

ISSUE SORTING TABLE
Scoping Period

Project Name: Armuchee Ridges

Date: May 18, 2007

COMMENTS/POTENTIAL ISSUES ARE CATEGORIZED ACCORDING TO WHETHER THEY ARE:

- 1) Comments beyond the scope of the project
- 2) Resolved by Forest Plan or other laws or regulations
- 3) Addressed through Forest Plan Standards or Best Management Practices (BMP's)
- 4) Addressed through mitigation measures or design features common to all alternatives
- 5) Issues that can be addressed by measuring the effects of different alternatives and comparing or contrasting differences between alternatives
- 6) Issues that can be addressed by developing alternatives to the proposed action
- 7) No issue identified

Commenter	Affected Resource/Topic	Comment/Potential Issue	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	Notes
Jim Webb – Ringgold	Wildlife	Supports proposal for wildlife habitat							X	
	Wildlife	Supports creation of edge			X					Will occur in restoration treatments
	Wildlife – Vegetation	Wants to see treatments proposed above 2500' elevation	X							No elevations over 1500' in proposal
	Wildlife – Vegetation	Supports regeneration treatments							X	
Shepherd Howell – Cartersville	Forest health – Wildlife	Supports thinning of pine stands							X	
	Restoration	Supports restoration of longleaf & shortleaf pines							X	
	Prescribed burning	Supports use of prescribed burning in thinned pine stands							X	
	Vegetation – Wildlife	Objects to cutting of overstory oaks						X		

Commenter	Affected Resource/Topic	Comment/Potential Issue	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	Notes
Shepherd Howell – Cartersville	NEPA	Wants more time to review – additional scoping notices before work on ground		X						Scoping ends when the decision is signed so we'll receive scoping comments until that time.
	Riparian Corridor	Supports restoration of riparian hardwood areas							X	
Sandra Tucker – US Fish & Wildlife Service – Athens	NEPA	Concern that management prescriptions are being excluded that benefit species of concern	X							These types of projects will be considered but not as a part of this EA.
Adam Hammond – GA DNR Wildlife Resources Div. Armuchee	Vegetation – Wildlife	Wants expansion of projects outside of pine forests to include hardwood and mixed hardwood forest types	X							These types of projects will be considered but not as a part of this EA.
Roger Tippens – Dalton	Wildlife – Forest Health	Supports project as proposed							X	
	Vegetation & Wildlife	Wants to see treatments done in Redwine Cove & Stover Creek areas	X							These types of projects will be considered but not as a part of this EA
Mike Dawson – Chattooga Co. Sole Commissioner	Wildlife – Forest Health	Supports project as proposed							X	
	Vegetation	Supports planting of oaks, shortleaf & longleaf to improve wildlife habitat							X	
	Vegetation	Opposed to Virginia Pine							X	Project will favor other pine species over Virginia Pine in treatment areas
Wes Anderson – Rocky Face	Wildlife – Forest Health	Supports project as proposed							X	
	Wildlife	Project will improve wildlife habitat							X	
Billy Williams - Trion	Wildlife – Forest Health	Supports project as proposed, particularly thinning and prescribed burning							X	
Harvey Howell, M.D. – Cartersville	Forest restoration	Interested in seeing chestnut restoration	X							Chestnut restoration requires seedling availability & site prep
	Access	Wants no more permanent roads built				X				No additional permanent roads are proposed for this project

Commenter	Affected Resource/Topic	Comment/Potential Issue	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	Notes
Harvey Howell, M.D. – Cartersville	Forest Health – Vegetation	Cut heavily in white pine, Virginia Pine, sourwood and sweet gum			X	X				
	Vegetation – Wildlife	Cut lightly in stands of white oak			X	X				
Sid Roberts – Cherry Log	Wildlife – Forest Health	Supports project as proposed							X	
Wayne Jenkins – Ellijay Georgia Forest Watch & Sarah Francisco – SELC	Project Data	Concerned about data accuracy	X							Resolve through discussions, updates of data
	Project costs	Wants an analysis of treatment costs					X			An economic analysis will be completed as part of the EA.
	Ecological differences	Don't treat Armuchee & Cohutta regions in same way	X							Proposed action located only on Armuchee portion
	Proposed treatment areas	Six pages of comments on specific stands identified in scoping notice				X				Addressed through discussions, corrections
	Monitoring	District needs to team up with Coweeta Lab for monitoring of project			X	X				Coweeta can be used as a resource for monitoring of projects
	Forest Plan	Not clear how proposed projects are consistent with Forest Plan desired conditions			X					Proposed action tiers to Forest Plan direction
	Invasive Species	Effects of proposed treatments on the introduction or spread of invasive species			X	X				Invasive species addressed through mitigations
	Management Prescriptions	Georgia Mountain Treasures – want no treatments in these areas	X							Georgia Mountain Treasures addressed at Forest Plan level
	Forest Plan	Not sure if proposed treatments are consistent with Forest Plan management prescriptions		X						Proposed action tiers to Forest Plan direction
	Prescribed Fire	Concern over the use and location of prescribed fire			X	X			X	
Prescribed Fire	Must have before and after monitoring of prescribed fires			X	X				Prescribed fire standards require pre & post fire monitoring	

Commenter	Affected Resource/Topic	Comment/Potential Issue	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	Notes
Wayne Jenkins – Ellijay Georgia Forest Watch & Sarah Francisco – SELC	Prescribed Fire	Don't have one size fits all prescribed fires – same on any site		X	X	X				Prescribed fire plans are prepared on individual sites based on objectives, conditions
	Prescribed Fire	Not opposed to appropriate use of prescribed fire							X	
	Roads / Access	New roads not needed				X				No new permanent roads are proposed for the project
	Recreation	Prevent illegal ATV use	X			X				
	Wildlife / Vegetation	Preserve hard and soft mast in project areas				X	X	X		
	Wildlife / Vegetation	No mature, mast producing (40 year old) oaks should be removed				X		X		Alternative can be proposed to retain all oaks
	Wildlife / Vegetation	No removal of oaks in the restoration or maintenance of shortleaf pine						X		Alternative can be proposed to retain all oaks
	Ecosystem restoration	No removal of oaks should occur in the longleaf restoration areas						X		Alternative can be proposed to retain all oaks
	NEPA	Don't use categorical exclusions for decision		X						Proposed action can be implemented with CEs per regulations
	NEPA	Do an environmental impact statement, not an environmental analysis		X						NEPA guides the appropriate level of documentation & analysis for a decision
NEPA	Do site specific analysis for each stand		X	X					Forest Service direction requires site specific planning for projects	
Riparian Corridors	Avoid activity within riparian corridors		X	X					Forest Plan direction exists for activities in riparian corridors	

