26

27

28

ORIGIN WILLIAM BLUMENTHAL 1 General Counsel CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT 2 GUY G. WARD 3 DAVID A. O'TOOLE MAY -Federal Trade Commission 55 West Monroe Street, Suite 1825 Chicago, Illinois 60603 PH. (312) 960-5634 5 FAX (312) 960-5600 6 gward@ftc.gov dotoole@ftc.gov 7 John D. Jacobs, Cal. Bar No. 134154 Priority Federal Trade Commission 8 Send 10877 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 700 Enter 9 Los Angeles, California 90024 Closed PH. (310) 824-4343 JS-5/JS-6 FAX (310) 824-4380 10 JS-2/JS-3 jjacobs@ftc.gov Scan Only_ 11 Attorneys for Plaintiff 12 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 13 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 14 WESTERN DIVISION 15 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, No. CV07-01791 TJH (SHx) 16 Plaintiff, 17318 STIPULATED ORDER FOR MYSTERY SHOP LINK, LLC, PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION 19 ∵<u>ēt</u> <u>alī.</u>, AS TO HARP MARKETING SERVICES, INC., AIDEN 20 Defendants. REDDIN AND MARC GURNEY 21 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("Commission" or 22 "FTC"), has filed a Complaint for Permanent Injunction and Other 23 Equitable Relief ("Complaint") against Defendants Mystery Shop 24 Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, 25 Kenneth Johnson, Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and

Marc Gurney for deceptive acts and practices in connection with

the advertising and telemarketing of "mystery shopping" employment

opportunities. The Complaint alleges that these deceptive acts DOCKETED ON MAY - **4** 2001

3 2007

OF CALIFORNIA

DEPUTY

and practices violated Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a). In conjunction with the filing of its Complaint, the Commission also moved this Court for entry of an order holding certain Defendants in contempt of the Consent Judgment And Order For Permanent Injunction With Respect To Defendant Robin L. Murphy, entered by this Court on April 14, 1997, in connection with the case captioned FTC v. Stratified Advertising and Marketing, Inc., et al., Civ. No. 96-4142 TJH (VAPx).

1 l

The Commission and Defendants Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and Marc Gurney, have stipulated to the entry of the following Stipulated Order for Preliminary Injunction ("Order"); and the Court, having considered the record and being fully advised in the premises, hereby finds:

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case and the parties hereto. Venue in the Central District of California is proper. Defendants Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin and Marc Gurney have been properly served with process.
- 2. The alleged activities of the Harp Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 3. Weighing the equities and considering Plaintiff's likelihood of ultimate success, the Court finds that the entry of this Order is in the public interest.
- 4. The parties have agreed to the entry of this stipulated
 Order without adjudication of any issue of fact or law and without
 the Harp Defendants admitting liability for any of the matters

3 |

5. No security is required of any agency of the United States for the issuance of a preliminary injunction. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(c).

ORDER

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- 1. "Plaintiff," "Commission," or "FTC" means the Federal Trade Commission.
- 2. "Defendants" means Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, Kenneth Johnson, Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and Marc Gurney, and each of them, by whatever names each might be known.
- 3. "Harp Defendants" means Harp Marketing Services, Inc.,
 Aiden Reddin, and Marc Gurney, and each of them, by whatever names
 each might be known.
- 4. "MSL Defendants" means Mystery Shop Link, LLC, Tangent Group, LLC, Robin Larry Murphy, Andrew Holman, and Kenneth Johnson.
- 5. "Account number" means any credit or debit card number, bank account number, deposit account number, personal identification number ("PIN"), access code, or security code, needed to charge or debit a consumer's account.
- 6. "Assets" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any real and/or personal property, including but not limited to chattels, goods, instruments, equipment, fixtures, general intangibles, effects, leaseholds, mail or other

deliveries, inventory, checks, notes, accounts, credits, receivables (as those terms are defined in the Uniform Commercial Code), and all cash, wherever located.

- 7. "Consumer" means any individual, group, unincorporated association, limited or general partnership, corporation, or other business entity.
- 8. "Customer" means any person who has paid, or may be required to pay, for goods or services offered for sale or sold by Defendants.
- 9. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.
- 10. "Person" means a natural person, an organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, association, cooperative, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
- 11. "Telemarketing" means any plan, program or campaign
 (whether or not covered by the Telemarketing Sales Rule, 16 C.F.R.
 Part 310) that is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or
 services, or the payment of money, by means of the use of one or
 more telephones.

I. PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS ORDERED that the Harp Defendants, and their successors and assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any entity, corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering, telemarketing, or sale of any product, program, good or service, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication:
- that Defendants are themselves hiring consumers to perform work or are hiring on behalf of others;
- 2. that a specified number of mystery shopping jobs are currently available through Defendants in consumers' local areas;
- 3. that a large percentage of mystery shopping jobs go unfilled due to a lack of mystery shoppers; or
- 4. that consumers who pay a fee to Defendants for access to mystery shopping jobs are likely to earn substantial income; and
- B. Misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, or failing to disclose, any fact material to a consumer's decision to purchase or use any product, program, good, or service.

II. MAINTAIN RECORDS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Harp Defendants, and their officers, agents, directors, servants, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, attorneys, corporations, subsidiaries,

affiliates, shareholders, successors, assigns, and all other persons or entities in concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any trust, corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, or any of them, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Failing to create and maintain books, records, accounts, bank statements, current accountants' reports, general ledgers, general journals, cash receipt ledgers, source documents, documents indicating title to real or personal property, and any other data which in reasonable detail fairly, accurately, and completely reflect the incomes, disbursements, transactions and uses of Defendants' Assets;
- B. Destroying, erasing, mutilating, concealing, altering, transferring, or otherwise disposing of in any manner, directly or indirectly, any scripts, advertisements, verification tapes, books, records, tapes, disks, contracts, accounting data, handwritten notes, checks (fronts and backs), correspondence, forms, manuals, electronically stored data, banking records, consumer or debtor lists or files, mailing lists, telemarketer lists, invoices, telephone records, receipt books, postal receipts, ledgers, payroll records, or other Documents of any kind, including information stored in computer-maintained form (such as electronic mail), in their possession, custody, or control.

III. FINANCIAL STATEMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, no later than ten (10) business days after entry of this Order, unless they have already done so,

the Harp Defendants shall provide to counsel for the Commission:

- A. A completed financial statement accurate as of the date of service of this Order upon such Defendant, in the forms previously provided to Defendants, along with the required attachments; and
- B. If requested by counsel for the Commission, after submission of the statement(s) specified in Paragraph A above, such additional information, verified under oath, as to payments, transfers, or assignments of funds, assets, or property as is reasonably necessary to explain or substantiate the information provided in the statement(s) specified in Paragraph A.

IV. ACCOUNTING PROVISIONS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within three (3) days after entry of this Order, the Harp Defendants shall serve on the Commission a detailed accounting of:

- A. all gross revenues and net profits obtained by the Harp Defendants from the sale of any product or service as the agent, employee, independent contractor or otherwise on behalf of the MSL Defendants, or their successors and assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, stated separately for each product or service; and
- B. the full names, addresses, telephone numbers, email addresses of all purchasers and the amount each purchaser paid for each product or service sold on behalf of the MSL Defendants, or their successors and assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys.

V. PROHIBITIONS REGARDING CONSUMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Harp Defendants, their successors and assigns, officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any entity, corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, are hereby restrained and enjoined from:

- A. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing the name, address, telephone number, Social Security number, account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person about whom any Defendant obtained such information in connection with the activities alleged in the Complaint; and
- B. Benefitting from or using the name, address, telephone number, Social Security number, account number, e-mail address, or other identifying information of any person about whom any Defendant obtained such information in connection with the activities alleged in the Complaint;

Provided, however, that the Harp Defendants may disclose identifying information to a law enforcement agency, or as required by any law, regulation, or court order, and to any affiliated entities owned by, or directly controlled by, the Harp Defendants.

VI. CREATION OF OTHER BUSINESSES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Harp Defendants, within ten (10) business days of their creating, operating, or controlling any business entity, whether newly-formed or previously inactive,

1 including, without limitation, any partnership, limited partnership, joint venture, sole proprietorship, limited liability company, or corporation, must provide written notice to the Commission disclosing: (1) the name of the business entity; (2) the address and telephone number of the business entity; (3) the names of the business entity's owners, officers, directors, principals, managers, members, and employees; and (4) a detailed description of the business entity's intended activities.

2

3 i

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Harp Defendants shall, within five (5) business days after entry of this Order, provide a copy of this Order to each of their corporations, subsidiaries, affiliates, divisions, directors, officers, partners, shareholders, successors, assigns, employees, attorneys, agents, and independent contractors, that are engaged in any function or activity substantially involved in the marketing of products or services to consumers, including, but not limited to, telemarketing, mail, e-mail, or Internet marketing. Within ten (10) business days after entry of this Order, the Harp Defendants shall serve upon Plaintiff an affidavit identifying the names, titles, addresses, and telephone numbers of the persons and entities Defendants have served with a copy of this Order in compliance with this provision.

Provided, however, that the Harp Defendants may alternatively provide employees and independent contractors a summary of Sections I, II, and V of the Order.

VIII. NOTICE OF THIS ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that copies of this Order may be distributed by first class mail, overnight delivery, facsimile,

Page 9 of 11

electronic mail, or personally, by agents or employees of Plaintiff, upon any credit card processing agent or agent providing electronic funds transfer services or automated clearing house processing, customer service agent, commercial mail receiving agency, mail holding or forwarding company, bank, savings and loan institution, credit union, financial institution, accountant, brokerage house, escrow agent, IRA custodian, money market or mutual fund, title company, commodity futures merchant, commodity trading company, common carrier, storage company, trustee, or any other person, partnership, corporation, or legal entity that may be in possession of any Documents, records, Assets, property, or property right of any named Defendant, and any Internet service provider or other person, partnership, corporation, or legal entity that may be subject to any provision of this Order. Service upon any branch or office of any financial institution or entity shall effect service upon the entire financial institution or entity.

IX. CONSUMER REPORTING AGENCIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, pursuant to Section 604 of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681b, any consumer reporting agency may furnish a consumer or credit report concerning Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin or Marc Gurney, to Plaintiff.

X. SEVERABILITY

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, the remaining provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

XI. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain

Page 10 of 11

IT IS SO ORDERED Dated

United States District Judge

28

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

1	jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.	
2	IT IS SO ORDERED.	\times
3		
4	Dated:	tod Ctotoo Biotrick Judeo
5	. 0111	ted States District Judge
6	SIGNED AND STIPULATED BY:	
7	Guy G. Ward	Dated: 4-26-07
8	David A. O'Toole Federal Trade Commission	
9	55 E. Monroe St., Suite 1860 Chicago, IL 60603	
10	PH. (312) 960-5634 FAX (312) 960-5600	
11	Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission	
12	redetal frade Commission	
13	1 Mm Mailer	Dated: Y-25-07
14	Ian D. Wolner Gary D. Hailey	
15	Venable LLP 575 7th Street, NW	
16	Washington, DC 20004-1601	
17	Jon-Jamison Hill Venable LLP	
18	2049 Century Park East, Suite 2100 Los Angeles, CA 90067	
19	PH. (310) 229-9907 FAX (310) 229-9901	
20	Attorneys for Defendants Harp Marketing Services, Inc.,	
21	Aiden Reddin and Marc Gurney	
22	An I	Dated: 04-24-07
23	Defendant Aiden Reddin, individually and on behalf	
24	of Harp Marketing Setyides, Inc.	
25		Dated: 4-24-07
26	Defendant/Marc Gurney,	Dated: 21-0'
27	individually and on behalf of Harp Marketing	
28	Services, Inc.	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE 1 2 I, Guy G. Ward, hereby certify that I caused to be served 3 true and correct copies of the attached [Proposed] Stipulated 4 Order for Preliminary Injunction as to Harp Marketing Services, 5 Inc., Aiden Reddin and Marc Gurney on the following parties by 6 first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid: 7 Laurence D. Strick 8 Stolar & Associates P.L.C. 433 North Camden Drive, Suite 600 Beverly Hills, CA 90210 Attorneys for Mystery Shop Link, LLC, 10 Tangent Group, LLC, and Andrew Holman 11 William I. Rothbard 12 Law Offices of William I. Rothbard 1217 Yale Street, Suite 104 13 Santa Monica, CA 90404 Attorneys for Robin Larry Murphy 14 and Kenneth Johnson 15 Ian D. Volner Gary D. Hailey 16 Venable LLP 575 7th Street, NW Washington, DC 20004 17 Attorneys for 18 Harp Marketing Services, Inc., Aiden Reddin, and 19 Marc Gurney 20 21 Dated: April 26, 2007 22

23

24

25

26

27