## APPENDIX A: APHIS LEADERSHIP PROGRAMS/CURRICULA EVALUATION CRITERIA

### Criteria Based Evaluation Method

The criteria based evaluation method was one of two independent methods used to evaluate the leadership programs/curricula. As part of this evaluation method, the team created an evaluation matrix which listed the definition, goal/standard, and measurement for each criterion. The development of the evaluation matrix is detailed below. The complete criteria matrix begins on page A-3.

*Development of Evaluation Matrix*

During the first meeting, team members revised the criteria established in the initial APHIS Leadership Development Strategy meeting. In addition, the team established a definition for each revised criterion, as shown in example 1 below.

| Criteria | Definition |
|---|---|
| 1. Uses and Engages Positional Leaders | Uses positional leaders at the appropriate levels in learning by<br><br>Participating in programs, asking & answering questions from participants and serve as subject matter experts/ instructors who make links to organization goals, strategies, vision, values, etc. |

*Example 1: Revised Criterion and Definition*

After the criteria and definitions were developed, the team created goal/standard for each criterion, as shown in example 2 below.

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard |
|---|---|---|
| 1. Uses and Engages Positional Leaders | Uses positional leaders at the appropriate levels in learning by<br><br>Participating in programs, asking & answering questions from participants and serve as subject matter experts/ instructors who make links to organization goals, strategies, vision, values, etc. | Program/curriculum uses and engages APHIS positional leaders (at appropriate levels) in leadership development programs and curricula when appropriate to participate in panels, make presentations, and deliver training as SMEs and make links between the training and APHIS strategic goals (vision, mission, values, and etc.) |

*Example 2: Criterion, Definition, and Goal/Standard*

Once each criterion was defined and a goal/standard established, the team created measurements to determine if a gap existed in the program/curriculum, as shown in example 3 below.

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 1. Uses and Engages Positional Leaders | Uses positional leaders at the appropriate levels in learning by<br><br>Participating in programs, asking & answering questions from participants and serve as subject matter experts/ instructors who make links to organization goals, strategies, vision, values, etc. | List Objective(s)<br>Program/curriculum uses and engages APHIS positional leaders (at appropriate levels) in leadership development programs and curricula when appropriate to participate in panels, make presentations, and deliver training as SMEs and make links between the training and APHIS strategic goals (vision, mission, values, and etc.) | Question A)<br>Are the leaders on the training schedule? Yes/No<br><br>Question B)<br>Are the leaders' involvements directly supporting learning objective(s)?<br><br>List Course(s)<br>List Module(s)<br>List Objectives |

*Example 3: Portion of Criteria Matrix relating to Criterion 1*

## APHIS Leadership Programs/Curricula Evaluation Criteria

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 1. Uses and Engages Positional Leaders | Uses positional leaders at the appropriate levels in learning by<br><br>Participating in programs, asking & answering questions from participants and serve as subject matter experts/ instructors who make links to organization goals, strategies, vision, values, etc. | List Objective(s)<br>Program/curriculum uses and engages APHIS positional leaders (at appropriate levels) in leadership development programs and curricula when appropriate to participate in panels, make presentations, and deliver training as SMEs and make links between the training and APHIS strategic goals (vision, mission, values, and etc.) | Question A)<br>Are the leaders on the training schedule? Yes/No<br><br>Question B)<br>Are the leaders' involvements directly supporting learning objective(s)?<br><br>List Course(s)<br>List Module(s) |
| 2. Demonstrates Judicious Use of Resources & Is Accountable to Tax Payers | Provides cost effective training which uses 80 percent internal resources; 20 percent external contractors; uses non pay federal/state and etc. facilities for training; and uses most cost effective & politically appropriate location | Program/curriculum provides cost effective training which uses a) 80 percent internal resources; 20 percent external contractors, b) (non pay) federal, state, and etc facilities for training and c) most cost effective & politically appropriate location. | Question A) Number and title of courses/programs/curricula which used internal resources and/or contractors<br><br>Question A1)  Cost of contractor(s) per program<br><br>Question B) Was a location cost analysis conducted to ensure training location was the most cost efficient? Yes/No<br>If no, please explain<br><br>Question B1) Was location politically appropriate (not a resort)? Yes/No<br> If no, please explain |

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 3. Involves Collective Community of Training and Development Resources | Ensures collaboration among training units on Training, Design, Development & Delivery and/or other support activities e.g. selection criteria, evaluation, etc. | Program/curriculum uses the best resources from among units of Training - Design, Development, and Delivery and/or other support (e.g. selection criteria, evaluation, etc.) | Question A) Is collaboration occurring in Training Design – Yes/No List all occurrences<br><br>Question B) Is collaboration occurring in Training Development – Yes/No List all occurrences<br><br>Question C) Is collaboration occurring in Training Delivery – Yes/No List all occurrences<br><br>Question D) Is collaboration occurring in other aspects of training (e.g. standardization of evaluation methods) – Yes/No List all occurrences |
| 4. Is Systematic and Comprehensive | Links program(s)/curricula are linked to the APHIS Leadership Roadmap, APHIS Strategic Goals, Workforce/Succession Plans; competency based; uses variety of learning opportunities, delivery methodologies, assessments, learning relationships, and individual learning goals as appropriate, in order to develop leaders at all levels of the organization | Program/curriculum is systematic and comprehensive 100 percent of time for all measurement criteria | Question A) Is the training program/curriculum linked to the APHIS Leadership Roadmap? – Yes/No How – is program/curriculum listed on the Roadmap?<br><br>Question B) Is the training program/curriculum linked to the APHS Strategy and Goal for Leadership Development – Yes/No |

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 4. Is Systematic and Comprehensive *continued* | | | Question C) Is the training program/curriculum linked to the Workforce/Succession Plans – Yes/No<br>Supports Workforce or Succession Plan Goal of<br><br>Question D) Is the training program/curriculum competency based – Yes/No<br><br>Question E) Does program/curriculum incorporate:<br><br>Variety of learning opportunities - Yes/No<br>• If yes, which learning experiences?<br><br>Variety of delivery methodologies – Yes/No<br>• If yes, which delivery methodologies?<br>Assessments used? – Yes/No<br>• If yes, what assessments are used?<br><br><br>Coaching? – Yes/No<br><br>Mentoring? – Yes/No |

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Participants' development of individual learning goals? – Yes/No |
| 5. Demonstrates Best Practices/Innovative Approaches/Techniques for Leadership Development | Uses best practices/ innovations for leadership development found in Federal and private sector.<br><br>Conducts periodic reviews to keep current with what is happening in the field of Leadership Development | Program/curriculum shows evidence of a link to best practices | Question A) Was a Federal or private sector best practice(s) or innovation(s) for leadership development used?<br>If yes, what was it and how was it used?<br><br>Question B) Was a periodic review conducted in order to keep current with what is happening in the field of Leadership Development?<br><br>If yes, what was the methodology and how was the course changed? |
| 6. Demonstrates Interchangeability | Program/curriculum applies across all of APHIS<br><br>Modules in a particular program/curriculum can be used for another *level* of leadership development | Program/curriculum is designed, developed, and delivered to maximize interchangeability between APHIS units | Question A) Which components of your program/curriculum are interchangeable in order to reduce redundancy across APHIS units?<br><br>Question B) Which components of your program/curriculum are interchangeable across employee levels based upon the APHIS Leadership Roadmap? |
| 7. Addresses Program Unique Leadership Needs | Training programs modules designed to meet specific/unique program Leadership needs (for example: LMR (Labor | Program/curriculum addresses unique program results | Are there unique program leadership needs in the program/curriculum? |

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| | Management Relation/ Collective Bargaining Unit); operational plan/strategic goals; values; mission statement; international relations or negotiations; inter-cultural communications | | If yes, what are the unique needs? |
| 8. Uses sound Instructional System Design (ISD) | Uses ISD model of Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation | Program/curriculum is based upon sound instruction system design (ISD) which includes all stages of Analysis, Design, Development, Implementation, and Evaluation (ADDIE). | Question A) Is program/curriculum designed using the ASTD model of ISD?<br><br>Yes/No<br>Question B) Check which *Analysis* documents are available?<br><br>• Record of training request<br>• Alignment of training to Strategic Goal<br>• Analysis of Learner<br>• Instructional analysis<br><br>Question C) Check which *Design* documents are available?<br><br>• Instructional Strategy<br>• Course Format and Prerequisites<br>• Design Documents including objectives, length of program/curriculum, length of individual units<br><br>Question D) Check which *Development* documents are |

| Criteria | Definition | Goal/Standard | Measurement |
|---|---|---|---|
| 8. Uses sound Instructional System Design *continued* | | | available? Program/Curriculum materials<br>• Instructional Methods/Media<br>• Instructor/Facilitator Guide<br>• Appendices/Attachments<br><br>Question E) Check which *Implementation* documents are available?<br>• Results of Pilot<br>• Marketing of program/curriculum<br>• Rollout of program/curriculum<br><br>Question F) Check which *Evaluation* documents are available?<br>Evaluation Guide<br>• List of all applicable levels of evaluation based upon Kirkpatrick's Five Levels<br>• List of all applicable questions for each level of evaluation |
| *Optional Worksheet*<br>Additional Information not covered in criteria 1-8 | | | |