

National Transportation Safety Board

Washington, D.C. 20594

Safety Recommendation

Date: May 25, 1989

In reply refer to: H-89-1

To the Governors of the 50 States and the Mayor of the District of Columbia

About 10:55 p.m. eastern daylight time on May 14, 1988, a pickup truck traveling northbound in the southbound lanes of Interstate 71 struck head-on a church activity bus traveling southbound in the left lane of the highway near Carrollton, Kentucky. As the pickup truck rotated during impact, it struck a passenger car traveling southbound in the right lane near the church bus. The church bus fuel tank was punctured during the collision sequence, and a fire ensued, engulfing the entire bus. The busdriver and 26 bus passengers were fatally injured. Thirty-four bus passengers sustained minor to critical injuries, and six bus passengers were not injured. The pickup truck driver sustained serious injuries, but neither occupant of the passenger car was injured. 1

The accident bus was a prestandard school bus, that is, it was manufactured before a series of special Federal motor vehicle safety standards (FMVSS) became effective which mandated a higher level of safety for school buses compared to other buses. Before April 1, 1977, school buses were required only to meet the minimum standards required of all multipurpose The Safety Board believes that the safety record for passenger vehicles. prestandard buses is relatively good. Because, in part, of the large size and mass of school buses relative to passengers cars, station wagons, and vans often used to transport children to school, prestandard buses provide safer transportation for school children than these other types of passenger vehicles. However, as a result of its investigation experience involving prestandard and poststandard school buses, the Safety believes that the improved protection (which the FMVSS relating to school buses requires) is responsible for saving lives and preventing many more serious injuries. Therefore, the Board believes that States should propose legislation establishing a date by which school buses manufactured before April 1977 will be phased out of use for public transportation purposes.

¹For more detailed information, read Highway Accident Report--"Pickup Truck/Church Activity Bus Head-on Collision and Fire near Carrollton, Kentucky, May 14, 1988" (NTSB-HAR-89/01)

Therefore, the National Transportation Safety Board recommends that the governors of the 50 States:

Propose legislation establishing a date by which school buses manufactured before April 1977 will be phased out of use for transportation of passengers. (Class II, Priority Action) (H-89-1)

Also, the Safety Board issued Safety Recommendations H-89-2 to the 49 States, except Kentucky, and the District of Columbia; H-89-3 to various church associations and other special activity groups; H-89-4 through -6 to the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration; H-89-7 to the Federal Highway Administration; and H-89-8 through -14 to the State of Kentucky.

The National Transportation Safety Board is an independent Federal agency with the statutory responsibility ". . . to promote transportation safety by conducting independent accident investigations and by formulating safety improvement recommendations" (Public Law 93-633). The Safety Board is vitally interested in any actions taken as a result of its safety recommendations and would appreciate a response from you regarding action taken or contemplated with respect to the recommendation in this letter. Please refer to Safety Recommendation H-89-1 in your reply.

KOLSTAD, Acting Chairman, and BURNETT, LAUBER, NALL, and DICKINSON, Members, concurred in this recommendation.

By: James L. Kolstad Acting Chairman

DISTRIBUTION LIST SAFETY RECOMMENDATION H-89-1

To the Governors of the 50 States and the Mayor of the District of Columbia

Honorable Harold Guy Hunt Governor of Alabama Montgomery, Alabama 36130

Honorable Steve Cowper Governor of Alaska Juneau, Alaska 99811

Honorable Rose Mofford Governor of Arizona Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Honorable Bill Clinton, Jr. Governor of Arkansas Little Rock, Arkansas 72201

Honorable George Deukmejian Governor of California Sacramento, California 95814

Honorable Roy Romer Governor of Colorado Denver, Colorado 80203

Honorable William A. O'Neill Governor of Connecticut Hartford, Connecticut 06115

Honorable Michael N. Castle Governor of Delaware Dover, Delaware 19901

Honorable Marion Barry Mayor of the District of Columbia Washington, D.C. 20004

Honorable Bob Martinez Governor of Florida Tallahassee, Florida 32301

Honorable Joe Frank Harris Governor of Georgia Atlanta, Georgia 30334

Honorable John Waihee, III Governor of Hawaii Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 Honorable Cecil D. Andrus Governor of Idaho Boise, Idaho 83720

Honorable James R. Thompson, Jr. Governor of Illinois Springfield, Illinois 62706

Honorable Evan Bayh Governor of Indiana Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Honorable Terry Branstad Governor of Iowa Des Moines, Iowa 50319

Honorable John Michael Hayden Governor of Kansas Topeka, Kansas 66612

Honorable Wallace G. Wilkinson Governor of Kentucky Frankfort, Kentucky 40601

Honorable Buddy Roemer Governor of Louisiana Baton Rouge, Louisiana

Honorable John R. McKernan, Jr. Governor of Maine Augusta, Maine 04330

Honorable William Donald Schaefer Governor of Maryland Annapolis, Maryland 21404

Honorable Michael S. Dukakis Governor of Massachusetts Boston, Massachusetts 02133

Honorable James J. Blanchard Governor of Michigan Lansing, Michigan 48909

Honorable Rudy Perpich Governor of Minnesota St. Paul, Minnesota 55155 Honorable Ray Mabus Governor of Mississippi Jackson, Mississippi 39205

Honorable John Ashcroft Governor of Missouri Jefferson City, Missouri 65101

Honorable Stan Stevens Governor of Montana Helena, Montana 59620

Honorable Kay A. Orr Governor of Nebraska Lincoln, Nebraska 68509

Honorable Robert J. Miller Governor of Nevada Carson City, Nevada 89701

Honorable Judd Gregg Governor of New Hampshire Concord, New Hampshire 03301

Honorable Thomas H. Kean Governor of New Jersey Trenton, New Jersey 08625

Honorable Garrey E. Carruthers Governor of New Mexico Santa Fe, New Mexico 87503

Honorable Mario M. Cuomo Governor of New York Albany, New York 12224

Honorable James G. Martin Governor of North Carolina Raleigh, North Carolina 27611

Honorable George Sinner Governor of North Dakota Bismarck, North Dakota 58505

Honorable Richard F. Celeste Governor of Ohio Columbus, Ohio 43215

Honorable Henry Bellmon Governor of Oklahoma Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73105 Honorable Neil Goldschmidt Governor of Oregon Salem, Oregon 97310

Honorable Robert P. Casey Governor of Pennsylvania Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17120

Honorable Edward D. DiPrete Governor of Rhode Island Providence, Rhode Island 02903

Honorable Carroll A. Campbell, Jr. Governor of South Carolina Columbia, South Carolina 29211

Honorable George S. Mickelson Governor of South Dakota Pierre, South Dakota 57501

Honorable Ned R. McWherter Governor of Tennessee Nashville, Tennessee 37219

Honorable William P. Clements, Jr. Governor of Texas Austin, Texas 78711

Honorable Norman H. Bangerter Governor of Utah Salt Lake City, Utah 84114

Honorable Madeleine M. Kunin Governor of Vermont Montpelier, Vermont 05602

Honorable Gerald L. Baliles Governor of Virginia Richmond, Virginia 23219

Honorable Booth Gardner Governor of Washington Olympia, Washington 98504

Honorable Gaston Carperton Governor of West Virginia Charleston, West Virginia 25305

Honorable Tommy Thompson Governor of Wisconsin Madison, Wisconsin 53702 Honorable Michael Sullivan Governor of Wyoming Cheyenne, Wyoming 82002

		V.