

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

+ + + + +

DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

+ + + + +

NATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON MICROBIOLOGICAL  
CRITERIA FOR FOODS

+ + + + +

MEETING

+ + + + +

TUESDAY, JULY 12, 2005

The meeting came to order at 10:45 a.m. in the Federal Hall of the Washington Plaza Hotel, 10 Thomas Circle, N.W., Washington, D.C., 20050, Dr. Merle Pierson, Chair, Presiding.

Members Present:

- MERLE PIERSON, Ph.D., Chairperson
- ROBERT BRACKET, Ph.D., Vice-Chairperson
- DR. DAVID ACHESON, Member
- DR. KATHRYN BOOR, Member
- DR. SCOTT BROOKS, Member
- DR. PEGGY COOK, Member
- DR. DANIEL ENGELJOHN, Member
- DR. TIMOTHY FREIER, Member
- DR. SPENCER GARRETT, Member
- DR. WALT HILL, Member
- DR. LEE-ANN JAYKUS, Member
- MS. BARBARA KOWALCYK, Member
- DR. JOHN KVENBERG, Member
- DR. JOSEPH MADDEN, Member
- DR. ALEJANDRO MAZZOTA, Member
- DR. ANN MARIE MCNAMARA, Member
- DR. DALE MORSE, Member

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

Members Present: (cont.)

DR. ELI PERENCEVICH, Member  
DR. DONALD SCHAFFNER, Member  
MS. VIRGINIA SCOTT, Member  
DR. JOHN SOFOS, Member  
DR. STERLING THOMPSON, Member  
DR. IRENE WESLEY, Member  
DR. DONALD ZINK, Member

Attendance by Phone:

DR. LARRY BEUCHAT, Member  
DR. LINDA HARRIS, Member

Executive Committee Members Present:

LEEANNE JACKSON, PH.D., FDA Liaison  
E. SPENCER GARETT, MS, Commerce Department Liaison  
LTC BRADFORD W. HILDABRAND, DVM, MVPM, Defense  
Department Liaison  
WALT HILL, PH.D., FSIS Liaison  
GERRI RANSOM, MS, Executive Secretariat  
KAREN THOMAS, Advisory Committee Specialist

OUTSIDE PARTICIPANT:

DR. SKIP SEWARD, American Meat Institute

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2 (10:45 a.m.)

3 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Well, good morning  
4 again. This is going to seem somewhat redundant  
5 because we've already had introductions, etc., but  
6 this officially opens our first plenary session of the  
7 2004 - 2006, what should I say, National Advisory  
8 Committee season? That's the span in which we're  
9 chartered.

10 Again, I'm Merle Pierson, the National  
11 Advisory Committee on Microbiological Criteria for  
12 Foods Chair. I'm, again, Acting Undersecretary for  
13 Food Safety and also I'm Deputy Undersecretary for  
14 Food Safety. I get to do two jobs, like you folks. I  
15 don't get two salaries -- I also get one, like you.

16 To my immediate right is the Vice-Chair of  
17 this committee, Dr. Bob Bracket, who is the Director  
18 of FDA's Center for Food Safety and Applied Nutrition.

19 This being the first session of the -- for  
20 the National Advisory Committee, and we're well into  
21 the first year, but we look forward to much work to be  
22 done in this newly formed committee.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

www.nealgross.com

1                   We've had the Committeemembers, both new  
2 and returning, appointed by the Secretary of  
3 Agriculture. I believe all of you have before you an  
4 official whatever document that's signed by the  
5 Secretary saying that you are -- called the  
6 Certificate of Appointment. See, she keeps me on the  
7 right track. You have a Certificate of Appointment  
8 signed by the Secretary.

9                   Actually, I've got some of those, and it's  
10 kind of fun to look at who was Secretary of  
11 Agriculture when and that, you know, Yoder and all  
12 those folks.

13                   Anyway, you'll be starting out this term  
14 with all new work charges. Our previous Committee was  
15 the highlight of effectiveness and efficiency. People  
16 like Spencer and that, chairing the subcommittees, he  
17 just cleared the deck of all charges before you. And  
18 so we're ready to start again.

19                   Actually, it's very, very important to be  
20 able to do that, because when you have this overlap of  
21 new members and you're halfway through a Committee  
22 document, the new members have to get up to speed, but

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealgross.com](http://www.nealgross.com)

1 also the new members like to put their own personal  
2 touch on what has been said. So it takes longer, but  
3 at least we start out with a clean slate on this so we  
4 can move forward.

5 This committee, of course, as I mentioned  
6 before, is performing an invaluable service to the  
7 supporting federal food safety agencies, USDA Food  
8 Safety Inspection Service, Department of Health and  
9 Human Services, Food and Drug Administration and  
10 Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, the  
11 Department of Commerce National Marine Fishery  
12 Services, and the Department of Defense Veterinary  
13 Service Activity.

14 Again, the National Advisory Committee is  
15 designed to provide scientific advice to our nation's  
16 food safety programs. And I'd like to thank each and  
17 every one of you for your willingness to share your  
18 valuable expertise as members of this committee.

19 As I mentioned, the previous Committee was  
20 very, very productive, having finished work on  
21 performance standards for several products of interest  
22 to FSIS and doing work on requisite scientific

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 parameters for establishing alternative methods for  
2 pasteurization.

3 These -- all these documents and materials  
4 are posted on the FSIS website, or actually it's on  
5 the National Advisory Committee's web page.

6 So this work, I think, has been very  
7 important. This, and the past work was very important  
8 to furthering our efforts relative to food safety and  
9 protection of public health. And again, we sure look  
10 forward to the work coming forth in the future. And  
11 also we plan to have these as peer-reviewed -- what  
12 has been done is peer-reviewed journal articles.

13 We anticipate three subcommittees to start  
14 up for this fiscal year and to work beyond this fiscal  
15 year. These will be -- there will be an introduction  
16 to these topics this morning and you'll be starting to  
17 work on these areas this week.

18 We do have, though, also planned, as we  
19 say, on-deck, certain projects, such as review of an  
20 ARS-FSIS Study on indicator organisms and poultry,  
21 assessment of the food safety importance and public  
22 health significance of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1     *paratuberculosis*, and scientific matters for  
2     validating post-harvest treatments for pathogen  
3     control in mollusks and shellfish.

4             I'd like to now turn the meeting over to  
5     our Vice-Chair, Bob Bracket.

6             DR. BRACKET: Thank you, Merle. I too,  
7     would like to welcome all of the returning members to  
8     the Committee as well as the new members. Those of  
9     you who were not here for the earlier part of our  
10    discussion this morning realize that we value very  
11    much the kind of discussion that we get from these  
12    meetings. And the participation of the members here  
13    in the effort allow us to move forward on a variety of  
14    different public health issues. And so, it is very  
15    important to us, and we do look forward to insightful  
16    discussions.

17            At this time, I would like to stop and go  
18    around again, for the record, and have individuals  
19    introduce themselves and state their affiliations.  
20    And keep in mind through this whole meeting to please  
21    speak directly into the microphones. These meetings  
22    are being transcribed, and we want our transcription

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 service to be able to identify whose voice it is with  
2 who's speaking.

3 So I guess I will start down at the  
4 beginning of the table here.

5 DR. ENGELJOHN: Good morning, I'm Dan  
6 Engeljohn, with the Food Safety and Inspection  
7 Service, USDA.

8 MS. SCOTT: I'm Jenny Scott, I'm Senior  
9 Director of Food Safety Programs for the Food Products  
10 Association.

11 MS. THOMAS: Karen Thomas, Advisory  
12 Committee Specialist for NACMCF.

13 MS. RANSOM: Gerri Ransom, FSIS, NACMCF  
14 Executive Secretariat.

15 DR. JACKSON: LeeAnne Jackson, Food and  
16 Drug Administration, Center for Food Safety and  
17 Applied Nutrition, Liaison to the Executive Committee.

18 LTC HILDABRAND: Brad Hildabrand,  
19 Department of Defense, Veterinary Service Activity.

20 DR. BOOR: Kathryn Boor, Cornell University  
21 Department of Food Science.

22 MR. GARRETT: Spencer Garrett, Director of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 the National Seafood Inspection Laboratory for the  
2 National Marine Fisheries Service. Also, I'm the  
3 Agency's principal public health spokesperson.

4 DR. SOFOS: John Sofos, Colorado State  
5 University.

6 DR. WESLEY: Irene Wesley, Agricultural  
7 Research Service, National Animal Disease Center,  
8 Ames, Iowa.

9 DR. THOMPSON: Sterling Thompson, Senior  
10 Manager, Microbiology Research Services, the Hershey  
11 Company.

12 DR. JAYKUS: Lee-Ann Jaykus, Departments of  
13 Food Science and Microbiology, North Carolina State  
14 University.

15 DR. BROOKS: Scott Brooks, with E. & J.  
16 Gallo.

17 DR. COOK: Peggy Cook, Safe Foods  
18 Corporation.

19 DR. FREIER: Tim Freier, with Cargill.

20 DR. ZINK: Don Zink, with Food and Drug  
21 Administration, Center for Food Safety and Applied  
22 Nutrition.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. MADDEN: Joe Madden, Neogen  
2 Corporation, Lansing, Michigan.

3 DR. KVENBERG: John Kvenberg, Food and Drug  
4 Administration, Center for Food Safety and Applied  
5 Nutrition.

6 DR. MAZZOTA: Alejandro Mazzota, with  
7 McDonald's Corporation.

8 DR. MCNAMARA: Ann Marie McNamara, with  
9 Silliker.

10 DR. MORSE: Dale Morse, New York State  
11 Department of Health.

12 MS. KOWALCYK: Barbara Kowalcyk, Beta  
13 Biostatistics and Safe Tables Our Priority.

14 DR. PERENCEVICH: Eli Perencevich,  
15 University of Maryland, Baltimore, and VA Maryland.

16 DR. HILL: Walt Hill, Food Safety and  
17 Inspection Service.

18 DR. SCHAFFNER: Don Schaffner, Rutgers  
19 University.

20 DR. BRACKET: All right, thank you all.  
21 We do have a couple members that are missing, but at  
22 this time I'd like to turn the floor over to -- forgot

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 the people on the phone. So those who are on the  
2 phone, Larry, you can start, I guess?

3 DR. BEUCHAT: Larry Beuchat, Center for  
4 Food Safety, University of Georgia.

5 DR. HARRIS: Linda Harris, UC Davis.

6 DR. BRACKET: All right, thanks. At this  
7 point, I'd like to turn the floor back over to Gerri  
8 Ransom, who is our Executive Secretariat, who can  
9 provide you with some additional information that  
10 you'll need for the meeting.

11 MS. RANSOM: Okay. Good morning again to  
12 our members, and good morning and welcome to our  
13 guests. I want to remind the Committee members that  
14 if you should need anything, please contact Karen or  
15 I.

16 I do want to point out to our guests that  
17 there are tables outside, which you've probably  
18 already seen, that contain documents related to  
19 NACMCF.

20 We do ask that you please not put any of  
21 your own materials that you wish to distribute on  
22 those tables or in front of Committee members. We do

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 have a separate area and you can speak to our folks  
2 outside at the table to get information distributed.

3 Moving on, I wanted to talk a little bit  
4 about NACMCF business. I have a few updates to  
5 report. I mentioned this earlier today, but NACMCF  
6 was rechartered on September 23, 2004.

7 Now, on April 8, 2005, the Secretary of  
8 Agriculture appointed 30 members to the Committee for  
9 the 2004 - 2006 term which, as Dr. Pierson has  
10 indicated, is just beginning. The current Committee  
11 and charter will run through September 23, 2006.

12 We had a slight delay in appointments  
13 being made this term, mostly related to a status  
14 change related to member status.

15 New this year, as our charter indicates,  
16 is the appointment of non-federal government employees  
17 as special government employees, or SGEs. This was  
18 done largely in response to some newly issued guidance  
19 from the Office of Government Ethics.

20 Establishing SGEs provides assurance that  
21 the Committee continues to provide independent  
22 scientific advice and that no financial conflicts of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 interest exist for members.

2 Establishing SGE members also makes our  
3 NACMCF Committee consistent with scientific advisory  
4 committees at FDA and also EPA.

5 I'm looking very much forward to working  
6 with you as a committee, and I hope you find your  
7 NACMCF term enjoyable, rewarding, and challenging, and  
8 I wish you a good work week this week.

9 And now I'll turn the floor back over to  
10 Dr. Pierson.

11 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Thank you, Gerri.  
12 And now let's move on to today's work. With all these  
13 formal introductions done we can get down to the real  
14 meat of the issues and reasons we're here.

15 It's been mentioned you'll receive  
16 introductions on our three active subcommittee topics  
17 and these subcommittees will commence their work this  
18 afternoon and for the remainder of this week.

19 First of all, then, is the Analytical  
20 Utility of *Campylobacter* Methodologies. This  
21 subcommittee is chaired by Dr. Dan Engeljohn, and Dr.  
22 Bill Shaw of FSIS who will be presenting this charge

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 to us today.

2 Determination of Cooking Parameters for  
3 Safe Seafood for Consumers; this subcommittee will be  
4 chaired by Spencer Garrett of the National Marine  
5 Fisheries Services, and Dr. Bob Bracket of FDA will be  
6 presenting this charge.

7 And then Consumer Guidelines for Safe  
8 Cooking of Poultry Products; this subcommittee will be  
9 chaired by Dr. Dan Engeljohn and Paul Uhler of FSIS  
10 will be making the presentation.

11 So what I'll do is call upon Bill Shaw to  
12 introduce our *Campylobacter* topic. Bill?

13 DR. SHAW: Okay. So I'll be introducing  
14 the charge for *Campylobacter*. The Agency seeks advice  
15 on the proposed *Campylobacter* methodology, as well as  
16 any other relevant methodology that may be of equal or  
17 greater value and should be considered for the  
18 upcoming baseline study.

19 And then the questions go as: What  
20 additional circumstances should be considered in order  
21 for FSIS to conclude that the poultry baseline study  
22 should address more than the two principal

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1       *Campylobacter* species of *Campylobacter jejuni* and  
2       *Campylobacter coli*?

3                   Question two, I broke down into the  
4       individual sentences. How can the ARS method, which  
5       Dr. Stan Bailey will talk more about later this  
6       afternoon, be most successfully used for high volume  
7       analysis in the conduct of a baseline study of  
8       *Campylobacter* presence and enumeration on poultry,  
9       both chicken, turkey, and goose, etc., possibly,  
10      carcasses, parts and ground product that may lead to a  
11      potential performance standard or guideline for the  
12      regulated industry?

13                   And then also: What, if any,  
14      modifications should be made as a result of discussing  
15      this method in comparison with others presented to the  
16      committee? Which, in addition Dr. Eric Line and Dr.  
17      Robert Mandrell will be speaking about.

18                   Please consider whether the above  
19      described atmospheric conditions, media and pre-  
20      enrichment and storage media are acceptable for the  
21      objective of this baseline study.

22                   And then question three entails as to --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 to utilize FSIS resources efficiently and effectively,  
2 FSIS expects to maintain as much continuity as  
3 possible between the current boiler rinse sampling for  
4 *Salmonella* and the proposed sampling for *Campylobacter*  
5 species.

6 What concerns regarding the *Campylobacter*  
7 species sampling method need to be attended to in  
8 order to properly address post-chill injured  
9 *Campylobacter* species cells as well as viable non  
10 cultural coccoid cells?

11 Moving on to question four: What further  
12 subtyping method should be performed on confirmed  
13 cultured, examples would be -- restriction fragment  
14 length polymorphism(RFLP), pulsed-field gel  
15 electrophoresis, ribosomal DNA sequencing, or possibly  
16 antibiotic susceptibility? And there are others that  
17 I'm sure the Committee will address? And what, if any,  
18 limitations do any of these methods pose?

19 Question five: What effect would *in situ*  
20 *Campylobacter* species cell aggregation have on the  
21 accuracy and reproducibility of the enumeration  
22 counts, and is there any remedy to address this issue?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 And Dr. Mandrell will speak about this.

2 And question six: Occasionally, non-  
3 thermophilic *Campylobacter* species cause human  
4 illness. It is unclear whether livestock and poultry  
5 are reservoirs for these species, or if they are  
6 present on meat and poultry products following  
7 slaughter and processing.

8 Current methodologies use selective agents  
9 and incubation conditions which may reduce their  
10 detection. If a pilot study was conducted to  
11 ascertain the presence of these species on meat the  
12 poultry products, what methodologies would best detect  
13 these species?

14 And I just wanted to say, later on this  
15 afternoon we'll have talks given by Dr. Robert  
16 Mandrell, Dr. Eric Line, and Dr. Stan Bailey, to give  
17 more insight into the background. Thank you.

18 DR. PIERSON: Thank you. You might just  
19 hold your place here for a couple seconds. You're  
20 wondering why? Because if we have any -- do we have  
21 any comments from the committee. You didn't expect  
22 this, did you?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 MR. GARRETT: The seafood guy is going to  
2 come.

3 DR. PIERSON: Okay. The seafood guy has a  
4 question.

5 MR. GARRETT: But under question two, it  
6 goes back: What, if any, modification should be made as  
7 a result of discussing this method in comparison with  
8 others presented to the committee?

9 And I would just suggest, you might want  
10 to add, and I'm sorry I didn't pick this up with the  
11 Executive Committee, just add the phrase, "and the  
12 reasons why" so you suggest modifications and  
13 specifically indicate the reasons why.

14 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Dale?

15 DR. MORSE: The question is the  
16 *Campylobacter* testing going to replace or supplement  
17 the *Salmonella* testing?

18 DR. GARRETT: It would supplement.

19 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Do we have any other  
20 questions?

21 DR. WESLEY: I do. When is the pilot  
22 study scheduled to begin?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 DR. GARRETT: Are you referring to  
2 question six of the baseline study or --

3 DR. WESLEY: The pilot study. You  
4 mentioned the pilot study.

5 DR. GARRETT: Yes. At this moment it's  
6 not scheduled. That's why we're asking the Committee  
7 if this was done, what would be your suggestions.

8 However, we do -- are proposing a baseline  
9 study for *E. coli*.

10 DR. PIERSON: As a reminder, this is Merle  
11 Pierson and I'm going to ask at the end if there are  
12 any questions, so if you have any questions or  
13 comments, identify yourself. I'm sorry I didn't  
14 mention that to you. In sequence, the first person was  
15 Spencer Garrett and then Dale Morse and then Irene  
16 Wesley.

17 And then, what Karen's doing is, she's  
18 indicating like they do at these international meetings  
19 if you have questions and you need to take your  
20 standard and you'd go like this (indicating) and you'd  
21 set it up on end. So do we have any nameplates  
22 standing on end here? If I see none, I would thank you

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 for your presentation.

2 I might also mention that, what we'll do  
3 is, you know, during the Committee meetings, we will  
4 have only Committee members entering into the  
5 discussion here. And then we will have the following,  
6 the regular meeting itself, opportunity for public  
7 comments or questions. So it'll be around 12:15,  
8 following the presentation of the -- two more of these  
9 topics that will allow for an opening for public  
10 comment and input. Okay. Thank you very much.

11 Now, I'll call upon Dr. Bob Bracket who  
12 will discuss the FDA National Marine Fishery Services  
13 seafood charge.

14 DR. BRACKET: All right. Thank you. As  
15 Merle said, what I'm going to do is talk about the  
16 issue that we have before NACMCF which is determination  
17 of cooking parameters for safe seafood.

18 And just as a point of background, so that  
19 everybody's at the same place, the reason we're  
20 concerned for this is because raw seafood can be  
21 contaminated with a variety of pathogens from various  
22 sources. And this particular product can be consumed

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 raw, partially cooked in some cases, or thoroughly  
2 cooked.

3 And the question that we have at FDA and  
4 we share with National Marine Fishery Service, is we  
5 would like to be able to give consumers clear and  
6 consistent guidance on how they can prepare and cook  
7 seafood so that it is safe microbiologically.

8 There are a number of different pathogens  
9 that are of concern. The ones that I have listed on  
10 the slide here are some examples, but I don't think  
11 that the Committee should be just confined to these if  
12 there are others that the Committee, during discussion  
13 finds that are also relevant, please feel free to  
14 discuss those as well.

15 These, the ones I've got listed here are  
16 *Vibrio* species and *Salmonella* species, *Listeria*  
17 *monocytogenes*, and *Staphylococcus aureus*. But we also  
18 are interested in treatments that would make for  
19 microbiologically safe products with respect to viruses  
20 and parasites that might be in sea foods as well.

21 The charge that we have to the  
22 subcommittee is, first of all, determine the minimal

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 requirements for achieving microbiologically safe  
2 cooked seafood, and the associated methods for an  
3 objective measurement to be sure that the product is  
4 properly cooked, and assess that all pathogens of  
5 concern, associated heat-labile toxins, if it's  
6 applicable, and seafood cooking methods that may be  
7 used by consumers.

8           There are a number of different cooking  
9 methods that one can find, both in cookbooks as well in  
10 some other sorts of industry documents, and I think all  
11 of these should be worth discussing.

12           Specific questions that we would like to  
13 see addressed are, first: What pathogens and parasites  
14 are of concern in seafood purchased by consumers? Do  
15 cooking methods differ in their ability to eliminate  
16 the identified organisms?

17           Third: Do the cooking requirements differ  
18 by the type of seafood, that is to say, would it differ  
19 by -- if it's a finfish, whether it be a molluscan  
20 shellfish or crustacean.

21           Fourth: What effect, if any does the  
22 condition of the seafood, when purchased, that is, if

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 it's raw state, cooked, frozen, have on the cooking  
2 treatment that will be required to make it safe?

3

4 Five: Is there a single temperature that  
5 will insure safe seafood?

6 Six: Are there other consumer methods for  
7 preparing sea foods that need to be addressed. And the  
8 example that we want here, some consumers believe that  
9 lime juice used in cerviche, which basically pickles  
10 it, cooks the product. And that needs to be stated  
11 emphatically.

12 And finally: Should consumer advice vary  
13 based on a susceptible at-risk populations? By this I  
14 mean, the young, the elderly, or pregnant women, or  
15 others that may be immuno-compromised, is there a  
16 separate set of directions that we need to give these  
17 individuals?

18 The outcome that we hope to get from the  
19 recommendations and the discussion of the Committee is  
20 that the information will be developed -- the  
21 information developed by the subcommittee, will be used  
22 by the Food and Drug Administration as well as the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 National Marine Fisheries Service, to develop consumer  
2 messages on cooking parameters necessary to insure the  
3 safety of seafood. And again, here are the ideal that  
4 we would like to have is consistency for consumers.

5 So that is the charge, and at this time I  
6 guess I'll address any questions or comments that you  
7 might have. Dale Morse?

8 DR. MORSE: I'm Dale Morse, New York.  
9 Just curious. A little bit more elaboration on the  
10 type of viruses. Are you going to be looking at  
11 Norovirus and hepatitis A, or is that to be determined?  
12 What -- what will you be looking at--

13 DR. BRACKET: We would like the Committee  
14 to determine that. If there's one or another that is  
15 of most concern, you're free to discuss that. Don't  
16 restrict yourself to anything that -- obviously we  
17 don't want viruses considered that have no relevance to  
18 seafood, but if it's a possibility for making a person  
19 ill, we would like to see it addressed.

20 DR. WESLEY: Will your committee consider  
21 wild versus farm-raised sea foods?

22 DR. BRACKET: I think that is a

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 consideration, yes. That's something that could be  
2 addressed. That goes back to the source of the  
3 product. Jenny?

4 MS. SCOTT: Jenny Scott, Food Products  
5 Association. Question number five asks for a single  
6 temperature that will insure safe seafood. Are you  
7 looking for a temperature without a time component,  
8 specifically, or could that be a temperature and time  
9 relationship?

10 DR. BRACKET: I would imagine that could  
11 be a temperature and time combination but is there one  
12 cooking parameter that could be given to all seafood as  
13 the question.

14 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Thank you, Bob.  
15 Gerri and I were just in conference here, and the way  
16 things are going right now is, it's mostly likely you  
17 will be finished well before noon, which is wonderful.

18  
19 So what we'll be doing is, immediately  
20 following this last presentation, we'll have any  
21 general public comments. We'll leave those open so  
22 that if you as public are going to comment, you --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 Gerri, you want folks to sign in or --

2 MS. RANSOM: Yes, we would like for public  
3 comment for people to go out to the front and sign up  
4 for that. And we'd limit it to ten minutes per person.

5 DR. PIERSON: Okay. We're ready for the  
6 presentation on the charge related to the cooking of  
7 poultry, so --

8 Paul, do you want to present the charge for consumer  
9 guidelines for safe cooking of poultry products?

10 MR. UHLER: A charge to subcommittee is to  
11 determine the minimum requirements for achieving  
12 microbiologically safe cooked poultry and associated  
13 methods of objective measurement.

14 The subcommittee should also assess all  
15 pathogens of concern in poultry cooking methods that  
16 may be used by consumers.

17 The information developed by this  
18 subcommittee will be used by FSIS to develop consumer  
19 messages on the cooking parameters necessary to insure  
20 the safety of poultry.

21 Questions to be considered are: What are  
22 limitations in various cooking methods, particularly

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 microwaving, that may need to be conveyed through  
2 labeling and other means to insure that poultry cooked  
3 by consumers is safe?

4           Second question: Do cooking requirements  
5 differ by a type of poultry? For example, chicken  
6 versus turkey, whole carcass versus parts, ground  
7 products with different levels of fat, and raw versus  
8 partially cooked.

9           And what effect, if any, does the  
10 condition of poultry, just prior to cooking, for  
11 example, chilled versus frozen, have on the cooking  
12 treatment?

13           Next: What is the single time/temperature  
14 combination for each type of poultry, whole versus  
15 parts, that was mentioned in number two, for consumers  
16 to use to insure safe cooked poultry?

17           Also: What parameters should inspectors  
18 consider in developing validated cooking instructions  
19 for use by consumers? Since consumers are not as  
20 capable of calibrating the cooking equipment and  
21 temperature measuring devices, as are inspected  
22 establishments, what, if any, special considerations

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealgross.com](http://www.nealgross.com)

1 should be considered in identification of safe cooking  
2 guidance for consumers? For example, adding a safety  
3 margin to the minimum time/temperature.

4 And lastly: What safety-based labeling  
5 considerations should be considered for conveying safe  
6 cooking instruction to consumers?

7 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Do we have any  
8 questions from the committee?

9 MS. KOWALCYK: The only question --  
10 Barbara Kowalcyk -- the only question I had is, should  
11 the committee be considering if there should be  
12 specific instructions to subpopulations, as with the  
13 seafood? Question number seven.

14 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Don?

15 DR. SCHAFFNER: Don Schaffner, Rutgers  
16 University. It seems to me like question two is a very  
17 simple question that requires just a yes or a no  
18 answer. Is that -- is that the correct phrasing of  
19 that question?

20 DR. PIERSON: Could you back up to  
21 question two?

22 DR. SCHAFFNER: Do cooking requirements

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 differ? I'd have to say, probably the answer is "yes."

2 So you might want to consider revising  
3 that question to give us, you know, allow a longer  
4 answer.

5 DR. PIERSON: A simple "yes" would not  
6 suffice? You know, this seems a little like the  
7 prelims, and so a yes or no wouldn't do it. The  
8 expectation would be, I would think, to provide that  
9 analysis.

10 DR. SCHAFFNER: I have another question,  
11 too. Another question: I'm trying to understand the  
12 difference between question five and question seven.  
13 They both deal with, I think, labeling and  
14 instructions. Five sort of sounds like the  
15 establishments are developing the instructions whereas  
16 seven, the way I read it, it sort of implies that the  
17 Agency is developing those instructions.

18 So I'd just like some clarification, if  
19 possible, as to what the difference is between those  
20 two questions.

21 MR. UHLER: The question five: Yes, the  
22 establishments are -- we encourage them to put the --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 to validate the cooking instructions that they have on  
2 the packaging.

3 And seven is: So, how can they best be  
4 conveyed to the consumer?

5 DR. ENGLEJOHN: This is Englejohn with  
6 FSIS. If I could provide some clarity as well. We do  
7 have, and we will get a presentation, the subcommittee  
8 will have a presentation made by a representative from  
9 the Minnesota Department of Agriculture and Health,  
10 partly related to an outbreak that occurred in that  
11 state.

12 And evidence would be -- they will at  
13 least be providing some information about what  
14 information was available to the consumer and then  
15 whether or not that information was actually valid that  
16 was on the packaging.

17 And so the two questions get at both of  
18 those issues. One is there is an expectation that the  
19 labeling instructions that the manufacturer uses would  
20 have to be validated. That is an area for which the  
21 Agency has not focused a great deal of attention, and  
22 we believe there needs to be guidance provided on what

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 would constitute appropriate validation of cooking  
2 instructions for the consumer.

3           Number seven, though, relates more to past  
4 Agency practices which we have used, as an example for  
5 partially cooked meat patties, we -- the Agency  
6 required that the labels of partially cooked meat  
7 patties have a warning statement that basically said,  
8 "Partially cooked, for safety must be cooked to an  
9 internal temperature of 160 degrees."

10           And we have other examples like that and  
11 they'll be examples presented in the subcommittee. But  
12 number seven gets at the issue of, would this be an  
13 appropriate type of labeling for consumers to help  
14 better convey safety conditions.

15           DR. ENGLEJOHN: Okay. So just to make sure  
16 that I understand, five is really dealing with the  
17 validity of the instructions whereas seven is dealing  
18 with the ability of those instructions to be  
19 interpreted by the consumer, is that right? Okay.  
20 Thank you.

21           DR. PIERSON: Okay. Do we have any other  
22 questions? If not, thank you very much for the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 presentation. And what we'll do now is we'll move on  
2 to public comments on these issues.

3 We have no one signed up for public  
4 comment. However, if you are so motivated at the  
5 present time, we'll still take comment. So if you  
6 haven't signed up, we'll still -- sure. Just make sure  
7 to identify yourself for the record.

8 DR. SEWARD: Skip Seward with the American  
9 Meat Institute. With regard to the safe cooking of  
10 poultry products questions. On number five, just so  
11 it's clear to me and perhaps to others, when you're  
12 talking about consumers, are you talking about what we  
13 think of as the public consumers? Not necessarily for  
14 retailers, restaurants, and -- because most of these  
15 establishments -- many establishments produce many,  
16 many products which go to many, many different  
17 customers, not all of whom are consumers.

18 And so I think you need to make sure that  
19 if you're addressing this question, that you're talking  
20 about those products which are going to households and  
21 consumers. That's when you specify, you're talking  
22 about for every product they make for every customer

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 that they have, then you perhaps need to clarify that,  
2 if that's your intent. Thank you.

3 DR. ENGLEJOHN: This is Englejohn, chair  
4 of that subcommittee, and thank you for that question.

5 And I would say that our primary direction  
6 at this time will be to focus on guidance to the  
7 consumer, the public consumer, not food service or  
8 other institutions.

9 DR. PIERSON: Do we have any other  
10 comment? Do you have a comment? Go ahead. I was  
11 going to say, you had your chance, but well, okay.

12 DR. KVENBERG: John Kvenberg, Food and  
13 Drug. Just when it gets down to the validation  
14 procedures and question five, I think just to bear in  
15 mind that it may have great utility relative to  
16 providing uniform guidance to the retail community and  
17 the people who implement local inspections through our  
18 food codes, because validation of processing  
19 temperatures on poultry products are something that  
20 could be utilized to back-up the science in those  
21 recommendations as well. Thank you.

22 DR. PIERSON: Okay. Any other comments,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 including members of the committee?

2 DR. MORSE: Dale Morse. I just had a  
3 procedural question. Since the committees are meeting  
4 independently, the potential for opportunity for the  
5 Committee as a whole to meet and discuss comes at the  
6 next meeting when there's presentation back, or --

7 DR. PIERSON: Yes. Okay. Good point.  
8 This is the only plenary session that we will have for  
9 this particular meeting. The reason is, you know, the  
10 orientation and introduction. We did not feel that the  
11 committees would be far enough down the road for a  
12 report out for a general session.

13 However, at some point in time, when  
14 there's sufficient progress, or that it's to the point  
15 that there needs to be a final report out to the entire  
16 committee, that will be done.

17 So -- and at some point in time the  
18 reports would be adopted by the full committee, okay?  
19 Does that answer your point or go beyond answering it?

20 DR. MORSE: Yes. So there'd be another  
21 opportunity to discuss these issues and, I guess in  
22 that regard, I know we have extra time, it sounds like

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 each committee will have additional presentations of  
2 information, so they can get more questions from the  
3 Committee after those presentations and --

4 DR. PIERSON: Right. At the subcommittee  
5 meetings. That's correct. For the Committee members, I  
6 mean, if we have specific individuals, appointed to  
7 these subcommittees. However, if you're not on that  
8 subcommittee and you have the free time, feel free to  
9 go to that subcommittee meeting and put in your two-  
10 cent's worth, too.

11 But, yes, the subcommittees, after the  
12 presentations, may have some potential for further  
13 refining these questions or bringing up some additional  
14 things. Just have to be a little careful in doing so.

15 We need to make sure that there's some concurrence of  
16 the sponsoring agencies. We don't want you to get too  
17 far astray of the points or the issues.

18 But that's part of the job of the  
19 subcommittee chairs, too -- to keep everything on  
20 course. Yes, Spencer?

21 MR. GARRETT: Thank you, Merle. Just a  
22 point back to Dale, that there'll be ample opportunity

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 for the full Committee to discuss what goes on in the  
2 subcommittees when they come back. These initial  
3 proceedings are kind of like, you know, group  
4 activities, growth activities, whatever, but just to  
5 get it off, but then I would recommend, Mr. Chairman,  
6 that there be subcommittee reports for the full  
7 Committee at the next scheduled meeting so you can  
8 together go through it to make certain the  
9 subcommittees are not getting off track, or they forgot  
10 something, or whatever.

11 DR. MORSE: Just to comment back -- this  
12 is Dale Morse again -- I think that's great if the  
13 other meetings are run this efficiently there might be  
14 an opportunity to have, you know, some of the  
15 presentations to the whole group so that then, when it  
16 is presented back, we'd have more of the background  
17 information ahead of time, so just a thought. If it's  
18 going to be this timely then that might have been an  
19 opportunity to have the subpresentations of the whole  
20 Committee for just future reference.

21 DR. PIERSON: Yes, possibility. And we've  
22 done that sort of thing. The difficulty is, sometimes

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)

1 there's so many subcommittees going and other things we  
2 -- and of course there will be, you know, background  
3 presented to the full Committee as it is appropriate,  
4 too.

5 So, yes, if we need some further education  
6 of the full Committee we can work something out.

7 Okay. Any other comments or questions?  
8 Okay. With that, I thank you very much for your  
9 participation this morning in opening up our National  
10 Advisory Committee for the 2004 - 2006 designation as -  
11 - for charter of this committee.

12 And this afternoon at 1:30 -- starting at  
13 1:30, we'll have the subcommittees, appropriate  
14 subcommittees meet.

15 One of the things Gerri was reminding me  
16 of is since there was a federal register notice that  
17 included the subcommittees starting at 1:30, we have to  
18 stick to that. So that we'll do -- the subcommittees  
19 will then start at 1:30.

20 So, again, is there anything else that  
21 anyone wants to add for the good of the cause and --  
22 Okay. If not, again I thank you very much and look

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

1 forward to your good work. Oh, here comes something.

2 MS. RANSOM: I just wanted to mention the  
3 rooms where the subcommittees going to be held at --  
4 they're right behind us. The seafood subcommittee's  
5 going to be in the Adams Room. And they're directly,  
6 right behind me.

7 DR. PIERSON: The meeting is adjourned.

8 (12:00 p.m.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS

1323 RHODE ISLAND AVE., N.W.

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20005-3701

(202) 234-4433

[www.nealrgross.com](http://www.nealrgross.com)