1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	WILLIAM BLUMENTHAL General Counsel GUY G. WARD DAVID A. O'TOOLE Federal Trade Commission 55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1825 Chicago, Illinois 60603 PH. (312) 960-5634 FAX (312) 960-5634 FAX (312) 960-5600 <u>gward@ftc.gov</u> dotoole@ftc.gov JOHN D. JACOBS, Cal. Bar No. 134154 Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Los Angeles, California 90024 PH. (310) 824-4343 FAX (310) 824-4340 ijacobs@ftc.gov Attorneys for Plaintiff FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION UNITED STATES DISTI FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRIC WESTERN DIVI	T OF CALIFORNIA
16	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,)) Civ. No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx)
17	Plaintiff,)
18	v.) }
19	STRATIFIED ADVERTISING AND MARKETING, INC., <u>et al.</u> ,))
20	Defendants.)
21		
22	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,) Civ. No. 07-01791 TJH (SHx)
23	Plaintiff,) STIPULATED ORDER FOR) PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND
24	V.) FINAL JUDGMENT AS TO DEFENDANTS MYSTERY SHOP
25 26	MYSTERY SHOP LINK, LLC, et al.,	LINK, LLC, TANGENT GROUP, LLC, ROBIN LARRY MURPHY, ANDREW HOLMAN, AND
20	Defendants.	KENNETH JOHNSON
28		
20		

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("Commission" or "FTC"), 1 has filed a Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable 2 3 Relief ("Complaint") against Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, Kenneth 4 Johnson, Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and Marc 5 Gurney for deceptive acts and practices in connection with the 6 7 advertising and telemarketing of "mystery shopping" employment opportunities. The Complaint alleges that these deceptive acts 8 and practices violated Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. 9 10 § 45(a).

In conjunction with the filing of its Complaint, the Commission also moved this Court for entry of an order holding certain Defendants in contempt of the Consent Judgment And Order For Permanent Injunction With Respect To Defendant Robin L. Murphy, entered by this Court on April 14, 1997, in connection with the case <u>FTC v. Stratified Advertising and Marketing, Inc.</u>, <u>et al.</u>, Civ. No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx).

The Commission and Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth Johnson ("MSL Defendants") have stipulated to the entry of the following Stipulated Order For Permanent Injunction And Final Judgment As To Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth Johnson ("Order") in settlement of the Commission's Complaint and contempt action.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Commission and the MSL Defendants, having requested the Court to enter this Order, and the Court having considered the Order and being fully advised in the premises, it

28

Page 2 of 23

is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

1

2

28

FINDINGS

3 1. The Complaint is an action by the Commission instituted 4 under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b). Pursuant 5 to this section of the FTC Act, the Commission has the authority 6 to seek the relief contained herein.

7 2. The Commission's Complaint states a claim upon which
8 relief may be granted against the MSL Defendants under Sections
9 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).

This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of
 this case and contempt action and the parties hereto. Venue in
 the Central District of California is proper. The MSL Defendants
 have been properly served with process.

4. The alleged activities of the MSL Defendants are in or
affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15
U.S.C. § 44.

5. The MSL Defendants, without admitting the allegations
set forth in the Commission's Complaint, agree to entry of this
stipulated Order.

6. The MSL Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial
review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this
Order. The MSL Defendants further waive and release any claims
any of them may have against the Commission, its employees,
representatives, or agents.

7. The MSL Defendants agree that this Order does not entitle them to seek or obtain attorney's fees as a prevailing party under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as

Page 3 of 23

1 amended; and the MSL Defendants further waive any right to 2 attorney's fees that may arise under said provision of law. The 3 parties shall each bear their own costs and attorney's fees 4 incurred in this action.

5 8. Any voluntary bankruptcy petition filed by any of the 6 MSL Defendants does not automatically stay this action, which the 7 Court finds is the "commencement or continuation of an action or 8 proceeding by a governmental unit . . to enforce such 9 governmental unit's . . police or regulatory power," as set 10 forth in 11 U.S.C. § 362(b)(4).

9. Any voluntary bankruptcy petition filed by any of the
MSL Defendants does not divest this Court of jurisdiction to enter
this Order against the MSL Defendants.

14 10. This Order is in addition to, and not in lieu of, any 15 other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law.

16 11. As to Defendant Robin Larry Murphy only, this Order
17 supersedes the Consent Judgment And Order For Permanent Injunction
18 With Respect To Defendant Robin L. Murphy ("Consent Judgment"),
19 entered by this Court on April 14, 1997, in connection with the
20 case FTC v. Stratified Advertising and Marketing, Inc., et al.,
21 Civ. No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx).

12. The MSL Defendants stipulate and agree that all conditions precedent for the Commission to execute against the \$100,000 performance bond, as set forth in Section V.F of the Consent Judgment in <u>FTC v. Stratified Advertising and Marketing,</u> <u>Inc., et al.</u>, Civ. No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx), are met, and, further, that the exhibits filed by the Commission in that case on March

Page 4 of 23

1 16, 2007 or afterwards, in support of its motion for contempt or 2 to execute against the performance bond, demonstrate by a 3 preponderance of the evidence that all such conditions precedent 4 are met.

13. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

ORDER

DEFINITIONS

8 For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall 9 apply:

1. "Plaintiff," "Commission," or "FTC" means the Federal
 Trade Commission.

2. "Defendants" means Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent
 Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, Kenneth Johnson,
 Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and Marc Gurney, and
 each of them, by whatever names each might be known.

3. "MSL Defendants" means Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent
Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth
Johnson, and each of them, by whatever names each might be known,
and their successors and assigns.

4. "Assets" means any legal or equitable interest in, right
 to, or claim to, any real and personal property, including but not
 limited to chattels, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures,
 general intangibles, effects, leaseholds, mail or other
 deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits,
 receivables (as those terms are defined in the Uniform Commercial
 Code), and all cash, wherever located.

27 28 5.

5

6

7

Page 5 of 23

"Assisting others" means: (1) performing customer

1 service functions including, but not limited to, receiving or 2 responding to consumer complaints; (2) providing, or arranging for 3 the provision of, names of potential customers; (3) performing 4 marketing services of any kind; (4) acting as an officer or 5 director of a business entity; or (5) providing payment processing 6 services of any kind.

6. "Consumer" means any individual, group, unincorporated
association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other
business entity.

10 7. "Customer" means any person who has paid, or may be 11 required to pay, for goods or services offered for sale or sold by 12 any Defendant.

"Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope 13 8. 14 to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, 15 audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data 16 17 compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into 18 reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a 19 20 separate document within the meaning of the term.

9. "Person" means a natural person, an organization or
 other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole
 proprietorship, limited liability company, association,
 cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an
 entity.

26 10. "Telemarketing" means any plan, program or campaign
27 (whether or not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R.

Page 6 of 23

1 Part 310) that is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or 2 services, or the payment of money, by means of the use of one or 3 more telephones.

4

I. BAN ON TELEMARKETING

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendant Robin Larry Murphy is 5 permanently restrained and enjoined from telemarketing, or 6 7 assisting others engaged in telemarketing, whether directly or through any entity, corporation, subsidiary, division, or other 8 device. Provided, however, that the ban on telemarketing shall 9 not apply to the extent that Defendant Robin Larry Murphy is 10 11 engaged in the business-to-business sales of telecommunications 12 equipment.

13

II. PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the MSL Defendants and their 14 officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other 15 persons in active concert or participation with them who receive 16 17 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, 18 whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, 19 subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, in 20 connection with the advertising, promotion, offering, telemarketing, or sale of any product, program, good or service, 21 22 are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

23 24

25

26

27

28

A. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication:

 that Defendants are themselves hiring consumers to perform work or are hiring on behalf of others;

 that a specified number of mystery shopping jobs are currently available through Defendants in consumers'

Page 7 of 23

local areas: 3. that a large percentage of mystery shopping jobs go unfilled due to a lack of mystery shoppers; or 4. that consumers who pay a fee to Defendants for access to mystery shopping jobs are likely to earn substantial income; Β. Falsely representing that any consumer will receive a list identifying multiple open positions or jobs in the consumer's chosen field and/or geographical location; Falsely representing the conditions a consumer must C. satisfy to obtain a refund; Failing to clearly disclose to any consumer all material D. conditions of obtaining a refund if, and at the time, the possibility of obtaining a refund is mentioned to the consumer; Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, or failing Ε. to disclose, any fact material to a consumer's decision to purchase or use any product, program, good, or service; and F. Assisting others who violate any provision of Paragraphs A through E of this Section. III. EQUITABLE MONETARY RELIEF IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that: Judgment is hereby entered in favor of the Commission, Α. and against the MSL Defendants, jointly and severally, in the amount of seventeen million, eight hundred eight thousand, four hundred ninety-nine U.S. Dollars (\$17,808,499.00), the estimated total consumer injury from 2003 through 2006, as equitable

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Page 8 of 23

monetary relief for consumer injury; provided, however, that this

judgment shall be suspended subject to the conditions set forth in
 Section IV of this Order;

Upon entry of this Order, the \$100,000.00 transferred by 3 Β. the Commission to the Court, on or about September 13, 2007, 4 pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 67, Local Rules 67-1 and 67-2, and the 5 Joint Stipulation and Order entered on August 23, 2007 in FTC v. 6 Stratified Advertising and Marketing, Inc., et al., Civ. No. 96-7 4142 TJH (VAPx), shall be paid to the Commission by wire transfer 8 or certified check in accordance with instructions to be provided 9 10 by counsel for the Commission;

11 С. All funds paid pursuant to this Order shall be deposited 12 into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to consumer 13 14 redress, and any attendant expenses for the administration of such equitable relief. The MSL Defendants shall cooperate fully to 15 assist the Commission in identifying consumers who may be entitled 16 17 to redress pursuant to this Order. In the event that direct redress to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds 18 remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any 19 remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including 20 consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably 21 related to Defendants' practices alleged in the Complaint. Any 22 funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the 23 24 United States Treasury as disgorgement. The MSL Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies 25 under this Part. The MSL Defendants shall have no right to 26 27 contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission. No

Page 9 of 23

portion of any payments under the judgment herein shall be deemed a payment of any fine, penalty, or punitive assessment;

1

2

25

26

27

28

3 D. In accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, as amended, the MSL Defendants are hereby required, unless they already have done so, 4 to furnish to the Commission their respective taxpayer identifying 5 numbers (social security numbers or employer identification 6 numbers), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and 7 reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of the MSL 8 Defendants' relationship with the government. Defendants Robin 9 Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth Johnson are further 10 required, unless they already have done so, to provide the 11 12 Commission with clear, legible and full-size photocopies of all 13 valid driver's licenses that they possess, which will be used for reporting and compliance purposes; 14

E. The MSL Defendants agree that the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed in this action shall be taken as true, without further proof, in the event of any subsequent proceedings or litigation to enforce this Order or to collect amounts due pursuant to this Section, including, but not limited to, a nondischargeability complaint in any bankruptcy case; and

F. Proceedings instituted under this Section are in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including any other proceedings the Commission may initiate to enforce this Order.

IV. RIGHT TO REOPEN

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

A. By agreeing to this Order, the MSL Defendants reaffirm

Page 10 of 23

and attest to the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the 1 financial statements signed by or on behalf of Defendants Mystery 2 Shop Link, LLC (dated December 21, 2006), Tangent Group, LLC 3 (dated December 21, 2006), Robin Larry Murphy (dated February 15, 4 2008), Andrew Holman (dated February 12, 2008), and Kenneth 5 Johnson (dated February 7, 2008), and provided to the Commission. 6 including all attachments and subsequent amendments and 7 corrections thereto. Plaintiff's agreement to this Order is 8 expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and 9 completeness of the MSL Defendants' financial condition, as 10 11 represented in the financial statements referenced above, which contain material information upon which Plaintiff relied in 12 negotiating and agreeing to the terms of this Order; 13

14 в. If, upon motion of the FTC, the Court finds that any of the MSL Defendants failed to disclose any material asset, 15 16 materially misrepresented the value of any asset, or made any 17 other material misrepresentation in or omission from his or its financial statement or supporting documents, the suspended 18 judgment entered in Section III.A shall become immediately due and 19 20 payable as to that MSL Defendant (less any amounts already paid). Provided, however, that, in all other respects, this Order shall 21 22 remain in full force and effect, unless otherwise ordered by the 23 Court; and

C. Any proceedings instituted under this Section shall be in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law, including but not limited to, contempt proceedings, or any other proceedings that the

28

Page 11 of 23

Commission or the United States might initiate to enforce this
 Order. For purposes of this Section, the MSL Defendants waive any
 right to contest any of the allegations in the Commission's
 Complaint.

5

V. PROHIBITIONS REGARDING CONSUMER INFORMATION

6 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the MSL Defendants and their 7 officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other 8 persons in active concert or participation with them who receive 9 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, 10 whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, 11 subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, are hereby 12 permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, Social Security number, account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person about whom any Defendant obtained such information in connection with the activities alleged in the Complaint; and

B. Benefitting from or using the name, address, telephone number, Social Security number, account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person about whom any Defendant obtained such information in connection with the activities alleged in the Complaint;

24 <u>Provided</u>, <u>however</u>, that the MSL Defendants may disclose
25 identifying information to a law enforcement agency or as required
26 by any law, regulation, or court order.

27 28

Page 12 of 23

1

VI. CEASE COLLECTION ON ACCOUNTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the MSL Defendants and their 2 officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other 3 persons in active concert or participation with them who receive 4 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, 5 whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, 6 7 subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, are hereby permanently enjoined and restrained from collecting, attempting to 8 9 collect, or assigning any right to collect payment for any mystery shopping employment opportunity, program, or service, directly or 10 through any third party, on any account established prior to entry 11 of this Order. 12

13

28

VII. MONITORING COMPLIANCE OF SALES PERSONNEL

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the MSL Defendants and their 14 officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other 15 persons in active concert or participation with them who receive 16 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, 17 whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, 18 subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, in 19 connection with any business involving telemarketing, are hereby 20 21 permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all employees and independent contractors engaged in sales or other customer service functions comply with Section II of this Order. These steps shall include adequate monitoring of sales presentations or other calls with consumers, and shall also include, at a minimum, the following: (1) listening to the

Page 13 of 23

1 oral representations made by persons engaged in sales or other 2 customer service functions; (2) establishing a procedure for 3 receiving and responding to consumer complaints; and (3) 4 ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints 5 regarding transactions in which each employee or independent 6 contractor is involved;

B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer
complaint received by any business to which this Section applies;
and

10 C. Failing to take adequate corrective action with respect 11 to any employee or independent contractor whom such Defendant 12 determines is not complying with this Order. This corrective 13 action may include training, disciplining, and/or terminating such 14 employee or independent contractor.

VIII. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

16 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of monitoring and 17 investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:

15

28

A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, the MSL Defendants each shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in such Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;

B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor
compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including
but not limited to the following:

Page 14 of 23

obtaining discovery from any person, without
 further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R.
 Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;

2. posing as consumers and suppliers to the MSL
5 Defendants, their employees, or any other entity managed or
6 controlled in whole or in part by any of them, without the
7 necessity of identification or prior notice; and

8 C. The MSL Defendants shall permit representatives of the 9 Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent 10 contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to 11 such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to 12 this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided, however, that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

20

IX. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANTS

21 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, in order that compliance with the 22 provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. For a period of five (5) years from the date of entry ofthis Order,

Defendants Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and
 Kenneth Johnson each shall notify the Commission of the following:

27 28 a. Any changes in his residence, mailing

Page 15 of 23

1 addresses, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) days of the date
2 of such change;

3 b. Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment), and any change in his ownership 4 interest in any business entity, within ten (10) days of the date 5 of such change. Such notice shall include the name and address of 6 7 each business that he is affiliated with, employed by, creates or forms, or performs services for; a statement of the nature of the 8 9 business; and a statement of his duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment; and 10

c. Any changes in his name or use of any aliasesor fictitious names; and

13 The MSL Defendants shall notify the Commission of 2. any changes in structure of Defendant Mystery Shop Link, LLC, or 14 Tangent Group, LLC, or any business entity that Defendant Robin 15 Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, or Kenneth Johnson directly or 16 indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may 17 affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including 18 but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or 19 other action that would result in the emergence of a successor 20 21 entity; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or 22 affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; the filing of a bankruptcy petition; or a change in the 23 corporate or business entity's name or address, at least thirty 24 25 (30) days prior to such change, provided that, with respect to any proposed change in the corporation or business entity about which 26 the Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date 27

Page 16 of 23

such action is to take place, Defendant shall notify the
 Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such
 knowledge.

B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of
this Order, the MSL Defendants each shall provide a written report
to the Commission, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting
forth in detail the manner and form in which they have complied
and are complying with this Order. This report shall include, but
not be limited to:

For Defendants Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman,
 and Kenneth Johnson:

12	a.	His then-current residence address, mailing	
13		addresses, and telephone numbers;	
14	b.	His then-current employment and business	
15		addresses and telephone numbers, a description	
16		of the business activities of each such	
17	employer or business, and his title and		
18	responsibilities for each such employer or		
19		business; and	
20	c.	Any other changes required to be reported	
21		under Paragraph A of this Section.	
22	2. For Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent		
23	Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth		
24	Johnson:		
25	a.	A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of	
26		this Order, obtained pursuant to Paragraph D	
27	of Section XI; and		
28	Page 17 of 23		

Any other changes required to be reported b. under Paragraph A of this Section. For the purposes of this Order, the MSL Defendants С. shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to: Associate Director for Enforcement Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Room NJ-2122 Washington, D.C. 20580 FTC v. Mystery Shop Link, LLC, et al., Civil Action Re: No. 07-01791 TJH (SHx) (C.D. Cal.); and FTC v. Stratified Advertising and Marketing, Inc., et al., Civil Action No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx) (C.D. Cal.) For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring D. required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to

communicate directly with the MSL Defendants.

X. RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

15 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of eight (8) years 16 from the date of entry of this Order, the MSL Defendants and their 17 officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and all other 18 persons in active concert or participation with them who receive 19 actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, 20 whether acting directly or through any person, trust, corporation, 21 subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, in 22 connection with any business involving telemarketing, are hereby 23 restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the 24 following records: 25

A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such

Page 18 of 23

28

26

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

1 revenues;

B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;

8 C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone 9 numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services 10 purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the 11 extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of 12 business;

D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received
directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses
to those complaints or requests;

E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials,
 advertisements, or other marketing materials; and

F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Paragraph D of Section XI, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Section IX.

XI. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of five (5) years
from the date of entry of this Order, the MSL Defendants shall
deliver copies of the Order as directed below:

A. LLC Defendants: Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, and

Page 19 of 23

28

27

1 Tangent Group, LLC must deliver a copy of this Order to all of their principals, officers, directors, members, and managers. 2 3 Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, and Tangent Group, LLC also must deliver copies of this Order to all of their employees, 4 agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the 5 6 subject matter of the Order. For current personnel, delivery 7 shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them 8 assuming their responsibilities. 9

10 Β. Individual Defendant Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman or Kenneth Johnson as Control Person: For any business that 11 Defendant Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, or Kenneth Johnson 12 controls, directly or indirectly, or in which he has a majority 13 14 ownership interest, he must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals, officers, directors, and managers of that business. 15 Defendant Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, or Kenneth Johnson 16 17 must also deliver copies of this Order to all employees, agents, and representatives of that business who engage in conduct related 18 to the subject matter of the Order. For current personnel, 19 20 delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to 21 them assuming their responsibilities. 22

C. Individual Defendant Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman,
or Kenneth Johnson as employee or non-control person: For any
business where Defendant Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, or
Kenneth Johnson is not a controlling person of a business but
otherwise engages in conduct related to the subject matter of this

28

Page 20 of 23

Order, he must deliver a copy of this Order to all principals and
 managers of such business before engaging in such conduct; and

D. The MSL Defendants must secure a signed and dated
statement acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30)
days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order
pursuant to this Section.

7

XII. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

8 **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that the MSL Defendants, within five 9 (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the 10 Court, must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement 11 acknowledging receipt of this Order.

12

XIII. COOPERATION WITH FTC

13 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the MSL Defendants shall, in 14 connection with this action or any subsequent investigations 15 related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences 16 that are the subject of the FTC's Complaint, cooperate in good 17 faith with the FTC and appear, or cause their officers, employees, 18 representatives, or agents to appear, at such places and times as 19 the FTC shall reasonably request, after written notice, for 20 interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, 21 and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by the 22 FTC. If requested in writing by the FTC, the MSL Defendants shall 23 appear, or cause their officers, employees, representatives, or 24 agents to appear, and provide truthful testimony in any trial, 25 deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the 26 transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the 27 Complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

Page 21 of 23

1	XIV. SEVERABILITY		
2	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are		
3	separate and severable from one another. If any provision is		
4	stayed or determined to be invalid, the remaining provisions shall		
5	remain in full force and effect.		
6	XV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION		
7	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain		
8	jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction,		
9	modification, and enforcement of this Order.		
10	The Commission and the MSL Defendants hereby stipulate and		
11	agree to entry of the foregoing Order, which shall constitute a		
12	final judgment in this action.		
13	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
14			
15			
16	THE HONORABLE TERRY J. HATTER, JR.,		
17	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE STIPULATED AND AGREED TO BY:		
18			
19	Any A. Nag Dated: 12/02/08		
20	Guy G. Ward David A. O'Toole		
21	Federal Trade Commission 55 W. Monroe St., Suite 1825		
22			
23	FAX (312) 960-5600 Attorneys for Plaintiff		
24	Federal Trade Commission		
25			
26			
27			
28	Page 22 of 23		

02:19pm From-STOLAR & ASSOCIATES, A PROF. LAW CORP. Sep-08-08 310-288-1827 T-735 P.002/002 F-259 9-8-08 Dated:_ Laurence D. Strick Stolar & Associates P.L.C. 433 North Camden Drive, Suite 600 Beverly Hills, CA 90210 PH. (310) 288-1828 FAX (310) 288-1827 Attorney for Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, and Andrew Holman 9/5/08 Dated: Defendant Andrew Holman, individually, and as an officer of Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, and Tangent Group, LLC 10 11 Dated:_____ 12 Defendant Robin Larry Murphy 11 14 Dated:____ Defendant Kenneth Johnson 1 10 1 1 1 2 2 2 2 2 Page 23 of 23

•

-

1		
1		Dated:
2	Laurence D. Strick Stolar & Associates P.L.C.	
3	433 North Camden Drive, Suite 600 Beverly Hills, CA 90210	
4	PH. (310) 288-1828 FAX (310) 288-1827	2
5	Attorney for Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC,	
6	Tangent Group, LLC, and Andrew Holman	
7		
8		Dated:
9	Defendant Andrew Holman, individually, and as an officer	
10	of Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, and Tangent Group, LLC	
11	$(\Gamma)/(\Lambda)$	al-l-m
12	- let -	Dated: 7/10/08
13	Defendant Robin Larry Murphy	,
14		Data.
15	Defendant Kenneth Johnson	Dated:
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28	Page 23	of 23

Dated:_____ 1 Laurence D. Strick Stolar & Associates P.L.C. 2 433 North Camden Drive, Suite 600 Beverly Hills, CA 90210 PH. (310) 288-1828 FAX (310) 288-1827 3 4 Attorney for Defendants Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, and 5 6 Andrew Holman 7 Dated:_____ 8 Defendant Andrew Holman, 9 individually, and as an officer of Defendants Mystery Shop Link, 10 LLC, and Tangent Group, LLC 11 12 Dated:_____ Defendant Robin Larry Murphy 13 Dated: 9/10/08 14 Defendant Kenneth Johnson 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 Page 23 of 23