
CHAPTER 4

ALTERNATIVES SUMMARY

This page intentionally left blank.

4. ALTERNATIVES SUMMARY

4.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents a summary comparison of the overall potential environmental impacts of the Proposed Action and Alternative Regulatory Actions. Chapter 3 addresses the individual impacts associated with each separate proposed and alternative regulatory change, including the No Action alternative. Cumulative impacts are also presented in Chapter 3.

The alternatives, as described in Chapter 2, are the Proposed Action, the Alternative Regulatory Actions, and No Action. No Action may best be described as the continuation of existing management activities and regulatory structure (see Section 2.3 for additional details of the No Action alternative).

4.2 IMPACT SUMMARY

4.2.1 The Proposed Action

Table 4-1 provides an overview of the expected environmental impacts from each regulatory change associated with the Proposed Action under the JMPR. Most of the regulatory changes proposed by NOAA result in beneficial impacts on resources within the ROI. Those changes that result in adverse impacts primarily involve regulatory burdens on human uses within the sanctuaries, such as commercial fisheries, marine transportation, or recreation.

The only significant adverse impact was identified on Public Access and Recreation, as a result of the preemption of the use of MPWC for tow-in surfing. This impact could be mitigated by providing for special use permits for competitions and training at Mavericks.

Less than significant adverse impacts were identified in Commercial Fisheries, Land Use, Marine Transportation, and Socioeconomics.

Beneficial impacts were identified in Air Quality, Biological Resources, Ocean/Geological Resources, Water Quality, Commercial Fisheries, Cultural Resources, Hazardous Materials, Land Use and Development, Public Access and Recreation, Research and Education, Socioeconomics, and Visual Resources.

Cumulatively adverse impacts were identified in Commercial Fisheries and Marine Transportation; cumulative beneficial impacts were identified in Air Quality, Biological Resources, Ocean/Geology, Water Quality, Commercial Fisheries, Cultural Resources, Hazardous Materials, Public Access and Recreation, and Socioeconomics.

**Table 4-1
Summary of Impacts under the Proposed Action**

Location	Proposed Regulatory Change	Air Quality	Biological Resources	Ocean/ Geological	Water Quality	Fisheries	Cultural	Hazards	Land Use/ Development	Marine Transportation	Public Access/ Recreation	Research and Education	Socio-economics	Visual	Summary
CC	Cruise Ship Definition and Discharges	+	+	○	+	+	○	+	○	⊙	+	+	+	+	⊙+
CC	Discharge - MSDs and Graywater	○	+	○	+	⊙+	○	+	⊙+	⊙	+	+	⊙	+	⊙+
CC	Discharge Regulations Clarifications	+	+	○	+	⊙+	○	+	⊙+	⊙	+	+	⊙+	+	⊙+
CC	Introduced Species	○	+	○	+	⊙+	+	+	⊙+	⊙	+	+	⊙+	○	⊙+
CB	Benthic Habitat Protection	○	+	+	○	+	+	○	○	○	+	○	○	○	⊙+
CB	Seabed Protection	○	+	+	○	+	+	+	○	○	+	○	○	+	⊙+
CB	Wildlife Disturbance	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	+	○	+	○	⊙+
GF	Cultural Resources	○	○	○	○	○	+	○	○	○	+	○	+	○	⊙+
GF	Deserted Vessels	+	+	○	+	⊙+	+	+	○	○	+	+	⊙+	+	⊙+
GF	Manager Permit	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○
GF	Oil and Gas Clarification	○	+	+	+	○	○	+	○	○	+	○	○	○	⊙+
GF	Discharge From Outside the Sanctuary	○	+	○	+	+	○	+	⊙+	⊙+	○	+	○	○	⊙+
GF	No-Anchoring Seagrass Protection Zones	○	+	○	+	+	○	○	○	⊙	⊙	○	○	○	⊙+
GF	White Shark Attraction and Approaching	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊙	○	⊙	○	⊙+
GF	Wildlife Disturbance	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	+	○	○	○	⊙+
MB	Boundary Changes – Davidson Seamount	+	+	+	+	⊙+	+	+	○	○	○	+	⊙	+	⊙+

Table 4-1
Impacts of Proposed Action *(continued)*

Location	Proposed Regulatory Change	Air Quality	Biological Resources	Ocean/ Geological	Water Quality	Fisheries	Cultural	Hazards	Land Use/ Development	Marine Transportation	Public Access/ Recreation	Research and Education	Socio-economics	Visual	Summary
MB	Cultural Resources	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○+
MB	Deserted Vessels	+	+	○	+	⊙+	+	+	○	○	+	+	⊙+	+	⊙+
MB	Dredge Disposal – Santa Cruz and Monterey Harbors	○	○	○	○	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○+
MB	Dredge Disposal – SF-12	+	+	+	+	○	+	○	○	○	+	+	○	+	○+
MB	Motorized Personal Watercraft	+	+	○	+	○	○	+	○	○	⊙+	+	⊙+	+	⊙+
MB	White Shark Attraction and Approaching	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○+
MB	Wildlife Disturbance	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○
All	Cumulative Impacts	+	+	+	+	⊙+	+	+	○	⊙	+	+	+	+	⊙+
	Summary	+	+	+	+	⊙+	+	+	⊙+	⊙	⊙+	+	⊙+	+	

Notes:

○ – No impact

+ – Beneficial impact

⊙ – Less than significant adverse impact

⊗ – Significant mitigable impact

● – Significant unavoidable impact

CC – Cross-Cutting Regulation

CB – Cordell Bank NMS

GF – Gulf of the Farallones NMS

MB – Monterey Bay NMS

4.2.2 Alternative Regulatory Actions

Table 4-2 summarizes environmental impacts associated with the Alternative Regulatory Actions. As noted in Chapter 2, there are not alternatives for each individual proposed regulatory change. The alternatives would result in similar impacts as discussed under the Proposed Action, with minor differences that are noted in Chapter 3. The direct significant impact on Public Access and Recreation relating to MPWC would be incrementally greater as a result of the alternative that includes preemption of the use of MPWC throughout the entire Sanctuary. This impact would be subject to the same mitigation measure as identified for the Proposed Action.

Cumulative adverse impacts associated with the alternatives were identified in Commercial Fisheries and Marine Transportation, and cumulative beneficial impacts were identified in Air Quality, Biological Resources, Ocean/Geology, Water Quality, Commercial Fisheries, Cultural Resources, Hazardous Materials, Public Access and Recreation, Socioeconomics, and Visual Resources.

4.2.3 The No Action Alternative

Table 4-3 summarizes impacts associated with No Action. Failure to implement the Proposed Action is generally considered to have minimal impact on resources within the ROI. Implementation of the No Action alternative would result in less than significant adverse impacts on Biological Resources (resulting from the water quality impact, continued impacts on white sharks in GFNMS, and continued MPWC use in MBNMS) and less than significant adverse impacts on Water Quality (from continued discharge into the sanctuaries). No cumulative impacts were identified under No Action.

**Table 4-2
Summary of Impacts under the Alternative Regulatory Actions**

Location	Proposed Regulatory Change	Air Quality	Biological Resources	Ocean/ Geological	Water Quality	Fisheries	Cultural	Hazards	Land Use/ Development	Marine Transportation	Public Access/ Recreation	Research and Education	Socio-economics	Visual	Summary
CC	Cruise Ship Prohibition Alternative	+	+	○	+	+	○	+	○	⊙	+	+	+	+	○+
CB	Benthic Habitat Protection Alternative	○	+	+	○	⊙+	+	○	○	○	+	○	○	○	⊙+
CB	Seabed Protection Alternative	○	+	+	○	⊙+	+	+	○	○	+	○	○	+	⊙+
GF	White Shark Approach Prohibition	○	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊙	○	⊙	○	⊙+
MB	Davidson Seamount Circular Boundary Alternative	+	+	+	○	⊙+	+	+	○	○	○	○	○	+	⊙+
MB	Davidson Seamount NMSA Alternative	○	+	+	○	⊙+	+	+	○	○	○	○	○	○	○+
MB	Motorized Personal Watercraft Alternative	+	+	○	+	○	○	+	○	○	⊙+	+	⊙	+	⊙+
All	Cumulative Impacts	+	+	+	+	⊙+	+	+	○	⊙	+	+	+	+	⊙+

Notes:

- – No impact
- +
- ⊙ – Less than significant adverse impact
- ⊗ – Significant mitigable impact
- – Significant unavoidable impact

- CC – Cross-Cutting Regulation
- CB – Cordell Bank NMS
- GF – Gulf of the Farallones NMS
- MB – Monterey Bay NMS

Table 4-3
Summary of Impacts under the No Action Alternative

Location	Air Quality	Biological Resources	Ocean/ Geological	Water Quality	Fisheries	Cultural	Hazards	Land Use/ Development	Marine Transportation	Public Access/ Recreation	Research and Education	Socio-economics	Visual	Summary
CC	○	⊖	○	⊖	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊖
CB	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊖
GF	○	⊖	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊖
MB	○	⊖	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	⊖
All (Cumulative)	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	○	

Notes:

- – No impact
- + – Beneficial impact
- ⊖ – Less than significant adverse impact
- ⊗ – Significant mitigable impact
- – Significant unavoidable impact

CC – Cross-Cutting Regulation
 CB – Cordell Bank NMS
 GF – Gulf of the Farallones NMS
 MB – Monterey Bay NMS