

RECORD TYPE: FEDERAL (NOTES MAIL)

CREATOR:Debbie S. Fiddelke (CN=Debbie S. Fiddelke/OU=CEQ/O=EOP@Exchange [CEQ])

CREATION DATE/TIME:28-AUG-2003 15:29:21.00

SUBJECT:: Fw: co2 talking points sent by epa

TO:Andrew_Wheeler@epw.senate.gov (Andrew Wheeler) (Andrew_Wheeler@epw.senate.gov (A
READ:UNKNOWN

TEXT:

Fyi

----- Original Message -----

From:Dana M. Perino/CEQ/EOP

To:Debbie S. Fiddelke/CEQ/EOP@EOP,
John D. Estes/WHO/EOP@Exchange@EOP,
michael_catanzaro@epw.senate.gov @ inet,
Kenneth L. Peel/CEQ/EOP@EOP,
William F. Holbrook/CEQ/EOP@EOP,
Khary I. Cauthen/CEQ/EOP@EOP

Cc:

Date: 08/28/2003 03:00:56 PM

Subject: co2 talking points sent by epa

press release still to come....stay tuned

Notice of Denial of the Petition for EPA to Regulate
Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions from Motor Vehicles
8/28/03

Action: EPA today (August 28, 2003) signed a notice denying a
petition to regulate greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles. The
Agency is denying the petition to regulate greenhouse gas emissions from
motor vehicles for three reasons:

1) EPA lacks authority under the Clean Air Act to
regulate CO2 and other greenhouse gases for climate change purposes;

2) The only practical way to reduce motor vehicle
emissions of CO2 is to regulate fuel economy, which is a task that
Congress has already assigned to DOT; and

3) EPA believes that regulating greenhouse gas
emissions from motor vehicles would be inappropriate at this time.

(See additional points below related to the reasons.)

In February 2002, President Bush announced an aggressive approach to
addressing climate change that encourages substantial voluntary reductions
in GHG intensity and pursues fuel economy improvements:

< This approach sets a national goal of reducing the GHG
intensity of the U.S. economy by 18 percent over the next ten years. This
strategy sets the U.S. on a path to slow the growth of GHG emissions and,
as the science justifies, to stop and then reverse that growth.

< In taking prudent environmental action at home and abroad, the U.S. is advancing a realistic and effective long-term approach, rather than adopting costly short-term measures whose benefit is uncertain.

< This policy supports vital climate change research, and lays the groundwork for future action by investing in science, technology, and institutions.

< In addition, the President's policy emphasizes international cooperation and promotes working with other nations to develop an efficient and coordinated response to global climate change.

< EPA is building efficient and effective market-driven programs that address the transportation sector's contribution to climate change. These programs include Climate Leaders, Energy Star, Smartway and Best Workplaces for Commuters.

< In February 2002, EPA launched Climate Leaders, a voluntary industry- government partnership under which companies work with EPA to evaluate their GHG emissions, set aggressive reduction goals, and report their progress toward meeting those goals. To date, more than 40 companies from almost all the most energy-intensive industry sectors have joined.

< EPA's Energy Star is a voluntary labeling program that provides critical information to businesses and consumers about the energy efficiency of the products they purchase. Reductions in GHG emissions from Energy Star purchases were equivalent to removing 10 million cars from the road last year.

< The Smartway transport partnership works with the trucking and railroad industry to achieve cleaner and more efficient vehicles and locomotives by adopting pollution control and energy saving technologies. Smartway partners will develop and deploy fuel-efficient technologies and practices to achieve substantial fuel savings and emission reductions. Idling strategies alone have the potential to save 1 billion gallons of diesel fuel per year, while reducing greenhouse gases by 2.5 MMTCE and NOx by 200,000 tons.

< Best Workplace for Commuters offers innovative solutions to commuting in order to reduce vehicle trips and miles traveled. We expect that 3.7 million employees will be covered by this program in 2005.

< EPA will also play a leadership role in advancing fuel cell vehicle and hydrogen fuel technologies and policies to support the U.S. environmental, energy and national security goals.

Additional talking points relating to (1), (2) and (3) above:

< No CAA provision specifically authorizes climate change regulation. A few sections mention climate change, but these are limited to non-regulatory measures.

< Congress has taken up the issue of climate change numerous times over the past few years, but has not enacted legislation that gives EPA authority to regulate GHG emissions for climate change purposes.

< Regulation of CO2 and other GHGs for climate change purposes would have enormous economic, practical, and societal implications, which certainly were not envisioned when the CAA was enacted and amended.

< Under these circumstances, it would be inappropriate for EPA to search for authority to regulate in an existing statute that was not specifically designed or enacted to deal with the climate change issue.

< [In case questions come up concerning the ACannon Memo@] In determining that the CAA does not authorize regulation to address climate change, EPA adopted the conclusion reached by its current General Counsel in a legal opinion reviewing relevant legal authorities and withdrawing the opinion and statements of two former EPA General Counsels who served in the prior Administration..

< Congress entrusted regulation of motor vehicle fuel economy to DOT, not EPA. CO2 emission standards set by EPA under the CAA would effectively supplant fuel economy standards set by DOT under the Energy Policy Act, because the only practical way of reducing vehicle CO2 emissions is to increase fuel economy.

< Establishing GHG emission standards for motor vehicles at this time would be premature, because it would require EPA to make scientific and technical judgments without the benefit of the studies being developed to reduce uncertainties and advance technologies.

< Establishing regulations now would result in an inefficient, piecemeal approach to addressing the climate change issue, because motor vehicles are only one of many categories of GHG emission sources.

< Unilateral EPA regulation of motor vehicle GHG emissions could also hamper U.S. efforts to persuade key developing countries to reduce the GHG intensity of their economies.

Background of the Petition:

§ The petition was filed by the International Center for Technology Assessment and 18 other technology, citizen and environmental advocacy groups October 20, 1999.

§ The petition asserted that EPA is obligated to regulate greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from motor vehicles under Section 202(a)(1) of the Clean Air Act.

§ Section 202(a)(1) provides that the Administrator [of EPA] shall by regulation prescribe ... in accordance with the provisions of [section 202], standards applicable to the emission of any air pollutant from any class or classes of new motor vehicle ..., which in his judgment cause, or contribute to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare.@

§ Petitioners claim that EPA has a mandatory duty to regulate GHG emissions from motor vehicles under Section 202 because EPA has already determined that:

§ CO2 and other GHGs are air pollutants under the Clean Air Act; and

§ GHG emissions from motor vehicles contribute to pollution that may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare.

reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare.

To the contrary, EPA has not made findings that trigger a mandatory duty under the CAA, even assuming the CAA authorized regulation to address climate change.

- ICTA and two other organizations (Sierra Club and Greenpeace) have filed a lawsuit in the U.S. District Court for DC seeking to compel EPA to respond to the petition. Rather than engage in needless and unproductive litigation, EPA has decided to take final action on the petition at this time.

0000002200DDDD050B00030000010B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0E0300C0000000024090C
00E0DD06130082010B00020033A33F0600001300DDD4320E000304008ABD00010E00D4DA0C0B00
030100000B00DA32DA0D0A000300000A00DA29D4330A000300000A00D4E03014000000007C0B24
096423240964231400E0DD070B00030000000B00DD546865806F6E6C798070726163746963616C
8077617980746F80726564756365806D6F746F728076656869636C6580656D697373696F6E7380
6F6680434FF206F232F306F380697380746FD0011500000B00090001100E500A0B0001201500D0
726567756C617465806675656C8065636F6E6F6D792C8077686963688069738061807461736B80
7468617480436F6E67726573738068617380616C72656164798061737369676E656480746FD001
1500000B00090001000F400B0C0001201500D0444F54D4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000
000A00D43B80616E64DD08170083010B00020033A33F060000840600001700DD8CD0041F000015
00130001F00F300C0D0001027C0B64237C0B642302201F00D08CDD090B00030000000B00DDCCDD
04220082010B00030033A30002000000000000000000000000000000000000000000002200DDDD050B000300
00010B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD06130082010B000200
33A3070800001300DDD4320E000304008ABD00010E00D4DA0C0B00030100000B00DA33DA0D0A00
0300000A00DA29D4330A000300000A00D4E0301400000007C0B24096423240964231400E0DD07
0B0003000000B00DD4550418062656C6965766573807468617480726567756C6174696E678067
7265656E686F7573658067617380656D697373696F6E738066726F6D806D6F746F728076656869
636C6573D0011500000B00090001D011100E0F00C1201500D0776F756C6480626580696E617070
726F70726961746580617480746869738074696D652E80DD08170083010B00020033A3020708000
4C0800001700DD8CD0041F00001500130001C012000F100001027C0B64237C0B642302201F00D0
8CDD090B00030000000B00DDD4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000000A00D4E0110C000000
00CC060C00E0E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD0041700000D000B00022409642324096423022017
00D0D4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000000A00D4E0110C00000000CC060C00E0E0300C00
00000024090C00E028536565806164646974696F6E616C80706F696E74738062656C6F77807265
6C6174656480746F8074686580726561736F6E73D4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000000A
00D42ED4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000000A00D429D0041F00001500130001A014E010
12000102240964232409642302201F00D0CCF20CF2496E80466562727561727980323030322C80
507265736964656E74804275736880616E6E6F756E63656480616E806167677265737369766580
617070726F61636880746F8061646472657373696E6780636C696D617465D0011500000B000900
018016C012140001201500D06368616E6765807468617480656E636F7572616765738073756273
74616E7469616C80766F6C756E7461727980726564756374696F6E7380696E8047484780696E74
656E7369747980616E648070757273756573806675656CD0011500000B000900017017B0131500
01201500D065636F6E6F6D7980696D70726F76656D656E74733AF30CF3D0041500000B00090001
6018A014160001201500D0CCD30E8100800A18000B000E000F0010001100120013001400150028
0012170000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000
00000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000
001E00000000000000000000000000000000000000000008100D3DD04220082010B00030033A3000000
00000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000
74040E00D2E0110C00000000CC060C00E0DD06130082010B00020033A3EF0B00001300DDDD4320E
00030400121700010E00D4F01B06F0D4330A000300000A00D4E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD07
0B00030000000B00DD5468697380617070726F61636880736574738061806E6174696F6E616C80
676F616C806F66807265647563696E67807468658047484780696E74656E73697479806F668074
686580552E532ED0011500000B00090001401A8016180001201500D065636F6E6F6D7980627980
31388070657263656E74806F76657280746865806E6578748074656E8079656172732E80805468
697380737472617465677980736574738074686580552E532E806F6E8061D0011500000B000900
01301B7017190001201500D07061746880746F80736C6F77807468658067726F777468806F6680
47484780656D697373696F6E7380616E642C8061738074686580736369656E6365806A75737469
666965732C80746F8073746F7080616E64D0011500000B00090001201C60181A0001201500D074
68656E807265766572736580746861748067726F7774682EDD08170083010B00020033A3EF0B00
00360C00001700DD8CD0041F00001500130001101D50191B000102240973232409732302201F00
D08CDD090B00030000000B00DDCCDD04220082010B00030033A300010000000000000000000000
000000000000002200DDDD050B00030000010B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0DD06130082010B
00020033A3070E00001300DDD4320E00030400121700010E00D4F01B06F0D4330A000300000A00
D4E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD070B00030000000B00DD496E8074616B696E67807072756465
6E7480656E7669726F6E6D656E74616C80616374696F6E80617480686F6D6580616E6480616272
6F61642C8074686580552E532E80697380616476616E63696E678061D0011500000B00090001F0
1E301B1D0001201500D0D4660B00000100010B00D4D4670A000000000A00D4D4660B0000010002
0B00D4D4670A000000000A00D47265616C697374696380616E6480656666656374697665806C6F
6E67847465726D80617070726F6163682C80726174686572807468616E8061646F7074696E6780
636F73746C798073686F7274847465726DD0011500000B00090001E01F201C1E0001201500D06D

656E686F757365806761738028D45F10000006000500000000011000D4474847D45F1000000600
0400000000011000D429D0011500000B00090001C021101D1F0001201500D0656D697373696F6E
738066726F6D806D6F746F728076656869636C657380756E6465728053656374696F6E80323032
286129283129806F668074686580436C65616E80416972804163742EDD08170083010B00020033
A3763C0000AF3C00001700DD8CD0041F00001500130001B022001E200001022409732324097323
02201F00D08CDD090B00030000000B00DDDD04220082010B00030033A300020000000000000000
000000000000000002200DDDD050B00030000010B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0DD061300
82010B00020033A3073E00001300DDD4320E00030400F09600010E00D4F00304F0D4330A000300
00A00D4E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD070B00030000000B00DD53656374696F6E8032303228
61292831298070726F7669646573807468617480F02004F07468658041646D696E697374726174
6F72805B6F66804550415D807368616C6C80627980726567756C6174696F6ED0011500000B0009
00019024E01F220001201500D0707265736372696265802E2E2E80696E806163636F7264616E63
658077697468807468658070726F766973696F6E73806F66805B73656374696F6E803230325D2C
807374616E6461726473806170706C696361626C65D0011500000B000900018025D02023000120
1500D0746F8074686580656D697373696F6E806F6680616E798061697280706F6C6C7574616E74
8066726F6D80616E7980636C617373806F7280636C6173736573806F66806E6577806D6F746F72
8076656869636C65D0011500000B000900017026C021240001201500D02E2E2E2C807768696368
80696E80686973806A7564676D656E748063617573652C806F7280636F6E747269627574658074
6F2C8061697280706F6C6C7574696F6E807768696368806D6179D0011500000B000900016027B0
22250001201500D0726561736F6E61626C7980626580616E74696369706174656480746F80656E
64616E676572807075626C6963806865616C7468806F728077656C666172652EF01F04F0DD0817
0083010B00020033A3073E0000403E00001700DD8CD0041F000015001300015028A02326000102
240973232409732302201F00D08CDD090B00030000000B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0DD04
220082010B00030033A300030000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000002200
010B00DDF20CF2F20EF2F30EF3F30CF3DD06130082010B00020033A3B24000001300DDD4320E00
030400F09600010E00D4F00304F0D4330A00030000A00D4E0300C0000000024090C00E0DD070B
00030000000B00DD5065746974696F6E65727380636C61696D8074686174804550418068617380
61806D616E6461746F7279806475747980746F80726567756C61746580D45F1000000600050000
0000011000D4474847D45F10000006000400000000011000D480656D697373696F6E738066726F
6DD0011500000B00090001302A8025280001201500D06D6F746F728076656869636C657380756E
6465728053656374696F6E803230328062656361757365804550418068617380616C7265616479
8064657465726D696E656480746861743A80DD08170083010B00020033A3B2400000EB40000017
00DD8CD0061F00001500130001202B702629000102240973232409732302201F00D08CDD090B00
030000000B00DDDD04220082010B00030033A30004000000000000000000000000000000000000022
00DDDD050B00030000010B00DDE0110C00000000CC060C00E0E0110C0000000024090C00E0DD06
130082010B00020033A3414200001300DDD4320E00030400F09600010E00D4F00304F0D4330A00
0300000A00D4E0300C000000007C0B0C00E0DD070B00030000000B00DD434FD41B1F0087010200
0800F401716D0200F20100005802020058020CA21F00D432D41B230086010200080058020CA200
0058020200F2010200F401716DCE4200002300D480616E64806F7468657280D45F100000060005
00000000011000D447484773D45F10000006000400000000011000D4806172658061697280706F
6C6C7574616E747380756E6465728074686580436C65616E80416972804163743B80616E6480DD
08170083010B00020033A341420000864200001700DD8CD0041F00001500130001B00400000000
01027C0B73237C0B732302201F00D08CDD090B00030000000B00DDDD04220082010B00030033A3
0005000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000000022
00CC060C00E0E0110C0000000024090C00E0DD06130082010B00020033A3B44300001300DDD432
0E00030400F09600010E00D4F00304F0D4330A000300000A00D4E0300C000000007C0B0C00E0DD
070B00030000000B00DD45F1000000600050000000011000D4474847D45F1000000600040000
0000011000D480656D697373696F6E738066726F6D806D6F746F728076656869636C657380636F
6E7472696275746580746F80706F6C6C7574696F6E8074686174806D6179D0011500000B000900
019006E001020001201500D0726561736F6E61626C7980626580616E7469636970617465648074
6F80656E64616E676572807075626C6963806865616C7468806F728077656C666172652EDD0817
0083010B00020033A3B4430000F94300001700DD8CD0041F000015001300018007D00203000102
7C0B73237C0B732302201F00D08CDD090B00030000000B00DD4660B00000100010B00D4D4670A
000000000A00D4D4660B00000100020B00D4D4670A000000000A00D4E0300C00000000CC060C00
E0E03014000000002409CC067323CC0673231400E0546F8074686580636F6E74726172792C8045
504180686173806E6F74806D6164658066696E64696E6773807468617480747269676765728061
806D616E6461746F7279806475747980756E64657280746865D0011500000B000900016009B004
050001201500D04341412C806576656E80617373756D696E67807468658043414180617574686F
72697A656480726567756C6174696F6E80746F806164647265737380636C696D61746580636861
6E67652ED0041F00001500130001500AA00506000102240973232409732302201F00D0DD042200

**Notice of Denial of the Petition for EPA to Regulate
Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions from Motor Vehicles**

8/28/03

Action: EPA today (August 28, 2003) signed a notice denying a petition to regulate greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles. The Agency is denying the petition to regulate greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles for three reasons:

- 1) EPA lacks authority under the Clean Air Act to regulate CO₂ and other greenhouse gases for climate change purposes;
- 2) The only practical way to reduce motor vehicle emissions of CO₂ is to regulate fuel economy, which is a task that Congress has already assigned to DOT; and
- 3) EPA believes that regulating greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles would be inappropriate at this time.

(See additional points below related to the reasons.)

In February 2002, President Bush announced an aggressive approach to addressing climate change that encourages substantial voluntary reductions in GHG intensity and pursues fuel economy improvements:

- ▶ This approach sets a national goal of reducing the GHG intensity of the U.S. economy by 18 percent over the next ten years. This strategy sets the U.S. on a path to slow the growth of GHG emissions and, as the science justifies, to stop and then reverse that growth.
- ▶ In taking prudent environmental action at home and abroad, the U.S. is advancing a realistic and effective long-term approach, rather than adopting costly short-term measures whose benefit is uncertain.
- ▶ This policy supports vital climate change research, and lays the groundwork for future action by investing in science, technology, and institutions.
- ▶ In addition, the President's policy emphasizes international cooperation and promotes working with other nations to develop an efficient and coordinated response to global climate change.
- ▶ EPA is building efficient and effective market-driven programs that address the transportation sector's contribution to climate change. These programs include Climate Leaders, Energy Star, Smartway and Best Workplaces for Commuters.
- ▶ In February 2002, EPA launched Climate Leaders, a voluntary industry-

government partnership under which companies work with EPA to evaluate their GHG emissions, set aggressive reduction goals, and report their progress toward meeting those goals. To date, more than 40 companies from almost all the most energy-intensive industry sectors have joined.

- ▶ EPA's Energy Star is a voluntary labeling program that provides critical information to businesses and consumers about the energy efficiency of the products they purchase. Reductions in GHG emissions from Energy Star purchases were equivalent to removing 10 million cars from the road last year.
- ▶ The Smartway transport partnership works with the trucking and railroad industry to achieve cleaner and more efficient vehicles and locomotives by adopting pollution control and energy saving technologies. Smartway partners will develop and deploy fuel-efficient technologies and practices to achieve substantial fuel savings and emission reductions. Idling strategies alone have the potential to save 1 billion gallons of diesel fuel per year, while reducing greenhouse gases by 2.5 MMTCE and NO_x by 200,000 tons.
- ▶ Best Workplace for Commuters offers innovative solutions to commuting in order to reduce vehicle trips and miles traveled. We expect that 3.7 million employees will be covered by this program in 2005.
- ▶ EPA will also play a leadership role in advancing fuel cell vehicle and hydrogen fuel technologies and policies to support the U.S. environmental, energy and national security goals.

Additional talking points relating to (1), (2) and (3) above:

- ▶ No CAA provision specifically authorizes climate change regulation. A few sections mention climate change, but these are limited to non-regulatory measures.
- ▶ Congress has taken up the issue of climate change numerous times over the past few years, but has not enacted legislation that gives EPA authority to regulate GHG emissions for climate change purposes.
- ▶ Regulation of CO₂ and other GHGs for climate change purposes would have enormous economic, practical, and societal implications, which certainly were not envisioned when the CAA was enacted and amended.
- ▶ Under these circumstances, it would be inappropriate for EPA to search for authority to regulate in an existing statute that was not specifically designed or enacted to deal with the climate change issue.

- ▶ **[In case questions come up concerning the "Cannon Memo"]** In determining that the CAA does not authorize regulation to address climate change, EPA adopted the conclusion reached by its current General Counsel in a legal opinion reviewing relevant legal authorities and withdrawing the opinion and statements of two former EPA General Counsels who served in the prior Administration..
- ▶ Congress entrusted regulation of motor vehicle fuel economy to DOT, not EPA. CO2 emission standards set by EPA under the CAA would effectively supplant fuel economy standards set by DOT under the Energy Policy Act, because the only practical way of reducing vehicle CO2 emissions is to increase fuel economy.
- ▶ Establishing GHG emission standards for motor vehicles at this time would be premature, because it would require EPA to make scientific and technical judgments without the benefit of the studies being developed to reduce uncertainties and advance technologies.
- ▶ Establishing regulations now would result in an inefficient, piecemeal approach to addressing the climate change issue, because motor vehicles are only one of many categories of GHG emission sources.
- ▶ Unilateral EPA regulation of motor vehicle GHG emissions could also hamper U.S. efforts to persuade key developing countries to reduce the GHG intensity of their economies.

Background of the Petition:

- The petition was filed by the International Center for Technology Assessment and 18 other technology, citizen and environmental advocacy groups October 20, 1999.
- The petition asserted that EPA is obligated to regulate greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from motor vehicles under Section 202(a)(1) of the Clean Air Act.
- Section 202(a)(1) provides that "the Administrator [of EPA] shall by regulation prescribe ... in accordance with the provisions of [section 202], standards applicable to the emission of any air pollutant from any class or classes of new motor vehicle ..., which in his judgment cause, or contribute to, air pollution which may reasonably be anticipated to endanger public health or welfare."
- Petitioners claim that EPA has a mandatory duty to regulate GHG emissions from motor vehicles under Section 202 because EPA has already determined that:
 - CO2 and other GHGs are air pollutants under the Clean Air Act; and
 - GHG emissions from motor vehicles contribute to pollution that may

