

## Border 2012 Summary of Comments

Frontera 2012/Border 2012  
Tijuana, Baja California, Mexico  
November 8, 2002

---

1. Welcome/Introduction by the representatives
  - ☞ Welcome: given by Laura Silvan. Secretariat of the Environment and Office of the Director General of Ecology of the state.
  - ☞ Presentation of the Presidium
  - ☞ Carlos de la Parra Rentería SEMARNAT
  - ☞ Flora Aguiles Robert, Office of the Director General of Ecology of the state
  - ☞ Myrna Yolanda Borja Medina, Office of the Director General of Ecology of Tijuana
  - ☞ Dr. Cándido Zatarain Talamantes, Baja California Legislature
  - ☞ Laura Yoshii EPA region 9

- Myrna Yolanda Borjes: representing Mayor Jesús González Reyes, of Tijuana, Baja California, cordially welcomes all of the guests and thanks them for choosing the facilities of Tijuana's City Hall as the site of such an important meeting. On behalf of the Mayor, she wishes them the greatest success in this gathering of citizens, hoping that they will hold binational meetings of this type that are so favorable for our region, followed by some thoughts on the well known environmental problems confronting the Tijuana-San Diego border region, as well as the entire the border strip.

- Carlos de la Parra Rentería SEMARNAT: Welcome to the citizens from different municipalities of Mexico's border region, such as Tecate, Ensenada, Tijuana and San Quintin. Welcome to the various authorities present at this meeting. Citizens are invited to participate in this proposal to share their doubts and comments, which will be punctually answered. Brief update on the 2012 Border program proposal.
2. Audiovisual presentation of the 2012 Border program
  - a. Demographic changes
  - b. Scarcity of drinking water supply, handling of wastes, and air pollution

- c. Presence of illnesses attributable to the region's environmental problems.

- d. Bilateral, federal and state cooperation to prepare a program to solve the environmental and public health problems in the border region between Mexico and the United States.
- e. Sustainable development principles
- f. Prior programs that have been carried out with the same objectives, under the "La Paz Agreement" have been the basis for preparing this new project: Border 2012.
- g. The "Border 21" program was begun in 1996 after the initiation of NAFTA, inviting community participation.
- h. The Cross Border Ecology Cooperation Commission and the North American Development Bank were the two agencies that were developed to attend to the Border 2012:

- Mexico-United States environmental health program
- Inauguration by the representative of Tijuana Mayor Gonzales Reyes
- The Audiovisual presentation: Border 2012

The border strip between the two nations runs for 3,500 kilometers from the Pacific Ocean to the Gulf of Mexico, with an estimated population of 12,000,000 people, who share strong cultural, environmental and economic ties.

The environment along this strip is seriously affected due to substantial population growth throughout the region.

The presence of illnesses attributed to environmental pollution factors.

The Mexican and U.S. sides of this region have always sought to work together to solve the problems resulting from this situation.

Collaboration with COCEF, BECC, NAD Bank have joined efforts to structure the goals proposed in the Border 2012 plan.

Presentation: Baja California-California Region

- Border crossing
- Shared natural resources and environmental concerns
- Air quality
- Use of pesticides
- Scarcity of available water supply
- Abandoned sites

Question and answer session:

- Rodolfo Mendez; Industry
- The three levels of government: Advise us as to why there is such an absence of sharing with the public about the [missing words]
- Since the Rio de Janeiro "agenda 21" project, consideration has been given to addressing the matter of Basin conservation, as likewise the absence of efforts to promote education and environmental methodology that has already been proposed.

Agreements are being structured with the Secretariat of Ecology, the EPA, for the Hydrological Basins project.

About Education; it will be taken into account in order to [missing words]

- Gabriela Johnston
- How can we make sure that the authorities respect legal standards, gas companies from the Orient
- Dirty "gas tanker ships" causing a high level of pollution along the coast.
- What are the legal penalties for failing to comply with the regulations related to the legal standards?

They will be applied with strict adherence to the legal standards.

- The program does not replace the established legal standards. The three governmental levels are coordinating to take into account.
- Pablo Armas
- About the indigenous communities, How are Mexico's indigenous communities going to take part in this project, some of whom live in remote areas of limited access? And the matter of scarce water supply.

Human Rights Protection Agency – Francisco Reynoso

- Absent indigenous communities: Cucapahs & Cumiahs: due to unrelated factors.

Jose Luis Castro, COLEF

- What methodology was used for this program's proposal? Internal consultation, Research, Experience? No measurement exists as for what the future may hold, a large part of the border project 21 is taken from this program.

A variety of regional scarcities were analyzed .

The program has been evolving for 18 months, the 10 states have met for successive session to discuss:

Border 21 ended in 2001, but the 9 working groups continued to work on their tasks, and submitted a report about the scarcities and the pending points, as well as projects accomplished.

Benito Garcia; Mixtec Ethnic Group of Baja California residents?

- Take into account the protection of the indigenous groups resident in and native to Baja California, as to their social and environmental rights. The importance of expressing consideration of the indigenous groups concretely in the Border 2012 program.
- All of the indigenous groups are being taken into account.

Creation of regional California-Baja California working groups, aspects concerning natural gas, generation of electricity, a number of forums will be held to work on specific projects.

- Why fewer federal agencies exist than previously;
- Did not want to participate .
- Let's wait to develop another agreement
- What is the reason for the duration of "border 2012" instead of the 6 years of the border 21 project.

Funds for this project?

– From taxpayers by way of the government that decides on priorities through legislative committees.

– The decision was taken from the absence of federal agencies of analysis.

– Use less time planning, in order to have more time to develop the proposed goals, monitor the change and the results.

– United States will furnish the funds that it has always devoted to environmental protection, which it approximately 73 million [dollars].

– All groups will be cordially invited to participate in this program, and it gives us pleasure

Marta Rocha – Playas de Tijuana

- A very interesting program, above all the invitation to the public to participate in its formation; many doubts exist concerning specific matters; I propose to invite various groups to express their concerns.
- Margarita Díaz:

How are prior working groups being incorporated into this new program?

The goals do not distinguish between one country and the other. How is a distinction going to be made between each country's results, regarding which we are aware of the great differences between many social and environmental aspects?

Border 2012 will be able to articulate this matter at the binational level, in order to **come up with** an answer.

Work at the state level, will their respective borders permit achieving the program's goals?

As the first stage of the program we will analyze the current state of affairs realistically.

Guillermo Morales: Rosarito

- Will this group take into account society's viewpoints and those of the government? The problems faced by Rosarito are of interest to me. Rosarito faces a broad spectrum of environmental problems, including those related to PEMEX, the Federal Electricity Commission, and heavy air pollution. And will the indigenous communities living in Rosarito be taken into account?
- Yes.

Comments:

Walter Zuniga, State Water Commission

- Quality and quantity of water in the hydrographic basins?
- University consortium
- Proposal: Page 16: sustainable water resources management tool, should they propose spacing of the hydrographic basins?
- Invite the people currently working on the hydrographic basins to your working groups?

Johana Guadana, Playas de Tijuana

- As a municipality, we are now experiencing the matter of environmental problems. I would like to know what municipal limits will cover this problem.
- The municipal administrations change, and the reports will be out of sync with dates of change. Would the program benefit if the program reports were submitted every year?

Raul Guzman; Border area thermoelectric plants?

- The dynamics of the energy market; the minimum environmental pollution impact of the series of plants intended to be built has been identified out to forty years in the future. In truth, these projects do not take into account how this region is going to grow over time, and the environmental impacts are for the area south of the border, and the economic benefits for the area north of the border.

Quality of life is much more affected over the long term. The environmental criteria comply with Mexico's standards, even though it is well known that they will not comply with U.S. environmental criteria. Therefore, standards should be established that must be met on both sides of the border.

Margarita?

What participation mechanisms will be employed in the process of setting up the program?

Elia Garcia; Ecology in Rosarito

A progress report should be given on the results of each working group regarding specific sets of problems, such as the thermoelectric plants, and above

all those concerning public health. Rosarito is within the area of kilometers comprising the border strip, and it records alarming levels of environmental pollution, and should therefore be included in this plan.

Provide a follow-up on the impact of this program, ascertain what specific benefit it brings to our citizens on a personal level.

Mrs.? - Tecate...

Water is a great natural resource, indispensable for life, and very scarce in this region.

About the national policies for the thermoelectric plants, standard 0-85, which is being developed and sets the EPA, CSGWEST limits, will prepare an inventory of the estimated long term impact on the region.

Oscar Romo

The translation of the document is not very accurate as to specific terminology.

The coastal areas are not mentioned.

The term indigenous community sounds discriminatory. I believe they should be mentioned as ethnic, or with their specific ethnic names.

On what basic documents is the document based?

Show the current status of the specific levels of environmental pollution in the document.

Basin management is absent from the manual.

The United States puts in 78 million dollars, but we do not have global figures from the monetary fund of Mexico.

Incorporate a tax into every toxic waste statement, and acknowledge the companies that support the reduction of their wastes, as well as:

the need to develop environmental health forums, that have so many social and environmental repercussions.

The need for the three levels of government to participate. I invite citizens to participate tomorrow November 9 at the San Jose Cortijo, ...of a gas company where benefits will go to the United States and the environmental pollution will stay in Mexico.



Karla García- Environmental attorney in Baja California

Page 17 of the document mentions the program's tools. Government officials concerned with these specific matters should be invited to participate in these forums as well as the citizens who are here today.

San Quintín:

At the national meeting of the Yaqui population, the term indigenous People is officially useable at the present time.

Rogelio Zuniga

Every Mexican is taken into consideration equally; indigenous or not indigenous.

Indigenous participation should be supported by several programs.

Electromagnetic amperes are not covered in the manual?

The citizenry is invited to express its opinions and doubts on the Internet page.

Close of the event; **Expressions of:**

Appreciation for the effort of the citizens who joined us today through their different organizations.

Appreciation to the Mayor for allowing us to use the city's facilities.

Appreciation to all who contributed.