

RECORD TYPE: FEDERAL (NOTES MAIL)

CREATOR:Elizabeth A. Stolpe ( CN=Elizabeth A. Stolpe/OU=CEQ/O=EOP [ CEQ ] )

CREATION DATE/TIME: 3-JUN-2003 19:41:46.00

SUBJECT:: Re: Comments on NRDC's Testimony on Power Plant Regulation

TO:Debbie S. Fiddelke ( CN=Debbie S. Fiddelke/OU=CEQ/O=EOP@EOP [ CEQ ] )  
 READ:UNKNOWN

TEXT:

oh for crying out loud. e.

Debbie S. Fiddelke 06/03/2003 06:54:49 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Phil Cooney/CEQ/EOP@EOP, Elizabeth A. Stolpe/CEQ/EOP@EOP, Dana  
 M. Perino/CEQ/EOP@EOP  
 cc:  
 Subject: Comments on NRDC's Testimony on Power Plant Regulation

note Clear Skies comments....didn't realize we were apologists for  
 Jeffords and the NRDC....

----- Forwarded by Debbie S. Fiddelke/CEQ/EOP on  
 06/03/2003 06:53 PM -----

Marlo Lewis <mlewis@cei.org>  
 06/03/2003 03:51:21 PM

Record Type: Record

To: Marlo Lewis <mlewis@cei.org>  
 cc:  
 Subject: Comments on NRDC's Testimony on Power Plant Regulation

The Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) is the leading force behind Sen. James Jeffords's (I-Vt.) Clean Power Act (S. 366), a bill that would impose costly new controls on power plant emissions of sulfur dioxide, nitrogen oxides, mercury, and carbon dioxide. The Bush Administration's Clear Skies Initiative, which would establish new controls on sulfur dioxide, nitrogen oxides, and mercury, but not carbon dioxide, is, in no small measure, a "me-too" response to Senator Jeffords's bill. It is thus fair to say that NRDC is driving much of the debate in Washington over Clean Air Act reform.

NRDC Climate Center Director David Hawkins has testified twice on the Clean Power Act, and once on the Clear Skies Act (S. 485). Mr. Hawkins has argued that the Bush plan will kill thousands of Americans every year because it does not go far enough to reduce power plant emissions.

This paper examines NRDC's claims regarding the health and mortality effects of fine particulate matter (PM 2.5) and mercury emissions. It finds that PM2.5 at current levels is unlikely to be increasing mortality, and that sulfate\*the form of PM caused by power plant emissions\*is a particularly implausible cause of deaths, because sulfate is not toxic.

Current power plant mercury emissions are also an implausible cause of harm. Power-plant mercury is a concern because high levels are found in some non-commercial freshwater fish consumed by sport-fishers and their friends and families. But less than one in 1,000 women have blood mercury levels as high as those associated with even subtle reductions in children's neurological health. Furthermore, as EPA concluded, no one knows where the mercury in fish is coming from. Most of it may come from past emissions that remain in the environment and are continually deposited and reemitted, and/or from areas outside the U.S. where mercury emissions are much higher. Thus, there is a significant risk that mandatory reductions in power plant mercury emissions will not significantly reduce mercury levels in freshwater fish.

Because higher incomes allow people to enhance their overall health and safety, the economic burdens of the Clean Power Act and the Clear Skies Act are likely to do more harm than good for public health.

- NRDC.pdf

===== ATTACHMENT 1 =====

ATT CREATION TIME/DATE: 0 00:00:00.00

TEXT:

Unable to convert NSREOP0102:[ATTACH.D20]SREOP01300GWX2H.001 to ASCII, The following is a HEX DUMP:

255044462D312E330D25E2E3CFD30D0A35352030206F626A0D3C3C200D2F4C696E656172697A65
642031200D2F4F203537200D2F48205B2037383020343439205D200D2F4C20323034383533200D
2F45203835373830200D2F4E203132200D2F5420323033363335200D3E3E200D656E646F626A0D
20
20
203030303030206E0D0A30
39203030303030206E0D0A30
3636203030303030206E0D0A30
373430203030303030206E0D0A30
33323032203030303030206E0D0A30
3034303935203030303030206E0D0A30
3034303635203030303030206E0D0A30
30303737383737203030303030206E0D0A30
3030303031323038203030303030206E0D0A747261696C65720D3C3C0D2F53697A652037320D2F
496E666F20353320302052200D2F526F6F7420353620302052200D2F5072657620323033363235
200D2F49445B3C3938313231396335373139613430383834356135363163316132326164623236
3E3C64613235386635656530356639346534663064323864356265363039663430633E5D0D3E3E
0D7374617274787265660D300D2525454F460D2020200D35362030206F626A0D3C3C200D2F54
797065202F436174616C6F67200D2F506167657320353120302052200D2F4D6574616461746120