENBERG: My only
7	cautionary word is that I really do think it's
8	unfortunate, it would have been helpful to
9	have the Chairman here to take part in this
10	conversation. And on her behalf, I would
11	obviously say we really need to bring this to
12	her attention, and sort of work it through
13	with her.
14	MR. MOONEY: We will follow
15	through, Madam Chairman, and do as Marty said,
16	and cover broader and less discreet
17	recommendations, everything we've heard here
18	today. Financial education, product safety
19	issues, and development of a product, consumer
20	financial product safety bureau recognition,
21	and Professor Warren and I have read every
22	word you have written on that subject. It's

NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

quite impressive. And we all have an interest in that, and exploring the incentives, so we will do as you suggest.

1

2

3

I'll talk to the 4 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman about ways that this committee could, 5 with the FDIC, do some of the things that 6 7 we've talked about here. And I think it would be useful for people to talk among themselves, 8 the things that Wade 9 too, some of was 10 suggesting, you know, how could we have a broader impact? 11

Well, if nobody has anything else, I think we're starting to lose people. So, thank you all.

15 MR. McDONALD: I would just like to make one comment for the record. It's been 16 said several times around the table about the 17 Chairman's role in bringing this issue to bear 18 19 some two and a half years ago, three years I want to not only congratulate her, but 20 ago. to congratulate the entire staff of the FDIC 21 in supporting this very, very important issue 22

> NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

that is touching the lives of millions of
 people.

3	This one issue has a significant
4	effect on the quality of life. And I just
5	want to say again that, thanks to the
6	leadership of the FDIC for bringing this issue
7	of economic inclusion to the table. We've
8	debated whether or not it was just for the
9	underbanked or unbanked. We now see how big
10	this picture is, and as Kelvin said, it's
11	America that this issue is touching. So I
12	would like to thank you guys once again for a
13	job well done.
14	MS. TAYLOR: Thank you.
15	(Whereupon, the above-entitled
16	matter was concluded at 2:54 p.m.)
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
	NEAL R. GROSS COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS
	1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. (202) 234-4433 WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701 www.nealrgross.com

1 2

3

NEAL R. GROSS

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS 1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W. WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

263