



Log M-413 B

National Transportation Safety Board

Washington, D.C. 20594

Safety Recommendation

Date: February 6, 1998

In reply refer to: M-98-7 and -8

Mike Foster
Governor
State of Louisiana
Post Office Box 94004
Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70804-9004

Shortly after 1400 on December 14, 1996, the fully loaded Liberian bulk carrier *Bright Field* temporarily lost propulsion power as the vessel was navigating outbound in the Lower Mississippi River at New Orleans, Louisiana. The vessel struck a wharf adjacent to a populated commercial area that included a shopping mall, a condominium parking garage, and a hotel. No fatalities resulted from the accident, and no one aboard the *Bright Field* was injured; however, 4 serious injuries and 58 minor injuries were sustained during evacuations of shore facilities, a gaming vessel, and an excursion vessel located near the impact area. Total property damages to the *Bright Field* and to shoreside facilities were estimated at about \$20 million.¹

The National Transportation Safety Board determined that the probable cause of this accident was the failure of Clearsky Shipping Company to adequately manage and oversee the maintenance of the engineering plant aboard the *Bright Field*, with the result that the vessel temporarily lost power while navigating a high-risk area of the Mississippi River. Contributing to the amount of property damage and the number and types of injuries sustained during the accident was the failure of the U.S. Coast Guard, the Board of Commissioners of the Port of New Orleans, and International RiverCenter, Inc., to adequately assess, manage, or mitigate the risks associated with locating unprotected commercial enterprises in areas vulnerable to vessel strikes.

This accident demonstrates that the many and diverse stakeholders in the area of the Port of New Orleans, including the Coast Guard, the State of Louisiana, the Board of Commissioners of the Port of New Orleans (the "Dock Board"), the pilot organizations, and the owners and operators of riverfront properties and nearby moored passenger ships, did not adequately prepare for or mitigate the risk of a marine casualty affecting people and property within the Port of New Orleans. Some of the stakeholders, most notably the Dock Board, had commissioned partial risk

¹For more detailed information, read Marine Accident Report—*Allision of the Liberian Freighter Bright Field with the Poydras Street Wharf, Riverwalk Marketplace, and New Orleans Hilton Hotel in New Orleans, Louisiana, December 14, 1996*. (NTSB/MAR-98/01)

assessment studies at various times for the assets in the harbor area. Despite their limitations (in either geography or scope), these studies did provide adequate information for the stakeholders to recognize the possibility of an accident similar to the one involving the *Bright Field*.

For example, risk assessment projects predicted an increase in accidents involving collisions, rammings, and groundings due to increased river traffic. The Louisiana State University risk assessment project, in 1994, concluded that no sections of the Port of New Orleans waterfront were free of ship allisions, including the area where the high-capacity passenger vessels, gaming vessels, and riverfront properties were located. Analysis of accident data for the Port of New Orleans from 1983 through 1993 (a total of 166 rammings along the left descending bank between miles 91 and 101 AHP) identified a mooring area for gaming vessels that had seen the fewest "historical allisions on the left bank." The study acknowledged, however, that no area of the left descending bank of the river had been completely free of vessel strikes during the 11-year period studied.

Despite this history of sensitivity to risk within the port area, the Riverwalk complex, including the condominium garage and the Hilton Hotel Riverside, were constructed on old warehouse piers on the river side of the levee. This location offered no "crush zone" that could absorb the impact of a marine ramming, and despite the fact that the piers themselves were not built to withstand being struck by a heavy vessel, no physical barriers were constructed outboard of the new buildings to offer them protection.

In contrast, the 1987 Audubon Institute-sponsored risk assessment similarly determined that there had been few allisions at the Bienville Street wharf and that because it is high up in the bend, it faced low risk of being struck by an outbound vessel. Nonetheless, recognizing low incidence, but a potential for high consequences, the Audubon Institute placed the Aquarium of the Americas behind the levee with a 100-foot buffer zone to protect the *shoreside* structure. No similar safety feature was considered or constructed for the Hilton Hotel or the Riverwalk Marketplace.

The International RiverCenter (IRC) obtained construction permits for the riverside expansion of the hotel from the city of New Orleans, the Corps of Engineers, and the Orleans Levee Board. In addition, the construction plans were approved by the Dock Board. According to the Dock Board, it may make recommendations to the IRC or other stakeholders in the area to widen the wharf, to allow silt to accumulate, or to further increase the robustness of construction in the area immediately outbound of their structures; however, it has no authority to compel such action. Currently, the damaged portions of the Riverwalk Marketplace mall, the parking deck, and the Hilton Hotel are being rebuilt in the same location. No physical barriers have been included in the rebuilding of these facilities. As with the initial construction, all permits were granted, and all plans were approved.

Furthermore, several passenger vessels, including gaming, tour and cruise vessels, were allowed to dock along the left descending bank, the side of the river at highest risk. Had the *Bright Field* lost power some time later and the same accident scenario evolved, the ship would likely have rammed the gambling vessel, resulting in substantial loss of life. The cruise vessels,

which had even less warning time, would quite likely also have sustained serious passenger injuries or loss of life.

While silting around the vessels' docking areas may offer some protection from ramming by deep-draft vessels at average river stages, the silt layer did not reduce water depth sufficiently to retard a runaway ship when the river was high, as it was on the day of the *Bright Field* accident. Additionally, no tugboats were used either as escorts or as a "barrier" to prevent a runaway ship from ramming the shore or colliding with another marine asset. And no environmental controls, such as the Corps of Engineers' opening of the Bonnet Carré Spillway, were put in place to reduce river flow or current.

The property owners and other stakeholders within the Port of New Orleans clearly had the responsibility to establish and maintain a reasonable level of safety in the port area. The Safety Board concluded, however, that the stakeholders within the Port of New Orleans, including Federal, State, and local agencies; private commercial entities; shipowners, and pilot associations have not determined the overall level of risk associated with the full range of activities within the port area and have not provided adequate protection for persons and property in that area.

As noted above, many of the risk factors associated with river commerce within the port area have already been identified in previous risk-assessment studies. The Safety Board believes that these factors may be amenable to known risk-reduction or risk-mitigation initiatives. Such initiatives might include reducing vessel speed, opening the spillway on a more regular basis, using tugboats either as escorts or as a "barrier" to protect marine assets, or moving the passenger vessels to a safer location.

The National Transportation therefore makes the following safety recommendations to the State of Louisiana:

Participate with the U.S. Coast Guard and other stakeholders in a comprehensive risk assessment that considers all activities, marine and shoreside, within the Port of New Orleans. (M-98-7)

In cooperation with the U.S. Coast Guard and other stakeholders, including Federal, State, and local agencies; private commercial entities; shipowners; and pilot associations, implement risk-management and risk-mitigation initiatives that will ensure the safety of people and property within the Port of New Orleans. (M-98-8)

Also, the Safety Board issued Safety Recommendations M-98-1 through -4 to the U.S. Coast Guard; M-98-5 and -6 to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers; M-98-9 through -12 to the Board of Commissioners of the Port of New Orleans; M-98-13 through -15 to International RiverCenter; M-98-16 through -18 to Clearsky Shipping Company; M-98-19 through -23 to New Orleans Paddlewheels, Inc.; M-98-24 through -26 to the New Orleans Baton Rouge Steamship Pilots Association; M-98-27 and -28 to the Crescent River Port Pilots Association; and M-98-29 and -30 to Associated Federal Pilots and Docking Masters of Louisiana, Inc.

The National Transportation Safety Board is an independent Federal agency with the statutory responsibility "to promote transportation safety by conducting independent accident investigations and by formulating safety improvement recommendations" (Public Law 93-633). The Safety Board is vitally interested in any action taken as a result of its safety recommendations. Therefore, it would appreciate a response from you regarding action taken or contemplated with respect to the recommendations in this letter. Please refer to Safety Recommendations M-98-7 and -8 in your reply. If you need additional information, you may call (202) 314-6450.

Chairman HALL, Vice Chairman FRANCIS, and Members HAMMERSCHMIDT, GOGLIA, and BLACK concurred in these recommendations.

By: 
Jim Hall
Chairman