Appendix H – Social-Economics

Retricted Use Alternative Analysis Model

This Page Left Blank Intentionally

Chapter 2.3.5 Restricted Use Alternative Analysis Model

The Restricted Use Alternative attempts to control weeds over the 10- to 15-year life of the project by using all available treatment methods. Its distinction from the proposed action is that herbicide treatment would not be allowed in riparian and special areas including wilderness, wild and scenic river corridors, municipal watersheds, and within 100 feet of SOLIs. The strategy would be to treat as many infested acres as early as possible. Therefore the initial emphasis is on broadcast herbicide applications in the uplands because broadcast application of herbicide is the most cost effective way to treat the most acres. Once the uplands are treated the emphasis shifts to treating riparian and special areas using manual/mechanical methods. During all years of the project, some of all treatment methods may be used, however the clear strategy emphasizes herbicides early in the project, then progressively moves away from herbicide treatments in favor of manual/mechanical and biocontrol methods as time goes on.

This spreadsheet models the Restricted Use Alternative discussed in section 2.3.5 of chapter 2. Like the Proposed Action, the model begins in year 1 (row 7 of the spreadsheet below) of the project with 22,842 acres of known invasive plant infestations to be treated (column B). In the first year available funding is spent using herbicides to treat approximately 4000 infested acres in the uplands. Years 2 and 3 (row 8 and 9) similarly treat approximately 3200 acres of previously untreated weeds (column E) and 800 acres previously treated (column G). At the same time, a minor acreage of manual/mechanical treatments may also occur in riparian and special areas (see alternative description in 2.3.5). The funding, acres treated and treatment methods in the first three years is virtually the same as the Proposed Action (Alternative B) except that treatment location is entirely in the uplands and not in any special areas, whereas Alternative B may treat in riparian and special areas with herbicides, as well as in the uplands.

Beginning in year 4 (row 10), differences between the Restricted Use Alternative and Alternative B begin to emerge. Sometime during year 4, herbicide treatment of the 11,179 acres of targeted upland areas not previously treated is completed. The herbicide retreatment continues and the remaining budget is spent on treating riparian or special areas using manual/mechanical and biocontrol methods. By year 5 (row 11), project emphasis is shifting from herbicide treatment methods to manual/mechanical methods. Treatment locations are also changing; shifting away from the uplands and focusing on riparian and special areas.

Because manual/mechanical methods cost more per acre, fewer acres can be treated given the same annual project budget. Per acre costs for each treatment method (columns Y - AK) used for this model are detailed in Chapter 2 of this EIS and are used to analyze Alternative B. Besides being more expensive, manual/mechanical methods are also less effective than herbicide treatments. Again the same assumptions of treatment method effectiveness used to analyze Alternative B were used to analyze this alternative. That is, 80 percent effective for herbicide treatments (column H) and 25 percent effective for manual/mechanical treatments (column I) (see Chapter 3.2 of this EIS for a more detailed discussion of effectiveness assumptions).

Initially, acres of weed infestation are reduced suggesting that the project purpose and need of eradicating, containing, and controlling weeds would be accomplished. However beginning in year 5, as herbicide use is curtailed and manual/mechanical methods are emphasized, the trend of weed reduction reverses and acres of weed infestation forestwide begin to increase. Ultimately, by the end of the project the area of weed infestation would roughly double from the present infestation level.

This spreadsheet is an approximation. Its purpose is not to precisely predict acres of weed infestation during the life of the project. Its purpose is to show trends of this alternative compared to the Proposed Action Alternative.

ESTIMATED ANNUAL ACRES OF TREATMENT ESTIMATED ACRES BY TREATMENT BY METHOD ESTIMATED A													TED ACRES BY TREATMENT BY METHOD					ESTIMATED COST BY TREATMENT METHOD																			
		ESTIM	ATED AN	NUAL .	ACRES ()F TREA	IMENT	1	1			MATED	ACRE	<u>S BY TREAT</u>	MENT BY N	AETHOD	ESTIN	IATED A	CRES BY 1	REATMI	ENT BY M	ETHOD		ESTIMAT	IED COST	BYTRE	ATMEN	I METH	ענ	Ľ	STIMATE	D COST BY 1	REATMEN	VT METH	dOD	4 /	
Year g	g	Total Remainin g Non- Upland Acres	Upland Acres Treated First time	Non- Upland Acres Treated (First Time)	Total acres retreated	Acres Retreated (c = 20% of prior year's e)	al, 75%	Total Acres Treated (c+d)	Remain g Untreat Acres (c)	ed untreate	of d Acres 0 Manua echani ed and c nd Herbici f Treatm d (e*16.8) %) .0	VM cal or ide ent 999 Acres Herbic spo (e*3.9 %)	s of cide - ot 984 (c*(cres of Manual Manua only Mecha eatments al, '0.306% Chemin (e*0.26 %)	ntrol al, Acres of Biocontrol (e*0.376 ical %)	Aerial	Acres of Manual/M echanica and or 5 Herbicide Treatmer (e*39.07 %)	Acres o Herbicide spot (e*6.948	only	Mechanic		Acres of Aerial (e*0%)	Acres of Manual/M echanicai and or Herbicide Treatmen (i*\$313)	Acres of Herbicide	Acres of Manual only	Mechanic al,	Acres of Biocontrol (m*\$70)		Total Cost of Treatment s by Year	and or Horbioido	Acres of Herbicide - spot	Acres Acres of Manual only Mecha reatment al, s (I*\$340 (I*\$70)	ntrol. I, Acres o nic Biocontr (m*\$70)	of Acres rol Aerial () \$42)	s of (n*) Total Cost of Treatment s by Year	Estimated Inventory and Effectiven ess Monitorin g Costs	Total Estimated Annual Costs
Average Annual Acres of Treatment G=1st 6 years, H=											~					.1		. 100				•									í T						
remaining years 4000 2400														P	Percentages	above m	ust total	to 100 pe	ercent.												1						
1 22,842	11,179	11,663	4,000			0	00	4,00	0 22,8	42 2,3	24 (676	159	12	11 1	5 95	1 1,56	3 27	78 7	. (327	7	0 \$211,575	5 \$55,776	6 \$4,162	\$736	\$1,053	\$39,959	\$313,261	\$193,822	\$40,854	\$2,434	\$0 \$22,9	10	\$0 \$260,020	\$188,000	\$761,281
2 21,166	7,579	12,829	3,200		80	0 80	0 0	4,00	0 21,1	66 2,1	57 6	676	159	12	11 1	5 95	1 1,56	3 27	78 7	. (327	7	0 \$211,575	5 \$55,776	6 \$4,162	\$736	\$1,053	\$39,959	\$313,261	\$193,822	\$40,854	\$2,434	\$0 \$22,9 ⁻	10	\$0 \$260,020	\$188,000	\$761,281
3 20,123	4,739	14,112	3,200		80	0 80	0 0	4,00	0 20,1	23 2,0	52 6	676	159	12	11 1	5 95	1 1,56	3 27	78 7	. (327	7	0 \$211,575	5 \$55,776	6 \$4,162	\$736	\$1,053	\$39,959	\$313,261	\$193,822	\$40,854	\$2,434	\$0 \$22,9	10	\$0 \$260,020	\$188,000	\$761,281
4 18,975	1,899	15,523	1,899	780	0 80	0 80	00	3,47	9 18,1	95 1,8	54	511	108	229	7 1	3 72	0 1,10	9 18	38 311	(285	5	0 \$159,850	\$37,63	5 \$77,701	\$497	\$916	\$30,238	\$306,836	\$137,552	\$27,566 \$	¢105,601	\$0 \$19,92		\$0 \$290,645		\$760,994
5 18,930	230	16,296	230	1,350	0 1,12	5 54	0 585	2,70	5 17,5	80 1,7	85 2	266	31	549	2 1	0 37	7 43	6 5	53 760) (221		0 \$83,108	3 \$10,733	3 \$186,592	\$142	\$712	\$15,816	\$297,102	\$54,092	\$7,861 \$	\$258,365	\$0 \$15,4	91	\$0 \$335,809	\$127,121	\$760,033
6 20,486	50	16,605	50	825	5 1,60	5 15	4 1,451	2,48	0 19,6	61 1,9	91 [·]	194	8	643	1	9 27	6 23	9 1	14 893	; (203	3	0 \$60,659	9 \$2,843	3 \$218,769	\$38	\$653	\$11,597	\$294,558	\$29,639	\$2,083 \$	\$303,503	\$0 \$14,20	05	\$0 \$349,429	\$116,568	\$760,556
7 22,426	13	17,513	13	660	0 1,74	8 4	1 1,707	2,42	1 21,7	66 2,2	01 [·]	175	2	669	0	9 24	9 18	7	4 928	; (198	3	0 \$54,694	4 \$746	6 \$227,344	\$10	\$637	\$10,476	\$293,906	\$23,139	\$546 \$	\$315,531	\$0 \$13,8	64	\$0 \$353,080	\$113,771	\$760,758
8 23,967	3	18,689	3	611	1 1,78	6 1	1 1,775	2,40	0 23,3	57 2,3	60 ·	169	1	674	0	9 24	2 17	2	1 935	; (196	6	0 \$53,018	3 \$195	5 \$229,108	\$3	\$632	\$10,161	\$293,117	\$21,389	\$143 \$	\$318,014	\$0 \$13,74	46	\$0 \$353,292	\$112,800	\$759,209
9 25,716	1	20,036	1	607	7 1,79	2	3 1,789	2.40	0 25,1	10 2,5	35 [.]	168	0	677	0	9 24	1 16	9	0 939) (196	6	0 \$52,698	3 \$5 ⁻	1 \$230,090	\$1		\$10,101	\$293,572			\$319,386	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,147		\$760,519
10 27,645	0	21,523	0	602		-	1 1,797	2,40			28	168	0	677	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 940		196	-	0 \$52,614		3 \$230,347	\$0		\$10,086	\$293,692			\$319,745	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,370		\$760,862
11 29,771	0	23,163	0	600		-	0 1,799	,	-			168	0	678	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 941		196		0 \$52,592	-	4 \$230,415	\$0		\$10,081	\$293,723			\$319,839	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,429		\$760,952
12 32,112	0	24,969	0	600	-		0 1,800	,	-			168	0	678	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 941		196	-	0 \$52,586	-	1 \$230,432	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,863	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,444		\$760,976
13 34,687	0	26,956	0	600		-	0 1,800	,	-			168	0	678	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 941		196		0 \$52,585		0 \$230,437	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,870	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,448		\$760,982
14 37,519	0	29,141	0	600	,		0 1,800	,	-			168	0	678	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 941		196		0 \$52,584		0 \$230,438	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,871	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,449		\$760,983
15 40,635	0	31,545	0	600	. ,		0 1.800	,				168	0	678	0	9 24	0 16	8	0 941		196		0 \$52,584		\$230,438	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
16 44.063	0	34,190	0	600	. ,	-	0 1.800	, -	,	,		168	0	678	0	9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
17 47,833	0	37,099	0	600	. ,	-	0 1.800	, -	/	,	-	168	0	678	0	9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	\$0		\$10,080				\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
18 51,980	0	40,298	0	600	. ,		0 1,800	, .		,		168	0	678		9 24	-	-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	00 \$0		\$10,080	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
19 56,542	0	43,818	0	600	. ,		0 1,800		,	,		168	0	678		9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	\$0 \$0		\$10,080				\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
20 61,560	0	47,690	0	600	. ,	-	0 1,800		-			168	0	678		9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	ψυ ¢0		\$10,080	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450 \$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
21 67,080	0	51,949	0	600	,		0 1,800					168	0	678		9 24	-	-	0 941		190		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	\$0 \$0		\$10,080	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450 \$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
21 67,080	0	56,634	0	600	-		0 1,800		,			168	0	678		9 24 9 24		-	0 941		190		0 \$52,584) \$230,438) \$230,438	φ0 ¢0		\$10,080	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450 \$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
22 73,153	0	50,034 61,787	0	600	,	_	0 1,800		-			168	0	678		9 24	-	-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438) \$230,438	۵ 0 \$0		\$10,080	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450 \$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
23 79,832 24 87,179	0	67,456	0	600	. ,	-	0 1,800					168	0	678	0 9	9 24 9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438) \$230,438	\$0 \$0		\$10,080				\$319,872 \$319,872	\$0 \$13,74	_	\$0 \$354,450 \$0 \$354,450		\$760,984 \$760,984
,	0	67,456 73,692	0		,			2,40					0			9 24	-	-	0 941		196					-											
25 95,261	U		U	600	-							168	0	678		9 24		-					0 \$52,584		\$230,438			1	\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
26 104,151	0	80,551	0	600		-	0 1,800		0 103,5			168	0	678		9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584		0 \$230,438				\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
27 113,930	0	88,096	0	600	,		0 1,800		0 113,3			168	0	678		9 24	-	-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584		\$230,438				\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
28 124,687	0	96,396	0	600	,	-	0 1,800		0 124,0			168	0	678	0 9	9 24	-		0 941		196		0 \$52,584		0 \$230,438				\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
29 136,520		105,525	0	600			0 1,800		0 135,9			168	0	678		9 24	-	_	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438				\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
30 149,536		115,568	0	600			0 1,800		0 148,9			168	0	678	0 9	9 24		-	0 941		196		0 \$52,584) \$230,438	\$0			\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74	_	\$0 \$354,450		
31 163,853		126,615	0	600	,	-	0 1,800		0 163,2			168	0	678	0 9	9 24	-		0 941		196		0 \$52,584		\$230,438	\$0			\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
32 179,603		138,766	0	600	,	-	0 1,800		0 179,0			168	0	678	0 9	9 24		8	0 941		196	-	0 \$52,584		\$230,438				\$293,734			\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74		\$0 \$354,450		
33 196,927	0	152,133	0	600	,		0 1,800		0 196,3			168	0	678	0 9	9 24	-	8	0 941		196		0 \$52,584	4 \$0	\$230,438	\$0	\$632	\$10,080	\$293,734		\$0 \$	\$319,872	\$0 \$13,74	10	\$0 \$354,450		\$760,984
				19,235	5 53,65	4		72,88	Ö	Total ac		543 ,809 \$219		10,110	41 32 ⁻ 32,899 \$22,50	,	9 11,03 94 \$1,368,2		04 27,366		0,001		0						\$9,768,437		Total troatme	ent costs \$21,09	1 586	Total ~	\$11,323,149	<u> </u>	
						-				COSLDY	111 QZ,300	JUD \$215	ত, তপত 🌖	0,112,400 \$2	2,000 QZZ,00	λυ φ400, I	φ1,300,Z	ə,001,8	φ σ ,304,438	, »	φ469,004	ت ت	¥0									ALL COSIS \$21,09	,000		nonitoring costs Cost of Treatmen		
						-																								Per Acre (Cost of Manue	al/Mechanical ar	d/or Herbici/				
					1	1				1	1								1	1	1	1	1	1					1			ai			5 55 /6 FIGI DIGIU	- unu 1070	