

U.S. Department of Justice
Environmental Enforcement Section
c/o NOAA DARC
7600 Sand Point Way, NE
Seattle, WA 98115
(206) 526-6617

FEB U 3 2000 TERED

AT SCATTLE

BY WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHING OF THE PROPERTY DEPUTY

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, THE STATE OF WASHINGTON, and THE TULALIP TRIBES OF WASHINGTON,

Plaintiffs,

V.

ASSOCIATED GROCERS, INC. and FOG-TITE, INC.,

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION NO.

RELATED CASES: C97-152D C97-1648WD C98-300R C99-665R

## DE MINIMIS CONSENT DECREE WITH FOG-TITE FOR NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES

This Consent Decree is made and entered into by the United States of America, on behalf of the Fish and Wildlife Service of the United States Department of the Interior ("FWS") and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration of the United States Department of Commerce ("NOAA"), the Washington Department of Ecology on behalf of the State of Washington, and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington, as their respective interests appear in the complaint, including as trustees for natural resources (collectively referred to as "Plaintiffs") and defendant Fog-

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

27 28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Tite, Inc. (hereinafter "Fog-Tite").

2

1

## I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

3 1. The Plaintiffs allege that the Tulalip Landfill is 4 located on Ebey Island between Steamboat Slough and Ebey Slough in the Snohomish River delta system between Everett and Marysville, Washington. Ebey Island is located in Snohomish 6 7 County, Township 30N, Range 5E, Section 32. The Tulalip Landfill Superfund Site ("the Site"), located within the Tulalip Indian Reservation, occupies approximately 147 acres of the western 10 portion of Ebey Island, just to the west of Interstate 5 and the Burlington Northern Railroad. The landfill area ("the Tulalip 11 Landfill") is bordered by a berm and is surrounded primarily by 12 wetlands in the form of freshwater and brackish water marshes. 13 To the west of the landfill area are approximately 160 acres of 14 15 salt marsh.

2. The Plaintiffs allege that in 1964, The Tulalip Tribes, a Section 17 Corporation federal corporation chartered pursuant to Section 17 of the Indian Reorganization Act, as amended, 25 U.S.C. § 477, leased the Site to Seattle Disposal Company for a period of 10 years. The lease was renewed in 1972. From 1964 to 1979, Seattle Disposal Company, its general partners J. Razore, J. Banchero, and other partners, and Marine Disposal Company, operated the Site, then known as the "Big Flats Landfill," as a disposal site for commercial and industrial waste. The Plaintiffs allege that waste material collected in King County, Snohomish County, and communities in and around the Puget Sound

27

28

16

18

20

21

22

23

24

2.5

26

U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617 region, including waste materials containing hazardous substances generated or transported by the Settling Defendants, was delivered to the Site by a variety of methods. In 1979, the landfill was closed and capped pursuant to the Rivers and Harbors Act of 1899, 33 U.S.C. §§ 403 and 407, and the Federal Water Pollution Control Act, 33 U.S.C. §§ 1311, 1319, 1342, and 1344, pursuant to a consent decree entered in the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on October 19, 1977, No. C77-721M. Additional capping materials, including construction debris and earthen materials, were placed on the source area by other parties after the 1979 consent decree closure, pursuant to the NPDES permit.

3. The Plaintiffs allege that hazardous substances within the definition of Section 101(14) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14), MTCA, RCW 70.105D.020(7), have been released into the environment from the Site. Hazardous substances have been found in soils in and around the Site, in sediments around the Site, in leachate emanating from the Site, and in ground water at the Site. Hazardous substances of concern found in soils and sediments include benzo(a)anthracene, benzo(a)pyrene, benzo(b)flouranthene, benzo(k)flouranthene, bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate, chrysene, 1,4-dichlorobenzene, flouranthene, fluorine, naphthalene, N-nitroso-di-n-propylamine, polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), and pyrene. Metals were also found at the Site, including arsenic, lead, and chromium.

- 4. The Plaintiffs allege that, as a result of these releases of hazardous substances, injuries to, destruction or losses of natural resources have occurred at the Site, and that such injuries, destruction or losses are compensable under Section 107(a)(4)(C) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a)(4)(C), and the Model Toxics Control Act ("MTCA"), Ch. 70.105D RCW.
- 5. Plaintiffs have filed, contemporaneously with the lodging of this Consent Decree, a civil complaint alleging that Settling Defendant is liable under Section 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, and MTCA Ch. 70.105D RCW, to the Plaintiffs for damages for the injury to, destruction of or loss of natural resources caused by the release of hazardous substances at or from the Site.
- 6. The Settling Defendant denies the allegations in the complaint in this action, including any and all allegations of liability and dispute the waste volumes attributed to it in EPA's volumetric report.
- 7. The purposes of this Consent Decree are to resolve the liability of the Settling Defendant for claims for Natural Resource Damages resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Tulalip Landfill and to protect the Settling Defendant against claims for contribution regarding Covered Matters.

27

26

4

6

8

10

 $\perp \perp$ 

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2.5

8. The parties recognize, and this Court finds, that the parties have negotiated this Consent Decree in good faith, and that implementation of this Consent Decree will avoid lengthy and protracted litigation, is fair, equitable, and in the public interest, and will expedite restoration of natural resources.

NOW, THEREFORE, the parties agree, and it is hereby ORDERED ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:

## II. PARTIES

- 9. "United States" means the United States of America, in all its capacities, including <u>inter alia</u> all departments, instrumentalities, administrations, natural resource trustees, and agencies of the Federal Government.
- 10. The "Tulalip Tribes of Washington" is a federally recognized Indian tribe organized under Section 16 of the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934, as amended, 25 U.S.C. § 476, and is the successor in interest to the Snohomish, Snoqualmie, Skykomish and other tribes and bands party to the Treaty of Point Elliot.
- 11. The "Department of Ecology" means the Washington Department of Ecology as designated state trustee pursuant to Section 107(f) of CERCLA, and 40 C.F.R. Part 300, Subpart G, and in its statutory role under MTCA, Ch. 70.105D, RCW.
- 12. "The State of Washington" or "the State" means the State of Washington, including <u>inter alia</u> all departments, administrations, natural resource trustees and agencies thereof.
- 13. "Settling Defendant" means defendant and signatory to this Consent Decree Fog-Tite, Inc.

## III. JURISDICTION

14. This Court has jurisdiction over this Consent Decree under Sections 107(a) and 113(b) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607(a) & 9613(b), 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 & 1345, and supplemental jurisdiction over state law claims as set forth in 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1367. The trustees have determined, pursuant to Section 122(g)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(1), that both the amount of hazardous substances contributed by Fog-Tite to the Site and the toxic or other nazardous effects of such substances were minimal in comparison to other hazardous substances at the facility.

### IV. DEFINITIONS

- 15. Whenever the following capitalized terms are used in this Consent Decree, they shall have the following meaning:
- a. "Natural Resources" include land, fish, wildlife, biota, air, water, groundwater, drinking water supplies, and other such resources belonging to, managed by, held in trust by, appertaining to, or otherwise controlled by the United States (including the resources of the exclusive economic zone), the State of Washington or the Tulalip Tribes of Washington.
- b. "Natural Resource Damages" means compensatory and remedial relief recoverable by the Federal, State and Tribal Trustees of Natural Resources on behalf of the public or tribal members for injury to, destruction of, or loss of use of any and all Natural Resources resulting from the release of hazardous substances, including (1) costs of damage assessment; (2)

compensation for loss, injury, impairment, damage or destruction of Natural Resources, whether temporary or permanent, or for loss of use value, non-use value, passive value, option value, amenity value, bequest value, existence value, consumer surplus, economic rent, or any similar value of Natural Resources; (3) any diminution in value of Natural Resources pending restoration; and (4) costs of restoring, rehabilitating, replacing, or acquiring the equivalent of the Natural Resources.

administrative liability Settling Defendant may have to the United States, the State of Washington (including the Washington Department of Ecology), the Tulalip Tribes of Washington, or any other individual or entity for any claim under 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607(a)(4)(c) & 9607(f), 33 U.S.C. § 1321, 33 U.S.C. §§ 2702, 2706, chapter 70.105D RCW, chapter 90.48 RCW, or any other federal, state, tribal or common law, for Natural Resource Damages resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Tulalip Landfill.

## V. PAYMENT AND RELATED MATTERS

16. Within 30 days of receiving notice of the entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall deliver to:

Registry of the U.S. District Court c/o Clerk, United States District Court Western District of Washington 1010 Fifth Avenue, Room 215 Seattle, WA 98104

a certified check payable to the Clerk of the United States
District Court for the Western District of Washington in the

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

28

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Band Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617 amount of NINE HUNDRED AND NINETY DOLLARS (\$990.00). The certified check submitted by Settling Defendant shall reference the "Tulalip Landfill NRD Settlement."

- 1/. Within 5 business days of making the payment specified in Paragraph 16, Settling Defendant shall provide written notification of the aforesaid delivery to the persons designated in Paragraph 27.
- 18. The amount deposited into the Registry of the Court shall be managed pursuant to the Order Directing the Deposit of Funds into the Registry of the Court issued by Judge Dimmick in United States v. Ace Galvanizing, Inc., No. C97-152D (Attachment A hereto), which is hereby incorporated into this Decree. These funds shall be used by Plaintiffs only for assessing, restoring, rehabilitating, replacing or acquiring the equivalent of the natural resources injured, destroyed, or lost as a reult of releases at or from the Site, as provided in 42 U.S.C. § 9607(f)(1).
- 19. If Settling Defendant fails to timely make any payment required under this Consent Decree, it shall be liable, commencing the day after payment is due, for interest on the unpaid balance at the federal judgment interest rate computed in accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 1961 as of the date payment is due, and, if incurred, the costs of enforcement and collection pursuant to the Federal Debt Collection Procedure Act, 28 U.S.C. § 3001 et seq.

1.5

#### VI. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE

20. In consideration of the Settling Defendant's timely compliance with the terms of this Consent Decree, the United States, the State of Washington (including the Washington Department of Ecology) and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington covenant not to sue or take any other civil or administrative action, after entry of this Consent Decree, against Settling Defendant for Covered Matters. This covenant not to sue shall extend to, and inure to the benefit of, the Settling Defendant and its past, present and future directors, officers and employees, acting in those capacities, and its successors and assigns. This covenant not to sue is subject to the reservations in Section VIII of this Decree.

21. In consideration of the Plaintiffs' covenants not to sue in this Section VI of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant agrees not to assert any claim or cause of action against any of the Plaintiffs arising out of injuries to Natural Resources resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Site, or to seek any costs, damages or attorneys' fees from any Plaintiff in connection with injuries to natural resources resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Site.

#### VII. CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

Subject to the Reservation of Rights in Section VIII of this Consent Decree, Plaintiffs agree that by entering into this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant will have resolved its

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

**14** 

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 - 9 -(206) 526-6617

liability for Covered Matters, as described in Paragraphs 15(c) and 20 of this Consent Decree, pursuant to Sections 122(g)(5) and 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(5) and 9613(f)(2), MTCA, RCW Chapter 70.105D.040(1),(2) and RCW 90.48.142, and shall be protected against claims for contribution regarding Covered Matters as provided in Sections 122(q)(5) and 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9622(g)(5) and 9613(f)(2), RCW 70.105D.040(d). Contribution protection shall extend to, and 9 inure to the benefit of, the Settling Defendant and its past, present and future directors, officers and employees, to the extent they were acting in those capacities, and its their 12 successors and assigns.

#### VIII. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

- Nothing in this Consent Decree is intended to be nor shall it be construed as a release or covenant not to sue for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, at law or in equity, which the Plaintiffs may have against Settling Defendant for:
- a. Any claims and liability as a result of failure to make the payments required by this Consent Decree;
- Any liability arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release, or threat of release of any hazardous substance, hazardous waste, or solid waste other than releases or threats of releases at or from the Size; or
  - Any criminal liability.
  - As required by MTCA, RCW 70.105D.040(4)(c), nothing in

27 28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

13

14

1.5

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

De Minimis Consent Decree

U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

this Consent Decree is intended to be nor shall it be construed as a release or covenant not to sue by the State of Washington for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, at law or in equity, which the State of Washington may have against Settling Defendant for factors not known to EPA at the time of entry of the decree that are discovered and present a previously unknown threat to human health or the environment. Factors known and threats known at the time of the entry of the Consent Decree include all facts, documents, evidence and data in the possession of EPA at the time of entry of the Consent Decree, including but not limited to all of the facts set forth in documents in EPA's administrative record for the Site, EPA's Risk Assessment for the Site and EPA's Proposed Plan for Interim Remedial Action for the Site.

## IX. DISCLAIMER OF LIABILITY

- 25. Neither entry of this Consent Decree nor any action in accordance with this Consent Decree shall constitute an admission of liability under any federal, state, tribal or local statute, regulation, ordinance, general maritime law or common law by Settling Defendant, its present or former officers, members, directors, trustees, shareholders, insurers, agents, representatives, employees, subsidiaries, successors, assigns or affiliates, for any fine, penalty, response costs, damages, or claims or any issues of fact or law for releases of hazardous substances at the Site.
  - 26. The parties further agree that none of the provisions

 $\perp 4$ 

U.S. Dept. Justice c/c NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617 of this Consent Decree or evidence of negotiations shall be offered or received in evidence in this action or any other action or proceedings by any other party for any purpose, except for enforcement of this Consent Decree or except as specifically provided herein. NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS Х. 27. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree. written notice is required to be given or a report or other document is required to be sent by one party to the other, it shall be directed to individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their successors give written notice of a change. All notices and submissions shall be considered effective upon receipt, unless otherwise provided. As to the United States: Chief Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611

Ben Franklin Station Washington, D.C. 20044

## As to the State of Washington:

Michelle Wilcox Toxics Cleanup Program State of Washington P.O. Box 47600 Olympia, Washington 98504-7600

## As to the Tulalip Tribes of Washington:

Tom McKinsey Tulalip Tribes of Washington 6326 33rd Ave., N.E. Marysville, Washington 98271

26 27

2

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

 $_{14}$ 

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

28

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

## XI. ENTRY OF DECREE

28. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than thirty (30) days and shall be made available for public notice and comment in accordance with Section 122(d)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(d)(2), 28 C.F.R. § 50.7, and RCW 70.105D.040(4)(a). The United States, the State of Washington and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington intend to defend the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree, unless comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations that indicate that the Consent Decree is not fair, reasonable or in the public interest, in which case the United States and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington reserve the right to withdraw or withhold their consent to the Consent Decree. The State of Washington reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations that demonstrate that the proposed settlement would not lead to a more expeditious restoration of natural resources. Settling Defendant consents to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.

- 29. After its entry by the Court, this Consent Decree shall be considered an enforceable judgement for purposes of post-judgement collection in accordance with Rule 69 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and other applicable federal statutory authority.
- 30. Settling Defendant hereby waives the 60-day notice requirement applicable to the trustees by virtue of Section

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

28

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Scattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617 113(g)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(g)(1), and agrees that any failure by Plaintiffs to give the notice required by that section shall not constitute a deficiency in the Complaint or in this Consent Decree.

31. This Court retains jurisdiction over both the subject matter of this Consent Decree and the Parties hereto for the duration of the performance of the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree solely for the purpose of enforcing those terms and conditions.

## XII. MISCELLANEOUS

- 32. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other appropriate relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendant shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, res judicata; collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United State in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this paragraph affects the enforceability of the covenants not to sue set forth in Section VI.
- 33. Settling Defendant shall not reference or rely upon its payment under this Consent Decree in any application for dredged or fill material under Section 404 of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act, or in any proceeding arising out of the Settling Defendant's application, or failure to apply, for such a permit.

U.S. Dept. Justice

<u>1</u>9

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

- 34. This Consent Decree shall not affect any party's rights against any person or entity not a party to this Consent Decree, except for the contribution protection provisions of Section VII.

  No person or entity other than the parties hereto shall have the authority to seek to enforce the terms of this Consent Decree.
- 35. This Consent Decree constitutes the entire agreement among the parties with regard to the subject matter hereof and can be modified or amended only with the express written consent of all the parties to this Consent Decree.
- 36. Each of the undersigned representatives of Plaintiffs and Settling Defendant certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind the party whom he or she represents to this Consent Decree.
- 37. The Tulalip Tribes of Washington's joinder to this
  Decree is solely in its capacity as a trustee for natural
  resources and constitutes a limited waiver of the Tulalip Tribes
  of Washington's sovereign immunity for the sole and limited
  purpose of enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree; provided
  that, this Consent Decree shall not act as a general waiver of
  sovereign immunity nor shall it in any way impair treaty-reserved
  hunting and fishing rights.
- 38. This Consent Decree may be executed in several counterparts and by facsimile and, as executed, shall constitute one agreement, binding on all parties hereto, even though all parties do not sign the original or the same counterpart.

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

28

1

J.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

1	We hereby consent to the e	entry of the foregoing Consent
2	Decree:	
3	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERIC	
4		
5	Į.	OIS J. SCHIFFER Assistant Attorney General
6		Invironment and Natural Resources Division
7	W	Inited States Department of Justice Jashington, D.C.
8		
9	\_\0,1000 Date	DEL GROSS
10	S	Section Chief Environmental Enforcement Section
11	U	United States Department of Justice Vashington, D.C.
12		Λ Λ
13	(-31-00	Lean Um
14		GEAN CARMAN Prial Attorney
15	E	Invironmental Enforcement Section United States Department of Justice
16	N	OAA DARC - DOJ 600 Sand Point Way, N.E.
17	<u> </u>	Seattle, Washington 98115-0070 206) 526-6617
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
24		
25		
26		
27		
- '		U.S. Dept. Justice

De Minimis Consert Decree for Natural Resource Damages -17-

28

c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Scattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

1		
2	FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON:	
3		Û.
4	James 26 200	Michelle Wilcox
5	Date	Program Director Toxics Cleanup Program
6		Washington Department of Ecology P.O. Box 47600
/		Olympia, Washington 98504-7600
8		
9	l/anloo Date	Joan Marchioro
10		Assistant Attorney General Ecology Division
11		629 Woodland Square Loop, S.E. P.O. Box 40117
12		Olympia, Washington 98504-0117
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
2 <b>3</b> 2 <b>4</b>	· 	
25		
26		
2 <b>0</b> 27		
٠ ١		U.S. Dept. Justice

De Minimis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

FOR THE TULALIP TRIBES OF WASHINGTON: Chairman Board of Directors 

De Minis Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

**-19** -

U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526 6617

1		
2	By the signature on this page, Fog-Tite, Inc. agrees to be bou by the terms of this Consent Decree:	nd
3	by the terms of this Consent Decree:	
4		
5	12-9-99 Umald I Midden	
6	Date	
7		
8		
9	Agent for Service of Process:	
10		
11	<u></u>	
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
21		
22		

U.S. Dept. Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 [206] 526-6617

28 Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

26

27

rce Damages - 20 -