



# R-CALF USA

RECEIVED  
FSIS DOCKET ROOM  
04 APR 21 AM 9:35

P.O. Box 30715  
Billings, MT 59107  
Phone: 406-252-2516  
Fax: 406-252-3176  
E-mail: r-calfusa@r-calfusa.com  
Website: www.rcalf.com

## DIRECTORS

**President/  
Region I**  
Leo McDonnell, Jr.  
Columbus, MT

**Vice President/  
Region II**  
Kathleen Kelley  
Meeker, CO

**Region III**  
Heman  
Schumacher  
Hereid, SD

**Region IV**  
Dean Cockrell  
Cedarville, CA

**Region V**  
Chuck Kiker  
Beaumont, TX

**Region VI**  
Malcolm Moore  
Auburn, KS

**Region VII**  
Jerry Swartz  
Alexandria, MN

**Region VIII**  
Gene Barber  
Lexington, KY

**Region IX**  
James Fudge  
Colquitt, GA

**Region X**  
Dennis Huber  
Bismarck, ND

**C.E.O.**  
Bill Bullard  
Billings, MT

January 17, 2004

President George W. Bush  
The White House  
1600 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, D.C. 20500

The Honorable Ann Veneman  
Secretary  
United States Department of Agriculture  
1400 Independence Avenue SW  
Washington, D.C. 20250

**Re: Correction to January 14, 2004 R-CALF USA Letter**

Dear President Bush and Secretary Veneman:

R-CALF USA would like to correct an error contained in its January 14, 2004 letter to you. In the second paragraph of the letter, R-CALF USA incorrectly characterized the actions taken by the OIE this week. Rather than "certify" that the United States was BSE free, the OIE actually removed the United States from the list of countries with native-born cases of BSE this week. As we noted in our letter, this change in OIE status bolsters the fact that the BSE outbreak is a Canadian, not U.S. or "North American" problem.

We regret the error in our characterization of the OIE's actions. Attached please find a corrected version of the January 14, 2004 letter.

Kindest regards,

Leo McDonnell  
President  
R-CALF USA

Attachment

602  
35-4237869  
APHIS



# R-CALF USA

VVHD-002 110 P.O. Box 30715  
Billings, MT 59107  
Phone: 406-252-2516  
Fax: 406-252-3176  
E-mail: r-calfusa@r-calfusa.com  
Website: www.rcaif.com

## DIRECTORS

### President/ Region I

Leo McDonnell, Jr.  
Columbus, MT

### Vice President/ Region II

Kathleen Kelley  
Meeker, CO

### Region III

Herman  
Schumacher  
Hemoid, SD

### Region IV

Dean Cockrell  
Cedarville, CA

### Region V

Chuck Kiker  
Beaumont, TX

### Region VI

Malcolm Moore  
Auburn, KS

### Region VII

Jerry Swartz  
Alexandria, MN

### Region VIII

Gene Barber  
Lexington, KY

### Region IX

James Fudge  
Colquitt, GA

### Region X

Dennis Huber  
Bismarck, ND

### C.E.O.

Bill Bullard  
Billings, MT

January 14, 2004

President George W. Bush  
The White House  
1600-Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, D.C. 20500

The Honorable Ann Veneman  
Secretary  
United States Department of Agriculture  
1400 Independence Avenue SW  
Washington, D.C. 20250

**Re: Mouthing Rule – Segregation of Cattle 30 Months or Older**

Dear President Bush and Secretary Veneman:

On behalf of nearly 9,000 individual cattle producing members and 55 state and local cattle association affiliates representing thousands more cattle producers, R-CALF USA has concerns about the recently enacted BSE rule concerning specified risk materials in cattle over 30 months in age 69 *Fed. Reg.* 1861 (USDA, FSIS, Jan. 12, 2004). Under the USDA's rule, certain tissue of animals over 30 months in age have been reclassified as inedible. Under the USDA's policy, meatpackers will determine age based on an examination of the dentition of the animals to determine whether there are at least one of the second set of permanent incisors erupting in the mouth ("Mouthing Rule").

Presently, there is no evidence of BSE in native U.S. cattle. The Holstein cow found to have BSE last month was confirmed to originate in Alberta, Canada. Indeed, today the World Animal Health Organization certified the United States as BSE free. As such this is **NOT a North American problem – this is a Canadian problem.** R-CALF USA believes the interim rule is overly broad and discriminates against the U.S. producer rather than targeting the source of any possible BSE contamination.

R-CALF USA firmly believes in the security and safety of the American domestic cattle supply. R-CALF USA fully supports USDA when it says the American beef supply is safe. R-CALF USA supports USDA's efforts to reopen U.S. export markets, and reassure our trading partners that "U.S. beef" is safe. R-CALF USA also generally supports USDA in its efforts to increase the confidence of American consumers in our beef supply. However, when one realizes that the

SCANNED

04-4239699  
FSIS

source of the BSE contamination was an imported cow and not native production, USDA's "Mouthing Rule" is placing a horrific burden on U.S. producers without offering any substantial benefit to the consuming public, or any long term benefits to the U.S. live cattle industry. The economic consequences of this rule are however clearly significant and far-reaching. To implement such an extraordinary and broad rule without first soliciting industry input, public hearings, and a thorough cost benefit analysis is disconcerting.

R-CALF USA members have been receiving letters from certain meatpackers indicating that they intend to deduct 15¢ per pound per head for any animal, whatever the origin, who is determined to be over 30 months of age pursuant to the "Mouthing Rule". The implementation of this rule is devaluing a group of cattle (i.e., heiferettes), that previously returned a premium over their current class (i.e., cull cows). This reclassification will result in significant losses both for the cow-calf producers as well as for the feedlot sector. While the data allowing for the quantification of this enormous loss will be available in the ensuing weeks as the market reacts to the "Mouthing Rule", R-CALF USA would note that after implementing a similar rule, cattle in Canada with more than two teeth are being sold for a **TOTAL PRICE** of 8¢ to 20¢ Canadian per pound live weight. USDA's current rule is too broad, and the agency should not sit idly by while the whole market for this subset of cattle slips in the U.S..

While we will address this rule in more detail later, R-CALF USA has two immediate proposals for USDA's consideration:

1. The "Mouthing Rule" be applied only to cattle imported into the U.S. from countries that are classified as not BSE free because BSE is not native to the U.S. cattle herd. Such an action would strengthen domestic and international consumer confidence in the U.S. beef supply, as USDA intends, while also limiting the burdens placed on the cattle and beef industries.
2. R-CALF USA believes there are other equally effective, yet less burdensome methods to address USDA's concerns. USDA should immediately call for nation-wide public field hearings to gain industry input regarding the rule regarding specified risk materials from cattle over 30 months, and to ascertain the financial burdens placed on U.S. live cattle producers. Alternative approaches to strengthening international and domestic consumer confidence in "U.S. beef" should be examined.

Thank you for your immediate consideration of this important request.

Kindest regards,



Leo McDonnell  
President  
R-CALF USA