

---

## Contents

<b>Chapter 1. The ASSIST Evaluation Project: An Overview .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction.....	4
The ASSIST Evaluation.....	13
Summary.....	24
Conclusions.....	26
References .....	26
<b>Chapter 2. The Strength of Tobacco Control Index.....</b>	<b>31</b>
Introduction.....	33
Development of the Strength of Tobacco Control Index.....	34
Collection, Analysis, and Validation of SoTC Data .....	40
Results of SoTC .....	44
Use of the SoTC to Evaluate Individual State Programs .....	49
Summary.....	54
Conclusions.....	54
References .....	86
<b>Chapter 3. Measuring Policy and Legislative Changes .....</b>	<b>87</b>
Introduction.....	89
State and Local Government Action for Tobacco Use Prevention and Control .....	90
The Value of Monitoring Policy and Legislative Changes .....	91
Methods for Rating the Comprehensiveness of Tobacco Control Laws .....	93
State and State+Local Rating Results .....	100
Summary.....	104
Conclusions.....	105
References .....	106
<b>Chapter 4. Initial Outcomes Index.....</b>	<b>111</b>
Introduction.....	113
Tobacco Use Outcome Measures .....	114
Defining and Selecting Initial Outcomes .....	116
Initial Outcomes Selected for the ASSIST Evaluation.....	119
The IOI for Policy.....	129
Summary.....	135
Conclusions.....	137
References .....	138

<b>Chapter 5. State Facilitating Conditions and Barriers to Implementation of Tobacco Control Programs.....</b>	<b>141</b>
Introduction.....	143
Overview of Influences.....	144
State Conditions Selected for the ASSIST Evaluation .....	145
Data Sources.....	149
Other Potential Covariates .....	151
Summary.....	155
Conclusions.....	156
References .....	158
<b>Chapter 6. Measuring the Impact of Tobacco on State Economies.....</b>	<b>163</b>
Introduction.....	165
Background.....	166
Studies on the Economic Impact of Tobacco .....	171
Measuring the Economic Impact of Tobacco for ASSIST .....	174
State Data and Trends.....	175
Summary.....	181
Conclusions.....	182
References .....	182
<b>Chapter 7. The ASSIST Newspaper Tracking System.....</b>	<b>185</b>
Introduction.....	187
The Challenge of Measuring the Effect of Media Interventions .....	189
Tracking the Articles.....	190
Trend Analyses .....	195
Summary.....	201
Conclusions.....	204
References .....	211
<b>Chapter 8. Evaluating Tobacco Industry Tactics as a Counterforce to ASSIST ...</b>	<b>213</b>
Introduction.....	215
Expert-based Conceptual Map of Industry Tactics .....	217
Review of the Published Literature on Tobacco Industry Tactics.....	224
Review of Tobacco Industry Documents.....	236
Tobacco Industry Tactics: An Evaluation Challenge.....	254
Summary.....	255
Conclusions.....	256
References .....	257

<b>Chapter 9. Final Outcomes: Analytical Methods and Results .....</b>	<b>265</b>
Introduction.....	269
Overall Considerations for Analysis.....	272
Adult Smoking Prevalence.....	274
Per Capita Cigarette Consumption.....	276
Primary Results.....	279
Secondary Results (SoTC and IOI Analyses) .....	279
Summary.....	289
Conclusions.....	292
References .....	302
<b>Chapter 10. Cost-effectiveness of ASSIST.....</b>	<b>305</b>
Introduction.....	307
A Cost-effectiveness Analysis: The Basic Approach .....	308
Cost-effectiveness: ASSIST.....	310
Summary.....	322
Conclusions.....	323
References .....	323
<b>Chapter 11. The ASSIST Evaluation: Contributions to Evaluation of Complex Public Health Initiatives.....</b>	<b>325</b>
Introduction.....	328
Challenges to Evaluating ASSIST .....	328
Response to Evaluation Challenges .....	329
Key Findings of the ASSIST Evaluation .....	331
What Do These Results Mean?.....	332
The Legacy of the ASSIST Evaluation.....	334
The Future of Tobacco Control .....	336
Using the ASSIST Evaluation Approach for Other Public Health Initiatives.....	338
Summary.....	339
Conclusions.....	340
References .....	344
<b>Index.....</b>	<b>351</b>

## Case Study

Case Study 7.1. Editorials Promote a Stronger Youth Access Law in North Carolina .....	201
--	-----

## Tables

Table 1.1. Comparison of COMMIT and ASSIST .....	12
Table 1.2. Key Constructs and Variables Initially Proposed for the ASSIST Evaluation.....	19
Table 1.3. Research Questions Guiding the ASSIST Evaluation .....	21
Table 1.4. Final Constructs and Variables Used for the ASSIST Evaluation .....	25
Table 2.1. The Constructs, Domains, and Measures of the Strength of Tobacco Control Index .....	38
Table 2.2. Standardized Strength of Tobacco Control Index and Construct Scores, 1999–2000, by State, Sorted by SoTC Scores .....	45
Table 2.3. Correlation of Legislative Scores (1999) with SoTC Scores (1999) .....	48
Table 2.4. Correlation of Tobacco Use Prevalence (2000) with SoTC Scores (1999) .....	48
Table 2.5. Inputs: Resources and Capacity, Sorted by Funds.....	50
Table 2.6. Components of the Efforts Construct, Sorted by Efforts Score .....	52
Table 2.E.1. Within-method Correlation Analysis of Domain-level Strength of Tobacco Control Variables.....	79
Table 2.E.2. Within-method Correlation Analysis among Three Constructs and Overall Strength of Tobacco Control for Full Model .....	80
Table 2.E.3. Within-method Correlation Analysis among Three Constructs and Overall Strength of Tobacco Control for Reduced Model .....	80
Table 2.E.4. Amount of Variability Explained by First Three Factor Loadings in Principal Components Analysis .....	81
Table 3.1. Target Criteria Rated with 4 Points for Items in the Youth Access Policy Area .....	94
Table 3.2. Target Criteria Rated with 4 Points for Items in the Clean Indoor Air Policy Area .....	95
Table 3.3. Summary Scores for Youth Access Legislation, All States, 1993–99 .....	100
Table 3.4. Summary Scores for State Clean Indoor Air by Preemption Score Adjustment and Year, All States, 1993–99 .....	101
Table 3.5. State+Local Clean Indoor Air Summary Scores by Year, 1993–98.....	103
Table 3.6. State+Local Summary Scores for Clean Indoor Air for ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States, 1993–98 .....	103
Table 4.1. Real Price of Cigarettes, 1992–99 .....	121
Table 4.2. Legislative Score Including Preemption and Local Adjustment .....	124
Table 4.3. Percentage of Indoor Workers with Smoke-free Workplaces.....	127
Table 4.4. Correlations among Initial Outcomes in 1992–93 and 1998–99 .....	129
Table 4.5. Initial Outcomes Index .....	131
Table 4.6. Correlation of Initial Outcomes with Final Outcomes and Change in Initial Outcomes with Change in Final Outcomes.....	133
Table 5.1. Variables Included in the ASSIST Evaluation Analysis.....	146
Table 5.2. Per Capita Funding (\$/Person) for Tobacco Control in Each State, by Year .....	154
Table 6.1. Percentages of Gross State Product from Tobacco Growing and Manufacturing .....	177

Table 7.1. Examples of Key Words for Search Strategy.....	192
Table 7.2. Definitions of Coded Variables .....	194
Table 7.3. Examples of Tobacco Topics .....	194
Table 7.4. Average Rate Variables for Each Year Analyzed (District of Columbia Excluded) .....	199
Table 8.1. Clusters and Statements in Descending Order, by Average Importance Rating.....	221
Table 8.2. Lobbying and Legislative Strategy .....	226
Table 8.3. Legal and Economic Intimidation and Creating the Illusion of Support .....	228
Table 8.4. Usurping the Agenda .....	228
Table 8.5. Harassment .....	228
Table 8.6. Undermining Science .....	230
Table 8.7. Media Manipulation and Public Relations.....	231
Table 8.8. Industry Tactics to Oppose Specific Public Health Initiatives .....	232
Table 8.9. Tobacco Industry Behavior at State and Local Levels.....	232
Table 9.1. Baseline Characteristics of ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States.....	270
Table 9.2. Covariates at Individual and State Levels .....	275
Table 9.3. Results of Regression Analysis of Smoking Prevalence for ASSIST Status, by Sex and Age .....	277
Table 9.4. Adjusted Differences in per Capita Cigarette Consumption between ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States during the Intervention Period .....	281
Table 9.5. IOI Analyses of the Impact of SoTC, as a Main Effect, on IOI and the Components of IOI.....	282
Table 9.6. Results from Regression Analysis of Smoking Prevalence for Strength of Tobacco Control .....	285
Table 9.7. Results from Regression Analysis of Smoking Prevalence for Initial Outcomes Index.....	285
Table 9.8. Results from Regression Analysis of per Capita Cigarette Consumption for Strength of Tobacco Control .....	286
Table 9.9. Results from Regression Analysis of per Capita Cigarette Consumption for Interactions of Strength of Tobacco Control and ASSIST Status .....	287
Table 9.10. Results from Regression Analysis of Temporal Pattern of per Capita Cigarette Consumption for Strength of Tobacco Control.....	288
Table 9.11. Results from Regression Analysis of per Capita Cigarette Consumption for Initial Outcomes Index.....	288
Table 9.12. Results from Regression Analysis of per Capita Cigarette Consumption for Interactions of Change in Initial Outcomes Index and Its Components with ASSIST Status .....	289
Table 10.1. ASSIST Total State Expenditures.....	311
Table 10.2. ASSIST per Capita Expenditures (Adult Population, 18 Years Old and Older) .....	312
Table 10.3. Life-years Gained Attributable to ASSIST: Women .....	313
Table 10.4. Cost-effectiveness with Various Recidivism Rates .....	313
Table 10.5. Cost-effectiveness with Various Changes in Women's Prevalence Rates .....	314
Table 10.6. Fraction of Lifetime Smoker Quits Attributable to ASSIST .....	314

## Figures

Figure 1.1. Trends over Time in Tobacco Control Projects and Their Evaluation .....	6
Figure 1.2. NCI's Five Phases of Cancer Control Research.....	7
Figure 1.3. The ASSIST Evaluation Model.....	18
Figure 1.4. ASSIST Evaluation Timeline .....	18
Figure 1.5. Final Conceptual Framework Used for ASSIST Evaluation.....	24
Figure 2.1. Heuristic Map of Components Proposed for Strength of Tobacco Control Index .....	37
Figure 2.2. Strength of Tobacco Control Scores by State .....	46
Figure 2.3. Resources Construct Scores by State .....	46
Figure 2.4. Efforts Construct Scores by State.....	47
Figure 2.5. Capacity Construct Scores by State.....	47
Figure 2.6. Change in Tobacco Control Funding (in Dollars), 1991–98 .....	51
Figure 2.E.1. Factor Analysis for Full Model.....	81
Figure 2.E.2. Strength of Tobacco Control—Full Model.....	83
Figure 2.E.3. Strength of Tobacco Control—Reduced Model .....	84
Figure 2.F.1. Basic Conceptual Framework.....	85
Figure 3.1. Mean Youth Access Summary Scores by Year and Preemption Status .....	101
Figure 3.2. Mean Clean Indoor Air Summary Scores by Year and Preemption Status.....	102
Figure 4.1. Real Price of Cigarettes Versus Adult Smoking Prevalence, 1992–93 .....	122
Figure 4.2. Real Price of Cigarettes Versus per Capita Cigarette Consumption.....	123
Figure 4.3. Legislative Score Versus Adult Smoking Prevalence .....	125
Figure 4.4. Legislative Score Versus per Capita Cigarette Consumption .....	126
Figure 4.5. Workplace Smoking Ban Versus Adult Smoking Prevalence .....	128
Figure 4.6. Workplace Smoking Ban Versus per Capita Cigarette Consumption.....	128
Figure 4.7. Initial Outcomes Index Versus Adult Smoking Prevalence.....	132
Figure 4.8. Initial Outcomes Index Versus per Capita Cigarette Consumption.....	132
Figure 4.9. Change in Initial Outcomes Index Versus Change in Adult Smoking Prevalence.....	134
Figure 4.10. Change in Initial Outcomes Index Versus Change in per Capita Cigarette Consumption .....	134
Figure 4.11. Trends in per Capita Cigarette Consumption for States in Each Tertile Group of Tobacco Control Initial Outcomes Index .....	135
Figure 5.1. Interactions of Forces Acting to Influence Tobacco Use .....	144
Figure 6.1. Tobacco Leaf Production.....	167
Figure 6.2. Tobacco Leaf Production and Cigarette Production, Consumption, and Exports .....	169
Figure 6.3. Tobacco Leaf Production and Exports, and Imports' Share in U.S. Use .....	169
Figure 6.4. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, 2000 .....	176
Figure 6.5. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross Domestic Product, United States .....	178
Figure 6.6. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, North Carolina.....	178

Figure 6.7. Tobacco Growing and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, Kentucky..... 179

Figure 6.8. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, Virginia ..... 179

Figure 6.9. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, Georgia..... 180

Figure 6.10. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, South Carolina ..... 180

Figure 6.11. Tobacco Farming and Manufacturing as Share of Gross State Product, Tennessee..... 181

Figure 7.1. Article Type by Year, 1993–2000..... 197

Figure 7.2. Policy Topic by Year, 1993–2000..... 197

Figure 8.1. Point-cluster Map Showing the Multidimensional Scaling Arrangement of the 88 Statements with the Eight-cluster Solution Superimposed ..... 223

Figure 8.2. Concept Map Showing Clusters and Relative Importance Ratings ..... 224

Figure 8.3. Experts’ Interpretation of the Industry Tactics Concept Map ..... 225

Figure 9.1. Bimonthly per Capita Cigarette Consumption in ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States ..... 278

Figure 9.2. Crude Difference in Bimonthly per Capita Consumption of Cigarettes between ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States..... 280

Figure 9.3. Yearly Initial Outcomes Index Average for ASSIST and Non-ASSIST States..... 284

Figure 9.B.1. Examples of States with Nonlinear Trends in Bimonthly per Capita Cigarette Consumption after 1993..... 297

Figure 9.B.2. Random Effects Analysis with 95% Confidence Interval of Difference in per Capita Cigarette Consumption (Non-ASSIST Minus ASSIST)..... 298

**Appendices**

Appendix 2.A. Assessment Rating of Variables ..... 56

Appendix 2.B. Key Elements of Strength of Tobacco Control Efforts ..... 57

Appendix 2.C. Agency Worksheet ..... 61

Appendix 2.D. Survey 2..... 65

Appendix 2.E. Validation of the Strength of Tobacco Control Model ..... 77

Appendix 2.F. Construct Validation of Strength of Tobacco Control..... 85

Appendix 5.A. Baseline Values for Variables Considered in the ASSIST Evaluation Analyses..... 157

Appendix 7.A. Coding Topics..... 205

Appendix 7.B. Search Strategies ..... 207

Appendix 9.A. Issues Related to Selection of Methods for Analyzing Smoking Prevalence ..... 293

Appendix 9.B. Approaches to Analyzing per Capita Cigarette Consumption Data ..... 296

Appendix 9.C. Outcome Measures: Per Capita Cigarette Consumption (Packs/Month) and Adult (18 Years and Older) Smoking Prevalence (%) ..... 301

Appendix 11.A. Crude Prevalence, Initial Outcomes Index, and Strength of Tobacco Control Index, by State..... 342